

# REPORT

on the results of the work of the external expert
commission for the evaluation
for compliance with the standards of specialized
accreditation of educational programs
7M11113 RESTAURANT AND HOTEL BUSINESS
(SCIENTIFIC AND PEDAGOGICAL DIRECTION)
7M11114 RESTAURANT AND HOTEL BUSINESS
(PROFILE DIRECTION)
OF THE JOINT STOCK COMPANY
"KAZAKH ABLAI KHAN UNIVERSITY
OF INTERNATIONAL RELATIONS AND WORLD
LANGUAGES"

Date of EEC visit: May 24 to May 26, 2022

# INDEPENDENT AGENCY FOR ACCREDITATION AND RATING External expert commission

Addressed to Accreditation Council of the IAAR



#### **REPORT**

on the results of the work of the external expert commission for the evaluation for compliance with the standards of specialized accreditation of educational programs 7M11113 RESTAURANT AND HOTEL BUSINESS (SCIENTIFIC AND PEDAGOGICAL DIRECTION) 7M11114 RESTAURANT AND HOTEL BUSINESS (PROFILE DIRECTION)

OF THE JOINT STOCK COMPANY "KAZAKH ABLAI KHAN UNIVERSITY OF INTERNATIONAL RELATIONS AND WORLD LANGUAGES"

Date of EEC visit: May 24 to May 26, 2022

Almaty May 26, 2022

# **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

(I) LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS	3
(II) INTRODUCTION	4
(III) PRESENTATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION	6
(IV) DESCRIPTION OF THE PREVIOUS ACCREDITATION PROCEDURE	7
(V) DESCRIPTION OF THE EEC VISIT	8
(VI) COMPLIANCE WITH SPECIALIZED ACCREDITATION STANDARDS	9
6.1. Standard "Management of the educational program"	9
6.2. Standard "Information Management and Reporting"	.14
6.3. Standard "Development and approval of the educational program"	. 17
6.4. Standard "Continuous monitoring and periodic evaluation of educational programs"	.21
6.5. Standard Student-Centered Learning, Teaching and Assessment	. 24
6.6. Standard "Students"	
6.7. Standard "Teaching Staff"	.31
6.8. Standard "Educational resources and student support systems"	
6.9. Public Information Standard	. 36
(VII) OVERVIEW OF STRENGTHS/BEST PRACTICE FOR EACH STANDARD	. 39
(VIII) OVERVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS FOR QUALITY IMPROVEMENT	. 40
(IX) OVERVIEW OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE DEVELOPMENT OF EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION	.43
(X) RECOMMENDATION TO THE ACCREDITATION COUNCIL	. 43
Appendix 1. Assessment chart "PARAMETERS OF A SPECIALIZED PROFILE"	. 44

# (I) LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS

JSC «NCSTE» National Center for Scientific and Technical Expertise

ACEP Academic Council of Educational Programs

HPE Higher professional education

SCES State compulsary educational standard

FA Final assessment

ICT Information and Communication Technologies

IC Individual curriculum
CTT Credit training technology
CED Catalog of elective disciplines

MES RK Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan

IR International relations

MOOC Massive Open Online Courses
MEP Modular educational programs

RAC-complex Research applied complex in the international professional direction

RW Research work

RWGS Research work of graduate students

SIRAS Scientific Innovation Research Applied School

RAL Research applied laboratory

LA Legal act

EP Educational program

BCEP Basic compulsory educational program

TS Teaching staff

WAP Working academic prrogram
QMS Quality management system

IWGS Independent work of graduate students

IWGST Independent work of graduate students with a teacher

TSS Teaching support staff

EMCD Educational-methodical complex of the discipline
EMD Educational and Methodological Department
EMC Educational and Methodological Council

AC Academic Council

FIR Faculty of International Relations
EER Electronic educational resources

ACQUIN The Accreditation, Certification and Quality Assurance Institute

MOODLE Modular Object-Oriented Dynamic Learning Environment

QS Quacquarelli Symonds (World University Rankings)

GPA Grade point average
GSC Graduate Service Center

# (II) INTRODUCTION

An external expert commission assessed the compliance of educational programs 7M11113 "Restaurant and hotel business" (scientific-pedagogical direction), 7M11114 "Restaurant and hotel business" (profile direction) of the Kazakh Ablai Khan University of International Relations and World Languages, with the standards of specialized accreditation of the IAAR (Order No. 68-18/1-OD of May 25, 2018) from May 24 to May 26, 2022, in accordance with the order of the Director General of the Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating No. 71-22-OD of March 25, 2022.

The report of the external expert commission (EEC) contains an assessment of educational programs 7M11113 "Restaurant and hotel business" (scientific-pedagogical direction), 7M11114 "Restaurant and hotel business" (profile direction) of the Kazakh Ablai Khan University of International Relations and World Languages upon the IAAR criteria, recommendations of the EEC on further improvement of the educational programs and parameters of the profile of educational programs of Kazakh Ablai Khan University of International Relations and World Languages.

# The composition of the EEC:

*Chairman of the EEC* - Tabishev Timur Arsenovich, candidate of pedagogical sciences, category I expert of the IAAR.

EEC coordinator - Niyazova Guliyash Balkenovna, head of the IAAR Project for institutional and specialized accreditation of universities (Nur-Sultan, the Republic of Kazakhstan).

# Cluster 1. Specialized accreditation

6B04	202	? Int <mark>er</mark>	nation	ıal Law
(5B0.	<i>302</i>	00 Int	ernati	onal
Law)			1	

7M04211 International Law (6M030200 International Law) *IAAR expert* – Marina Viktorovna Chokina, Ph.D. in Law, Associate Professor, category II expert (Almaty, Republic of Kazakhstan).

*IAAR expert, student* - Erbolov Daniyar Erbolovich, 2nd year student of EP 7M04201 International Law of the Al-Farabi Kazakh National University, category III expert (Almaty, Republic of Kazakhstan).

# Cluster 2. Primary specialized accreditation

7M04212 International Law

*IAAR expert* - Kairdenov Serik Syrlybayevich, Master of Law, Ph.D. in Economics, Associate Professor of Sh. Ualikhanov Kokshetau University, category II expert (Kokshetau, Republic of Kazakhstan).

7M04213 Jurisprudence

*IAAR expert* – Tatarinova Lola Furkatovna, Ph.D. in Law, Associate Professor of the International University of Business UIB, category I expert (Almaty, Republic of Kazakhstan).

*IAAR expert, student -* Zhansen Baurzhanovich Bulatov, 4th year student of EP 5B030300 Law Enforcement of Narikbayev KAZGUU University, category III expert (Nur-Sultan, Republic of Kazakhstan).

8D03122 Regional studies

*IAAR expert* - Aikenova Dina Maratovna, PhD, category II expert (Nur-Sultan, Republic of Kazakhstan).

# Cluster 3. Specialized accreditation

7M01111 Pedagogy and psychology (6M010300 Pedagogy and psychology)

and IAAR expert - Abibulaeva Aizhana Budanovna, Doctor of Pediatrics, Professor of L.N.Gumilyov Eurasian National University, category II expert (Nur-Sultan, Republic of Kazakhstan).

*IAAR expert, employer* - Sadykova Nurzhamal Anuarbekovna, Excellence in Education, deputy director of Oralkhan Bokey lyceum school #44, category II expert (Ust-Kamenogorsk, Republic of Kazakhstan).

*IAAR expert, student* - Sarabek Nazerke Erikkyzy, 3rd year student of EP primary school teacher of a humanitarian college, category III expert (Aktobe, Republic of Kazakhstan).

### Cluster 5. Primary specialized accreditation

7M11113 Restaurant and hotel business 7M11114 Restaurant and hotel business

*IAAR expert* – Konstantin Yurievich Korolev, Ph.D., associate professor, category II expert.

IAAR Expert – Mambetaliev Kenenbay Tortayevich, Ph.D., Candidate of geographical sciences, George Washington University Teaching Assistant, category II expert (California, USA)

*IAAR expert, employer* – Damilya Bakhitkereevna Kunanova, director of Tourism Department of the National Chamber of Entrepreneurs "Atameken", category II expert (Nur-Sultan, Republic of Kazakhstan).

*IAAR expert, student* – Kapasbek Aru Bakytkyzy, 4th year student of EP 5B091200 Restaurant and hotel business of Turan University, category III expert (Almaty, Republic of Kazakhstan).

#### Cluster 6. Specialized accreditation

7M02316 Simultaneous translation *IAAR expert* – Viorica Lifari PhD, professor of the State University of Moldova, category II expert (Chisinau, Moldova).

*IAAR expert* – Burbekova Saule Zhorabekovna, Ph.D. in Philology, associate professor of Astana IT University, category I expert (NurSultan, Republic of Kazakhstan).

*IAAR expert, student* - Ruslanbekkyzy Batygul, 3rd year student of the EP Foreign Language of Osh State University, student of the academic mobility program of L.N.Gumilyov Eurasian National University, category III expert (Nur-Sultan, Republic of Kazakhstan).

# (III) PRESENTATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION

Joint stock company "Kazakh Ablai Khan University of International Relations and World Languages" - (hereinafter KazUIR&WL) is a specialized university that summarizes the best Kazakh and international educational traditions and practices, skillfully combining the quality of the educational process with the subject variety of educational programs.

Training at KazUIR&WL is carried out in accordance with the State license for educational activities in graduate and postgraduate professional education AB 0137365 of 03.02.2010 in 17 programs, 14 master programs, 5 doctoral programs PhD.

Kazakh Ablai Khan University of International Relations and World Languages, an accredited organization of higher education in the city of Almaty, was founded by the Decree of the Council of People's Commissars of the USSR #1696 of September 16, 1940, as the Kazakh Teachers' Institute of Foreign Languages (KazSTIFL). In April 1944, Kaznarkompros prepared a proposal to transform KazSTIFL into the Kazakh State Pedagogical Institute of Foreign Languages. By the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 1263 of June 23, 1993 Almaty Pedagogical Institute of Foreign Languages was transformed into the Kazakh State University of World Languages, and in 1999, the University was named after Abylai Khan. By the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan #1099 of August 23, 2001, the State Enterprise "Kazakh State Ablai Khan University of International Relations and World Languages" was transformed into Closed Joint-Stock Company "Kazakh Ablai Khan University of International Relations and World Languages". According to Article 90 of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Joint Stock Companies", CJSC "KazGUMO", on May 13, 2003, by the decision of the general meeting of shareholders, was renamed into JSC "Kazakh Ablai Khan University of International Relations and World Languages".

At the present stage, positions of KazUIR&WL have strengthened due to the high assessment of its training quality in bachelor, master and PhD doctor programs by international and national accreditation and rating agencies, including the Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating / IAAR, German Institute for Accreditation, Certification and Quality Assurance / ACQUIN and QS World Universities Rankings.

The university confidently maintains its position of 801-1000 in the QS WUR World University Rankings 2021. In 2021, the university improved its position in the QS EECA 2021 regional university rankings taking position 221-230. Since 2021, the direction "Modern Languages" of the university for the first time took position 301-320 in the world subject ranking QS WUR by Subject 2021: Modern Languages.

The development of quality assurance culture takes place within implementation of European programs in the field of higher education: the DOQUP-TEMPUS project. "Documentation for quality assurance of educational programs: DOQUP model", project "Implementation of Education Quality Assurance System via Cooperation of University-Business-Government in HEIs".

KazUIR&WL systematically works on the internationalization of education and successfully cooperates with 24 leading universities in the world, conducts joint double diploma programs in specialties, as well as master programs. Today KazUIR&WL is a member of 14 reputable international associations and other organizations.

The University fully owns the academic resources to implement educational activities for the accredited educational programs: 5 academic buildings, 3 student dormitories, 1 sports and recreation complex, 2 assembly halls, 2 conference rooms, 3 canteens, 2 buffets, 4 reading rooms.

Modern scientific and educational infrastructure of the university includes research laboratories, innovative education centers. The university publishes scientific journals recognized by the domestic and international academic community, "Journal of KazUIR&WL" of the series: "Pedagogical Sciences", "Philological Sciences", "International Relations and Regional Studies". The series "Pedagogical Sciences" and "Philological Sciences" were included in the list of publications recommended by the Committee for Quality Assurance in Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan for the publication of the main results of scientific activity by order No. 821 on 07.12.2021.

The University regularly informs the public and key stakeholders about all aspects of its activity by publishing materials in various Internet resources, including social networks and the media. The university uses the official website - http://www.ablaikhan.kz, the website of the teaching staff - http://ablaikhan.kz, the website of scientific publications http://journals.ablaikhan.kz, the educational portal - http://portal.ablaikhan.kz, e-learning system portal - http://lms.ablaikhan.kz.

The postgraduate educational program "Restaurant and Hotel Business" was developed by the Department of International Tourism Management on September 02, 2019 and approved by the expert commission in the Register of educational programs of higher and postgraduate education.

In the 2020-2021 academic year, the educational program was transferred to the Department of Hospitality Management of KazUIR&WL. The department was opened in 2020, its purpose is to provide professional training of highly qualified specialists for the hospitality industry; formation of core competencies, knowledge, skills and abilities in the area of hotel and restaurant business, management, marketing, modern information technologies, entrepreneurial activities in the field of catering and accommodation, coordination of research activities of undergraduate and postgraduate students.

Training graduates in these EP is carried out on the basis of the Laws of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education", the charter of the university, the curriculum and programs of disciplines developed in the prescribed manner, orders of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the rector of the university, decisions of the Academic Council of the University and the Academic Council of the faculty, as well as other regulations and documents.

# (IV) DESCRIPTION OF THE PREVIOUS ACCREDITATION PROCEDURE

This is the first external assessment of the Educational programs 7M11113 "Restaurant and hotel business" (scientific-pedagogical direction), 7M11114 "Restaurant and hotel business" (profile direction) of the Joint Stock Company "Kazakh Ablai Khan University of International Relations and World Languages" for compliance with the standards of the primary specialized accreditation of the educational programs of higher and postgraduate education (Ex-ante) (put into effect by the order of the director of NU "IAAR" No. 68-18 / 1-OD dated May 25, 2018).

# (V) DESCRIPTION OF THE EEC VISIT

The EEC worked at the Kazakh Ablai Khan University of International Relations and World Languages from May 24 to May 26, 2022 according to the approved Program of the combined visit of the expert commission for specialized accreditation of educational programs (hybrid form).

On 23.05.2022 an on-line orientation meeting was held in order to coordinate the work of the EEC, during the meeting responsibilities were distributed among the members of the commission, the schedule of the visit was clarified, and agreement on the choice of methods for examining the evaluated EPs was reached.

In order to obtain objective information about the quality of the educational programs and the entire infrastructure of the university, to clarify the content of self-assessment reports, on-line meetings with the rector, vice-rectors of the university, heads of structural divisions, heads of educational programs, heads of departments, representatives of the teaching staff, students, graduates (for EPs with graduates) and employers were held. 31 representatives took part in the meetings (Table 1).

Table 1 – Information about employees and students who took part in on-line meetings with EEC IAAR:

Participant category	Number
Rector	1
Vice rectors	5
Heads of structural divisions	10
Deans	3
Heads of EPs, heads of departments	6
Teaching staff	4
Undergraduate, graduate, doctoral students (survey participants)	2
Alumni	0
Employers and representatives of the internship bases	0
Total	31

During the off-line visit and from the video recordings, the members of the EEC got acquainted with the material and technical base, visited: the office of the RAC resource center, the office of the "Confucius Institute of the Kazakh Ablai Khan University of International Relations and World Languages", a language laboratory, a forensic laboratory (room 403), "Courtroom" (room 402), "Legal Support Department" office (room 415), medical center. Also, members of the EEC visited the library, museum of Ablai Khan and the ethnographic museum.

At the hybrid meetings of the EEC IAAR with the target groups of the university, the mechanisms for implementing the policy of the university were clarified and certain data presented in the self-assessment report of the university were specified.

Members of the EEC visited, in a hybrid format, the internship bases of the assessed EPs:

- 1) Kazakhstan Hotel (4 stars);
- 2) Shera Inn Hotel (4 stars).

EEC members attended on-line lessons:

- 1) Foreign language (professional);
- 2) Modern approaches to the study of issues of organization and management of sustainable development of the tourism and hospitality industry.

In accordance with the accreditation procedure, a survey of 13 teachers and students of the EP cluster was conducted - 7 teachers; 6 students. The results of the survey are indicated in Appendix No. 4.

In order to confirm the information presented in the Self-Assessment Report, external experts requested and analyzed the working documentation of the university. Along with this, the experts studied the Internet positioning of the university through the official website of the university https://www.ablaikhan.kz/ru/about-us/our-university.html

As part of the planned program, EEC developed and offered recommendations based on the results of the examination for improving the accredited educational programs of the Kazakh Ablai Khan University of International Relations and World Languages, at an online meeting with the management on 26.05.2022.

# (VI) COMPLIANCE WITH SPECIALIZED ACCREDITATION STANDARDS

# 6.1. Standard "Management of the educational program"

- ✓ The university has to demonstrate the goal and development strategy of the EP based on the analysis of external and internal factors with the wide involvement of various stakeholders.
  - ✓ The quality assurance policy has to reflect the link between research, teaching and learning.
  - ✓ The university demonstrates the development of quality assurance culture.
- ✓ Commitment to quality assurance should be applied to any activity performed by contractors and partners (outsourcing), including the implementation of joint / double degree education and academic mobility.
- ✓ The EP management ensures transparency of the EP development plan based on the analysis of its work, the real positioning of the university and the focus of its activities on meeting the needs of students, the state, employers and other stakeholders.
- ✓ The EP management demonstrates the functioning of the mechanisms for the formation and regular review of the EP development plan and monitoring its implementation, assessing the achievement of learning goals, meeting the needs of students, employers and society, making decisions aimed at continuous improvement of the EP.
  - ✓ The EP management should involve representatives of stakeholder groups, employers, students and teaching

staff in the formation of the EP development plan.

