

### **REPORT**

On the results of the work of the External Expert Evaluation Commission for compliance with the requirements of the standards for international institutional accreditation of educational organizations in the field of health care (based on WFME/AMSE/ESG)

FSGFEI HE VolgSMU Ministry of Healthcare of Russia December 11-12, 2023

### INDEPENDENT ACCREDITATION AND RATING AGENCY External Expert Commission

Addressed Accreditation IAAR Council



#### **REPORT**

On the results of the work of the External Expert Evaluation Commission for compliance with the requirements of the standards for international institutional accreditation of educational organizations in the field of health care (based on WFME/AMSE/ESG)

FSGFEI HE VolgSMU Ministry of Healthcare of Russia December 11-12, 2023

### **CONTENT**

(I) LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS	3
(II) INTRODUCTION	4
(III) INTRODUCTION OF THE EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION	4
(IV) DESCRIPTION OF THE PREVIOUS ACCREDITATION PROCEDURE	6
(V) DESCRIPTION OF THE VISIT OF EEC	6
(VI) COMPLIANCE WITH INSTITUTIONAL ACCREDITATION STANDARDS	
6.1. Mission and Values Standard	8
6.2. Standard "Educational Program"	9
6.3. Student Assessment Standard	
6.4. Standard "Learners"	14
6.5. Academic Staff/Faculty Standard	16
6.6. Educational Resources Standard	19
6.7. Quality Assurance Policy Standard	21
6.8. Management and Administration Standard	23
6.9. Constant Update Standard	25
(VII) AN OVERVIEW OF STRENGTHS/BEST PRACTICES FOR EACH STANDARD	28
(VIII) REVIEW OF QUALITY IMPROVEMENT RECOMMENDATIONS	29
(IX) REVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE DEVELOPMENT OF EDUCATION.	AL
ORGANIZATIONS	30
(X) RECOMMENDATION TO THE ACCREDITATION BOARD	30
Annex 1. Evaluation Table "PARAMETERS OF THE INSTITUTIONAL PROFILE"	31

#### (I) <u>LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS</u>

AMSE – Association of Medical Schools in Europe

ESG – Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in

the European Higher Education Area

IFMSA – International Federation of Medical Students'

Associations

WFME – World Federation for Medical Education

VSMI – Volgograd State Medical Institute

WHO – World Health Organization

ISAQE — Internal system for assessing the quality of education

EEC – External Expert Commission

SFA – State Final Attestation

SEC – State Examination Commission

USE – Unified State Exam

CMPE Institute, ICMPE – Institute of Continuing Medical and Pharmaceutical

Education

IPH – Institute of Public Health named after N.P.

Grigorenko

HAAP, IAAR – Independent Accreditation and Rating Agency

SCIM – Scientific Center for Innovative Medicines with Pilot

Production

UN – United Nations

EP – Educational program

IA – Intermediate Attestation

TS – Teaching Staff

PS – Professional standard

Mass media – Mass media

FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of - Volgograd State Medical University of the Ministry

the Ministry of of Healthcare of Russia

Healthcare of Russia,

VolgSMU

FSES HE - Federal'nyy gosudarstvennyy obrazovatel'nyy standart

vysshego ob

FAT – Valuation Fund

EIEE – Electronic information and educational environment

ELS – Electronic Library System

#### (II) INTRODUCTION

In accordance with Order No. 171-23-OD dated 13.10.2023 of the Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating, from December 11 to 12, 2023, an external expert commission assessed the compliance of standards for international institutional accreditation of educational organizations in the field of healthcare (based on WFME/AMSE/ESG) (No. 150-22-OD dated December 21, 2022, second edition).

The report of the External Expert Commission (EEC) contains an assessment of the submitted educational organization to the IAAR criteria, recommendations of the EEC for further improvement of the educational organization and the parameters of the institutional profile of the programs.

#### **Composition of the EEC:**

- 1) *Chairman of the IAAR Commission* Dosmagambetova Raushan Sultanovna, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Medical University of Karaganda (Republic of Kazakhstan) *Offline participation*
- 2) *IAAR Expert* Kirichenko Larisa Viktorovna, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, Perm State Medical University named after Academician E.A. Wagner of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia (Russian Federation) *Off-line participation*
- 3) *IAAR Expert* Elena S. Tulupova, Ph.D., Institute of Public Health and Medical Law, 1st Faculty of Medicine, Charles University (Czech Republic) *On-line participation*
- 4) IAAR Expert , Employer Tatyana N. Gerok, Chief Physician of the Multidisciplinary Clinic, Krasnodar Territory (Russian Federation) On-line participation
- 5) *IAAR expert*, *student* Mineev Aleksey Germanovich, resident of the Department of Therapy, Samara State Medical University (Russian Federation) *On-line participation*
- 6) *IAAR* Coordinator Malika Saidulaeva, Project Manager of the Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating (Republic of Kazakhstan) *Off-line participation*

#### (III) INTRODUCTION OF THE EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION

The VolgSMU of the Ministry of Health of Russia was founded in 1935 as the Stalingrad State Medical Institute (Decree of the Council of People's Commissars of the USSR dated 17.08.1935 No. 1818). By the Decree of the Presidium of the Supreme Soviet of the USSR of October 2, 1985, VSMI was awarded the Order of the Red Banner of Labor for its merits in the training of qualified specialists, the development of public health and medical science. In 1993, the Volgograd Medical Institute was transformed into the Volgograd Medical Academy (Order of the Council of Ministers – the Government of the Russian Federation dated 25.06.1993 No. 1127-R, the Order of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia dated 12.07.1993 No. 159). In 2003, the Volgograd Medical Academy was renamed into the State Educational Institution of Higher Professional Education "Volgograd State Medical University" of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia (Order of the Ministry of Education of the Russian Federation dated 08.01.2003 No. 10, Order of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia dated 11.02.2003 No. 102). In accordance with the Decree of the Government of the Russian Federation dated 10.09.2008 No. 1300-r, the University was assigned to the jurisdiction of the Ministry of Health and Social Development of the Russian Federation. In accordance with the order of the Ministry of Health and Social Development of the Russian Federation dated 28.04.2012 No. 434, the university was reorganized in the form of joining it as a separate subdivision (branch) of the State Educational Institution of Higher Professional Education "Pyatigorsk State Pharmaceutical Academy" of the Ministry of Health and Social Development of the Russian Federation. By the Decree of the Government of the Russian Federation dated 19.07.2012 No. 1286-r, the university was assigned to the jurisdiction of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia.

VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia is a legal entity – a budgetary institution (non-profit organization) established in accordance with the legislation of the Russian Federation;

By type it is an institution of higher education, by type it is a specialized university. By the decision of the Administration of the Volgograd region dated 05.07.1993 No. 3531 (information on the registration of a legal entity before 01.07.2002) it was registered in the Unified State Register of Legal Entities under No. 1023403441380. The founder of the university is the Russian Federation; the powers of the Founder are exercised by the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia. The activities of the university are organized in accordance with the Charter approved by the order of the Ministry of Health of Russia dated 23.06.2016 No. 396, which is amended as necessary. VolgSMU has a special permit (extract from the register of licenses) for the right to carry out educational activities; Certificate of State Accreditation No. 3181 dated 10.07.2019 and two annexes to it, issued by the Federal Service for Supervision in Education and Science, giving the right to carry out educational activities within the framework of the main university in three enlarged groups of specialties of secondary vocational education, four enlarged groups of areas of higher education of the first stage - bachelor's programs, five enlarged groups of specialties of higher education II Two enlarged groups of higher education training areas of the second stage – master's programs, thirteen enlarged groups of higher education specialties of the third stage training of highly qualified personnel (of which ten groups of specialties in postgraduate programs for the training of scientific and pedagogical personnel and three enlarged groups of specialties under residency programs).

The total number of students at the main university at the first and second levels of higher education is 7462 (of which 2521 are foreign students). 1222 people are trained in clinical residency at the university, of which 46 are foreign citizens.

The university has 10 scientific directions/scientific schools, 13 schools of excellence, 7 dissertation councils in the parent university and 1 dissertation council in the branch.

The university has wide international recognition, as evidenced by the export of educational services (over the past three years, the number of foreign students is about 42.6%; there are 17 existing agreements with partners from 6 countries; more than 4500 specialists with a diploma of VolgSMU work in 127 countries of the world. As part of the creation of competitive educational programs, VolgSMU signed an agreement on the implementation of joint educational programs with Bukhara State Medical University named after Abu Ali ibn Sino (Uzbekistan) in the specialties of General Medicine, Dentistry, Pediatrics. A project is being worked out with the Urenche branch of the Tashkent Medical Academy on SOPs in the direction of "Dentistry" and on continuing professional education programs, and also the trajectory of cooperation with Jinzhou Medical University (China) is also being worked out in terms of the implementation of an educational program in the specialty of Dentistry according to the 5+0 model. Active work is underway to recognize VolgSMU diplomas in foreign countries. On 07.10.2023, a cooperation agreement was signed with the National Union of Medical Students, which is the official representative of the International Association of Medical Students - IFMSA. This association provides an opportunity to undergo internships in different countries of the world, including Russia, as well as to create local (local) committees at the university to work on the current agenda of the WHO and the UN. Since the summer of 2023, work has been resumed within the framework of the Association of International Students of Russia. There is an expansion of the geography of admission and an increase in the share of foreign students in the total number of students. Thus, the number of students from South American countries has increased: in the 2023-2024 academic year, 17 students from South American countries (1 student from Colombia, 16 students from Ecuador) are studying at VolgSMU. As part of positioning VolgSMU as a provider of interests of regional Russian universities and companies abroad, close cooperation has been established with Jordan and India. Thus, a full range of agreements has been signed with Jordan (University of Jordan) (the last one was in 2023), which provides opportunities for expanding cooperation, including through IFMSA. In India, VolgSMU is one of the most recognizable medical universities. Work is underway in the direction of recognition of the Faculty of Dentistry of VolgSMU, for which a dossier of the university has been prepared for sending to the Dental Council of the country. As part of the

implementation of the direction for the internationalization of scientific research at VolgSMU, the issue of cooperation with the Mazandaran University of Medical Sciences (Islamic Republic of Iran) is being worked out in four areas: clinical pharmacology, medicinal chemistry, pharmacology, chemistry. Also, due to the large number of Egyptian students, work has been underway with Port Said University since 2022 to sign a cooperation agreement.

