



«АККРЕДИТТЕУ ЖӘНЕ РЕЙТИНГТІҢ  
ТӘУЕЛСІЗ АГЕНТТІГІ» КЕМ

НУ «НЕЗАВИСИМОЕ АГЕНТСТВО  
АККРЕДИТАЦИИ И РЕЙТИНГА»

INDEPENDENT AGENCY FOR  
ACCREDITATION AND RATING

# REPORT

on the results of work of the external expert commission on assessment  
on compliance with the requirements of the standards for primary  
specialised programme accreditation of joint Master's degree programmes  
7M04104 MBA Management in Healthcare 7M04105 EMBA  
Management in Healthcare  
Kazakh National Medical University named after S.D. Asfendiyarov and  
Suleyman Demirel University

from 26 to 28 April 2023

**INDEPENDENT ACCREDITATION AND RATING AGENCY**  
**External Expert Commission**

**Addressed to**  
**Accreditation**  
**IAAR Accreditation Council**



«АККРЕДИТТЕУ ЖӘНЕ РЕЙТИНГТІҢ  
ТӘУЕЛСІЗ АГЕНТТІГІ» КЕМ

НУ «НЕЗАВИСИМОЕ АГЕНТСТВО  
АККРЕДИТАЦИИ И РЕЙТИНГА»

INDEPENDENT AGENCY FOR  
ACCREDITATION AND RATING

**REPORT**

**on the results of work of the external expert commission on assessment  
on compliance with the requirements of the standards for primary specialised programme  
accreditation of joint Master's degree programmes  
7M04104 MBA Management in Healthcare  
7M04105 EMBA Management in Healthcare  
Kazakh National Medical University named after S.D. Asfendiyarov  
and Suleyman Demirel University**

**from 26 to 28 April 2023**

**Almaty, 2023**

**(I) LIST OF NOTATIONS AND ABBREVIATIONS**

MH RK	Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
GOSO	State obligatory standard of education
QMS	Quality management systems
PPP	Faculty
PhD	Doctor of Philosophy
OP	Educational program
KIS	Control and measuring instruments
TMC	Educational Programs Committee
COC	Quality Assurance Commission
OOD	General education disciplines
MNVO RK	Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
QED	Catalog of elective disciplines
RUPL	Working curricula
AIS	Automated information systems
DB	Basic disciplines
AP	Profile disciplines
RO	Learning Outcomes
CRC	Learning outcomes
ECTS	European credit transfer (transfer) and accumulation system
OSCE	Objective structured clinical examination
AC	Academic Council
SRO	Independent work of the student
NIRS	Student research work
SNK	Student Scientific Circle
PBL	Problem-based learning
SVL	Case-based learning
TVL	Project-based research, learning by doing, science research project

## (II) INTRODUCTION

In accordance with the order №32-23-OD from 20.02.2023 of the Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating from 26 to 28 April 2023 the external expert commission assessed the compliance with the standards of primary specialized accreditation of joint educational programs of Master's degree 7M04104 MBA Management in Healthcare (2 years) and 7M04105 EMBA "Management in Healthcare" (1 year).

The report of the External Expert Committee (EEC) contains the assessment of the submitted joint RP against the NAAR criteria, the recommendations of the EEC on further improvement of the RP and the evaluation parameters.

### **Composition of the VEC:**

**IAAR expert, Chairperson of the EEC** - Boyko Svetlana Leonidovna, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Grodno State Medical University (Republic of Belarus, Grodno) *Off-line participation;*

**IAAR Expert** - Dmitry Voronov, MD, Associate Professor, National Medical Research Center of Obstetrics, Gynecology and Perinatology named after V.I. Kulakov, (Russian Federation, Moscow, Russia). V.I. Kulakov National Medical Research Center of Obstetrics, Gynecology and Perinatology, (Russian Federation, Moscow), *Off-line participation;*

**IAAR expert** - Bacinschi Nicolae Gheorghievici, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the State University of Medicine and Pharmacology named after Nicolae Testemitanu (Republic of Moldova, Chisinau, Chisinau, On-line participation). Nicolae Testemitanu State University of Medicine and Pharmacology (Republic of Moldova, Chisinau), *On-line participation;*

**IAAR expert** - Torlanova Botagoz Ongarovna, Candidate of Pharmacy, JSC "South Kazakhstan Medical Academy" (Republic of Kazakhstan, Shymkent), *Off-line participation;*

**IAAR Expert** - Berdesheva Gulshara Aitkalievna, Candidate of Medical Sciences, NAO "West Kazakhstan University named after M. Ospanov. M. Ospanov" (Republic of Kazakhstan, Aktobe), *Off-line participation;*

**IAAR expert** - Sekenova Raushan Kozganbaevna Sekenova, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, Astana Medical University (Republic of Kazakhstan, Astana), *Off-line participation;*

**IAAR Expert, VEC Employer** -- Yessenev Olzhas Brimzhanovich, Master of Business Administration in Healthcare, State Institution Hospital with Polyclinic of Police Department of North-Kazakhstan region (Republic of Kazakhstan, Petropavlovsk), *On-line participation;*

**IAAR Expert, VEC student** - Valentina A. Kuzyakova, student of NAO "Medical University of Karaganda", (Republic of Kazakhstan, Karaganda), *On-line participation;*

**IAAR expert, VEC student** - Orzaeva Bayan Bolatkalikyzy, Master's student, NAO "Semey Medical University" (Republic of Kazakhstan, Semey), *On-line participation;*

**IAAR expert, VEC student** - Aigerim Bakytzhanova Bazaralieva, Master's student, Al-Farabi Kazakh National University (Republic of Kazakhstan, Almaty), *Off-line participation;*

**IAAR Coordinator** - Alisa Satbekovna Dzhakenova, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Head of Medical Projects of the Agency (Republic of Kazakhstan, Astana), *Off-line participation.*

### (III) REPRESENTATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION

The Kazakh National Medical University named after Sanzhar Jafarovich Asfendiyarov (hereinafter KazNMU) was opened by the Decree of the SNK of the RSFSR on December 2, 1930. In 2018, by the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the university was transformed from RGP on PCV to NAO "Kazakh National Medical University named after S. D. Asfendiyarov".

KazNMU has a license to carry out educational activities under educational programs of higher (bachelor, internship) and postgraduate education (master, doctoral and residency) №KZ74LAA00017008 from 19.09.2019. with annexes 001 - 006, issued by the Committee for Control in the Sphere of Education and Science of the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan; license for medical activity №19014500 with annexes 001-020 issued by the Department of Entrepreneurship and Investments of the Almaty City Akimat dated 05.07.2019.