- ✓ The EP management must demonstrate the individuality and uniqueness of the EP development plan, its consistency with national development priorities and the development strategy of the educational organization.
- ✓ The university must provide a clear definition of those responsible for business processes within the EP, distribution of staff duties, and the delimitation of the functions of collegial bodies.
- ✓ The EP management ensures the coordination of the work of all persons involved in the development and management of the EP, its continuous implementation, and also involves all interested parties in this process.
- ✓ The EP management must ensure the transparency of the management system, functioning of the internal quality assurance system, including its design, management and monitoring, and the adoption of appropriate decisions.
  - ✓ The EP management of should carry out risk management.
- ✓ The EP management should ensure participation of representatives of parties concerned (employers, teaching staff, students) in the collegiate management bodies of the educational program, as well as their representativeness in making decisions on the management of the educational program.
- ✓ The university must demonstrate innovation management within the EP, including analysis and implementation of innovative proposals.
- ✓ The EP management must demonstrate its openness and accessibility for students, teaching staff, employers and other parties concerned.
  - ✓ The EP management confirms the participation in trainings in education management programs.
- ✓ The EP management must ensure that the progress made since the last external quality assurance procedure is taken into account when preparing for the next procedure.

#### Evidence

The University has a Quality Policy, which is approved by the rector of KazUIR&WL and is available for teaching staff, students and stakeholders and is published on the university website - http://www.ablaikhan.kz/ru/about-us/our-university/politik.html (Quality Policy. Reg. #2 of 27.08.2021). The policy contains the main activities, key areas of the university development, principles of quality assurance and follows from the University Strategy for ensuring the quality of education for 2020-2024. – <a href="https://www.ablaikhan.kz/ru/about-us/our-university/mission.html">https://www.ablaikhan.kz/ru/about-us/our-university/mission.html</a>.

The Quality Policy provides the basis for the development and analysis of the Quality Objectives, which are an integral part of quality management and are approved every academic year, which ensures the development of quality culture of the university (Quality Objectives. Reg. #3 of 27.08.2021) – <a href="http://www.ablaikhan.kz/ru/about-us/our-university/politik.html">http://www.ablaikhan.kz/ru/about-us/our-university/politik.html</a>.

Information on the implementation of quality goals and objectives is placed in articles about the university, included in collections and advertising booklets for applicants, materials on the activities of the institution, presented in the media of republican, regional and local significance - http://www.ablaikhan.kz/ru/ about-us/our-university/politik.html.

Connection between scientific research, teaching and learning in the accredited EPs is carried out through the introduction of the scientific research results into the educational process (writing textbooks, conducting project research work, preparing master theses in scientific and pedagogical magistracy), conducting joint research, involving students and graduates in research work and integrated implementation of scientific research by students. This is confirmed by an extensive list of publications of the teaching staff of the Hospitality Management Department and research projects.

The management of the accredited EP presented plans for the development of the EP (Appendix 17 of the self-assessment report) with the implementation timeframe, goals, objectives, risks and response measures, the structure and content of the EP, and the expected outcomes. The current plans for the development of the educational programs are consistent with the mission and strategic documents for the development of the university. In addition, the accredited EPs are designed with consideration of the basic principles of the development of the industry, reflected in the Concept for the Development of Tourism Industry of the Republic of Kazakhstan until 2023 and the State Program for the Development of Tourism Industry of the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2019–2025.

The university has an approved procedure for managing the EP development plan - development of the EP specification based on the "Regulations on the structure of the specification of the educational program". The head of the department with the involvement of the teaching staff carry out monitoring the development plan of the EP and its specification. The specifications of the EP are approved (Appendix 18 of the self-assessment report) after discussion and a positive conclusion at a meeting of the department and the academic council of the faculty, finally with positive reviews from the employer and the SMC expert of the university.

The institutional mechanism for designing the EP supposes the involvement of all interested parties: employers are included in the process of the EP development at the initial stage - the development of the graduate's competence model, and at the final stage - the examination and review of the EP; teaching staff formulates learning outcomes and develops

modules to achieve the expected results in accordance with the competence model; students build their educational trajectory, forming an individual curriculum based on the CED.

The management of the accredited EPs provides evidence of the involvement of business representatives in the design and expertise. Thus, in 2019, working curricula of the accredited EPs were agreed with the director of Nur Adil travel company G. Abilasan. In 2020, the director of Kazakhstan Tourism Association R. Shaikenova gave professional evaluation on the master program. In the academic year 2020–2021, the director of LLP "Health improving complex Bayan Zhurek" G.R. Shymyrbaeva was involved in the examination and evaluation of the EP (copies of expert evaluation are presented in Appendix 26 of the self-assessment report).

Also, employers of travel companies and hotels are involved as reviewers of master's theses, are included in the commission on FA (Order on the approval of the chairmen of the final attestation commissions of the PGEF dated November 16, 2021 #88), where they give a professional assessment of practical skills and the composition of the students' competencies.

Responsibility for business processes within the EP is distributed according to their functional characteristics. In the implementation of the EP at the department, at the beginning of the academic year, responsibilities for research work, internship and strategic partnership, EMC, international cooperation and employment of graduates are appointed.

Various collegiate bodies are involved in the management processes of the EP - the Academic Council of the University, the EMC of the University and the ASEP of the faculties. The ACEP of the faculty includes representatives of postgraduate students, employers, leading teachers and scientists. The representativeness of the main interested parties in the collegiate management bodies of the EP is confirmed by the lists of members of the Academic Council of the Faculty of Postgraduate Education for the academic years 202-2021 and 2021-2022 in Annex 77 of the self-assessment report.

The EP management demonstrates a model of implementing relationship between the business community, scientific community, teaching staff and students: (1) coordinating the structure and content of the EP with representatives of the real sector; (2) employment of graduates at industry enterprises; (3) organization and holding annual fairs of the EP graduates; (4) participation in scientific projects and programs; (5) systematic surveys of potential employers of the EP; (6) organization of pedagogical, research practice, scientific internships for graduates on the basis of industry enterprises, research organizations, government agencies.

# Analytical part

Analysis of the submitted documents showed that the quality assurance policy is fixed in the regulatory documents of the university on its website, which indicates accessibility, openness and transparency for all interested parties.

The management of the university demonstrates the development of quality assurance culture at the institutional level through the annual update of the Quality Objectives. However, to reveal issues related to the development of quality culture, an illustration of the impact of these targets on the accredited EPs is also required.

The management of the accredited EPs has done serious work on the formation of EP development plans and their specifications. Nevertheless, the questions of the real positioning of the accredited EPs require clarification. Thus, the management provides information on the share of 20%, occupied by EP 7M11113 "Restaurant and hotel business" (scientific and pedagogical direction) in the educational services market, noting that a similar program is presented in 5

universities of the country. At the same time, the positioning of the EP of the profile direction is not presented, which, given the lack of enrollment and contingent of students, is extremely necessary. In addition, aspects of the uniqueness of the accredited EPs are disclosed in a general way, it is necessary to clarify the specific competitive advantages of the EP over the programs of other universities and reflect this in the EP development plan, specification and description on the website. Taking into account the fact that a similar task was set for the management of the faculty and department by the decision of the Academic Council of 22.20.2021 #7-1 with a deadline of 30.06.2021, there is also a need to clarify the mechanism for guaranteeing the implementation of the decisions of collegiate bodies and university management and to ensure the quality of their practical implementation.

The mechanism for regular reviewing and monitoring the EP development plan has a framework nature: the results of monitoring are included in the annual report of the department, which, as stated, lists specific indicators used to assess the performance of the EP (p.24 of the self-assessment report). However, in the report of the department for the academic year 2020–2021 submitted as confirmation –

https://docs.google.com/document/d/1Rxap514IcMsZY3or09oDpGfgfVZzGMyn/edit - the information regarding monitoring the EP development plan completely duplicates the section "The main objectives of the educational program 7M11113 Restaurant and hotel business" of the development plan with fragmentary clarifications on the achievement or non-achievement of the result. The conclusions presented as the outcome of the EP development plan implementation should follow from the results of its implementation, and not be a separate list of abstract tasks without deadlines. The presented approach cannot be considered as a documented presentation of monitoring results.

This shortcoming, in turn, follows from the fundamental approach to the formation of the EP development plan in terms of defining its objectives: some of them are formulated in general terms, there are no quantitative indicators, specific deadlines for achieving results, people in charge of the implementation. Thus, the mechanisms of the formation and regular revision of the EP development plan and monitoring its implementation need to be improved.

Risk management work is carried out within the framework of the Development Strategy until 2025, in accordance with the "Risk Management" standard, a commission on the analysis of the current situation and risk management has been established, the EP development plans have a risk map and corrective measures. In general, the results of work on risk management in the context of the accredited EPs can be considered satisfactory. The exception is the risk of decreasing the contingent, reduction of which requires formation of a systematic and strategic approach to the implementation of the policy of attracting the contingent.

The composition of the Academic Council of the Faculty of Postgraduate Education confirms the participation of representatives of employers, teaching staff, students and other interested parties in the collegiate management bodies of the EP. Meetings of the academic council are held twice a year; the annual work plan of the council is presented. However, neither during the visit of the EEC, nor from the self-assessment report was it possible to obtain information about the results of the activities of the academic council, the decisions and the recommendations made, which may indicate a formal approach to the organization of its activities, especially in the context of involving stakeholder groups. In this regard, it seems necessary to clarify the procedure of regular reporting, reflecting the results of the work of the Academic Council and the implementation of its work plan.

Innovation management within the framework of the EP is implemented through the research applied laboratory - RAL #3 "Modern innovations and trends in the tourism and hospitality industry", which is part of the research innovative and applied school "Modernization of socio-economics and modern geo-economic trends". As part of the activities of RAL #3, EMCD on the module "Sales Technologies and the Formation of Strategies for Promotion of a Hotel and Restaurant Product" was developed, which is confirmed in the curriculum. The planprogram of research and applied activities (Appendix 7 of the self-assessment report) includes the tasks of RAL # 3 in terms of creating educational and applied products for implementation: designing an interdisciplinary module course (The role of modern and legal financial management in ensuring efficient tourism and hotel business), designing EMCD and teaching aids for MINOR courses (Domestic tourism management, Inbound tourism management). However, in the course of analyzing the structure of the accredited EPs, presented in the development plans and specifications, these modules and courses could not be found, although the deadline for their submission to the Academic Council dates back to 2020. In this regard, it is necessary to clarify the innovation managing mechanisms at the university as a whole and of the accredited EPs, in particular.

Strengths/best practice of EP 7M11113 "Restaurant and hotel business" (scientific and pedagogical direction), 7M11114 "Restaurant business and hotel business" (profile direction) are not identified.

# **EEC** recommendations:

- analyze the actual positioning of the accredited EPs with the involvement of business community representatives, determine the competitive advantages of the EPs over the programs of other universities, reflect the outcomes in the EP development plans, specifications and descriptions on the university website. Deadline: 01.10.2022;
- amend the Regulations "On the procedure of designing the educational program development plan and monitoring its implementation", in part (1) including requirements for setting goals for the EP development plan using "SMART" methodology; (2) the need to identify those responsible for achieving target indicators; (3) introducing a unified report form for monitoring the implementation of the EP development plan. Deadline: 01.08.2022;
- adjust the EP development plans in accordance with the requirements of the updated document, taking into account the Quality Goals approved for the academic year 2022-2023. Deadline: 01.10.2022;
- the management of the EP has to specify the procedure of regular reporting, reflecting the results of the Academic Council's work and the implementation of its work plan, to fix changes in the LA regulating the functioning of the Academic Council. Deadline: 01.08.2022;
- the management of the EP has to submit to the management of the university: (1) a report on the implementation of the work plan of RAL #3 in terms of creating educational and applied products for implementation in the EP, to make proposals for adjusting the plan based on the results of the review; (2) a report on the implementation of the decisions of the Academic Council dated 22.20.2021 #7-1 in terms of assigned instructions. Deadline: 15.07.2022.

#### Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria:

According to the standard "Management of the educational program" of EP 7M11113 "Restaurant and hotel business" (scientific and pedagogical direction), 7M11114 "Restaurant

and hotel business" (profile direction) 15 criteria have ben analyzed, of which 13 have satisfactory positions, 2 - suggest improvement.

# 6.2. Standard "Information Management and Reporting"

✓ The university must ensure the functioning of the system for collecting, analyzing and managing information

based on modern information and communication technologies and software.

- ✓ The EP management demonstrates the systematic use of processed, adequate information to improve the internal quality assurance system.
  - ✓ The EP management demonstrates the presence of a reporting system reflecting the activities of all structural

units and departments within the EP, including assessment of their performance.

- ✓ The university must determine the frequency, forms and methods for assessing the management of the EP, the activities of collegial bodies and structural divisions and top management.
  - ✓ The university must demonstrate a mechanism for ensuring protection of information, including identification

of people responsible for the reliability and timeliness of information analysis and data provision.

- ✓ The university demonstrates the involvement of students, employees and teaching staff in the processes of collecting and analyzing information, making decisions based on them.
  - ✓ The EP management must demonstrate the existence of communication mechanisms with students, employees

and other stakeholders, including conflict resolution.

✓ The university must ensure the measurement of the degree of satisfaction with the needs of students, teaching

staff and personnel within the framework of the EP and demonstrate evidence of the elimination of identified shortcomings.

- ✓ The university should evaluate the effectiveness and efficiency of the work of the EP.
- ✓ The information collected and analyzed by the university within the framework of the EP should take into account:

key performance indicators;

dynamics of forms and types of the student contingent;

students' academic performance, achievements and dropouts;

student satisfaction with the implementation of the EP and the quality of education at the university;

availability of educational resources and support systems for students;

employment and career growth of graduates.

- ✓ Students, teaching staff and personnel must document their consent to the processing of personal data.
- ✓ The management of the EP should contribute to the provision of the necessary information in the relevant fields of science.

## Evidence

KazUIR&WL uses modern information systems, information and communication technologies and software in order to adequately manage information. All ICs have the required licenses, technical description, and methods of working with them are indicated in the service documentation. Center for Information Technology, the department of technical repair and maintenance of software and the department of software development are in charge of their functioning.

There are several basic information systems at the university and information flows generated by them:

- information flows of the educational work management system EMS 1C HEI (contingent, teaching staff load, schedules, examination materials, test, examination results, midterm and current assessment results, classroom fund and other information related to the educational process) and the educational portal - http://portal.ablaikhan.kz;

- information flows of the e-learning process management system LMS Moodle (E-EMCD, including educational content in electronic format: lecture, seminar materials, SIW, projects, etc.) http://lms.ablaikhan.kz/login/index.php;
- information flows generated by the ESUVO system, which contain all the reporting information according to the strict accountability charts and are automatically sent to the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan http://esuvo.ablaikhan.kz;
- information flows of the key performance indicators tracking system http://kpi.ablaikhan.kz;
- information flows of the electronic document management system http://doc.ablaikhan.kz;
- document management of the administrative department (automation of internal orders of the administrative department);
- information flows of automation of incoming, outgoing and internal correspondence of the university;
- appointment of executors and monitoring/fixing of the results of consideration/execution;
  - document management functions of the educational process;
  - document management functions for the student service center;
  - online proctoring functions for the examinations.

Access to information is primarily limited at the level of the physical infrastructure. Only a strictly limited number of people have direct physical access to the servers that store information. Access to any confidential information through electronic systems is provided to employees only as required through individual accounts with an individual login and password, as well as through differentiation of access levels by roles.

The system of regular reporting and monitoring includes: annual reports of the teaching staff, which reflect information on the implementation of individual work plans; annual reports of departments and faculties on academic and methodical work, research work, research work of graduate students, educational work; analysis of the results of the EP implementation, development plans at the faculty council; analysis of the internal audit results.

Information protection is realized at several levels. First of all, mandatory protection against viruses / trojans and other malicious programs is provided through the anti-virus software NODESET 32 Endpoint Security. Anti-virus software is installed on all critical nodes/servers and end-user computers.

Persons in charge of the accuracy of information are directly the units and employees using these information and communication technologies. The university standard "Procedure for working with corporate websites" (STU 02-2018 dated 30.01.2018) describes the work procedure and those in charge of the accuracy of information on corporate websites.

The management of accredited EPs is responsible for the information submitted for posting on the website, professional data on teaching staff, information on released state educational grants, distribution of places in hostels, information for applicants - https://www.ablaikhan.kz/ru/? option=com\_content&view=article&id=3420.

The university demonstrates a variety of communication channels with the subjects of the educational process and other interested parties: information stands, the university website, the rector's blog, the educational portal of the university, social networks Facebook, Instagram, VKontakte, the media, the World of Languages newspaper, etc. Boxes for suggestions and

comments and hotlines are installed at each faculty, there are, advisory and curatorial hours are held, and there are mechanisms for resolving conflict situations.

In accordance with the current legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On personal data protection" (May 21, 2013 # 94-V), all students, employees and teaching staff of the university give consent to the processing of their personal data.

# Analytical part

Based on the results of the analysis of materials for compliance with the requirements of the criteria of the standard "Information Management and Reporting" for the accredited EPs, it should be noted that the university has an information and reporting management system. The nature and structure of information flows and the information systems used for their processing correspond to the main functional processes implemented by the university. The information collected as part of the activities of the university, including through statistical processing, allows on to generate various reports and, in general, make decisions based on facts.

The university has developed a balanced scorecard adopted to improve the activities of management in the implementation of business processes, both in the field of administration and in the field of education and science. Within the system, the effectiveness of the work of each individual employee / unit is assessed according to key indicators. Undoubtedly, the use of such a system is a serious advantage for assessing the effectiveness and efficiency of processes at the institutional level, both in general and in terms of individual processes or entities.

In the context of the accredited EPs, it was declared that the EP management systematically collects, accumulates and analyzes information on their implementation and evaluates in all areas through such indicators as "effectiveness" and "efficiency". However, an excerpt from the report on the evaluation of the work of postgraduate education faculty, formed according to the balanced scorecard mentioned above, is given as confirmation, which requires several clarifications.

First, assessing the effectiveness and efficiency of a unit cannot be equivalent to solving a similar task in the EP, for which a system of own performance indicators should be formed.

Secondly, within the accredited EPs, such an assessment is not possible, since the development plans of the EPs do not define specific target indicators for achieving the goals, and the information collected and analyzed within the EP does not contain key performance indicators for their implementation. A similar conclusion is also true in terms of determining the availability of educational resources and support systems for students: the lack of quantitative indicators makes the analysis of this information impossible.