The university is represented in the following international ranking systems:

Scimago institutions rankings (SIR) – 569th place;

MosIUR – Three University Missions or Moscow International Ranking (Russia) – 1001st place;

It is present in the DEQAR database – the results of external quality control (contains information about accredited higher education institutions and educational programs).

## (IV) <u>DESCRIPTION OF THE PREVIOUS ACCREDITATION</u> PROCEDURE

International institutional accreditation of VolgSMU according to IAAR standards is carried out for the first time.

#### (V) DESCRIPTION OF THE VISIT OF EEC

The work of the EEC was carried out on the basis of the approved Program of the visit of the Expert Commission on Institutional Accreditation to VolgSMU in the period from December 11 to 12, 2023.

In order to coordinate the work of the EEC, on 10.12.2023, an introductory meeting was held, during which powers were distributed among the members of the commission, the schedule of the visit was clarified, and an agreement was reached on the choice of examination methods.

In order to obtain objective information about the quality of the organization of education and the entire infrastructure of the university, to clarify the content of self-assessment reports, meetings were held with the rector, vice-rectors of the university in the areas of activity, heads of structural divisions, deans of faculties, heads of departments, teachers, students, graduates, employers. A total of 164 representatives took part in the meetings (table 1).

Table 1 - Information about employees and trainees who took part in meetings with the IAAR EEC:

Category of participants	Quantity
Rector	1
Vice-Rectors and Head of the Rector's Office	3
Heads of structural subdivisions	12
Deans of Faculties	8
Heads of Departments	32
Teachers	35
Studying	36
Graduates	20
Employers	17
Altogether	164

During the tour, the members of the EEC got acquainted with the state of the material and technical base, visited the Scientific Center for Innovative Medicines with pilot production: the Laboratory of Toxicology, the Laboratory of Pharmacology of Cardiovascular Drugs, the Laboratory of Cell Technologies, the Laboratory of Morphopharmacology, the Laboratory of Neuropsychotropic Drugs, the Laboratory of Information Technologies in Pharmacology and Computer Modeling, Laboratory of Chemical and Pharmaceutical Technologies and Pilot Industrial Section of Finished Dosage Forms, Laboratory of Synthesis of Innovative Medicines

E-Medical Training Center: Department of Organization of Simulation Training and Primary Accreditation, Department of Organization of Simulation Training and Specialized Accreditation, Simulation Center of Obstetrics, Gynecology and Perinatology, Simulation Center for Pre-Hospital Care and Accreditation of Secondary Vocational Education Specialists.

At the meeting of the VEC IAAR with the target groups of VolgSMU, the mechanisms for the implementation of the university's policy were clarified and certain data presented in the university's self-assessment report were specified.

For the period of accreditation, classes were attended: 2 practical classes on "hygiene" for foreign students studying in Russian at the Faculty of Dentistry, teachers: Novikov D.S., Yatsyshena T.L.

In the course of their work, the members of the EEC visited the following practice bases: the Process Factory of VolgSMU, the Dental Clinical and Diagnostic Center of VolgSMU, and the Family Medicine Clinic.

In accordance with the accreditation procedure, a survey of 628 teachers, 2876 students, including junior and senior students, was conducted.

In order to confirm the information provided in the Self-Assessment Report, external experts requested and analyzed the working documentation of the university. Along with this, experts studied the Internet positioning of the university through the official website of the university https://www.volgmed.ru/.

Within the framework of the planned program, recommendations for improving the accredited educational organization of VolgSMU, developed by the EEC based on the results of the examination, were presented at a meeting with the management on 12.12.2023.

## (VI) COMPLIANCE WITH INSTITUTIONAL ACCREDITATION STANDARDS

#### 6.1. Mission and Values Standard

- An educational organization should:
- ✓ have a published statement outlining the NGO's mission, values, priorities, and goals.
- ✓ communicate the mission of the NGO to stakeholders and the health sector.
- ✓ describe the NGO's mission, values, educational goals, research functions, and relationship with health services and communities.
  - ✓ ensure that the mission of the NGO is aligned with the institutional strategy.
- ✓ Ensure the participation of faculty, students and other stakeholders in the development of the NGO mission.

#### Evidence

The mission of VolgSMU reflects the goals and educational strategy, allows to train competent specialists with higher medical, pharmaceutical, as well as secondary vocational education, is the basis for building the goal of the program of strategic development of the university and it consists in the continuous improvement of the professional level, ensuring global competitiveness by creating modern, effective conditions for education, practical training and education highly qualified medical, scientific, managerial personnel, development of advanced medical technologies, implementation of applied and fundamental research in demand by domestic and international professional environments.

The purpose of the university's mission is to ensure the leadership of the university in the domestic educational and scientific environment, the formation of a brand of quality, academic reputation and competitiveness in the international scientific and educational space.

The values of the Mission of VolgSMU are: life with the university; academic freedom; healthy lifestyle; openness and relevance of time at each stage of development; scientific breakthroughs; patriotism; conscientiousness.

The priorities of the Mission of VolgSMU are: the university highly values its traditions, combining fundamental and professional training of students, creates conditions for the formation and development of scientific schools; the university is developing as a multicultural space in which different ethnic cultures enrich each other and are a factor in the sustainability of social systems; the university as an open system develops partnerships with employers, consumers of educational institutions; services, educational and scientific centres, authorities and the public; The University supports integration into the world system of higher education, the development of new directions and technologies in the development of education and science, preserving the best traditions of domestic higher education; Teachers, staff, graduate students, residents and students are the main guarantor of the successful development of the VolgSMU of the Ministry of Health of Russia, forming an academic culture, contributing to the increase in educational, methodological and research potential, and establishing close cooperation with practical healthcare.

When formulating the Mission of VolgSMU, the transparency of the processes was noted, while the Mission, its goal, values and priorities for its achievement, are posted on the official website of the university, which ensures the availability and openness of this information for all interested parties (faculty, students, representatives of the employer, etc.).

The participation of faculty, trainees and other stakeholders in the development and revision of the Mission, its goals, values and priorities at all stages is documented.

#### Analytical part

Within the framework of the "Mission and Values" standard, in the course of the work of the expert commission and the analysis of the submitted documentation, compliance with the requirements of the standard was revealed. All stakeholders participated in the development and approval of the Mission: teaching staff, students, representatives of the practical sphere, employers.

The mission of VolgSMU is brought to the attention of interested parties by posting on the official website, on information stands of all structural divisions; informing during meetings of the department, academic councils of faculties, institutes, the academic council of the university and working meetings.

However, when interviewing the heads of structural units, teaching staff, students, and employers, no one was able to quote the Mission in full.

The main stakeholders in the formulation of the mission, its purpose, values and priorities are teaching staff, students and employers (Chief Physicians, Heads of Departments of Medical Organizations). The formulation of the mission, its educational and research functions is mainly entrusted to the teaching staff. Students, representatives of health authorities and employers are involved through the collegial governing bodies of the university (they are members of the Academic Council of the Federal State Budgetary Educational Institution of Higher Education of the Volgograd State Medical University of the Ministry of Health of Russia, academic councils of faculties, institutes, educational and methodological commissions of the faculties, the Institute of Scientific and Physical Education, the College of the Volgograd State Medical University, and are also members of the working groups on quality at the EMC of the Faculties, the Institute of Health.

Experts note that stakeholders (students and employers, etc.) found it difficult to answer what exactly was their personal participation in the development of the mission and its goal.

Satisfactory marks were given by experts on those items that formally comply with the standard, but require increased attention if the criteria of the standards are met.

#### Strengths/Best Practices:

No strengths were identified for this standard.

#### **Recommendations of the EEC:**

No.

#### Conclusions of the EEC on the following criteria:

- *Strong* 0
- Satisfactory 5
- Suggest improvements 0
- *Unsatisfactory* 0

#### 6.2. Standard "Educational Program"

- An educational organization should:
- ✓ Have procedures in place for the development and formal approval of the EP at the institutional level. Programs should be designed in accordance with established objectives, including the principles underlying the EP model used, the relationship between the components and the expected learning outcomes.
- ✓ Ensure that the qualifications obtained from the implementation of educational programmes are clearly defined and explained.
- ✓ determine the expected learning outcomes that students should master by graduation, as well as the expected learning outcomes for the structural units of the EP (disciplines/modules).
- ✓ In the development of the EP, ensure that the objectives of the EP are consistent with the institutional strategy and that there are clearly defined expected learning outcomes; participation of students and other stakeholders in the development of the EP; unhindered advancement of the student in the process of mastering the EP; Determining the expected workload of students (e.g., in credits or hours) Providing internship opportunities (where necessary).
- ✓ Ensure that the content of the EP includes the necessary sections to prepare learners for their role in practical health care and for their subsequent further learning.
- ✓ Use educational strategies and teaching methods to ensure that students achieve the expected learning outcomes.
- ✓ ensure that the choice of EP design is related to the mission, intended outcomes, resources, and context of the PO.

#### Evidence

According to the self-assessment report, as well as data obtained during interviews with faculty, students and employers, the group of EP developers includes: employees of the specialized dean's office, departments, the Department of Educational Programs, the Educational Department, as well as employees of specialized organizations, representatives of the employer and representatives of students.

All stakeholders participate in the process of assessing the quality of the EP at the stages of development, approval, review and annual update.

To improve the quality of educational programs, the opinion of teaching staff, who are the developers and implementers of educational programs, students and employers, as well as the academic performance of students, including intermediate and final ones, is studied annually. They express their opinions at meetings of collegial bodies at various levels and in the course of monitoring satisfaction surveys.

The training of students in the EP is based on the competency-based approach. Universal and general professional competencies in the EP are established by the FSES HE, and professional competencies are established by VolgSMU in accordance with the PS. The level of competence formation is assessed in the course of current and intermediate certification, the State Final Examination and in practice in accordance with the FAT and the certification procedure. All educational programs consist of three sections: disciplines, practice and state final certification. Number of hours by discipline and their ratio is established in accordance with the requirements of the regulatory framework, experience in the implementation of EP and the needs of employers.

