REPORT

on the results of work of the external expert commission on assessment
of TURAN UNIVERSIT's
compliance with the requirements of the
institutional accreditation standards
from April 1 to April 2, 2024

INDEPENDENT AGENCY FOR ACCREDITATION AND RATING
External Expert Commission

Addressed to
To IAAR
Accreditation Council

REPORT

**on the results of work of the external expert commission on assessment
of TURAN UNIVERSIT's
compliance with the requirements of the institutional accreditation standards
from April 1 to April 2, 2024**

2024

CONTENT

(I) LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS

AC – Academic Calendar
PC – Public Company
AMS – Administrative and Management Staff
AMS – Automated Management System
SCES – State Compulsory Education Standard
DAA – Department of Academic Affairs
UHEMS – Unified Higher Education Management System
EHEA – European Higher Education Area
ECTS – European Credit Transfer System
ICT – Information and Communication Technologies
IC – Individual Curriculum
CED – Catalog of Elective Disciplines
CEM – Catalog of Educational Modules
MEP – Modular Educational Programs
RW – Research Work
SRW – Students' Research Work
NQS – National Qualifications System
NQF – National Qualifications Framework
MC – Mandatory Component
GED – General Education Disciplines
EP – Educational Programs
AS – Academic Staff
DDP – Double Degree Program
JEP– Joint Educational Programs
AC – Academic Council
EMCD – Educational and Methodical Complex of Disciplines
RK – Republic of Kazakhstan
WC –Working Curriculum
QMS – Quality Management System
SIW – Students' Independent Work
TGSIW – Teacher-Guided Students' Independent Work
TME– Technical Means of Education
EMC – Educational and Methodical Council

(II) <u>INTRODUCTION</u>

In accordance with the order of the Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating (IAAR) No.39-24-OD, dated 31.01.2024, from April 1 to 2, 2024, the external expert commission assessed Turan University's compliance with the IAAR institutional accreditation standards (dated 16 June, 2020, No.57-20-OD, 6th edition).

The report of the External Expert Commission (EEC) contains the assessment of the educational organization to the NAAR criteria, recommendations from the EEC for further imrovement of the the educational organization and institutional profile parameters.

The External Expert Commission comprises:

1 Chairperson of the IAAR Commission – Gulvira Sovetbekovna Akybaeva, Candidate of Economic Sciences, E.A. Buketov Karaganda University (Republic of Kazakhstan) *Off-line participation*

2 IAAR Expert – Konstantin Korolev, Candidate of Economic Sciences, Assistant Professor, North-West Institute of Management of the Russian Presidential Academy of National Economy and Public Administration (RANEPA) (Russian Federation) *Off-line Participation*

3 IAAR Expert –Galiya Akhmetvalievna Movkebayeva, Doctor of Science, Professor, Professor of Department of International Relations and World Economy, Al-Farabi Kazakh National University (Republic of Kazakhstan) *Off-line Participation*

4 IAAR Expert – Darkhan Berikovich Akpanbetov, Candidate of Technical Sciences, Associate Professor, International Engineering and Technology University (Republic of Kazakhstan) *Off-line participation*

5 IAAR Expert, Employer Representative – Temirlan Khaleluly Madiev, leading expert of the Investment Projects Support Department of the Chamber of Entrepreneurs of Almaty (Republic of Kazakhstan) *Off-line participation*

6 IAAR Expert, Student Representative – Zhibek Kairatovna Bayasilova, 4th year student of the Bachelor Program "Tourism", Member of Kazakhstan Students' Alliance, Kazakh Ablai Khan University of International Relations and World Languages (Republic of Kazakhstan) *Off-line participation*

7 IAAR Coordinator – Malika Akhyadovna Saidulaeva, Project Manager of the Independent Accreditation and Rating Agency (Republic of Kazakhstan) *Off-line participation*

(III) PRSESENTATION OF EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION

Turan University, established in 1992, is part of the Turan Educational Corporation, an integrated complex comprising Turan School-Lyceum, two colleges in Almaty and Astana, and two universities: Turan University and Turan-Astana University. Additionally, it includes the Tau-Turan educational and recreational complex located in the Belbulak Gorge.

The university offers programs across three levels: Bachelor's, Master's, and Doctoral degrees. Currently, it encompasses several faculties: the Economic Faculty, Faculty of Humanities and Law, Faculty of Digital Technologies and Art, Higher School of Business (HSE), and the "Foundation" Preparatory Faculty. It hosts 15 chairs, four institutes – Research Institute of Tourism, Institute of World Economy and International Relations, Research Institute of Law, and Research Institute of Informatization of Education (established in 2020) – along with departments, centers, divisions, and three dissertation councils.

Education is offered through 29 Bachelor's degree programs, 24 Master's degree programs (including MBA, EMBA), 5 Doctoral degree programs, and 1 DBA program. The total student body consists of 5,143 individuals: 4,753 Bachelor degree students, 329 Master's degree students, and 61 Doctoral degree students.

The university employs 338 qualified full-time academic staff members, including 34 Doctors of Sciences, 92 Candidates of Sciences, and 39 PhDs. Part-time instructors from other universities, practitioners from various industries and foreign professors actively contribute to the educational process.

A key strategic focus is on supporting research, with 94% of the academic staff engaged in research activities in 2023. The university is leading research across 27 topics registered at the National Center for Independent Examination (NCIE), with 12 topics specifically addressing applied research to enhance educational processes and teaching methodologies.

Three research topics are funded through the State budget and align with the university's strategic goals:

1. "Digital Revolution in Universities of Kazakhstan: Challenges, Realities, Prospects" (Zakirova D.I.)
2. "Labor Market Research in Kazakhstan Under Conditions of Digital Transformation of Economy" (Yeralina E.M.)
3. "Development of a Model of Assessment of Professional Competences at the Stages of Formation in Higher Education Institution" (Abdiyev K.S.)

The university also executes 18 social and business initiatives aimed at uncovering and capitalizing on the entrepreneurial potential of academic staff members and students. Each scientific research direction is defined by the priorities outlined in the current strategy, emphasizing the relevance and practical application of the research topic, taking into account the specifics of the educational program, existing scientific foundations and the focus on achieving research objectives.

Between 2019 and 2023, three projects were implemented with funding secured through participation in the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan's competition for grant financing of scientific research (details available in the "Research Work" standard). Additionally, university faculty members participate in projects for young scientists funded by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan (PhDs Asyltaev E.B., Yussupova S.Sh., and others). The outcomes of conducted scientific research are actively integrated into the educational process, substantiated by certificates, implementation reports, and certifications. By the end of 2023, the university has validated 295 implementations. Analysis indicates a consistent growth trend: 238 in 2019, 221 in 2020, 266 in 2021, and 231 in 2022.

The university possesses a contemporary material and technical infrastructure compliant with sanitary norms, state educational standards, encompassing a total area of 10.5 hectares. The

collective area of buildings and structures amounts to 57,364 square meters. This infrastructure includes four academic buildings with complete infrastructure spanning 25,342.4 square meters, comprising four medical service facilities, five dining facilities, and sports and fitness amenities. Additionally, there are three dormitories totaling 3,299.7 square meters, open sports grounds spanning 6,559 square meters, and the "Tau-Turan" educational and recreational complex covering 4,283 square meters.

According to the General Ranking TOP-20 of universities in Kazakhstan (NAAR), the university consistently ranks within the top 10 humanities universities in Kazakhstan. In the Independent Ranking of university demand in Kazakhstan for 2023, Turan University secured the 6th position. Annually, the university's educational programs participate in national rankings conducted by the NCE RK "Atameken".

(IV) DESCRIPTION OF THE PREVIOUS ACCREDITATION PROCEDURE

In accordance with Order No. 8-19-OD dated January 25, 2019, from the Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating (NAAR), the external expert commission conducted an assessment of Turan University's compliance with NAA's institutional accreditation standards from February 20 to 22, 2019 (based on 5th edition, dated February 24, 2017, No. 10-17-OD).

The External Expert Commission (EEC) report includes an assessment of Turan's performance against NAAR's institutional accreditation criteria, along with recommendations from the EEC aimed at enhancing the university's institutional profile parameters.

The External Expert Commission is composed of:

Chairperson – Yuriy Nikolaevich Pak, Doctor Technical Sciences, Professor at Karaganda State Technical University.

International Expert – Sophio Hundadze, PhD, DBA, Associate Professor, Head of Educational Program Development Department at the European University (Tbilisi, Georgia).

National Expert – Klara Umirzakovna Kunakova, Doctor of Pedagogical Sciences, Professor at the Department of Theoretical and Applied Linguistics, Kazakh Ablai Khan University of International Relations and World Languages (Almaty).

Employer Representative – Askar Aituov, Head of DAR Lab Innovation Laboratory (Almaty).

Student Representative – Zarina Bakytzhanovna Nurmuhan, 3[rd]year student of the Bachelor Program "5B011900 – Foreign Language: Two Foreign Languages" at Kazakh Ablai Khan University of International Relations and World Languages (Almaty).

National Expert – Sedep Toktamuratovna Mirzakypova, Doctor of Economic Sciences, Professor at Narxoz University (Almaty).

National Expert – Maya Zhetkergenovna Arzaeva, Head of Finance Department at the Higher School of Economics and Business of Al-Farabi Kazakh National University (Almaty).

Student Representative – Daryn Ermekbayuly Toleubai, student of the Bachelor Program "5B050900 Finance" at Kazakh Engineering and Technological University (Almaty).

National Expert – Aigul Kuanyshbaevna Rakisheva, Candidate of Economic Sciences, Assisstant Professor, Corresponding Member of the International Academy of Science and Practice of Production Organization, Member of the Expert Project Club "Astana ExProClub 2025", Member of Astana Project Managers Club (Astana) .

National Expert – Zhamal Madakhmetovna Ayapova, Candidate of Economic Sciences, DBA, Director of Business School at Kazakh Humanities and Law University (Astana).

Student Representative – Aida Erzhanqyzy Suleimenova, 3[rd]year student of the Bachelor Program "6B051100 Marketing" at Kazakh Engineering and Technological University (Almaty).

International Expert – Vladimir Alekseevich Zernov, Doctor of Technical Sciences, Professor, Rector of Russian New University, Chairperson of the Council of Association of Private Educational Organizations of Higher and Professional Education of Russia (Moscow).

National Expert – Farida Ravilievna Gusmanova, Candidate of Physical and Mathematical Sciences, Assisstant Professor of Computer Science Department at Al-Farabi Kazakh National University (Almaty).

Student Representative – Aizada Aidynkyzy Kasymkhan, 3rd year student of the Bachelor Program "5B070400 Computer Engineering and Software" at Al-Farabi Kazakh National University (Almaty).

NAAR Observer – Guliash Balkenovna Niyazova, Project Manager for Institutional and Specialized Accreditation of Universities (Astana).

Recommendations to the university under the previous procedure (2019):
Standard "Strategic Development and Quality Assurance"
The management of the university should proactively engage diverse stakeholders to ensure transparency in the development, monitoring, and regular updating of the university's strategic documents. It is crucial to foster a culture of quality throughout all organizational levels, implementing continuous monitoring of activities to drive improvement, and swiftly taking corrective actions when goals and objectives are not met.
"Administration and Management" Standard
The university administration should continue its work on preventing the risks identified during the development of strategic documents.
It is imperative that they conduct systematic analysis to evaluate the efficacy of implemented changes across all management tiers. Furthermore, ongoing training in certified management programs for senior leadership remains a priority to ensure continued professional development.
"Information Management and Reporting" Standard
The university administration should continue working on the system of regular reporting, including performance assessment and effectiveness of departments, educational programs, scientific research, and their interactions and strengthen the role of the Academic Council in monitoring the implementation of decisions and increasing accountability of the responsible parties. During the collection and analysis of information, apply strategic KPIs (Key Performance Indicators) to cascade down first to the level of structural units and then to individual employees, aimed at improving overall work performance. Ensure access to up-to-date information in various fields of science, including international scientometric databases.
"Development and Approval of Educational Programs" Standard
Continue preparing students for professional certification in other educational programs. Continue adjusting competencies to ensure their measurability and achievability, and reduce the number of competencies in academic disciplines without compromising students' professional qualifications. Prepare methodological materials for developing assessment tools for educational program outcomes. Facilitate the implementation of joint educational programs with international educational organizations.
"Continuous Monitoring and Periodic Assessment of Educational Programs" Standard
Ensure the university's management assesses educational programs to determine if learning objectives are achieved.
Further advance the training of evaluators in contemporary methodologies for assessing learning outcomes.
"Student-Centered Learning, Teaching and Assessment" Standard
Ensure assessment procedures align students' educational outcomes with planned learning outcomes and program goals.
"Students" Standard
Promote the internationalization program, including expanding academic mobility and attracting foreign students.

"Academic Staff" Standard

Implement measures to enhance staff members' contributions to the university's development strategy by using strategic document cascading up to the faculty level. Aggregate personnel management data to incentivize timely recognition and reward of faculty members based on their performance. Enhance staff members' efforts to improve the quality of distance learning. Continue developing the faculty members' academic mobility.

"Research Work" Standard

Support the recognition of research results, including patent applications and copyrights. Strive to diversify funding sources for research activities. Implement measures to increase the publication of educational and methodological literature accredited by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Association of Universities of the Republic of Kazakhstan as a result of initiative research.

"Finances" Standard

Conduct external independent audits and publish results, excluding those representing commercial secrets, on the university's website.

"Educational Resources and Student Support Systems" Standard

Accelerate the deployment of the corporate network portal ASU Turan for convenience of students and academic staff in accessing information on educational programs, assessments and dormitories.

"Public Information" Standard

Continue engaging with partners, including scientific/consulting organizations, business partners, social partners, and educational organizations.

On April 5, 2019, by decision of the NAAR Accreditation Council, Turan University was accredited for 5 years.

To implement the recommendations, the university developed an action plan. The results of the planned activities are stated in the interim reports of Turan University. Post-monitoring control assessing the implementation of theNAAR Accreditation Council recommendations resulting from institutional accreditation was conducted by the NAAR expert group at KNU on June 7, 2021 (Stage 1) and April 24, 2023 (Stage 2). Post-accreditation monitoring of the university's activities was carried out within the framework of the action plan for implementing the NAAR Accreditation Council recommendations and in accordance with the provisions for post-accreditation monitoring.

The post-accreditation monitoring of the university's activities showed that, overall, the recommendations of the NAAR Accreditation Council are being implemented, with some exceptions.

Members of the NAAR Accreditation Council conducting re-accreditation from April 1 to 2, 2024, found that systematic work had been carried out on previous recommendations. An analysis of the recommendations' implementation showed that Turan University fully implemented all recommendations under 11 out of 12 standards. This was confirmed during the visit by the NAAR Accreditation Council members, and the results of post-accreditation monitoring confirmed 100% compliance. The recommendation for implementing professional certification is 90% complete, as work has begun to create conditions for issuing professional certificates.

For instance, in the "Tourism" educational program, students can undergo professional certification with Sabre Travel Network Central Asia in booking and with LLC "Almaty/Astana City Tour" in tour guiding.

In the "Accounting and Audit" program (Financial Accounting 1; Management Accounting 1; 1C Accounting), and in the "Information Systems" program (Fundamentals and Calculated Tasks, Introduction to 1C Accounting), preparation is underway for professional certification in the 1C program.

The "Information Technology" program includes courses such as "Routing, Scaling, and Switching Networks (CISCO)" and "Designing and Developing Client-Server Software

Architecture (CISCO)". The "Routing, Scaling, and Switching Networks (CISCO)" course deepens and enhances the training of engineers in modern telecommunications network construction with packet switching, introduces the concept of next-generation network construction, and principles for building multiservice networks.

(V) DESCRIPTION OF THE EEC VISIT

The Accreditation Council (AC) conducted its proceedings in accordance with the approved Program for the visit of the expert commission for Turan University's institutional accreditation from April 1 to 2, 2024. To streamline the AC's efforts, an inaugural meeting was convened on March 31, 2024. During this session, responsibilities were delegated among commission members, the visitation schedule was finalized, and consensus was achieved on the selection of evaluation methodologies.

To gather comprehensive insights into the university's educational framework and overall infrastructure, and to enhance the quality of the self-assessment report, extensive consultations were conducted. These meetings included discussions with the university's leadership, including the rector and vice-rectors overseeing various domains, as well as with heads of departments, deans, faculty members, students, graduates, and employers. In total, 152 stakeholders actively participated in these sessions (refer to Table 1).

Table 1 – Information about employees and students participated in meetings with the NAAR EEC:

Category of Participants	Number
Rector	1
Vice-Rectors	4
Heads of Structural Units	18
Deans	4
Department Chairs	17
Academic Staff	29
Students	38
Graduates	22
Employers	19
Total	152

During the visual inspection, the EEC members assessed the state of the university's material and technical base, visited educational and scientific laboratories, coworking centers, studios, and open student areas.

During meetings with targeted groups at Turan University, the NAAR EEC clarified the mechanisms for implementing the university's policies and specified individual data presented in the university's self-assessment report.

The EECmembers visited practice bases such as Turan School-Lyceum, JSC "Sentras Insurance" Insurance Company and Khakimov office.

In accordance with the accreditation procedure, surveys were conducted with 86 faculty members and 535 students, including junior and senior students.

To verify the information presented in the self-assessment report by external experts, the university's working documentation was requested and analyzed. Additionally, experts examined the university's online positioning through its official website at https://turan.edu.kz/.