Educational activity in KazNMU is carried out in accordance with the Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan from July 27, 2007 "On Education" and other by-laws and legal acts of the Ministry of Education and Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

Since 2006 KazNMU started training bachelors, masters, PhD doctors based on the principles of trinity (education, science, practice). Being a signatory of the Great Charter of Universities, in 2011, in accordance with the principles of the Bologna process, carried out the transition to credit technology of undergraduate education, supported by the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan. KazNMU has 6 schools, 2 faculties and the Department of Master's and Doctoral studies; collegial bodies: the Board of Directors, the Management Board of KazNMU, the Academic Council and its subordinate councils in the areas of activity, the Disciplinary Commission, 7 Committees of Educational Programs (hereinafter referred to as EPC) and 6 Quality Assurance Commission (hereinafter referred to as QAC).

School of Public Health named after Kh. Dosmukhamedov (hereinafter - SPS) carries out educational activity on OP "Public Health". The faculty was founded in 1943 on the basis of Almaty Medical Institute as a sanitary-hygienic faculty according to the order of NKZ USSR № 234 from May 14, 1943. From 1964 to 1985 it was a part of Karaganda Medical Institute. Since 1985 it again became a part of the Medical University of Almaty. In 2004 by the decision of the Academic Council of the Faculty (Minutes № 2 from 12.10.2004) on the basis of renaming the specialty "hygiene and epidemiology" to "medical and prophylactic business" the Faculty was renamed into the medical and prophylactic faculty. In 2013 it was transformed into the Faculty of Public Health, in 2017. - in the School of Public Health (SPH). In general, KazNMU and School of Public Health created a favorable environment and effective resources for the implementation of educational activities. The teaching staff of the School of Public Health: 1 academician, 5 Doctor of Medical Sciences, 26 Candidate of Medical Sciences, 12 PhDs, 54 Masters. Tenure of SHO faculty is 46%, 14% of faculty has non-zero h-index.

Suleyman Demirel University (SDU) was opened in 1996 with the participation of the First President of Kazakhstan N.A.Nazarbayev and the 9th President of Turkey - Suleyman Demirel. SDU is a private higher education institution, which is a non-profit organization with a trust form of management. The structure of the university includes: rectorate, 3 faculties, 1 Business School, Center for Multidisciplinary Education, 8 departments, 12 research laboratories, 22 departments and structural units.

SDU trains specialists in 55 educational programs, including 28 bachelor's degree programs, 22 master's degree programs, 7 PhD educational programs.

The contingent of students at the beginning of the 2022-2023 academic year is 8008 students, namely on bachelor's programs 7363 students, on master's programs 567 students, on doctoral programs 78 students. SRU has a trilingual system of education, according to which 62%

of its educational programs are taught in English, 20% - in Kazakh, and 18% are available in English, Kazakh or Russian. Education is conducted according to the ECTS system.

SRU Business School implements programs of 4 clusters, has 45 units of full-time teaching staff, including 1 Doctor of Science, 3 Candidates of Science, 13 PhDs, 28 Masters.

#### **(IV) DESCRIPTION OF THE PREVIOUS ACCREDITATION PROCEDURE**

This is the first time the accreditation is being conducted.

#### **(V) DESCRIPTION OF THE VISIT**

VEC work was carried out on the basis of approved Program of visit of expert commission on institutional and specialized program accreditation in KazNMU in the period from 26 to 28 April 2023.

In order to coordinate the work of the VEC, an introductory meeting was held on 24.04.2023, during which the powers were distributed among the commission members, the schedule of the visit was clarified, and agreement was reached on the choice of examination methods.

In order to obtain objective information about the quality of the organization of education on the joint Master's Program "7M04104 MBA Management in Healthcare" and "7M04105 EMBA Management in Healthcare", to clarify the content of the self-assessment report, meetings were held with the rector, vice-rectors of the university in the areas of activity, heads of structural units, dean of the School of Public Health, dean of the Business School of SRU, heads of departments, teachers, students. A total of 37 representatives took part in the meetings (Table 1).

Table 1 - Information on staff and trainees who participated in meetings with the NAAR VEC:

<b>Category of participants</b>	<b>Quantity</b>
Rector	1
Vice-Rectors	2
Heads of structural subdivisions	15
Heads of OPs, heads of departments	3
Teachers	6
Learners	10
<b>Total</b>	<b>37</b>

During the excursion members of the EEC got acquainted with the state of material and technical base. On April 26 according to the program were visited: museum, Scientific library, Scientific genomic laboratory, educational buildings. At the meeting of the EEC NAAR with the target groups KazNMU the mechanisms of implementation of the Master Program "7M04104 MBA Management in Health Care" and "7M04105 EMBA Management in Health Care" and specification of individual data presented in the self-assessment report were clarified.

For the period of accreditation classes were attended at the Department of Policy and Management in Health Care (head of the department L.K. Kosherbaeva, associate professors A.A. Maukenova, L.B. Seiduanova). The department presents educational-methodical complex of disciplines, journals, work plans and scientific works (monographs, methodological recommendations) of faculty members.

During the work on 27.04.2023 members of the EEC visited the following bases of practice: Municipal Clinical Hospital No. 5 (chief physician - B.N. Sadykov, deputy chief physician and staff of specialized departments - S.O. Tolegenova and A.J. Abdrakhmanova) and



Alatau Assistance - network of medical centers Medicare (medical director - K.B. Ibraeva). KazNMU concluded cooperation agreements with medical organizations to conduct practice.

During the visit of EEC members to health care organizations, heads of organizations noted close cooperation with KazNMU in terms of providing training rooms, classrooms, offices, as well as various resources for the implementation of practice-oriented part of the educational process.

In accordance with the procedure of accreditation of the joint OP 6 teachers and 10 students were surveyed.

In order to confirm the information presented in the Self-Assessment Report, the external experts requested and analyzed the working documentation of the Master Program 7M04104 MBA Management in Healthcare and 7M04105 EMBA Management in Healthcare. Along with this, the experts studied the information of the official websites of [universitieskaznmu.edu.kz](http://universitieskaznmu.edu.kz) and [sdu.edu.kz](http://sdu.edu.kz)

As part of the planned program, the recommendations for improvement of the OPs of Master's Degree "7M04104 MBA Healthcare Management" and "7M04105 EMBA Healthcare Management", developed by VEC based on the results of the examination, were presented at the meeting with the management on 28.04.2023.



## (VI) COMPLIANCE WITH THE STANDARDS OF PRIMARY SPECIALIZED ACCREDITATION

### 6.1. Standard "RIGHT TO PARTICIPATE (ACCEPTANCE)"

#### *Evidentiary part*

Partners in joint educational programs are S.D. Asfendiyarov Kazakh National Medical University (KazNMU) and Suleyman Demirel University (SDU). Sulaiman Demirel University (SDU).

KazNMU carries out educational activities on the basis of the relevant license (No. KZ74LAA00017008 issued by the State Institution "Committee for Control in the Sphere of Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science (MES) of the Republic of Kazakhstan (RK)" (19.09.2019) in accordance with Article 36 of the Law of RK "On Permits and Notifications".

