



«АККРЕДИТТЕУ ЖӘНЕ РЕЙТИНГТИҢ
ТӘУЕЛСІЗ АГЕНТТІГІ» КЕМ

НУ «НЕЗАВИСИМОЕ АГЕНТСТВО
АККРЕДИТАЦИИ И РЕЙТИНГА»

INDEPENDENT AGENCY FOR
ACCREDITATION AND RATING

REPORT

on the results of the external expert commission's work to assess compliance with the standards for international accreditation of basic medical and pharmaceutical education programs based on WFME/AMSE/ESG (Kyrgyz Republic)
560001 General Medicine (Higher Professional Education)

ALA-TOO INTERNATIONAL UNIVERSITY

from May 6 to May 8, 2024

INDEPENDENT AGENCY FOR ACCREDITATION AND RATING

External Expert Commission

**Addressed
to the Accreditation Council
of NAAR**



REPORT

on the results of the external expert commission's work to assess compliance with the standards for international accreditation of basic medical and pharmaceutical education programs based on WFME/AMSE/ESG (Kyrgyz Republic)

560001 General Medicine (Higher Professional Education)

ALA-TOO INTERNATIONAL UNIVERSITY

from May 6 to May 8, 2024

Bishkek, 2024

(I) LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

HPE	Higher Professional Education
HEI	Higher Education Institution
GIA	State Final Attestation
DE&QM	Department of Education and Quality Management
KR	Kyrgyz Republic
MH&SD	Ministry of Health and Social Development
ME&S KR	Ministry of Education and Science of Kyrgyz Republic
AIU	Ala-Too International University
SRW	Scientific Research Work
HO	Healthcare Organizations
BEP	Basic Educational Program
EP	Educational Program
TS	Teaching Staff
QMS	Quality Management System
SC	Student Council
EMC	Educational and Methodological Complex
ECTS	European Credit Transfer and Accumulation System
NH under MoH KR	National Hospital under the Ministry of Health of the Kyrgyz Republic
KRIoB&RT	Kyrgyz Research Institute of Balneology and Rehabilitation Treatment
NSC	National Surgical Center
NCPH	National Center for Phthisiology
RCD&V	Republican Center for Dermatology and Venereology
RCPN	Republican Center for Psychiatry and Narcology
CMH	Clinical Multidisciplinary Hospital
CPC	City Perinatal Center
FAIMER	Foundation for Advancement of International Medical Education and Research
WFME	World Federation for Medical Education
PMQ	Primary Medical Qualification
GMC	General Medical Council
PLAB	Professional and Linguistic Assessments Board
CME	Continuous Medical Education
MKPD&S	Medical Knowledge Platform for Doctors and Students
SAC	State Attestation Commission
KSMI R&AT	Kyrgyz State Medical Institute for Retraining and Advanced Training
AIMP	Association of Internal Medicine Physicians
ISP	Individual Study Plan
EEC	External Expert Commission

(II) INTRODUCTION

In accordance with Order No. 67-24-OD dated February 9, 2024, of the Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating (IAAR), an external expert commission (EEC) conducted an assessment from May 6 to May 8, 2024, to determine the compliance of the educational program 560001 General Medicine at Ala-Too International University with the standards of international accreditation for basic medical and pharmaceutical education programs (based on WFME/AMSE/ESG, Kyrgyz Republic). The evaluation was conducted under Order No. 150-22-OD dated December 21, 2022 (third edition).

The EEC report contains an evaluation of the educational program's compliance with IAAR standards, EEC recommendations for further improvement of the educational program, and parameters of the educational program profile.

EEC Members:

1) ***Chairman of the Commission, IAAR*** – Irina Nikolaevna Moroz, First Vice-Rector, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Belarusian State Medical University (Republic of Belarus), participated offline.

2) ***IAAR Expert*** – ***Bauyrzhan Kadenovich Omarkulov***, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, Karaganda State Medical University (Republic of Kazakhstan), participated offline.

IAAR Expert, Employer – ***Bolot Abdykadyrovich Borboldoev***, Republican Center for Mental Health (Kyrgyz Republic), participated offline.

IAAR Expert, Student – ***Akylai Adiletovna Dzhamankulova***, first-year student in the General Medicine program at the International University of Kyrgyzstan (Kyrgyz Republic), participated offline.

IAAR Coordinator – ***Malika Akhyadovna Saidulaeva***, Project Manager of the Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating (Republic of Kazakhstan), participated offline

(III) OVERVIEW OF THE EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION

Ala-Too International University (AIU) is one of the leading international higher education institutions in Central Asia. Established in 1996, AIU was founded by the International Educational Institution "Sapat". AIU operates as a private legal entity in accordance with the legislation of the Kyrgyz Republic.

In 2013, AIU launched the IT and Business College, followed by the Distance Learning Center, master's and postgraduate programs, significantly expanding the university's prospects for growth and development. Today, AIU comprises four academic faculties, 19 bachelor's programs, two bachelor's programs in distance learning, two master's programs in distance learning, 10 master's programs, six postgraduate programs, three Ph.D. programs, and three institutes. 4 Faculties and Programs: Faculty of Engineering and Computer Science, Faculty of Humanities, Faculty of Economics and Management, Medical Faculty. 18 Academic Programs and Specializations: "Cybersecurity and Ethical Hacking", "Fundamentals of Creative Industries", "Computer Engineering", "Electronics and Nanoelectronics", "Artificial Intelligence and Robotics", "Applied Mathematics and Informatics", "Data Analysis and Intelligent Systems", "Quality Management (Management in Information Technology)", "Linguistics (Translation and Interpreting)", "Philology (English Language and Literature)", "Psychology", "Pedagogy", "Journalism", "Advertising and Public Relations", "Jurisprudence (International Law and Business Law)", "Economics (International Economics and Business)", "International Relations", "Management", "Economics (Finance and Credit)", "General Medicine".

2 Bachelor's Degree Programs (Distance Learning): "Management", "Pedagogy". 2 Master's Degree Programs (Distance Learning): "Management", "Pedagogy". 9 Master's Degree Programs: "Computer Science and Engineering", "Management", "Pedagogy", "Economics", "Linguistics", "International Relations", "Journalism", "Jurisprudence", "Psychology". 6 Doctoral Programs: "Economic Theory", "Economics and National Economy Management", "Comparative-Historical, Typological, and Comparative Linguistics", "General Pedagogy, History of Pedagogy, and Education", "Social Philosophy", "History and Theory of Culture". 3 PhD/Doctoral Programs: "Computer and Information Technology", "Philology", "Pedagogy".

The major language of education is English. Students from specific faculties may choose a second foreign language, such as Japanese, German, Chinese, or French. Preparatory courses are available for those who do not have proficiency in English.

Ala-Too International University (AIU) actively collaborates with universities in North America, South Korea, Germany, Poland, and France within the framework of a dual-degree program. This program offers students several benefits, including immersion in a new cultural and educational environment, the opportunity to earn two diplomas within the same study period, and enhanced competitiveness in the job market both domestically and internationally.

Currently, the Medical Faculty of AIU collaborates with foreign universities, research centers, and healthcare organizations in Germany, Pakistan, India, China, Kazakhstan, Russia, and other countries. Under existing agreements and participation in projects (such as Erasmus), international academic mobility for AIU faculty and students is actively developing with institutions like Osijek University (Osijek, Croatia), WSB University in Poznan (Poland), Lomza State University of Applied Sciences (Poland), and others.

The Medical Faculty of the International University of Ala-Too is a dynamically growing educational unit of the university, committed to a socially responsible approach to preparing medical professionals at both national and international levels.

The Medical Faculty of Ala-Too International University of was established in 2016 by Order No. 952/1 of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Kyrgyz Republic, dated June 21, 2016 (protocol No. 1-1-4, dated June 16, 2016), in coordination with the Ministry of Health of the Kyrgyz Republic. The faculty's educational activities are conducted based on a license, registration No. D 2019-0011, issued on June 12, 2019. [License and Certificate of Accreditation](#).

The Medical Faculty, under the specialty 560001 – "General Medicine", operates in accordance with the Charter of the International University of Ala-Too. [Charter Document](#) (report, documents, interviews).

As of April 1, 2024, the Medical Faculty has 557 students enrolled, including 44 from Kyrgyzstan, with the rest coming from various countries abroad. The faculty comprises four departments, employing 62 staff members, including 2 with doctoral degrees, 11 with candidate of science degrees, 6 PhDs, and 2 professors (reports, documents, interviews).

Students develop practical and clinical skills at the faculty's own clinical base, the Ala-Too International University Hospital (located in Bishkek, Ch. Aitmatov Ave., 16). This multidisciplinary hospital offers planned and emergency care, with a structure that includes inpatient (75 beds), outpatient, and polyclinic services. It operates under license No. 3578 issued on July 8, 2019. Additional clinical training is conducted at various healthcare facilities across Kyrgyzstan, including republican, city, regional, and district medical organizations. These include the National Hospital under the Ministry of Health of the Kyrgyz Republic (NH under MoH KR), Kyrgyz Research Institute of Balneology and Rehabilitation, National Center of Cardiology, National Center of Oncology, Republican Center for Disaster Medicine, Republican Narcological Center, the Republican Forensic Medical Expertise Center, City Clinical Emergency Hospital, Clinical Multidisciplinary Hospital No. 2, Bishkek City Gynecology Hospital, Bishkek City Perinatal Center, the Unified Center for Family Medicine in Sverdlov District of Bishkek, and K.I. Skryabin Kyrgyz National Agrarian University (reports, documents, interviews).

The Medical Faculty actively participates in several international research projects in collaboration with foreign scientists:

- Department of Zoology and Environmental Sciences (GKV, Haridwar, India): Project on "Polymorphisms of CDKAL1 (rs10946398) and TCF7L2 (rs7903146) Genes and Their Association with Type 2 Diabetes Mellitus Risk in Uttarakhand Population, India."
- Department of Biotechnology and Department of Biochemistry, Medical College (New Delhi, India): Project on "Cell-Free Modifications of TCF7L2 Gene and Their Correlation with Type 2 Diabetes Mellitus in Northern Indian Population."
- Department of Medical Biotechnology, Yeungnam University (Gyeongsan, South Korea): Similar research on TCF7L2 gene.
- Department of Biochemistry, Faculty of Science, King Abdulaziz University (Jeddah, Saudi Arabia): Project on "Biochemical Interaction of Salt Sensitivity: A Key Factor in Hypertension Development."
- Department of Pharmacology, Umm Al-Qura University College of Pharmacy (Mecca, Saudi Arabia), and the University of Electronic Science and Technology of China (Chengdu, Sichuan, China): Project on "Mechanism of pH-Induced Conformational Changes in MurE Ligase from Salmonella enterica Serovar Typhi."
- Department of Physiology, Faculty of Medicine, Abant Izzet Baysal University (Bolu, Turkey): Project on "Protective Effects of Trimetazidine Against Bilirubin-Induced Neurotoxicity."

Research findings have been published in prestigious international scientific journals with high impact factors, including: *Journal of Research in Medical and Dental Science, Molecular and Cellular Biochemistry, Journal of Biomolecular Structure and Dynamics, Meta Gene, Heart Vessels Transplant*. No commercialization of research technologies is noted within the accredited educational program for this specialty.

(IV) DESCRIPTION OF THE PREVIOUS ACCREDITATION PROCEDURE

In accordance with the order of the Independent Accreditation and Rating Agency (IARA) No. 64-19-OD dated May 6, 2019, the External Expert Commission conducted an evaluation of the compliance of the educational program 560001 – "General Medicine" with the requirements of international standards for primary basic accreditation of IARA (No. 64-18/1-OD dated May 25, 2018, first edition) at the Institution "Ala-Too International University" of the Kyrgyz Republic on May 28-29, 2019.

Members of the Commission:

1. Commission Chairman – Turdaliyeva Botagoz Saitovna, MD, Professor, JSC "Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education" (Almaty).
2. International Expert – Irine Sakhelashvili, PhD, European University (Tbilisi, Georgia).
3. Employer – Mukeeva Suyumzhan Toktorovna, PhD, Association of Family Physicians and Family Nurses of Kyrgyzstan (Bishkek).
4. Student – Omkar Sonawane, Ala-Too International University (Bishkek).
5. Inspector of the Agency – Aymurzyeva Aygerim Urinbaevna, Head of Medical Projects of the Agency (Nur-Sultan).

Recommendations to the university within the framework of the previous accreditation procedure for the General Medicine educational program:

Standard "Educational Program":

1. Revise the curriculum (EP) and structure it based on the principle of integrated disciplines, both horizontally and vertically.
2. Develop and implement disciplines aimed at developing analytical and critical thinking of students, starting from the junior courses.
3. Include the teaching of evidence-based medicine in the junior courses.

4. Ensure early contact of students with patients and provide for the development of language competencies.
5. Involve students of the medical faculty in councils and commissions responsible for educational programs, faculty development, and university development as a whole.
6. Expand partnerships with primary and secondary healthcare organizations to facilitate the development of students' clinical skills considering the diversity of healthcare delivery levels.

Standard "Students":

1. Develop and implement an admissions policy that includes the assessment of language proficiency as a mandatory component during applicant selection and document the process, ensuring it is communicated to potential applicants.
2. Develop and implement an admissions policy for students with disabilities and provide the necessary resources.

Standard "Educational Resources":

1. Identify the scientific potential of the teaching staff (TS), define scientific priorities, and establish available and required resources.
2. Develop and implement research projects involving university staff and students.
3. Incorporate the achievements of scientific research into the educational process, both proprietary and borrowed.
4. Develop and implement a plan for professional development of teaching staff in medical education expertise, train them in expertise methods, and implement documentation of EP expertise.

Standard "Assessment of EP":

1. Develop, approve, and implement mechanisms for evaluating and revising the EP based on annual monitoring with the participation of stakeholders (students, teaching staff, administrative staff, employers).

Standard "Mission and Outcomes":

1. Involve employers, students, and teaching staff in the development and discussion of the mission and outcomes of the EP, documenting the discussion process.

Standard "Educational Program":

1. Reflect in course syllabi, especially clinical ones, topics on the search and critical evaluation of scientific data.

Standard "Student Assessment Policy":

1. Develop and implement methods to assess the validity, reliability, and fairness of student achievement assessment methods and ensure their availability for external review.
2. In the development of assessment methods, use and adhere to the principle of integration.

Standard "Students":

1. Strengthen ties with employers to address the adequacy of student numbers based on the needs of practical healthcare.

Standard "Educational Resources":

1. Develop and implement professional development courses on medical education expertise and conduct training seminars for the teaching staff.

Standard "Management and Public Information":

1. Ensure the publication of annual reviews, including quantitative and qualitative indicators of EP implementation on the university's website, with mandatory discussions at advisory body meetings with stakeholders (students, teaching staff, administrative staff, employers).

On June 14, 2019, by the decision of the IARA Accreditation Council, the General Medicine educational program was accredited for 5 years.

For the implementation of the recommendations, the university developed an action plan approved on August 25, 2019. The results of the planned activities were reflected in the university's interim reports.