As part of the planned program, recommendations for improving Turan University's activities, developed by the EEC based on the evaluation results, were presented during a meeting with the university administration on April 2, 2024.

(VI) COMPLIANCE WITH INSTITUTIONAL ACCREDITATION STANDARDS

6.1. "Strategic Development and Quality Assurance" Standard

- ✓ *The university must demonstrate the development of a unique mission, vision and strategy based on the analysis of external and internal factors, with broad engagement of diverse stakeholders.*
- ✓ *The university must demonstrate that its mission, vision, and strategy are oriented towards meeting the needs of the state, society, real economy sectors, potential employers, students and other stakeholders.*
- ✓ *The university must demonstrate transparency in the processes of formulating, monitoring, and regularly reviewing its mission, vision, strategy, and quality assurance policy.*
- ✓ *The university must have published policies on quality assurance, mission, vision, and strategy.*
- ✓ *The university develops documents for specific areas of activity and processes (plans, programs, regulations, etc.) that specify the quality assurance policy.*
- ✓ *The quality assurance policy must reflect the link between research, teaching, and learning.*
- ✓ *The university must demonstrate the development of a culture of quality assurance.*

Evidence Part

The university's mission involves culture, education and science for the benefit of society. The principal regulatory document defining the university's development directions, ways to address set tasks and goals is its Development Strategy for 2021-2024, approved by the Academic Council in November 2020 and accessible to all stakeholders on the university's website.

The development, coordination and approval of the Strategy and other strategic documents are governed by the documented procedure "Strategic Planning". The Strategy is developed through the establishment of a special working group comprising vice-rectors, heads of research and development, deans, department directors, heads of departments, and the director of the Office of Management, Quality and Analytics.

The working group submits the draft Strategy for consideration and discussion; the resulting document is formed based on consensus among all members of the working group, taking into account all suggestions and comments. The Strategy is discussed and approved at meetings of the Academic Council, which includes stakeholders such as employers and students on a permanent basis.

Quality assurance policy is part of the university's strategic management and is used by senior management as a means to manage its activities aimed at improving the quality of education. The quality assurance policy is accessible to every participant in the educational process and is disseminated to all interested parties through publication on the website. The quality assurance policy is annually analyzed for adequacy and suitability, if necessary, it is adjusted by the Academic Council to ensure its continuous development and improvement. For instance, the quality assurance policy, which was in effect since 2018, was revised in 2021 following the adoption of a new Vision and Strategy.

Annual quality objectives for structural units are the primary tool for implementing the Quality Assurance Policy, using the Strategy's performance indicators for their establishment. For instance, by 2022, the university successfully achieved the strategic goal of accreditation by the international agency, with parts of its programs accredited by the Accreditation, Certification, and Quality Assurance Institute (ACQUIN).

Internal regulatory documents that specify the Quality Assurance Policy include codes, policies, documented SMK procedures, and supporting provisions and rules. Currently, the university's business processes are regulated by Quality Management System (QMS) procedures approved by the Academic Council (Protocol No. 19 of August 31, 2023) and endorsed by Rector's Order No. 121 of August 31, 2023.

At all levels of the university, there is a systematic and ongoing monitoring process to assess the progress towards achieving strategic and tactical goals across various areas of operation. Each year at the meetings of the Faculty Councils, Academic Council and Rectorate responsible leaders, including vice-rectors, deans, heads of departments, and department heads, present their annual reports on evaluation of implementing these goals and tasks.

With the aim to maintain staff engagement in strategic planning, the following facilitation sessions are annually held at Turan University: "Strategic Development Spiral of Turan University: A New Turn" (January 2020), "University Development Strategy: From Intentions to Results. Development Roadmap 2021-2024" (January 2021), "30 Years of Development: Turan University Vision" (March 2022), and "Blind Spots or Indifference to Common Results: Causes and Consequences" (January 2023).

In the context of fostering a culture of quality development, in 2019, the EFQM standard was introduced and the university conducted its first self-assessment for compliance with the President of Kazakhstan's Quality Model "Altyn Sapa". In 2020, the university renewed its partnership with the Russian Register Certification Association and certified its Quality Management System (QMS) to ISO 9001:2015 standards. That same year, following the President of Kazakhstan's "Altyn Sapa" Award competition, the university won in the category of "Best Service Provider."

Analytical Part

The analysis presented in the evidence section allows us to conclude that the university has its articulated Mission, Vision, Quality Assurance Policy, Development Strategy for 2021-2024, and demonstrates diverse examples of document development across all areas of activity and processes (academic policy, personnel policy, risk management, research and innovation, international cooperation, employment of graduates, etc.). There is an approved institutional procedure governing the development, coordination, and approval of the Strategy and other strategic documents.

The Quality Assurance Policy, Mission, Vision, and Development Strategy are accessible to both internal and external stakeholders and are published on the website. The university's documentation reflects alignment of its core activities with the needs of the state, society, potential employers, students and other stakeholders.

The Quality Assurance Policy encompasses all types of university activities: academic, managerial, research, innovation, experimental, socio-cultural and educational management. Moreover, the integration of teaching and learning, scientific research and innovation development is built upon the university's innovative entrepreneurial ecosystem.

Continuous improvement of the university's internal quality assurance system supports compliance with international quality standards such as ISO 9001:2015, ESG, and accreditation standards. Recognition of the university's commitment to quality improvement is evidenced by its awards from independent international certification bodies.

It is noteworthy that facilitation sessions for university faculty members and staff contribute to the engagement of internal stakeholders in strategic management processes, aligning individual goals and interests with the university's overarching objectives.

The External Evaluation Committee (EEC) concluded that a significant strength of the university lies in the development of a unique Mission, Vision, and Development Strategy based on analysis of internal and external factors.

Firstly, the Strategy is developed in alignment with the goals and objectives outlined in the State Program for Development of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2020-2025, Development Strategy of Almaty till 2050 and the Regional Entrepreneurship Development Program "Almaty Business – 2025".

Secondly, the Strategy incorporates recommendations for ensuring the quality of higher education developed by the European Association for Quality Assurance in Higher Education (ENQA). The document adheres to standards and principles for quality assurance within the European Higher Education Area (ESG).

Thirdly, during the Strategy's development, a thorough market analysis was conducted to position the university within the national and international educational landscapes, including analysis of major competitors, SWOT analysis, risk analysis and identification of key global trends impacting higher education development, all of which influence the university's strategic directions.

Fourthly, the university's strategic goals are formulated based on its Mission and Vision and are structured into 5 main development directions, all with quantifiable indicators.

Fifthly, interviews revealed that the Strategy development process engages not only internal stakeholders but also representatives from the external environment and the real economic sector. This is facilitated through the mechanism of reviewing the Strategy at meetings of the Board of Trustees of the University, which includes representatives from the National Chamber of Entrepreneurs of the Republic of Kazakhstan "Atameken", parliamentarians and business community representatives. Additionally, Strategy discussions and approvals occur within the framework of the university's Academic Council meetings, which include representatives from all groups of interested parties.

Sixthly, strategic development directions are decomposed into tactical and operational plans at the level of faculties and departments, with faculty members and staff having specific performance indicators to measure their participation in Strategy implementation.

Strengths/Best Practices:

The university has demonstrated the development of a unique mission, vision and strategy based on analysis of external and internal factors with extensive involvement of various stakeholders.

The EEC Recommendations:
None.

The EEC conclusions:

Under the "Strategic Development and Quality Assurance" Standard, the university has 1 strong and 6 satisfactory positions.

6.2. "Administration and Management" Standard

✓ *The university carries out management processes, including planning and resource allocation in accordance with its strategy.*
✓ *The university must demonstrate successful operation and improvement of the internal quality assurance system.*
✓ *The university must demonstrate risk management analysis.*
✓ *The university must demonstrate effectiveness analysis of changes.*
✓ *The university must demonstrate analysis of identified discrepancies, implementation of developed corrective and preventive actions.*
✓ *The university must demonstrate management of the educational process through management of educational programs, including assessment of their effectiveness.*
✓ *The university demonstrates development of annual activity plans, including as of faculty members, based on the Strategy.*
✓ *Commitment to quality assurance should apply to any activities performed by contractors and partners (outsourcing), including joint/double degree education and academic mobility implementation.*
✓ *The university must provide evidence of transparency of its management system.*
✓ *The university must ensure the participation of students and faculty members in the activity of collegial governance bodies.*
✓ *The university must demonstrate evidence of openness and accessibility of leaders and administration to students, faculty members, parents, and other stakeholders.*
✓ *The university must demonstrate innovation management, including analysis and implementation of innovative proposals.*
✓ *The university should strive to participate in international, national, and regional professional alliances, associations, etc.*
✓ *The university must provide training for university management, structural units, and educational programs in education management programs.*

✓ *The university should aim for progress achieved since the last external quality assurance procedure to be taken into account in preparation for the next procedure.*

Evidence Part

Planning and resource allocation are carried out in accordance with the strategic development plan indicators across its key directions. Matters related to resource allocation are deliberated upon at Faculty Councils, university management meetings, and departmental meetings. For instance, departments conduct human resources planning annually in June to determine the academic staff needs for organizing competitions to fill vacant academic positions. The planning of qualitative indicators is based on a department's pedagogical workload calculation for the academic year, the number of students and the ratio of academic staff members to students (16:1), as established by the Rector's decree.

Development planning of the educational process in accordance with the needs of the educational programs is carried out through requests from departments for the procurement of equipment, technical means of support, furniture, allocation of space for laboratories, and educational sites.

The university's quality management system (QMS) serves as the basis for its internal quality assurance system, comprising a set of documented QMS procedures supported and specified by internal regulatory documents.

An integral component of the university's quality assurance system is risk management. The corresponding procedure was implemented in 2019, revalidated in 2023. Annually, risk maps for all QMS processes are approved by the Vice-rector. Based on these maps, departments and other units develop risk management plans for the academic year. Risk management activities are conducted continuously. For instance, in the 2023-2024 academic year, 13 new risks were identified, including those related to the "Educational Program Management" process.

Risk management in managing educational programs is conducted in accordance with the "Management of Modular Educational Program" procedure. Threats identified during the SWOT analysis of the development of educational programs are reflected in the department's risk management plans. For example, during the development of the "World Economy" educational program development plan the following threats were identified: 1) "Potential shortage of positions for specialists in the republican, regional, and city labor markets" and 2) "Decreased attractiveness of the educational program to prospective students." Based on this, risks have been identified and documented in risk maps for processes such as "Management of Educational Programs", "Student Enrollment", and "Graduate Employment". Corresponding measures have been developed to minimize or avoid these risks and have been included in the department's Risk Management Action Plan.

Annual planning of activities for all departments is based on the university's strategic development vectors. Goals in the area of quality for the academic year are developed along with corresponding work plans. Conducting assessments of the performance of collegial bodies and senior management is also included in the university's work plans. For instance, the presentation at the Academic Council by Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs with a report on educational activities is stipulated in the Academic Council's work plan. The report from the Department of Quality Management is part of the Academic Activity Report.

Management of non-conformities is regulated by procedures such as "Non-Conforming Product", "Continuous Improvement of QMS", and "Internal Audits". For instance, during an internal audit in January 2023, discrepancies were identified concerning the insufficient informativeness of the educational program document form. The QMS auditor received a suggestion from the Head of the Tourism and Service Department regarding the feasibility of optimizing the form in accordance with EU standards. In February 2023, the QMS Review Group discussed this suggestion and the proposed draft, and developed a new educational program document form based on which programs were developed for the 2023 intake (Minutes of QMS

Review Group Meeting #5 dated 10.02.2023).

The university utilizes outsourcing opportunities to ensure catering services, technical maintenance and repair of buildings and transport, printing services, imposing quality requirements on suppliers' services. Selection of suppliers is conducted based on evaluations of multiple suppliers according to the "procurement" procedure. Requirements are also established for these organizations and individuals partly defined by the terms of the contracts concluded. For instance, when selecting partner universities, accreditation and licenses in the relevant field of study are required; for international professors, academic degrees and scientific publications in indexed databases are necessary.

The university's collegial governance bodies include the Board of Trustees, Academic Council, Rectorate, Quality Management System (QMS), Faculty Council, and Advisor-Curator Council. Stakeholders such as students, employers, and representatives of public organizations are involved in the work of these collegial bodies.

Transparency and openness are ensured through the availability of information about university administration and structure, as well as decisions made by collegial bodies. Information is disseminated through announcements on the website, information boards, LED screens in lobbies, corporate email newsletters, notifications in messenger groups, and announcements via advisor-curators, student council representatives and heads of departments. An overwhelming majority (99%) of staff assess the accessibility of the university administration as "good" or "very good" (according to survey results from the Internal Quality Assurance Commission). Similarly, over 95% of students report a high or very high level of accessibility to their respective deaneries (schools, faculties, departments).

The university actively participates in international, national, and regional professional alliances and associations. These include the Association of Universities of Kazakhstan, the Triple Helix Association in Kazakhstan, the Kazakhstan Marketing Association, the Association of Trade and Industrial Enterprises, the Club of Hoteliers of Kazakhstan Association of Hotels and Restaurants and the European Logistics Association (ELA).

There is a "School of Pedagogical Excellence" at the university, and professional development courses in educational management are organized. Department heads attend courses in ICT, republican conferences and training seminars in management and quality assurance in education. For example, in 2021, to enhance management skills in the digital transformation of higher education, 62 employees participated in an international online internship titled "Higher Education 4.0 Digital Transformation". In October-November 2022, the Rector, Vice-Rectors, and heads of educational programs took part in a practical training on developing educational programs organized by "BTS Education" at the University.

Corporate training for academic staff in document management based on modern quality management principles and ISO 9001:2015 requirements is conducted annually. The Vice-Rector for IT and Data Security and faculty members underwent training on the ISO anti-corruption standard.

Analytical Part

Analysis of the documents and materials presented confirms that the Quality Management System (QMS) of the University serves as the guarantor of education quality and forms the basis for its internal quality assurance system, encompassing educational, scientific, administrative, and economic spheres of the university's activities. The University's business processes are regulated by documented QMS procedures, as well as supported and specified by internal regulatory documents.

The institutional risk management procedure involves annual approval of a risk map for all QMS processes. Risks identified during SWOT analysis are assessed based on their impact on activity quality. Departments and other units then develop risk management plans for the academic

year accordingly.

The organizational framework for departmental activities is based on annual work plans developed according to the University's strategic directions and Quality Assurance Policy objectives. Mechanisms for resource provision are also outlined in corresponding plans aligned with the University's activity directions.

The university has developed procedures for identifying discrepancies and established mechanisms and quality criteria for activities outsourced to third parties. The personnel compositions of collegial governance bodies are approved by the Rector's order. Participation of students, teaching faculty and employer representatives in university collegial governance bodies is ensured. The performance of collegial governance bodies is evaluated through presentation and discussion of respective activity reports, as confirmed by annual work plans of higher-level collegial bodies, which include reviewing these reports.

The university participates in international, national and regional professional alliances and associations. When preparing for the current reaccreditation procedure, the university considered the recommendations received from the previous institutional accreditation and during post-accreditation monitoring. It should be noted that despite having various university partners, opportunities for developing joint and double-degree programs are not effectively utilized.

Particular attention is given to the openness of university management and administration towards students and other stakeholders. The university has established communication mechanisms with students, academic staff members, support personnel and employers through advisory sessions, information boards, the Turan information system, the University's website and the Rector's blog. All Vice-Rectors, including the first Vice-Rector, are available daily for meetings without prior appointment. Students have the opportunity to participate in informal meetings with the Rector ("Dinner with the Rector"). The Committee on Youth Affairs operates for communications with students. There is also an "Ideas Box" where questions, complaints, etc., can be submitted.

The results of surveys conducted by the EEC among academic staff members and students, as well as responses obtained during interviews with these focus groups, confirm the accessibility of university management and administration and their commitment to fostering feedback from the staff and students. This has been recognized by the EEC as a strength of the university.

Significant attention is devoted to training the university's management, structural units and educational programs through educational management programs. In the appendices to the Self-Assessment Report and during interviews with various focus groups, the University provided numerous confirmations of training completion for the University representatives in educational management programs. The themes of these programs cover various aspects of modern university operations: quality assurance, digitalization, anti-corruption measures, and document management. The outcome of this process is not only the development of new competencies among the university executives at different levels but also their application in professional practice.

As a result of educational program training for the university executives in October-November 2022, an innovative educational program "6B11103 - Innovation Management in Tourism and Hospitality" was developed (included as an innovative program in the Register of Educational Programs of Non-State Educational Organizations of the Republic of Kazakhstan).

Strengths/Best Practices:

1. The university has demonstrated evidence of openness and accessibility of its management and administration to students, academic staff, parents and other stakeholders.
2. The university provides training for university management, heads of structural units, and educational programs in educational management programs.

The EEC Recommendations:

None.

The EEC conclusions:

Under the "Administration and Management" Standard, the university has 2 strong and 13 satisfactory positions.