KazNMU employs famous scientists-educators of the Republic of Kazakhstan, academicians of the National Academy of Sciences of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Russian Academy of Medical Sciences, Academy of Preventive Medicine of the Republic of Kazakhstan, International Academies, honored workers of science and education, as well as graduates of foreign universities. KazNMU has cooperation agreements with universities of far and near abroad countries, among which are: Charite University (Berlin, Germany), Lithuania, Nagasaki University (Nagasaki, Japan), Asia-Pacific University (Beppo, Japan), Parkway College (Singapore); University of Perugia (Perugia, Italy), Zadunai University (Krems, Austria); Kyrgyz State Medical Academy (Bishkek, Kyrgyz Republic), National Medical University named after A. Bogomolets (Bishkek, Republic of Kyrgyzstan), National Medical University named after A. Bogomolets (Bishkek, Republic of Kyrgyzstan). A. Bogomolets National Medical University (Kiev, Ukraine), I. Sechenov Moscow Medical Academy (Moscow, Russia). I. Sechenov Moscow Medical Academy (Moscow, Russia) and others. The University staff is actively involved in the implementation of research works under international programs and grants.

SDU is a private higher education institution, which is a non-profit organization with a trust form of management. SDU carries out educational activities on the basis of the relevant license (№ KZ68LAA00003730, issued by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, 02.12.2014) within the framework of the national educational system in accordance with the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The teaching staff are professionals who graduated from prestigious educational institutions of the country and abroad. Graduates of the leading foreign universities of the world work in SDU, which include: Cambridge University (UK), Harvard University (USA), University of Southern California (USA), Columbia University (USA), Boston University (USA), University of Illinois (USA), Universitede Montreal (Canada), Jacobs University (Germany), Carnegie Mellon University (USA), Pennsylvania State University (USA), University of Pittsburgh (USA) and others.

KazNMU Development Program for 2019-2023 was approved by the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan on June 27, 2019 № 453, Strategic directions of KazNMU for 2019-2023 are determined by the decision of the Board of Directors of KazNMU № 1 from March 20, 2019 and reflect the key priorities of KazNMU.

In 2017, SDU passed the certification of the quality management system in relation to educational activities for compliance with the requirements of ST RK ISO 9001-2016 (Annex 0.3). In 2018, the Quality Assurance Manual was approved, Annex 2 (1) to the Manual is the Quality Policy, Annex 2(2) is the Quality Objectives [https://drive.google.com/file/d/1A4-STbNUL55KnVNzv54-ZST35IFPupZU/view?usp=share\\_link](https://drive.google.com/file/d/1A4-STbNUL55KnVNzv54-ZST35IFPupZU/view?usp=share_link). Quality objectives are reviewed and approved on an annual basis. In 2020, the University underwent institutional accreditation by the NAAR and received the corresponding certificate for a period of 5 years.



The Strategic Plan for the development of SRU for 2018-2023 was approved in 2018. The Strategy reflects the key priorities for the University and also contains key performance indicators (KPIs) for different areas of the University's activities.

When selecting partner universities, universities paid special attention to the comparability of the quality of educational services provided in other higher education institutions. One of the main aspects in the selection of partners is the compliance of postgraduate education programs. The objectives of the joint OPs of the universities are in line with the objectives of the partners and the principles of the Bologna Process.

Universities are members of the Academic Integrity League. The Academic Integrity Policy of the universities aims to improve and enhance the quality of education at the university by promoting and implementing the ten fundamental principles of academic integrity.

### ***Analytical part***

During the visit the experts carried out a detailed analysis of the organization of education for compliance with the requirements of regulatory legal acts in the field of implementation of higher education in the Republic of Kazakhstan.

OP MBA 7M04104 - "Management in Healthcare" and EMBA 7M04105 - "Management in Healthcare" are included in the register of educational programs of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan from 24.12.2021 and 10.12.2021 respectively from KazNMU, further on April 28, 2022 and July 18, 2022 respectively from SDU. The OP passports approved by the experts of the National Registry are published on the portal of KazNMU and SDU. OP passports contain a description of each element of the program and learning outcomes.

In the Strategic Plan of the University in 2019, it was planned to open and register a number of graduate educational programs, including double-diploma programs, among them OP "7M04102-MBA Management in Healthcare" (2 years) and "7M04103-EMBA Management in Healthcare" (1 year).

Within the framework of the direction "Business and Management" in KazNMU in 2020, MBA and EMBA programs "Healthcare Management" were opened, with recommendations of NAAR experts on the need to create joint MA on MBA and EMBA. The analysis of international ratings of partner universities, qualitative composition of the teaching staff and a number of other quality indicators indicates the participation of leading universities in the implementation of the SOP. In February 2022, KazNMU and SRU concluded Memorandums of Cooperation No. 56-57/02.2022.

The Memorandum of Cooperation between the partner universities clearly outlines the conditions for the development, implementation of SOPs.

In 2022, joint OPs of KazNMU with SRU were launched with an enrollment of twenty (20) Master students.

EMBA 7M04105 - Healthcare Management and MBA 7M04104 - Healthcare Management educational program passports developed June 3, 2021 [https://drive.google.com/file/d/1B9KUw9pLftqcvmS8PddvOvPGLHR\\_SjPj/view?usp=share\\_link](https://drive.google.com/file/d/1B9KUw9pLftqcvmS8PddvOvPGLHR_SjPj/view?usp=share_link).

The implementation of educational programs is carried out in accordance with the Memorandum of Cooperation No. 57/02.2022 dated February 1 and No. 56/02.2022 dated February 1, 2022, academic calendar, schedule and other jointly developed documents.

KazNMU and SDU policy expresses the desire to implement the principles of the Bologna Process and comply with international ISO standards, accreditation standards, national and international rating criteria.

Within the framework of the mobility program of master's students, cooperation with the Bukhara State Medical Institute named after Abu Ali ibn Sino is planned.

### ***Strengths/best practices***

1. National and international recognition of both partner universities, leading or high positions of the universities in national and international rankings.

**VEC recommendations**

1. The SOP management to make changes in the policy of admission and selection of students in terms of clearly defining the criteria of initial academic, professional and competence level of students required for admission to MBA/EMBA educational programs (deadline - August 2023).
2. The SOP management to develop an action plan to expand academic mobility of students on MBA/EMBA programs, including in relation to universities teaching similar programs in English and to set target indicators (target indicators) for the implementation of the plan (deadline - by the end of 2023).

**EQC conclusions:(strong/satisfactory/predicting improvement/unsatisfactory)**

*strengths - 1,  
satisfactory - 7,  
suggests improvement - 2,  
unsatisfactory-0.*

**6.2. Standard "LEARNING RESULTS"****Evidentiary part**

OP "7M04104- MBA Healthcare Management" (2 years) and "7M04105- EMBA Healthcare Management" (1 year) are designed for healthcare executives and managers. The programs develop the general management abilities of entrepreneurs and managers to improve business and management skills.