Post-monitoring of the implementation of the IARA External Expert Commission's recommendations formed based on the results of program accreditation was conducted at the university on May 25, 2022 (Stage 1). Post-accreditation monitoring of the university's activities was carried out within the framework of the action plan for the implementation of the External Expert Commission's recommendations and was conducted in accordance with the post-accreditation monitoring regulations.

The post-accreditation monitoring of the University's activities showed that, in general, the recommendations provided by the Accreditation Expert Commission (AEC) are being followed, with the exception of some recommendations.

At the same time, members of the AEC, who conducted the reaccreditation from May 6 to 8, 2024, established that the following work had been done based on the recommendations of the previous AEC:

As a result of the accreditation procedure, the AEC made 22 recommendations for the development of the educational program (EP). To implement these recommendations, the university management developed an action plan, approved on August 25, 2019. To revise the Mission of the Medical Faculty of the AIU, a meeting was organized with the participation of employers, academic staff (AS), and students, as confirmed by the protocol of the meeting (Appendix 1). At the Faculty's meeting on September 13, 2022, a commission was created to revise the EP and curriculum of the Medical Faculty and improve integrated learning with the involvement of students and employers, as confirmed by the protocols №2 dated September 13, 2022, no ref. protocol dated September 22, 2022, and no ref. order dated September 15, 2022 (Appendices 6, 7, 8).

The Medical Faculty of AIU annually publishes a review with quantitative and qualitative indicators of the EP's implementation. Experts were not provided with evidence on this point. Weekly meetings are held with advisory bodies, involving stakeholders (students, AS, administrative staff, employers) to discuss and implement the EP. The experts note that the provided link to the single protocol does not reflect the essence of the implementation of this recommendation. The review data are posted on the AIU website. The experts find that no specific link confirming the information is provided. The curriculum of the Medical Faculty for the 2022-2023 academic year has been revised based on the principle of the integration of disciplines both horizontally and vertically:

- Clinical disciplines in internal medicine, pediatric diseases, surgery, obstetrics, and gynecology are integrated vertically from the 3rd to the 6th year, starting from the propedeutics of diseases and finishing with professional skills (sub-internship – 6th year);
- Related specialties are integrated horizontally, for example, adult and pediatric infections, pulmonology and phthisiopulmonology, nephrology and urology, rheumatology and traumatology, surgical diseases with topographic anatomy and surgical diseases with oncology, etc.;
- Given the current epidemiological situation, disciplines such as HIV, tobacco addiction, health, and lifestyle have been included in the variable part of the curriculum. This is confirmed by Appendices 10, 11 "Curriculum of the Medical Faculty for 2022-2023" and the main educational program of higher professional education in the specialty.

To introduce disciplines aimed at developing analytical and critical thinking into the educational process, the following elective subjects were included in the curriculum: critical thinking, teaching skills, management principles, entrepreneurship, public speaking, interpersonal communication, and social media marketing (4 credits each), as reflected in the attached curriculum.

The following proposals have been developed and suggested for the AS of the Medical Faculty to include in the educational process and the educational and methodological complex: inclusion of goals for developing thinking and content that fosters critical thinking, assignments and exercises aimed at developing cognitive skills and critical thinking, logical tasks using logical operations, communication skills, discussion of errors in solving tasks and problems through

organizing debates, discussions, and creative competitions; participation in group solutions to educational problems; turning lessons into active, engaging games using various techniques to develop critical thinking and increase student engagement and motivation (e.g., "Brainstorm," "Ideal," "Puzzle Problems," "Insert," etc.); reviewing one's and others' literary works, essays, course papers, and theses (critical text analysis); fostering self-education, self-control, active self-learning, informational and cognitive independence, subjectivity of the student, writing essays, analytical reviews, and research papers with subsequent identification of fallacies and erroneous judgments, as confirmed by Appendices 12-14.

In the curriculum of the Medical Faculty for the 2021-2022 academic year, the discipline of evidence-based medicine was initially on the 6th year but was moved to the 4th year after the AEC recommendation, which is confirmed by the curriculum.

The staff composition of the Medical Faculty of AIU is reflected in Appendix 32. The total number of employees is 52, of which 11 hold academic degrees, accounting for only 21.1% of the total number of AS. The staff consists of 36 full-time employees and 16 part-time employees. According to the latest State Educational Standards for the Kyrgyz Republic, the share of AS with academic degrees should be at least 40% of the total number of disciplines. According to the data from the Medical Faculty for 2022-2023, the number of subjects lectured by professors with academic degrees is 17, or 41.5% of all subjects (a total of 41 subjects) in the basic part of the proposed curriculum for the 6-year program. Experts believe the figures provided do not correspond to reality. The figures on the number of academic staff in the first and second paragraphs do not match. The provided list of publications is not divided into periods for the first and second post-accreditation monitoring, which complicates the work of the experts. Of the 22 publications listed, 11 do not meet the timeframes of the post-accreditation monitoring. The conducted activities do not correspond to or fully reflect the implementation of this recommendation: the scientific potential of the TS of the faculty has not been identified, scientific priorities have not been described or defined, and the available and necessary resources have not been established.

Experts believe that the report on this recommendation does not describe or attach evidence of the implementation of EP expertise documentation. A professional development course on the expertise of medical education has not been developed or implemented, and no training seminars for TS have been held. It is unclear why two recommendations of the AEC have been combined into one.

According to the State Educational Standards for Higher Professional Education in the specialty 560001 "General Medicine", the developers of the EP periodically update it. At least once a year, the Medical Faculty must review the EP based on certain criteria, as reflected in Appendix 11.

To actively involve students and other parties in evaluating the EP, it has been posted on the AIU website with feedback from students, TS, administrative staff, and employers. To evaluate the quality of the EP's implementation for the 2022-2023 academic year, the AIU issued an order to create a Commission on the Quality Management System (Appendix 41).

However, experts believe that there is no developed, approved, and implemented mechanism for assessing and revising the EP based on annual monitoring with the participation of stakeholders (students, AS, administrative staff, employers). Thus, experts noted that some of the AEC's recommendations have been partially fulfilled.

(V) VISIT DESCRIPTION OF THE EEC

The work of the Expert Evaluation Commission (EEC) was carried out based on the approved Program of the Expert Commission visit for the program accreditation of the MUA educational program from May 6 to May 8, 2024.

To coordinate the work of the EEC, an online introductory meeting took place on May 5,

2024. During the meeting, the responsibilities of the commission members were assigned, the visit schedule was clarified, and agreement was reached on the methods of evaluation.

To obtain objective information about the quality of the educational program and the entire infrastructure of the university, as well as to clarify the contents of the self-assessment reports, meetings were held with the rector, vice rectors responsible for various areas of activity, heads of structural units, deans, department heads, faculty members, students, graduates, and employers. A total of 91 representatives of students, teaching staff, administrative and support personnel, employers, and graduates participated in the meetings (Table 1).

Table 1 – Information about the staff and students who participated in the meetings with the NAAR EEC:

Participant Category	Quantity
Vice rectors	4
Heads of structural units	12
Deans and deputy deans	4
Department heads	4
Staff	18
Students	25
Graduates	16
Employers	8
Total	91

During the site inspection, the EEC members reviewed the state of the material and technical base, visiting the HR Office, Student Office, library, international office, student council, cafeterias for faculty and students, classrooms, and educational-practical laboratories (simulation lab, biochemistry lab, microbiology lab, etc.).

At the meetings with the university's target groups, the EEC clarified the mechanisms for implementing the university's policies and provided additional details for certain data presented in the self-assessment report.

The EEC members visited the practice bases for the accredited programs: the "ALA-TOO" University Clinic, the National Hospital of the Ministry of Health of the Kyrgyz Republic, and M.M. Mamakeev National Surgical Center of the Ministry of Health of the Kyrgyz Republic.

The EEC members attended a class on the course "Surgical Diseases" with the topic "Diverticula of the intestine: Meckel's diverticulum and pseudodiverticula. Ischemia of the intestine. Crohn's disease. Ulcerative colitis." The session was conducted by Assistant Professors of the Department of Surgical Diseases Sanjar Aknaazarov and Aitpek Kokumbekov, with 18 students present from the group MED-20 (4 students were absent). The class took place at the M.M. Mamakeev National Surgical Center.

According to academic freedom, classes are held approximately as follows: The group is divided into 2 subgroups of 9 students each. The first subgroup begins with attendance checking (3 students were absent), followed by an oral quiz on the previous topic (acute appendicitis, diagnosis, treatment, complications), checking the case reports created by the students. The topic is reviewed: Diverticula of the intestine: Meckel's diverticulum and pseudodiverticula. Anatomy, embryology, and normal physiology of the gastrointestinal tract. Definition, etiology, pathogenesis, clinical picture, diagnosis, differential diagnosis, treatment, and complications.

By the end of the class, the student should know the etiology and pathogenesis of Meckel's diverticulum, its clinical presentation, diagnosis, treatment, and complications, as well as the differences between diverticula and pseudodiverticula. They should be able to recognize Meckel's diverticulum based on symptoms and medical history and create an examination plan.

- Homework.

- Additional time is spent on practical skills training, such as suturing, types of surgical stitches, and intestinal anastomosis (end-to-end, side-to-side, end-to-side).

As part of the accreditation procedure, surveys were conducted among 18 faculty members and 30 students, including those from both junior and senior years.

To verify the information presented in the Self-Assessment Report, external experts requested and analyzed the university's working documentation. In addition, experts studied the university's online presence through its official website <https://alato.edu.kg/>.

As part of the scheduled program, recommendations for improving the accredited educational program of the university, developed by the EEC based on the results of the evaluation, were presented to the university leadership during a meeting on May 8, 2024.

(VI) COMPLIANCE WITH PROGRAM ACCREDITATION STANDARDS

6.1. Standard "Mission and Outcomes"

Probatory Part

In accordance with the "Strategic Development Plan of AIU for 2024-2028," based on new tasks set by the "National Strategy for the Development of the Kyrgyz Republic for 2018-2040," the Kyrgyz Republic Government Program for Health Protection and Healthcare System Development for 2019-2030 "Healthy People, Prosperous Country," the "Education Development Strategy of the Kyrgyz Republic for 2021-2040," and reflecting the needs of all stakeholders in the Kyrgyz Republic and the global community in general, the mission of the educational program 560001 "Medicine" has been defined.

The mission of the Educational Program 560001 "Medicine" is to train qualified and socially responsible specialists—doctors at the undergraduate medical education level, ready for postgraduate training throughout their lives, based on integrated quality education aligned with science and clinical practice, corresponding to international standards, fostering spiritual and moral qualities in medical personnel, who can contribute to the development of national and global medicine and healthcare, as well as addressing public health issues.

This mission is consistent with the Mission and Vision of AIU and the State Educational Standard for Higher Professional Education for Program 560001 "Medicine" and the qualification of a specialist (Doctor), approved by the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Kyrgyz Republic No. 1357/1 dated July 30, 2021.

The development of the AIU Strategic Plan for 2024-2028 involved all structural units and stakeholders and was approved at the AIU Academic Council meeting, protocol No. 4 dated December 28, 2023.

At the AIU Medical Faculty meeting on September 13, 2022, a commission was created to review the program, including its mission and curriculum, and to improve integrated education by involving active students from the medical faculty and employers. The commission consisted of: 1. Kudaibergen Osmonaliev, Tynarbek Arzykulov, R.B. Kydyralieva, students: Shabir Khan (3rd-year), Umar Shavaiz (4th-year), Zhetkinbekova Tolkun (5th-year), Avais Shah (2nd-year), Zakhin Ahmad (4th-year). Employers: Jumabaev Mamraim Narynbaevich, Deputy Director for Clinical Work at NCKT; Sakmamatov Konush Mamytovich, Chief Physician at NCP. The meeting protocols (protocol No. 2 dated September 13, 2022) and the relevant order of the Medical Faculty were presented to the EEC (report, documents, interviews).

To widely inform the public and interested parties, the Mission of AIU and the Medical Faculty is presented in the AIU 5-year Strategy, at department meetings, public councils of AIU, on the AIU website and Medical Faculty page, information boards in educational buildings and structural units of AIU, in advertising brochures and videos, and it is also disseminated via email

to all AIU units, the Ministry of Education and Science of the Kyrgyz Republic, and the Ministry of Health of the Kyrgyz Republic.

Guarantees for the inclusion of achievements in medical research in the fields of biomedical, clinical, behavioral, and social sciences are reflected both in the formulation of the Mission, Vision, and Goals, as well as enshrined in the AIU Charter. According to the Charter, the university conducts fundamental and applied research in the fields of natural, medical, and humanities sciences, as well as experimental developments.

Scientific research and the use of its results are reflected in the AIU Strategy for 2021-2026 and the new Strategy for 2024-2028, item 5.3, which states that the strategy is aimed at the development of scientific research activities and the active use of scientific achievements in biomedical, clinical, and social research in the educational process.

The main stakeholders of AIU in the development and formulation of the Mission and Quality Assurance Policy are the rector, vice rectors, administration, members of the collegial management bodies, faculty, students, the Ministry of Health, the Ministry of Education and Science, and employers. According to the AIU Charter, the right to participate in discussions and decision-making regarding AIU's activities is guaranteed for students (item 12.1) and the faculty (item 12.4).

In accordance with the AIU Strategic Plan for 2024-2028, a system of relationships with all stakeholders is provided, including employers, AIU alumni, parents, the Ministry of Education and Science of the Kyrgyz Republic, students, through visits to stakeholders and key employers, creation of a job portal, opening elective courses based on employer requests, participation of stakeholders in the AIU Academic Council, social projects with alumni, conducting regular surveys, etc.

One of the indicators of AIU's effective activities is the success of its graduates in further education and employment, demonstrating the knowledge and competencies acquired during their studies at AIU. For instance, AIU graduates: Nurkyz Alymkulova is studying for a master's degree in Korea, Shamsuddin Abdi Mohammed works as a general practitioner in Djibouti, Abdirrahman Farhan is an assistant professor of general practice in Somaliland, Burak Bedri Ayverdi and Hatice Bedriye Ayverdi work in a hospital in Sweden, Merve Melek Kara, Nalan Berre Ozkara, Nurefshan Turkmen work in the USA as part-time employees and are in the process of taking USMLE tests; Bushra Nur Gunduz is employed in a hospital in Germany and is taking the PLAB test. Among last year's graduates: Beishenalieva Nurkyz and Eshmuratova Roza are studying for a master's degree in cardiology and rehabilitation in the USA, Gunduz Yavuz Selim and Katmer Serdar are employed in Germany, and about 7 of the best graduates are employed at our university "Ala-Too."

Analytical Part

The mission of the Educational Program 560001 "Medicine" was developed in accordance with the requirements of state educational standards, the needs of the state and the labor market, the Strategic Development Plan, and the Mission of the International University "Ala-Too."

AIU has "institutional autonomy in matters of staff selection and placement, conducting educational, scientific, financial, and other activities in accordance with the legislation and the Charter, approved in accordance with the law and by the Academic Council."