6.3. "Information Management and Reporting" Standard:

✓ *The university must ensure the functioning of a system for collecting, analyzing, and managing information based on the application of modern information and communication technologies and software tools.*
✓ *The university must demonstrate the use of processed, adequate information for effective management of educational programs and improvement of the internal quality assurance system.*
✓ *The university must have a system of regular reporting at all levels of the organizational structure, including assessment of the performance and effectiveness of departments, educational programs, scientific research and their interaction.*
✓ *The university must establish the frequency, forms and methods of assessing the management of educational programs, activities of collegiate bodies and structural units, senior management and implementation of research projects.*
✓ *The university must demonstrate the establishment of procedures and ensure the protection of information, including designating responsible persons for the accuracy and timeliness of information analysis and data provision.*
✓ *An important factor is the involvement of students, academic staff and personnel in the processes of information collection, analysis and decision-making based on it.*
✓ *The university must demonstrate the existence of mechanisms for communication with students, academic staff and other interested parties, including conflict resolution mechanisms.*
✓ *The university must measure the satisfaction levels of academic staff, students and personnel and provide evidence of addressing identified deficiencies.*
✓ *The university must evaluate the performance and effectiveness of its activities, including in terms of educational programs.*
✓ *Information collected and analyzed by the university should take into account:*

- *key performance indicators;*
- *dynamics of the student body in terms of forms and types;*
- *academic performance levels, student achievements, and dropout rates;*
- *student satisfaction with the implementation of educational programs and the quality of education at the university;*
- *availability of educational resources and support systems for students;*
- *employment and career advancement of graduates.*

✓ *Students, academic and other internal stakeholders must document their consent to the processing of personal data.*
✓ *The university must facilitate the provision of all necessary information in relevant scientific areas.*

Evidence Part

To collect and analyze information, the university utilizes various tools and platforms, including website updates, "Turan" information system, LMS Canvas, email, and online survey system.

The main modules of the "Turan" information system include:

1. Admission Committee (applications for admission and formation of first-year student cohorts for all educational programs, applications for accommodation in student dormitories).
2. Personnel Management (personnel records, staffing of academic and administrative staff).
3. Department of Academic Affairs (educational programs, academic schedules, distribution of advisors).
4. Management of Master's and PhD Programs (student registration, educational schedules, academic regulations, academic advising).
5. Financial and Economic Unit (tuition fee control, costs, government educational grants, etc.).
6. Student Service Center (certificates, transcripts, and other student requests).
7. Department (curriculum management, calculation of teaching load, etc.).
8. Dean's Office (student registration, work with academic advisors).

The Information Security Policy (approved by Order No. 156 dated September 20, 2021) establishes a set of rules and procedures ensuring the protection of the university's information

infrastructure. The Department of Software Development and Automation of the IT and Digital Development Department is responsible for the direct organization and effective functioning of the information security system. The university's Information Security Policy defines rules for permissible use of information assets, systems, resources and equipment by employees and students to maintain the necessary level of information security.

Access to information is regulated based on its content and the necessity for performing official duties. Information intended for a broad audience is published on the university's website. Information aimed at improving internal processes or serving as the basis for managerial decisions is provided to internal users through internal channels, including electronic means. Students have access only to their personal profiles, while academic staff members also have limited access. Administrative staff members have access only to data that is defined by their positions.

The evaluation of the effectiveness and performance of the university, faculties, departments and other units is based on the analysis of reports in various areas of activity: educational and methodological, scientific research, educational, financial, administrative and economic, international activities and academic management. Key reports distributed across the university's structural levels are presented as follows: at the university level, the annual public report of Rector on the university's achievements; at the department and division levels, reports from unit leaders; at the faculty level, reports from deans; at the department level, annual reports by direction from the department, individual plan reports from academic staff members and advisor reports for the semester. All reports are reviewed at meetings of collegial bodies involved in assessing the performance and effectiveness of the university's activities. For academic staff members, a rating system for assessing their activities is in operation, which is regulated by the Regulations on the Rating System for Assessing the Performance of the Academic Staff.

The indicators of the effectiveness of the educational program (EP) are established by the documented procedure "Management of Modular Educational Program" and include indicators such as graduates' employment rates, student satisfaction with the content and quality of the educational program, availability of educational materials for disciplines, student participation in scientific events, clubs, sections, research projects, and employer involvement in the development and implementation of the educational program and others.

The participation of key stakeholders in the information gathering processes is based on mechanisms for obtaining feedback from them. The regulation on the organization and conduct of surveys of students, academic staff, administrative staff and employers determines the directions and timing of their participation in surveys. The survey results are published on the website under the section "Institutional Analysis". The survey results are reviewed at meetings of collegial bodies, during which measures are taken to improve the directions of activity. For example, following the survey "Assessment of Employee Satisfaction with Work at the University" conducted from February 28 to March 17, 2023, it was identified that academic staff members feel a lack of material motivation for research, publications, and monographs. To address this issue, Protocol of the Academic Council No. 19 dated August 31, 2023, approved the "Regulation on Incentives for Publication in Journals Indexed by Scopus-Q1/Q2/Q3 for the Academic Year 2023-2024". As a result of this decision, there was an increase in the number of publications during the reporting period.

Communication with participants in the educational process and other stakeholders occurs in the formats of "student-teacher" "student-student", "student-group", and "teacher-teacher" during the academic process as well as extracurricular activities. In cases of complaints or grievances, students have the right to contact their advisor, department chair or faculty dean.

Students, academic and administrative staff members provide their consent for processing of personal data. Students upon admission to the university and staff members upon employment, complete the document "Consent to the Collection, Processing of Personal Data". According to this document, the university's relationships regarding the collection, processing, and protection of personal data comply with the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

To support scientific research informationally, the university's website includes pages for

scientific institutes and scientific journals, where information for authors and key results of scientific activities are published.

Analytical Part
.

Based on the analysis of the presented data, it is evident that the university employs a robust system for gathering, analyzing and managing information using modern ICT tools and software. These tools encompass ASU "Turan", LMS Canvas, email systems, electronic feedback mechanisms from key stakeholders and the university website.

ASU "Turan" serves as a unified database for the university, offering additional information services such as an information portal, student personal accounts, and faculty offices. Information related to implemented educational programs includes detailed profiles of professionals, competency models, curricula and individual study plans.

LMS Canvas facilitates functions for managing learning, fostering collaboration, organizing educational materials, and monitoring student progress to enable timely and informed educational decisions.

The university has implemented stringent procedures for information security, assigning responsible individuals for overseeing these processes. Rules and protocols designed to safeguard the university's IT infrastructure are categorized based on infrastructure components and directions of information security provision.

Both students and academic and administrative staff members explicitly consent to the processing of personal data. Students provide consent upon admission to the university, while academic staff members do so upon employment, through completion of the "Consent to the Collection and Processing of Personal Data" document.

The university operates a structured system of regular reporting across all levels of its organizational hierarchy. These reports undergo review during meetings of collegial bodies tasked with assessing university performance and effectiveness. Based on these discussions, collegial evaluations are conducted, and decisions are made to plan and implement corrective actions aimed at achieving strategic priorities.

The university actively involves students, academic staff, and administrative personnel in the processes of data collection and analysis through regular surveys on various aspects of university activities. Results from these surveys are deliberated upon during meetings of collegial bodies that include representation from diverse stakeholder categories.

Strengths/Best practices:

Not identified.

The EEC Recommendations:
None.

The EEC conclusions:

Under the "Information Management and Reporting" Standard, the university has 17 satisfactory positions.

6.4. "Development and Approval of Educational Programs" Standard

✓ *The university must demonstrate the existence of a documented procedure for development and approval of educational programs at the institutional level.*
✓ *The university must demonstrate that the developed educational programs align with established goals, including intended learning outcomes.*
✓ *The university must demonstrate the existence of a developed graduate profile for each educational program, describing learning outcomes and personal qualities.*

✓ *The university must demonstrate conducting external evaluations of educational programs.*
✓ *The qualification awarded upon completion of the educational program must be clearly defined, explained and correspond to a specific level in the National Qualifications Framework (NQF), QF-EHEA.*
✓ *The university must determine the impact of disciplines and professional practices on the formation of learning outcomes.*
✓ *The ability to prepare students for professional certification is an important factor.*
✓ *The university must provide evidence of the involvement of students, faculty, and other stakeholders in the development of educational programs and ensuring their quality.*
✓ *The university must ensure that the content of educational disciplines and learning outcomes align with the level of education (Bachelor's, Master's, Doctoral).*
✓ *The structure of educational programs should include various types of activities corresponding to the learning outcomes.*
✓ *The presence of joint educational programs with foreign educational organizations is an important factor.*

Evidence Part

The university follows a structured approach to developing and approving educational programs, adhering to the QMS documented procedure "Management of Modular Educational Programs," ratified by the University Academic Council (Protocol No. 19, August 31, 2023). Additionally, Methodological Recommendations for designing modular educational programs were endorsed during the Educational and Methodological Council meeting (Protocol No. 5, January 19, 2023).

To align with strategic goals and stakeholder needs, the university actively involves students and various internal and external stakeholders in educational program development. Academic staff members, students and employers participate in discussions and contribute suggestions during program development, attending governing collegial body meetings as permanent or invited participants. For example, at a meeting of the educational and methodological section of the Department of Information Technology (Protocol No. 1, August 25, 2022), academic staff members, employers and students discussed updates to educational programs and the inclusion of new disciplines in the curriculum.

The Faculty of Economics convened to evaluate the modular educational programs across Bachelor's, Master's, and Doctoral specialties. After comprehensive presentations by faculty members, department heads, external experts, program reviewers, Bachelor's and Master's students, the council decided to recommend to the university's Educational and Methodological Council (EMC) that the Academic Council approve the faculty's educational programs for the 2023-2024 academic year.

Educational program reviews are publicly accessible on the university's website under the "About Us" – "Faculties and Departments" section. For instance, stakeholders can find feedback on the Logistics educational program (EP "Logistics") at https://turan.edu.kz/en/obrprogramms/logistics/ under the Stakeholder Reviews tab. Guidelines for selecting employers involved in developing and assessing educational program quality are outlined in the Methodological Recommendations for Employer Engagement.

The content of educational programs adheres to the respective State Educational Standards (SES) and is operationalized through curricula and syllabi. Student studyload, measured in credits earned throughout the academic year, encompasses theoretical instruction, final assessments and additional learning formats. Attainment of an academic degree requires students to fulfill the prescribed credit requirements. The selection of disciplines and modules within these programs is guided by learning outcomes defined by competencies aligned with the qualification criteria of the National Qualifications Framework (NQF) and the European Qualifications Framework (EQF). Information resources used in program development include professional standards, qualification guides for positions in relevant economic sectors, the Atlas of New Professions and Competencies and qualification criteria listed on employers' websites.

Each educational program incorporates a graduate profile, outlined in the "Qualification Model of the Graduate" section. Modular educational programs are accessible to the public through the university's website under the "Faculties and Departments" section.

Upon completion of Bachelor's, Master's and Doctoral educational programs, graduates obtain qualifications that correspond to Levels 6, 7, and 8 of the National Qualifications

Framework (NQF) and EQF Levels 6-8 of the European Qualifications Framework (EQF).

The educational program (EP) structure at the university encompasses various activities, including theoretical training across core and specialized disciplines, industrial and pre-diploma internships, and final assessments. The content of these disciplines and internships is designed to achieve planned learning outcomes. For instance, in the discipline "Corporate Finance" within the Bachelor's program in "Finance", students delve into topics such as enterprise finance fundamentals, contemporary issues in corporate governance, mathematical principles underlying financial and credit calculations, financial reporting, management of fixed and working capital, and income generation.

Upon successful completion of this discipline, students are equipped to analyze and assess risks, implement strategies to mitigate them, evaluate the effectiveness of financial resource utilization to minimize losses, devise innovative solutions to systemic economic and financial challenges, fulfill professional responsibilities related to ongoing economic activities, and innovate in the development and provision of modern financial and credit products and services.

The educational program "Tourism" exemplifies a pathway where students have the opportunity to achieve professional certification upon graduation. This program incorporates specialized courses such as "Electronic Booking and Reservation Systems in the Service Industry", "Tour Guiding", "Practical Tourism in Kazakhstan", and "Domestic Tourism". The curriculum, assignments, and assessments for these courses are developed in collaboration with industry partners like "Sabre Travel Network Central Asia" and "Almaty/Astana City Tour". Upon completing these courses, students are eligible to take exams and, upon successful completion, obtain internationally recognized certificates from "Sabre Travel Network Central Asia" in reservation systems and from "Almaty/Astana City Tour" in tour guiding.

During the 2022-2023 academic year, preparations were underway for students to sit exams for internationally recognized certificates from "R-keeper, Shelter, StoreHouse". Additionally, third-year students in the "Tourism" and "Restaurant and Hotel Business" programs undergo foundational training in the "Galileo Basic Course" system provided by TravelPort. This certification confirms student' proficiency in GDS booking systems.

In the discipline "1C-ERP" within the "Logistics" educational program, fourth-year students in the Economics Faculty can prepare for exams to obtain internationally recognized certificates in "Production Management", "Merchandise Planning", and "Warehouse and Delivery". Furthermore, graduates of the educational program 6B11301 – "Logistics" can receive a qualification certificate from the European Logistics Association (ELA) upon successful completion of their studies, valid for five years.

Analytical Part

Based on the analysis of the presented documents and materials, it is evident that the university has a documented institutional procedure governing the development and approval of educational programs (EP). The process involves multiple stages of deliberation: initially at the department level through the Department Educational Methodological Council (DEMC) and departmental meetings involving employers and students; subsequently at the faculty level and culminating at the Educational Methodological Council (EMC). Approved EPs are finalized at the Academic Council by the end of the academic year for implementation in the subsequent intake

The content of each EP adheres to the relevant State Educational Standards (SES) and is implemented through structured curricula and programs. Mandatory components are specified by standard curricula and typical educational programs, encompassing core and specialized discipline cycles, elective components, and university-specific subjects. Disciplines and modules are aligned with defined learning outcomes articulated in competencies that correspond to the qualification requirements of the National Qualifications Framework (NQF) and the Occupational Qualifications Requirements (OQR). Reference materials used in EP development include professional standards, qualification handbooks for managers and specialists in relevant sectors,

the Atlas of New Professions and Competencies, and job qualification requirements from employer websites.

Each EP includes a graduate qualification model that integrates professional activities, job functions, qualification criteria, personal and professional competencies, positions, and corresponding qualification levels within the National Qualifications Framework (NQF) and the QF-EHEA. The Educational Model Catalog (CEM) within EP structures specifies modules, disciplines, prerequisites, post-requisites, and workload for each discipline, demonstrating the impact of disciplines and practices on learning outcomes through a clear matrix.

The university demonstrates its commitment to external evaluation of EPs and incorporates evidence of stakeholder participation to ensure and enhance their quality. Documented criteria guide the engagement of external experts based on their experience in relevant professional fields, qualification levels, interest in university graduates and departments, and experience in evaluating theses, projects, and dissertations.

Several EPs at the university include provisions for preparing students for professional certification. An essential criterion for EP effectiveness, as defined by the university's documented procedures (specifically point 8.4 of the 'Management of MEP' procedure), is the establishment of joint educational programs (JEPs) with international partners. Procedures for developing JEPs, criteria for selecting partner universities, and protocols for concluding agreements on JEPs are outlined in the "International Cooperation" and "Implementation of JEPs and Double Degree Programs" procedures.

While faculty reports from the Academic Methodological Council (AMC) highlight ongoing discussions and partnerships for JEPs and double degree programs with international universities, formal documentary evidence such as contracts or agreements was not presented during the analysis. Interviews with department heads and EP management revealed that discussions with various international partners are underway for potential program launches.

Given these findings, it is imperative for the university administration and individual EPs to organize and formalize their efforts in developing and launching JEPs and double degree programs with international partners, ensuring structured progress and eventual implementation.

Strengths/Best Practices:

Not identified.

The EEC Recommendations:

1 The university administration is tasked with conducting a thorough assessment of the potential of educational programs (EPs) to evaluate their feasibility for scaling up to Joint Educational Programs (JEPs) and Double Degree Programs (DDPs) with international partners. Following this analysis, compile a selection of the most promising EPs suitable for the development of JEPs and DDPs with international partners. Deadline: October 1, 2024.

2 The university administration is responsible for creating detailed roadmaps aimed at establishing Joint Educational Programs (JEPs) and Double Degree Programs (DDPs) in collaboration with international partners for the identified promising EPs. These roadmaps must be developed and finalized by December 31, 2024.

The EEC conclusions:

Under the "Development and Approval of Educational Programs" Standard, the university has 10 satisfactory positions and 1 position that requires improvement.

6.5. "Continuous Monitoring and Periodic Assessment of Educational Programs" Standard

✓ *The university must demonstrate the existence of a documented procedure for conducting monitoring and periodic assessment of educational programs (EPs) to achieve EP goals. The results of these procedures are aimed at continuously improving EPs.*
✓ *The university must ensure the review of the content and structure of EPs while considering changes in the labor market, employer requirements and societal demands.*
✓ *Monitoring and periodicassessment of EPs should cover:*

  o *Program content in light of the latest scientific advancements in specific disciplines to ensure the relevance of the taught material.*
  o *Changes in societal needs and the professional environment.*
  o *Workload, academic performance and graduation rates of students.*
  o *Effectiveness of student assessment procedures.*
  o *Expectations, needs, and satisfaction of students with EPs.*
  o *Educational environment and support services, their alignment with EP goals.*

✓ *The university must provide the evidence of students, employers and other stakeholders' involvement in the review of EPs.*
✓ *All stakeholders must be informed of any planned or implemented actions regarding EPs. All changes made to EPs must be published.*
✓ *Support services must ensure identification and fulfillment of the needs of various student groups.*

Evidence part

Quality assurance at the university is maintained through a process-oriented approach outlined in existing regulatory documents governing EP monitoring. These documents define the structure and content quality of EPs, development plans for EPs, and stakeholder satisfaction (including employers, students, and faculty) with educational services. Changes to EPs are initiated by employers, students, and faculty in accordance with the "Management of EP" Regulation.