Thirdly, the key performance indicators of the EPs, established and recorded in the relevant documentation, can be integrated into the global balanced scorecard of the university to ensure transparency in the implementation of the EPs, plans for their development, control by management - which in general will be an important mechanism for developing quality assurance culture both at the institutional level and specific EPs, guaranteeing decision-making based on facts.

Strengths/best practice of EP 7M11113 "Restaurant and hotel business" (scientific and pedagogical direction), 7M11114 "Restaurant and hotel business" (profile direction) have not been identified.

#### **EEC** recommendations:

- introduce specific key performance indicators for all areas of the EP implementation, ensure transparency and accessibility of information on key performance and efficiency indicators. Deadline: 01.09.2022;
- evaluate the effectiveness and efficiency of the accredited EP in accordance with the established indicators, including availability of educational resources and support systems for students of the EP, present the results of the assessment to the management of the university. Deadline: 01.10.2022;
- ensure the improvement of the mechanism for the systematic use of adequate information to improve the internal quality assurance system by integrating the key performance indicators of the EP into the balanced scorecard of the university. Deadline: 01.06.2023

### EEC conclusions by criteria

According to the standard "Information management and reporting" EP 7M11113 "Restaurant and hotel business" (scientific and pedagogical direction), 7M11114 "Restaurant and hotel business" (profile direction), 16 criteria are disclosed, of which 13 have satisfactory positions, 3 - suggest improvement.

# 6.3. Standard "Development and approval of the educational program"

- ✓ The university must demonstrate the existence of a documented procedure for the EP development and its approval at the institutional level.
  - ✓ The university must demonstrate the compliance of the developed EP with the established goals and planned

learning outcomes.

- ✓ The EP management should determine the influence of disciplines and professional practices on the formation of learning outcomes.
- ✓ The university demonstrates the model of a graduate of the EP, describing the learning outcomes and personal qualities.
- ✓ The qualification awarded upon completion of the EP must be clearly defined, explained and correspond to a certain level of the HSK, QF-EHEA.
  - ✓ The management of the EP should demonstrate the modular structure of the program based on ECTS, ensure

correspondence of the structure of the EP content to the goals set, with a focus on achieving the planned learning outcomes for each graduate.

- ✓ The management of the EP should ensure that the content of academic disciplines and learning outcomes correspond to each other and the level of education (bachelor's, master's, doctoral studies).
  - ✓ The management of the EP must demonstrate the conduct of external examinations of the EP.
- ✓ The management of the EP must provide evidence of the participation of students, teaching staff and other stakeholders in the development and quality assurance of the EP.
- ✓ The EP management must demonstrate the uniqueness of the educational program, its positioning in the educational market (regional/national/international).
  - ✓ An important factor is the possibility of preparing students for professional certification.
  - ✓ An important factor is the presence of joint and / or double-diploma EP with foreign universities.

#### **Evidence**

Development and approval of educational programs at KazUIR&WL is carried out in accordance with the provisions of regulatory legal acts in higher and postgraduate education, internal regulatory documents that make up the Academic policy of the university and ensure the achievement of its strategic goals. The policy includes the procedure for registering students to attend classes; carrying out current, midterm and final assessment; organizing all types of internships for students; assessment of students' knowledge; rules for the transfer, restoration,

expulsion of students; final certification, rules for maintaining academic integrity, rules for granting academic leave, regulations on basic and additional educational programs, regulations on multilingual education.

The main document in the course of designing the EP is the university standard "Design and development of educational services" of 17/10.2016 (Appendix 68 of the self-assessment report). The algorithm for approving the EP, developed and proposed by the graduating department, includes the following sequence: (1) sending the EP to employers for reviewing; (2) considering at the department meeting; (3) considering by the academic council of the faculty; (4) considering by the scientific and methodological council; (5) approval by the Academic Council; (6) including the EP in the register.

The university collaborates with potential employers, specialists with practical experience (Ritz Carlton Hotel, Kazzholpark Hotel, LLP "Bayan Zhurek", LLP "Akbulak Resort Hotel", LLP "Qazaq Yeli Travel", LLP "Nur Adil", I.A. Turdieva - Leading Manager of the Sales and Events Department, D.Shumakaeva - Director of the Kazzholpark Hotel, etc.) at the stage of developing and approving educational programs and CEDs. There are documented facts of external examinations of the accredited EPs.

Graduate models are detailed in the specification of the accredited EPs and are presented in Appendix 88 of the self-assessment report. Graduate models development was based on the National Qualifications Framework, the requirements of the Dublin descriptors, the requirements of the labor market. Learning outcomes are formulated both at the level of the entire EP, and at the level of individual modules or academic disciplines. Based on the learning outcomes, the level of qualification actually achieved by the graduate is determined by comparing their knowledge, skills and competencies with the learning outcomes embedded in the relevant qualifications.

Individual educational trajectories are formed on the basis of individual curricula. The IEP of the student is registered under their personal identification number ID in the corporate management system of the educational process "1SUuniver", registration for elective disciplines is carried out online. The student has the right to change their IEP within the working curriculum of the EP before the beginning of the theoretical training semester during the registration period indicated in the academic calendar. The department provides students with the information on the number of elective disciplines and their brief descriptions through advisors.

Students of EP 7M11113 "Restaurant and hotel business" (scientific and pedagogical direction) are provided with places for research internships. The experts participating in the offline visit of the EEC visited internship bases, got acquainted with the documentation on the organization of the internship and contracts with the hotel industry enterprises.

The process of harmonization of the EPs with the programs of leading foreign universities is based on comparison of the planned learning outcomes, content of academic disciplines, approaches to the organization of professional internship, forms of midterm and final assessment. Comparison of the accredited EPs with similar programs of the leading universities of Russia (Plekhanov Russian University of Economics, Financial University under the Government of the Russian Federation, Lomonosov Moscow State University) showed 85% compliance, with the programs of European universities (Schellhammer Business School, NHL Stenden University of Applied Sciences) - 50%.

At the institutional level, the requirements for partner universities for cooperation within the joint EPs have been formed: partners must have a license to conduct educational work in the corresponding EP, high rating and EP quality indicators, international recognition. Monitoring the quality of educational programs for cooperation is carried out based on a basic bilateral agreement.

#### Analytical part

The analysis showed that, at the institutional level, the university has formed an academic policy regulating the main processes of managing educational activities for higher and postgraduate educational programs, as well as the corresponding procedures for ensuring the quality of the EPs. The policy is published on the official website of the university and is available to all interested parties.

Evidently, the formal policies and procedures provide the framework through which the EP's management must develop and monitor the effectiveness of its own quality assurance system. At the same time, acquaintance with the submitted documentation and the results of interviews during the EEC visit, demonstrated the potential for improvements in terms of the implementation of the institutional mechanisms of academic policy and quality assurance of the professional training process of students at the level of the accredited EPs.

- 1. The syllabuses of some EP disciplines conducted in the English language have reference lists either with exclusively Russian-language sources, or contain predominantly Russian-language titles in the reference list (Fundamentals of innovative technologies in human resource management, Methodology for planning and forecasting the cluster model of the tourism and hotel business, Methodology of Scientific Researches in Tourism).
- 2. Syllabuses of some EP disciplines have similar learning outcomes and competencies (Language for academic purposes, Foreign language (professional) and General professional foreign language; "Technology of Development and promotion strategies for restaurant and hotel product" and "Analysis of trends in the development of the restaurant and hotel business"). It is obvious that the same competence or learning outcome within the EP as a whole is formed by its different learning elements, but at the disciplinary level, competences and learning outcomes of different disciplines are recommended to be clearly differentiated, thereby demonstrating their specific contribution to the formation of program learning outcomes.
- 3. The planned learning outcomes, thematic content of some disciplines do not fully correspond to their names ('Organizational Design', 'Analysis of trends in the development of the restaurant and hotel business', 'Technology of development and promotion strategies for restaurant and hotel product').
- 4. There are inaccuracies in the calculation of the labor intensity of types of educational work, which may not correspond to the overall labor intensity of the discipline (Methodology for planning and forecasting the cluster model of the tourism and hotel business).

Taking into account the facts stated above, the management of the accredited EPs needs to improve the compliance of the content of disciplines and practices with the required learning outcomes, as well as the compliance of the content of academic disciplines and planned outcomes with the level of education.

Management of the EP demonstrates the conduct of external expertise. The self-assessment report contains information that the expert assessments contain a reasoned justification for the introduction of new disciplines (p.75), however, familiarization with copies of the documents presented in Appendix 26 of the self-assessment report does not confirm this information. In the interviews of the EP management, evidence of changes in the curricula based

on the results of expertise was not presented either. Documents on the participation of external stakeholders in the meetings on the design and implementation of the accredited EPs, attached to the self-assessment report, do not disclose these issues.

There is the need to provide opportunities for preparing students of the accredited EPs for their professional certification. Certification is carried out with the support of professional associations, confirms the formation of practical competencies and significantly increases the competitiveness of a graduate in the modern labor market. The management of the accredited EPs needs to determine the list of disciplines, whose content will be aimed at preparing students for certification.

Strengths/best practice of EP 7M11113 "Restaurant and hotel business" (scientific and pedagogical direction), 7M11114 "Restaurant and hotel business" (profile direction) have not been identified.

# EEC recommendations:

- provide in the structure of the discipline syllabuses a section demonstrating the contribution of the discipline to the formation of learning outcomes and competencies at the level of the EP, to reflect the corresponding changes in the discipline syllabuses of the accredited EPs. Deadline: July 15, 2022;
- adjust the thematic content of disciplines based on the planned learning outcomes and competencies, their contribution to the formation of program learning outcomes and graduate competencies. Deadline: July 15, 2022;
- provide the disciplines conducted in the English language with authentic literature provide disciplines implemented in English with sources of authentic literature. Deadline: July 15, 2022;
- ensure the compliance of labor intensity of educational work types with the total labor intensity of the discipline. Deadline: July 15, 2022;
- submit a complete set of educational and methodological documentation of the accredited educational programs for internal examination. Deadline: July 15, 2022;
- expand the formats of the business community representatives participation and participation of employers involved in external assessments in the process of developing EPs and ensuring their quality (monitoring current and future needs, employers, joint development and adjustment of EPs, targeted admission of students, involvement of employers for the implementation of EPs, etc.). Deadline: 01.02.2023
- determine the professional certification types that students can be trained for, determine the list of disciplines, whose content is aimed at preparing them for certification. Deadline: December 31, 2022.

#### EEC conclusions by criteria

According to the standard "Development and approval of the educational program" EP 7M11113 "Restaurant and hotel business" (scientific and pedagogical direction), 7M11114 "Restaurant and hotel business" (profile direction) disclosed 12 criteria, of which 9 have satisfactory positions, 3 - suggest improvement.

# <u>6.4. Standard "Continuous monitoring and periodic evaluation of educational programs"</u>

- ✓ The university must ensure the revision of the structure and content of the EP, taking into account changes in the labor market, the requirements of employers and the social demand of society.
- ✓ The university must demonstrate the existence of a documented procedure for monitoring and periodic evaluation with the purpose of achieving the EP goals and continuous improvement of the EP.
  - ✓ Monitoring and periodic evaluation of the EP should consider: the program content in the context of the latest scientific and technological achievements in a particular discipline;

changes in the needs of society and professional environment;

workload, performance and graduation of students;

the effectiveness of student assessment procedures;

needs and degree of satisfaction of students;

compliance of the educational environment and the work of support services with the EP goals.

- ✓ The management of the EP should publish information about changes to the EP, inform interested parties about any planned or undertaken actions within the EP.
- ✓ Support services should identify the needs of various groups of students and the degree of their satisfaction with the organization of training, teaching, assessment, mastering the EP in general.

#### Evidence

At KazUIR&WL, there is a continuous mechanism for monitoring and periodical assessment of the EP quality, which includes compiling a university passport; data collection, information cards on the rating of the EP for participation in the competition for obtaining a state order; analysis of the results of examination sessions in the context of faculties, EPs, disciplines with the annual and semi-annual reports; analysis of the results of the final assessment of undergraduates (control of updating the master theses themes, results of state exams and defending master's theses, etc.); development of methodological support for credit technology and analysis of the availability of intra-university documentation, syllabuses; surveying various categories of undergraduates, graduates, parents, employers on the quality of educational services provided and preparation of proposals; analysis of the level of informatization of the educational process, introduction of distance learning technologies; evaluation and analysis of the results of teachers' and students' research work.

Hospitality Management department monitors the educational and methodological support of the educational process; realizes quality control of training sessions; control over the organization and conduct of all types of internships; control over the implementation of educational, methodological, scientific and educational work of the teaching staff, adopted in the individual work plans of teachers; control over the annual improvement of the pedagogical qualifications of teachers; carries out analysis of the results of current, midterm assessment of students' knowledge, the results of examination sessions in the context of specialties, courses and disciplines; carries out control over the technical equipment of educational laboratories; quality control of the test tasks and other forms of students' knowledge assessment during the examination session.

The external evaluation of the EP is represented by the following procedures: attestation and accreditation of the university; state certification of students; rating of specialties and the university as a whole; survey of employers; external review of graduation papers and teaching materials.

The need to change the content of the EP, curricula, learning outcomes is determined during the analysis of the labor market, state programs for the development of the industry,

international trends, the study of the opinions and wishes of students, teachers and is discussed at meetings of collegial management bodies.

In order to study the level of satisfaction of students with the quality of education and further work to improve the educational services provided by the university, diagnostic tools have been developed - the questionnaire "Teacher through students' eyes".

In general, graduates assess the quality of education as quite high, as evidenced by the answers to questions regarding the professionalism, level of training and work of teachers. Obtaining fundamental and applied knowledge and skills are the most important components of the educational process in the opinion of students, while the material, technical and informational equipment of the educational process are of lesser priority.

To check educational achievements of students, the following types of students' knowledge assessment are provided: 1) current assessment; 2) midterm control; 3) final control.

The level of educational achievements of students in each module (discipline) is expressed in the final grade, formed from the admission grade and the final assessment grade. All current information about students' progress is put down by teachers in the information base "Educational Portal" weekly. Student's personal growth is monitored by GPA, the value of which is the basis for the transfer of students from course to course.

When making changes to the working curriculum of the EP and updating the learning outcomes, the EP management, together with employers, analyzes changes in the labor market, studies the opinions and wishes of students, teachers, survey results, state programs for the development of the industry, international trends. At the meetings of the Academic Council, after the changes made, the working curriculum is approved, and subsequently an application is submitted for updating in the register of the EP of the Bologna Process Center. After consideration and expertise, approval by the experts of the Bologna Process Center, the EP receives the right to be implemented at the university.

One of the mechanisms for informing all interested parties about any planned or undertaken actions in relation to the EP is their involvement in the meetings of the educational and methodological council, academic council.

## Analytical part

The analysis showed that the university has defined mechanisms for continuous monitoring and periodic evaluation of the EPs, aimed, among other things, at their continuous improvement.

The management of the EP provides evidence in the self-assessment report confirming that a periodic assessment of changes in the needs of society and the professional environment has been carried out. In particular, the theme "On the implementation of market-demanded options for basic specialties in training personnel for the media and tourism industry and international service sectors, caused by the intensification of socio-economic development and competition in the world labor market" was discussed at the meeting of the Academic Council on February 22, 2021. On the results of the discussion, it was decided to develop and implement in the EP practice-oriented minors with the involvement of employers. Based on the results of the meeting of the educational and methodological council on March 26, 2020, with the participation of employers, the names of disciplines were updated based on new trends in the development of the subject area of accredited EPs. Corresponding changes are recorded in the curriculum.

Actualization of the EP in the light of the latest scientific achievements is implemented through the RAL #3 "Modern innovations and trends in the tourism and hospitality industry", an example of which is presented in the Standard "Educational Program Management" (EMCD on the module "Sales Technologies and the Formation of Strategies for Promotion of the Hotel and Restaurant product" has been designed.

At the same time, monitoring and periodic evaluation in accordance with the parameters of the Standard "Ongoing monitoring and periodic evaluation of educational programs" should cover other aspects, including the workload, progress and graduation of students, effectiveness of assessment procedures, educational environment and support services, their compliance with the objectives of the EP. These issues were either not disclosed or presented in a general form: "students' load meets the regulatory requirements…"; "data on students' progress and graduation can be traced in the annual reports of the chairmen of the FAC and the department reports…"

In terms of assessment procedures, the report contains a description of various forms of assessment: speaking, writing, combined assessment, presentations, discussions, round table discussions, case studies, tests, reports, presentations with reports, problem solving, unsupervised work. However, this approach does not form an idea of the ongoing monitoring of the effectiveness of specific assessment procedures, and the task of maintaining the relevance of the taught disciplines cannot be solved in isolation from the analysis of the effectiveness of student assessment procedures: the implementation of the principles of student-centered learning involves the formation of funds for assessment tools based on designed learning outcomes. In this regard, any changes made to the disciplines taught should be carried out in the context of the graduate's competence model and the methodology for assessing learning outcomes. However, the facts confirming the commitment of the management of the accredited EPs to this approach were not presented.

The process of amending the content of the accredited EPs should be accompanied by an appropriate update of the educational environment and adjustment of student support services work. The interrelation of such work has not been demonstrated.

In the context of the shortcomings identified in the educational documentation of the EP (Standard "Development and approval of the educational program"), as part of the monitoring and periodic evaluation of the EP, a specification of the examination procedure for new and / or implemented modules, disciplines, EP courses is required. The management of the university should clearly define and approve the procedure, sequence of necessary actions, establish the areas of responsibility of the participating structural units and officials, the timing and frequency of internal examinations.

Thus, the management of the accredited EPs has to have a systematic approach to the organization of continuous monitoring and periodic evaluation of the EPs. The quality of the EP is impossible to ensure by focusing only on separate aspects that are subject to monitoring and evaluation.

Strengths/best practice of EP 7M11113 "Restaurant and hotel business" (scientific and pedagogical direction), 7M11114 "Restaurant and hotel business" (profile direction) have not been identified.