The mission of the joint educational programs (EP) "7M04104-MBA Management in Healthcare" (2 years) and "7M04105-EMBA Management in Healthcare" (1 year) is to train managers who are able to comprehensively solve the problems of management and economics of healthcare, have skills in strategic development of medical business, including the use of IT-solutions.

The mission and goals of the OP are in line with the missions and goals of KazNMU and SDU and correspond to the main activities of the Strategic Development Plan of KazNMU and the Strategic Development Plan of SDU.

The mission of the OP corresponds to the requirements of the state standards of education, the needs of the state and the market, and is based on the study of problematic issues of theoretical and practical health care.

When developing the objectives of the educational program, the types and tasks of professional activity, which the student should receive and be able to demonstrate after mastering the educational program, are taken into account. The objectives of the program correspond to the needs of potential consumers (stakeholders).

**Analytical part**

The SOP is based on the possibility of interdisciplinary learning, which gives the opportunity to transform individual blocks in accordance with the structure of employers' requests for the formation of specific professional competencies, which contributes to the effective integration of undergraduates into the modern scientific and professional community.

The main objective of the OP MBA and EMBA is to prepare highly qualified, competitive health care managers with a high level of professional competence and research skills.

Within the framework of the SOP, economic, managerial disciplines of the professional module are studied, as well as the possibility of on-the-job training is provided.

OP, working curriculum and content of disciplines are developed in accordance with the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan from October 31, 2018 № 604 "On Approval of State Compulsory Standards of Education of all levels of education" (currently the State Compulsory Standard of Higher and Postgraduate Education, approved by the Order of the Minister of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan from July 20, 2022 № 2).

The educational program "7M04104 - MBA Management in Healthcare" includes disciplines on the formation of professional competencies - 58 credits (university component - 6 credits, elective component - 44 credits, industrial practice - 8 credits); disciplines on personal development and leadership skills - 20 credits; industrial practice, master's thesis and final certification.

The educational program "7M04105 - EMBA Management in Healthcare" includes disciplines for the formation of professional competencies - 20 credits (university component - 6 credits, elective component - 14 credits); disciplines for personal development and leadership skills - 10 credits; industrial practice, master's thesis or project and final certification.

The block of disciplines for the formation of professional competencies is aimed at the formation and understanding of scientific concepts and methods in the field of basic economic sciences, which are fundamental for the acquisition of managerial scientific knowledge and their application in professional activities. The block of disciplines of personal development and leadership formation is aimed at the formation of knowledge and skills necessary for solving key problems in the professional activity of a manager, decision-making skills based on modern principles of practice and science.

The distribution of disciplines between the universities was made according to the Memoranda of Cooperation.

Catalogs of elective disciplines with a list of disciplines, elective components, learning objectives, brief content and expected learning outcomes are available to provide an alternative choice of academic disciplines.

The realized experimental-research works of undergraduates are actual and contain scientific novelty and practical significance.

The SOP ensures the achievement of the planned learning outcomes of Master's students.

Professional competencies of graduates (final results of the educational program) are formed within the SOP. The correspondence of the content of academic disciplines and learning outcomes to the level of Master's degree is provided by partner universities in accordance with the State Educational Standards.

***Strengths/best practices***

No strengths have been identified for this standard

***VEC recommendations***

There are no recommendations for this standard

***EQC conclusions:(strong/satisfactory/predicting improvement/unsatisfactory)***

*strengths - 0,*

*satisfactory - 5,*

*suggests an improvement - 0,*

*unsatisfactory-0.*

***6.3. Standard "PROGRAM DEVELOPMENT AND APPROVAL"***

***Evidentiary part***

The structure and content of the joint OP Management in Healthcare is based on the student-centered approach (Master's students) in training.

The OP in KazNMU is developed in accordance with the Academic Policy, Regulations on Educational Programs of KazNMU <https://kaznmu.kz/rus/wp-content/uploads/2021/09/polozhenie-ob-obrazovatelnyh-programmah-kaznmu-im.-s.d.-asfendiyarova.pdf>, SOP "Evaluation and Analysis of Educational Programs of KazNMU"; in SDU - in accordance with the Guidelines for the development of OP of SDU.

Two HEIs have developed curricula, OP passports and forms for filling in the unified register (URMS) using the templates provided in the above-mentioned documents.

The educational program MBA 7M04104 Management in Healthcare and EMBA 7M04105 Management in Healthcare is based on the needs of the labor market and analysis of the existing infrastructure, the objectives of the OP are defined, competencies and learning outcomes corresponding to the descriptors are formed, normative legal acts, professional standards are studied, the curriculum of the program, the Passport of the OP, the working curriculum are developed and reviewed, and approved on the basis of a positive decision of the Academic Council of the two universities.

The content of the discipline in the formation of modules is structured into logically completed methodological blocks. Interdisciplinary connection is clearly traced in the syllabuses of academic disciplines and modules of the OP, made taking into account the mastering of prerequisites and post-requisites, as well as taking into account the specifics of the educational program. The presented modular OPs give an advantage in planning and implementation of individual learning trajectory.

Elective disciplines are defined in accordance with the direction of training and specialization of MBA and EMBA program for health care system. On the disciplines of the OP are developed syllabuses, which are considered jointly at the interdepartmental meeting, discussed and approved by the CPC KazNMU, the Department of Master's programs of SRU. The content of syllabuses is formed based on the final results of Master's degree programs. Disciplines of both university component and optional component are grouped into modules.

Joint OPs provide coverage of the required volume of workload. Duration of mastering the educational program of Master MBA is 2 years with the mastering of disciplines with a total volume of 120 credits, EMBA - 1 year, with the mastering of disciplines with a total volume of 60 credits (in accordance with the ranges of credits according to FQ-EHEA).

Master's degree training of the two programs is carried out within the framework of the general profile (generalmanager) and the corporate program. The implementation of the two programs is provided by the teaching staff with experience in scientific activity, as well as experience in management, business research and consulting, with the use of modern educational technologies.

#### ***Analytical part***

The academic year in the Master's program consists of academic periods - 2 semesters, lasting 15 weeks each, a period of interim certification/ final control, practices, final certification and vacations.

OPs are provided with RUPL, academic calendar and individual study plan. The RUPL and academic calendars are developed for the current academic year on the basis of the curriculum approved at the Academic Council meeting. To control the progress and compliance with the terms of writing a thesis or project work, each master's student develops an "Individual Master's Work Plan", where the student keeps records throughout the learning process as it is completed.