AIU has "institutional autonomy" with effective interaction/cooperation with healthcare management bodies, healthcare institution leaders of various ownership forms, executive authorities, and other partners, due to the availability of professional personnel resources. This is supported by the provision of clinical bases and equipment, ensuring access to patients, which is a strong point for implementing the educational process and meets the criteria of the NAAR standard (interviews, clinical base visits, documents).

Analysis of stakeholder involvement (employers, healthcare practitioners, faculty members) in formulating the mission and expected learning outcomes showed that they are adequately informed about this process, and the university ensures the involvement of all

participants in the educational process in the development and updating of the AIU Mission and the Program Mission (interviews, report, documents).

Interviews with educational process participants (faculty, staff members, and students) also showed that the university fully ensures that the declared Mission of the Program "Medicine" and expected outcomes are based on the opinions/suggestions of other stakeholders, in line with NAAR standard criteria.

Strengths/Best Practices:

The institutional autonomy of the International University "Ala-Too," which is expressed in the right to organize and self-govern, the realization of academic freedom without ideological, political, or religious interference, while taking a series of competencies and commitments in accordance with national policy and higher education development strategies, and constructive interaction with the healthcare sector of the Kyrgyz Republic (Ministry of Health of the Kyrgyz Republic, National Hospitals), is a strong point in implementing the Program 560001 "Medicine."

EEC Recommendations:

There are no recommendations for this standard.

EEC Conclusions on Criteria:

- ***Strengths – 1***
- ***Satisfactory – 12***
- ***Require Improvement – 0***
- ***Unsatisfactory – 0***

For the "Mission and Learning Outcomes" standard, the educational program of the specialty 560001 "Medicine" has 1 strong, 12 satisfactory, 0 requiring improvement, and 0 unsatisfactory positions.

6.2. The standard "Educational Program"

Probatory Part

The educational program 560001 "Medical Care" was developed in accordance with the State Educational Standard of Higher Professional Education (SES VPO) for the specialty 560001 "Medical Care" and the qualification of a specialist (Doctor), approved by the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Kyrgyz Republic No. 1357/1 dated July 30, 2021. It is based on a spiral structure. The AIU's BEP (Basic Educational Program) complies with the requirements of the "List of Higher Professional Education Specialties Confirmed by the Assignment of the Specialist Qualification to Graduates."

Higher medical education is provided at AIU through integrated education using the European Credit Transfer and Accumulation System (ECTS). The unified principles of BEP development are reflected in AIU's local act "Regulation on the Basic Educational Program of Higher Professional Education."

The educational program in the specialty 560001 "Medical Care" at AIU was implemented in 2016 and revised in 2022 according to proposals embedded in the AIU Development Strategy for 2024-2028 and the latest State Standard.

The implementation of the integrated model of the "Medical Care" program is based on the use of traditional and innovative approaches and teaching methods, such as:

- **Traditional Methods:** Lectures, seminar sessions. Despite the advent of new information technologies, lectures remain one of the main forms of teaching in medical schools. In particular, clinical lectures play a crucial role, fostering clinical thinking, student participation in diagnosis formulation, building trustful and partnership relationships, and adhering to ethical and deontological principles.
- **Problem-Based Learning (PBL):** The medical education system focuses on solving complex healthcare issues. The curriculum includes not only fundamental disciplines but

also those that develop social, behavioral, and professional competencies (Appendix 10: Curriculum). From the first semester, the relationship between fundamental subjects and clinical situations is demonstrated to enhance the practical relevance of students' knowledge.

- **Team-Based Learning (TBL):** This is implemented through small group work during practical sessions, where tasks or scenarios (e.g., role-playing games) are assigned. Students apply their knowledge through individual and team activities, receiving immediate feedback. For instance, the practical class on "Mechanisms of Skeletal Muscle Contraction" involves dynamometry, where students analyze the obtained data.
- **Student-Centered Learning:** The AIU "Medical Care" program allows students to shape their individual learning paths by choosing elective courses and research topics (Appendix 10: Curriculum). Up to 50% of the program is allocated for independent student work, coordinated by academic staff. Elective courses include subjects like Academic Writing, Gene Engineering, HIV, Tobacco Dependence Control, Medical Rehabilitation, Professional Diseases, Healthy Lifestyle, Pedagogy, Foreign Languages, Molecular Medicine Projects, First Aid, Teaching Art, Management Principles, Entrepreneurship, Public Speaking, Interpersonal Communication, Social Media Marketing, Critical Thinking, etc.
- **Case-Based Learning (CBL):** This method integrates knowledge, skills, and behaviors through clinical cases presented at all stages of professional training. Using clinical case banks with visual aids like ECG data, spirometry, laboratory results, etc., helps students integrate and apply their knowledge effectively.

In January 2022, the AIU Medical Faculty joined ASPE (Association of Standardized Patient Educators), emphasizing clinical training where students interact with real patients, refining their diagnostic and patient history-taking skills during the clinical disciplines such as pediatrics, internal medicine, family medicine, etc.

Research-Based Learning (RBL), which promotes the development of students' research competencies, is implemented starting from the first years of study at the faculty. In the initial stages of education (1st-2nd years), student involvement is supervised by the instructor during practical sessions and independent work. For example, in the course on normal physiology, RBL is introduced from the first module through independent work, where students begin to develop skills in writing projects and preparing abstract reports, with mandatory use of reference data. Subsequently, students can conduct experimental work and engage in research activities both during classroom sessions and while working independently. Students of the "Medical Care" program are actively involved in research projects in contemporary medical science and healthcare. It is important to note that conducting scientific research and involving students in research activities, as well as using the results of scientific work in the educational process, is mandatory for the teaching staff. This is reflected in the AIU Strategy for 2024-2028.

Training through Information and Communication Technologies: This is implemented through the use of the OCS (Online Course System), where for each taught subject, students can find the syllabus, recommended course literature, lectures, and assignments for completion. Additionally, the system is used for ongoing and final assessments of students' knowledge.

It is important to note that at the Medical Faculty of AIU, the practice of information retrieval and the use of electronic library resources is facilitated through the online learning platform AMBOSS. This platform is referred to as the "Medical Knowledge Library," intended for medical students and doctors. It includes a library and a bank of questions in accordance with the USMLE recommendations. The platform is paid, but the AIU administration has acquired a license for its use, allowing free access for students and faculty within the library. This platform has been operational at AIU for only two to three months, with high student activity observed. Its effectiveness will be assessed in a year.

The Basic Educational Program (BEP) includes an integrated model consisting of subjects and organ systems, based on a modular and spiral design. The curriculum contains basic biomedical, behavioral, social, and clinical disciplines.

The structure of the "Medicine" Basic Educational Program (BEP 560001) includes 360 credits:

- BLOCK 1 – 325 credits (humanitarian, social, and economic cycle),
- BLOCK 2 – 25 credits (practical training),
- BLOCK 3 – Final State Exam (10 credits). AIU has the right to change the number of hours allocated to the study of subjects within the blocks by 10%.

In the "Medicine" EP 560001, biomedical sciences are represented by the following disciplines: anatomy, histology, cytology, embryology, microbiology, immunology, virology, physiology, medical biology, biochemistry, basic pharmacology, biophysics, pathophysiology. These subjects help form a broad range of competencies in students, such as OK 1, PC: 2,5, 15, 16, 17, 18, 31, 32 (Appendix 53).

To ensure sufficient contact with patients, the EP "Medicine" includes an increased number of practical training credits up to 25 credits. The practice starts in the first year with "Assistant to Junior Medical Personnel," continues in the second year with "Assistant to a Nurse," and then progresses from the 3rd to 6th year: "Care for Children with Somatic and Surgical Diseases," "Assistant to an Ambulance Paramedic," "Assistant to a Hospital Doctor," "Assistant to a Family Doctor," and so on.

Assessment of practical skills is conducted using the Clinical Skills Assessment Sheet in accordance with the List of Practical Skills (Appendix 76). and Competencies that a student must master upon completing their internship. This assessment now constitutes 50% (previously 30%) of the final grade in this clinical discipline. A student who has not mastered the necessary practical skills by more than half is not allowed to take the oral and written exams (Appendix 45).

The "Medicine" EP 560001 is based on scientific methodology, reflected in competency catalogs. The methods included in the EP help medical students develop critical thinking. These methods are mandatory throughout the EP, from the first year. For example, starting with the "Informatics" course, students learn statistical data analysis and correlation analysis methods, which foster a scientific worldview and prepare them for deeper studies in other natural and biomedical sciences. Subsequently, students expand their knowledge in medical statistical analysis when studying "Public Health." (Appendix 49).

Students can also participate in research projects organized by faculty members (Appendix 44).

To implement a critical and scientific approach to studying and evaluating scientific data, the following activities have been developed and integrated into the curriculum:

1. Coordination of research in the development of thinking and the exchange of experiences between researchers and educators on innovations in critical thinking formation technologies through conferences, seminars, masterclasses, publications, and special projects (Appendix 14).

From 2020 to 2023, 22 international scientific and practical conferences were held with the participation of students from the EP 560001 "General Medicine": "New Viral Infection: COVID-19 Pandemic" (May 15, 2020), "2nd International Scientific Webinar on COVID-19" (December 15, 2020), International Scientific and Practical Conference "Invited Med Talk Series" (February 22, 2021), World Congress on Undergraduate Research (WorldCUR) & the British Conference of Undergraduate Research (BCUR) with the participation of IAU (April 2023), educational seminar "New Methods in Education" with Professor Jyotika Ramaprasad from the University of Miami (March 9-17, 2023), International Seminar on Tuberculosis (March 22, 2023), conferences dedicated to healthy lifestyles (May 19, 2023) and, access to information (September 29, 2023), seminar "Development of Syllabi and Assessment Criteria for Students" (October 6, 2023), seminar "How to Prepare a Scientific Publication for Scopus Journals" (October 16, 2023), training "CyberPro" (December 20, 2023), and others. The conference and seminar programs (programs and orders for conference conduct are attached (Appendix 18). The number of students involved in scientific research has been steadily increasing year by year: in 2022, only 3 students

participated in projects, while in 2023, 9 students were involved. The increased interest in this area among students is due to the positive impact of scientific activities, especially the presence of publications, on the competitive selection process for postgraduate education in prestigious institutions in Europe and the USA. For example, last year's graduate, Alimulova Aibike, who actively participated in the medical faculty's scientific projects, successfully entered the Master's program in Healthcare Management in the USA.

A workshop on developing research skills titled "How to Write a Case Report. Tips and Tricks" was conducted for the teaching staff of the Medical Faculty of IAU (Appendix 19) (report, documents, interviews).

In order to integrate subjects aimed at developing analytical and critical thinking into the educational process, elective courses such as critical thinking, the art of teaching, principles of management, entrepreneurship, public speaking skills, interpersonal communication, and social media marketing (4 credits each) have been included in the curriculum, as reflected in the attached syllabus.

Proposals have been developed and suggested for the teaching staff of the Medical Faculty regarding the inclusion of the following in the curriculum and the educational-methodical complex: inclusion of goals aimed at developing critical thinking in the educational program; assignments and exercises designed to practice thinking skills and critical thinking, logical tasks with the application of logical operations; ensuring communication skills, discussing errors in solving tasks and problems through organizing discussions, debates, disputes, creative contests; participation in group problem-solving; transforming classes into active and engaging games using various techniques for developing critical thinking and increasing student activity and motivation (e.g., "Brainstorming," "Ideal," "Problem Mosaic," "Insert," etc.); reviewing own and others' literary works, essays, term papers, and diploma theses (critical text analysis); developing self-education, self-control, active self-learning, informational and cognitive independence, and student subjectivity, writing essays, analytical reviews, and analytical-oriented reports with subsequent identification of one's own and others' fallacies and erroneous judgments (documents).

Analytical Part

Basic educational program (BEP) "General Medicine" has been developed in accordance with the Regulations on the BEP and includes general provisions, characteristics of the preparation direction and professional activities, competencies, general requirements for implementation conditions, the curriculum, course annotations, all types of practical training, final state certification (FSC), and a competency map of BEP.

The curriculum for the EP "General Medicine" for the 2022-2023 academic year was revised based on the principle of the integration of disciplines, both horizontally and vertically:

- Clinical disciplines such as internal medicine, pediatric diseases, surgery, obstetrics and gynecology are integrated vertically from the 3rd to the 6th year, starting with disease propedeutics and concluding with professional skills (subinternship - 6th year);
- Adjacent specialties are integrated horizontally, such as adult infections and pediatric infections, pulmonology and phthisiopulmonology, nephrology and urology, rheumatology and traumatology, operative surgery with topographic anatomy and surgical diseases, surgical diseases and oncology, etc.;
- Considering the epidemiological situation, disciplines like HIV, tobacco addiction, and health and lifestyle have been included in the elective part of the curriculum.

This is confirmed by Appendices 10 and 11, "Curriculum of the Medical Faculty for the 2022-2023 Academic Year" and the Main Educational Program of Higher Professional Education in the preparation specialty (report, documents, interviews).

In the study of specialized (clinical) disciplines, students of the EP 560001 "General Medicine" of IAU spend 30% of their study time in planned patient interactions, including interviews, examinations, and performing various diagnostic and therapeutic procedures, which results in the acquisition of professional competencies and further enables the provision of highly

qualified medical care. Thus, practical sessions with patients begin from the first year and continue until graduation.

However, members of the External Expert Commission (EEC) have identified the following shortcomings: the university has not approved the procedure for the development, approval, and review of the EP, nor for the introduction of innovations into the EP (interviews, documents). Also, the university does not have algorithms for planning and implementing the EP to achieve the expected learning outcomes. These processes are delegated to the dean of the medical faculty, as he is the head of the EP, which does not align with the criteria of the NAAR standard (interviews).

During interviews with teaching staff and students, EEC members noted that the university does not sufficiently utilize teaching and learning methods that stimulate, prepare, and support students in taking responsibility for their own learning process (interviews, documents).

It was observed that there is a low level of awareness among the heads of structural divisions, department chairs, and teaching staff about the procedure for incorporating changes and additions into the EP, based on critical evaluations of literature and scientific data; adaptation of the EP content in line with scientific developments in medicine, achievements in scientific, technological, medical, and pharmaceutical research, as well as the current and anticipated needs of society and the healthcare system.

The EEC members also found that insufficient numbers of students, healthcare practitioners, and representatives of professional associations participate in the discussion, development, revision, and updating of the EP (interviews, documents).

When analyzing the documents of the educational and methodical complex of disciplines, no evidence was found that the EP includes the results of contemporary scientific research (documents, interviews).

During visual inspection of the educational laboratories and visits to the practice bases (ALA-TOO University Clinic), EEC members identified that the teaching staff does not conduct safety briefings for students, and the relevant documents (safety logs, teaching staff qualification for safety, etc.) were not presented (visual inspection, interviews, etc.).

Strengths/Best Practices:

No strengths identified in this standard.