The existing structure of training students at VolgSMU ensures the consistency of the presentation of educational material, acquired knowledge, skills, and the integration of disciplines horizontally and vertically. The EP provides for the study of optional and elective disciplines.

Members of the expert commission noted that today the mobility of students is implemented only in the course of educational or industrial practice.

Quality control of students' training in the EP is carried out in accordance with the requirements of the internal system for assessing the quality of education implemented at VolgSMU.

Based on the survey of students, it can be concluded that the quality of educational programs at the university 97.3 per cent of students are satisfied, and 96.6 per cent are satisfied with teaching methods in general.

#### Analytical part

Educational programs in various specialties at VolgSMU are developed in full accordance with the FSES HE, the professional standard, the mission of the university and its goal. The learning outcomes are well-thought-out and aimed at achieving the key competencies of medical graduates. Basic and profiling disciplines, the strategy of teaching and assessment with the involvement of external assessment by potential employers, continuity, transparency of the entire educational process fully correspond to the goal of comprehensive training of a competent graduate in accordance with the needs of practical healthcare.

The university has sufficient material and technical equipment of the EP and the availability of educational and scientific funds of literature, national and international scientific databases.

The EP is updated annually in accordance with the latest achievements and changes, as well as the results of scientific research of the teaching staff. Annual updates of the EP also concern information support, taking into account newly published and acquired educational publications, monographs, etc.

The quality of training of graduates and their professional competencies is confirmed by the characteristics and feedback from the heads of practice bases and employers.

The results of the EP update and employers' reviews can be found on the official website of the University.

In the process of interviewing students and teaching staff, the members of the expert commission noted that:

- not all teachers and students of the university are familiar with the mission of the EP, since it is presented only in electronic and printed versions of the EP themselves and are not presented on the website of the university and other information sources,
- only 1 representative of the student body, who is a member of collegial bodies, participates in the development and approval of the EP,
- Modern active teaching methods have been little introduced into the teaching process. In the process of surveying students, it was found out that 23% of respondents do not believe that the teacher presents the material in an interesting way.

At present, the EP at VolgSMU is built on the principle of traditional medical education, i.e. fundamental disciplines are studied in the first years with a subsequent transition to classes at clinical and specialized departments in the senior years. Fundamental disciplines are taught in the form of separate courses, without organized coordination at the interdepartmental level.

According to the EEC, in order to increase the effectiveness of training students and guarantee the achievement of the expected learning outcomes, it is necessary to develop and implement integrated programs in the educational process, in which the emphasis is placed on the formation of clinical competencies through the acquisition of practical and communicative skills starting from the first year, teaching fundamental disciplines in the context of the tasks of medical practice and attracting clinicians to lecture on basic aspects medical knowledge. Fundamental disciplines are studied in an integrated way within the framework of training modules focused on individual body systems. The learning process becomes active in its essence, meaning the independent role of students in organizing the discussion, determining the list of questions to prepare for classes and finding the necessary information. As a result, motivation is stimulated for the purposeful acquisition of fundamental knowledge that is in demand in clinical practice.

#### Strengths/Best Practices:

No strengths were identified for this standard.

#### Recommendations of the EEC:

- 1. Heads of educational programs need to post the missions of the EP on the official website of the University and information stands of the departments. Deadline: 01.03.2024
- 2. Heads of EPs are recommended to include modern active teaching and learning methods in the educational process, taking into account the best international practices (TBL, CBL, RBL, etc.). The deadline is 01.09.2024.
- 3. The management of the university should expand the participation of students in the development, approval and updating of the EP. The deadline is 01.09.2024.
- 4. Heads of educational programs to develop and implement integrated training programs in the educational process. Deadline until 01.09.2025.

#### Conclusions of the EEC on the following criteria:

- *Strong* − *0*
- *Satisfactory* 7
- Suggest improvements 0
- *Unsatisfactory* 0

#### 6.3. Student Assessment Standard

- An educational organization should:
- ✓ Define, approve and publish a student assessment policy, which is implemented through a centralized system of multiple, coordinated assessments that correspond to the expected learning outcomes. The student assessment policy is communicated to all stakeholders.
- ✓ Provide an assessment system that regularly offers students effective feedback, identifies their strengths and weaknesses, and helps them consolidate their learning. This formative assessment is linked to educational strategies that ensure that all learners have the opportunity to fulfil their potential.
- ✓ To integrate student-centered learning processes into their programs to encourage learners to take an active role in co-building the educational process, student assessment should reflect this approach.
- ✓ Provide a grading system on the basis of which progress and graduation decisions are made. A wide range of assessment methods and formats are used in the final assessment of learning outcomes depending on their "usefulness assessment", which includes a combination of validity, reliability, impact on learning, acceptability and effectiveness of assessment methods and format.
- ✓ use the results of student assessment to improve the work of academic staff, structural units of the EP (disciplines/modules), EP, and educational institution.
- ✓ Ensure that an assessment policy, with a centralized system that guides and supports its implementation, entails the use of a variety of summative and formative methods leading to the acquisition of the knowledge, clinical/practical skills, and behaviors required by the physician/specialist.
- ✓ ensure that the policy assessment system is consistent with the mission of the PO, its specific educational outcomes, available resources, and the context of the EP.
- ✓ Students are regularly assessed across disciplines (modules) and clinical internships to provide feedback that guides their learning, promotes early identification of underachieving learners and opportunities for improvement.

#### Evidence

On the basis of the self-examination report, interviews with teaching staff and students, members of the EEC, it was revealed that the assessment of students' learning outcomes is carried out in accordance with the requirements of the "Regulation on the forms, frequency, procedure for conducting current monitoring of academic progress and intermediate certification, as well as on the point-rating system for assessing the academic performance of students of the VolgSMU of the Ministry of Health of Russia". On the basis of this provision, funds of evaluation tools (FOS) are developed for each discipline, practice, including the procedure for certification of students (both current and intermediate) and assessment tools. The components of the FAT are placed in the EIEE of VolgSMU - on the page of the department on the university's website and in electronic courses of disciplines. practitioners at the EIEP of VolgSMU, where they are available to all interested parties.

The forms of current attestation are established by the FAT of the discipline. In the course of TA, the level of assimilation of knowledge, skills and abilities by students in the discipline is assessed. Assessment is carried out by marks in points on a five-point scale, the average of which at the end of the semester is converted into a mark on a hundred-point scale.

Forms of intermediate attestation are established by the curriculum of the EP. PA is conducted by teachers in the form of a test, a test with a grade, a term paper, and in the form of an exam. Assessment is carried out by marks in a hundred-point scale, which are converted into a five-point system (for an exam, a test with a grade) or a pass-fail system (for a pass).

The forms of the State Final Attestation (SFA) (state exam, defense of the final qualification work) are established by the educational program in accordance with the requirements of the FSES HE.

The SFA is conducted by the State Examination Commission (SEC), which includes at least 50% of the persons who are representatives of employers. Assessment is carried out by marks in a hundred-point system, which are converted into a five-point system.

Students are given the right to retake unsatisfactory PA results, as well as the right to retake the SFA.

All the necessary local regulatory documentation on the assessment of students, assessment tools, the procedure for certification for each discipline and practice are placed in the EIEE of VolgSMU.

The principles of attestation and the conditions for studying each discipline are necessarily brought to the attention of students at the first lesson on the discipline and practice by the teacher of the group.

The timeliness of feedback from students on the results of the assessment of their knowledge, skills, and abilities is ensured by directly communicating the results of attestation in seminar-type classes and entering them into the academic performance register, test and examination sheet, record book and EIEE of VolgSMU. Electronic journals are not used today.

The effectiveness and efficiency of the applied assessment system is discussed at the meetings of the departments and educational and methodological commissions of the faculties/institutes.

One of the effective forms influencing the objectivity of knowledge assessment is the use of a point-rating system.

Based on the study of the submitted materials, the members of the EEC consider it insufficient to include student-centered learning processes in educational programs, as well as the use of assessment methods and formats in the final assessment, including a combination of validity, reliability, acceptability and effectiveness.

#### Analytical part

According to this standard, in the process of analyzing the submitted documents, the results of interviews with teaching staff and students, it was revealed that there is evidence that the procedure for assessing students is clearly defined and is communicated to teachers and students.

The use of the point-rating system in assessing students' knowledge allows students to take responsibility for the quality of their education. However, due to the lack of electronic journals, students can only get acquainted with grades in teachers' paper journals, which limits the possibility of assessing their rating in real time.

Forms of student control are transparent and accessible to the stakeholders of the educational program.

According to the results of a survey of students conducted during the EEC visit, 96.4% of respondents were satisfied with the objectivity of the assessment of knowledge, skills and other academic achievements, 2.2% of students were not satisfied with the tests and exams. 85.4% of respondents fully agree that the evaluation criteria used by the teaching staff are clear and accessible, while 11.6% partially agree.

In the opinion of the EEC, little attention is paid to determining the validity and reliability of assessment methods in educational programs. A wider range of assessment methods and formats should be used, depending on their "usefulness assessment", which includes a combination of validity, reliability, impact on learning, acceptability and effectiveness of assessment methods and format, using modern software.

#### Strengths/Best Practices:

No strengths were identified for this standard.

#### Recommendations of the EEC:

- 1. EP supervisors are encouraged to use a wide range of assessment methods and formats on a regular basis, depending on their "usefulness assessment", which includes a combination of validity, reliability, impact on learning, acceptability and effectiveness of assessment methods and format. Deadline -01.09.2024
- 2. The management of the university is recommended to introduce electronic journals to ensure the documentation of the process of assessing students' academic achievements, their accessibility and openness.

The deadline is 01.12. Oct. 2024

#### Conclusions of the EEC on the following criteria:

- *Strong 0*
- *Satisfactory* 6
- Suggest improvements 2
- *Unsatisfactory* 0

#### 6.4. Standard "Learners"

- An educational organization should:
- ✓ have a publicly available policy that outlines the objectives, principles, criteria, selection and admission processes for students.
- ✓ Have pre-defined, published, and consistently enforced rules governing all periods of the student "life cycle," i.e., admission, performance, recognition, and certification.
- ✓ Provide students with accessible and confidential academic, social, psychological, and financial support services, as well as career guidance.
- ✓ when developing policies, consider the relationship between the number of students (including international students) and the resources, facilities and infrastructure available for their appropriate learning, equity and diversity issues, rules for re-application, deferred admission and transfer from other GS/EPs.
- ✓ In the process of selecting students, pay attention to the selection requirements, selection stages, mechanisms for submitting proposals, mechanisms for filing and receiving complaints.
- ✓ Offer and provide support to learners in developing academic skills, managing physical and mental health, personal wellbeing, managing finances, and career planning.