Feedback from employers, students, and faculty is gathered through annual sociological surveys, roundtable discussions, and meetings. Analysis of EP development plans and monitoring systems is conducted collaboratively with employers. The assessment of students' educational achievements spans from initial levels to the formation of competitive specialists, evaluated through regular stakeholder surveys, active employer engagement on quality assurance, and an internal university quality monitoring system.

Suggestions from students and stakeholders are documented in detailed meeting minutes, and changes are incorporated into EPs, Curriculum Development Plans (KEDs), and Educational Methodological Council (EMCD) deliberations. During visits by the External Expert Commission (EEC) to practice bases and meetings with employers, graduates' preparedness, professional skills, innovative approaches, and application of existing competencies in professional contexts are noted.

Monitoring and evaluation requirements for EPs are stipulated in the Academic Policy, supported by the Quality Assurance Policy and Strategy, and reflected in the regulations of collegiate bodies responsible for educational quality control. The university's activities are reported annually by departments and faculties, documented in meeting minutes and integrated into EP development plans.

Assessment of EP acquisition levels aligns with procedures such as "Assessment of Learning Outcomes", regulations for ongoing monitoring of student performance, and guidelines for thesis/project evaluations, Master's theses/projects, and professional practices. The university conducts biannual internal audits of its Quality Management System (QMS) to ensure compliance across all departments, with audit programs and criteria developed for monitoring purposes.

The university diligently oversees the QMS performance. Biannual internal audits are conducted to assess the operations of all university departments. These audits involve developing and implementing audit programs with established monitoring and evaluation criteria. The university acknowledges ongoing enhancements in documentation and document management processes across most departments, with notable improvements observed particularly within these areas.

Students and stakeholders have access to educational process documents on the university website (including MEPs, EP development plans, academic calendars, study schedules, exams, and project defenses) and on the LMS Canvas (EMCDs and educational materials).

Each student can track their EP progress through personal pages on LMS Canvas and ASU "Turan". Support services at the university are designed to promptly identify and meet the needs of various student groups.

Analytical part

Following the EEC's visit to the graduating department and document review, it was confirmed that the university conducts ongoing monitoring and periodic assessment of educational programs (EPs). The analysis of performance also assesses the effectiveness of student assessment procedures, including a review of assessment forms aligned with discipline learning outcomes after each examination session during department meetings. Student progress and graduation data are analyzed using ASU "Turan" electronic portal data.

Based on interviews with heads of structural units, department heads and academic staff, the EEC observed that EP heads, typically department heads or academic staff, lack sufficient information regarding their appointment process, requirements, scope of responsibilities, rights and functional duties associated with their roles.

The curriculum is structured to meet employer competency requirements, emphasizing practical training alongside academic components in each EP. Elective disciplines are selected based on comprehensive analysis of labor market demands, incorporating current trends in scientific advancement.

Mechanisms for assessing student satisfaction with EP training include discussions held during department meetings, the educational and methodological counci, and the university's Academic Council. Feedback from employers and students is integrated into these discussions to ensure thorough evaluation. An annual student survey collects reliable feedback on educational service quality, deliberated at faculty meetings to determine necessary improvements.

To ensure effective implementation and foster an optimal learning environment, the department conducts monitoring, evaluation and review of EPs. An annual extended departmental meeting assesses EP relevance with active stakeholder participation. Involvement of students and graduates identifies their needs, facilitating proposals for new learning outcomes and competencies. Employer participation identifies emerging competencies and expectations within the professional community, supporting updates to course/module content.

However, NAAR experts noted that the university website inadequately reflects planned and implemented EP actions for internal and external stakeholders. Regarding the EP "6B06103 - Intelligent Robotics" (Faculty of Economics), the EEC experts suggest the university administration reassess its implementation within the Faculty of Digital Technologies and Art to ensure alignment with specialist training direction.

Based on information provided to the EEC experts, the university website lacks integration of student assessment policy with learning outcomes (competencies). Additionally, discrepancies were noted for the EP "Tourism" between approval dates recorded in the Academic Council's EP registry (23.02.2023, protocol No. 13) and the EHEA registry (22.02.2023). The learning outcomes matrix for the EP "Tourism" available at [link] aligns with outcomes 2, 3, and 4. Some EPs are developed based on multiple professional standards (e.g., EP "6B11101 Tourism" based on 8 professional standards), prompting the need for explanatory information clarifying which disciplines cover each standard, specific student learning paths to acquire related skills and competencies, and how these pathways integrate into individual learning pathways.

Strengths/Best Practices:

Not identified.

The EEC Recommendations:

1. The university administration is tasked with developing a mechanism to publish information on the official university website regarding any planned or implemented actions related to EPs (plans, reports, protocols), specifying all involved stakeholders and approving an internal regulatory document. Decisions regarding changes in the structure and content of EPs must be promptly published and accessible to all stakeholders on the university's website within 10 days of such changes. Deadline: before the start of the 2024-2025 academic year.

2. The head of the EP "6B11101 Tourism" is required to align the date of approval of the EP at the Academic Council with the EHEA registry. Deadline: by September 1, 2024.

3. The head of the EMW department should incorporate or enhance the corresponding section/item in the EP, which includes the matrix illustrating the relationship between professional standards and educational disciplines/modules. Deadline: by September 1, 2024.

4. The relevant department should develop or enhance the corresponding internal document that defines the procedure for appointing, requirements, scope of responsibilities, rights, and functional duties of EP heads. Deadline: by September 1, 2024.

5. EP heads are instructed to clearly indicate in the syllabi the alignment of student assessment policies with learning outcomes (competencies). The head of the EMW department should revise or supplement the internal regulatory document on syllabus development accordingly. Deadline: by September 1, 2024.

The EEC conclusions:

Under the "Continuous Monitoring and Periodic Assessment of Educational Programs" Standard, the university has 10 satisfactory positions and 1 position that requires improvement.

6.6. "Student-Centered Learning, Teaching, and Assessment" Standard

- ✓ *The university must respect and pay attention to various groups of students and their needs, providing them with flexible learning paths.*
- ✓ *The university must ensure the use of diverse teaching and learning methods.*
- ✓ *The university must demonstrate the presence of a feedback system on the use of different teaching methods and assessment of learning outcomes.*
- ✓ *An important factor is the presence of original research in the field of teaching methodology of academic disciplines.*
- ✓ *The university must demonstrate support for student autonomy while simultaneously providing guidance and assistance from teachers.*
- ✓ *The university must demonstrate the presence of procedures for responding to student complaints.*
- ✓ *The university must ensure consistency, transparency and objectivity in the mechanism for assessing learning outcomes, including an appeals process.*
- ✓ *The university must ensure that the procedures for assessing student learning outcomes align with planned learning outcomes and program goals. Criteria and assessment methods must be published in advance.*
- ✓ *The university must define mechanisms to ensure that every graduate achieves the intended learning outcomes and ensure the completeness of their formation.*
- ✓ *Assessors must be proficient in modern methods of assessing learning outcomes and regularly update their qualifications in this area.*

Evidence part

At Turan University, students across diverse backgrounds benefit from equal educational opportunities within all educational programs (EPs), facilitated by a system of grants and discounts that promotes inclusive education (Sections 2.9.2-2.9.4 of the Rules).

The university extends specialized support to three student categories:

1. Talented students;

2. Students with special educational needs (SEN);
3. Students from socially vulnerable groups.

Within the EPs, students from all categories have access to flexible learning paths through elective modules in their respective fields of study, entrepreneurial courses, and language classes (English, Chinese, Turkish). Certified courses are also available. For instance, within the "Restaurant and Hotel Business" EP, students can pursue professional programs such as R-kipper, Starhouse, and Shelter. In the discipline of "Electronic Booking and Reservation Systems in Tourism", students learn the GDS SABRE program for managing air travel bookings and sales. In the "Accounting" EP, students master certified courses in 1C Accounting. In the Master's program for "Information Systems", disciplines like "Machine Learning" and "Statistical Data Analysis Systems (in Python)" are studied through the Coursera online platform, leading to certification.

The university emphasizes choice not only in academic pursuits but also in practical training placements and a variety of physical education options, including tourism-sport training, volleyball, basketball, football, boxing, and rhythmic gymnastics.

To ensure equitable opportunities and cater to individual learning needs, including the pursuit of additional disciplines and resolution of academic obligations, Turan University offers a summer semester. This allows students to enroll in supplementary courses such as the "Summer School for Entrepreneurs" and additional language classes for IELTS preparation. The university facilitates language choice within its trilingual framework and offers a second foreign language option in programs like TS, Tourism, IR, and Restaurant and Hotel Business.

All students can participate in competitions associated with the AM programs, with details provided on the university's website.

Turan University features an inclusive infrastructure with designated library spaces, ramps, elevators, and accessible parking for individuals with disabilities. Dormitory accommodations and complimentary internet access are available for students from out-of-town or orphaned backgrounds.

In 2019, Turan University developed the Regulation on Ensuring Inclusive Education Conditions, and since 2020, the Support Center for Students with Special Educational Needs has been operational. A memorandum outlining the organization of education for students with special educational needs has been formulated and approved by the Academic Methodological Council.

The departmental academic staff has prioritized the integration of creative and innovative methods into the educational process. Over the past five years, they have utilized a variety of lecture formats, including problem-based, multimedia, error-planned lectures, and lecture-discussions. Additionally, they employ diverse approaches, methodologies, technologies, techniques, and practical exercises such as creative tasks, small group work, collaborative learning, role-playing, business games, case studies, master classes, situational analysis, and discussions. Noteworthy active and innovative teaching methods that have been implemented include the flipped classroom method, case analysis method, discussion method, lecture-conversation, visualization lecture, brainstorming, project method, among others. Each discipline outlines its teaching forms and methods in the syllabus, and assignments are detailed on the LMS Canvas platform.

To track academic staff satisfaction with methodological innovations, department meetings are conducted at the end of each semester. These meetings include discussions on open classes and reciprocal visits to analyze the application of current and active teaching methods. Additionally, surveys titled "Teacher Through the Eyes of Students" are administered to monitor the

effectiveness and efficiency of implementing innovations and technical teaching methods, and to assess student satisfaction with the educational process. Based on the feedback analysis, student preferences and needs are considered, guiding decisions that influence the development of educational programs.

Students also engage in feedback through the Canvas educational platform, facilitating two-way communication among participants in the educational process via the "Discussion" tab and the "Comment" feature. Furthermore, students can communicate directly with Rector through his blog and the university's corporate email (Rector's Office), receiving detailed responses.

An essential aspect involves the integration of original research in the teaching methodologies of educational disciplines within academic programs. These have been deliberated in methodological seminars, conferences, Academic Methodological Council meetings and in departments of teaching staff meetings.. They have been published in various publications, including the "Bulletin of Turan University" and in the specialized open-access scientific and practical journal "Eurasian Journal of Current Research in Psychology and Pedagogy".

According to the thematic publication plan for 2022-2023, a total of 56 publications were scheduled, comprising 3 textbooks, 46 teaching aids, 4 teaching and methodological guides, 2 practical manuals, and 1 compilation, all of which were released within specified timelines. For instance, Professor Kubekov B.S. utilized ontological engineering and competency-project technology to develop and structure educational content.

Based on an innovative learning model, a novel approach to implementing the paradigm of "Educational Engineering" has been proposed. Monographs have been prepared on this subject: "Organization and presentation of educational knowledge based on ontology". Almaty: SP "LP-Zhasulan", 2019 - 336 pages; "Innovative learning model based on ontological engineering and competency-project technology" (2024).

Professor Asimov M.A., from the Department of Psychology, has introduced the new method "Self-control". This discipline is incorporated into the educational program 7M03108 - "Clinical Psychology". Innovations within the "Translation Studies" educational program are implemented within specialized disciplines such as "Translation Services" and "Professional Translation Programs". These courses integrate innovative tools in translation activities, including tiflocommenting of text excerpts (standard and cognitive), utilization of dictionary shells like StarDict and GoldenDict, and electronic dictionaries from publishers Multilex (MediaLingva) and Polyglossum for various translation types, alongside computer programs SmartCat and Trados.

The university encourages student initiatives by maintaining an open-door policy that allows for consultation and support. The university facilitates the development of student business ideas through the coworking hub and business incubator activities.

At the department level, there is regular monitoring of the effectiveness and impact of new teaching methods on the educational process. This includes assessing student performance, their satisfaction with the educational process and considering employer feedback and employment outcomes.

An educational innovation involves integrating specific disciplines into the curriculum with dedicated subject-specific staff members on the Coursera platform. For instance, in programs like "7M06101 – Information Systems" and "7M06103 – Information Systems", students study disciplines such as "Machine Learning", "Statistical Data Analysis Systems (in Python)", and "Intelligent Data Analysis and Visualization" (Protocol No. 10 dated June 22, 2023). Similarly, these disciplines are offered in Master's program.

As per the Academic Policy, the grading criteria for students are detailed in the syllabi. The fundamental principles of assessment are also outlined in the freshman guidebook. The academic calendar, available on the website, encompasses all assignment types and the academic year schedule.

Final assessment (interim certification) takes the form of exams, including computer-based

tests and oral and written examinations. If a student disagrees with their final assessment results, they may lodge an appeal by the following working day after the exam.

During the examination period (interim certification), the head of the university forms an appeals committee comprising academic staff members whose expertise aligns with the disciplines under appeal.

The Appeals Committee reviews appeals and session protocols document recommendations for assessing learning outcomes in the appealed subjects.

The Appeals Committee conducts a review of appeals, and meeting minutes document suggestions for assessing the learning outcomes in the disciplines under appeal. The student's academic progress in their chosen program is measured based on their Grade Point Average (GPA).

The criteria and methods for assessment are also defined within the Educational and Methodical Complex of Disciplines (EMCD): the course assessment guidelines are specified in the syllabi and the assessment policies for individual assignments are detailed in the "Assignments for Current and Interim Control" section. These requirements are available on LMS Canvas under the "Assignments" tab. There is considerable emphasis on ensuring the quality of assignment assessments and maintaining a standard distribution of grades.

Outcomes from sessions are scrutinized during departmental meetings and assessed by the Educational and Methodological Council (EMC). Seminars are arranged for academic staff members to address assessment criteria. Expert groups comprising experienced staff members within departments ensure alignment between course objectives and learning outcomes. These experts complete the Quality Management System Form for Course Materials developed by the QMS Working Group in 2020.

As part of the School of Pedagogical Excellence, annual courses on Pedagogical Competence (PC) are offered to academic staff members. In the academic years 2019-2020 and 2020-2021, two seminars were held where academic staff members were trained in developing educational achievement metrics for students. Within the School of Pedagogical Excellence, special training sessions were scheduled from January 8 to 12, 2024 to equip academic staff with skills in designing assessment criteria for subsequent integration into the educational process or for refinement in the spring semester.

Given that a student-centered approach emphasizes student accountability for their education, the university's Academic Policy establishes specific measures for students who do not meet the intended learning outcomes.

Analitical part

The Accreditation Commission verified that Turan University implements student-centered education emphasizing personalized learning and active student engagement in acquiring knowledge, thereby enhancing the effectiveness and quality of the educational process. Each educational program (EP) provides students with access to syllabi, the Educational and Methodical Complex of Disciplines (EMCD), scientific and educational literature, methodological materials, and other informational resources. Additionally, students benefit from consultations with academic staff (AS) and guidance from advisor-curators.

Interviews with various focus groups revealed that advisor-curators effectively support students in selecting disciplines, managing academic studyload, choosing research topics, arranging internships and more. This involvement also fosters the development of students' social skills and engagement in collegiate activities such as the Academic Council, Youth Affairs Committee, Student Council, and various events.

Although research in teaching methodologies within educational disciplines is recognized as crucial, the Accreditation Commission highlighted its uneven representation across all educational programs.

In interviews with students, graduates, and employers, there was consistent feedback

advocating for practical orientation of classes and provision of assignments directly aligned with professional requirements.

Survey results from students indicate high satisfaction levels:

- 65.1% expressed complete satisfaction with the relevance of material presented by academic staff, reflecting the latest advancements in science and practice.
- 63.9% were completely satisfied with the fairness of assessments measuring knowledge, skills, and educational achievements, with only 0.9% indicating dissatisfaction.
- 65.0% reported complete satisfaction with the clarity and comprehensibility of assessment criteria used by academic staff.
- 65.1% were completely satisfied with the overall teaching methods employed.

Strengths/Best Practices:

Not identified.

The EEC Recommendations:

1. Enhance the quantity of academic staff's original research endeavors in teaching methodology under the paradigm of student-centered learning. Deadline: January 1, 2025.
2. Incorporate manuals detailing the application of personal teaching methodologies into the
3. Maintain the organization of conferences and seminars annually to facilitate the exchange of experiences and presentation of research findings on implementation of personal teaching methodologies in specialized disciplines, aiming for feedback and continuous enhancement.

The EEC conclusions:

Under the "Student-Centered Learning, Teaching and Assessment of Performance" Standard, the university has 10 satisfactory positions.