EEC Recommendations:

1. The Vice-Rector for Educational Work, the Head of the Department of Education and Quality Management, and the Dean of the Medical Faculty, in cooperation with the heads of clinical departments, should ensure the introduction and use of teaching methods based on the integration of practical and theoretical components with mentoring, regular evaluation, and feedback, including adherence to ethical standards. Deadline – September 2024; further – permanently.
2. The AIU administration should train university staff to ensure the safety of the learning environment and patients at clinical bases and internship sites. Deadline – 2024/2025 academic year; further – permanently.
3. The Vice-Rector for Educational Work, the Head of the Department of Education and Quality Management, and the Dean of the Medical Faculty, together with the heads of clinical departments, should develop and implement an algorithm that ensures the inclusion of changes and additions to the EP based on a critical review of literature and scientific data, adapting the EP content to the latest scientific, technological, medical, and pharmaceutical developments and societal and healthcare needs. Deadline – September 2024; further – permanently.
4. The Head of the Department of Education and Quality Management should develop algorithms for planning and implementing EPs and introducing innovations in EPs to

- achieve the expected learning outcomes. Deadline – September 2024; further – permanently.
5. The AIU administration should expand the involvement of students, representatives from practical healthcare, and professional associations in the collegial bodies for the development, revision, and updating of EPs. Deadline – September 2024; further – permanently.

EEC Conclusions on Criteria:

- ***Strong: 0***
- ***Satisfactory: 22***
- ***Require Improvements: 6***
- ***Unsatisfactory: 0***

6.3. Standard "Student Assessment"

Probatory Part

The policies and procedures for assessing student learning outcomes at AIU are carried out in accordance with the objectives of the educational program, expected learning outcomes, and the requirements of national educational standards. The criteria, methods, frequency, and procedures for current progress monitoring, intermediate, and final assessments of students, as well as the regulation of passing scores and grades, are outlined in the publicly available documents on the AIU website, including the Regulation on Credit Accumulation (ECTS), the Regulation on Current and Intermediate Control, the Regulation on the Department of Automation of the Educational Process Management System, the Regulation on Registration and the Educational Process, and the regulations approved by the medical faculty of AIU: Rules and Regulations; Educational and Examination Regulations (Appendices 45, 45-1). These are also reflected in the BEP, curricula, and syllabi of disciplines. Additionally, the requirements for knowledge assessment are outlined in the "Regulation on Current Control and Intermediate Certification of Students in Higher Educational Institutions of the Kyrgyz Republic" and the "Regulation on Final State Certification of Graduates of Higher Educational Institutions of the Kyrgyz Republic," approved by Government Decree No. 346 on May 29, 2012.

To ensure the objectivity of knowledge assessment and the adequacy of the tools and mechanisms used, AIU has implemented a PMS, OCS assessment system, which allows for a differentiated approach to assessing students' knowledge, taking into account their achievements throughout the semester and making the evaluation process as transparent as possible. Assessment of students' knowledge in the studied disciplines is conducted through computer testing, oral and combined control, bedside questioning, and is divided into current (assessment of student activity), milestone, and final assessments, in accordance with the requirements of national educational standards.

Current progress monitoring is conducted through oral discussions, assessments of assignments, direct observation, and evaluation of student activity, situational problem-solving, laboratory work, and working with medical documentation and patients (under the supervision of the teacher). The form of milestone control is outlined in the syllabus of the discipline. Milestone control covers the entire volume of material studied up to the time of its conduct, including questions from students' independent work. SIW allows for monitoring the learning progress of the student, evaluating how disciplined, initiative, and creatively they perform the program and requirements.

Final assessment is carried out after the module has been studied, allowing for evaluation of the effectiveness of the module, the disciplines included, their content, and, most importantly, the competencies that the sequential or simultaneous study of the disciplines in the chosen field of study is intended to develop.

After the final assessment, an analysis of the educational process and methodological support is carried out, and measures are taken to improve the quality of students' knowledge. The procedure for milestone and final assessments is shown in the attached video and is outlined in the syllabi.

A positive grade in the final assessment of student academic achievements serves as the basis for earning the required number of credits for the corresponding discipline. The examination session is held twice a year, at the end of the academic semesters. In case of an unsatisfactory grade for the final assessment or absence from the exam without a valid reason, the student does not receive credits for the corresponding discipline, in accordance with the approved regulations at the medical faculty.

The assessment of graduates' knowledge is conducted in accordance with the National Educational Standard for Higher Professional Education (HPE) "Medical Sciences" 560001 and the qualification of a specialist (Doctor), approved by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Kyrgyz Republic Order No. 1357/1 of July 30, 2021, and the "Regulation on Final State Certification of Graduates of Higher Educational Institutions of the Kyrgyz Republic," approved by Government Decree No. 346 of May 29, 2012. It is based on a comprehensive examination, which is carried out in two stages: assessment of clinical skills (bedside care) and an interdisciplinary exam by ticket (the State Final Exam Program for the Medical Faculty is attached, Appendix 47).

To ensure the objectivity and transparency of the procedures, the assessment of knowledge during the State Final Examination (SFE) is conducted with the involvement of external experts as examiners and chairmen of examination committees; all parts of the knowledge assessment process are documented (journals, grading and examination sheets, rating lists, etc.). Documentation related to the SFE is attached.

All results are recorded in PMS and are accessible to both students and their parents. Additionally, transparency and accessibility of the assessment procedures are ensured by providing open access to all interested parties to the regulatory and procedural documents related to the educational process. During computer testing and the final state certification, video surveillance of the exams is conducted. If necessary, video recordings can be shown to the students' parents and other interested parties.

In case of an unsatisfactory grade in the current exam, students are provided with the right to retake the exam twice.

At AIU, the process and methods for assessing students' achievements are available for external expert evaluation. The development and discussion of curricula, forms, and methods of knowledge assessment involve not only the faculty members but also stakeholders, healthcare organizations, professional associations, and student communities. Discussions are held in the form of round tables, focus groups, and training sessions. The meeting protocol from March 26, 2024, and photo report are attached (Appendices 51, 78).

For monitoring student progress and ensuring the quality of education, each student has a personal account in PMS, where information on their academic progress after exams (student academic record), data on expulsion, reinstatement, transfer, session extensions, disciplinary penalties, granted benefits, and rewards (study progress report) are reflected.

Analytical Part

At AIU, the criteria, methods, frequency, and procedures for current progress monitoring, intermediate, and final assessment of students, as well as the regulation of passing scores and grades, are outlined in publicly available documents on the official website: the Regulation on Credit Accumulation (ECTS), the Regulation on Current and Intermediate Control, the Regulation on the Department of Automation of the Educational Process Management System, the Regulation on Registration and the Educational Process, as well as in the regulations approved by the medical faculty of AIU: Rules and Regulations; Educational and Examination Regulations.

Upon analysis of documents and interviews with leaders of structural units and teaching staff, the EEC identified a low level of awareness regarding the use of methods for documenting the reliability, validity, and fairness of assessment methods, which does not meet the NAAR standard criteria and requires improvement.

The EEC members, during interviews, found that the assessment methods are not accessible and that the assessment tools do not undergo external expert evaluation, which does not meet NAAR standards.

AIU lacks a system of additional methods and formats of assessment according to their "assessment effectiveness," including the use of multiple assessors and assessment methods, which does not meet NAAR standards and requires improvement. There is no characterization of the introduction of new assessment methods based on needs, nor an analysis of the "usefulness" of the assessment methods (interviews, documents).

The EEC members, upon analyzing documents and interviewing structural unit heads and teaching staff, found that new assessment methods are not implemented according to need, and the documentation of different types and stages of learning and assessment is not in place, which does not meet NAAR standards and requires improvement.

A low level of awareness of teaching staff regarding the use of assessment methods comparable to the expected results, as well as the algorithms ensuring the achievement of learning outcomes, the relevance and adequacy of the education, and timely, specific, constructive, and objective feedback based on assessment, was noted. This does not meet the NAAR standards and requires improvement.

Strengths/Best Practices:

No strengths were identified for this standard.

EEC Recommendations:

1. The AIU administration, the vice-rector for academic work, and the head of the Department of Education and Quality Management should organize training for teaching staff and workers of structural units on assessment methods and formats according to their "assessment effectiveness" and ensure their use in the implementation of educational programs. Deadline: During the 2024/2025 academic year, and further – permanently.
2. The head of the Department of Education and Quality Management should develop an algorithm for documenting the reliability, validity, and fairness of assessment methods. Deadline: September 2024, further – permanently.
3. The AIU administration, vice-rector for academic work, and the head of the Department of Education and Quality Management should ensure the implementation of the process of documenting the reliability, validity, and fairness of assessment methods. Deadline: During the 2024/2025 academic year, further – permanently.
4. The AIU administration, vice-rector for academic work, and the head of the Department of Education and Quality Management should develop an algorithm for conducting external expert evaluation of assessment methods. Deadline: During the 2024/2025 academic year, and further – permanently.
5. The AIU administration, vice-rector for academic work, and the head of the Department of Education and Quality Management should develop an algorithm ensuring the achievement of learning outcomes, the relevance and adequacy of education, and timely, specific, constructive, and objective feedback based on assessment. Deadline: During the 2024/2025 academic year, and further – permanently.
6. The AIU administration, vice-rector for academic work, in collaboration with the head of the IT department, should ensure the implementation of a system for monitoring individual student achievements. Deadline: During the 2024/2025 academic year, and further – permanently.

EEC Conclusion on the Criteria:

- **Strengths – 0**
- **Satisfactory – 5**
- **Requires improvement – 5**
- **Unsatisfactory – 0**

6.4. Standard "Students"**Probatory Part**

AIU defines and implements an admission policy, including clearly established procedures for the student selection process. The admission of students to the OP 560001 "Medicine" at AIU is conducted in accordance with the following regulatory documents: Government Decree No. 355 of the Kyrgyz Republic dated June 30, 2022, "On approval of normative legal acts in the field of higher and secondary professional education of the Kyrgyz Republic", the Admission Procedure to higher educational institutions of the Kyrgyz Republic (as amended by the Decrees of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Kyrgyz Republic dated August 1, 2022, No. 425, November 21, 2022, No. 654, November 25, 2022, No. 656, November 30, 2022, No. 665, February 28, 2023, No. 106), the Regulations on State Educational Grants and Budget Places in Educational Organizations of Higher and Secondary Professional Education of the Kyrgyz Republic, the Regulations on Nationwide Testing for Applicants, Orders of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Kyrgyz Republic on the schedule for selection rounds and enrollment of applicants, and on the threshold scores for each academic year.

The necessary documents of AIU are available on the AIU website, section: Department of Education and Quality of AIU: "Regulations on the Admissions Committee of AIU", "Regulations on the Procedure for Conducting Attestation Exams for Applicants with Secondary Vocational Education", "Regulations on the Procedure for Transfer and Restoration of Students at the International University of Ala-Too", "Regulations on the Appellate Committee".

The "Regulations on Entrance Examinations at the International University of Ala-Too" https://pms.alatoo.edu.kg/common/download/aiuRules/rule_15.pdf, "Regulations on the Faculty of AIU", "Regulations on the Department of AIU", Functional duties of technical secretaries of the Admissions Committee of the International University of Ala-Too, Functional duties of the chairman and members of the entrance examination committee of AIU.

Every year, according to the orders of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Kyrgyz Republic, the minimum passing score, enrollment plan for each specialty, and the schedule for selection rounds and enrollment of applicants are approved.

Selection and admission to grant places are based on the results of the nationwide testing (ORT) within the quotas approved by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Kyrgyz Republic. The selection and admission of applicants who are citizens of the Kyrgyz Republic to AIU for OP 560001 "Medicine" are carried out only based on the results of the nationwide testing (ORT). The minimum passing score and the enrollment plan for each specialty are approved by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Kyrgyz Republic every year. According to the university rankings in the Kyrgyz Republic based on the competition for enrollment in grant places and the average test scores of applicants, AIU ranks 7th among all universities in Kyrgyzstan, with the average score of entrants in 2022 being 165.8 in the university rankings of Kyrgyzstan.

The competition for admission to the contract form of education is held only based on the results of the ORT of the current year. The competition is held without regard to the categories established for applicants applying for state educational grants. Applicants with the highest scores on the ranked list are recommended for admission.

Persons with disabilities may be admitted in accordance with the following regulatory legal

acts of the Kyrgyz Republic, if the medical and social examination concludes that there are no contraindications for studying at the university in the chosen area of study and specialty: the Regulations on State Educational Grants and Budget Places in Educational Organizations of Higher and Secondary Professional Education of the Kyrgyz Republic, the Procedure for Admission to Higher Educational Institutions of the Kyrgyz Republic (as amended by the Decrees of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Kyrgyz Republic dated August 1, 2022, No. 425, November 21, 2022, No. 654, November 25, 2022, No. 656, November 30, 2022, No. 665, February 28, 2023, No. 106).

The transfer rules are part of AIU's education policy and are regulated by: "Regulations on the Procedure for Transfer, Expulsion, and Restoration of Students at Higher Educational Institutions of the Kyrgyz Republic", approved by Government Decree No. 346 dated May 29, 2012; "Temporary Regulations on the Recognition of Academic Results of Students of Higher Educational Institutions of the Kyrgyz Republic Studying at Foreign Universities", approved by Order No. 225/1 of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Kyrgyz Republic dated April 29, 2013; and the Regulations "On the Procedure for Transfer and Restoration of Students at the International University of Ala-Too".

The university has sufficient material and technical resources to carry out the educational process in accordance with the existing information resources.

AIU owns 5 academic buildings for conducting the educational process, including 95 classrooms (17 of which are laboratories), a library with 2 reading rooms, 6 computer labs with 478 computers, 73 projectors, 47 interactive whiteboards (smartboards), 42 printers, 6 scanners, 11 photocopiers, 30 televisions, and sports facilities, including summer volleyball, basketball, tennis, and football courts. The "Medicine" program has 4 laboratories with microscopes, slides, mannequins, projectors, smartboards, and computers connected to the internet. The program has full compliance with the necessary material resources.

Currently, the AIU library, with the financial support of the founder "Sapat" and the university, is acquiring newly released textbooks. Access to the internet allows for the use of new technologies in information and bibliographic services for faculty and students.

The library has 2 reading rooms for students and faculty. The library's book collection is classified using the decimal classification system. An electronic book catalog and internet access are available.

AIU operates an electronic library: a dedicated room equipped with 2 computers for independent work with electronic publications and digitizing information. The library has its own local database, which can be accessed online, featuring a powerful search mechanism and links to other medical databases and websites with a wide range of literature. For students' convenience, wireless Wi-Fi is available, which works outside of working hours as well.

All students and employees receive medical care, with outpatient services provided daily from 8:00 AM to 5:00 PM. Each employee of AIU has a health record book. The staff is governed by the Regulations on the Medical Unit. A large-scale health education program is conducted among the university's students and staff. Lectures and talks on specific diseases and other medical topics are organized for students. Medical examinations are carried out for new staff members, and mandatory health check-ups are conducted once a year.

Analytical Part

On the AIU website and in promotional booklets, it is stated that foreign students will be taught in English, and language proficiency documentation is required for applicants. Russian and Kyrgyz languages are auxiliary languages necessary for communication with patients and for interactions within the country of study. In case of insufficient English language proficiency, preparatory courses at AIU are offered. Confirmation of the above statements is provided in the links and documents listed below.