#### EEC recommendations:

- in the procedure for monitoring and periodic evaluation of the EP, provide mechanisms for analyzing: (1) the effectiveness of student assessment procedures, (2) students' workload,

progress and graduation, (3) educational environment, support services for their compliance with the goals of the EP. Deadline: 01.08.2022;

- develop a local legal act regulating the conduct of periodic expertise of the EP components. Deadline: 01.08.2022

#### EEC conclusions by criteria

On Standard "Continuous monitoring and periodic evaluation of educational programs" EP 7M11113 "Restaurant and hotel business" (scientific and pedagogical direction), 7M11114 "Restaurant and hotel business" (profile direction) 10 criteria are disclosed, of which 7 have satisfactory positions, 3 - suggest improvement.

# 6.5. Standard Student-Centered Learning, Teaching and Assessment

- ✓ Management of the EP should ensure respect and attention to various groups of students and their needs, providing them with flexible learning paths.
- ✓ Management of the EP should ensure teaching based on modern achievements of world science and practice in the field of training, use of various modern methods of teaching and evaluating learning outcomes ensuring the achievement of the objectives of the EP, including competencies, skills to perform research work at the required level.
  - ✓ Management of the EP should determine mechanisms of distributing students' workload between theory

practice within the framework of the EP, ensuring the mastery of the content and achievement of the objectives of the EP by each graduate.

- ✓ An important factor is conducting research on teaching methods of the EP disciplines.
- The university must ensure that the procedures for assessing learning outcomes are in line with the expected

outcomes and goals of the EP.

- ✓ The university must ensure the consistency, transparency and objectivity of the mechanism for assessing the learning outcomes of the EP, publication of criteria and assessment methods in advance.
- ✓ Assessors should be proficient in modern methods of evaluating learning outcomes and regularly improve their skills in this area.
- ✓ The EP management must demonstrate the feedback system on the use of various teaching methods and evaluation of learning outcomes.
  - ✓ Management of the EP must support students' autonomy and also provide guidance and assistance from the

teacher.

✓ Management of the EP must demonstrate the existence of student complaints feedback.

#### **Evidence**

Student-centered education at KazUIR&WL plays an important role in achieving learning outcomes. It enables to create necessary conditions for each student contributing to the effective advancement along the chosen educational trajectory. Student-centered learning is based on the use of various forms of teaching, pedagogical methods and technologies, regular feedback on all issues, support for the student autonomy with proper guidance and assistance from the teacher, strengthening mutual respect between the teacher and the student, timely feedback on students' complaints.

Individualized and personalized student training is expressed in various ways of their scientific and educational activities: when choosing elective courses, the topic of a dissertation, choosing a supervisor for a master's thesis, and participating in research and creative work.

Development of inclusive education system at the university is one of the priority areas and is carried out in accordance with the Plan for the Organization of Psychological and Pedagogical Support for Inclusive Education –

 $https://www.ablaikhan.kz/images/content/static/documents/study-process/\%D0\%\\9F\%D0\%BB\%D0\%B0\%D0\%BD\%20\%D0\%B8\%D0\%BD\%D0\%BA\%D0\%BB\%D1\%8E\%D0\%B7\%202021-2025.pdf.$ 

The CEDs of the accredited EPs are uploaded on the educational portal http://www.ablaikhan.kz; teaching staff and students access through individual logins and passwords.

Hospitality Management Department has provided a system of academic counseling for graduate students, aimed at monitoring and supporting their progress. For this purpose, an advisory service has been created, in addition, advisory work is carried out by the teachers. Consultative work with students is carried out during the entire period of study and before examination sessions, according to the approved schedule of consultations. Information about the teachers posted on the university portal helps graduate students in matters of academic advising.

The main pedagogical innovations are related to the use of interactive teaching methods. A number of innovative teaching methods have been introduced into the educational process within the framework of the EP: (1) the technology of integrated project-based learning; (2) situational analysis method; (3) interactive technologies (heuristic, brainstorming, problem-based learning, debates, role-playing games, business games, forums, panel discussions, portfolio). The content of students' unsupervised work in professional disciplines is related to their future profession, which is solving standard and pragma-professional tasks. The midterm control is carried out in the form of integrated tasks.

Availability of own research on teaching methods of the EP's academic disciplines is confirmed by relevant publications, including academic and methodological publications.

Students are informed about all types of assessment criteria through the educational portal, "educational process" section - "progress control". Mechanisms of assessing graduates' learning outcomes are carried out by passing state exams and defending master's theses.

Documented information containing certificates demonstrating the compliance of the graduate's level of competence with the established requirements, is entries in the examination and final assessment sheets, the original diploma with an attachment and seals, signed by the rector of the university – upon graduation.

The university has established a procedure of responding to students' complaints. On the official website http://www.ablaikhan.kz there is the rector's blog, where students can send their complaints and any questions they are interested in and get answers. There is a popping out dialog box where the consultants answer questions, react to complaints and suggestions from students and parents online. A complaint can also be filed through the youth committee leader or the student trade union committee, through the faculty leaders, directly through the control and documentation department. Some complaints, such as current or midterm assessment appellations, are handled by the university's academic department and the Vice rector for Academic Affairs. Information about the existence of a mechanism for responding to students' complaints, including the rector's blog, was confirmed by students' interview answers.

The department has developed long-term plans for advanced training of teaching staff. The choice of the direction of advanced training is determined by the need to improve pedagogical skills, introduction of pedagogical teaching technologies, and improvement of the content of the taught disciplines.

#### Analytical part

The analysis shows that the university has formed the institutional framework for the implementation of a student-centered approach. Accredited EPs, in most aspects, meet the principles of student-centered teaching, learning and assessment. This applies to various teaching and learning forms and methods, methodological developments, mechanisms of student autonomy support, as well as providing guidance and assistance, guarantees of the completeness of the learning outcomes by graduates, the availability of procedures for responding to complaints and appeals. All this allows to create conditions conducive to the effective promotion of students in the EP.

However, some aspects of the work on the student-centered approach implementation require certain improvements. Thus, the provision of flexible educational trajectories for students of the EP takes place on the basis of a catalog of elective disciplines and the formation of an individual curriculum for each cycle of academic disciplines. At the same time, the study of the submitted CED and working curricula of the EP showed some inconsistencies in these documents. In particular, the working curricula of the accredited EPs in both directions are drawn up in such a way that there is no possibility of choosing disciplines: they present the first of the possible alternatives indicated in the CED. In this regard, it is recommended to include the groups of elective disciplines in the working curricula from which the student can make a choice.

The self-assessment report states that the EP graduate tudents have the opportunity to study in Kazakh and Russian (p. 88), the submitted EP specifications indicate 3 languages of instruction (Kazakh, Russian, English). In the working curricula, English is ndicated as the language of instruction for most disciplines of the EP of the scientific and pedagogical direction and all disciplines of the EP of the profile direction. Based on the analysis of the presented CED syllabuses, it can be concluded that within one group disciplines may be implemented in the national or Russian languages, and in English. It remains unclear how in this case an individual learning path will be provided for students who want to choose a certain discipline in the desired language of instruction? If the disciplines presented in the CED are available for study in the national, Russian and English languages (as indicated in the specifications of the EP), it is recommended to ensure appropriate versions of the syllabuses for each language of instruction.

During the evaluation of educational documentation and interviews of students of the accredited EPs by members of the EEC, it was revealed that the transparency and objectivity of the mechanism for assessing learning outcomes within the framework of accredited EPs is not fully ensured. In the table of grades, including their letter equivalents, there is no description of the criteria reflecting the level of competency formation.

The management of the accredited EPs provides facts confirming that some teachers have passed the advanced training in educational technologies and teaching methods. However, the entire teaching staff of the accredited EPs should be involved in this process, since one of the requirements for teachers is the competence in modern methods for assessing learning outcomes and regular advanced training in this area.

Strengths/best practice of EP 7M11113 "Restaurant and hotel business" (scientific and pedagogical direction), 7M11114 "Restaurant and hotel business" (profile direction) have not been identified.

EEC recommendations:

- harmonize the structure and content of the elective part of the working curricula of the EP with the catalogs of elective disciplines, provide students with the opportunity to form flexible educational trajectories in any of the teaching languages available for the implementation of the EP. Deadline: July 15, 2022;
- expand the format of the grade-rating system by including a textual description of the grades in the terminology of the learning outcomes within a particular discipline. Make appropriate changes to the working curricula / syllabuses of all disciplines, communicate the information to the students. Deadline: 31.12.2022.
- provide training for the teaching staff of the accredited EPs in advanced training programs in the field of innovative pedagogy and modern methods of assessing learning outcomes. Deadline: 01.07.2023.

# EEC conclusions by criteria

According to the Standard "Student-centered learning, teaching and academic performance assessment" EP 7M11113 "Restaurant and hotel business" (scientific and pedagogical direction), 7M11114 "Restaurant and hotel business" (profile direction), 10 criteria are disclosed, of which 9 have satisfactory positions, 1 - suggests improvement.

# 6.6. Standard "Students"

- The university must demonstrate the policy of forming student contingent and ensure transparency and publicity of the procedures regulating the life cycle of students (from admission to completion).
- ✓ Management of the EP should provide special adaptation and support programs for newly enrolled and foreign students.
- ✓ The university must demonstrate the compliance of its actions with the Lisbon Recognition Convention, including the mechanism of recognizing the results of students' academic mobility, as well as the results of additional, formal and non-formal education.
- ✓ The university should provide an opportunity for students' external and internal academic mobility, assist them in obtaining external grants for education.
- ✓ The university should encourage students in self-education and development outside the main program (extracurricular activities).
  - An important factor is the existence of a mechanism of supporting gifted students.
- ✓ The university must provide cooperation with other educational organizations and national centers of the "European Network of National Information Centers for Academic Recognition and Mobility / National Academic Recognition Information Centers" ENIC / NARIC in order to ensure comparable recognition of qualifications.
- ✓ The university must provide students with internship places and assist with the employment of graduates, maintaining contact with them.
- ✓ The university must demonstrate the procedure for issuing documents to graduates confirming the qualifications received, including the achieved learning outcomes.
- ✓ Management of the EP must demonstrate that the graduates of the program have skills that are in demand in the labor market and that these skills are really relevant.
- ✓ Management of the EP must demonstrate the existence of a mechanism for monitoring the employment and professional activities of graduates.
  - ✓ An important factor is an active alumni association/association.

#### Evidence

Students are admitted to KazUIR&WL in accordance with the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Approval of the Model Rules for Admission to Educational Organizations Implementing Professional Educational Programs of Higher Education (CAPG of the Republic of Kazakhstan, 2012, #26, art.363, of January 19, 2012 #111, as amended on

December 27, 2018, #895), in accordance with subparagraph 25 of article 4 of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education" (as amended and supplemented on 22.12.2016) and the rules of the University developed on their basis.

The academic policy of the university describes the procedures and rules of admission to the EP, the rules of transferring from course to course, transferring from other universities, the procedure for re-crediting the results and periods of study obtained in other universities, expelling - <a href="https://www.ablaikhan.kz/ru/study-process/study-process/academic-policies.html">https://www.ablaikhan.kz/ru/study-process/study-process/academic-policies.html</a>.

Formation of a contingent of master students is carried out by placing a state educational order, as well as fee-based education. Data on the contingent of master students in EP 7M11113 "Restaurant and hotel business" (scientific and pedagogical direction) is presented in table 2.

Table 2 - The contingent of graduate students in EP 7M11113 "Restaurant and hotel business" in 2020-2022.

Academic year	Total	Grant holders	Fee-paying students
2020-2021	2	2	-
2021-2022	6	6	-

There is no contingent in EP 7M11114 "Restaurant and hotel business" (profile direction).

Forecasting the number of state grants is based on the Approval of the Rules for the selection of applicants for participation in scholarship programs, in accordance with the Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan of October 8, 2018 #548. At the same time, the university operates a system for allocating external grants to support active students with high academic performance. According to the Regulations "On grants to students of JSC "KazUIR&WL" of 24.07.2015, for the purpose of social support for students, the University grants are provided for the entire period of study (https://www.ablaikhan.kz/ru/forapplicants/for-applicants/grants.html).

The university has the required material and technical base (campuses, elements of the logistics structure, information resources, human resources, etc.), which enables implementing the policy of forming the contingent of the accredited EPs.

Student Service Center (SSC), founded at KazUIR&WL in the academic year 2018-2019, answers all students' questions in various fields of education. Advisors and curators inform students about the rector's and dean's orders related to the educational process, about the internal regulations, the Charter and the organizational structure of the university, the regulations on competitions, conferences and other events held at faculty and university. Despite the absence of foreign students in the accredited EPs, the university has mechanisms to ensure the implementation of special programs for their adaptation.

KazUIR&WL recognizes the qualifications of students and employees obtained abroad in accordance with the Convention on the Recognition of Qualifications Relating to Higher Education in the European Region - the Lisbon Convention (Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 13, 1997 #202-I), cooperates with the national centers of the European Network National Information Centers for Academic Recognition and Mobility/National Academic Recognition Information Centers" ENIC/NARIC in order to ensure comparable recognition of qualifications.

The university has created conditions and a wide partner network for the implementation of academic mobility programs. According to the general procedure for the implementation of external academic mobility of students at KazUIR&WL, several options for implementing external academic mobility are provided: at the expense of international programs like ERASMUS +, ERASMUS MUNDUS, etc.; students also have the opportunity to study at their own expense (Spain, Germany, South Korea, China). Implementation of these programs and students' participation in them are regulated by the "Regulations on academic mobility of students, teachers and employees of KazUIR&WL.

The Alumni Association of KazUIR&WL helps to maintain connection with the university and with other alumni through various events, continuing education programs, as well as special university events for alumni. (http://www.ablaikhan.kz/ru/component/content/article/2-uncategorised/1904-accotiation.html).

A graduate student who has passed the final state certification and confirmed the completion of the EP is awarded a master's degree in service sector in the EP "Restaurant and Hotel Business" by the decision of the FCC; a state diploma and an attachment to it are issued. The issuance of a state-recognized diploma with a transcript is carried out on the basis of the rector's order for graduation. The diploma attachment is filled out on the basis of a transcript on the implementation of the curriculum by the student in accordance with the grades obtained in all disciplines in the amount provided for by the State Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the WAP, types of internships and the results of the final certification.

# Analytical part

Analysis of the self-assessment report shows that the university has formed and publishes consistent rules regulating all periods of study, ranging from admission, expelling, academic performance to graduation, etc. Implementation of these rules in the accredited EPs ensures the smooth and consistent development of the student's academic career, progress along the educational trajectory: the initial acquaintance of students with the corporate culture of the university, the procedure and features of training at the university and on the EP; monitoring of students' academic achievements is ensured; graduates receive appropriate documents confirming the qualifications obtained, including the learning outcomes and the context of the educational process.

Management of the accredited EPs should clearly convey the institutional guidelines regarding the policy of contingent formation at the EP level. Solving the problem of student enrollment reduction requires proactive measures on promoting the EP, planning work on attracting students.

In accordance with paragraph 78 of the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan of June 17, 2015 #391 "On approval of qualification requirements for educational activities and a list of documents confirming compliance with them", continuous enrollment of students is required for the last 2 years of relevant area of training. In accordance with the Instructional Letter of the Center for the Bologna Process and Academic Mobility of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan on the formation and maintenance of the Register of educational programs of higher and postgraduate education of February 16, 2022, an exclusion is made from the Register of EP (section 5, p. 5.6) in case of loss of relevance of the EP (lack of EP contingent), in case when at the undergraduate and / or master's levels the contingent of students or graduation is less than 3 people for 2 years in a row.

Analysis of the educational documentation of the EP and syllabuses showed that the majority of the disciplines of the accredited EP is implemented in English. Questions regarding the need to define the languages of instruction available for the choice of students were given in the description of the Standard "Student-Centered Learning, Teaching and Assessment". It is necessary to clarify how the minimum requirements for the level of English proficiency of applicants are formed. Members of the EEC could not find the relevant information on language proficiency on the university website, which can mislead potential applicants who do not have the required level of knowledge of English.

In order to integrate into the international educational space, improve the quality of knowledge, comparability of the EP with the programs of foreign universities, strengthen internationalization, the university implements students' academic mobility. The main partners of the Hospitality Management Department in the implementation of academic mobility are the Antalya Academy of Tourism (Turkey), the Baltic International Academy (Latvia), Hainan Tropical Maritime University (PRC), with which cooperation agreements are signed. At the institutional level, all the possibilities for implementing academic mobility programs have also been created. However, in 2020-2022 academic mobility was not carried out due to epidemiological restrictions. Obviously, this reason objectively hindered the implementation of physical mobility, but alternatives in the form of virtual (distance) exchanges, based on rich experience in the use of distance learning technologies, have a high potential and should be introduced into the practice of implementing accredited EPs.

Management of the EP provides students with places for internship, there are agreements on cooperation with organizations of the hotel business. However, expanding the formats of participation of the business community representatives and employers in the development of the accredited EP and ensuring their quality, indicated in the analytical and recommendatory parts of the standard "Development and approval of an educational program", requires the adoption of strategic management decisions. Taking into account the applied nature of the accredited EPs, a promising vector of work is the introduction of dual education mechanisms, as well as the creation of a basic department of hotel business at one of the partner enterprises.

Strengths/best practice of EP 7M11113 "Restaurant and hotel business" (scientific and pedagogical direction), 7M11114 "Restaurant and hotel business" (profile direction) have not been identified.

#### WEC recommendations:

- specify the procedure of enrolling the EP contingent, approve the recruitment plan for 2023; develop an action plan to reduce the risks in contingent enrollment and marketing promotion of the EP. Deadline: 01.09.2022;
- determine by a local regulatory legal act the minimum requirements of English proficiency for applicants of the accredited EPs and publish them in open access. Deadline: 01.07.2022;
- to develop a "road map" for the development of academic mobility, including distance (virtual) academic mobility with foreign partner universities. Deadline: 01.12.2022
- ensure the creation of a hotel business department at one of the partner enterprises. Deadline: 01.09.2023.

According to the standard "Students" EP 7M11113 "Restaurant and hotel business" (scientific and pedagogical direction), 7M11114 "Restaurant and hotel business" (profile direction), 12 criteria are disclosed, of which 10 have satisfactory positions, 2 - suggest improvement.