6.7. "Students" Standard

✓ *The university is required to articulate a policy that guides the development of students from admission through graduation and ensures transparency in its processes. It must define, approve, and publicly disclose procedures that govern the entire student lifecycle*
✓ *Special adaptation and support programs must be provided for newly enrolled and international students.*
✓ *The university must demonstrate adherence to the Lisbon Recognition Convention, including implementing mechanisms to recognize academic mobility outcomes and achievements from formal and informal learning.*
✓ *Collaboration with other educational institutions and national centers of the European Network of Information Centres for Academic Recognition and Mobility (ENIC/NARIC) is necessary to ensure consistent recognition of qualifications.*
✓ *Efforts must be made to facilitate both internal and external student mobility, as well as to assist students in securing external study grants.*
✓ *The university must prioritize securing internships for students, supporting graduate employment, and maintaining alumni connections.*
✓ *Graduates must be furnished with documentation verifying their qualifications, detailing attained learning outcomes, and providing the context, content, and completion status of their education.*
✓ *A mechanism for monitoring graduates' employment and professional activities must be established and demonstrated by the university.*
✓ *Active encouragement must be given to students to engage in self-directed learning and extracurricular development alongside their formal studies.*
✓ *The presence of a robust alumni association is a critical consideration.*
✓ *The university must have a mechanism in place to support gifted students effectively.*

Evidence part

The university's approach to student body formation includes admitting applicants who are well-prepared for university education, actively selecting the specialization within their chosen educational program (EP) and achieving required scores on National Testing (ENT) or Complex Testing (KT) exams. Admission of foreign citizens and individuals with prior higher education is

based on interview outcomes. Candidates for Master's and PhD programs must meet specified scores on foreign language and specialization exams. Matters concerning student body composition and admission outcomes are deliberated during departmental and rectorate meetings.

An analysis of university admissions over the past 5 years indicates growth in the undergraduate student body. The dynamics of maintaining enrollment levels for Master's and PhD programs show some fluctuations. There has also been an improvement in the quality of students, particularly those sponsored by the state.

Currently, the overall student retention rates are 81% for undergraduate EPs, 104% for Master's programs and 93% for PhD programs. The increase in student enrollment is attributed to new admissions and transfers from other universities, highlighting the popularity of the university's EPs. The university is renowned for the high quality of its student body, demonstrated by numerous successes in national and international competitions and Olympiads.

The university aims to attract first-year students who possess a strong foundation in their respective fields. To achieve this objective, the Admission Committee implements a range of marketing initiatives:

To support newly enrolled and international students, the university hosts an orientation week distinct from the first semester. During this period, freshmen engage with university administration, familiarize themselves with campus services, obtain login credentials for accessing Turan University Information System, LMS Canvas and the E-library, undergo language proficiency assessment tets to determine their proficiency level, enroll in courses, and navigate the Student Guide available on the university website. Advisors during the orientation program acquaint students with the Academic Policy, educational programs (EP), academic calendar, class schedules, internal regulations and residential guidelines for student dormitories. Additionally, students are introduced to the Student Code. Special attention is provided to international students; for example, Chinese students receive guidance from a faculty member proficient in Chinese – Senior Lecturer Shiderina from the "Department of Regional Studies and International Relations".

The university's Academic Policy adheres to international standards in education quality, including the "Lisbon Recognition Convention". The process of recognizing prior learning outcomes is detailed in the "Student Body Formation" procedure, encompassing Credit Transfer Certificate (CTC) protocols for educational disciplines and Academic Difference. Previous achievements are considered for admissions to abbreviated educational programs, transfers, reinstatements, academic mobility, and admission of foreign students. Academic differences in study plans are determined by reviewing the list of studied disciplines, their programs, and the academic hours or credits documented in the transcript or certificate issued to individuals who have not completed education according to the university's educational program (UEP) and prerequisites. If the academic difference includes disciplines not scheduled for the current academic period, students are enrolled in them during the summer semester, following the logical sequence of study.

During the reporting period, the university secured a total of 225 contracts with international organizations, universities from distant and neighboring countries, and Kazakhstani universities. The scope of international cooperation in 2023 extended to 39 countries. For the academic year 2023-2024, the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan allocated the University 6 grant-funded opportunities for studying abroad in European and Southeast Asian countries, totaling 9,179,254 tenge. Partner universities abroad offering tuition-free education for a semester include Woosong University and SolBridge Business School in Daejeon, South Korea; Ondokuz Mayis University in Samsun, Turkey; the Maritime Academy in Slupsk, Poland; Rzeszow University of Technology in Rzeszow, Poland; and Lawrence Technological University in Detroit, USA.

To support academic mobility (AM), the university employs information boards across its departments, distributes relevant documents and information among departments and units, and shares announcements regarding competitions and other updates on its website and social media

platforms. The university is actively enhancing its reputation within the international education community, attracting considerable interest from foreign students.

In the academic years 2021-2022 and 2022-2023, the university hosted 93 and 97 international students respectively, with the number rising to 121 for the 2023-2024 academic year. These students come from diverse countries such as the USA, Armenia, Germany, Canada, Kyrgyzstan, China, Uzbekistan, Russia, Tajikistan, Ukraine, and the UK. Additionally, in 2023, 22 international students are enrolled in the preparatory faculty, originating from Nigeria, Germany, the USA, France, China and Afghanistan.

From 2019 to 2024, a total of 128 undergraduate students participated in outbound academic mobility (AM), including 123 through external mobility and 5 through internal mobility. Similarly, 83 master's students engaged in AM, with 79 using external mobility and 4 internal mobility opportunities. In the 2023-2024 academic year, 6 students pursued studies abroad with grants from the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, while 10 students benefited from the Zero Grant program. Two students extended their studies into the spring semester of that academic year.

Efforts to expand exchange programs offering tuition-free options involved negotiations with various foreign universities during this period. The university successfully signed cooperation agreements for exchange programs and internships with four universities. Negotiations were also held with Zukurova University's international office to increase grant-funded placements under the Mevlana program. Moreover, a meeting took place on February 25, 2020, with the French consortium Leonardo da Vinci Group, Graduate School of Engineering, and Graduate School of Management (France), focusing on the implementation of collaborative programs, including AM initiatives.

Throughout this period, the university welcomed 7 students through incoming AM programs, including 2 via external mobility and 5 through internal mobility arrangements.

Professional internship is a mandatory component of higher and postgraduate professional education programs at Turan University, concluding the academic year with practical training. Presently, there are more than 200 facilities available for these internships.

Turan University conducts annual surveys among employers and graduating students to evaluate satisfaction with internship conditions and content, as well as employers' satisfaction with students and university instructors. Since 2018, students from all courses have participated in online surveys to gauge their satisfaction with the organization and execution of professional internships. Results from these surveys, focusing on student and employer satisfaction with internship conditions and content, as well as with university instructors, are deliberated annually during meetings of the university's collegial bodies and at conferences dedicated to professional practice.

In an effort to bolster these measures, the university has introduced a specialized suite of educational programs known as the "Career Readiness Program" on the Coursera MOOC platform for its students.

Since January 2019, Turan University has operated a Student Service Center dedicated to providing efficient and high-quality service to students under a unified "one-stop shop" approach. Beginning in 2020, students have had the ability to submit online requests for documents confirming their education, academic performance and book orders.

Analytical part

The External Expert Commission (EEC) has affirmed that student enrollment planning is guided by several factors: projecting the demands of the republican and regional labor markets for specialists according to the quantities and fields of study specified in the state license for educational activities; quotas and grants allocated by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan (MES RK); the university's faculty capacity; and the availability of necessary facilities for the educational process.

Based on interviews with focus groups, it is noteworthy that employers generally highly appreciate the level of theoretical and practical training, communication skills, discipline and overall professional preparedness of university graduates.Students also express a high level of satisfaction with the organization of departmental activities during their practical training.

The EEC Commission has ensured that the registry of internship bases is regularly reviewed through continuous monitoring, prioritizing potential employers with a stable economic position and high reputation.

Upon completion of their final professional internships, many students receive job offers from their internship sites. Other students have opportunities for employment through job fairs, career days, employer meetings, the Instagram @turan_career_center, assistance from the Career and Leadership Center (https://turan.edu.kz/ru/career-and-leadership-center/), and involvement with the Turan-Zerde Alumni Association.

The Employment Center provides targeted support for job placement among graduates, particularly those who have benefited from state grants.

Talented students are identified through diverse competitions and Olympiads, benefiting from extensive support provided by the university administration, including scholarships, tuition discounts (ranging from 10% to 100%) and financial aid for participation in international competitions, Olympiads, and sports events.

Strengths/Best Practices:

1. The university fosters an environment conducive to offering students internship opportunities, aiding graduates in securing employment, and maintaining ongoing connections with them.

2. An alumni association is actively run by the university.

3. The university has devised a framework to nurture talented students, facilitating their growth and ensuring they have the essential conditions for self-fulfillment and a prosperous career.

The EEC Recommendations:

Diversify the range of programs available for both internal and external academic mobility of students within the educational programs (EP). Deadline: September 1, 2025.

The EEC conclusions:

Under the "Students" Standard, the university of education has 3 strong positions and 8 satisfactory positions.

6.8. "Academic Staff" Standard

✓ *The university must have an objective and transparent personnel policy that includes recruitment, professional growth and staff development, ensuring the professional competence of the entire faculty.*
✓ *The university must have clear, transparent, and objective criteria for hiring employees, appointing to positions, promotions, and dismissals, and must adhere to them in its operations.*
✓ *The university must demonstrate the alignment of its faculty potential with the university's development strategy and the specifics of educational programs.*
✓ *The university must demonstrate the evolution of the role of educators in transitioning to student-centered learning.*
✓ *The university must define the contribution of its academic staff to the implementation of the university's development strategy and other strategic documents.*
✓ *The university must provide opportunities for career advancement and professional development of its staff, including young professionals.*
✓ *The university must engage practitioners from relevant industries in teaching.*
✓ *The university must demonstrate motivation for the professional and personal development of its staff, including recognition for integrating research and education and applying innovative teaching methods.*
✓ *Active application of information and communication technologies in the educational process (e.g., online learning, e-portfolios, MOOCs, etc.) is an important factor.*
✓ *The university must demonstrate a commitment to developing academic mobility, attracting the best international and domestic educators.*
✓ *The university can demonstrate the involvement of its academic staff in society (the role in the education system, contribution to science, regional development, creation of cultural environment, participation in exhibitions, creative competitions, charity programs, etc.).*

Evidence part

Staff recruitment at Turan University begins with an assessment of educational program needs, followed by the announcement of competitions to fill available positions. During accreditation periods, candidate selection adheres to the Regulations on Competitive Recruitment of Academic Staff, 3rd Edition, dated December 4, 2018, and 4th Edition, approved by Rector's Order No. 156 on September 20, 2021 (with the latest amendments on May 5, 2023), in addition to vacancies advertised on the university's official website.

The qualifications and number of academic staff align with the requirements of Bachelor's, Master's and PhD programs, ensuring compliance with licensing standards. Key indicators of academic staff include academic degrees, relevant practical and teaching experience, emplyment records in current roles, engagement in scientific and methodological initiatives, research work and others. The recruitment process for academic staff involves rigorous compliance checks, ongoing assessment of quantity and quality and continuous monitoring and assessment of teaching activities bythe university administration.

New academic staff members undergo competitive selection processes. The selection committee members are appointed by Rector through decisions made by the Academic Council. Initially, applicant documents are screened to ensure they meet qualification standards. The committee evaluates candidates based on their qualifications and pedagogical expertise, assessing their ability to contribute effectively to educational programs and support strategic goals aligned with the university's innovative initiatives. In 2023, a standardized "Resume of Academic Staff" format was introduced to enhance the comprehensive assessment of candidates.

Turan University's academic staff policy emphasizes transparency and effectiveness, with clear criteria for management availabilty, incentivizing academic performance, fostering professional growth and ensuring unrestricted access to university resources for academic staff. Presently, the university employs 448 academic staff members, including 338 permanent staff (75% academic staff), all meeting requisite qualification standards. Among permanent staff, 61% hold advanced academic degrees: 34 are Doctors of Science, 92 are Candidates of Science, and 39 hold PhDs. The university's personnel practices align closely with its strategic priorities.

New staff members are recruited through competitive processes. Selection Committee Members are appointed by Rector's Order based on decisions of the Academic Council. At the initial stage, applicant documents are reviewed for compliance with qualification requirements. The selection committee evaluates the qualification characteristics and pedagogical expertise of candidates through presentations on educational program projects, examines the applicant's personal record, highlighting experience in entrepreneurial and project activities, readiness (ability) to mentor student START-UPs, aligning with the strategic goals of the innovative entrepreneurial university. In 2023, a standardized "Resume of Academic Staff" document format was developed to ensure informative and comprehensive candidate information.

The university's HR policy is effective and transparent, clearly reflecting criteria for leadership accessibility, incentivizing academic staff performance, professional competence, and self-improvement, as well as ensuring academic staff's unrestricted access to university resources. Currently, the university employs 448 faculty members, of whom 338 are full-time (75% academic staff), meeting qualification requirements. Among full-time staff, 61% hold academic degrees: 34 are Doctors of Science, 92 are Candidates of Science, and 39 hold PhDs.

The university's HR policy is implemented in accordance with the main priorities of its Strategy.

The rights and responsibilities of academic staff members are defined in job descriptions, which undergo periodic updates to meet current requirements. All personnel procedures are documented in orders that are promptly communicated to all employees. Competency standards for academic staff members are defined in the Regulations on Academic Staff, detailing the qualifications necessary for positions at Turan University.

To enhance teaching quality and foster closer integration with industry, the university engages practitioners and hosts guest lectures with business professionals. Notably, these practitioners include both full-time academic staff members and part-time staff members with their respective fields of expertise. Selection of practitioner staff members adheres to the university's qualification criteria. Currently, 75% of the university's academic staff possess practical work experience in their respective fields of expertise.

Professional development of academic staff and employees are organized by various university structures (Continuous Education Institute, Educational and Methodological Work Department, department units) in different Kazakhstani and international universities and organizations, funded both by the university and from personal resources.

Under the university's "Vectors of Internationalization" strategy, Turan University actively engages foreign lecturers and experts to conduct training sessions for academic staff, deliver guest lectures to students, and facilitate meetings with international organizations. These organizations also recruit students for participation in summer schools, internships abroad, and cultural exchange programs. When inviting foreign scholars, department heads adhere to specific criteria, including:

- Holding an MSc, MBA, MA, PhD, or equivalent doctoral degree
- Minimum 5 years of teaching experience and 10 years of professional experience
- Recent publications in scientific and professional journals with significant impact factors
- Stay duration of foreign specialists ranging from 2 to 4 weeks

Demonstrating consistent progress in international mobility initiatives, the university annually participates in programs by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, aimed at funding the academic mobility of foreign specialists to enhance teaching practices. Between 2019 and 2023, the university secured 12,881 thousand tenge in budgetary funding to attract foreign professors.

Furthermore, the university's academic staff actively collaborates on 6 joint international projects, with 4 of these partnerships involving institutions such as Istanbul University (Istanbul, Turkey), GITIS (Moscow, Russia), Federal Volgograd State Social Pedagogical University (Volgograd, Russia) and the Academy of Public Administration under the President of Ukraine (Kyiv, Ukraine). These collaborations are funded on an equal basis using university resources. Additionally, two projects are supported through grant agreements.

1. European Commission project "CAREN II - Central Asian Research and Education Network". Project leader: Doctor of Techical Sciences, Professor Zhaparov B.A. Project cost: 187.2 million tenge.
2. "Modernization and Development of Educational Programs in Pedagogy and Education Management in Central Asian Countries. European Union, TEMPUS program. Project leader: Doctor of Pedagogical Sciences, Abuova N.A. Project cost: 769,373.45 euros.

The main forms of academic mobility within these projects include integrated learning (for students), internships, and lecture delivery (for faculty members). The effectiveness of the foreign academic staff engaged is monitored through activities implementing a Key Performance Indicator (KPI) evaluation system.

Comprehensive information about academic staff is available on the university's website, specifically on the faculty pages (https://turan.edu.kz/ru/fakultety/). One of the indicators of professionalism and competence among academic staff and employees is the number of individuals who have received state awards, prizes, honorary titles, grants such as "Best University Professor" and others (totaling over 40 types of state and departmental awards).

In 2020, Turan University introduced a new Performance Rating System (PRS) for its academic staff, where ratings are determined by aggregating scores across key performance areas

relevant to their positions. A subset consisting of the top and bottom 20% of academic staff based on these ratings is selected. The conclusions of the PRS commission guide decisions made by the Academic Council, documented in protocols and approved through the rector's directives. These decisions form the basis for both moral and financial incentives for the academic staff. The PRS results are utilized by selection committees to nominate candidates for national competitions such as "Best Teacher", as well as internal university competitions like "Best Advisor-Curator" and "Best Scientist of Turan University". The Academic Council ratifies the findings of the PRS commission.

The system aimed at fostering the professional and personal growth of faculty and staff includes moral encouragements like commendations, certificates, and nominations for state and departmental awards, alongside financial rewards such as various types of bonuses and financial aid. Bonuses are disbursed based on annual performance evaluations, as well as for birthdays, anniversaries, and other significant milestones. Other strategies to motivate employees towards more effective and innovative work involve sponsoring their attendance at courses, seminars, conferences, and internships, both domestically and abroad. Furthermore, the university earmarks funds for publishing textbooks, teaching materials, and monographs authored by its faculty. The academic staff of Turan University enjoy the privilege of having their work published at no cost in the scholarly journal "Vestnik of Turan University".