Planned topics of master's thesis on OP "7M04104 - MBA Management in Healthcare" (2 years) and projects on OP "7M04105 - EMBA Management in Healthcare" (1 year) were discussed with master's students in the course of essay writing and interview to determine the scientific interests of the entrants.

The topics of dissertation works/projects and scientific supervisors of master's students were successively approved at the departmental meeting, the meeting of the Scientific Commission at the meeting of the Scientific Council and finally approved by the Academic Council. Specially for the reporting OPs of MBA and EMBA the Scientific Commission for Business and Management was created, the functions of which include provision and support of research activities of master's students studying at MBA/EMBA programs: [https://docs.google.com/document/d/1SMKUHorsOoF6Wnvwjoc7Uk1af2uA52d/edit?usp=share\\_link&oid=117923579182330104541&rtpof=true&sd=true](https://docs.google.com/document/d/1SMKUHorsOoF6Wnvwjoc7Uk1af2uA52d/edit?usp=share_link&oid=117923579182330104541&rtpof=true&sd=true), taking into account the peculiarities of the direction "Business and Management" and qualification "Master of Business Administration".

Masters students are assigned two supervisors from two universities: with economic and medical (health care organization) backgrounds for a full study in both business and health care.



New forms and methods of teaching are used during the implementation of the program: multimedia lectures, problem lectures, case-based learning, including case studies, team-oriented learning, including work in small groups, role-playing, business games, use of problem and situational tasks in practical classes, e-learning.

Practice of Master students in higher education institutions is an important part of training. During the research practice Master students fill out practice diaries. At the end of practice at each base master students receive an assessment for the practice, with an assessment in the diary signed by the head of practice at this base.

Bases of practice provide master students with the necessary conditions for the implementation of the practice program, and have material and technical base, providing all types of theoretical and practical training provided by the curriculum.

Universities organize and conduct the practice of Master's students in accordance with the approved regulations, Rectors' orders on sending them to practice and the practice program drawn up jointly with the practice supervisor.

Bases of research practice in 2022-2023 academic year are planned RCHD, Health Department, KazNII Oncology and Radiology, Research Institute of Eye Diseases and other medical organizations (Emergency Emergency Hospital, SCP "Aksai Hospital NMU", city polyclinics).

During the year, meetings of vice-rectors and deans with students are organized, rectors' blogs, telephone numbers and trust boxes are functioning. Master's students can verbally or in writing to the department, dean's office, the Department of Master's and Doctoral Studies on the quality of the program and the implementation of the curriculum.

Regularly carried out assessment of the OP, monitoring and control of the achievements of the final learning outcomes aimed at continuous improvement of the quality of educational services provided at the University.

When it is necessary to update or restructure the OP and the content of elective disciplines, modern needs of society, priorities of the national health care system, medical science and education will be taken into account.

For the period of the State Attestation of Master students a special commission is created, the chairman of which is appointed a person from an external organization for the purpose of independent objective assessment of the OP and further taking into account the opinions and comments of the members of the commission in the revision of the OP.

***Strengths/best practices***

No strengths have been identified for this standard

***VEC recommendations***

There are no recommendations under this standard

***EQC conclusions:(strong/satisfactory/predicting improvement/unsatisfactory)***

*strengths - 0,*

*satisfactory - 5,*

*suggests an improvement - 0,*

*unsatisfactory-0.*

***6.4. Standard "ADMISSION, SUCCESS, RECOGNITION AND CERTIFICATION of Learners"***

***Evidentiary part***

The procedure for admission of students and relevant requirements for applicants are defined and presented in the Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan from October 31, 2018 № 600 "On approval of the Model Rules of admission to training in educational organizations implementing educational programs of higher and

postgraduate education", KazNMU Admission Rules, Memorandum and Academic Policy and published on the websites of KazNMU and SDU.

KazNMU and SRU Universities adhere to the admission policy for the MBA/EMBA Master's program "Management in Healthcare" aimed at selecting the best candidates for the Master's program in accordance with the legal requirements. The policy and criteria for admission to the Master's program are consistent with the mission and outcomes of the two OPs.

The criterion of the previous level of education for admission to MBA and EMBA OPs is higher education, EMBA OPs require at least 3 years of managerial experience.

KazNMU and SDU have defined the mechanisms of career guidance work aimed at selecting applicants for Master's degree programs in MBA/EMBA "Management in Healthcare". Information about the beginning of the admission committee is available on the website and social networks of KazNMU and SDU <https://www.instagram.com/reel/CgthjJ1ARk9/?igshid=MDJmNzVkMjY=>.

### ***Analytical part***

For acceptance of documents and organization of entrance examinations at the University an admission committee is created under the chairmanship of the Rector of the University, which includes representatives from KazNMU and SDU. The rules and procedures of the appeal process at the University are described in the Rules of Admission to Doctoral (PhD) and Master's programs. The EEC notes that the information on the SOP in terms of criteria and procedure for selection of students is incomplete, clear criteria were not confirmed during a number of interviews with focus groups.

The policy of admission of students with disabilities to the Master's program is conducted in accordance with the current laws and regulations of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Academic Policy of universities.

The entire contingent of students and information on the movement of students during the academic year is entered and processed on the UniPort portal of the SDU.

The process of training on MBA/EMBA is carried out on the basis of the Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan from April 20, 2011 152 "On approval of the Rules of organization of educational process on credit technology of training", internal regulatory documents of universities KazNMU and SDU. On all issues related to expulsion, transfer, reinstatement, consultations are provided in the Student Service Center.

In accordance with the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan from March 30, 2012 № 390 "On approval of the Rules of sending a specialist to work, granting the right of self-employment, exemption from the obligation or termination of the obligation to work by citizens who studied on the basis of the state educational order", master's students are granted the right of self-employment.

According to the *Lisbon Convention* on the Recognition of Qualifications, universities operate on the basis of the "Rules for the Recognition of Learning Achievements of Adults through Non-formal Education Provided by Organizations on the List of Recognized Organizations Providing Non-formal Education" and define the policy of recognition of learning outcomes obtained by students and are a mandatory element of educational activities.

Diploma on awarding the degree of Master of Business Administration shall be issued in accordance with the procedure established by the Memorandum to the graduate who has passed the final state attestation in accordance with the established procedure.

### ***Strengths/best practices***

No strengths have been identified for this standard

### ***VEC recommendations***

1. To the management of SOP to objectify and formalize the criteria and system of evaluation of entrance exam results (deadline - August 2023).

***EQC conclusions:(strong/satisfactory/predicting improvement/unsatisfactory)***



*strengths - 0,  
satisfactory - 2,  
suggests an improvement - 1, unsatisfactory-0.*

### **6.5. Standard "STUDENT-CENTERED LEARNING, TEACHING AND ASSESSMENT OF LEARNING"**

#### ***Evidentiary part***

The implementation of MBA "7M04104 - "Management in Health Care" and EMBA "7M04105 - "Management in Health Care" is aimed at taking into account the interests of students and acts as a student-centered, in this regard, the teaching staff of the departments uses various innovative teaching methods and business training to stimulate students to play an active role in the learning process, which is the main principle of student-centered learning.