# 6.7. Standard "Teaching Staff"

- ✓ The university must have an objective and transparent personnel policy in the context of the EP, including recruitment (including invited teaching staff), professional growth and development of staff, ensuring the professional competence of the entire staff.
- ✓ The university must demonstrate the compliance of the qualitative composition of the teaching staff with the established qualification requirements, the strategy of the university, and the objectives of the EP.
- ✓ Management of the EP should demonstrate the change in the teacher's role in connection with the transition to student-centered learning and teaching.
- ✓ The university should provide teaching staff, including young teachers, with the opportunities of career growth and professional development.
- ✓ The university should involve in the teaching process specialists from relevant industries with professional competencies meeting the requirements of the EP.
- ✓ The university must demonstrate the existence of a motivation mechanism for the professional and personal development of teaching staff.
- The university must demonstrate widespread use of information and communication technologies and software in the educational process by the teaching staff (for example, on-line training, e-portfolio, MEPs, etc.).
- ✓ The university must demonstrate its focus on the development of academic mobility, attracting the best foreign and domestic teachers.
- ✓ The university must demonstrate the involvement of each teacher in promoting a culture of quality and academic honesty at the university, determine the contribution of teaching staff, including invited ones, to achieving the goals of the EP.
- ✓ An important factor is the involvement of teaching staff in the development of the economy, education, science and culture of the region and the country.

#### Evidence

Procedures for managing the university personnel are described in the personnel policy of KazUIR&WL, which regulates the issues of recruitment, professional growth and development of the teaching staff and ensures professional competence of the staff in implementation of the educational process. The personnel policy of the university is formed in accordance with the requirements of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan and internal documents placed in the database of regulatory documents, to which all employees have access.

The recruitment procedure is carried out through the formation of the staffing schedule of the teaching staff and the announcement of a competition for vacant teaching positions with indication of qualification requirements, which ensures the transparency of the procedure for employing teachers.

There are the following requirements when employing the teaching staff of the EP: basic education must correspond to the profile of the specialty, the teacher must have relevant qualifications and possess professional competencies, business initiative and competence in accordance with job descriptions for a particular position. Employment criteria are: work experience; level of training (degree, advanced training); competence; special skills; publications; working and moral qualities; appearance.

The teaching staff is hired on a competitive basis, individual contracts are concluded according to the results of the competition. Prolongation of the employment contract is carried

out on the basis of certification of teaching staff in the main areas of activity. Hiring, promotion, reduction, dismissal are carried out in accordance with the labor legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The level of competence of the teaching staff of the magistracy is measured in accordance with the Qualification requirements of July 15, 2021 #339 - https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/V2100023542. All teachers involved in the EP have basic education. The average age of teaching staff of the accredited EPs is 42 years, of which those with academic degrees - 45 years. Average teaching experience is 20 years. The staffing capacity is 100%. The structure of the teaching staff of the accredited EPs is presented in Table 3.

Table 3 - The staffing capacity of the accredited EPs

Staffing capacity	2020-2021	2021-2022
Doctors of Science	-	-
Candidates of Science	4	4
PhD	1	1
Total	5	5
Academic degree holders	100%	100 %
rate		

The responsibility for the employees is reflected in the Labor Regulations, job descriptions, safety and labor protection documentation. Favorable working conditions at the university as a whole and on the EP include: maintaining sanitary and hygienic conditions, uninterrupted supply of electricity, heat, cold water, communication. Favorable working conditions imply fully equipped workplaces, a rational layout of the workplace.

Material motivation and incentives for teachers to professional development and research activities are implemented through internal regulations (Regulations on wages and social support for employees, University Standard "Personnel Management"). Non-material incentive mechanisms include: expression of gratitude, awarding with diplomas, awarding the titles "Honorary Worker of Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan", "Best University Teacher".

The participation of teaching staff in the implementation of the strategic documents of the university is ensured through their involvement in various activities of RAL #3 "Modern innovations and trends in the tourism industry and hospitality", which correlate with the strategic goals of the university.

Professional development of the teaching staff of the Hospitality Management Department is carried out through advanced training, carried out in various forms: advanced training courses, internships, seminars, trainings. For example, the management of the accredited EPs was trained in the course "Management in Education. Project Management" conducted by Dr. Heimo Mikkola, Eastern University (5.11.2018 - 30.11.2018, 144 hours).

#### Analytical part

EEC notes a good potential of the teaching staff of accredited EPs. The university is responsible for its employees, provides them with favorable working conditions.

The survey of teachers conducted during the EEC visit demonstrates their high satisfaction with the conditions created for the implementation of professional activities. Thus, the majority of respondents note a "very good" or "good" position of the university on 34 proposed issues (for example, opportunities for continuous development of their potential, use of

their own strategies, methods, innovations in the learning process, availability of educational and methodological literature, accessibility and openness of the management, conditions for combining teaching and research, etc.). In addition, all interviewed teachers demonstrate complete satisfaction with relations with colleagues at the department, wage conditions, work convenience, services available at the university, labor protection and safety, food system, medical and other services.

The personnel policy of the university is objective and transparent, including the accredited EPs. In the course of interviewing the teaching staff, it was emphasized that applicant teachers are given equal opportunities to participate in the competitions; fair competition among the participants, maximum objectivity, and publicity are ensured.

However, the requirements to the level of English proficiency of the teaching staff, the criteria for their selection and admission to the teaching process remain unclear. The self-assessment report indicates that it is recommended to have an international certificate confirming the level of foreign language proficiency for language disciplines. Obviously, such phrasing means (1) it is not mandatory, (2) does not regulate the qualification requirements for teachers of other disciplines conducted in English, for example.

In the course of studying the self-assessment report and the work of the EEC, evidence was found of attracting practitioners from tourism sector to teaching bachelor's program "Restaurant and Hotel Business" (Master of Tourism A.S. Karataeva - training manager for the AMADEUS system, I.A. Turdieva - Event Manager of the Ritz Carlton Hotel, G.R. Shymyrbayeva - Managing Director of LLP HIC Bayan Zhurek, Zh.M. Uaysova - Chief Accountant of LLP Ak-Bulak Sports and Recreation Complex). It remains unclear why this practice has not been introduced to the accredited master programs. The work planned for the 2022–2023 academic year can be significantly expanded through the introduction of dual training mechanisms based in partner enterprises of the university, which has been noted in the analytical part of the Standard "Students".

During the interviews teaching staff of the accredited EPs told about the lack of wide opportunities for academic mobility, including online (remote or virtual) mobility with foreign partner universities, which correlates with the need to meet the similar needs of students identified in the Standard "Students".

#### Strengths/best practice

Strengths/best practice of EP 7M11113 "Restaurant and hotel business" (scientific and pedagogical direction), 7M11114 "Restaurant and hotel business" (profile direction) have not been identified.

#### EEC recommendations:

- specify the minimum requirements to the level of English proficiency for the teaching staff of the EP conducting lessons in English. Make appropriate changes to the documents regulating the personnel policy and the selection of teaching staff. Deadline: 01.09.2022;
- devise a "road map" on the development of academic mobility of teaching staff with foreign partner universities. Deadline: 01.12.2022.

#### EEC conclusions by criteria

According to the Standard "Teaching staff" EP 7M11113 "Restaurant and hotel business" (scientific and pedagogical direction), 7M11114 "Restaurant and hotel business"

(profile direction), 9 criteria are disclosed, of which 8 have satisfactory positions, 1 - implies improvement.

## 6.8. Standard "Educational resources and student support systems"

- $\checkmark$  The university must guarantee the compliance of the infrastructure, educational resources, also material and technical, with the goals of the educational program.
- ✓ Management of the EP must demonstrate the sufficiency of classrooms, laboratories and other facilities supplied with modern equipment to ensure the achievement of the objectives of the EP.
- ✓ The university must demonstrate the compliance of information resources with the needs of the university and the implemented EP, including the following areas:

technological support for students and teaching staff in accordance with educational programs (for example, online learning, modeling, databases, data analysis programs);

library resources, including a fund of educational, methodical and scientific literature on general education, basic and major disciplines on paper and electronic media, periodicals, access to scientific databases;

examination of research results, graduation works and dissertations for plagiarism;

access to the educational Internet resources;

functioning of WI-FI on its territory.

- ✓ The university must provide conditions for conducting scientific research, integrating science and education, publishing the results of research works of teaching staff and students.
- The university should strive to ensure that the educational equipment and software used for the development of educational programs are similar to those used in the relevant sectors of the economy.
- ✓ The management of the EP should demonstrate the existence of procedures for supporting various groups of students, including information and counseling.
  - ✓ The management of the EP should show the existence of conditions for the advancement of students

along individual educational trajectories.

- ✓ The university must take into account the needs of different groups of students (adults, working, foreign students, as well as students with special educational needs).
  - The university must ensure that the infrastructure meets the safety requirements.

# Evidence

Formation of material and technical resources KazUIR&WL is carried out in accordance with the requirements of state education standards of the Republic of Kazakhstan, state supervision services (Construction Rules and Regulations and STRK). The infrastructure of the university includes campuses and laboratory buildings, libraries, a printing house, canteens, first-aid posts, sports halls and other educational and auxiliary facilities.

The educational process of the accredited EPs is implemented in 3 campuses: the main campus, campus 1, campus 3. The material and technical base of the university includes buildings, premises, laboratory equipment, means of technical and information support for the educational process (technical training aids, computer classes, etc.), means of external communication.

The university regularly improves its material and technical base, acquiring new and replacing physically and morally obsolete equipment. Students have the opportunity to use computers in reading rooms and in other classrooms equipped with computers, in the hours free from lessons.

4 computer classes on the 3rd floor of the main campus are free from lessons for students to use the computers at any time.

In 2017, infrastructure was developed for barrier-free access to education and accommodation for students with special educational needs. Ramps and staff call buttons have

been installed in all campuses and dormitories. The campus is provided with elevators for people with limited mobility: the floor numbers on the elevator buttons are marked in Braille for tactile perception, audio detectors are also installed. On the territory of the university, on the main traffic routes, a tactile-ground guide strip is installed, and at the entrance to the campus for the visually impaired, an information mnemonic diagram (tactile traffic diagram) is installed that displays information about the premises in the building without interfering with the main traffic flow. In the main campus and campus 3, specially designated toilet cabins for people with limited mobility have been installed.

The university has a medical center supplied with modern medical equipment, providing in-depth medical assistance to students, graduates and staff. The material fund improves every year and new equipment is purchased.

Technological support for students and teaching staff is carried out through the call center 87272920384 (ext. 1115) or the official website of the university, which contains the necessary information for students, teachers, employees, including ICT support.

The library fund contains about 1 million items; there are 5 reading rooms equipped with computers with access to the electronic catalog with the university's, domestic and foreign databases. The licensed software of the Kazakhstan automated library information system "KALIS" complies with international standards.

The accredited EPs have a sufficient amount of required educational literature (Table 4).

Table 4 - Book availability of EP 7M11113 "Restaurant and hotel business" for the 2020-2021 academic year

Total ex.	Academic literature, ex.	Scientific literature, ex.
4836	3156	1680

Access to databases is provided in reading rooms and resource centers: Republican Interuniversity Electronic Library - (http://www.rmeb.kz/); EBSCO e-Book Academic Collection - http://search.ebscohost.com; Scopus database - http://www.scopus.com/; Springer database http://link.springer.com/ etc.

The university and Plagiat.pl concluded an agreement until January 31, 2023, according to which the university gets access to tools for searching for borrowings in students' works, including PhD works in the StrikePlagiarism system. Every year, the University buys software "Anti-plagiarism. University", which provides a technology for checking text documents for borrowing and is used to check the written works of students for the amount of borrowing, and to analyze works for illegal borrowing.

All computer classes have access to the Internet resources; accredited EPs are fully provided with educational equipment. The provision of WI-FI in campuses and dormitories is 70%.

#### Analytical part

The analysis showed that, in general, the university demonstrates a continuous process of improving material, technical and information resources, including those used for the implementation of the accredited EPs (classrooms, laboratories, computer equipment, library collections, access to international databases, etc.). Conditions to meet students' educational and individual needs, the infrastructure for inclusive education have been created at the University. An examination of students' research work outcomes and of their written works for plagiarism, is provided.

The student survey conducted during the EEC visit to the University showed that the vast majority of respondents (about 95%) are completely satisfied with the availability of academic and personal counseling, provision with educational materials in the learning process, the quality of services provided in libraries and reading rooms, educational resources, computer classes, Internet resources, and the overall quality of the study program.

However, the management of the accredited EPs needs to pay attention to the compliance of information resources with the specifics of the EP, in particular, library resources, funds of educational, methodological and scientific literature, both for general and major disciplines. Shortcomings in the educational and methodological documentation (Standard "Development and approval of the educational program"), inconsistencies revealed in the lists of literature for some disciplines and the language of instruction and some outdated sources require improvements.

In addition, the management of the accredited EPs has not provided a single example confirming the availability of educational equipment and software similar to those used in the restaurant and hotel business, copies of license agreements for the purchase of software, or listing of special equipment types. In this regard, it is required to purchase and put into operation such types of educational equipment and software, or provide students with direct access to original solutions used in enterprises (for example, IS "eQonaq").

Strengths/best practice of EP 7M11113 "Restaurant and hotel business" (scientific and pedagogical direction), 7M11114 "Restaurant and hotel business" (profile direction) have not been identified.

#### WEC recommendations:

- update the library funds, paper and electronic educational, methodological and scientific literature in all disciplines of the EP, including those conducted in English; update the lists of references given in the syllabuses of the disciplines. Deadline: 31.12.2022
- provide the EP with educational equipment and software similar to those used in the restaurant and hotel business (for example, IS "eQonaq"). Deadline: 01.02.2023.

### EEC conclusions by criteria

According to the Standard "Educational resources and student support systems" EP 7M11113 "Restaurant and hotel business" (scientific and pedagogical direction), 7M11114 "Restaurant and hotel business" (profile direction) 9 criteria have been disclosed, of which 7 have satisfactory positions, 2 - suggest improvement.

### 6.9. Public Information Standard

- ✓ The university guarantees that the published information is accurate, objective, up-to-date and reflects all areas of the university's activities within the educational program.
- $\checkmark$  Informing the public should include support and explanation of national programs for the development of the country and the system of higher and postgraduate education.
- ✓ The management of the university should use variety of ways to disseminate information (including the media, web resources, information networks, etc.) to inform the general public and interested parties.
  - ✓ Information about the educational program is objective, up-to-date and should include: the purpose and expected outcomes of the EP, the qualifications; information about evaluation system of educational achievements of students;

information about academic mobility programs and other forms of cooperation with partner universities

and employers;

information about the opportunities for the development of personal and professional competencies of students and employment opportunities;

data reflecting the positioning of the EP in the market of educational services (at the regional, national,

international levels).

- ✓ An important factor is publication of reliable information about the teaching staff in open resources.
- ✓ The university must publish audited financial statements for the EP on its own web resource.
- ✓ The university should post information and links to external resources based on the results of external evaluation procedures.
- ✓ An important factor is the placement of information about cooperation and interaction with partners, including scientific / consulting organizations, business partners, social partners and educational organizations.

#### Evidence

The official website is the main resource of informing the public about the university's activities, national development programs of the country, the work of the system of higher and postgraduate education, the implementation of the EP - https://www.ablaikhan.kz/. The site has a Jivocity chatbot giving online feedback and answering questions from site visitors. The order of publication and information placement is determined by the academic calendar, structural divisions plans and the media plan for the academic year.

The university runs a press service, whose area of responsibility includes information support for the university and its divisions; formation of a positive public opinion of the university through the media; monitoring the media, studying trends in public opinion of the university and assessing the impact of the media on it.

Additional channels for informing the public of the university are social networks, print media, and student radio. The university has accounts in social networks: Instagram https://www.instagram.com/kazumo23, VKontakte https://vk.com/kazumo23, Youtube https://www.youtube.com/channel/UCWh8T5-dSgGOTg6lj8KP- lw, Facebook https://www.facebook.com/ablaikhan.kz. Direct communication with applicants and students of the university is carried out through their accounts in social networks.

The university issues the newspaper "The World of Languages", the electronic version of which is also posted on the university website, in the "Press Center" section https://www.ablaikhan.kz/ru/component/content/article/83-press-center/1177-language-world.html.

There is student radio that informs students about important events taking place at the university. The radio news block goes on the air daily at 11.50 and 15.40, running time is 10 minutes. The news is broadcast in two languages.

The "Applicants" section of the university website http://www.ablaikhan.kz/ru/for-applicants/for-applicants/our-faculties.html provides visitors with information on general conditions for admission to the university and descriptions of the EPs. The "Freshman's Guide" provides general information about the university, methods and criteria of grading, rules of conducting various types of assessment, etc. – <a href="https://www.ablaikhan.kz/ru/for-students/for-students/freshman-guide.html">https://www.ablaikhan.kz/ru/for-students/for-students/freshman-guide.html</a>.

Information about the accredited educational programs is posted on the page https://www.ablaikhan.kz/ru/?option=com\_content&view=article&id=3420. In addition, the management of the EP informs the public and interested parties about the implemented EP by informing future graduates of undergraduate programs (including other universities) about master programs, the benefits of entering KazUIR&WL, distributing booklets of the faculty and demonstrating presentations.

There are publications about the accredited EPs in the online media: teaching staff of the department notifies applicants about the possibilities of enrolling to the EP, about the list of required documents, important deadlines, specifics of entrance exams - https://yvision.kz/post/771693.

Information about the teaching staff of the EP is presented on the university website in the appropriate section - http://pps.ablaikhan.kz/backend/web/index.php?r=science%2Flistlectors#.

Information on the results of the external evaluation is published on the Accreditation tab - http://www.ablaikhan.kz/ru/about-us/our-university/accreditation.html.

### Analytical part

The analysis showed that the university operates on the principles of transparency, openness, involvement and awareness of the interested parties in its activities, continuous development and adaptation to ever changing conditions.

The university publishes reliable, objective, up-to-date information about the accredited educational programs, has a variety of public information technologies, including electronic and traditional channels of communication with interested parties. Explanatory work is provided on the role of education, current trends in the development of the educational sphere.