Social support for employees encompasses various benefits such as corporate discounts on tuition fees for their children attending Turan Lyceum Turan College and Turan University for undergraduate and graduate programs. Employees themselves benefit from these discounts when pursuing second higher education, Master's degrees, PhD programs and MBA programs in business education at Turan University. Additionally, employees enjoy discounts for accommodation and recreational activities at Tau-Turan Recreational Center.

Following recommendations from the NAAR External Expert Commission for enhancing academic mobility among students and academic staff, Turan University has entered into cooperation agreements with more than 50 partner universities and scientific-educational centers across nearby and distant foreign countries. Grants provided by the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan have facilitated visits by professors from Germany, Canada, the USA, Latvia, Malaysia, Russia and Ukraine. Furthermore, over 100 academic staff members from Turan University have participated in internships and training programs at foreign universities.

Analytical part

The analysis of the presented data reveals that all educational programs are adequately staffed with academic personnel in accordance with contemporary standards. Statistical data on the distribution of academic staff by fields of study confirms alignment with qualification requirements across educational programs for the 2023-2024 academic year. There is a positive trend in the staffing of the educational process, with indicators related to the quality and quantity of academic staff affirming the presence of sufficient personnel to effectively deliver the University's educational programs. The implementation of personnel management policies is monitored through metrics outlined in the Strategy and key documents such as the Quality Assurance Policy, Corporate Code of Ethics, Personnel Management Procedure, Personnel Management Regulations and others. Monitoring of academic staff activities, mechanisms for evaluating their performance indicators and approaches to assessing teacher competence are detailed in the Regulations on the Rating Evaluation of Academic Staff.

Following meetings and interviews with academic staff, the NAAR EEC has affirmed that the University offers robust incentives to encourage active contributions to its strategic objectives.

Moreover, academic program leaders actively engage professionals from prominent state organizations, international companies and business entities that collaborate with the university. These engagements include guest lectures, master classes, seminars, trainings and presentations.

The participation of practitioner-lecturers and international scholars enriches the educational process and enhances graduates' professional competencies valued by employers.

To gauge academic staff satisfaction with working conditions, the university conducts comprehensive surveys. Overall, the surveys indicate a high satisfaction level among academic staff across various aspects:

- Regarding the university management and administration's acceptance of criticism, 34.9% rated it "very good", 59.3% as "good", and 5.8% as "relatively poor".
- The accessibility of university management to students and teachers received ratings of "very good" from 65.1% of respondents, "good" from 33.7% of students and 34.9% of teachers and "relatively poor" from 1.2% of students (0% of teachers).
- Academic freedom was rated "very good" by 55.8% and "good" by 45.8% of academic staff, with 2.1% rating it "relatively poor".
- In response to evaluating workload satisfaction, 88.4% of respondents answered "very good" or "good", 9.3% "relatively poor", 1.2% "poor", and 1.2% "very poor".
- Responses to questions on staff involvement in decision-making, attraction of young specialists to the educational process and opportunities for professional and personal growth were rated "relatively poor" by 4.7%, 2.3%, and 5.8% of respondents, respectively.

The University maintains high moral and material standards to support the professional activity of academic staff members.

Strengths/Best Practices:

1. The university provides opportunities for career advancement and professional development of academic staff, including young professionals.
2. The university demonstrates motivation for the professional and personal development of academic staff, including recognition for contributions to integrating scientific activities and education, as well as implementing innovative teaching methods.

The EEC Recommendations:

The university adminstration is encouraged to continuously stimulate the participation of academic staff in academic mobility programs, joint scientific research with international partners and international projects. They should also continue efforts to attract the best foreign and domestic taching staff members.

The EEC conclusions:

Under the "Academic Staff" Standard, the university has 2 strong positions and 9 satisfactory positions.

6.9. "Research Work" Standard

✓ *The university must demonstrate alignment of research priorities with national policies in education, science and innovation development.*
✓ *The university must ensure alignment of research activities with the university's mission and strategy.*
✓ *The university must conduct planning and monitor the performance of research work .*
✓ *The university must demonstrate processes to engage students in research activities.*
✓ *The university must support the representation of scientific positions of researchers, academic staff and students at various scientific platforms, including the publication of research results.*
✓ *The university must facilitate the implementation of research outcomes, including consulting and commercialization.*
✓ *The university must support the recognition of research results, including registering scientific projects with authorized bodies and obtaining patents and copyrights.*
✓ *Joint research collaborations with foreign universities are an important factor.*
✓ *The university must aim to diversify sources of funding for research and development activities.*

✓ *The university must establish mechanisms to motivate research activities among students, academic staff and other internal stakeholders.*

Evidence part

Research Work (RW) initiatives at the University align with its approved mission and Strategy, embodying the institution's vision as an innovative and entrepreneurial entity.

Turan University's RW endeavors adhere to the 2021-2024 Development Strategy, crafted in alignment with Kazakhstan's science and higher education development priorities. Annual RW performance metrics are adjusted based on input from participants in the University's facilitation sessions.

In accordance with Kazakhstan's plan for Higher Education and Science development until 2029, the university is establishing a scientific profile for its academic staff and employees within ASU "Turan". This digital profile will streamline the gathering and analysis of RW activities, ensuring comprehensive access to all necessary documentation through a unified platform.

The University underwent successful scientific accreditation in 2022, compliant with Kazakhstan's regulations (certificate issued by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan valid until June 20, 2027).

The University's scientific and innovative endeavors are overseen by various entities, including the Science Department, the RW Commercialization Center, the Business Incubator, five Research Institutes, the publisher of the scientific journal "Vestnik Turan", the Scientific Information System (SIS), the Young Scientists Council and the Scientific Ethics Council. Additionally, the University houses 13 research laboratories, 11 specialized facilities, 2 international centers, 2 photo pavilions and 2 film pavilions across its departments.

As per the guidelines outlined in the "Research Work and Innovation" protocol and the procedures governing the detection and prevention of scientific plagiarism at Turan University, all research projects undergo compulsory verification through the anti-plagiarism internet platform StrikePlagiarism.com.

The University has successfully executed 9 project grants and participates in the "Zhass Galym" State Program of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

Turan University stands out as the sole institution in Kazakhstan where three internationally recognized exams (IELTS, TOEFL, and SAT) are organized and administered. These exams are globally acknowledged and highly sought after. Additionally, the University serves as a venue for certification tests conducted by the National Testing Center QAZTEST and operates the ELA Certification Center.

From 2018 to 2022, Turan University implemented the joint international research project "Towards an alternative model of heritage as sustainable development in Kazakhstan" in partnership with the University of London (United Kingdom). From 2018 to 2023, the University participated in the Japan International Research Grant "Eurasia Foundation from Asia", aimed at promoting the development of joint research outcomes and advancing a specialized course on forming an Asian community in the near future.

In collaboration with the global team of GUESSS Kazakhstan in 2021, researchers from the University of St. Gallen and the University of Bern (Switzerland), along with Turan University, conducted an international study on entrepreneurship development in the academic environment through the Global University Entrepreneurial Spirit Students' Survey (GUESSS).

In 2023, the university received financial support for business incubators from JSC "NARI Qazinnovations" of the Ministry of Digital Development, Innovations and Aerospace Industry of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Participants in the incubation program receive a certificate enabling them to compete for grant funding for technology commercialization. Three projects received grant funding, one project signed an investment agreement, one project completed the UN acceleration program, and one project signed a commercialization agreement with the University totaling USD 255.5 thousand.

In the academic years 2022-2023 and 2023-2024, 9 employees and academic staff from Turan University successfully competed for international internships at prestigious research centers and universities worldwide as part of the "500 Scientists" initiative.

During the academic year 2023-2024, Rector Alshanov R.A. was honored with the "Akmet Baitursynuly" award by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan. In the preceding academic year 2022-2023, 5 academic staff members from Turan University received recognition badges from the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan for their contributions to the development of science in the country.

According to the results of the MESRK RK "Best Researcher" competition in 2022, a prize of 6.1 million tenge was awarded to Doctor of Historical Sciences and Associate Professor Kamalov A.K.. Senior Lecturer Ashimova A.B. received the Presidential Prize of 4 million tenge in the "Playwriting" competition in 2023.

Over the past five years, Turan University's academic staff have published more than 270 papers in Scopus-indexed journals, with over 70 publications in Web of Science-indexed journals and 780 publications in journals recommended by the Committee for Control of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

During this period, employees and academic staff at Turan University have obtained 188 patents and copyrights. In 2023 alone, academic staff published 46 scientific monographs, textbooks and educational materials and received 70 protective documents. The university has shown consistent growth over the last five years.

In the academic year 2023-2024, students of Turan University published 420 articles in various domestic and international journals and conferences. From 2019 to 2024, Turan University hosted more than thirty international scientific-practical conferences, round tables, and workshops.

Analytical part

During the EEC's visit, the university showcased effective implementation of policies aimed at developing its scientific staff, promoting staff growth and establishing mechanisms and criteria for the systematic assessment of academic staff performance. The institution provided opportunities for advancing scientific activities and enhancing the qualifications of its academic staff. It has also instituted support mechanisms for young educators, such as allocating Rector's grants for education within its Master's and Doctoral programs. The departments demonstrate a strong integration of research outcomes into teaching processes. Nevertheless, the EEC experts observed a low success rate in doctoral dissertation defenses by the university's doctoral candidates.

After conducting a visual inspection of the university's physical infrastructure, the EEC members particularly noted the adequacy of the educational processes, supported by all necessary educational, scientific and material resources. These conditions are conducive to conducting scientific research, integrating science and education and disseminating research results among academic and administrative staff as well as students.

Subsequent to examining the university's material and technical resources and conducting interviews with the university administration, heads of departments, academic staff and students, the EEC members emphasized a notably positive trend in acquiring essential research, educational, laboratory and multimedia teaching resources during the reporting period. This progress is exemplified by the establishment in 2023 of the collaborative research laboratory "R&D Laboratory of Artificial Intelligence and Robotics" at Turan University and U.A. Dzholdasbekov Institute of Mechanics and Mechanical Engineering and the modern Coworking Hub.

Strengths/Best Practices:

1. The university demonstrated processes for engaging students in research activities.

2. The university facilitated the presentation of scientific positions by researchers, academic staff, and students at various scientific platforms, including the publication of scientific results.
3. The university employs mechanisms to motivate research activities among students, academic staff and other internal stakeholders.

The EEC Recommendations:

The relevant department and heads of educational programs should integrate a section into the program development plan aimed at enhancing the education and training of doctoral candidates. This should involve providing support from academic supervisors and university management to foster favorable conditions for the successful defense of doctoral dissertations. This initiative is to be continuously implemented.

The EEC conclusions:

Under the "Research Work" Standard, the university has 3 strong positions and 7 satisfactory positions.

6.10. "Finances" Standard

✓ *The university must develop development scenarios aligned with its development strategy, taking into account risk assessment.*

✓ *The university must demonstrate operational and strategic planning of its budget.*

✓ *The university must demonstrate the presence of a formalized financial management policy, including financial reporting.*

✓ *The university must demonstrate the existence of an internal audit system.*

✓ *The university must demonstrate the conduct of an external independent audit.*

✓ *The university must have a mechanism to assess the adequacy of financial resources for various types of activities within the university, including the university's development strategy, educational programs development and research projects.*

Evidence part

Ensuring the quality of education and fostering sustainable development of the educational institution hinges significantly on continually enhancing its material, technical, and informational resources.

The university's financial strategy is squarely focused on securing the necessary funds to execute its Development Strategy, adhering to the legislative framework of the Republic of Kazakhstan and guided by internal policies, accounting standards and strategic planning.

Operationally, the university prepares an annual budget (January to December) disaggregated by departments, with specific allocations aimed at bolstering all facets of university operations. The university's funding approach is rooted in principles of efficiency, effectiveness, prioritization, transparency, delegation of authority, responsibility and autonomy across all budgetary levels. A critical factor in the university's economic sustainability is its organizational structure, which delineates functions and clarifies responsibilities based on experience.

Key initiatives to ensure financial and economic stability include: 1) expanding the revenue base by increasing enrollment of state-funded students; 2) augmenting funding for internships and professional development programs; 3) enhancing financial support for infrastructure development.

The university maintains an internal financial audit system overseen by an independent commission established annually by Rector. Its primary objective is to furnish the university's administration with impartial assessments of institutional activities, encompassing financial operations. Audit findings undergo scrutiny by the Academic Council, with annual updates on the

university's revenue dynamics and structure published on its website under the "About Us" section, specifically under "Financial Statements".

As part of its annual external audit, the university submits periodic reports to state educational authorities of the Republic of Kazakhstan concerning its financial and economic activities. These reports are directed to the E-SUVU, the Department of Higher and Postgraduate Education of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, and the Statistics Department of Almaty.

Analytical part

The distribution of university funding among different activities reveals that tuition fees from contractual agreements constitute the primary funding source (86%), followed by state-funded student subsidies from the government budget (9.2%), revenues from university research activities (1.2%), and income generated from student accommodation services. Overall, the university's total revenue increased by 69% during the reporting period.

An independent commission, established annually by Rector's order, oversees the university's internal financial audit system. Its purpose is to provide unbiased information about the institution's activities, including financial operations, to the university's leadership. Audit findings are subsequently reviewed by the Academic Council. However, experts from the Accreditation Commission observed that Appendix 1.4 of the University Academic Council's Work Plan for the 2023-2024 academic year does not address this issue. Given that the "Model Rules of Operation of the Academic Council of Higher Education Institution and the Procedure for Its Election" stipulate the Academic Council's responsibilities, which encompass reviewing annual reports of Rector, Vice-rectors, heads of structural units and methods of conducting educational, research, financial, economic, informational and international activities, the EEC recommends that university administration incorporate the matter of financial reporting into the Academic Council's agenda.

During interviews, university management demonstrated that financial resource management is assured through cash flow analysis, efficiency and risk assessments of financial investments and appropriate methodologies. The university's financial stability is reinforced by significant improvements in infrastructure, salary increments and diverse forms of incentives and financial aid for both academic staff members and students.

Strengths/Best Practices:

Not identified.

The EEC Recommendations:

The university administration should include the issue of financial reporting in the Academic Council's work plan. Deadline: by September 1, 2024.

The EEC conclusions:

Under the "Finances" Standard, the university has 6 satisfactory positions.

6.11. "Educational Resources and Student Support Systems" Standard

✓ The university must ensure that educational resources, including material-technical and infrastructural resources, align with the university's strategic goals.
✓ The university must demonstrate the existence of procedures to support various groups of students, including information and counseling services.
✓ The university must demonstrate alignment of information resources with strategic goals:

- o *Technological support for students and academic staff in accordance with educational programs (e.g., online learning, modeling, databases, data analysis programs).*
- o *Library resources, including collections of educational, methodological, and scientific literature in both print and electronic formats across general education, core, and specialized disciplines, periodicals, and access to scientific databases.*
- o *Expertise in the results of research work, theses and dissertations for plagiarism.*
- o *Access to educational Internet resources.*
- o *Functioning of Wi-Fi on campus.*

- ✓ *The university must strive to create conditions for educational, scientific and other activities. The development of infrastructure must be based on monitoring results of satisfaction with infrastructure by students, academic staf and other stakeholders.*
- ✓ *The university must aim to ensure that educational equipment and software used in educational programs are equivalent to those used in relevant industries.*
- ✓ *The university must ensure that infrastructure meets security requirements.*
- ✓ *The university must consider the needs of various groups of students (adults, working students, international students, and students with disabilities).*
- ✓ *The university creates conditions for students to progress through individual educational trajectories.*

Evidence part

Turan University's material and technical infrastructure, spanning 10.5 hectares, complies with state educational standards (GESO), the current Qualification Requirements for higher and postgraduate education institutions, sanitary and epidemiological norms, fire safety regulations, safety standards, and labor protection rules. The facilities encompass buildings and structures totaling 57,364 square meters.

Resource requirements are initially aligned with the university's strategy, followed by annual assessments across all resource categories. Operational needs for resources are determined on a quarterly, monthly, or shorter basis, measured in both physical units (to support educational activities and manage university department operations) and monetary units (for financial planning and evaluation). The initial data for assessing resource needs are tailored to the specific requirements of university departments.

The university centrally manages drinking and utility water, heating, electricity, and telephone services, ensuring all engineering networks meet established standards. Within its main building, there is an assembly hall seating 450 people across 680 square meters, as well as a library accommodating 320 seats over an area of 582.9 square meters.

The university features a diverse range of classrooms equipped with modern technology, specialized cabinets, laboratories, and workshops. Its facilities encompass forensic science, physics, robotics labs, a media lab, psychological center, international research and debate center, digital innovation hub, language labs, multimedia rooms, "Turan Channel" TV studio, courtroom, computer labs, film pavilion, and a business incubator. In 2023, construction began on a modern coworking hub spanning 500 square meters, which opened in December of that year.

The university offers advanced equipment, platforms, and software to support learning and operational needs, including:

1) A computer inventory featuring 690 desktop computers, 68 laptops, 30 all-in-one computers, 8 servers, 130 printers and multifunction devices, along with 2 3D printers.

2) Facilities encompassing 47 multimedia rooms, 75 classrooms equipped with projectors, and 13 computer labs. Additionally, there are 5 video walls, 8 video screens, 2 LED screens, 24 interactive whiteboards, 9 interactive panels, 10 televisions, and 1 Apple TV 4K.

3) A conference hall accommodating 32 seats, equipped with 15 screens and 32 microphones.