The teacher-student ratio is regulated by the Temporary Regulations on Licensing Educational Activities in the Kyrgyz Republic. In the 2022-2023 academic year, the teacher-to-

student ratio for the "Medicine" program at AIU is 1:9, which meets licensing requirements for higher professional education programs, and the material and technical base with a ratio of 1:9 also meets licensing requirements.

Student counseling and support are coordinated by the dean and the vice-dean for educational work at the medical faculty.

The provision of student support at AIU is ensured by the Admissions Committee, the Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs, the Dean, the psychologist, the Educational Resource Center, and the International Office, including online support.

To ensure appropriate conditions for medical care, AIU has a medical unit.

Information about student assistance and counseling programs is made available through the AIU website.

Course curators, course coordinators, and representatives of the Student Council hold meetings for first-year students to familiarize them with future professional prospects, form individual educational trajectories, etc. They introduce students to the typical curricula and catalogs of elective courses, as well as the academic schedule with faculty members (Appendix 58).

The dates for academic and control activities, as well as internships throughout the academic year, including holidays (vacations and public holidays), are presented in the academic calendar, which is developed annually by the Educational and Methodological Center and approved by the Academic Council of AIU (Appendix 60). All documents are available at the faculty dean's office, in the PMS system, and on the AIU website, as well as posted on bulletin boards in the hall.

AIU has an alumni association, the Public Union "Ala-Too Graduates". Information on graduate employment is attached (Appendix 51). Currently, the medical faculty's dean's office plans to maintain information about future graduates, track their professional progress, and create a database of graduate employment. The medical faculty of AIU plans to build a Multi-Profile Clinic "Ala-Too," where graduates may work (interview).

When meeting with focus groups (faculty members and students) and analyzing the presented documents, the EEC members noted that only one student is represented in AIU's Collegiate Bodies. Therefore, it is necessary to increase the number of students in the student self-government bodies and ensure that they actively participate in the development of the mission and OP, the planning of learning conditions, and the evaluation and management of the OP.

AIU has information on the employment of graduates in all fields, and every year a round table is organized to discuss the alignment of the education received with practical application and further improvements in the educational process. According to the academic schedule and based on agreements with employers, students are sent for educational, production, and pre-qualification internships (interview).

Strengths/Best Practice:

No strengths identified for this standard.

EEC Recommendations:

1. The AIU leadership, Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs, and Dean of the Medical Faculty should ensure the expansion of student representation in student self-government bodies and their involvement in the development of the mission, intended learning outcomes, program development, planning learning conditions, and evaluating and managing the program. Deadline: September 2024, further – permanently.

EEC Conclusions on Criteria:

- ***Strong: 0***
- ***Satisfactory: 16***
- ***Requires Improvement: 0***
- ***Unsatisfactory: 0***

6.5. Standard "Academic Staff/Faculty"

Probatory Part

The policy for the selection and hiring of staff at AIU is determined in accordance with the labor legislation of the Kyrgyz Republic, the Education Law of the Kyrgyz Republic, the "Regulations on the Procedure for Filling Positions of Academic Staff in Higher Educational Institutions of the Kyrgyz Republic," and internal regulations of AIU: the "Regulations on the Procedure for Filling Faculty Positions at AIU," Qualification Requirements for Candidates for Positions to be Filled by Competition, the AIU Development Strategy for 2021-2026, and the new strategy for 2024-2028. These documents specify strategic goals related to the scientific and qualification support for faculty development, enhancing the personnel potential of AIU, improving the faculty motivation system for self-development and qualification enhancement, fostering academic mobility of faculty, and improving the quality of life of AIU's faculty and staff. Additionally, the following documents are available: Faculty Regulations, Department Regulations at AIU; job descriptions are available on the website.

The staffing of the medical faculty at AIU is provided (staff schedule and full list of teaching staff, Appendix 32). The faculty composition of AIU's medical faculty has been analyzed by the Expert Commission (EC) members, with the staff schedule and the full list of teaching staff provided (Appendix 32). The total number of faculty members is 62, of which 19 hold academic degrees. There are 44 full-time staff and 18 part-time staff. The percentage of faculty with academic degrees (based on the total number of faculty) is 30.6%. According to the provided document, as of May 6, 2024, the faculty list includes 62 people: 44 full-time faculty, 18 part-time faculty, and 19 with academic degrees. Of the full-time staff, 14 have academic degrees, resulting in a 31.8% degree-holding percentage when calculated based on full-time staff.

Workload planning for faculty at the medical faculty is based on an annual workload of 1500 hours per academic year. According to established norms at AIU, faculty duties are divided into the following types: teaching work, educational and methodological work, research work, and educational and upbringing work (interview).

In order to recognize the academic activity of faculty, AIU uses both material and non-material incentives aimed at ensuring high-quality performance by the faculty. AIU has developed and approved a Rewards Regulation (Appendix 63). In order to conduct a rating analysis of the activities of the faculty, departments, faculties, institutes, and centers, AIU has established the "Regulation on the Rating Evaluation of the Activities of Faculty, Departments, Faculties, Institutes, and Centers" and the "Regulation on Measures for Academic Incentives at AIU."

According to the latest state standard, the share of subjects taught by faculty members with academic degrees (candidate or doctor of sciences) should be at least 40% of the total number of subjects. According to the data from the medical faculty for the 2022-2023 academic year, the number of subjects taught by faculty with academic degrees is 22, which accounts for 53.6% of all subjects (41 subjects in total) in the basic part of the curriculum for the 6-year program, meeting or exceeding the necessary requirements of the state standard.

Analytical Part

The criteria and procedures for selecting the academic staff at the medical faculty are outlined in the "Regulations on the Procedure for Filling Positions of Academic Staff in Higher Educational Institutions of the Kyrgyz Republic," the "Regulations on the Procedure for Filling Faculty Positions at AIU," and the Qualification Requirements for Candidates for Positions to be Filled by Competition. When selecting candidates for faculty positions, the level of professional education, qualifications, professional experience, research activity, and ability to prepare highly qualified specialists according to modern labor market needs are considered. Priority is given to individuals with higher qualifications, academic degrees and titles, pedagogical and research

experience, and clinical work experience in the relevant specialty, etc. (e.g., characteristics, recommendation letters, awards, etc.).

Additionally, in order to encourage research and educational activities, AIU has developed the following regulations: "Researcher of the Year," "Lecturer of the Year," and the "Regulation on the Scientific Ranking and Financial Incentives for Scientific and Research Activities of AIU Faculty." During the interview with focus groups, EEC members noted a low level of awareness among department heads and faculty about the organization and conduction of educational activity expertise to enhance the academic staff potential, which does not meet the standards of the NAAR criteria and requires improvement (interview).

Strengths/Best Practice:

No strengths were identified for this standard.

EEC Recommendations:

1. The AIU administration, the Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs, and the Head of the Department of Education and Quality Management should organize training for department heads, chairpersons, and faculty on educational activity expertise. Completion date: during the 2024/2025 academic year and further permanently.
2. The AIU administration, the Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs, and the Head of the Department of Education and Quality Management should ensure the organization and implementation of educational activity expertise to enhance the academic staff potential. Completion date: during the 2024/2025 academic year and further permanently.
3. The AIU administration, the Vice-Rector for Administrative Affairs, should balance the academic staff (in biomedical, clinical, behavioral, and social sciences) and the ratio of medical to non-medical faculty members, including those working full-time or part-time, academic and non-academic staff. Completion date: September 2024.

EEC conclusions on Criteria:

- ***Strengths*** – 0
- ***Satisfactory*** – 7
- ***Require improvement*** – 1
- ***Unsatisfactory*** – 0

6.6. Standard "Educational Resources"

Probatory Part

The material and technical base of AIU consists of 5 educational buildings, a scientific library with reading rooms, and research laboratories. The educational and laboratory facilities of AIU are equipped with the necessary number of classrooms, all furnished with modern teaching aids.

AIU owns 5 educational buildings for conducting the educational process, housing 95 classrooms (including 17 laboratory rooms). In the computer labs, the following software is installed: Windows 7, 10 (32, 64 bit), Linux 12, 14, 17 (Ubuntu); Visual Studio 2015; systems for reinforcing theoretical knowledge and forming practical skills in programming and testing software products; object-oriented programming language Python; C++; database management system MS SQL Server 2010; BPWin – a tool for modeling complex processes, including business processes, and more.

In total, AIU has 6 computer labs. The university is equipped with 478 computers, 73 projectors, 47 interactive whiteboards (smartboards), 42 printers, 6 scanners, 11 copiers, 30 televisions, and also has a sports complex, summer volleyball, basketball, tennis, and football courts, a gym, 4 cafeterias, and a medical office. The library is operational, with 2 equipped reading rooms.

The total usable area of the university is 19261.0 m² (including Block E). The areas of the educational buildings are as follows: Block A – 3665.18 m²; Block B – 2337.4 m²; Block C – 2314.2 m²; Block D – 7109.32 m²; Block E – 3400 m²; Sports Complex – 435.36 m².

It is worth noting that in 2023, a new Block E with an area of 3,400 m² was launched for the implementation of the educational program 560001 "General Medicine," with modern renovations and equipped with contemporary furniture.

Furthermore, based on agreements with 14 healthcare organizations, AIU has access to educational spaces for practical training. Therefore, the educational process utilizes lecture halls and classrooms both in AIU's own educational buildings and in the clinical bases of healthcare organizations in Bishkek. The space provided for each student exceeds 3 square meters, which meets licensing requirements.

At the medical faculty, all classrooms are equipped with modern multimedia equipment (projectors, audio systems, televisions, and smart panels); specialized rooms are available, such as simulation rooms and laboratories for anatomy, histology, chemistry, microbiology, and professional skills; labs for practical training, experiments, and scientific research. Four smart panels were purchased for the new laboratories in Block E. In total, the medical faculty has 112 computers, 2 smartboards, 17 projectors, 5 printers, and 1 television. Of the 46 staff members, 35 have computers. According to the state standard, for electronic publications, the university must have at least 7 computers with internet access for every 100 students, and the medical faculty fully complies with this requirement.

To develop clinical skills in students, AIU has a professional skills lab, equipped with simulation equipment and mannequins of varying levels of realism. A new batch of mannequins is expected. The list of equipment for other laboratories is attached. According to a decree from the rector of AIU dated August 10, 2023, funding of \$55828 was allocated for further development and improvement of the medical faculty's resources.

For the development of distance learning technologies and skills, AIU operates an International Center for Distance Education, equipped with computers and software such as "Doodle," "Moodle," and Zoom.

The library collection meets the requirements for training specialists in educational programs and contains 39,361 items, including:

- Printed publications (textbooks, teaching aids, dissertations, abstracts, periodicals, etc.) – 19,597 items;
- Electronic publications (textbooks, teaching aids, and video materials) – 19,764 items.

In the past 5 years, there has been a steady increase in the purchase of textbooks and educational materials, with an improved quality of acquired literature.

The electronic library information is categorized into the following types: text, digital, graphical, audio, video materials, multimedia, computer programs, and combined formats. The library contains 19,764 units of material entered into the Yordam program. Students and faculty of the medical faculty have full access to the electronic library, lectures, and educational video materials. The electronic library can be accessed via the link: (search with the term "all" and the number 611 to find all relevant medical literature). In 2022, the medical faculty independently purchased up-to-date medical literature, which was added to the library's collection. In 2023, the AIU library's collection was replenished with 88 new pieces of medical literature (purchased with AIU funds).

To enhance the work of the electronic library, an agreement was signed with AMBOSS, and logins were purchased for 30 computers to access the electronic library, where students have access to all materials (video materials, test tasks, etc.).

The availability of required textbooks and teaching aids, including electronic versions and lecture notes/presentations, for AIU students is 1:1. The library serves readers in 2 reading rooms with 200 seating places.

The library uses the automated library system "IRBIS-64," which includes modules such as "Administrator," "Completer," "Cataloger," "Reader," and "Book Issue." The introduction of the

automated information library system "IRBIS-64" has enabled the use of new information technologies in the library's operations. An electronic catalog and electronic card files have been created, allowing library users to find information about books and select literature on specific topics in just minutes. The library also provides access to reference and search databases such as Web of Science, Hinari, eLIBRARY.RU, Polpred, as well as free access to eIFL resources: Edward Elgar Journals & eBooks, IntellectJournals, IOPScience, LAN, Cochrane Library, PubMed, OpenEdition, MSP electronic reference and regulatory document databases (clinical protocols, building codes, etc.).

For physical education and sports activities, there is an indoor sports hall, 4 training fields (basketball, volleyball, football, and tennis), equipped with appropriate sports equipment, a gym, a wrestling room, a covered table tennis area, and tables for teqball. There are special stairs for students with limited mobility to enter the gym.

Analytical Part

The members of the EC confirmed that the existing material and technical base of AIU is sufficient to adequately carry out the educational program. The material and technical base includes: classrooms, library/co-working center, simulation rooms, educational laboratories, computer labs, dormitories, fitness hall, 4 training fields (basketball, volleyball, football, and tennis), equipped with appropriate sports equipment, cafeterias for faculty and students, a food station (cafeteria), a medical office, and 14 clinical bases – national hospitals, city hospitals, family medicine centers (interviews, documents).

The University Clinic "ALA-TOO" serves as a full clinical base owned by the university, providing students with practical skills and training. It is a multidisciplinary institution (75 beds) offering outpatient, inpatient (therapy, cardiology, surgery, dialysis center), and day hospital services.

AIU provides access for both faculty and students to use information and communication technologies for independent learning, communication with colleagues, access to healthcare information and patient data, patient curation, and working in the healthcare system to provide medical care (report, documents, interview).

During a visual inspection and visits to practical bases, the EEC members noted that safety instructions were not conducted during lessons, and faculty members did not present any documents verifying that students had undergone safety training (visual inspection, interview).

The EEC members noted a low level of awareness among department heads, faculty, and staff regarding the implementation of education expertise policies at the planning, implementation, and evaluation stages of the program, which does not comply with the NAAR criteria and requires improvement (interview, documents).

Interviews with focus groups (department heads, faculty, and staff) revealed that there is no system for encouraging the development of expertise in evaluating education and research in medical education as a discipline, nor for fostering faculty interest in conducting research in medical education, which does not meet the NAAR criteria and requires improvement (interview, documents).

The EEC members were not provided with evidence of internal and external reviews of the educational program, nor evidence that faculty had been trained and acquired skills to conduct educational expertise (interview, documents).

Strengths/Best Practice:

No strengths were identified for this standard.

EEC Recommendations:

1. The AIU administration should provide training for university staff to ensure the safety of the learning environment and patient safety at clinical and production practice sites. Completion date: during the 2024/2025 academic year, and further permanently.

2. The AIU administration should organize the implementation of an education expertise policy at the planning, implementation, and evaluation stages of the program and train department heads and faculty on using expertise in educational programs. Completion date: during the 2024/2025 academic year, and further permanently.
3. The AIU administration should develop a system to encourage the development of expertise in evaluating education and research in medical education, as well as to support faculty interest in conducting research in medical education. Completion date: during the 2024/2025 academic year, and further permanently.