#### Evidence

Admission and selection to Volgograd State Medical University is carried out in accordance with the Charter of the Federal State Budgetary Educational Institution of Higher Education of the Volgograd State Medical University of the Ministry of Health of Russia and the annual admission rules adopted by the Academic Council of the University and approved by the Rector. Separate documents approve the Rules for admission to secondary vocational education programs, bachelor's, specialist's, master's programs, residency programs, on postgraduate training programs for scientific and scientific-pedagogical personnel. Admission to Bachelor's and Specialist's programs is based on the results of the USE and (or) entrance exams conducted by the university. Admission can also be carried out without conducting entrance exams in accordance with Part 5.2 of Article 71 of Federal Law No. 273-FZ. The results of the entrance exams are promptly posted on the admissions page of the VolgSMU website.

Information about special rights and benefits for admission to VolgSMU in 2023 is set out in section 4 of the Admission Rules, and is also posted as a separate file on the website.

There are various ways to submit documents for study: through the federal state information system "Unified Portal of State and Municipal Services (Functions)", through the electronic information system of the university, through public postal operators, by submitting documents in person to the university.

The admission rules developed at the university establish the features of admission to targeted training, the features of the admission of foreign citizens and stateless persons.

Information for applicants for specific educational programs, including the number of places, basic admission requirements, program benefits, and post-graduation prospects, is available on the website.

The number of places for admission is planned taking into account the Development Program of VolgSMU and is coordinated with the Health Committee of the Volgograd Region and the Ministry of Health of Russia.

Career guidance work at VolgSMU is carried out in two directions: attracting potential applicants and assisting in the employment of graduates.

Attraction of applicants is carried out through educational and enlightenment exhibitions, joint career guidance events with specialists of leading medical/pharmaceutical/other organizations at all-Russian exhibitions and forums. Every year, VolgSMU holds Open Days, information about which is published both on the information resources of the university (the

university's website, the official page of VKontakte, official Telegram channel), as well as on the websites of third-party organizations and local media.

There is a project "Partner School of Volgograd State Medical University", the Center for Pre-University Education "Pre-University of Volgograd State Medical University".

Career guidance work aimed at promoting the employment of graduates is carried out at the stage of training (master classes, schools of excellence) and at the end of training by the Center for Assistance to the Employment of Graduates by providing information about vacancies in medical institutions, pharmacies, pharmaceutical companies, diagnostic centers of Volgograd, the Volgograd region and other regions, as well as holding meetings with employers and representatives regional authorities and lawyers.

In order to support and advise students, to facilitate integration into university education, to guide them in choosing the most appropriate options for educational, cultural and social programs, the university has an institute of mentoring (mentoring).

Information about measures of social support at VolgSMU is posted on a special page of the official website of the university, in social networks, information stands of the university and dormitories, sent to the personal account, and also discussed at introductory and current course meetings. Experts note that the scholarship commissions of all faculties, the Institute of Health, and the college of Volgograd State Medical University include representatives of students. Students are regularly awarded prizes, grants and scholarships as an encouragement for excellent studies, active participation in social, scientific and sports life.

The university also provides for such types of encouragement of students as moral stimulation - awarding certificates of honor, letters of thanks from the rector, entry on the Board of Honor, including virtual. The participation of students in scientific, social and sports life is stimulated by additional rating points in disciplines on the basis of the Regulation on the forms, frequency, procedure for conducting current monitoring of academic progress and intermediate certification, as well as on the point-rating system for assessing academic performance.

In order to provide measures of social support and stimulate research work, personal scholarships are awarded by the order of the rector. The university is developing a system of socio-pedagogical and psychological assistance to socially vulnerable students and student families.

VolgSMU has the National Center for Scientific Equipment, the Center for Collective Use of Scientific Equipment, and a Simulation Pharmacy, which ensure the efficiency of activities

Volunteer and volunteer activities of students are developed and supported at VolgSMU. The University has a Volunteer Center of VolgSMU and Public Health Volunteers.

More than 30 sports sections have been organized for students, and the VOLGOMED sports and recreation complex is functioning.

The university has created conditions to ensure inclusive education of students belonging to the category of disabled and persons with LHC in programs of secondary vocational, higher and additional education. For this purpose, the Department of Inclusive Education has been specially created.

The body of student self-government at the university is the Student Council of VolgSMU Its activities are regulated by the relevant Regulations and are covered in detail in social networks and on the university's website.

The work of student self-government bodies at VolgSMU is carried out in priority areas of student life: educational, scientific, and social. They actively interact with departments, deans of faculties, the director of the Institute of Health, the rectorate and the administration of the university (in the form of permanent representation as part of the academic council of the faculties and the university, the Educational and Methodological Commission and the Commission for the Consideration of Students' Applications for Transfer from Paid to Free Education, etc.

#### Analytical part

At VolgSMU, the requirements for the standard are met to a sufficient extent. It should be noted that the selection and admission to the university is carried out in accordance with the Federal Law on Education in the Russian Federation, the admission procedure, and the admission rules. Information about the conditions of admission is in the public domain and applicants are provided with equal, open and accessible conditions for admission. The most deserving applicants are selected for enrollment, determined by the sum of the points of entrance exams and individual achievements.

The university's policy in the field of admission and selection of students is transparent, uniform and accessible.

Students are given the opportunity to participate in advisory bodies, in the evaluation and improvement of the EP.

But at the same time, in the course of interviews with students, it was revealed that students who are members of the academic councils of the faculties and the university do not regularly attend meetings and cannot remember whether the issues of formulating the mission, content and implementation of educational programs were discussed at those meetings where they were present.

In the course of interviewing students and graduates of the EP, members of the EEC found that during meetings with the heads of departments, the dean's office, students have the opportunity to express their opinion and wishes about the EP, the organization of the educational process and its quality, financial and social issues.

The results of the survey of students showed high (over 95%) indicators of satisfaction in terms of the attitude and level of accessibility of the dean's office, the availability and responsiveness of the university management, the support of educational materials in the learning process, the availability of counseling on personal problems, the financial and administrative services of the educational institution, the level of availability of library resources, the quality of services provided in libraries and reading rooms, the existing educational resources of the university. the usefulness of the website of educational organizations in general and faculties in particular, the clarity of the procedure for taking incentives and disciplinary measures, the general quality of curricula, teaching methods in general, the quality of teaching.

#### Strengths/Best Practices:

No strengths were identified for this standard.

#### Recommendations of the EEC:

No.

#### Conclusions of the EEC on the following criteria:

- *Strong* 0
- Satisfactory 6
- Suggest improvements 0
- *Unsatisfactory* 0

#### 6.5. Academic Staff/Faculty Standard

- An educational organization should:
- ✓ have a sufficient number of qualified teaching staff necessary for the implementation and implementation of the EP, taking into account the number of students, teaching and learning styles.
- ✓ have objective and transparent processes for the recruitment, professional development and development of all staff to guarantee the competence of their teachers.
  - ✓ implement the declared policy of continuous professional development of its teaching staff.
- ✓ Define a policy for the recruitment of academic staff, including consideration of the number, level, qualifications of academic staff required to provide the planned EP to the expected number of students, the distribution of the faculty by profile, qualification and seniority.

- ✓ Recognize the importance of teaching, develop clear, transparent and objective criteria for recruitment, appointment, promotion, dismissal and follow in their activities.
- ✓ To provide opportunities for career development and professional development of teachers, to encourage scientific activities to strengthen the link between education and research, innovative teaching methods and the use of advanced technologies.

#### **Evidence**

The personnel policy for the selection and admission of teaching staff at the university, as well as the qualification requirements for applicants for teaching positions and for the positions of researchers, the process of considering candidates for teaching positions and career advancement of teaching staff are determined by the Labor Code of the Russian Federation, Federal Law No. 273-FZ of 29.12.2012 "On Education in the Russian Federation" and other regulatory legal acts of the Russian Federation.

The University has a Personnel Policy (Regulation on the Personnel Policy of the Federal State Budgetary Educational Institution of Higher Education of VolgSMU of the Ministry of Health of Russia for 2023-2026, approved by Order No. 239-KO dated 02/15/2023), one of the most important functions is the formation of a personnel reserve to fill the leadership positions of scientific and pedagogical workers within the framework of the program "Start your career at VolgSMU!". For young employees, there are Schools of Young Specialists and a developed mentoring system, which is part of the personnel policy of the university.

The staff of the teaching staff is approved by the staffing table based on the needs of the EP. In accordance with the self-assessment report and interviews during the visit of the EEC to the university, an analysis of the movement of personnel in the context of teaching staff is carried out twice a year.

The total number of teaching staff is 1661 people, of which 755 work on a permanent basis. The degree of teaching staff as a whole is 65% (Candidate of Sciences - 823, Doctor of Sciences - 261). In accordance with the requirements of the FSES HE, practitioners are also involved in the positions of teaching staff - managers and (or) employees of other healthcare organizations, including on the terms of external part-time employment. The ratio of the average annual number of students per teacher is 9.0:1 in general; in specialties: "General Medicine", "Pharmacy" - 8.5-9.0:1, "Dentistry" - 8.0-8.5:1, for other specialties and areas - 9.5-11.0:1.

The university has sufficient economic conditions to attract teaching staff in accordance with the Regulation on the remuneration of employees, approved by the order of the Federal State Budgetary Educational Institution of Higher Education of the VolgSMU of the Ministry of Health of Russia dated 04/29/2021 No. 536-KO. The average salary of teaching staff for 2022 is more than 2 times higher than the average for the constituent entity of the Russian Federation.