4) Additional resources include 8 cameras, 3 camcorders, and an acoustic system.

The university is committed to acquiring cutting-edge filmmaking equipment (ARRI, Blackmagic, Swit, Manfrotto, Aputure, Hollyland, Dedolight) from leading manufacturers recognized by global cinematographers. Licensed software (Adobe Premiere Pro, After Effects,

Audition, Photoshop, DaVinci Resolve) is integral to student education, ensuring attainment of expected outcomes specified in educational programs.

The Turan University Information System (ASU Turan) offers tools for organizing and overseeing the educational process, monitoring staff and student demographics and facilitating intra-departmental requests. These include procurement of educational and scientific literature/journals, website content management, photocopying, photography, videography, and handling student inquiries at the Student Support Center. ASU Turan features modules like "Educational Process" (with components such as "Grade Sheet" and "Examination Committee Protocols") and the "Research" module, where axademic staff input data on publications and intellectual property.

Google authentication for ASU and the Turan educational portal is actively used, enabling automatic access for employees and students to the Electronic Library (EB) and LMS Canvas. New interfaces for admission requests have been developed to streamline processes like "Educational Process Planning and Organization", ensuring alignment with contemporary educational standards.

Development of information resources is closely tailored to the university's profile through collaboration with academic staff members. Funding is replenished based on departmental requests within ASU Turan, which includes automated notifications regarding request status updates (in progress, completed, notes).

Details on journals, including scientific publications received by the library, are cataloged in the Electronic Library's Journal Catalog. Annually, the library subscribes to periodicals; for the first half of the 2024 academic year, subscriptions to 73 titles amounting to 2,147,526.37 tenge have been secured. An updated list of periodicals is regularly published on the university's website under the "Library" section – "Resources" – "Periodicals".

The library's collection is enhanced with digital versions of educational literature. During the period from January to December 2023, 166 literary titles were digitized in accordance with copyright laws. Information on electronic resources, including scientific databases, is accessible through the university's website under the "Library" section – "Resources" – "Electronic Resources" tab.

The university offers free Wi-Fi across the campus, library, and student dormitories, with a total bandwidth capacity of 100 Mbps. All university computers are integrated into a local network that automates various educational processes. Each department is equipped with IP telephony based on Cisco CallManager architecture. Check Point R80.30 cyber security gateways and management systems are employed to ensure advanced and effective protection against large-scale cyber threats.

Turan University emphasizes the enhancement of its IT infrastructure as part of its "digital university" initiative. Significant funding is dedicated to updating both computer and office equipment, along with procuring necessary software. The university manages licenses and subscriptions for a variety of software from Microsoft and other vendors, maintaining detailed records. These software solutions are tailored for licensed educational institutions in technical and natural sciences, supporting both educational and research activities.

Among these offerings, Microsoft Office 365 A1 features online editions of Microsoft Office, "Class and Staff Notebooks", unlimited file storage via OneDrive, HD video conferencing capabilities, Microsoft Teams, alongside desktop access to OneNote and email with a 50 GB mailbox.

The university utilizes a variety of platforms accessed through users' corporate email addresses. Compliance with Safety and Labor Protection Regulations governs efforts to ensure safe working conditions for employees and students, alongside the implementation of labor

protection measures. Emergency protocols are established, including the formation of an evacuation commission under Rector's Order No. 5 dated January 3, 2024.

Additionally, surveillance cameras are strategically positioned throughout academic buildings and internal spaces (totaling 390 cameras: 280 internal and 110 external), capable of transmitting footage to law enforcement agencies when necessary. Security features such as turnstiles and panic buttons are also operational. Oversight agencies (including the Sanitary and Epidemiological Service, Fire Safety Service, and State Construction Supervision) conduct proactive inspections to verify infrastructure compliance with safety standards, as affirmed by Compliance Report No. 175 dated July 4, 2022, from the Fire Safety Service.

All floors of the University buildings are equipped with fire alarms, which are periodically inspected and promptly repaired (repair work completion reports for the fire alarm system as of August 15, 2023, totaling 7,060,180 KZT, and December 19, 2023, totaling 2,548,759 KZT). Fire signal detectors were purchased for 160,000 KZT. Additionally, fire hydrants are installed on all floors, adequately equipped with fire hoses. Fire extinguishers are present in educational units and computer labs. According to fire safety standards, all rooms with computer equipment and household electrical appliances are equipped with fire suppression tools.

Evacuation plans in case of fire or earthquake are displayed in the foyers and stairwells of all building floors.

For students with mobility impairments, there are accessible elevators. Special headphones are available for students with hearing impairments, and sanitary facilities and parking zones are provided. Students with special educational needs have the opportunity to develop optimal individual educational paths, with individual training schedules arranged when necessary. A revised version of the website for visually impaired users has been updated, including a section dedicated to inclusive education. A policy outlining activities to ensure conditions for inclusive education at Turan University has been developed.

The university, represented by its legal consultant, supports the registration and visa processes for foreign students, as well as individuals invited for internships, faculty positions, participation in scientific research, international events, and exchange programs.

Within the university's educational and socio-cultural framework, the Advising Institute operates effectively. Each advisor-curator develops an annual work plan that includes both group and individual meetings with assigned students. Advisors aid students in orienting and adapting to the educational environment, offering guidance on academic matters. Additionally, students receive advisory assistance from their thesis/project supervisors. They can also seek support for student life and developmental issues from the Deputy Dean of the faculty and the Student Affairs Office as needed.

Analytical part

Upon inspecting Turan University's facilities, the EEC confirmed the university's possession of sufficient material, technical, informational, and library resources. Electronic platforms are readily available for faculty and students to support the educational process effectively.

The Commission also verified that the university's library acquires educational, methodological, and scientific literature, along with subscriptions to periodicals, tailored to meet the educational standards outlined by the State Educational Standards of the Republic of Kazakhstan across all disciplines and levels.

Academic staff and student interviews revealed adherence to the university's Academic Policy regarding academic integrity. Final papers and publications in university journals undergo obligatory checks through the StrikePlagiarism.com anti-plagiarism internet system. Additionally, the university website hosts the "Rector"s Blog".

The EEC received convincing evidence that advisor-curators compile and update a comprehensive student profile annually at the start of each academic term to assess student needs.

This profile encompasses various categories, including students with disabilities, international students, socially vulnerable students, student athletes, student activists, members of the Alumni Association and winners of internal university competitions. Students falling within these categories are eligible to apply for tuition discounts under the guidelines specified in the "Rules for Awarding Rector's Grant and Applying the Discount System at Turan University".

Survey findings among academic and administrative staff indicated high satisfaction levels regarding the adequacy and accessibility of essential scientific and educational literature in the library: 69.8% rated it as "very good"," 26.7% as "good" and 3.5% as "relatively poor".

In response to the question on encountering issues related to internet access or weak connectivity in their work, 2.3% reported "often", 12.8% "sometimes", and 84.9% "never".

Regarding satisfaction with the university's current educational resources: 67.5% expressed being "completely satisfied", 25.4% "partially satisfied" and 5% "partially dissatisfied". Satisfaction levels with the availability of computer labs were 69.7%, 22.8%, and 6% respectively, while for internet resources, they were 66.4%, 23.6%, and 6.2%.

Strengths/Best practices:

1. Turan University's educational framework is comprehensively backed by essential traditional information sources and access to networked educational resources, including multimedia projectors, interactive whiteboards, and computer labs connected to both the local network and Wi-Fi. The university is licensed for various software products acquired from Microsoft or third-party vendors, with meticulous record-keeping.
2. The university's infrastructure development robustly fosters an environment conducive to educational and scientific endeavors.

The EEC Recommendations:
None.

The EEC Conclusions:

Under the "Educational Resources and Student Support Systems" Standard, the university has 2 strong positions and 10 satisfactory positions.

6.12. "Public Information" Standard

✓ *The information published by the university must be accurate, objective, up-to-date, and reflect all areas of the university's activities.*

✓ *· The university management must utilize various methods of disseminating information (including mass media, websites, information networks, etc.) to inform the general public and stakeholders.*

✓ *Public information efforts must support and clarify national development programs of the country and the higher and postgraduate education system.*

✓ *The university must publish audited financial statements on its own website.*

✓ *The university must demonstrate on its website information that characterizes the university as a whole and its educational programs.*

✓ *It is important to have adequate and objective information about faculty, staff, and student profiles.*

✓ *Informing the public about collaborations and interactions with partners, including scientific/consulting organizations, business partners, social partners, and educational organizations, is crucial.*

✓ *The university must publish information and links to external resources based on the results of external assessment procedures.*

Evidence part

Turan university operates an official website available in Kazakh, Russian, and English,

accessible at https://turan.edu.kz/. The website plays a pivotal role in shaping the university's image and serves as an informative hub for prospective students, parents, employers, graduates, and staff. It fosters transparency by providing global access to a range of sections including university overview, structure, faculties, educational offerings, research updates, news, social activities, press releases, and admissions information. Regularly updated news and links to external web resources such as government sites, university partnerships, informational portals, and social media platforms are also featured.

The university management views public communication as essential for fulfilling its mission, goals, and quality assurance commitments outlined in the 2021-2026 University Development Strategy. Detailed protocols for disseminating information about university activities are outlined in the revised Regulation on Management of the University's Internet Resources, as per Order No. 156 issued on September 20, 2021, available at www.turan.edu.kz.

Moreover, public outreach is facilitated through the university's press office interactions with media outlets. Information is shared via the "Media About Us" section (https://turan.edu.kz/ru/smi-o-nas/) and through events like open days, job fairs, alumni reunions, and university promotional activities (https://turan.edu.kz/ru/category/news/). The university's newspaper "StudiYA" maintains a dedicated webpage, regularly featuring news on campus life, outstanding students, and esteemed faculty members (https://turan.edu.kz/ru/gazeta-studiya/). Additionally, the website showcases Turan University's scientific journals: "Bulletin of Turan University", "Eurasian Scientific Journal of Law", and "Eurasian Journal of Current Research in Psychology and Pedagogy" (http://surl.li/qoqit).

For alumni, the university offers insights into current job openings, employment statistics by program, career opportunities, notable alumni achievements, career-related events, and job fairs (https://turan.edu.kz/ru/career-and-leadership-center/, https://turan.edu.kz/ru/turan-zerde/).

Turan University actively disseminates updates and links across various platforms such as @almaty.today, @_stan.kz, @almatymarathon, @almaty.tv, and @missqazaqstan.official, collaborates with influential bloggers like @yussupov21, @bayanmaxatkyzy, @ahonberzhan, @dakentiy_official, @baha_puper, @kuandyk_sagynyw, and engages in outdoor advertising campaigns including in the metro system.

In summary, Turan University diligently ensures accessible public information concerning its mission, goals, and quality assurance policies through a comprehensive array of communication channels.

Analytical part

The accreditation commission members acknowledge that the university's website contains objective and current information about its faculties and educational programs (EP). However, they point out that the site lacks adequate details regarding current internal regulatory documents for external stakeholders, and not all educational programs feature catalogs of educational modules (for instance, the humanities and law faculty's program for the 2023-2024 academic year). There is a need to enhance website navigation across EP pages to ensure comprehensive coverage of information such as EP development plans, learning outcomes (LOs), expected learning outcomes specification: CED, CD and CMD, as well as details on qualification opportunities upon completion of EP.

The university effectively coordinates and substantiates the activities of EP management and academic staff through social media, the university newspaper and various media channels. The university administration employs diverse strategies for disseminating information, utilizing media platforms, informational resources and social networks to keep the public and stakeholders informed. Informational boards, posters, stands, banners, etc., are strategically placed in university building foyers to inform prospective students.

Rector's blog serves as a feedback channel for stakeholders to address concerns or suggestions, where monitoring, recording, promptly preparing and posting responses to inquiries

are carried out.

The university website's content (sections, banners, categories) undergoes continuous updates. Regular and systematic assessments of satisfaction with information regarding the university's activities, specifics, and the progress of educational programs (EP) are conducted through surveys, polls, feedback mechanisms, and the rector's blog.

The university administration publishes audited financial statements for the past three years on its website. However, accreditation experts have observed that these reports only encompass budgetary funds from state educational contracts, and the audits were performed by university staff members without involving an independent auditor. According to Tables 9.1 and 9.2 of the Self-Assessment Report, revenue from educational services under budget programs constitutes 9.15% of the university's total income. Therefore, to comprehensively assess the university's financial standing, the accreditation commission stresses the importance of incorporating all revenues and expenditures outlined in Tables 9.1 and 9.2 of the Self-Assessment Report into financial disclosures.

Furthermore, accreditation experts have highlighted the absence of an internal regulatory document governing the preparation of financial statements by university staff. They recommend conducting audits of the university's financial statements by independent auditors in accordance with international audit standards and making the audit results available on the university's website, excluding any proprietary information. As noted in the Self-Assessment Report on page 91, "... in line with the accreditation commission's recommendation to conduct external independent audits and publish non-proprietary results on the university's website, external financial audits were conducted in 2019 and 2020". However, the outcomes of these external financial audits have not been published on the university's official website.

Strengths/Best Practice:

Not identified.

The EEC Recommendations:

1 The university management is instructed to publish internal regulatory documents of the University in open access on the university's website for informing the general public and interested parties. Deadline: by September 1, 2024.

2 The university management is instructed to develop an internal regulatory document regulating the procedure for conducting audits of the university's financial statements, including all revenues and expenditures related to the university's activities that do not constitute commercial secrets. Deadline: by September 1, 2024.

3 The university management is recommended to develop a plan (roadmap) or amend existing strategic work plans of the university to include activities for conducting audits of the university's financial statements by independent auditors in accordance with international audit standards. Deadline: by September 1, 2024.
.

The EEC Conclusions:

Under the "Public Information" Standard, the university has 6 satisfactory positions and and 2 positions requiring improvement.

(VII) REVIEW OF STRENGTHS/BEST PRACTICES OF EACH STANDARD

"Strategic Development and Quality Assurance" Standard

The university has demonstrated the formulation of a distinctive mission, vision and strategy through comprehensive analysis of internal and external factors, actively engaging diverse stakeholders.

"Administration and Management" Standard

The university shows transparency and accessibility of its administration and management to students, academic staff, parents and other stakeholders. Additionally, it ensures leadership training for university management, heads of departments and educational programs through specialized management education initiatives.

"Information Management and Reporting" Standard

Not identified.

"Development and Approval of Educational Programs" Standard

Not identified.

"Continuous Monitoring and Periodic Assessment of Educational Programs" Standard

Not identified.

"Student-Centered Learning, Teaching and Assessment of Performance" Standard

Not identified.

"Students" Standard

1 The university fosters favorable conditions for students, including facilitating internships, aiding graduates in employment and maintaining ongoing connections.

2 The university supports an alumni association.

3 The university has implemented a framework to nurture gifted students, enabling their development and fostering conditions for their successful careers.

"Academic Staff" Standard

1 The university supports the professional growth and development of the academic staff, including opportunities for career advancement, particularly among young professionals.

2 The university motivates the personal and professional development of academic staff members, recognizing their contributions to integrating scientific research and education, and innovating teaching methodologies.

"Research Work" Standard

1 The university engages students in research activities,

2 The university supports the dissemination of research findings of academic staff members across various scientific platforms

3 The university employs mechanisms to encourage research among academic staff members, students and other internal stakeholders.

"Finances" Standard

Not identified.

"Educational Resources and Student Support Systems" Standard

The university ensures comprehensive support for its educational process, providing access to essential traditional and networked educational resources such as multimedia projectors, interactive whiteboards and computer labs connected to both local networks and Wi-Fi. It maintains licenses and subscriptions for various software products from Microsoft and other providers, effectively managing these resources to support educational and scientific endeavors.

"Public Information" Standard

Not identified.

(VIII) REVIEW OF RECOMMENDATION FOR QUALITY IMPROVEMENT FOR EACH STANDARD

"Strategic Development and Quality Assurance" Standard

Not identified.

"Administration and Management" Standard

Not identified.

"Information Management and Reporting" Standard

Not identified.

"Development and Approval of Educational Programs" Standard

1 University management is responsible for conducting a thorough analysis of the potential of educational programs (EPs) to assess their feasibility for scaling up to joint educational programs (JEPs) and double degree programs (DDPs) with international partners. Based on the analysis, identify a list of the most promising EPs suitable for developing JEPs and DDPs with international partners. Deadline: October 1, 2024.

2 University management is tasked with creating roadmaps for the development of JEPs and DDPs in collaboration with international partners for the identified promising EPs. Deadline: December 31, 2024.

"Continuous Monitoring and Periodic Assessment of Educational Programs" Standard

1 The university management is to establish a mechanism for publishing information on the university's official website regarding any planned or ongoing actions related to EPs (such as plans, reports, protocols), specifying all involved parties and approving them through internal regulatory documents. Information on decisions regarding changes in EP structure and content must be published and accessible to all stakeholders on the university's website within 10 days of such changes. Deadline: before the start of the 2024-2025 academic year.

2 The head of the "Tourism" EP must align the EP approval date at the Academic Council with the registry of educational programs and activities (EPVO). Deadline: by September 1, 2024.

3 The head of the Department of Educational and Methodological Work is to incorporate a relevant section/item into the modular educational programs (MEP), integrating a matrix that correlates professional standards with educational disciplines/modules. Deadline: by September 1, 2024.

4 The respective department is to develop/add an appropriate internal document defining the procedure for appointing EP heads, specifying requirements, responsibilities, rights and functional duties. Deadline: by September 1, 2024.