EEC Conclusions on Criteria:

- ***Strengths – 0***
- ***Satisfactory – 12***
- ***Require improvement – 2***
- ***Unsatisfactory – 0***

6.7. Standard "Evaluation of the Educational Program"

Probatory part

To improve the implementation and outcomes of the educational program 560001 "General Medicine," the faculty carries out monitoring, accompanied by periodic evaluations and feedback at different levels. The purpose of monitoring is to identify discrepancies in a timely manner and to adjust educational standards to align with strategic goals, meet labor market requirements, and ensure that faculty members are capable of preparing competitive specialists. Both internal and external mechanisms are applied. External mechanisms include audits by higher authorities (Ministry of Education and Science, Ministry of Health of the Kyrgyz Republic), institutional and specialized accreditation with post-control, independent graduate evaluations, etc. Internal mechanisms include evaluations of students/teaching staff, self-assessment of educational departments/faculty, internal audits within the faculty departments, and internal control of departments/Dean's offices/offices, ongoing, intermediate, and final assessments of students, faculty ranking, and student ranking.

All stages and levels of ensuring the quality of the educational program are regulated by the current legislation and regulations: the Law on Education of the Kyrgyz Republic, Government Resolutions of the Kyrgyz Republic, State Educational Standards, Regulations, and Legal Acts of the Ministry of Education and Science and Ministry of Health of the Kyrgyz Republic, and the Charter of AIU. The policy for ensuring quality in education at AIU is published on the official website of AIU and includes the mission, vision, "Development Strategy of AIU," Quality Management System (QMS), the order on the creation of a mission for quality management at AIU (Appendix 41), as well as educational goals and learning outcomes as reflected in the approved Ministry of Education and Science of the Kyrgyz Republic graduate competency catalogues.

The policy for ensuring the quality of education at AIU has been widely discussed at the meetings of the Quality Education Council and the Academic Council on October 28, 2021, and was approved by the rector of AIU.

The logistics of monitoring and evaluating the educational program are detailed in the following AIU documents: "Quality Management System (QMS) Manual."

Monitoring and evaluation of the educational program 560001 "General Medicine" are mandatory and involve both faculty members and students. The high level of the faculty's performance is ensured by the quality of the selection of faculty, administrative, and support staff. One of the university's strategic goals is improving the qualification of faculty, which is also one of the objectives of AIU's policy for ensuring the quality of education.

AIU provides the necessary resources to faculty and creates an information infrastructure that supports their activities through process automation (electronic document flow, PMS, OCS, etc.). In order to motivate faculty participation in the AIU development strategy, mechanisms and criteria for evaluating the effectiveness of faculty activities, their competency level, professional potential, and preparedness to achieve the strategic goals of AIU have been developed.

Analytical part

The members of the accreditation committee (EEC) found that AIU has not implemented an effective monitoring program for the key components, processes, and outcomes of the educational program, including the collection and analysis of data on various aspects of the program, analysis of student academic achievements, and the mechanisms for obtaining feedback from faculty and students have not been sufficiently developed. Consequently, the ability to improve the structure, content, and final outcomes of the program is limited (documents, interviews).

In the mechanism for monitoring and evaluating the educational program presented by the university, there is no clearly and thoroughly described methodology for the internal assessment of the overall program and its components (documents, interviews).

To assess the quality of the implementation of the educational program for the 2022-2023 academic year, the rector of AIU issued an order to establish a Quality Management System (QMS) Commission (documents).

During interviews, it was revealed that there is no developed, approved, and implemented mechanism for evaluating and reviewing the program based on annual monitoring with the participation of stakeholders (students, faculty, administrative staff, employers).

The accreditation committee members also noted the low level of awareness among heads of structural divisions, department chairs, faculty members, and students regarding the system for involving faculty and students in the planning and evaluation of the program and the use of evaluation results for program improvement. This does not meet the criteria of the NAAR standard and requires improvement (interviews).

Strengths / Best Practice:

No strengths have been identified for this standard.

EEC Recommendations:

1. The management of AIU, the vice-rector for academic affairs, and the head of the Department of Education and Quality Management should develop and implement measures (regulated procedures) to increase the awareness of heads of structural divisions and faculty members about the monitoring procedure of the educational program, assessment of the educational process, methods of student evaluation, student progress, and the evaluation and analysis of identified problems affecting the quality of the program. Deadline – within the 2024/2025 academic year, and further permanently.
2. The management of AIU, the vice-rector for academic affairs, and the head of the Department of Education and Quality Management should develop a mechanism that ensures the transparency of monitoring and evaluation at all stages of the program's implementation, involving stakeholders and ensuring awareness among participants in the educational process regarding the procedure of monitoring and evaluation of the program. Deadline – within the 2024/2025 academic year, and further permanently.
3. The management of AIU, the vice-rector for academic affairs, and the head of the Department of Education and Quality Management should develop a mechanism for conducting monitoring and evaluation of the educational program. Deadline – within the 2024/2025 academic year, and further permanently.

EEC Conclusions on Criteria:

- ***Strengths – 0***

- *Satisfactory* – 6
- *Require improvement* – 3
- *Unsatisfactory* – 0

6.8. Standard "Management and Administration"

Probatory part

In accordance with the Charter of AIU, the Regulation on Academic Governance of AIU, the governing bodies of the university are: the highest body - the Founder, the executive body - the Rector, and the collegial body - the Academic Council. The Academic Council, chaired by the Rector of AIU, addresses key and current issues of AIU's operations. It consists of professors and associate professors, and its activities are regulated by a Regulation approved by the Rector. The composition of the Academic Council of AIU is also determined by the Rector. The Rector heads AIU and manages its activities in accordance with its Charter.

The university includes faculties, departments, laboratories, institutes, centers, subdivisions for secondary and additional professional education, preparatory departments and courses, research departments, social infrastructure units, dormitories, offices, branches, and other structural units, and is authorized to create educational complexes, participate in the creation and activities of associations, unions, and other organizations to develop and improve education. However, they are not legal entities. Their status and functions are determined by regulations adopted by the Academic Council of the university and approved by the Rector. The structure of AIU is attached.

One of the collegial management bodies is the Rector's Council, which includes: the Rector, vice-rectors, deans of faculties, and heads of some structural units of AIU. The Rectorate is responsible for the operational management of the university, coordination of the activities of its structural units, and resolving current issues related to academic and financial-economic activities. Vice-rectors act in accordance with the responsibilities assigned to them by the Rector and the delegated authority for managing structural units of AIU.

Collegial management bodies necessarily include representatives of academic staff. For instance, heads of departments, vice-deans, faculty members, deans, and/or deputy deans, vice-rectors are included in all collegial (public) councils. Through the decisions of collegial bodies, faculty members participate in governance and the definition of AIU's development strategy and the strategies of its structural units. One form of participation of faculty members in management decisions is through their involvement in the work of deans' offices and departments, where decisions regarding academic, educational, research activities, and staffing issues are discussed and made. Regular meetings between the Rectorate and the faculty of all departments are held on a scheduled basis.

Student participation in university management is ensured by their right to be elected to collegial governing bodies, to make proposals for improving the educational and training process to the Rector, the Academic Council, and other public councils. Students are included in the collegial management bodies of AIU: the Academic Council, and the Faculty Council.

The Faculty Council of the Medical Faculty includes: Shabir Khan – 4th-year student, Umar Shawaiz – 5th-year student, Zhetkinbekova Tolkun – 6th-year student. Students participate in the process of planning, implementation, and monitoring the academy's activities also through youth organizations and the student leadership system based on the Regulations on the Student Council and student clubs at the International University Ala-Too, conducting satisfaction surveys, etc. The work of the student council is based on social partnership. It allows the involvement of AIU students as social actors in management, control, and evaluation of activities; strengthens the role of student organizations in the process of forming future specialists who meet the modern requirements of society.

The participation of civil society, practical healthcare organizations, parents, and the Ministry of Health and Ministry of Education and Science of the Kyrgyz Republic is realized

through round tables, public hearings, open days, as well as participation in open meetings of AIU public councils.

Analytical part

AIU has a clear scope of responsibilities and powers for providing resources for educational programs, including a targeted budget for education, as outlined in the Charter and Strategy of AIU. The responsible structural units include: the Department of Finance and Accounting for budget planning and resource need control (accounting); the Department of Education and Quality Management (DE&QM) for determining resource needs through student and faculty satisfaction surveys; the DE&QM and library for providing educational and methodological resources; the Information Technology Center for determining needs and creating specifications for computer equipment, office equipment, and software; the Human Resources and Legal Department for determining needs and providing human resources (staff list) etc.

AIU's budget is formed from revenues generated from tuition fees under contracts and other income in accordance with the legislation of the Kyrgyz Republic on providing educational services. According to the Charter of AIU, the sources of financing and material-technical support for the university's activities include funds from the Founders, income from activities specified in the Charter: income from entrepreneurial activities not prohibited by the legislation of the Kyrgyz Republic, voluntary donations, property contributions, grants, charitable donations, and other sources not prohibited by law.

In order to ensure transparency and openness in the planning and use of financial resources at AIU, discussions and hearings of the budget are held by the Financial Committee, the Academic Council, and the Rector's Council.

As a result of decisions by the Financial Committee, a 15% increase in the salaries of faculty members was implemented. To motivate faculty in improving teaching quality, AIU has developed and implemented a Regulation on the Ranking of Faculty, Departments, Institutes, and Centers aimed at recognizing the academic achievements, scientific contributions, and teaching qualifications of staff (documents, interviews).

EEC members noted that one of the strengths of the university is that it is independent and allocates resources necessary for the implementation of educational programs and distributes educational resources according to their needs. For instance, the budget of the Medical Faculty for the 2023-2024 academic year was \$55,828, while for the 2024-2025 academic year, the budget is planned to be \$298,728 (documents, interviews).

Another strength noted by EEC experts is that AIU has the ability to independently allocate resources, including rewarding faculty members who have achieved planned results, such as publications in international peer-reviewed journals (SCOPUS, WoS) (documents, interviews).

Strengths / Best Practice:

1. AIU allocates necessary resources for the implementation of the educational program and distributes educational resources according to their needs.
2. Motivation and rewards for faculty members who achieve planned results.

EEC Recommendations:

No recommendations for this standard.

EEC Conclusions on Criteria:

- ***Strengths*** – 2
- ***Satisfactory*** – 11
- ***Require improvement*** – 0
- ***Unsatisfactory*** – 0

6.9 Standard "Continuous Improvement"

Probatory part

The university continuously improves and updates the content of processes, organizational approaches, and infrastructure. The university allocates financial resources for continuous improvement based on the needs in the development of educational and scientific-practical programs.

As a dynamically developing and socially responsible university, AIU regularly reviews its activities for improvement. In accordance with the AIU Charter, an annual analysis and discussion of reports on various areas of AIU's activities (academic, educational-methodical, scientific, educational, financial, etc.) and the implementation of AIU's Development Strategy as a whole are conducted. To carry out internal evaluations of different types of activities, including financial management, AIU has developed and approved Guidelines 1 and Guidelines 2 for the quality management system. Internal evaluations and audits are conducted based on rector and vice-rector orders, starting with the formation and approval of a working group of experts/commission and the work schedule.

Annual reviews of activities and revisions of AIU's mission and development strategy are carried out (corrective formulations and measures are made) after the expiration of its implementation period. The Mission, Goals, Development Strategy of AIU for 2021-2026, its implementation plan, and objectives were revised. Annually, based on the analysis of the results of AIU's performance for the academic year and its needs, the structure of AIU is revised and approved. In the new structure, the number of vice-rectors has increased, and a Board of Trustees has been introduced. The Department of Education and Quality Management has been divided into two departments.

To ensure resources for continuous improvement, AIU has developed and implemented a system for gathering information on resource needs. All structural units of AIU submit their requests annually at the end of the year, which are consolidated and analyzed by the Department of Finance and Accounting.

AIU has introduced a Regulation on the preparation of applications for financing research projects. Summary information on applications is presented to the Rectorate Council, where priorities and the volume of purchases are determined and approved. Based on the decisions made, a procurement plan and program budget are formed. Additionally, resource needs are determined during the annual meeting of the administration with all structural units at the end of the academic year and based on the results of surveys of students, faculty, and other stakeholders.

Analytical part

The analysis and evaluation of AIU's activities for the future show that the university aims to expand and improve its material and technical base, for which sufficient financial resources are allocated. The university initiates the process of reviewing its activities, but it is not systematic.

The process of updating at the university is based on accumulated experience and leads to the revision of policies and practices in educational, scientific, and economic processes.

AIU adapts its mission in line with current realities and opportunities for providing quality educational services, which affects the final results of education, the revision, and adaptation of the educational program and its model (documents, interviews).

Organizational structure and management principles are being developed in response to changing circumstances and needs.

VEC members found that the university does not update the educational program or adjust the components of the educational program and their interrelations according to advancements in biomedical, behavioral, social, clinical, hygiene, pharmaceutical sciences, changes in demographic situations, the health/morbidity structure of the population, and socio-economic and cultural conditions (interviews, documents).

Interviews with heads of structural units, department chairs, and faculty revealed low awareness regarding updates to the educational program and changes in learning outcomes (interviews, documents).

Strengths / Best Practice:

1. The Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs, the Head of the Department of Education and Quality Management, and the Dean of the Medical Faculty, together with the heads of clinical departments and courses, are recommended to develop and implement an algorithm ensuring the inclusion of changes and additions to the educational program based on a critical evaluation of literature and scientific data; adaptation of the content of the educational program in accordance with scientific advancements in medicine, achievements in scientific, technological, medical, and pharmaceutical developments, and the current and anticipated needs of society and the healthcare system. Deadline: September 2024, further permanently.
2. AIU's management, the Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs, and the Head of the Department of Education and Quality Management are recommended to develop an algorithm ensuring the transparency of monitoring and evaluating the educational program when changes are made, with the broad involvement of stakeholders. Deadline: During the 2024/2025 academic year, further permanently.

EEC Conclusions on Criteria:

- ***Strengths*** – 0
- ***Satisfactory*** – 10
- ***Require improvement*** – 2
- ***Unsatisfactory*** – 0

(VII) REVIEW OF STRENGTHS / BEST PRACTICES FOR EACH STANDARD

Standard "Mission and Learning Outcomes" The institutional autonomy of the International University of "Ala-Too," which is expressed in the right to organize and self-manage, to implement academic freedom without ideological, political, or religious interference, while taking on a set of competencies and obligations in accordance with national policies and higher education development strategies, and constructive interaction with the healthcare sector of the Kyrgyz Republic (Ministry of Health of the Kyrgyz Republic, National Hospitals), is a strong point in the implementation of the educational program 560001 "Medical Affairs."

Standard "Educational Program" No strengths/best practices have been identified for this standard.

Standard "Assessment of Students" No strengths/best practices have been identified for this standard.

Standard "Students" No strengths/best practices have been identified for this standard.