The University applies various methods of material and non-material incentives using the system of rating assessment of the activities of teaching staff in accordance with the Regulation on the rating assessment of the activities of teachers of the Federal State Budgetary Educational Institution of Higher Education of the VolgSMU of the Ministry of Health of Russia. Also, a competition for the best educational publication is held in accordance with the Regulations on the annual competition for the best educational publication, different types of incentives are used, such as the Rector's Commendation, the Rector's Certificate of Honor, the Badge of Honor "For Merit to the University" (has 3 degrees), the honorary title (status) "Honorary Professor", approved by Order No. 1564-KO dated 12/23/2020 "On Approval of the Regulations on Awards and Honorary Titles (Statuses) of the Volga State Medical University of the Ministry of Health of Russia". According to the data presented, dozens of university employees annually receive awards from ministries and departments, local self-government bodies, etc.

Professional development of teaching staff is carried out on the basis of individual plans, including mandatory accreditation in accordance with the legal documents of the Russian Federation. Training of teaching staff under advanced training and retraining programs on the basis of the Regulation on the organization of additional professional education of teachers of the Federal State Budgetary Educational Institution of Higher Education of the VolgSMU of the

Ministry of Health of Russia, approved by the Ministry of Health of Russia. Order No. 400-KO dated 15.03.2023 and the Regulations on the Development and Implementation of Additional Educational Programs at VolgSMU, approved. Order No. 1624-KO dated 09/28/2023. There is a Center for Additional Education of the Institute of Public Health named after N.P. Grigorenko, which provides teaching staff with advanced training courses in the field of electronic education, pedagogical competencies, language training for teaching staff for teaching in English, and the advanced training program "Head of an educational organization (management in the field of education)". The university is implementing an innovative project "System of Continuous Pedagogical Development of Teachers of a Medical University (School of Pedagogical Excellence)", participants receive additional points in the teacher's personal rating to receive an incentive bonus.

The university has a system of internal scientific grants in accordance with the Regulations on the Intra-University Competition of Research Works, approved by the University of the Russian Federation. Order No. 1288-KO dated 03.11.2020. The results of scientific research are presented in the form of 81 patents for inventions, 242 acts of implementation in medical practice. Employees of the university are developers of clinical protocols and recommendations, are the authors of 12440 scientific papers in Russian and international scientific journals, etc. These results are introduced into the learning process through the publication of monographs, textbooks, methodological recommendations, and manuals.

Academic mobility of teaching staff at the university is in the process of development, at the moment 19 agreements have been concluded with universities in Uzbekistan, the Republic of Belarus, Iran and other countries, the exchange of lectures was carried out in an online format.

This information is confirmed by the documents provided and the results of interviews during the EEC visit.

#### Analytical part

The personnel policy of VolgSMU complies with the strategies and regulatory documents of the Russian Federation, as well as regulations and strategic documents of the university. The HR policy covers the range of all necessary issues of recruitment, qualifications, promotion and professional development. As can be concluded on the basis of the data provided, the university uses a flexible system for the formation of the teaching staff, including the use of a personnel reserve, the involvement of external specialists from both academic staff and practitioners, including external part-timers, etc. Thus, taking into account also sufficient economic opportunities and competitive salaries, it can be concluded that the university has all the necessary resources to attract and retain qualified teaching staff

At the same time, the university has a system of confirmation (through regular accreditation) and development of the qualifications of teaching staff through additional professional education and advanced training according to an individual plan, including on the basis of its own Center for Continuing Education of the Grigorenko Institute of Public Health. At the same time, in addition to individual courses of additional education and advanced training in the necessary areas, the university also implements such innovative programs as "Head of an Educational Organization (Management in the Field of Education)" and "System of Continuous Pedagogical Development of Teachers of a Medical University (School of Pedagogical Excellence)". Thus, the university ensures the development of both pedagogical, scientific and managerial potential of its employees, as well as the transfer of best practices and continuity with the help of the School of Young Specialists and the mentoring system.

The university applies various methods of material and non-financial incentives, motivation and promotion of employees for achievements in the professional field, including incentive payments based on personal rating, grant support for scientific work, various distinctions and awards. Achievements are included in the personal rating, which is taken into account both for financial incentives and for inclusion in the talent pool. Thus, the university

provides transparent procedures for professional growth and assessment of the quality of teaching staff.

In recent years, the increase in the number of cooperation agreements concluded with foreign universities indicates the motivation of the university in the development of international cooperation and academic mobility of teaching staff. However, at present, the mobility of teaching staff is limited to the online format.

Thus, the policies and activities of the university meet the requirements of the Standard.

#### Strengths/Best Practices:

No strengths were identified for this standard.

#### Recommendations of the EEC:

- 1) To expand the directions and forms of academic mobility of teaching staff.
- 2) To expand opportunities for professional development of teaching staff in the field of EP development, assessment methods, and the creation of integrated programs.

#### Conclusions of the EEC on the following criteria:

- *Strong* 0
- *Satisfactory* 6
- Suggest improvements 0
- *Unsatisfactory* 0

#### 6.6. Educational Resources Standard

- An educational organization should:
- ✓ Ensure that adequate, accessible, and appropriate learning resources and student support services are available.
- ✓ Have appropriate and sufficient resources to ensure that trainees receive the necessary clinical/practical training.
- ✓ Provide adequate access to virtual and physical information resources to support the mission of the GS and SO.
- ✓ Provide training with appropriate attention to the safety of the learning environment and patients, including observation of the trainee's activities in clinical/industrial settings.
- ✓ When allocating and planning and providing educational resources with support services, take into account the needs of different groups of students (adults, employed, part-time, international students, persons with disabilities) and take into account the trends of student-centered learning
- ✓ Ensure that all resources are accessible and aligned with learning objectives, and that learners are informed of available services.
  - ✓ Ensure that management and specialized services play a key role in the provision of support services

#### Evidence

The educational and material base of VolgSMU includes premises for training, accommodation, research, medical, creative, social and humanitarian, extracurricular and other activities with a total area of 162000 sq. m., including: 8 educational buildings; 3 dormitories for 1380 people; Scientific and Fundamental Library, Volgomed Sports and Recreation Complex (2016), Sports and Health Camp, Multidisciplinary Clinic No. 1, Family Medicine Clinic, Center for Electronic Medical Education, Center for Dental Practices, Veterinary Center, Dental Clinical and Diagnostic Center, Scientific Center for the Development of Innovative Medicines with Pilot Production (2018). Each dormitory has student recreation areas, a gym, and a sports ground. Educational buildings are equipped with a canteen or buffet.

Since 2019, projects have been implemented to repair and modernize dormitories and educational buildings, a simulation center for endoscopic surgery and intraluminal endoscopy, as well as a student co-working space "LOFT". Since 2020, the Center for Youth Innovative Creativity (specializing in bioprinting technologies) has been operating.

The security system of the university includes anti-terrorist security measures, fire safety,

health protection of students and employees of the university, workplace safety in accordance with state regulations and internal orders and instructions. The Integrated Security Department is responsible for the functioning of the security system.

The university has created conditions to ensure inclusive education for people with disabilities and persons with LHC, according to programs of adapted secondary vocational, higher and additional education. The Department of Inclusive Education of VolgSMU is engaged in ensuring inclusive education, including the use of distance and contact educational technologies. The infrastructure for inclusive education includes, in particular, the Center for Collective Use for Interdisciplinary Training of People with Disabilities and Persons with LHC, the Center for Social and Domestic Adaptation of Persons with Disabilities and Persons with LHC, located in the reading room of the library of VolgSMU.

Clinical and practical training of students is carried out on the basis of their own clinics (Clinic No. 1, Family Medicine Clinic and Dental Clinical and Diagnostic Center) and on the basis of 116 cooperation agreements and 12 contracts for the gratuitous use of non-residential premises with 10 healthcare organizations. For practical training, the Interdepartmental Center for the Development of Practical Skills and Research Work of the Faculty of Pharmacy, The Process Factory of the Department of Public Health and Health Care of the CMPE Institute and the Simulation Pharmacy of VolgSMU.

Provision of information resources is carried out on the basis of the Regulation on the Information Development Department. VolgSMU has a modernized library with a fund of 855800 units of printed and electronic documents, and the Center for Electronic Medical Education of VolgSMU. The electronic library system "EBS VolgSMU", which is part of the electronic library, subscribes to 15 network professional electronic full-text databases, 115334 of placed electronic documents. According to interviews conducted during the EEC visit, the library does not have subscriptions to specialized journals devoted to medical education. Electronic full-text resources of the library are integrated into the "Electronic Information Educational Environment of VolgSMU" (EIEE), access is provided through an electronic personal account. To create its own educational resources, a multidisciplinary educational student center is used - the Allegro media studio of VolgSMU.

This information is confirmed by the documents provided and the results of interviews during the EEC visit.

#### Analytical part

The university has a developed material and technical base, including its own educational buildings, dormitories, sports and recreation complexes, and a library. At the same time, the documents provided and the results of interviews during the visit of the EEC also indicate that the university is constantly developing its educational and material base - equipment is being modernized, major repairs are being carried out, and new centers are being built.

The presence of a comprehensive safety system, which includes various aspects of occupational health and safety and the creation of a safe environment for students and employees under the leadership of the Integrated Security Department, indicates a high degree of attention to safety issues in the educational process on the part of the university.

The data provided also indicate that VolgSMU has the necessary resources for inclusive education, including adapted educational programs, specialized centers that help both in matters of education and social adaptation.

In the materials provided and during the visit, the availability of printed and electronic resources, the electronic educational environment, the formation of which was completed by the creation of the Center for Electronic Medical Education of VolgSMU, was also demonstrated. However, at present, the university does not have subscriptions to specialized journals devoted to medical education.

In addition to external educational resources, the university has the technical capabilities to create its own educational materials in various forms, as evidenced by the creation of a

multidisciplinary media studio "Allegro" of VolgSMU.

Thus, the activities of the university meet the requirements of the Standard.

#### Strengths/Best Practices:

A well-developed network of resources for clinical and practical training of students, including both its own clinics and a significant number of contracted medical institutions, as well as such innovative centers for practicing practical skills as the Interdepartmental Center for Practicing Practical Skills and Research Work of the Faculty of Pharmacy, the Simulation Center for Endoscopic Surgery and Intraluminal Endoscopy, the Process Factory of the Department of Public Health and of the CMPE Institute and the Simulation Pharmacy of Volgograd State Medical University.