5 EP heads are to indicate in syllabi the alignment of student assessment policies with learning outcomes (competencies). The head of the Department of Educational and Methodological Work is to revise/add to the internal regulatory document on syllabus development. Deadline: by September 1, 2024.

"Student-Centered Learning, Teaching and Assessment of Performance" Standard

1 Increase the number of academic staff's proprietary research projects in teaching methodology for student-centered learning. Deadline: January 1, 2025.

2 Include manuals for implementing proprietary teaching methods in the publication plan. Deadline: January 1, 2025.

3 Continue organizing conferences and seminars to exchange experiences and present research findings on the implementation of proprietary teaching methods in core subjects, aimed at gathering feedback and improving teaching methods. Deadline: annually.

"Students" Standard
Expand the range of internal and external academic mobility programs for EP students. Deadline: September 1, 2025.

"Academic Staff" Standard
The university management is to continuously promote academic staff participation in academic mobility programs, joint scientific research with international partners and international projects, and to persist in efforts to attract top international and domestic academic staff members.

"Research Work" Standard
The respective department and EP heads are to include a section in the EP development plan focused on enhancing the education/training of doctoral students, supported by academic supervisors and university management to create favorable conditions for successful dissertation defenses. Deadline: Permanent.

"Finances" Standard
The university management is to incorporate financial reporting issues into the work plan of the university's Academic Council. Deadline: by September 1, 2024.

"Educational Resources and Student Support Systems" Standard

None.

"Public Information" Standard

1 The university management is to ensure internal regulatory documents of the university are openly accessible to the public and interested parties via the university's website. Deadline: by September 1, 2024.

2 The university management is to develop an internal regulatory document outlining procedures for auditing the university's financial statements, including all income and expenses related to university activities not classified as proprietary. Deadline: by September 1, 2024.

3 The university management is advised to develop a roadmap or amend existing strategic plans for conducting audits of the university's financial statements by independent auditors in accordance with international audit standards. Deadline: by September 1, 2024.

(IX) REVIEW OF RECOMMENDATION FOR DEVELOPMENT OF THE EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION

None.

(X) RECOMMENDATION TO THE ACCREDITATION COUNCIL

The External Expert Commission members unanimously agreed on recommending Turan University for accreditation for a duration of 7 years.

Annex 1. Assessment table "Conclusion of the External Expert Commission"

No	No	Assessment Criteria	Educational Organization Position			
			Strong	Satisfactory	Involves improvement	Unsatisfactory
"Strategic Development and Quality Assurance" Standard						
1	1	The university must demonstrate the development of a unique mission, vision and strategy based on the analysis of external and internal factors, with broad involvement of diverse stakeholders.	+			
2	2	The university must demonstrate that its mission, vision, and strategy are oriented towards meeting the needs of the state, society, real economy sectors, potential employers, students and other stakeholders.		+		
3	3	The university must demonstrate transparency in the processes of formulating, monitoring and regularly reviewing its mission, vision, strategy and quality assurance policies.		+		
4	4	The university must have published quality assurance policies, mission, vision, and strategy.		+		
5	5	The university develops documents for individual areas of activity and processes (plans, programs, regulations, etc.) that specify the quality assurance policy.		+		
6	6	The quality assurance policy must reflect the connection between scientific research, teaching and learning.		+		
7	7	The university must demonstrate the development of a quality assurance culture.		+		
Total			1	6	0	0
"Adminstration and Management" Standard						
8	1	The university conducts management processes, including planning and allocation of resources in accordance with the strategy.		+		
9	2	The university must demonstrate the successful functioning and improvement of the internal quality assurance system. Вуз должен продемонстрировать успешное функционирование и улучшение системы внутреннего обеспечения качества		+		
10	3	The university must demonstrate risk management analysis. Вуз должен продемонстрировать анализ управления рисками		+		
11	4	The university must demonstrate analysis of the effectiveness of changes.		+		
12	5	The university must demonstrate analysis of identified discrepancies, implementation of developed corrective and preventive actions.		+		
13	6	The university must demonstrate management of the educational process through management of educational programs, including assessment of their effectiveness.		+		

14	7	The university develops annual activity plans, including as those of the academic staff (Planning, Programming, and Budgeting) based on the Strategy.		+		
15	8	Commitment to quality assurance must apply to any activities carried out by contractors and partners (outsourcing), including the implementation of joint/double degree programs and academic mobility.		+		
16	9	The university must provide evidence of transparency in the university management system.		+		
17	10	The university must ensure the participation of students and academic staff (teaching, research, and support staff) in the work of collegial governing bodies.		+		
18	11	The university must demonstrate evidence of openness and accessibility of management and administration to students, academic staff, parents and other stakeholders.	+			
19	12	The university must demonstrate innovation management, including analysis and implementation of innovative proposals.		+		
20	13	The university must aim to participate in international, national and regional professional alliances, associations, etc.		+		
21	14	The university must provide training for university management, structural units and educational programs in educational management programs.	+			
22	15	The university must strive for progress achieved since the last external quality assurance procedure to be taken into account in preparation for the next procedure.		+		
Total			**2**	**13**	**0**	**0**
"Information Management and Reporting" Standard						
23	1	The university must ensure the functioning of a system for collecting, analyzing and managing information based on the application of modern information and communication technologies and software tools.		+		
24	2	The university must demonstrate the use of processed, adequate information for effective management of educational programs and improvement of the internal quality assurance system.		+		
25	3	The university must have a system of regular reporting at all levels of the organizational structure, including assessment of the performance and effectiveness of departments, educational programs, research, and their interactions.		+		
26	4	The university must establish the frequency, forms and methods of evaluating the management of educational programs, the activities of collegial bodies and structural units, senior management and the implementation of research projects.		+		
27	5	The university must demonstrate the establishment of procedures and ensure the protection of information, including defining responsible persons for the accuracy and timeliness of information analysis and data provision.		+		

28	6	It is important to involve students, academic staff and support staff in the processes of collecting and analyzing information, as well as decision-making based on this information.		+		
29	7	The university must demonstrate the existence of mechanisms for communication with students, staff and other stakeholders, including mechanisms for conflict resolution.		+		
30	8	The university must measure the satisfaction of the needs of academic staff, support staff and students, and demonstrate evidence of addressing identified deficiencies.		+		
31	9	The university must evaluate the performance and effectiveness of its activities, including within the framework of educational programs.		+		
The information collected and analyzed by the university must take into account:						
32	10	Key performance indicators		+		
33	11	Student enrollment dynamics by forms and types		+		
34	12	Level of academic performance, student achievements and attrition		+		
35	13	Student satisfaction with the implementation of educational programs and the quality of education at the university		+		
36	14	Accessibility of educational resources and support systems for students		+		
37	15	Employment and career growth of graduates		+		
38	16	Students, academic staff and other internal stakeholders must document their consent to the processing of personal data		+		
38	17	The university must facilitate providing all necessary information in relevant fields of study		+		
Total			**0**	**17**	**0**	**0**
"Development and Approval of Educational Programs" Standard						
39	1	The university must demonstrate the existence of a documented procedure for the development and approval of educational programs at the institutional level.		+		
40	2	The university must demonstrate that the developed educational programs align with established goals, including expected learning outcomes.		+		
41	3	The university must demonstrate the existence of a developed graduate profile model for educational programs, describing learning outcomes and personal qualities.		+		
42	4	The university must demonstrate conducting external evaluations of educational programs.		+		
43	5	The qualification awarded upon completion of the educational program must be clearly defined, explained and correspond to a specific level within the NQF, QF-EHEA.		+		

44	6	The university must determine the impact of disciplines and professional practices on the formation of learning outcomes.		+		
45	7	An important factor is the ability to prepare students for professional certification.		+		
46	8	The university must provide evidence of students, academic staff and other stakeholder'' participation in the development of educational programs and ensuring their quality.		+		
47	9	The university must ensure that the content of study disciplines and learning outcomes corresponds to the level of education (Bachelor's, Master's, Doctoral).		+		
48	10	The structure of educational programs must include various types of activities corresponding to learning outcomes.		+		
49	11	An important factor is the presence of joint educational programs with foreign educational organizations.			+	
Total			**0**	**10**	**1**	**0**
"Continuous Monitoring and Periodic Assessment of Educational Programs" Standard						
50	1	The university must demonstrate the existence of a documented procedure for monitoring and periodic evaluation of educational programs (EP) to achieve the goals of the programs. The results of these procedures are aimed at continuous improvement of the educational programs.		+		
51	2	The university must ensure a review of the content and structure of educational programs considering changes in the labor market, employer requirements and societal demands.		+		
Monitoring and Periodic Assessment of Educational Programs must consider:						
52	3	the content of programs in light of the latest scientific advancements in a specific discipline to ensure the relevance of the taught subject		+		
53	4	changes in societal needs and the professional environment		+		
54	5	studyload, academic performance and graduation of students		+		
55	6	the effectiveness of student assessment procedures			+	
56	7	expectations, needs, and satisfaction of students with the education provided by the educational program		+		
57	8	the educational environment and support services, their alignment with the objectives of the educational program		+		
58	9	The university must provide evidence of student, employer and other stakeholder involvement in the review of the educational programs.		+		
59	10	All stakeholders must be informed about any planned or implemented actions regarding the educational programs. All changes made to the educational programs must be published.		+		
60	11	Support services must identify and meet the needs of various groups of students.		+		

			0	10	1	0
Total			0	10	1	0
"Student-Centered Learning, Teaching and Assessment of Performance" Standard						
61	1	The university must ensure respect and attention to various groups of students and their needs, providing them with flexible learning pathways.		+		
62	2	The university must ensure the use of various forms and methods of teaching and learning.		+		
63	3	The university must demonstrate the existence of a feedback system regarding the use of various teaching methods and assessment of learning outcomes.		+		
64	4	An important factor is the presence of proprietal research in the field of teaching methods of academic disciplines.		+		
65	5	The university must demonstrate support for students' autonomy while providing guidance and assistance from academic staff.		+		
66	6	The university must demonstrate the existence of a procedure for responding to student complaints.		+		
67	7	The university must ensure consistency, transparency and objectivity in the mechanism for assessing learning outcomes, including appeals.		+		
68	8	The university must ensure that the procedures for assessing students' learning outcomes correspond to the planned learning outcomes and program goals. Criteria and assessment methods must be published in advance.		+		
69	9	The university must define mechanisms to ensure that each graduate masters the learning outcomes, ensuring the completeness of their formation.		+		
70	10	Evaluators must possess modern methods of assessing learning outcomes and regularly update their qualifications in this area.		+		
Total			0	10	0	0
"Students" Standard						
71	1	The university must demonstrate a policy for shaping the student body from admission to graduation and ensure transparency of its procedures. Procedures regulating the student lifecycle (from admission to completion) must be defined, approved and published.		+		
72	2	The university must provide special adaptation and support programs for newly enrolled and international students.		+		
73	3	The university must demonstrate compliance with the Lisbon Recognition Convention, including the existence and application of mechanisms for recognizing the academic mobility of students, as well as the results of additional formal and informal learning.		+		
74	4	The university must collaborate with other educational organizations and national ENIC/NARIC centers (European Network of Information Centers in the European Region / National Academic Recognition Information Centers) to ensure comparable recognition of qualifications.		+		
75	5	The university must facilitate both external and internal student mobility and assist them in obtaining external grants for education.		+		

76	6	The university must make maximum efforts to provide students with internship placements, support graduates in finding employment, and maintain connections with them.	+			
77	7	The university must provide graduates with documents confirming their qualifications, including achieved learning outcomes, as well as the context, content and status of their education and proof of its completion.		+		
78	8	The university must demonstrate the existence of a mechanism for monitoring the employment and professional activities of graduates.		+		
79	9	The university must actively encourage students towards self-education and development outside the main program (extracurricular activities).		+		
80	10	An important factor is the existence of an active alumni association.	+			
81	11	An important factor is the presence of a mechanism to support gifted students.	+			
Total			**3**	**8**	**0**	**0**
"Academic Staff" Standard						
82	1	The university must have an objective and transparent personnel policy, including recruitment, professional growth and staff development, ensuring the professional competence of the entire staff.		+		
83	2	The university must have clear, transparent, and objective criteria for hiring, appointment to positions, promotions and dismissals and adhere to them in its operations.		+		
84	3	The university must demonstrate that the human resources of the academic and administrative staff align with the university's development strategy and the specificities of the educational programs.		+		
85	4	The university must demonstrate the change in the role of the faculty in transitioning to student-centered learning.		+		
86	5	The university must define the contribution of its academic staff to the implementation of the university's development strategy and other strategic documents.		+		
87	6	The university must provide opportunities for career advancement and professional development for its staff, including young professionals.	+			
89	7	The university must engage practitioners from relevant industries in teaching. Вуз должен привлекать к преподаванию практиков соответствующих отраслей		+		
90	8	The university must demonstrate motivation for the professional and personal development of its academic staff, including recognition for contributions to integrating research and education and applying innovative teaching methods.	+			
91	9	An important factor is the active use of information and communication technologies in the educational process by the academic staff (e.g., online learning, e-portfolios, MOOCs, etc.).		+		
92	10	The university must demonstrate a commitment to enhancing academic mobility by attracting the best foreign and domestic staff members.		+		

93	11	The university can show the involvement of its academic staff in societal activities (their role in the education system, contributions to scientific development, regional development, creating a cultural environment, participation in exhibitions, creative competitions, charity programs, etc.).		+		
Total			**2**	**9**	**0**	**0**
"Research Work" Standard						
94	1.	The university must demonstrate alignment of research priorities with national policies in education, science and innovation development.		+		
95	2.	The university must ensure that its research activities align with the university's mission and strategy.		+		
96	3.	The university must conduct planning and monitor the effectiveness of research work.		+		
97	4.	The university must demonstrate processes for engaging students in research activities.	+			
98	5.	The university must support the presentation of scientific positions by researchers, academic staff and students at various scientific forums, including the publication of research results.	+			
99	6.	The university must facilitate the implementation of research results, including consulting and commercialization.		+		
100	7.	The university must support the recognition of research results, including registering scientific projects with authorized bodies, and obtaining patents and copyrights.		+		
101	8.	Conducting joint research with foreign universities is an important factor.		+		
102	9.	The university must strive to diversify sources of funding for research and development activities.		+		
103	10.	The university must provide mechanisms to motivate research and development activities among students, academic staff and other internal stakeholders.	+			
Total			**3**	**7**	**0**	**0**
"Finances" Standard						
104	1	The university must develop development scenarios aligned with its development strategy, taking into account risk assessment.		+		
105	2	The university must demonstrate operational and strategic planning of its budget.		+		
106	3	The university must demonstrate the existence of formalized financial management policies, including financial reporting.		+		
107	4	The university must demonstrate the existence of an internal audit system.		+		
108	5	The university must demonstrate the conduct of external independent audits.		+		
109	6	The university must have a mechanism to assess the adequacy of financial resources for various activities of the university, including the		+		

№	№	Criterion				
		university's development strategy, educational program development and research projects.				
Totaly			**0**	**6**	**0**	**0**
"Educational Resources and Student Support Systems" Standard						
110	1.	The university must ensure that educational resources, including material-technical resources and infrastructure, align with the university's strategic goals.	+			
111	2.	The university must demonstrate the presence of procedures to support various groups of students, including information and counseling.		+		
The university must demonstrate that information resources align with strategic goals:						
112	3.	Technological support for students and personnel in accordance with educational programs (e.g., online learning, modeling, databases, data analysis programs).		+		
113	4.	Library resources, including collections of educational, methodological, and scientific literature in general education, foundational, and specialized disciplines in both print and electronic formats, periodicals and access to scientific databases.		+		
114	5.	Expertise in research results, theses and dissertations for plagiarism.		+		
115	6.	Access to educational internet resources.		+		
116	7.	Functioning Wi-Fi on campus.		+		
117	8.	The university must strive to create conditions for educational, scientific and other activities. The development of infrastructure should be based on the results of monitoring satisfaction with the infrastructure by students, academic and administrative staff and other stakeholders.	+			
118	9.	The university must aim to ensure that educational equipment and software used in educational programs are equivalent to those used in relevant industries.		+		
119	10.	The university must ensure that its infrastructure meets security requirements.		+		
120	11.	The university must consider the needs of various student groups (adults, working students, international students, as well as students with disabilities).		+		
121	12.	The university creates conditions for students to advance along individual educational pathways		+		
Total			**2**	**10**	**0**	**0**
"Public Information" Standard						
122	1.	The information published by the university must be accurate, objective, up-to-date, and reflect all directions of the university's activities.		+		
123	2.	The university management must use various methods to disseminate information (including media, web resources, information networks, etc.) to inform the general public and stakeholders.			+	

124	3.	Public information must include support and clarification of national development programs of the country and the higher and postgraduate education system.		+		
125	4.	The university must publish audited financial statements on its own website.			+	
126	5.	The university must demonstrate reflection of information characterizing the university as a whole and in terms of educational programs on its website.		+		
127	6.	An important factor is the availability of adequate and objective information about academic staff in terms of individuals.		+		
128	7.	Informing the public about cooperation and interaction with partners, including scientific/consulting organizations, business partners, social partners and educational organizations, is an important factor.		+		
129	8.	The university must publish information and links to external resources on the results of external evaluation procedures.		+		
Total			**0**	**6**	**2**	**0**
TOTAL			**13**	**112**	**4**	**0**