All faculty members and students of the University are assigned their own virtual office in AIS "SIRIUS" <https://sirius.kaznmu.kz/>, each employee or student has his/her own identification code (login and password).

Universities provide university library and Internet library for self-education of students. The availability of access to information and library resources ("Elsevier", "Springer", Cochrane Library, "Thomson Reuters", "BookUp", etc.) allows to expand the opportunities for self-education of undergraduates.

In order to provide each university student with access to regulatory and legal information of state bodies, universities actively use information resources <http://adilet.zan.kz/>, educational websites of universities <https://kaznmu.edu.kz/>, <https://sdu.edu.kz/>.

In universities, including within the framework of this OP, the "Program of trilingual education" is implemented, which is based on the provisions of the Law of RK "On Education" from July 27, 2007 N 319-III ZRC and the Law "On languages in the Republic of Kazakhstan" from 11.07.1997 N 151-I, assuming a gradual development of trilingual education in the university among both students and faculty.

In the educational process to assess the learning achievements of students, a group of independent experts, a group of test-takers, a Working Group on the introduction of innovative teaching methods in the educational process of KazNMU were created.

The methods and forms of assessment for each discipline are specified in the discipline syllabuses.

The lists of examiners and examination committees are formed by the head of the department from among the teachers having qualifications corresponding to the profile of the given academic discipline.

Classes for master's students are conducted by applying innovative methods such as cumulative project-based learning, case studies, demonstration-turned-learning, business games, and project defense. The methodology of conducting online classes, conducting end-of-term controls and taking exams is actively used. Several information systems are used, including Moodle and TEAMS - modular object-oriented dynamic learning environments. Through Moodle and TEAMS the teacher can create courses with content in the form of texts, auxiliary files, presentations, questionnaires, etc. The use of these information systems gives master students the opportunity to exercise their autonomy in the learning process. Thus, the technical capabilities of multimedia technologies are actively used in the implementation of the OP in order to improve the effectiveness of learning.

#### ***Analytical part***

Guest lectures by both foreign professors and Kazakhstani management practitioners are held regularly.

The University has a system of monitoring the quality of students' knowledge, the results of current control, interim, final attestation of students' knowledge, evaluation of master's theses.

At the beginning of the academic year, the department draws up a plan of open classes and a schedule of mutual visits to classes. The system of open classes, supervisory visits and mutual visits is carried out in accordance with the current plans and is aimed at monitoring the activities of teaching staff implementing the program by assessing the competence of teachers, comprehensive assessment of the quality of teaching, including through questionnaires to students.

For the functioning of the feedback system, including the operational presentation of information about the results of the assessment of students' knowledge is provided the possibility of using the electronic educational system "SIRIUS", which students can use to obtain information about the results of the assessment of their knowledge.

Objectivity of students' knowledge assessment and adequacy of tools and mechanisms of their assessment is implemented in accordance with the normative documents on the organization of credit technology of education in universities and functional capabilities of "SIRIUS" in KazNMU, PMS in SDU. With the help of proctoring program the objectivity of students' knowledge assessment is provided for the period of examination session (interim certification). The universities have an appeal procedure.

The final stage of training is the state final certification, aimed at verifying the knowledge, skills, skills and competence acquired by students in the process of mastering the relevant specialty and determining the professional competence of the graduate.

Professional development of teaching staff is carried out in various directions: "Distance learning", "Academic leadership", "Innovative educational technologies", etc.

***Strengths/best practices***

No strengths have been identified for this standard

***VEC recommendations***

There are no recommendations for this standard

***EQC conclusions:(strong/satisfactory/predicting improvement/unsatisfactory)***

*strengths - 0,*

*satisfactory - 5,*

*suggests an improvement - 0,*

*unsatisfactory-0.*

***6.6. Standard "SUPPORT FOR LEARNERS"***

***Evidentiary part***

Joint MBA/EMBA educational programs are designed for on-the-job training. For the convenience of working learners, all classes are held in the daytime and evening, with the evening period prevailing. Academic counseling processes are provided upon enrollment and throughout the entire training process, as well as the work of an envisioner service.

For newly arrived students on joint educational programs MBA 7M04104 and EMBA 7M04105 provided an introductory adaptation program, which, depending on the current situation can be implemented both offline and online (through Instagram, Webex and live broadcast YouTube). Within the framework of this program, acquaintance with the management and departments of KazNMU and SDU, the structure and academic policy of both educational institutions, program coordinators and editors of students is carried out.

For each student on joint educational programs MBA 7M04104 and EMBA 7M04105 a Personal Account is created. In the Personal Account each student is provided with continuous access to all necessary information resources, electronic services and services, including learning achievements during the entire period of study, to the learning logs, to educational and methodological materials, to the service of familiarization with local regulations; the possibility

of electronic applications for various types of certificates, applications for participation in competitions, grants, etc. is provided.

In KazNMU and SDU for students there is Helpdesk - single contact points within the Universities to service internal technical requests of users of all levels.

A specialized center of psychological support for students functions in the SDU. In KazNMU students who are in a state of psychological choice or in a difficult life situation can apply for online support.

Opportunities and accessibility of education on joint educational programs MBA 7M04104 / EMBA 7M04105 for students with disabilities are implemented according to the "Regulations on the organization of inclusive education in KazNMU" and "Policy of Equality, Diversity and Inclusion of SRU". In order to raise awareness about inclusion and equal opportunities policy, various seminars were held for staff and faculty with the participation of international consultant on higher education Sophia Butt. KazNMU department staff also underwent additional training on the program of additional professional education "Organizational and managerial foundations of inclusive education at the university".

Conditions for students with disabilities, such as the availability of ramps, elevators, special restrooms in accordance with the general norms of the Law "On Social Protection of Disabled Persons in the Republic of Kazakhstan" are provided in SDU and KazNMU.

To implement the rights and legitimate interests of students and employees of the educational organization in KazNMU introduced and implemented "Anti-corruption standard", approved in 2021.

#### ***Analytical part***

KazNMU and SDU provide comprehensive support to students on joint educational programs MBA 7M04104 and EMBA 7M04105 during the entire period of study in the form of continuous consulting, technical and information support.

The implemented policies and standards define the basic principles in academic activities in the form of providing equal opportunities for all learners to receive quality and accessible education; providing academic freedom to learners in choosing elective disciplines and tracking their own progress on the e-learning portal.

Anti-corruption and academic integrity standards are observed, including intolerance to any form of corruption and discrimination; ensuring transparency and accessibility of information for stakeholders, which contributes to the achievement of planned learning outcomes.