#### Recommendations of the EEC:

To include subscriptions to specialized national and periodicals on medical education in the Electronic Library System "EBS VolgSMU". The deadline is March 2024.

#### Conclusions of the EEC on the following criteria:

- *Strong 1*
- Satisfactory 6
- Suggest improvements 0
- *Unsatisfactory* 0

#### 6.7. Quality Assurance Policy Standard

- An educational organization should:
- ✓ Have a quality assurance system that addresses the educational, administrative, and research components of the institution's activities.
- ✓ have a published quality assurance policy that is part of its strategic management. Internal stakeholders should develop and implement this policy through appropriate structures and processes with the involvement of external stakeholders.
- ✓ Have a process and outcome monitoring programme that includes the collection and analysis of data on key aspects of the EP to ensure that the educational process is carried out appropriately and to identify any areas that require intervention, and data collection is part of the administrative procedures in relation to student admission, student assessment and completion.
- ✓ define policies and procedures as the basis for a coherent and consistent NGO quality assurance system, official status and be accessible to the general public.
- ✓ Ensure that quality assurance policies reflect the link between research, teaching and learning and take into account the national and intra-university context; supports the organization of a quality assurance system; structural subdivisions of the NGO, management, teaching staff and students performing quality assurance duties; processes to ensure academic reputation and freedom, processes to prevent intolerance of any kind and discrimination against students and teachers; Participation of external stakeholders in quality assurance.

#### Evidence

In accordance with the Charter of the University, the employees of the University in their activities are guided by the Mission, Vision, Policy and Goals in the field of quality, documents necessary for the functioning of the quality management system in accordance with the requirements of STB ISO 9001. The Quality Management System (QMS) was implemented at VolgSMU in 2010, the university formulated the Quality Policy of the VolgSMU of the Ministry of Health of Russia posted on the university's website. Quality goals are set annually and approved at a conference of staff and students, the minutes of which are available on the university's website. The strategy and priority areas for the development of the university are defined in the Development Program of the Volga State Medical University of the Ministry of Health of Russia for 2022–2024.

Since 2007, VolgSMU has been regularly certified within the framework of the Russian Register system (currently the certificate is valid until 26.1.2026), a supervisory audit of the quality management system for compliance with the current ISO standard is carried out.

The Intra-University System for Assessing the Quality of Education (ISAQE) of VolgSMU includes a system of internal control in all areas of activity; internal audits of departments; assessment of satisfaction with the quality of education of the participants in relations in the field of education; TS rating; monitoring of students' educational achievements; state final attestation of graduates; the results of surveys of participants in relations in the field of education; The main document for the analysis of the effectiveness of the QMS implementation is the annual Report on the results of the self-examination of VolgSMU.

The Assistant to the Rector is responsible for the implementation of the QMS. The main elements of the comprehensive support of the QMS functioning at each faculty/institute are a permanent working group on quality, whose representatives take an active part in the meetings of the relevant collegial bodies - the EMC and the Academic Council of the faculty/institute.

Monitoring procedures within the framework of the ISAQE VolgSMU are carried out in accordance with the <u>Regulation on the intra-university system for assessing the quality of education in the FSBEI HE of the Volgograd State Medical University of the Ministry of Health of Russia in the following areas:</u>

monitoring the quality of the admission campaign;

monitoring the quality of students' mastering of the EP;

monitoring of the quality of the EP;

monitoring of the quality of the work of the teaching staff;

monitoring of the satisfaction of participants in relations in the field of education with the quality and conditions of educational activities;

monitoring of the EIEE of VolgSMU;

monitoring of graduates' employment and their professional achievements

Monitoring of the satisfaction of participants in relations in the field of education with the quality and conditions of educational activities, which is provided by the Office of Educational Programs on the basis of the Regulations. The results of monitoring are discussed at meetings of departments, academic councils of faculties/institutes, rectorates and are brought to the attention of interested parties, posted in the EIEE of VolgSMU.

Currently, the university is implementing a number of projects aimed at the effective development of the main areas of activity, including human resources, improvement of management processes, for example, "Lean University - VolgSMU", programs "Project Office" and "Process Factory". In addition to external experts, their own departments are involved in the creation and implementation of projects, for example, the scientific developments of the Departments of Public Health and Health Care of the Institute of Health and the CMPE Institute of the University are used, employees take advanced training courses "Topical issues of the implementation of lean technologies in medical organizations" on the basis of the Center for Electronic Medical Education of VolgSMU.

The above information is confirmed by the documents provided and the results of interviews during the EEC visit.

#### Analytical part

The documents provided and interviews during the visit of the EEC confirm that VolgSMU has a quality control policy, which is based on the strategic documents of the university and published on the university's website. The university also involves staff, students and other stakeholders in the discussion and decision-making on quality issues, as evidenced by the minutes of the conference of employees and students and meetings of collegial bodies.

The university uses various mechanisms of both external (accreditation, certification, licensing) and internal quality control in various areas of activity and management, including various areas of internal audit. At the same time, the system of quality working groups ensures the active involvement of all stakeholders in the quality management system of educational processes and programs.

The data provided confirm the existence of a monitoring system within the framework of

the QMS, which covers various aspects of the activities of VolgSMU, as well as the results of educational activities and relationships between all participants in the educational process, employers and graduates.

The implementation of new projects in the field of quality management (for example, "Lean University – VolgSMU", the "Project Office" and "Process Factory" programs) indicates that the university is taking measures to improve its QMS and involve employees in the processes of quality management and improvement both through trainings and the proposal and implementation of its own projects.

Thus, the policies and activities of the university meet the requirements of the Standard.

#### Strengths/Best Practices:

No strengths were identified for this standard.

#### Recommendations of the EEC:

No.

#### Conclusions of the EEC on the following criteria:

- *Strong* 0
- Satisfactory 5
- Suggest improvements 0
- *Unsatisfactory* 0

#### 6.8. Management and Administration Standard

- An educational organization should:
- ✓ Have a defined governance structure for teaching, learning, research, and resource allocation that is transparent and accessible to all stakeholders, is consistent with the mission and functions of the institution, and ensures its sustainability.
- ✓ ensure that it collects, analyses and uses relevant information to effectively manage its activities and its EPs.
- ✓ Have policies and procedures in place to engage or advise students and faculty on key aspects of educational activities and the EP management process.
- ✓ have appropriate and sufficient administrative support to achieve their teaching, learning and research objectives.
- ✓ inform the public about its activities (including programmes). The information provided must be clear, reliable, objective, up-to-date and accessible.
- ✓ determine the mechanisms for collecting and analyzing information about their activities, their EPs and use the data obtained in the work of the internal quality assurance system.
- ✓ Develop a review policy and process to ensure adequate and effective administrative, staffing and budgetary support for all NGO activities.
- ✓ Provide information on their activities, including the EPs being implemented, the expected learning outcomes of these EPs, the qualifications awarded, teaching, learning, assessment procedures, passing scores and learning opportunities provided to students, as well as information on graduate employment opportunities.

#### Evidence

The management of VolgSMU activities is carried out in accordance with the Charter. Direct management of the university is carried out by the rector. Operational management is the rectorate. The distribution of powers between the Rector and the Vice-Rectors is fixed by the relevant order, job descriptions of the Vice-Rectors and the regulations of their subordinate structural divisions.

The main elected representative body is the Academic Council chaired by the Rector, which includes deans of faculties, directors of institutes, heads of departments, representatives of practical health care, representatives of the trade union committee of employees and students, representatives of students.

Public and collegial associations of the university are also academic councils of faculties/institutes, commissions (e.g. educational and methodological), the managerial

competencies and functions of which are determined by the relevant regulations and regulations.

The structure of the university includes a college, 5 faculties (medical, pediatric, dental, medical and biological, pharmaceutical), 2 institutes (Institute of Public Health, Institute of Continuing Medical and Pharmaceutical Education), 78 departments (including 45 clinical) and other structural units. Direct management of the organizational units of the university is carried out by deans, directors of institutes, heads of departments, all these positions are elected in accordance with the Charter.

The administrative management of the university is based on the Mission and Quality Policy. The process of providing educational programs with professional personnel is managed by the Human Resources Department. The management of the educational process is carried out jointly by the Department of Educational Programs and the Educational Department on the basis of the Regulations on the Management of Educational Programs and the Regulations on the Educational Administration. The management of the processes of informatization and digitalization is carried out by the management of information development by the Regulation on the Department of Information Development. All information on the activities of the departments and the relevant Regulations are posted on the university's website.

Informing the public and all participants in the field of educational relations about the activities of VolgSMU, EP, learning outcomes, educational opportunities, etc. is carried out through the EIEE of VolgSMU (official website and electronic information and educational portal), as well as through speeches by representatives of the university administration and teaching staff in the media, publications in social networks (university-wide communities/chats in VK, Telegram, communities/chats of individual EPs, alumni associations, etc.)

The course of educational activities is also recorded in the EIEE of VolgSMU and all regulatory and administrative acts and other organizational documents are placed, which are also sent to the heads of structural divisions through the electronic document management system Directum RX and/or by e-mail corporate mail. Training seminars for teaching staff are held according to the current regulatory requirements of educational activities and management of educational programs.

Information is collected and managed using the Directum RX electronic document management system. The types of data to be managed (documentation) are determined by the nomenclature of files or electronic catalogs in the electronic document management system. The protection of information containing personal data is carried out in accordance with the Regulation on Work with Personal Data in the Federal State Budgetary Educational Institution of Higher Education of the Volga State Medical University of the Ministry of Health of Russia.

Volgograd State Medical University of the Ministry of Health of Russia is a budgetary organization and is financed from the federal budget (in 2022 - 34.4%), income received from entrepreneurial activities (40.7%), income from the Compulsory Medical Insurance Fund (13.6%) and gratuitous (sponsorship) assistance from legal entities, individual entrepreneurs, individuals.

Participation of teaching staff and students in the activities of the university is carried out through their representation in collegial bodies (the Academic Council of VolgSMU, academic councils of faculties/institutes, educational and methodological commissions, etc.), collecting the opinions of stakeholders during monitoring within the framework of the ISAQE procedures, as well as through direct communication with the university administration through personal meetings, communication through the official website of the university (the "Ask a question" button), phone, e-mail, social media.