At the same time, analysis of the pages with the descriptions of the accredited EPs revealed that the information available to an external user is presented in a somewhat abbreviated version. In particular, there is no information about approaches to teaching, learning, assessment systems; passing grades and students' learning opportunities. Obviously, this information is basic for informing potential applicants of the accredited EPs, thus it needs to be placed not only on the educational portal, which is not accessible to a wide range of interested persons, but also in the public domain on the university website.

The university should also reflect the list of the main partners of the EPs, information on interaction with them, describe the employment opportunities for graduates, provide links to the publications of the teaching staff of the accredited EPs on their personal pages. In addition, the EEC notes that the English page of the accredited EPs has links to Russian-language documents.

Strengths/best practice of EP 7M11113 "Restaurant and hotel business" (scientific and pedagogical direction), 7M11114 "Restaurant and hotel business" (profile direction) have not been identified.

#### EEC recommendations:

- place information about approaches to teaching, learning, and the assessment system; passing scores and learning opportunities for students; list of the main partners of the EP on the EP page of the university's official website. Specify information about employment opportunities for graduates. Deadline: 01.08.2022;

- post English versions of the EP development plans, their specifications on the English language page of the accredited EPs. Deadline: 01.04.2023;
- regularly post information about cooperation and interaction with the partners of the EPs on the EP page of the official website of the university and in social network accounts. Deadline: permanent.

### EEC conclusions by criteria

According to the Standard "Informing the public" EP 7M11113 "Restaurant and hotel business" (scientific and pedagogical direction), 7M11114 "Restaurant and hotel business" (profile direction), 10 criteria are disclosed, of which 10 have satisfactory positions.

## (VII) OVERVIEW OF STRENGTHS/BEST PRACTICE FOR EACH STANDARD

### Standard "Management of the educational program"

Strengths/best practice of EP 7M11113 "Restaurant and hotel business" (scientific and pedagogical direction), 7M11114 "Restaurant and hotel business" (profile direction): not identified.

### Standard "Information Management and Reporting"

Strengths/best practice of EP 7M11113 "Restaurant and hotel business" (scientific and pedagogical direction), 7M11114 "Restaurant and hotel business" (profile direction): not identified.

### Standard "Development and approval of the educational program"

Strengths/best practice of EP 7M11113 "Restaurant and hotel business" (scientific and pedagogical direction), 7M11114 "Restaurant and hotel business" (profile direction): not identified.

### Standard "Continuous monitoring and periodic evaluation of educational programs"

Strengths/best practice of EP 7M11113 "Restaurant and hotel business" (scientific and pedagogical direction), 7M11114 "Restaurant and hotel business" (profile direction): not identified.

### Standard "Student-Centered Learning, Teaching and Assessment"

Strengths/best practice of EP 7M11113 "Restaurant and hotel business" (scientific and pedagogical direction), 7M11114 "Restaurant and hotel business" (profile direction): not identified.

### Standard "Students"

Strengths/best practice of EP 7M11113 "Restaurant and hotel business" (scientific and pedagogical direction), 7M11114 "Restaurant and hotel business" (profile direction): not identified.

### Standard "Teaching Staff"

Strengths/best practice of EP 7M11113 "Restaurant and hotel business" (scientific and pedagogical direction), 7M11114 "Restaurant and hotel business" (profile direction): not identified.

### Standard "Educational resources and student support systems"

Strengths/best practice of EP 7M11113 "Restaurant and hotel business" (scientific and pedagogical direction), 7M11114 "Restaurant and hotel business" (profile direction): not identified.

### Standard "Public Information"

Strengths/best practice of EP 7M11113 "Restaurant and hotel business" (scientific and pedagogical direction), 7M11114 "Restaurant and hotel business" (profile direction): not identified.

# (VIII) OVERVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS FOR QUALITY IMPROVEMENT

### Standard "Management of the educational program"

EEC recommendations for EP 7M11113 "Restaurant and hotel business" (scientific and pedagogical direction), 7M11114 "Restaurant and hotel business" (profile direction):

- analyze the actual positioning of the accredited EPs with the involvement of representatives of the business community, determine the competitive advantages of the EP over the programs of other universities, reflect the results in the EP development plans, specifications and descriptions on the university website. Deadline: 01.10.2022;
- amend the Regulations "On the procedure for designing an educational program development plan and implementation monitoring", namely (1) include requirements for setting goals for the EP development plan according to the 'SMART' methodology; (2) the need to identify those responsible for achieving target indicators; (3) introduction of a unified report form for monitoring the implementation of the EP development plan. Deadline: 01.08.2022;
- adjust the EP development plans in accordance with the requirements of the updated document and the Quality Goals approved for the 2022-2023 academic year. Deadline: 01.10.2022;
- specify the procedure of regular reporting by the management of the EP, reflecting the results of the work of the Academic Council and the implementation of its work plan, to fix changes in the NLA that regulates the functioning of the Academic Council. Deadline: 01.08.2022;
- management of the EP should submit to the university management: (1) a report on the implementation of the work plan of RAL #3 in terms of creating educational and applied products for implementation in the EP, to make proposals for adjusting the plan based on the results of the review; (2) a report on the implementation of the decisions of the Academic Council of 22.20.2021 #7-1 in terms of assigned instructions. Deadline: 15.07.2022.

### Information Management and Reporting Standard

EEC recommendations for EP 7M11113 "Restaurant and hotel business" (scientific and pedagogical direction), 7M11114 "Restaurant and hotel business" (profile direction):

- introduce specific key performance indicators for all areas of the EP implementation, ensure transparency and accessibility of information on key performance and efficiency indicators. Deadline: 01.09.2022;
- evaluate the effectiveness and efficiency of the accredited EP in accordance with the established indicators, including availability of educational resources and support systems for students of the EP, present the results of the assessment to the management of the university. Deadline: 01.10.2022;
- ensure the improvement of the mechanism for the systematic use of adequate information to improve the internal quality assurance system by integrating the key performance indicators of the EP into the balanced scorecard of the university. Deadline: 01.06.2023

Standard "Development and approval of the educational program"

### EEC recommendations for EP 7M11113 "Restaurant and hotel business" (scientific and pedagogical direction), 7M11114 "Restaurant and hotel business" (profile direction):

- provide in the structure of the discipline syllabuses a section demonstrating the contribution of the discipline to the formation of learning outcomes and competencies at the level of the EP, to reflect the corresponding changes in the discipline syllabuses of the accredited EPs. Deadline: July 15, 2022;
- adjust the thematic content of disciplines based on the planned learning outcomes and competencies, their contribution to the formation of program learning outcomes and graduate competencies. Deadline: July 15, 2022;
- provide the disciplines conducted in the English language with authentic literature provide disciplines implemented in English with sources of authentic literature. Deadline: July 15, 2022:
- ensure the compliance of labor intensity of educational work types with the total labor intensity of the discipline. Deadline: July 15, 2022;
- submit a complete set of educational and methodological documentation of the accredited educational programs for internal examination. Deadline: July 15, 2022;
- expand the formats of the business community representatives participation and participation of employers involved in external assessments in the process of developing EPs and ensuring their quality (monitoring current and future needs, employers, joint development and adjustment of EPs, targeted admission of students, involvement of employers for the implementation of EPs, etc.). Deadline: 01.02.2023
- determine the professional certification types that students can be trained for, determine the list of disciplines, whose content is aimed at preparing them for certification. Deadline: December 31, 2022.

### Standard "Continuous monitoring and periodic evaluation of educational programs"

## EEC recommendations for EP 7M11113 "Restaurant and hotel business" (scientific and pedagogical direction), 7M11114 "Restaurant and hotel business" (profile direction):

- in the procedure for monitoring and periodic evaluation of the EP, provide mechanisms for analyzing: (1) the effectiveness of student assessment procedures, (2) students' workload, progress and graduation, (3) educational environment, support services for their compliance with the goals of the EP. Deadline: 01.08.2022;
- develop a local legal act regulating the conduct of periodic expertise of the EP components. Deadline: 01.08.2022.

### Standard "Student-Centered Learning, Teaching and Assessment"

EEC recommendations for EP 7M11113 "Restaurant and hotel business" (scientific and pedagogical direction), 7M11114 "Restaurant and hotel business" (profile direction):

- harmonize the structure and content of the elective part of the working curricula of the EP with the catalogs of elective disciplines, provide students with the opportunity to form flexible educational trajectories in any of the teaching languages available for the implementation of the EP. Deadline: July 15, 2022;
- expand the format of the grade-rating system by including a textual description of the grades in the terminology of the learning outcomes within a particular discipline. Make appropriate changes to the working curricula / syllabuses of all disciplines, communicate the information to the students. Deadline: 31.12.2022.
- provide training for the teaching staff of the accredited EPs in advanced training programs in the field of innovative pedagogy and modern methods of assessing learning outcomes. Deadline: 01.07.2023.

### Standard ''Students''

EEC recommendations for EP 7M11113 "Restaurant and hotel business" (scientific and pedagogical direction), 7M11114 "Restaurant and hotel business" (profile direction):

- specify the procedure of enrolling the EP contingent, approve the recruitment plan for 2023; develop an action plan to reduce the risks in contingent enrollment and marketing promotion of the EP. Deadline: 01.09.2022;
- determine by a local regulatory legal act the minimum requirements of English proficiency for applicants of the accredited EPs and publish them in open access. Deadline: 01.07.2022;
- to develop a "road map" for the development of academic mobility, including distance (virtual) academic mobility with foreign partner universities. Deadline: 01.12.2022
- ensure the creation of a hotel business department at one of the partner enterprises. Deadline: 01.09.2023.

### Standard "Teaching Staff"

EEC recommendations for EP 7M11113 "Restaurant and hotel business" (scientific and pedagogical direction), 7M11114 "Restaurant and hotel business" (profile direction):

- specify the minimum requirements to the level of English proficiency for the teaching staff of the EP conducting lessons in English. Make appropriate changes to the documents regulating the personnel policy and the selection of teaching staff. Deadline: 01.09.2022;
- devise a "road map" on the development of academic mobility of teaching staff with foreign partner universities. Deadline: 01.12.2022.

### Standard "Educational resources and student support systems"

EEC recommendations for EP 7M11113 "Restaurant and hotel business" (scientific and pedagogical direction), 7M11114 "Restaurant and hotel business" (profile direction):

- update the library funds, paper and electronic educational, methodological and scientific literature in all disciplines of the EP, including those conducted in English; update the lists of references given in the syllabuses of the disciplines. Deadline: 31.12.2022
- provide the EP with educational equipment and software similar to those used in the restaurant and hotel business (for example, IS "eQonaq"). Deadline: 01.02.2023.

### Standard "Public Information"

EEC recommendations for EP 7M11113 "Restaurant and hotel business" (scientific and pedagogical direction), 7M11114 "Restaurant and hotel business" (profile direction):

- place information about approaches to teaching, learning, and the assessment system; passing scores and learning opportunities for students; list of the main partners of the EP on the EP page of the university's official website. Specify information about employment opportunities for graduates. Deadline: 01.08.2022;
- post English versions of the EP development plans, their specifications on the English language page of the accredited EPs. Deadline: 01.04.2023;
- regularly post information about cooperation and interaction with the partners of the EPs on the EP page of the official website of the university and in social network accounts. Deadline: permanent.

# (IX) OVERVIEW OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE DEVELOPMENT OF EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION

There are no EEC recommendations related to the development of the EO, but not related to quality improvement measures and compliance with the IAAR standards for the accredited EPs.

### (X) RECOMMENDATION TO THE ACCREDITATION COUNCIL

The External Expert Commission made a unanimous decision to recommend educational programs 7M11113 "Restaurant and hotel business" (scientific and pedagogical direction), 7M11114 "Restaurant and hotel business" (profile direction) of the Joint Stock Company "Kazakh Ablai khan University of International Relations and World Languages" to the Accreditation Council to accredit for a period of 3 (three) years.

# Appendix 1. Assessment chart "PARAMETERS OF A SPECIALIZED PROFILE"

Conclusion of the External Expert Commission on quality assessment of educational programs 7M11113 "Restaurant and hotel business" (scientific and pedagogical direction), 7M11114 "Restaurant and hotel business" (profile direction) of the Joint Stock Company "Kazakh Ablai Khan University of International Relations and World Languages"

<b>№</b> п\п	Nº	Evaluation criteria	Position of the education organization			
	п\п		strong	Satisfactory	Requires improvement	Unsatisfactory
Stand	dard ''M	lanagement of the educational program''				
1	1.	The organization of higher and (or) postgraduate education must have a published quality assurance policy that reflects the interrelation between research, teaching and learning		+		
2	2.	The organization of higher and (or) postgraduate education must demonstrate the development of quality assurance culture, including the accredited EP		+		
3	3.	Commitment to quality assurance should apply to any activity performed by contractors and partners (outsourcing), including the implementation of joint/double-degree education and academic mobility				
4	4.	The EP management demonstrates transparency in the EP development plan, with the starting dates for implementation, based on its work analysis, the actual positioning of the EP and the focus of its activities on meeting the needs of the state, employers, students and other stakeholders		1		
5	5.	The EP management demonstrates the existence of mechanisms for the formation and regular revision of the EP development plan and monitoring its implementation, assessing the achievement of learning goals, meeting the needs of students, employers and society, making decisions aimed at		L	+	
6	6.	continuous improvement of the EP  The EP management should involve representatives of stakeholder groups, including employers, students and teaching staff in the formation of the EP development plan	7	+		
7	7.	The management of the EP must demonstrate the individuality and uniqueness of the EP development plan, its consistency with national priorities and the development strategy of the organization of higher and (or) postgraduate education		+		
8	8.	The organization of higher and (or) postgraduate education must demonstrate a clear definition of those in charge of business processes within the EP, a clear distribution of staff duties, and delimitation of the functions of collegial bodies		+		
9	9.	The management of the EP must provide evidence of the transparency of the educational program management system		+		
10	10.	The management of the EP must demonstrate the existence of an internal quality assurance system for the EP, including its design, management and monitoring, their improvement, decision-making based on facts		+		
11	11.	The management of the EP must carry out risk management, including the EP undergoing primary accreditation, and also demonstrate a system of measures aimed at reducing the degree of risk		+		
12	12.	The management of the EP should ensure the participation of representatives of employers, teaching staff, students and other interested parties in the collegiate management bodies of the educational program, as		+		

		well as their representativeness in making decisions on the management of the educational program				
13	13.	The EO must demonstrate innovation management within the EP, including the analysis and implementation of innovative proposals			+	
14	14.	The management of the EP must demonstrate evidence of readiness for openness and accessibility for students, teaching staff, employers and other		+		
15	15.	interested parties  The management of the EP must be trained in education management		+		
13	13.	programs				
		Total by Standard	0	13	2	0
Stan	dard "In	nformation Management and Reporting"				
16	1.	The university must ensure the functioning of the system for collecting,		+		
		analyzing and managing information based on modern information and				
		communication technologies and software and what use of variety of				
		methods to collect and analyze information in the EP.				
17	2.	The EP management demonstrates the systematic use of processed,		+		
		adequate information to improve the internal quality assurance system				
18	3.	The management of the EP must demonstrate fact-based decision making		+		
19	4.	A system of regular reporting should be provided within the EP, reflecting		+		
		all levels of the structure, including effectiveness and efficiency				
	1	assessment of the departments activities and scientific research				
20	5.	The university must determine the frequency, forms and methods for		+		
		assessing the management of the EP, the activities of collegial bodies and				
		structural divisions and top management.				
21	6.	The university must demonstrate a mechanism for ensuring protection of		+		
		information, including identification of people responsible for the				
		reliability and timeliness of information analysis and data provision				
22	7.	The university demonstrates the involvement of students, employees and		+		
		teaching staff in the processes of collecting and analyzing information,				
		making decisions based on them				
23	8.	The EP management must demonstrate the existence of communication mechanisms with students, employees and other stakeholders, including		+		
24	9.	conflict resolution  The university must ensure the measurement of the degree of needs				
		satisfaction of students, teaching staff and personnel within the EP		+		
25	10.	The EO should provide the effectiveness and efficiency assessment of activities, including on the EP			+	
	1	The information expected to be collected and analyzed within the EP	7			
2.5		should take into account:	1			
26	11.	key performance indicators			+	
27	12.	the dynamics of forms and types of the student contingent		+		
28	13.	academic performance, student achievements and dropouts		+		
29	14.	student satisfaction with the implementation of the EP and the quality of education at the university		+		
30	15.	availability of educational resources and support systems for students			+	
31	16.	The EO must confirm the implementation of the procedures for processing		+		
		personal data of students, employees and teaching staff on the basis of their documented consent				
			0	10	2	0
G:		Total by Standard	0	13	3	0
		evelopment and approval of the educational program"				
32	1.	The university must demonstrate the existence of a documented procedure		+		
		for the EP development and its approval at the institutional level				
33	2.	The university must demonstrate the compliance of the developed EP with the established goals and expected learning outcomes		+		
34	3.	The management of the EP must demonstrate the existence of mechanisms for reviewing the content and structure of the EP, taking into account		+		
		101 To reviewing the comein and structure of the EF, taking into account	<u>I</u>	<u>I</u>	l	<u> </u>