Established systems of psychological support for students help to improve the psychological well-being of students and staff of the university, providing a safe and caring environment in which all parties to the educational process can access professional psychological counseling services.

KazNMU and SDU create for students on joint educational programs inclusive environment for all students and takes into account the needs of different groups of citizens. Universities guarantee the possibility of mastering this educational program by persons with disabilities.

Students on joint educational programs are involved in the process of evaluation of the educational program and conditions of its implementation. Comments and suggestions of students on the organization of the educational process, the program of study of elective disciplines, the library fund and other issues related directly to the learning process are taken into account.

#### ***Strengths/best practices***

No strengths were identified for this standard.

#### ***VEC recommendations***

There are no recommendations for this standard.

***EQC conclusions:(strong/satisfactory/predicting improvement/unsatisfactory)***  
*strengths - 0,*

*satisfactory - 4,  
suggests an improvement - 0,  
unsatisfactory-0.*

### 6.7. Standard "RESOURCES"

#### **Evidentiary part**

The teaching staff involved in the implementation of joint educational programs of MBA and EMBA refers to the H. Dosmukhamedov School of Public Health of KazNMU and the School of Business of SRU. The faculty members involved in the implementation of joint MBA and EMBA programs belong to the Kh.Dosmukhamedov School of Public Health of KazNMU and the School of Business of SRU.

The teaching staff of the School of Public Health is represented by 115 employees, including 1 academician, 5 doctors of sciences, 25 candidates of sciences, 12 PhDs, 54 masters. Seniority of teachers is 46%, 14% of faculty has non-zero h-index. For the last year teachers of the School of Public Health of KazNMU carried out 5 scientific/research programs and projects, published 19 articles indexed in Web of Science, Scopus bases

SRU Business School is represented by 45 units of full-time teaching staff, including 1 Doctor of Science, 3 Candidates of Science, 13 PhDs, 28 Master's students. In 2022, more than half of the staff participated in research projects. In the journals indexed in the international databases Scopus and Web of Science, 92 and 60 scientific papers have been published by SDU employees, respectively. In addition, the scientific department of SRU publishes 4 scientific journals.

In order to train highly specialized specialists in public health and medical management, exchange of international experience and information were invited visiting professors: Azizi Bin Ayob and Vishna Devi Nadarajah - Malaysia, Jack Alan De Hovitz - USA, Knyazev E.G. - Russian Federation, Vytenis Kalibatas - Lithuania, Jusupov K.O. - Kyrgyzstan. In turn, within the framework of academic mobility programs, the teaching staff of KazNMU and SDU, implementing joint educational programs, made trips to the Tashkent Medical Academy (Uzbekistan), International Higher School of Medicine (Bishkek, Kyrgyzstan), University of Milan (Italy), Bukhara State Medical Institute (Uzbekistan), Tajik State Medical University, Medical University of Sofia (Bulgaria), Charite University (Germany).

Decision making in the formation of university staff is ensured by the "Recruitment Rules" under which competition for vacant posts is announced.

Qualification requirements for faculty members, job duties, rights and responsibilities are set out in the "Department Regulations", "Job descriptions of department/module staff". Time regulations for each type of activity of teachers are established in accordance with the Labor Contract, which is concluded with each employee individually.

Teachers carry out educational, scientific and organizational-educational work. Time standards for calculation of hours of pedagogical load is guided by the Law of RK July 27, 2007 № 319-III "On Education"; GOSO RK № 2 "Teaching work and pedagogical load". Calculation of pedagogical load of teaching staff KazNMU is made according to SOP "Time standards for planning and accounting of teaching load of teaching staff". Calculation of pedagogical load of teaching staff of SDU is regulated according to the "Regulations on planning of pedagogical load of SDU teaching staff".

To improve the level of practical skills of students in the educational process universities attract representatives of the practical level on a contractual basis, as well as guest lecturers

Universities provide employees with professional training, retraining and professional development. Teachers of KazNMU and SRU, implementing MBA and EMBA programs, underwent training and internship in the following foreign universities: Peter the Great St. Petersburg Polytechnic University, The Korea Institute for International Economic Policy, University of Surrey, Israel's Agency for International Development Cooperation Ministry of Foreign Affairs, University of Jyväskylä, University Kebangsaan Malaysia, Rwthachen



University, University of Utrecht, Medical University of Sofia and others. KazNMU conducts regular attestation of teaching staff in accordance with the "Rules of attestation of teaching staff of NAO Kazakh National Medical University named after S.D. Asfen. S.D. Asfendiyarov"; coefficients and additional payments to salary are assigned according to the results of attestation. The system of motivation and stimulation of employees according to the "Regulations on the grading of positions of teaching staff of SRU" is also implemented in SRU.

KazNMU and SRU implement joint research by teachers of both educational organizations. Currently, MBA students are involved in the project of SRU (which also involves faculty and doctoral students of KazNMU) "Integration of children with autism spectrum disorder in the socio-educational environment on the basis of comprehensive support: challenges and benefits". Also EMBA students participate in the Project "Development of technology to assess the effectiveness of the health care system in the intersectoral context and its impact in the context of regions".

The application of innovative technologies in the educational process of the university is regulated by the "Regulations on the working group for the introduction of innovative and active teaching methods"

The University has signed cooperation agreements with medical organizations: Subsidiary organizations - 5, hospitals - 52, PHC - 52, UC - 4, NTs, research institutes - 9, Republican - 3, Oblast - 3, Inpatient organizations - 29, Maternity hospitals - 4, TB organizations - 2, PHC organizations - 30, Private ICs, LLPs - 26, Central district hospitals - 2, Other medical organizations - 1, located in Almaty city, Almaty oblast and 8 regions of RK.

KazNMU has a scientific library, providing full and prompt library and information-bibliographic service to students, researchers, faculty and other categories of readers of the university in accordance with information requests on the basis of wide access to any funds area of 6386 square meters, including the area of library premises - 5 396 square meters, the area of book storage - 902 square meters.

In the Scientific Library for the work of undergraduates there are: 50 monoblocks, 40 computers, 41 notebooks, 2 video projectors, 3 screens for various events, multiplying and copying equipment - 1 scanner-semi-automatic, 2 scanners for digitizing documents, 15 printers.

The computer equipment is constantly being updated and replenished. In 2023, 46 monoblocks, 13 laptops, 5 MFPs were purchased for the School of Public Health, from which the computer equipment of the implemented educational programs MBA/EMBA was replenished. Under the project "Licence, Master professionnels en formation ouverte et à distance pour le management stratégique de la qualité et la gestion des risques en santé en Russie, au Kazakhstan et en Azerbaïdjan - LMQS" Erasmus+ no. 618860-EPP-1-2020-1-EL-EPPKA2-CBHE-JP, where the funds for the purchase of a mobile studio (computers, microphones and cameras) are provided for the participation of faculty members of the Department of Health Policy and Management.