The above information is generally confirmed by the documents provided and the results of interviews during the EEC visit.

#### Analytical part

Based on the presented data, it can be concluded that the university has a clear management structure both at the level of the rectorate and collegial bodies of the university and individual departments.

The university has a well-developed administrative apparatus acting on the basis of relevant regulatory documents that formulate the policy and procedures of the university in relation to various aspects of the functioning of the organization and the educational programs being implemented.

The University actively uses various means of virtual communication, as well as the capabilities of its electronic information system (EIEE of VolgSMU) to bring to the attention of all interested parties the necessary regulatory and administrative acts and other documents, as well as to record the progress of educational activities. Thus, the transparency of the management system and the transparency of management decisions made both in relation to administrative aspects and the management of the educational process itself is ensured.

The presence of differentiated sources of financing of the university, both on the basis of the federal budget and as a result of entrepreneurial activities and other sources, as well as the absence of overdue debts, indicates the financial stability of the university and the availability of sufficient resources for the implementation of educational activities.

The university also uses a variety of mechanisms for obtaining feedback to make managerial decisions from faculty and students within the framework of representation in collegial bodies, during monitoring within the framework of the ESOKO procedures, as well as through personal meetings and virtual communication with the university administration.

Thus, the policies and activities of the university meet the requirements of the Standard.

#### Strengths/Best Practices:

No strengths were identified for this standard.

#### Recommendations of the EEC:

No.

#### Conclusions of the EEC on the following criteria:

- *Strong* − 0
- Satisfactory 8
- Suggest improvements 0
- Unsatisfactory 0

#### 6.9. Constant Update Standard

- An educational organization should:
- ✓ Monitor and periodically evaluate programs to ensure that they achieve their purpose and meet the needs of learners and society. The results of these processes should lead to continuous improvement of the EP. All stakeholders should be informed of any planned or undertaken actions in relation to the EP.
- ✓ undergo external quality assurance procedures in accordance with European standards and recommendations on a regular basis.
- ✓ In the monitoring, periodic evaluation and revision of the EP, include an assessment of the content of the EP taking into account the latest scientific achievements in a particular discipline to ensure the relevance of the discipline taught; the changing needs of society; workload, academic performance and graduation of students; the effectiveness of student assessment procedures; expectations, needs and satisfaction of students with the EP training; educational environment and support services and their relevance to the goals of the program.
- $\checkmark$  Regularly evaluate and revise the EP with the involvement of students and other stakeholders and publish the changes made.
- ✓ Regularly participate in external quality assurance procedures which, where necessary, take into account the requirements of the legislation under which they operate.

#### **Evidence**

Constant updating of all aspects of VolgSMU's activities is carried out on the basis of the Development Program for 2022-2024. One of the main mechanisms for continuous improvement of processes at the university, improving the quality of education is internal audits in accordance

with the requirements of the ESOKO. The results of monitoring are considered at the meetings of the academic councils of faculties/institutes, the rector's office, the academic council of VolgSMU and serve as the basis for determining measures to update and improve the quality of processes at the university.

The analysis of the implementation of the planned indicators and activities is carried out annually, taking into account the results of external and internal audits, reports of commissions, on which the relevant vice-rectors make analytical reports on the types of activities at the Academic Council (for example, the report of the Vice-Rector for Educational Activities in May 2023). If necessary, changes are made to the next year's targets.

As part of the monitoring and annual updating of the EP, measures are taken to improve its quality based on the analysis of data from the internal quality management system (ERMS):

- students' academic performance;
- feedback from the teaching staff (monitoring of satisfaction, meetings of the department dedicated to the introduction of current scientific achievements in the EP, to introduce innovative teaching methods, to introduce new modern equipment into the educational process, etc.);
  - feedback from employers (collegial bodies, satisfaction monitoring);
- feedback from students (collegial bodies, satisfaction monitoring). The results of various types of internal audits are communicated to stakeholders, for example, in the form of memos (e.g., based on the results of the audit of the organization, the conduct and documentary support of the educational activities of the departments, or the support of educational and industrial practices). The results of interviews with students during the EEC visit confirm both the openness of the teaching staff and the university administration to receiving feedback from students, and real changes in the educational process on the recommendations of students, for example, to change the procedure for assessing students in some subjects, the inclusion of additional hours and support for students in preparation for state exams.

An important mechanism of constant updating is a comprehensive procedure of self-examination (in accordance with the Regulations on Self-Examination of the Federal State Budgetary Educational Institution of Higher Education of the Volgograd State Medical University of the Ministry of Health of Russia), as a result of which educational activities, the management system, the content and quality of training of students, the organization of the educational process, the demand for graduates, the quality of personnel, educational and methodological, library and information support, material and technical base, and functioning are assessed Reports on the results of the self-examination of the university and individual EPs, including conclusions and recommendations, indicating the "strengths", indicating possible threats/risks, as well as areas for improvement and ways of improvement, are approved at the conference of employees and students and published on the website of the university.

External assessment of the educational activities and management of VolgSMU includes, in particular, the successful completion of the procedures for state accreditation of educational activities in the main EPs, state accreditation monitoring, international accreditation in the Certification Association "Russian Register", independent assessment of the quality of education by the Public Council for NOCs of the Ministry of Education and Science of Russia, recertification for compliance with the requirements of the current ISO standard in relation to the development and implementation of educational programs and other activities in accordance with the license.

VolgSMU also monitors the results of external audits of other universities, which it uses to improve its own educational activities (for example, the creation and implementation in 2023 of "road maps" for correcting information in the main section of the site and for conducting an internal audit, the revision of the ISAQE in August 2023).

The above information is confirmed by the documents provided and the results of interviews during the EEC visit.

#### Analytical part

The policy of VolgSMU in the field of continuous renewal is formulated in the form of the Development Program for 2022-2024. In order to implement the Program, the University uses a comprehensive system of comprehensive internal and external assessment. At the same time, various forms and directions of monitoring and internal audit are components of the ISAQE. Thus, data from different departments, EPs, educational processes, scientific activities, etc., are collected and analysed in the course of planned monitoring procedures and an annual comprehensive self-examination procedure.

Reports on the results of the self-examination of the university and individual EPs are approved at the conference of staff and students and published on the university's website. Thus, the university ensures the availability and openness of information about the state of educational activities at VolgSMU. The active participation of stakeholders in monitoring, decision-making and communication with the heads of the EP and the university was also confirmed during the EEC visit.

As for external quality assurance, according to the data obtained from the self-assessment report and during the visit of the EEC, VolgSMU not only successfully passes the procedures of mandatory and voluntary accreditation and certification, but also monitors the results of external assessment of other universities, which it uses to plan preventive measures aimed at improving its own educational activities and the functioning of the internal QMS.

Thus, the policies and activities of the university meet the requirements of the Standard.

#### Strengths/Best Practices:

No strengths were identified for this standard.

#### Recommendations of the EEC:

No.

#### Conclusions of the EEC on the following criteria:

- *Strong* − 0
- Satisfactory 5
- Suggest improvements 0
- Unsatisfactory 0

### (VII) AN OVERVIEW OF STRENGTHS/BEST PRACTICES FOR EACH STANDARD

#### Mission & Values Standard

No strengths were identified for this standard.

#### Standard "Educational Program"

No strengths were identified for this standard.

#### Student Assessment Standard

No strengths were identified for this standard.

#### Standard ''Learners''

No strengths were identified for this standard.

#### Academic Staff/Faculty Standard

No strengths were identified for this standard.

#### **Educational Resources Standard**

A well-developed network of resources for clinical and practical training of students, including both its own clinics and a significant number of contracted medical institutions, as well as such innovative centers for practicing practical skills as the Interdepartmental Center for Practicing Practical Skills and Research Work of the Faculty of Pharmacy, the Simulation Center for Endoscopic Surgery and Intraluminal Endoscopy, the Process Factory of the Department of Public Health and of the CMPE Institute and the Simulation Pharmacy of Volgograd State Medical University.

#### Quality Assurance Policy Standard

No strengths were identified for this standard.

#### Management and Administration Standard

No strengths were identified for this standard.

#### Continuous Update Standard

No strengths were identified for this standard.

#### (VIII) REVIEW OF QUALITY IMPROVEMENT RECOMMENDATIONS

Mission & Values Standard No.

#### Standard "Educational Program"

- 1. Heads of educational programs need to post the missions of the EP on the official website of the University and information stands of the departments. Deadline: 01.03.2024
- 2. Heads of EPs are recommended to include modern active teaching and learning methods in the educational process, taking into account the best international practices (TBL, CBL, RBL, etc.). The deadline is 01.09.2024.
- 3. The management of the university should expand the participation of students in the development, approval and updating of the EP. The deadline is 01.09.2024.
- 4. Heads of educational programs are to develop and implement integrated training programs in the educational process. Deadline until 01.09.2025.

#### Student Assessment Standard

- 1. EP supervisors are encouraged to use a wide range of assessment methods and formats on a regular basis, depending on their "usefulness assessment", which includes a combination of validity, reliability, impact on learning, acceptability and effectiveness of assessment methods and format. Deadline -01.09.2024
- 2. The management of the university is recommended to introduce electronic journals to ensure the documentation of the process of assessing students' academic achievements, their accessibility and openness. The deadline is 01.12. Oct. 2024

Standard ''Learners''

No.

#### Academic Staff/Faculty Standard

- 1) To expand the directions and forms of academic mobility of teaching staff.
- 2) To expand opportunities for professional development of teaching staff in the field of EP development, assessment methods, and the creation of integrated programs.

#### Educational Resources Standard

To include subscriptions to specialized national and periodicals on medical education in the Electronic Library System "EBS VolgSMU". The deadline is March 2024.

Quality Assurance Policy Standard

No.

Management and Administration Standard

No.

Continuous Update Standard

No.

## (IX) REVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE DEVELOPMENT OF EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATIONS

(X) RECOMMENDATION TO THE ACCREDITATION BOARD

Members of the EEC came to a unanimous opinion that Volgograd State Medical University is recommended for accreditation for a period of 5 years.