		changes in the labor market, the requirements of employers and the social demand of society				
35	4.	The university demonstrates the model of a graduate of the EP, describing the learning outcomes and personal qualities		+		
36	5.	The management of the EP must demonstrate the conduct of external reviews of the EP content and expected results of its implementation		+		
37	6.	The qualification awarded upon completion of the EP must be clearly defined, explained and correspond to a certain level of the HSK, QF-EHEA.		+		
38	7.	The EP management should determine the influence of the disciplines and professional internship on the formation of learning outcomes			+	
39	8.	An important factor is the possibility of preparing students for professional certification			+	
40	9.	The management of the EP must provide evidence of the participation of students, teaching staff and other stakeholders in the development and quality assurance of the EP		+		
41	10.	The management of the EP should ensure that the content of academic disciplines and learning outcomes correspond to each other and the level of education (bachelor's, master's, doctoral studies)			+	
42	11.	The structure of the EP should provide various types of activities ensuring students' achievement of the expected learning outcomes		+		
43	12.	An important factor is the correspondence between the content of the EP and the learning outcomes of the EP implemented by organizations of higher and (or) postgraduate education in the EHEA		+		
		Total by Standard	0	9	3	0
Stand		Continuous monitoring and periodic evaluation of educational				
prog	rams''	The FO should determine the marketines for magicaline and main dis-				
44	1.	The EO should determine the mechanisms for monitoring and periodic evaluating of the EP to ensure the achievement of the goals, meet the needs of students, society, and show the focus of the mechanisms on the continuous improvement of the EP				
45	2.	Monitoring and periodic evaluation of the EP should include: the program content in the context of the latest scientific and technological achievements in a particular discipline		+		
46	3.	changes in the society requirements and professional environment		+		
47	4.	workload, performance and graduation of students		+		
48	5.	the effectiveness of student assessment procedures			+	
50	6. 7.	expectations and satisfaction of students by the EP educational environment and support services, and their compliance with the objectives of the EP		+	+	
51	8.	management of the EP must demonstrate a systematic approach to monitoring and periodical assessment of the quality of the EP			+	
52	9.	the EO, the management of the EP should determine a mechanism for informing all interested parties about any planned or taken actions in relation to the EP		+		
53	10.	all changes made to the EP must be published		+		
		Total by Standard	0	7	3	0
Stand	dard "St	tudent-Centered Learning, Teaching and Assessment"				
54	1.	the EP management should ensure respect and attention to various groups of students and their needs, provide them with flexible learning paths			+	
55	2.	the EP management should provide the use of various forms and methods of teaching and learning		+		
56	3.	an important factor is own research in the field of teaching methods of	_	+	1	

the EP management must demonstrate the existence of teedback mechanisms to various teaching and learning outcomes assessment methods  58 5. The management of the EP must demonstrate the mechanisms of student autonomy support and provide guidance and assistance from the teacher responding to complaints from students of the EP management of must demonstrate the existence of a procedure for responding to complaints from students of the EP must ensure the consistency, transparency and objectivity of the mechanism for evaluating learning outcomes for each EP, including appealations  60 7. the EO must ensure that the procedures for assessing the EP students' learning outcomes correspond to the expected outcomes and goals of the program, the publication of criteria and assessment methods in advance the EO should define the mechanisms to ensure the achievement of learning outcomes by each EP graduate and ensure the completeness of their formation.  63 10. assessors must be familiar with modern methods for assessing learning outcomes and regularly improve their skills in this area.  75 Standard "Students"  64 1. the EO must demonstrate the existence of a policy for the formation of the EP student contingent, ensure transparency and publicity of its procedures governing the life cycle of students (from admission to completion)  65 2. basic requirements for applicants  66 3. maximum group size for seminars, practical, laboratory and studio classes the EP management should determine the procedure for the formation of a student contingent between the procedure for the formation and human resources  67 4. predicting the number of government grants  68 5. analysis of potential social conditions for students, including provision of places in the hostel  70 7. the EP management must demonstrate readiness to conduct special adaptation and support programs for newly enrolled and foreign students  71 8. the EO must demonstrate the compliance of its actions with the Lisbon Recognition Convention, the existence of a mechanism for re			d TD	1	Ι.	l	1
methods  5. The management of the EP must demonstrate the mechanisms of student autonomy support and provide guidance and assistance from the teacher cautonomy support and provide guidance and assistance from the teacher the EP management of must demonstrate the existence of a procedure for responding to complaints from students papealations.  60 7. the EO must ensure the consistency, transparency and objectivity of the mechanism for evaluating learning outcomes for each EP, including appealations with the EO must ensure that the procedures for assessing the EP students' learning outcomes correspond to the expected outcomes and goals of the program, the publication of criteria and assessment methods in advance the EO should define the mechanisms to caster the achievement of learning outcomes by each EP graduate and ensure the completeness of their formation.  62 9. the EO should define the mechanisms to caster the achievement of learning outcomes by each EP graduate and ensure the completeness of their formation of their formation.  63 10. sasessars must be familiar with modern methods for assessing learning outcomes and regularly improve their skills in this area.  64 1. the EO must demonstrate the existence of a policy for the formation of the EP student contingent, ensure transparency and publicity of its procedures governing the life cycle of students (from admission to completion)  65 2. basic requirements for applicants  66 3. maximum group size for seminars, practical, laboratory and studio classes + existence on the procedure for the formation of a student configuration and publicity of the analysis of the available material and technical base, information and human resources  69 6. analysis of potential social conditions for students, including provision of places in the hostel  70 7. the EP management must demonstrate readiness to conduct special adaptation and support programs for newly curolled and foreign students  71 8. the EO should provide an opportunity for external and internal mobility of the	57	4.	the EP management must demonstrate the existence of feedback		+		
58							
autonomy support and provide guidance and assistance from the teacher the EP management of must demonstrate the existence of a procedure for responding to complaints from students the EO must ensure the consistency, transparency and objectivity of the mechanism for evaluating learning outcomes for each EP, including appealations the EO must ensure that the procedures for assessing the EP students' learning outcomes correspond to the expected outcomes and goals of the program, the publication of criteria and assessment methods in advance the EO should define the mechanisms to ensure the achievement of learning outcomes by each EP graduate and ensure the completeness of their formation.  Standard "Students"  Total by Standard    Standard "Students"  ### Deformation of the EP students from admission to completion the EP management should determine the procedure for the formation of a student contingent, ensure transparency and publicity of its procedures governing the life cycle of students (from admission to completion)  ### Total by Standard  ### Deformation of a student of the EP management should determine the procedure for the formation of a student contingent, ensure transparency and publicity of its procedures governing the life cycle of students (from admission to completion)  ### Total by Standard  ### Deformation of a student of the formation of a student contingent based on:  ### analysis of the available material and technical base, information and human resources  ### analysis of the available material and technical base, information and human resources  ### analysis of potential social conditions for students, including provision of places in the hostel  ### Deformation of a students from admission of completes students  ### the EO must demonstrate the compliance of its actions with the Lisbon Recognition Convention, the existence of a mechanism for recognizing the results of additional, formal and non-formal learning  ### Deformation Centers for Academic Recognition and Mobility / National Academic	58	5			+		
the EP management of must demonstrate the existence of a procedure for responding to complaints from students the EO must ensure the consistency, transparency and objectivity of the mechanism for evaluating learning outcomes for each EP, including appealations the EO must ensure that the procedures for assessing the EP students' learning outcomes correspond to the expected outcomes and goals of the program, the publication of criteria and assessment methods in advance the EO should define the mechanisms to ensure the achievement of learning outcomes by each EP graduate and ensure the completeness of their formation.  Total by Standard  Standard "Students"  Total by Standard  be EP student contingent, ensure transparency and publicity of its procedures governing the life cycle of students (from admission to completion)  the EP management should determine the procedure for the formation of a student contingent based on:  the EP management should determine the procedure for the formation of a student contingent based on:  analysis of the available material and technical base, information and human resources  analysis of potential social conditions for students, including provision of places, in the hostel  the EP management must demonstrate readiness to conduct special adaptation and support programs for newly enrolled and foreign students  the EO must demonstrate the compliance of its actions with the Lisbon Recognition Convention, the existence of a mechanism for recognizing the results of academic mobility of students, as well as the results of additional, formal and non-formal learning  the EO should cooperate with other educational organizations and national centers of the "European Network of National Information Centers for Academic Recognition and Mobility / National Academic Recognition Information Centers for Academic Recognition and Mobility / National Academic Recognition Information of qualifications  the EO should provide the EP graduates with documents confirming the qualifications received, achieve	50	] 3.			ļ '		
responding to complaints from students  the EO must ensure the consistency, transparency and objectivity of the mechanism for evaluating learning outcomes for each EP, including appealations  the EO must ensure that the procedures for assessing the EP students' learning outcomes correspond to the expected outcomes and goals of the program, the publication of criteria and assessment methods in advance  the EO should define the mechanisms to ensure the achievement of learning outcomes by each EP graduate and ensure the completeness of their formation.  Total by Standard  **Total by Standard**  Total by Standard "Students"  ### Total by Standard O  ### EP student contingent, ensure transparency and publicity of its procedures governing the life cycle of students (from admission to completion)  ### the EO must demonstrate the existence of a policy for the formation of the EP student contingent based on:  ### Standard "Students"  ### Total by Standard O  ### Standard "Students of the EP students of the EP management should determine the procedure for the formation of a student contingent based on:  ### assisted of the students of the students of the EP management should determine the procedure for the formation of a student contingent based on:  ### Total by Standard O  ### Total by Standard	59	6		1	+		
the EO must ensure the consistency, transparency and objectivity of the mechanism for evaluating learning outcomes for each EP, including appealations  8. the EO must ensure that the procedures for assessing the EP students' the EO must ensure that the procedures for assessing the EP students' the EO should define the mechanisms to ensure the achievement of learning outcomes by each EP graduate and ensure the completeness of their formation.  Total by Standard Standard "Students"  Total by Standard "Students"  the EO must demonstrate the existence of a policy for the formation of the EP student contingent, ensure transparency and publicity of its procedures governing the life cycle of students (from admission to completion)  the EP management should determine the procedure for the formation of a student contingent based on:  basic requirements for applicants  maximum group size for seminars, practical, laboratory and studio classes  practicing the number of government grants  analysis of the available material and technical base, information and human resources  analysis of potential social conditions for students, including provision of places in the host!  the EO must demonstrate the compliance of its actions with the Lisbon Recognition Convention, the existence of a mechanism for recognizing the results of academic mobility of students, as well as the results of additional, formal and non-formal learning  the EO should cooperate with other educational organizations and national enteres of the "European Network of National Information Centers for Academic Recognition and Mobility / National Academic Recognition of qualifications  the EO should provide an opportunity for external and internal mobility of the EP students, readiness to help them in obtaining external educational grants  the EO should provide an opportunity for external and internal mobility of the EP students, readiness to help them in obtaining external educational contact with them  the EP management must demonstrate readiness to provide stude	<i>3 7</i>	0.	•		ļ '		
mechanism for evaluating learning outcomes for each EP, including appealations  between the EO must ensure that the procedures for assessing the EP students' learning outcomes correspond to the expected outcomes and goals of the program, the publication of criteria and assessment methods in advance  compared to the EO should define the mechanisms to ensure the achievement of learning outcomes by each EP graduate and ensure the completeness of their formation.  Total by Standard  Standard "Students"  Total by Standard O  Standard "Students"  4	60	7		1	,		
appealations  the EO must ensure that the procedures for assessing the EP students' learning outcomes correspond to the expected outcomes and goals of the program, the publication of criteria and assessment methods in advance  the EO should define the mechanisms to ensure the achievement of learning outcomes by each EP graduate and ensure the completeness of their formation.  assessors must be familiar with modern methods for assessing learning outcomes and regularly improve their skills in this area.  Total by Standard  Students''  64	00	/.					
Standard "Students"							
learning outcomes correspond to the expected outcomes and goals of the program, the publication of criteria and assessment methods in advance the EO should define the mechanisms to ensure the achievement of learning outcomes by each EP graduate and ensure the completeness of their formation.    3	61	8.		1	+		
program, the publication of criteria and assessment methods in advance	-						
learning outcomes by each EP graduate and ensure the completeness of their formation.  10. assessors must be familiar with modern methods for assessing learning outcomes and regularly improve their skills in this area.  Total by Standard 0 9  Standard "Students"  4 the EO must demonstrate the existence of a policy for the formation of the EP student contingent, ensure transparency and publicity of its procedures governing the life cycle of students (from admission to completion)  the EP management should determine the procedure for the formation of a student contingent based on:  2 basic requirements for applicants  3 maximum group size for seminars, practical, laboratory and studio classes  4 predicting the number of government grants  5 analysis of the available material and technical base, information and human resources  69 6. analysis of potential social conditions for students, including provision of places in the hostel  70 7. the EP management must demonstrate readiness to conduct special adaptation and support programs for newly enrolled and foreign students  71 8. the EO must demonstrate the compliance of its actions with the Lisbon Recognition Convention, the existence of a mechanism for recognizing the results of additional, formal and non-formal learning  72 9. the EO should cooperate with other educational organizations and national centers of the "European Network of National Information Centers for Academic Recognition and Mobility / National Academic Recognition Information Centers" ENIC / NARIC in order to ensure comparable recognition of qualifications  73 10. the EO should provide an opportunity for external and internal mobility of the EP students, readiness to help them in obtaining external educational grants  74 11. the EP management must demonstrate readiness to provide students with internship places, promote the employment of graduates, and maintain contact with them  75 12. the EO should provide the EP graduates with documents confirming the qualifications received, achieved learning							
their formation.  assessors must be familiar with modern methods for assessing learning outcomes and regularly improve their skills in this area.  Total by Standard 0 9  Standard "Students"  4 1. the EO must demonstrate the existence of a policy for the formation of the EP student contingent, ensure transparency and publicity of its procedures governing the life cycle of students (from admission to completion)  the EP management should determine the procedure for the formation of a student contingent based on:  5 2. basic requirements for applicants  6 3. maximum group size for seminars, practical, laboratory and studio classes + 67  4 4. predicting the number of government grants  5 analysis of the available material and technical base, information and human resources  6 analysis of potential social conditions for students, including provision of places in the hostel  7 the EP management must demonstrate readiness to conduct special adaptation and support programs for newly enrolled and foreign students  7 the EO must demonstrate the compliance of its actions with the Lisbon Recognition Convention, the existence of a mechanism for recognizing the results of academic mobility of students, as well as the results of additional, formal and non-formal learning  7 the EO should cooperate with other educational organizations and national centers of the "European Network of National Information Centers for Academic Recognition and Mobility / National Academic Recognition Information Centers" ENIC / NARIC in order to ensure comparable recognition of qualifications  7 the EO should provide an opportunity for external and internal mobility of the EP students, readiness to help them in obtaining external educational grants  7 the EO should provide the EP graduates with documents confirming the qualifications received, achieved learning outcomes, as well as the context, content and status of the education received and evidence of its completion	62	9.	the EO should define the mechanisms to ensure the achievement of		+		
A							
Standard "Students"  1. the EO must demonstrate the existence of a policy for the formation of the EP student contingent, ensure transparency and publicity of its procedures governing the life cycle of students (from admission to completion)  the EP management should determine the procedure for the formation of a student contingent based on:  5. basic requirements for applicants  4. predicting the number of government grants  5. analysis of the available material and technical base, information and human resources  69 analysis of potential social conditions for students, including provision of places in the hostel  70 7. the EP management must demonstrate readiness to conduct special adaptation and support programs for newly emolled and foreign students  71 8. the EO must demonstrate the compliance of its actions with the Lisbon Recognition Convention, the existence of a mechanism for recognizing the results of academic mobility of students, as well as the results of additional, formal and non-formal learning  72 9. the EO should cooperate with other educational organizations and national centers of the "European Network of National Information Centers for Academic Recognition and Mobility / National Academic Recognition Information Centers" ENIC / NARIC in order to ensure comparable recognition of qualifications  73 10. the EO should provide an opportunity for external and internal mobility of the EP students, readiness to help them in obtaining external educational grants  74 11. the EP management must demonstrate readiness to provide students with internship places, promote the employment of graduates, and maintain contact with them  75 12. the EO should provide the EP graduates with documents confirming the qualifications received, achieved learning outcomes, as well as the context, content and status of the education received and evidence of its completion				<u> </u>			
Standard "Students"	63	10.			+		
Standard "Students"  64			- · · ·	0	0	1	
1. the EO must demonstrate the existence of a policy for the formation of the EP student contingent, ensure transparency and publicity of its procedures governing the life cycle of students (from admission to completion)  the EP management should determine the procedure for the formation of a student contingent based on:  2. basic requirements for applicants  66 3. maximum group size for seminars, practical, laboratory and studio classes  77 4. predicting the number of government grants  8 analysis of the available material and technical base, information and human resources  8 analysis of potential social conditions for students, including provision of places in the hostel  70 7. the EP management must demonstrate readiness to conduct special adaptation and support programs for newly enrolled and foreign students  8 the EO must demonstrate the compliance of its actions with the Lisbon Recognition Convention, the existence of a mechanism for recognizing the results of academic mobility of students, as well as the results of additional, formal and non-formal learning  72 9. the EO should cooperate with other educational organizations and national centers of the "European Network of National Information Centers for Academic Recognition and Mobility / National Academic Recognition Information Centers" ENIC / NARIC in order to ensure comparable recognition of qualifications  73 10. the EO should provide an opportunity for external and internal mobility of the EP students, readiness to help them in obtaining external educational grants  74 11. the EP management must demonstrate readiness to provide students with internship places, promote the employment of graduates, and maintain contact with them  75 12. the EO should provide the EP graduates with documents confirming the qualifications received, achieved learning outcomes, as well as the context, content and status of the education received and evidence of its completion			·	U	9	1	0
EP student contingent, ensure transparency and publicity of its procedures governing the life cycle of students (from admission to completion)  the EP management should determine the procedure for the formation of a student contingent based on:  5	Stand	dard ''St	udents"				
EP student contingent, ensure transparency and publicity of its procedures governing the life cycle of students (from admission to completion)  the EP management should determine the procedure for the formation of a student contingent based on:  5	64	1.	the EO must demonstrate the existence of a policy for the formation of the			+	
governing the life cycle of students (from admission to completion)  the EP management should determine the procedure for the formation of a student contingent based on:  basic requirements for applicants  maximum group size for seminars, practical, laboratory and studio classes  maximum group size for seminars, practical, laboratory and studio classes  predicting the number of government grants  analysis of the available material and technical base, information and human resources  analysis of potential social conditions for students, including provision of places in the hostel  the EP management must demonstrate readiness to conduct special adaptation and support programs for newly enrolled and foreign students  the EO must demonstrate the compliance of its actions with the Lisbon Recognition Convention, the existence of a mechanism for recognizing the results of academic mobility of students, as well as the results of additional, formal and non-formal learning  the EO should cooperate with other educational organizations and national centers of the "European Network of National Information Centers for Academic Recognition and Mobility / National Academic Recognition Information Centers" ENIC / NARIC in order to ensure comparable recognition of qualifications  the EO should provide an opportunity for external and internal mobility of the ED should provide an opportunity for external and internal mobility of the ED should provide an opportunity for external educational grants  the EP management must demonstrate readiness to provide students with internship places, promote the employment of graduates, and maintain contact with them  the EO should provide the EP graduates with documents confirming the qualifications received, achieved learning outcomes, as well as the context, content and status of the education received and evidence of its completion							
student contingent based on:  2. basic requirements for applicants  63 amaximum group size for seminars, practical, laboratory and studio classes  4 predicting the number of government grants  5 analysis of the available material and technical base, information and human resources  69 analysis of potential social conditions for students, including provision of places in the hostel  70 analysis of potential social conditions for students, including provision of places in the hostel  71 adaptation and support programs for newly enrolled and foreign students  72 the EO must demonstrate the compliance of its actions with the Lisbon Recognition Convention, the existence of a mechanism for recognizing the results of academic mobility of students, as well as the results of additional, formal and non-formal learning  72 9. the EO should cooperate with other educational organizations and national centers of the "European Network of National Information Centers for Academic Recognition and Mobility / National Academic Recognition Information Centers' ENIC / NARIC in order to ensure comparable recognition of qualifications  73 10. the EO should provide an opportunity for external and internal mobility of the EP students, readiness to help them in obtaining external educational grants  74 11. the EP management must demonstrate readiness to provide students with internship places, promote the employment of graduates, and maintain contact with them  75 12. the EO should provide the EP graduates with documents confirming the qualifications received, achieved learning outcomes, as well as the context, content and status of the education received and evidence of its completion							
basic requirements for applicants  7			the EP management should determine the procedure for the formation of a		l.		
maximum group size for seminars, practical, laboratory and studio classes							
4. predicting the number of government grants  5. analysis of the available material and technical base, information and human resources  69 6. analysis of potential social conditions for students, including provision of places in the hostel  70 7. the EP management must demonstrate readiness to conduct special adaptation and support programs for newly enrolled and foreign students  71 8. the EO must demonstrate the compliance of its actions with the Lisbon Recognition Convention, the existence of a mechanism for recognizing the results of academic mobility of students, as well as the results of additional, formal and non-formal learning  72 9. the EO should cooperate with other educational organizations and national centers of the "European Network of National Information Centers for Academic Recognition and Mobility / National Academic Recognition Information Centers" ENIC / NARIC in order to ensure comparable recognition of qualifications  73 10. the EO should provide an opportunity for external and internal mobility of the EP students, readiness to help them in obtaining external educational grants  74 11. the EP management must demonstrate readiness to provide students with internship places, promote the employment of graduates, and maintain contact with them  75 12. the EO should provide the EP graduates with documents confirming the qualifications received, achieved learning outcomes, as well as the context, content and status of the education received and evidence of its completion	65	2.				+	
analysis of the available material and technical base, information and human resources  69 6. analysis of potential social conditions for students, including provision of places in the hostel  70 7. the EP management must demonstrate readiness to conduct special adaptation and support programs for newly enrolled and foreign students  71 8. the EO must demonstrate the compliance of its actions with the Lisbon Recognition Convention, the existence of a mechanism for recognizing the results of academic mobility of students, as well as the results of additional, formal and non-formal learning  72 9. the EO should cooperate with other educational organizations and national centers of the "European Network of National Information Centers for Academic Recognition and Mobility / National Academic Recognition Information Centers" ENIC / NARIC in order to ensure comparable recognition of qualifications  73 10. the EO should provide an opportunity for external and internal mobility of the EP students, readiness to help them in obtaining external educational grants  74 11. the EP management must demonstrate readiness to provide students with internship places, promote the employment of graduates, and maintain contact with them  75 12. the EO should provide the EP graduates with documents confirming the qualifications received, achieved learning outcomes, as well as the context, content and status of the education received and evidence of its completion	66	3.	maximum group size for seminars, practical, laboratory and studio classes		+		
5.   analysis of the available material and technical base, information and human resources   4   11.   the EP management must demonstrate readiness to conduct special adaptation and support programs for newly enrolled and foreign students   4   12.   the EO should provide the EP graduates with documents confirming the qualifications received, achieved learning outcomes, as well as the context, content and status of the education received and evidence of its conduct special adaptation and support programs for newly enrolled and foreign students   4   11.	67	4.	predicting the number of government grants	1	+		
human resources  69 6. analysis of potential social conditions for students, including provision of places in the hostel  70 7. the EP management must demonstrate readiness to conduct special adaptation and support programs for newly enrolled and foreign students  71 8. the EO must demonstrate the compliance of its actions with the Lisbon Recognition Convention, the existence of a mechanism for recognizing the results of academic mobility of students, as well as the results of additional, formal and non-formal learning  72 9. the EO should cooperate with other educational organizations and national enters of the "European Network of National Information Centers for Academic Recognition and Mobility / National Academic Recognition Information Centers" ENIC / NARIC in order to ensure comparable recognition of qualifications  73 10. the EO should provide an opportunity for external and internal mobility of the EP students, readiness to help them in obtaining external educational grants  74 11. the EP management must demonstrate readiness to provide students with internship places, promote the employment of graduates, and maintain contact with them  75 12. the EO should provide the EP graduates with documents confirming the qualifications received, achieved learning outcomes, as well as the context, content and status of the education received and evidence of its completion					+		
69 6. analysis of potential social conditions for students, including provision of places in the hostel  70 7. the EP management must demonstrate readiness to conduct special adaptation and support programs for newly enrolled and foreign students  71 8. the EO must demonstrate the compliance of its actions with the Lisbon Recognition Convention, the existence of a mechanism for recognizing the results of academic mobility of students, as well as the results of additional, formal and non-formal learning  72 9. the EO should cooperate with other educational organizations and national centers of the "European Network of National Information Centers for Academic Recognition and Mobility / National Academic Recognition Information Centers" ENIC / NARIC in order to ensure comparable recognition of qualifications  73 10. the EO should provide an opportunity for external and internal mobility of the EP students, readiness to help them in obtaining external educational grants  74 11. the EP management must demonstrate readiness to provide students with internship places, promote the employment of graduates, and maintain contact with them  75 12. the EO should provide the EP graduates with documents confirming the qualifications received, achieved learning outcomes, as well as the context, content and status of the education received and evidence of its completion  Total by Standard 0 10							
places in the hostel  70 7. the EP management must demonstrate readiness to conduct special adaptation and support programs for newly enrolled and foreign students  71 8. the EO must demonstrate the compliance of its actions with the Lisbon Recognition Convention, the existence of a mechanism for recognizing the results of academic mobility of students, as well as the results of additional, formal and non-formal learning  72 9. the EO should cooperate with other educational organizations and national centers of the "European Network of National Information Centers for Academic Recognition and Mobility / National Academic Recognition Information Centers" ENIC / NARIC in order to ensure comparable recognition of qualifications  73 10. the EO should provide an opportunity for external and internal mobility of the EP students, readiness to help them in obtaining external educational grants  74 11. the EP management must demonstrate readiness to provide students with internship places, promote the employment of graduates, and maintain contact with them  75 12. the EO should provide the EP graduates with documents confirming the qualifications received, achieved learning outcomes, as well as the context, content and status of the education received and evidence of its completion  Total by Standard 0 10	69	6			+		
the EP management must demonstrate readiness to conduct special adaptation and support programs for newly enrolled and foreign students  the EO must demonstrate the compliance of its actions with the Lisbon Recognition Convention, the existence of a mechanism for recognizing the results of academic mobility of students, as well as the results of additional, formal and non-formal learning  the EO should cooperate with other educational organizations and national centers of the "European Network of National Information Centers for Academic Recognition and Mobility / National Academic Recognition Information Centers" ENIC / NARIC in order to ensure comparable recognition of qualifications  the EO should provide an opportunity for external and internal mobility of the EP students, readiness to help them in obtaining external educational grants  the EP management must demonstrate readiness to provide students with internship places, promote the employment of graduates, and maintain contact with them  the EO should provide the EP graduates with documents confirming the qualifications received, achieved learning outcomes, as well as the context, content and status of the education received and evidence of its completion  Total by Standard 0 10	0)						
adaptation and support programs for newly enrolled and foreign students  the EO must demonstrate the compliance of its actions with the Lisbon Recognition Convention, the existence of a mechanism for recognizing the results of academic mobility of students, as well as the results of additional, formal and non-formal learning  172 9. the EO should cooperate with other educational organizations and national centers of the "European Network of National Information Centers for Academic Recognition and Mobility / National Academic Recognition Information Centers" ENIC / NARIC in order to ensure comparable recognition of qualifications  10. the EO should provide an opportunity for external and internal mobility of the EP students, readiness to help them in obtaining external educational grants  11. the EP management must demonstrate readiness to provide students with internship places, promote the employment of graduates, and maintain contact with them  12. the EO should provide the EP graduates with documents confirming the qualifications received, achieved learning outcomes, as well as the context, content and status of the education received and evidence of its completion  13. Total by Standard 0 10	70	7					
The EO must demonstrate the compliance of its actions with the Lisbon Recognition Convention, the existence of a mechanism for recognizing the results of additional, formal and non-formal learning   +	70	/.					
Recognition Convention, the existence of a mechanism for recognizing the results of academic mobility of students, as well as the results of additional, formal and non-formal learning  72 9. the EO should cooperate with other educational organizations and national centers of the "European Network of National Information Centers for Academic Recognition and Mobility / National Academic Recognition Information Centers" ENIC / NARIC in order to ensure comparable recognition of qualifications  73 10. the EO should provide an opportunity for external and internal mobility of the EP students, readiness to help them in obtaining external educational grants  74 11. the EP management must demonstrate readiness to provide students with internship places, promote the employment of graduates, and maintain contact with them  75 12. the EO should provide the EP graduates with documents confirming the qualifications received, achieved learning outcomes, as well as the context, content and status of the education received and evidence of its completion  Total by Standard 0 10	71	0					
results of academic mobility of students, as well as the results of additional, formal and non-formal learning  9. the EO should cooperate with other educational organizations and national centers of the "European Network of National Information Centers for Academic Recognition and Mobility / National Academic Recognition Information Centers" ENIC / NARIC in order to ensure comparable recognition of qualifications  10. the EO should provide an opportunity for external and internal mobility of the EP students, readiness to help them in obtaining external educational grants  11. the EP management must demonstrate readiness to provide students with internship places, promote the employment of graduates, and maintain contact with them  12. the EO should provide the EP graduates with documents confirming the qualifications received, achieved learning outcomes, as well as the context, content and status of the education received and evidence of its completion  Total by Standard  10. Total by Standard  11. Total by Standard	/1	8.			+		
additional, formal and non-formal learning  72		1					
72 9. the EO should cooperate with other educational organizations and national centers of the "European Network of National Information Centers for Academic Recognition and Mobility / National Academic Recognition Information Centers" ENIC / NARIC in order to ensure comparable recognition of qualifications  73 10. the EO should provide an opportunity for external and internal mobility of the EP students, readiness to help them in obtaining external educational grants  74 11. the EP management must demonstrate readiness to provide students with internship places, promote the employment of graduates, and maintain contact with them  75 12. the EO should provide the EP graduates with documents confirming the qualifications received, achieved learning outcomes, as well as the context, content and status of the education received and evidence of its completion  Total by Standard 0 10		1		9			
centers of the "European Network of National Information Centers for Academic Recognition and Mobility / National Academic Recognition Information Centers" ENIC / NARIC in order to ensure comparable recognition of qualifications  73		- 1					
Academic Recognition and Mobility / National Academic Recognition Information Centers" ENIC / NARIC in order to ensure comparable recognition of qualifications  73	72	9.			+		
Information Centers" ENIC / NARIC in order to ensure comparable recognition of qualifications  73		100	-				
recognition of qualifications  10. the EO should provide an opportunity for external and internal mobility of the EP students, readiness to help them in obtaining external educational grants  11. the EP management must demonstrate readiness to provide students with internship places, promote the employment of graduates, and maintain contact with them  12. the EO should provide the EP graduates with documents confirming the qualifications received, achieved learning outcomes, as well as the context, content and status of the education received and evidence of its completion  Total by Standard  10. the EO should provide the EP graduates with documents confirming the qualifications received, achieved learning outcomes, as well as the context, content and status of the education received and evidence of its completion							
10. the EO should provide an opportunity for external and internal mobility of the EP students, readiness to help them in obtaining external educational grants  11. the EP management must demonstrate readiness to provide students with internship places, promote the employment of graduates, and maintain contact with them  12. the EO should provide the EP graduates with documents confirming the qualifications received, achieved learning outcomes, as well as the context, content and status of the education received and evidence of its completion  14. Total by Standard 0 10							
the EP students, readiness to help them in obtaining external educational grants  74 11. the EP management must demonstrate readiness to provide students with internship places, promote the employment of graduates, and maintain contact with them  75 12. the EO should provide the EP graduates with documents confirming the qualifications received, achieved learning outcomes, as well as the context, content and status of the education received and evidence of its completion  Total by Standard 0 10							
grants  74 11. the EP management must demonstrate readiness to provide students with internship places, promote the employment of graduates, and maintain contact with them  75 12. the EO should provide the EP graduates with documents confirming the qualifications received, achieved learning outcomes, as well as the context, content and status of the education received and evidence of its completion  Total by Standard 0 10	73	10.			+		
11. the EP management must demonstrate readiness to provide students with internship places, promote the employment of graduates, and maintain contact with them  12. the EO should provide the EP graduates with documents confirming the qualifications received, achieved learning outcomes, as well as the context, content and status of the education received and evidence of its completion  14. Total by Standard 0 10			the EP students, readiness to help them in obtaining external educational				
internship places, promote the employment of graduates, and maintain contact with them  75 12. the EO should provide the EP graduates with documents confirming the qualifications received, achieved learning outcomes, as well as the context, content and status of the education received and evidence of its completion  Total by Standard 0 10			grants				
internship places, promote the employment of graduates, and maintain contact with them  75 12. the EO should provide the EP graduates with documents confirming the qualifications received, achieved learning outcomes, as well as the context, content and status of the education received and evidence of its completion  Total by Standard 0 10	74	11.	the EP management must demonstrate readiness to provide students with		+		
contact with them  75 12. the EO should provide the EP graduates with documents confirming the qualifications received, achieved learning outcomes, as well as the context, content and status of the education received and evidence of its completion  Total by Standard 0 10			internship places, promote the employment of graduates, and maintain				
75 12. the EO should provide the EP graduates with documents confirming the qualifications received, achieved learning outcomes, as well as the context, content and status of the education received and evidence of its completion  Total by Standard 0 10							
qualifications received, achieved learning outcomes, as well as the context, content and status of the education received and evidence of its completion  Total by Standard 0 10	75	12.			+		
content and status of the education received and evidence of its completion  Total by Standard 0 10							
Total by Standard 0 10							
·				0	10	2	0
Standard "Teaching Staff"	C/	1 1 115	•		10		
	Stand	aard ''T	eacning Staif"				