Standard "Academic Staff / Teachers" No strengths/best practices have been identified for this standard.

Standard "Educational Resources" No strengths/best practices have been identified for this standard.

Standard "Evaluation of the Educational Program" No strengths/best practices have been identified for this standard.

Standard "Management and Administration"

1. AIU allocates the necessary resources for the implementation of the educational program and distributes educational resources according to their needs.
2. Motivation and reward for academic staff who achieve the planned results.

Standard "Continuous Improvement" No strengths/best practices have been identified for this standard.

(VIII) REVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS FOR QUALITY IMPROVEMENT

Standard "Mission and Learning Outcomes"

No recommendations for this standard.

Standard "Educational Program"

1. The Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs, the Head of the Department of Education and Quality Management, and the Dean of the Medical Faculty, together with the heads of clinical departments, should ensure the implementation and use of teaching methods based on the integration of practical and theoretical components, using a mentorship system, regular assessments, and feedback, including adherence to ethical requirements and standards. Deadline – September 2024; further permanently.
2. The university management should conduct training for university staff to ensure the safety of the learning environment and patients at clinical bases and production practice sites. Deadline – during the 2024/2025 academic year, further permanently.
3. The Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs, the Head of the Department of Education and Quality Management, and the Dean of the Medical Faculty, together with the heads of clinical departments and courses, are recommended to develop and implement an algorithm for incorporating changes and additions into the educational program (EP), based on critical literature reviews and scientific data, and adapting the content of the EP in accordance with developments in medicine, scientific, technological, medical, and pharmaceutical advancements, as well as current and anticipated needs of society and the healthcare system. Deadline – September 2024; further permanently.
4. The Head of the Department of Education and Quality Management should develop algorithms for planning and implementing the EP and introducing innovations in the EP to achieve expected learning outcomes. Deadline – September 2024; further permanently. AIU leadership is advised to expand the representation of students, healthcare professionals, and professional associations in collegial bodies for participation in the development, revision, and updating of the EP. Deadline – September 2024; further permanently.

Standard "Assessment of Students"

1. AIU leadership, the Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs, and the Head of the Department of Education and Quality Management should organize training for faculty and structural unit staff on methods and formats of assessment according to their "assessment effectiveness" and ensure their use in implementing the EP. Deadline – during the 2024/2025 academic year, further permanently.
2. The Head of the Department of Education and Quality Management should develop an algorithm for documenting the reliability, justification, and fairness of assessment methods for students. Deadline – September 2024, further permanently.
3. AIU leadership, the Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs, and the Head of the Department of Education and Quality Management should ensure the implementation of a process for

- documenting the reliability, justification, and fairness of student assessment methods. Deadline – during the 2024/2025 academic year, further permanently.
4. AIU leadership, the Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs, and the Head of the Department of Education and Quality Management should develop an algorithm for conducting external evaluation of assessment methods. Deadline – during the 2024/2025 academic year, further permanently.
 5. AIU leadership, the Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs, and the Head of the Department of Education and Quality Management should develop an algorithm to ensure the achievement of learning outcomes by students, the adequacy and relevance of the learning process, and the provision of timely, specific, constructive, and objective feedback to students based on the assessment of their activities. Deadline – during the 2024/2025 academic year, further permanently.
 6. AIU leadership, the Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs, and the Head of the Department of Information Technologies should ensure the implementation of a system for tracking individual student achievements. Deadline – during the 2024/2025 academic year, further permanently.

Standard "Students"

1. AIU leadership, the Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs, and the Dean of the Medical Faculty should ensure the expansion of student representation and authority in student self-governance bodies, and their involvement in the development of the mission, planned learning outcomes, the development of the EP, planning of learning conditions, assessment, and management of the EP. Deadline – September 2024; further permanently.

Standard "Academic Staff / Teachers"

1. AIU leadership, the Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs, and the Head of the Department of Education and Quality Management should organize training for heads of structural units, department chairs, and faculty members on conducting evaluations of educational activities. Deadline – during the 2024/2025 academic year, further permanently.
2. AIU leadership, the Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs, and the Head of the Department of Education and Quality Management should ensure the organization and implementation of educational activity evaluations to enhance the potential of academic staff. Deadline – during the 2024/2025 academic year, further permanently.
3. AIU leadership, the Vice-Rector for Administrative Affairs should balance the academic staff (biomedical, clinical, behavioral and social sciences, the ratio between medical and non-medical faculty members, working full-time or part-time, academic and non-academic staff). Deadline – September 2024.

Standard "Educational Resources"

1. AIU leadership should conduct training for university staff to ensure the safety of the learning environment and patients at clinical bases and production practice sites. Deadline – during the 2024/2025 academic year, further permanently.
2. AIU leadership should organize the implementation of policies using expertise in education during the planning, implementation, and evaluation phases of the program, and train heads of structural units and faculty on the use of educational program expertise. Deadline – during the 2024/2025 academic year, further permanently.
3. AIU leadership should develop an algorithm to stimulate the development of expertise in educational evaluation and research in medical education, promoting staff interest and

involvement in medical education research. Deadline – during the 2024/2025 academic year, further permanently.

Standard "Evaluation of the Educational Program"

1. AIU leadership, the Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs, and the Head of the Department of Education and Quality Management should develop and implement activities (regulated procedures) to raise awareness among heads of structural units and faculty about the educational program monitoring procedure, evaluation of the educational process, student assessment methods, student progress, evaluation, and analysis of identified issues affecting the quality of the educational program. Deadline – during the 2024/2025 academic year, further permanently.
2. AIU leadership, the Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs, and the Head of the Department of Education and Quality Management should develop an algorithm to ensure transparency in the monitoring and evaluation process at all stages of the EP implementation, with broad involvement of stakeholders and awareness of educational process participants about the monitoring procedure and evaluation results. Deadline – during the 2024/2025 academic year, further permanently.
3. AIU leadership, the Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs, and the Head of the Department of Education and Quality Management should develop a mechanism for monitoring the evaluation of the EP. Deadline – during the 2024/2025 academic year, further permanently.

Standard "Management and Administration"

No recommendations for this standard.

Standard "Continuous Improvement"

1. The Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs, the Head of the Department of Education and Quality Management, and the Dean of the Medical Faculty, together with the heads of clinical departments and courses, are recommended to develop and implement an algorithm for incorporating changes and additions to the educational program (EP) based on critical reviews of literature and scientific data, adapting the content of the EP in accordance with advancements in medical science, technological, medical, and pharmaceutical developments, and the current and anticipated needs of society and the healthcare system. Deadline – September 2024; further permanently.
2. AIU leadership, the Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs, and the Head of the Department of Education and Quality Management should develop an algorithm to ensure transparency in monitoring and evaluating the EP when making changes, with broad involvement of stakeholders. Deadline – during the 2024/2025 academic year, further permanently.

(IX) REVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE EDUCATION ORGANIZATION

None.

(X) RECOMMENDATION TO THE ACCREDITATION COUNCIL

The members of the Accreditation Expert Commission unanimously agreed that the educational program 560001 "Medicine" (higher professional education) is recommended for accreditation for a period of 5 years.



Appendix 1. Evaluation Table "PROGRAM PROFILE PARAMETERS"

№	№	№ of criteries	EVALUATION CRITERIA	Position EO			
				Strengths	Satisfactory	Require improvement	Unsatisfactory
Standard 1: "MISSION AND OUTCOMES"							
1.1 Definition of a mission							
The educational organization must:							
1	1	1.1.1.	The educational organization must define the mission of the educational program and communicate it to the interested parties and the healthcare sector.		+		
2	2	1.1.2.	The mission of the educational program should reflect the goals and educational strategy that enable the preparation of a competent specialist at the higher education level in the healthcare field, providing a solid foundation for a future career in any area of healthcare, including all types of practice, administrative medicine, and healthcare research. The specialist should be capable of performing the role and functions in accordance with the established requirements of the healthcare sector, prepared for postgraduate education, and committed to lifelong learning.		+		
3	3	1.1.3.	Ensure that the mission includes achievements in research in the fields of biomedical, clinical, pharmaceutical, behavioral, and social sciences, global health aspects, and reflects key international health issues.		+		
1.2. Institutional autonomy and academic freedom							
The educational organization must:							
4	4	1.2.1.	To possess institutional autonomy in order to develop and implement a quality assurance policy, for which the administration and faculty are responsible, particularly concerning the development of the educational program and the allocation of resources necessary for its implementation.	+			
5	5	1.2.2.	To ensure academic freedom for staff and students to implement the educational program and utilize the results of new research to improve the study of specific subjects/issues without expanding the educational program.		+		
1.3. "Learning outcomes"							
The educational organization must:							
6	6	1.3.1.	To define the expected learning outcomes that students should achieve upon completion of their studies, which include the possibility of reaching basic-level achievements in terms of knowledge, skills, and professional relationships; a solid foundation for a future career in any area of the healthcare sector; future roles in the healthcare sector; subsequent postgraduate training; commitment to lifelong learning; the health needs of society, the needs of the healthcare system, and other aspects of social responsibility.		+		
7	7	1.3.2.	To ensure appropriate behavior of students towards their peers, faculty, medical staff, patients, and their families.		+		

8	8	1.3.3.	Publish the expected learning outcomes of the educational program.		+		
9	9	1.3.4.	Define and coordinate the alignment of the expected learning outcomes upon completion with those required for postgraduate education.		+		
10	10	1.3.5.	Provide opportunities for students to participate in research in the relevant area of healthcare.		+		
11	11	1.3.6.	Pay attention to the anticipated learning outcomes related to global health.		+		
1.4. Participation in formulating the mission and learning outcomes.							
The educational organization must:							
12	12	1.4.1.	Ensure the involvement of key stakeholders in formulating the mission and expected learning outcomes.		+		
13	13	1.4.2.	Ensure that the stated mission and expected learning outcomes are based on the opinions/suggestions of other stakeholders.		+		
				<i>Total</i>	1	12	0
Standard 2. EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM							
2.1. Model of the educational program and teaching methods.							
The educational organization must:							
14	1	2.1.1.	Define the specifications of the educational program, including a statement of intended learning outcomes, a curriculum based on a modular or spiral structure, and the qualification obtained upon completion of the program.		+		
15	2	2.1.2.	Utilize teaching and learning methods that encourage, prepare, and support learners to take responsibility for their learning process.			+	
16	3	2.1.3.	Ensure that the educational program is implemented in accordance with the principles of equality.		+		
17	4	2.1.4.	Develop learners' abilities for lifelong learning.		+		
2.2. Scientific Method							
An educational organization must:							
18	5	2.2.1.	Throughout the entire educational program, instill in learners the principles of scientific methodology, including methods of analytical and critical thinking, research methods in healthcare, and evidence-based medicine.		+		
19	6	2.2.2.	Incorporate the results of contemporary scientific research into the educational program.		+		
2.3 Basic biomedical science							
An educational organization must:							
20	7	2.3.1.	Define and incorporate the achievements of basic biomedical sciences into the educational program to foster learners' understanding of scientific knowledge, concepts, and methods that form the foundation for acquiring and applying clinical scientific knowledge in practice.		+		
21	8	2.3.2.	Modify the educational program to reflect the advancements in biomedical sciences, including scientific, technological, medical, and pharmaceutical developments, as well as the current and anticipated needs of society and the healthcare system.		+		
2.4. Behavioral and social sciences, medical/pharmaceutical ethics, and jurisprudence.							
An educational organization must:							
22	9	2.4.1.	Define and incorporate the achievements of behavioral sciences, social sciences, medical/pharmaceutical ethics, and jurisprudence into the educational program.		+		
23	10	2.4.2.	Modify the educational program to reflect the advancements in behavioral and social sciences, medical/pharmaceutical ethics, and jurisprudence, including contemporary scientific, technological, medical, and pharmaceutical developments, as well as the current and anticipated needs of society and the		+		

			healthcare system; and the changing demographic and cultural context.				
2.5. Clinical/pharmaceutical sciences and skills.							
An educational organization must:							
24	11	2.5.1.	Define and incorporate the achievements of clinical/pharmaceutical sciences into the educational program to ensure that learners, upon completion of their studies, acquire sufficient knowledge, clinical, and professional skills to assume appropriate responsibility in their subsequent professional activities;		+		
25	12	2.5.2.	Ensure that learners spend a sufficient portion of the program in planned interactions with patients and service users in appropriate clinical/production settings, gaining experience in health promotion and disease prevention.		+		
26	13	2.5.3.	Determine the amount of time allocated for studying core clinical/specialized disciplines.		+		
27	14	2.5.4.	Organize training with appropriate attention to the safety of the learning environment and patients, including the observation of actions performed by learners in clinical/production settings.			+	
28	15	2.5.5.	Modify the educational program to reflect the advancements in scientific, technological, medical, and pharmaceutical developments, as well as the current and anticipated needs of society and the healthcare system.		+		
29	16	2.5.6.	Ensure that each learner has early contact with real patients and service users, including their gradual involvement in service provision and assuming responsibility in the following areas: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Patient examination and/or treatment under supervision in appropriate clinical settings; • Sanitary and epidemiological surveillance procedures, including the examination and/or inspection of objects under supervision, conducted at relevant production bases (sanitary and epidemiological expertise centers, territorial departments of sanitary-epidemiological control, including transportation, disinfection organizations, and healthcare institutions); • Patient counseling on the rational use of medications, carried out in relevant production settings. 		+		
30	17	2.5.7.	Structure the various components of training in clinical, hygienic skills for monitoring environmental and production factors, as well as other production skills, in accordance with the specific stage of the educational program.		+		
2.6. Structure of the educational program, content, and duration.							
An educational organization must:							
31	18	2.6.1.	Describe the content, volume, and sequence of subjects/modules, including compliance with the appropriate balance between basic biomedical, behavioral, social, and clinical/specialized disciplines.		+		
32	19	2.6.2.	Provide for the integration of related sciences and disciplines horizontally.		+		
33	20	2.6.3.	Provide for the vertical integration of clinical/specialized sciences with basic biomedical, behavioral, and social sciences.		+		
34	21	2.6.4.	Provide opportunities for elective content and define the balance between the mandatory and elective components of the educational program.		+		
35	22	2.6.5.	Define the relationship with complementary medicine, including non-traditional, traditional, or alternative practices, occupational medicine, addressing the impact of the		+		