# Annex 1. Evaluation Table "PARAMETERS OF THE INSTITUTIONAL PROFILE"

	№	Evaluation Criteria		Position	of the NGO	)
Item No.			Strong	Satisfact ory	Suggests improve ment	Unsatisfa ctory
		. MISSION & VALUES				
		onal organization should:		I		
1		have a published statement outlining the NGO's mission, values, priorities, and goals		+		
2		communicate the mission of the NGO to stakeholders and the health sector		+		
3		describe the mission of the NGO, its values, educational goals, Research Functions and Relationships with Health Services and Communities		+		
4		ensure that the mission of the NGO is aligned with the institutional strategy	1	+		
5		ensure the participation of faculty, students and other stakeholders in the development of the NGO mission		+		
Standa	ard 2	EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM				
An ed	ucati	onal organization should:				
6		Have procedures in place for the development and formal approval of the EP at the institutional level. Programs should be designed in accordance with established objectives, including the principles underlying the EP model used, the relationship between the components and the expected learning outcomes		+		
7		Ensure that the qualifications obtained from the implementation of educational programmes are clearly defined and explained	V	+		
8		determine the expected learning outcomes that students should master by graduation, as well as the expected learning outcomes for the structural units of the EP (disciplines/modules)		+		
9	-	In the development of the EP, ensure that the objectives of the EP are consistent with the institutional strategy and that there are clearly defined expected learning outcomes; participation of students and other stakeholders in the development of the EP; unhindered advancement of the student in the process of mastering the EP; Determining the expected workload of students (e.g., in credits or hours) Providing internship opportunities (where necessary)		ľ		
10		ensure that the content of the EP includes the necessary sections to prepare learners for their role in practical health care and for their subsequent further learning		+		
11		Use educational strategies and teaching methods to ensure that learners achieve the expected learning outcomes		+		
12		ensure that the choice of OE design is related to the mission, expected outcomes, resources, and context of the PO		+		
Standa	ard 3	STUDENT ASSESSMENT				-
An ed		onal organization should:		,		
13	3.1	Define, approve and publish a student assessment policy, which is implemented through a centralized system of multiple, coordinated assessments that correspond to the expected learning outcomes. The student assessment policy is communicated to all stakeholders.		+		
14		Provide an assessment system that regularly offers students effective feedback, identifies their strengths and weaknesses, and helps them consolidate their learning. This formative assessment is linked to educational strategies that ensure that all learners		+		

		t				
1.5		have the opportunity to reach their potential				
15	3.3	Integrate student-centered learning processes into their programs to encourage learners to take an active role in co-building the			+	
		educational process, student assessment should reflect this				
		approach				
16	3.4	Provide a grading system on the basis of which progress and			+	
		graduation decisions are made. A wide range of assessment				
		methods and formats are used in the final assessment of learning				
		outcomes, depending on their "utility assessment", which				
		includes a combination of validity, reliability, impact on				
		learning, acceptability and effectiveness of assessment methods				
	2.5	and format				
17	3.5	use the results of student assessment to improve the work of		+		
		academic staff, structural units of the EP (disciplines/modules), EP, educational institution				
18		Ensure that an assessment policy with a centralized system		+		
10	3.0	guides and supports its implementation, entailing the use of a		+		
		variety of summative and formative methods leading to the				
		acquisition of the knowledge, clinical/practical skills and				
		behaviors required by the physician/specialist				
19	3.7	ensure that the assessment system policy is consistent with the	- 5	+		
		mission of the PO, its specific educational outcomes, available		1		
		resources, and the context of the EP				
20	3.8	Regularly assess students across disciplines (modules) and		+		
		clinical internships to provide feedback that guides their				
		learning, promotes early identification of underachieving learners and opportunities for improvement				
Stand	ond 4	. STUDYING			-	
	_	onal organization should:				
21	_	have a publicly available policy that outlines the objectives,				
41	4.1	principles, criteria, selection and admission processes of students		T-		
22	42	have pre-defined, published, and consistently enforced rules				
		governing all periods of the student "life cycle," i.e., admission,				
		achievement, recognition, and certification	700			
23	4.3	Provide students with accessible and confidential academic,		+		
		social, psychological, and financial support services, as well as				
		career guidance				
24	4.4	When developing policies, take into account the relationship		+		
		between the number of students (including international				
		students) and the resources, facilities and infrastructure available		1		
		for their appropriate learning, equity and diversity issues, rules for re-application, deferred admission and transfer from other				
		GS/EPs	1			
25	4.5	In the process of selecting students, pay attention to the selection		+		
		requirements, selection stages, mechanisms for submitting	-			
		proposals, mechanisms for filing and receiving complaints				
26	4.6	Offer and provide support to learners in developing academic		+		
		skills, managing physical and mental health, personal wellbeing,				
<b>a</b> .	L	managing finances, and career planning				
		. ACADEMIC STAFF/FACULTY				
	_	onal organization should:				1
27	5.1	have a sufficient number of qualified teaching staff necessary for		+		
		the implementation and implementation of the EP, taking into				
20	5.2	account the number of students, teaching and learning style		1		
28	3.2	have objective and transparent processes for the recruitment, professional development and development of all staff to		+		
		guarantee the competence of their teachers				
29	5.3	implement the stated policy of continuous professional		+		
		development of its teaching staff		•		

			1	1		
30	5.4	Define a policy for the recruitment of academic staff, including		+		
		consideration of the number, level, qualifications of academic				
		staff required to provide the planned EP to the expected number				
		of students, the distribution of faculty by profile, qualifications and seniority				
21	5.5	·		1		
31	3.3	Recognize the importance of teaching, develop clear, transparent and objective criteria for recruitment, appointment, promotion,		+		
		dismissal and follow in their activities				
32	5.6	to provide career and professional development opportunities for		+		
32		teachers, to encourage scientific activities to strengthen the link		T		
		between education and research, innovative teaching methods				
		and the use of advanced technologies				
Stand		. EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES				
		onal organization should:				
33		Ensure that adequate, accessible, and appropriate learning		+		
		resources and support services are available				
34		Have appropriate and sufficient resources to ensure that trainees	+			
		receive the necessary clinical/practical training	4			
35	_	provide adequate access to virtual and physical information	1	+		
		resources to support the mission of the GS and EP				
36	6.4	Provide training with appropriate attention to the safety of the		+		
		learning environment and patients, including observation of the		1		
		trainee's activities in clinical/industrial settings		1		
37		When allocating and planning and providing educational		+		
		resources with support services, take into account the needs of	_			
		different groups of students (adults, employed, part-time,				
		international students, persons with LHC) and take into account			7	
20		the trends of student-centered learning				
38		Ensure that all resources are accessible and aligned with learning objectives, and that learners are informed of available services		+		
39		Ensure that management and specialized services play a key role		-		
3)		in the provision of support services				
Stand	_	. QUALITY ASSURANCE POLICY				
-	_	onal organization should:				
40		have a quality assurance system that addresses the educational,	-	4	-	
		administrative, and research components of the institution's				
		activities		1		
41	7.2	have a published quality assurance policy that is part of its		+.		
		strategic management. Internal stakeholders should develop and				
		implement these policies through appropriate structures and				
		processes with the involvement of external stakeholders				
42		Have a programme to monitor processes and outcomes,		+		
		including the collection and analysis of data on key aspects of				
		the EP to ensure that the educational process is carried out appropriately and to identify any areas requiring intervention, as				
		well as data collection as part of the administrative procedures in				
		relation to student admission, assessment and completion				
43	7.4	define policies and procedures as the basis for a coherent and		+		
		consistent NGO quality assurance system, official status and be		•		
		accessible to the general public				
44	7.5	Ensure that quality assurance policies reflect the link between		+		
		research, teaching and learning and take into account the national				
		and intra-university context; supports the organization of a				
		quality assurance system; structural subdivisions of the NGO,				
		management, teaching staff and students performing quality				
		assurance duties; processes to ensure academic reputation and				
		freedom, processes to prevent intolerance of any kind and				
		discrimination against students and teachers; Participation of				
		external stakeholders in quality assurance				

Standa	ard 8	. MANAGEMENT & ADMINISTRATION				
An edi	ucatio	onal organization should:				
45		Have a defined governance structure for teaching, learning, research, and resource allocation that is transparent and accessible to all stakeholders, consistent with the mission and functions of the institution, and ensures its sustainability		+		
46		ensure that it collects, analyses and uses relevant information to effectively manage its activities and its EPs		+		
47		Have policies and procedures in place to engage or advise students and faculty on key aspects of educational activities and the EP management process		+		
48		have appropriate and sufficient administrative support to achieve their teaching, learning and research objectives		+		
49		inform the public about its activities (including programmes). The information provided should be clear, reliable, objective, upto-date and accessible	1	+		
50		determine mechanisms for collecting and analyzing information on their activities, their EPs and use the data obtained in the work of the internal quality assurance system		+		
51		develop a review policy and process to ensure adequate and effective administrative, staffing and budgetary support for all NGO activities		+		
52	4	provide information on their activities, including the implemented EPs, the expected learning outcomes of these EPs, the qualifications awarded, teaching, learning, assessment procedures, passing scores and learning opportunities provided to students, as well as information on graduate employment opportunities		+		
Standa	ard 9.	. CONSTANT UPDATING				
An edı	ucatio	onal organization should:			-47	
53		Monitor and periodically evaluate programs to ensure that they achieve their purpose and meet the needs of learners and society. The results of these processes should lead to continuous improvement of the EP. All stakeholders should be informed of any actions planned or taken in relation to the EP		Γ		
54		undergo external quality assurance procedures in accordance with European standards and recommendations on a regular basis		+		
55		In the monitoring, periodic evaluation and revision of the EP, include an assessment of the content of the EP taking into account the latest scientific achievements in a particular discipline to ensure the relevance of the discipline taught; the changing needs of society; workload, academic performance and graduation of students; the effectiveness of student assessment procedures; expectations, needs and satisfaction of students with the EP training; educational environment and support services and their relevance to the objectives of the program				
56	9.4	Regularly evaluate and revise the EP with the involvement of students and other stakeholders, with the publication of the changes made		+		
57	9.5	regularly participate in external quality assurance procedures which, where necessary, take into account the requirements of the legislation under which they operate		+		
·		TOTAL	1	54	2	0