76	1.	the EO must have an objective and transparent personnel policy, within the EP as well, including recruitment, professional growth and personnel		+		
		development, ensuring the professional competence of the entire staff				
77	2.	the EO must demonstrate the compliance of the potential of the teaching staff with the specifics of the EP		+		
78	3.	the EP management must demonstrate responsibility for its employees and		+		
		provide favorable working conditions for them				
79	4.	the EP management should demonstrate the change in the role of the		+		
		teacher in connection with the transition to student-centered learning				
80	5.	the EO must determine the contribution of the EP teaching staff to the		+		
		implementation of the development strategy of the EO, and other strategic documents				
81	6.	the EO should provide opportunities for career growth and professional development of the EP teaching staff		+		
82	7.	the EO management should involve practitioners from the relevant sectors			+	
		of the economy in teaching				
83	8.	the EO should encourage professional and personal development of the EP		+		
		teachers, including encouragement for the integration of scientific				
84	9.	activities and education, the use of innovative teaching methods an important factor is the readiness to develop academic mobility within		+		
04	<i>)</i> .	the EP, to attract the best foreign and domestic teachers				
		Total by Standard	0	8	1	0
	dard "E	ducational resources and student support systems"				
85	1.	the EO must guarantee a sufficient number of educational resources and student support services to ensure the achievement of the EP goals		+		
86	2.	the EO must demonstrate the sufficiency of material and technical		+		
		resources and infrastructure, taking into account the needs of various groups of students within the EP (adults, working, foreign students,				
		students with disabilities)				
87	3.	the EP management must demonstrate the existence of procedures for		+		
1		supporting various groups of students, including information and		7		
		counseling the EP management must demonstrate the compliance of information				
		resources with the specifics of the EP, including:	7			
88	4.	technological support for students and teaching staff (e.g. online learning,		+		
		modeling, databases, data analysis programs)				
89	5.	library resources, including a fund of educational, methodical and scientific literature on general education, basic and major disciplines on			+	
		paper and electronic media, periodicals, access to scientific databases				
90	6.	examination of the results of research, graduation works, dissertations for		+		
		plagiarism				
91	7.	access to educational Internet resources		+		
92	8.	WI-FI on the territory of the educational organization		+	,	
93	9.	the EO demonstrates the plan of providing the EP with educational equipment and software similar to those used in the relevant sectors of the			+	
		economy				
		Total by Standard	0	7	2	0
Stan	dard "Pı	ublic Information"				
		The PA must publish reliable, objective, up-to-date information about the				
94	1.	educational program and its specifics, which should include:  expected learning outcomes of the educational program being implemented		+		
7 7	••	onposited rearring outcomes of the educational program being implemented	<u> </u>			

### **Unofficial Translation**

		TOTAL	0	86	17	0
		Total by Standard	0	10	0	0
		interaction with partners within the EP	h.			
103	10.	an important factor is informing the public about cooperation and		+		
		information about the teaching staff of the EP				
102	9.	an important factor is the availability of adequate and objective		+		
		that characterizes it as a whole and in the context of educational programs				
101	8.	the EO must demonstrate the reflection on the web resource of information		+		
		and postgraduate education				
		national development programs of the country and the system of higher				
100	7.	informing the public should include support and explanation of the		+		
		general public and interested parties				
		information, including the media, information networks to inform the				
99	6.	the EP management should provide variety of ways to disseminate		+		
98	5.	information about employment opportunities for graduates		+		
97	4.	information about passing grades and learning opportunities provided to students		+		
07	4.	and forms)				
96	3.	approaches to teaching, learning, assessment system (procedures, methods		+		
		of the educational program				
95	2.	qualification and (or) qualification that will be awarded upon completion		+		