			environment and technological production factors, as well as the social setting on public health.					
2.7. Program management								
An educational organization must:								
36	23	2.7.1.	Define procedures for the development, approval, and review of the educational program.			+		
37	24	2.7.2.	Establish a committee under academic leadership responsible for the planning and implementation of the educational program to ensure the achievement of the expected learning outcomes.			+		
38	25	2.7.3.	Ensure the representation of faculty, learners, and other stakeholders, including representatives from clinical and production bases, alumni, and healthcare professionals involved in the learning process, in the committee responsible for the educational program.		+			
39	26	2.7.4.	Through the committee responsible for the educational program, plan and implement innovations in the program.			+		
2.8. Connection with medical/pharmaceutical practice and the healthcare system.								
An educational organization must:								
40	27	2.8.1.	Ensure continuity between the educational program and subsequent stages of professional training or practical activity that the learner will undertake upon completion of the program.		+			
41	28	2.8.2.	Take into account the specific conditions in which graduates will be working and modify the educational program accordingly.		+			
				<i>Total</i>	0	22	6	0
Standard 3. ASSESSMENT OF LEARNERS								
3.1. Assessment methods								
An educational organization must:								
42	1	3.1.1.	Define and approve the principles, methods, and practices used for assessing learners, including the number of exams, criteria for setting passing scores, grades, and the number of allowed retakes.		+			
43	2	3.1.2.	Ensure that assessment procedures cover knowledge, skills, attitudes, and professional behavior.		+			
44	3	3.1.3.	Use a wide range of assessment methods and formats based on their "usefulness evaluation," including a combination of validity, reliability, impact on learning, acceptability, and effectiveness of the methods and assessment formats.			+		
45	4	3.1.4.	Ensure that the assessment process and methods are open (accessible) for review by external experts.			+		
46	5	3.1.5.	Ensure that assessment methods and results avoid conflicts of interest and include a system for appealing the outcomes of learner assessments.		+			
47	6	3.1.6.	Ensure transparency in the assessment procedure and its results, and inform learners about the criteria and procedures used for assessment.			+		
48	7	3.1.7.	Provide the possibility for documenting and evaluating the reliability and validity of assessment methods, as well as involving external examiners.			+		
3.2. The relationship between assessment and learning.								
An educational organization must:								
49	8	3.2.1.	Use assessment principles, methods, and practices that are aligned with the planned learning outcomes and teaching and learning methods, ensuring the achievement of intended learning outcomes, supporting learner development, and maintaining an appropriate balance between formative and summative assessments to guide learning and make decisions about academic performance.			+		
50	9	3.2.2.	Provide the possibility of adjusting the number and nature of		+			

			exams to stimulate both knowledge acquisition and integrated learning.					
51	10	3.2.3.	Ensure timely, specific, constructive, and fair feedback to learners on assessment results.		+			
				<i>Total</i>	0	5	5	0
Standard 4. LEARNERS								
4.1. Admission and selection policy								
An educational organization must:								
52	1	4.1.1.	Define and implement an admission policy based on the principles of objectivity, including a clear statement about the learner selection process.		+			
53	2	4.1.2.	Have a policy and implement practices for the admission of individuals with disabilities.		+			
54	3	4.1.3.	Have a policy and implement practices for transferring learners from other educational organizations, including foreign institutions.		+			
55	4	4.1.4.	Establish a connection between the selection process, the mission of the educational organization, the educational program, and the desired quality of graduates; periodically review the admission policy.		+			
56	5	4.1.5.	Implement a system for appealing decisions regarding the admission of learners.		+			
4.2. Recruitment of learners								
An educational organization must:								
57	6	4.2.1.	Determine the number of learners to be admitted based on the capabilities of the educational organization at all stages of the educational program.		+			
58	7	4.2.2.	Periodically adjust the number and composition of admitted learners, taking into account the opinions of stakeholders responsible for workforce planning and development in the healthcare sector, to meet the medical needs of the population and society as a whole.		+			
59	8	4.2.3.	Provide for the possibility of periodically reviewing the number and composition of admitted learners through consultations with other stakeholders and adjust them to meet the health needs of the population and society as a whole.		+			
4.3. Counseling and support for learners								
An educational organization must:								
60	9	4.3.1.	Have an academic counseling system for learners.		+			
61	10	4.3.2.	Offer learners a support program focused on social, financial, and personal needs, allocating appropriate resources and ensuring the confidentiality of counseling and support.		+			
62	11	4.3.3.	иметь систему обратной связи с обучающимися по оценке условий и организации образовательного процесса		+			
63	12	4.3.4.	Provide learners with documents confirming the qualifications obtained (diploma) and the diploma supplement (transcript).		+			
64	13	4.3.5.	Take into account the needs of different groups of learners and provide opportunities for the formation of individual educational trajectories.		+			
65	14	4.3.6.	Provide academic counseling based on monitoring learner performance, which includes career guidance and planning.		+			
4.4. Representation of learners								
An educational organization must:								
66	15	4.4.1.	Develop and implement a policy for the representation of learners and their appropriate involvement in defining the mission, developing, managing, and evaluating the educational program, as well as other matters related to learners.		+			
67	16	4.4.2.	Provide opportunities to encourage, support, and assist		+			

			student activities and student organizations.					
				<i>Total</i>	0	16	0	0
Standard 5. ACADEMIC STAFF / FACULTY								
5.1. Staff recruitment and selection policy								
The educational organization must develop and implement a staff selection and hiring policy that:								
68	1	5.1.1.	Defines their category, responsibilities, and balance of the academic staff/faculty in basic biomedical sciences, behavioral and social sciences, and medical/pharmaceutical sciences for the adequate implementation of the educational program (EP), including the proper ratio between faculty of medical, non-medical, and pharmaceutical profiles, faculty working full-time or part-time, as well as the balance between academic and non-academic staff.		+			
69	2	5.1.2.	Takes into account the criteria for scientific, educational, and clinical achievements, including the ratio between teaching, research activities, and 'service' functions.		+			
70	3	5.1.3.	Defines and ensures the monitoring of the responsibilities of the academic staff/faculty in basic biomedical sciences, behavioral and social sciences, as well as clinical, hygiene, and pharmaceutical sciences.		+			
71	4	5.1.4.	Provides for the possibility in the selection and hiring policy to take into account criteria and characteristics such as the attitude towards the mission and economic opportunities of the educational organization, as well as significant features of the region.		+			
5.2. Personnel Activity and Development Policy.								
The educational organization must develop and implement a personnel activity and development policy aimed at:								
72	5	5.2.1.	Maintaining a balance of opportunities between teaching, research, and 'service' functions, ensuring recognition of worthy academic activities with appropriate emphasis on teaching, research, and professional qualifications.		+			
73	6	5.2.2.	Ensuring that individual staff members have sufficient knowledge of the entire educational program, as well as training and professional development for faculty, their growth, and evaluation				+	
74	7	5.2.3.	The ability to consider the 'teacher-student' ratio depending on various components of the educational program		+			
75	8	5.2.4.	Staff career development		+			
				<i>Total</i>	0	7	1	0
Standard 6. EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES								
6.1. Material and technical base								
An educational organization must:								
76	1	6.1.1.	To have a sufficient material and technical base that allows for the adequate implementation of the educational program, as well as to create a safe learning environment for staff, students, patients, and their relatives		+			
77	2	6.1.2.	Improve the learning environment by regularly updating and expanding the material and technical base to align with changes in educational practices.		+			
6.2. Resources for practical training								
An educational organization must:								
78	3	6.2.1.	Provide the necessary resources to offer students proper clinical/practical experience, including: • Quality and categories of patients/service users • Quantity and categories of clinical/production facilities • Monitoring of students' practice		+			
79	4	6.2.2.	Evaluate, adapt, and improve the conditions of clinical/practical training to meet the needs of the population.		+			
6.3. Information technologies								
An educational organization must:								
80	5	6.3.1.	Develop and implement a policy aimed at the effective and		+			

			ethical use and evaluation of relevant information and communication technologies.					
81	6	6.3.2.	Ensure access to websites or other electronic media.		+			
82	7	6.3.3.	Provide access for instructors and students to relevant patient data and healthcare information systems using existing and appropriate new information and communication technologies for independent learning, information access, patient databases, and working with healthcare information systems.		+			
6.4. Research in the field of medicine/pharmacy and scientific achievements								
An educational organization must:								
83	8	6.4.1.	Use research activities and scientific achievements in the fields of medicine and pharmacy as the foundation for the educational program.		+			
84	9	6.4.2.	Formulate and implement a policy that fosters the strengthening of the connection between scientific research and education; provide information about the research infrastructure and priority areas in the organization's educational research.		+			
85	10	6.4.3.	Ensure that the connection between scientific research and education is reflected in teaching, encourages, and prepares students for participation in healthcare research.		+			
6.5. Expertise in the field of education								
An educational organization must:								
86	11	6.5.1.	Have access to educational expertise on the processes, practices, and issues of medical and pharmaceutical education by involving specialists, educators, psychologists, and sociologists at the university, inter-university, and international levels; develop and implement a policy of expertise in the development, implementation, and evaluation of educational programs, as well as in the development of teaching and assessment methods.			+		
87	12	6.5.2.	Demonstrate evidence of the use of internal or external educational expertise in staff development, taking into account current experience in medical/pharmaceutical education and supporting staff interests in conducting research in education.			+		
6.6. Exchange in the field of education								
An educational organization must:								
88	13	6.6.1.	Formulate and implement a policy on national and international cooperation with other educational organizations, including staff and student mobility, as well as the transfer of educational credits.		+			
89	14	6.6.2.	Promote the participation of instructors and students in academic mobility programs both domestically and internationally, and allocate appropriate resources for these purposes.		+			
				<i>Total</i>	0	12	2	0
Standard 7. EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM								
7.1. Monitoring and evaluation mechanisms of the program								
An educational organization must:								
90	1	7.1.1.	Have regulated procedures for monitoring, periodic evaluation of the educational program and learning outcomes, as well as the progress and performance of students.			+		
91	2	7.1.2.	Develop and apply an evaluation mechanism for the educational program that examines the program, its key components, student performance, identifies and addresses issues, and ensures that relevant evaluation results influence the educational program.			+		
92	3	7.1.3.	Periodically evaluate the program, thoroughly reviewing the			+		

			educational process, components of the educational program, expected learning outcomes, and social responsibility.					
7.2. Feedback between instructor and student								
An educational organization must:								
93	4	7.2.1.	Systematically collect, analyze, and respond to feedback from instructors and students.		+			
94	5	7.2.2.	Use feedback results to improve the educational program.		+			
7.3. Student academic achievements								
An educational organization must:								
95	6	7.3.1.	Analyze the academic performance of students and graduates in accordance with the mission, expected learning outcomes, curriculum, and resource availability.		+			
96	7	7.3.2.	Analyze the academic performance of students and graduates, taking into account the conditions of their prior education and preparation level upon admission to the university; use the results of the analysis to interact with the department responsible for student selection, curriculum development, and student advising.		+			
7.4. Stakeholder engagement								
An educational organization must:								
97	8	7.4.1.	Engage key stakeholders in the monitoring and evaluation of the educational program.		+			
98	9	7.4.2.	Provide stakeholders with access to the program evaluation results, collect and analyze their feedback on the practical performance of graduates and their opinions on the educational program.		+			
				<i>Total</i>	0	6	3	0
Standard 8. MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION								
8.1. Management								
An educational organization must:								
99	1	8.1.1.	Define the structural units and their functions, including the relationships within the university.		+			
100	2	8.1.2.	Define committees within the governance structure, their responsibilities, and composition, reflecting the representation of key and other stakeholders, ensuring transparency in the work of governing bodies and the decisions they make.		+			
8.2. Academic leadership								
An educational organization must:								
101	3	8.2.1.	Describe the responsibilities of academic leadership in defining and managing the educational program.		+			
102	4	8.2.2.	Periodically assess academic leadership in relation to achieving its mission and expected learning outcomes.		+			
8.3. Education budget and resource allocation								
An educational organization must:								
103	5	8.3.1.	Have a clear distribution of responsibilities and authorities for resource allocation to the educational program, including a targeted education budget.		+			
104	6	8.3.2.	Allocate the resources necessary for the implementation of the educational program and distribute educational resources in accordance with their needs.	+				
105	7	8.3.3.	Provide the ability to independently allocate resources, including compensation for instructors who appropriately achieve the planned learning outcomes; when distributing resources, consider scientific achievements in healthcare, public health issues, and their needs.	+				

8.4. Administrative staff and management								
An educational organization must:								
106	8	8.4.1.	Have administrative and professional staff for the implementation of the educational program and related activities, ensuring proper management and resource allocation.		+			
107	9	8.4.2.	Ensure the participation of all departments of the educational organization in the processes and procedures of the internal quality assurance system.		+			
8.5. Interaction with the healthcare sector								
An educational organization must:								
108	10	8.5.1.	Engage in constructive interaction with the healthcare system and sectors of society and government related to health, including international ones.		+			
109	11	8.5.2.	Give official status to cooperation, including involving staff and students, with partners in the healthcare sector.		+			
8.6. Public information								
An educational organization must:								
110	12	8.6.1.	Publish complete and accurate information about the educational program and its achievements on the official website of the educational organization and in the mass media.		+			
111	13	8.6.2.	Publish objective information about the employment and demand for graduates on the official website.		+			
				<i>Total</i>	2	11	0	0
Standard 9. CONTINUOUS UPDATING								
An educational organization must:								
112	1	9.1.1.	As a dynamic and socially responsible organization, initiate procedures for the regular review and updating of the process, structure, content, outcomes/competencies, assessment, and learning environment of the program, address documented deficiencies, and allocate resources for continuous updates.		+			
113	2	9.1.2.	Base the updating process on prospective research in healthcare and the results of internal studies, evaluations, and literature on medical/pharmaceutical education.		+			
The educational organization must ensure that the process of updating and restructuring leads to the revision of policies and practices in accordance with previous experience, current activities, and future prospects, and provide the possibility to address the following issues during the updating process:								
114	3	9.1.3.	Adaptation of the mission for the scientific, socio-economic, and cultural development of society.		+			
115	4	9.1.4.	Changes in the expected learning outcomes of graduates in accordance with documented needs of the environment in which they will operate. Modification of learning outcomes based on documented needs of the post-graduate training environment, including clinical skills, preparation in public health matters, and participation in providing medical care to patients in accordance with the responsibilities assigned to graduates after completing the educational organization.		+			
116	5	9.1.5.	Adaptation of the educational program model and teaching methods to ensure their adequacy and relevance.		+			
117	6	9.1.6.	Adjustments to the elements of the educational program and their interconnections in accordance with advances in biomedical, behavioral, social, clinical, hygienic, and pharmaceutical sciences, changes in demographic trends and the health/sickness structure of the population, as well as socio-economic and cultural conditions. The adjustment process will ensure the inclusion of new relevant knowledge, concepts, and methods, and the exclusion of outdated ones.			+		
118	7	9.1.7.	Development of assessment principles, methods, and the number of exams in accordance with changes in the planned learning outcomes and teaching methods.			+		

119	8	9.1.8.	Adaptation of the student admission policy and selection methods in response to changing expectations and circumstances, workforce needs, changes in the pre-university education system, and the needs of the educational program.		+		
120	9	9.1.9.	Adaptation of the recruitment and formation policy for the academic staff in accordance with changing needs.		+		
121	10	9.1.10.	Updating of educational resources in accordance with changing needs, such as the student intake, the number and profile of academic staff, and the educational program.		+		
122	11	9.1.11.	Improvement of the monitoring and evaluation process of programs.		+		
123	12	9.1.12.	Development of the organizational structure, as well as leadership and management, to handle changing circumstances and needs, and over time, adapt to the interests of various stakeholder groups.		+		
<i>Total</i>				0	9	3	0
<i>Overall total</i>				3	102	18	0