Distance learning portal LMS Moodle is integrated with the information system of KazNMU AIS Sirius, with products MS Office 365 (MS Teams), ZOOM and online proctoring system (AERO), anti-plagiarism systems Turnitin, Strike Plagiarism, with the electronic library of KazNMU.

### ***Analytical part***

The teaching staff of the departments implementing joint educational programs of MBA and EMBA consists of highly qualified, retired employees with scientific achievements, who are recognized experts in their field, including international class experts. Involvement of leading professors of the two universities in the teaching of expert joint educational programs allows to implement a modern innovative educational program and potentially achieve high final results of education, solving the difficult for medical education problem of combining the competencies of medical management, business management and strategic business planning. The available mechanisms and resources aimed at solving this problem are the strong point of these joint educational programs.

For example, among the faculty members of the Economics and Business Department of SRU, 40% of them received their education abroad in such universities as Ecole Supérieure de la Recherche Commerciale de France, University of Bonn in Germany, Istanbul University, University of Essex and University of Leeds in Great Britain, University of Putra in Malaysia, etc. In order to stimulate the teaching staff to constantly improve the level of English language proficiency, there is a system of salary increment from 15000 to 90000 tg. for SDU teaching staff who have a certificate confirming the level of English language proficiency (IELTS, TOEFL).

When considering candidates, the decision to assign specific disciplines to them is based on their professional experience, field of professional activity, teaching experience, and professional certifications.

There are differences between the requirements for teaching staff occupying positions of different qualification levels and administrative positions, which is reflected in job descriptions and in the scope of teaching, scientific, educational, administrative and social work. The level of labor remuneration is determined in accordance with qualification, complexity of labor, quantity and quality of work performed, as well as working conditions

Time standards for planning the teaching load of teaching staff allow to maintain a balance between the different spheres of teachers' activities and the ratio of their volumes (teaching, research, practical on the profile of the discipline, etc.). The organization of educational activity is carried out through the planning of the educational process and the content of education, the choice of ways to conduct them. The structure of the content of education is determined in accordance with the established requirements for accounting and measuring tools of education: curricula and programs, the volume of academic load, the duration of academic periods, types of academic classes, the volume of educational material on the basis of the State Educational Standards. The teaching staff is formed on the basis of the needs for effective implementation of educational programs, as well as on the basis of the total volume of academic load. Based on the results of teaching quality assessment, as well as the results of questionnaire survey of undergraduates, the University determines the necessary areas of development and professional development of the teaching staff.

It is also necessary to emphasize the progressively developing processes of digital transformation of higher education institutions, transferring the interaction with consumers of services (learners, public authorities and their systems, patients, partners, etc.) and key services into a fully digital format. Particularly positive attention is drawn to the significant role given to the processes of digitalization and digital transformation in the training of MBA and EMBA programs. Trainees in joint programs have access not only to the digital environment of the two universities, but they are also provided with opportunities to master and work directly in various information systems of different levels, including national, and covering both public and private systems of health care, health insurance, statistical accounting, financial planning, etc., and this training is not theoretical and abstract, but on the example of specific best practices of medical institutions and systems that

Determination of financial and economic policy of KazNMU and management structure of the university is the responsibility of the first head of the university - rector. To conduct financial issues in KazNMU the position of financial director is created, powers and duties are defined. Formation of contingent of Master students of MBA, EMBA is carried out only on the basis of payment of tuition at the expense of own funds of citizens or other sources. In KazNMU the definition of the main priorities of spending money is approved by the highest collegial bodies of the University - the Supervisory Board. Financial activity of the university is also quarterly reviewed at the meeting of the Supervisory Board.

### ***Strengths/best practices***

1. High level of profile education, recognition as National and international experts, experience in implementing international educational programs, high degree of international academic mobility and international internships of the teaching staff implementing joint MBA/EMBA educational programs.



2. Significant degree of digitalization of the joint educational program, including ensuring access and mastering by students of various medical information, management and financial and economic digital solutions, which, along with the previous point, potentially allows in the course of MBA/EMBA programs to form complex competencies combining competencies of medical management, business management and strategic business planning.

***VEC recommendations***

There are no recommendations for this standard.

***EQC conclusions:(strong/satisfactory/predicting improvement/unsatisfactory)***

*strengths - 2,*

*satisfactory - 5,*

*suggests an improvement - 0,*

*unsatisfactory-0.*

***6.8. Standard "PROSPECTIVITY AND DOCUMENTATION"***

***Evidentiary part***

Information about the implemented educational programs, including MBA and EMBA programs is presented on the official websites of KazNMU and SDU.

On the platform of AIS Sirius for students downloaded syllabuses, teaching materials, available logs of progress. For the development of communication skills, the ability to engage in publishing activities in Sirius KazNMU library with sections of the electronic catalog is placed.

Internal regulatory documents governing the academic process are posted on the University's internal website [pms.sdu.edu.kz](http://pms.sdu.edu.kz), which can be accessed by all employees, teachers and students through login and password of personal e-mail box in the corporate mail system.

Work with the applications of students is centralized. Received applications are sent for consideration of responsible departments or officials with control of terms and completeness of the decision of the request. The University has a system of informing all applicants, faculty and staff by means of electronic mailings, which are sent to corporate mail. Also the system of informing operates through the official website of the University, official accounts (Instagram, Facebook, Telegram), posting announcements and information on the stands.

KazNMU and SDU have automated systems for collecting and processing information on educational and scientific activities AIS BMPDMS and Moodle. To ensure the protection of information, all teachers and students have individual logins and passwords.

A number of planned activities are carried out to assist in employment, which include: master classes and workshops with potential employers, seminars and guest lectures from leading experts for graduate students on proper resume writing and networking

Class attendance control is automated and centralized in the system [pms.sdu.edu.kz](http://pms.sdu.edu.kz). Electronic attendance for each discipline is used at all classes to record attendance in accordance with the schedule, which allows to control the fulfillment by students of the standards of Academic Policy in relation to the academic discipline and fulfillment of teaching load by teachers in accordance with the curriculum.

Students and teaching staff, employers are involved in the processes of collecting and analyzing information through questionnaires, interviewing and making decisions on their basis. The practice of personal meetings of the heads of educational programs and administration with students and teachers is also used.

***Analytical part***

The official websites of KazNMU and SDU contain basic information about the implemented SOPs. At the same time, it should be noted that in terms of description of the specific content of these programs, conditions of their implementation, features of the admission

policy and principles, positioning of the target audience of these educational programs, specific principles and methods of training, learning outcomes and motivational characteristics, this information is of general introductory nature, and/or the data and description given differ on the websites of the two universities implementing SOPs.

Universities have developed the Regulations on documentation management, which establishes the structure, composition, unified procedure for the development, coordination, approval, accounting, distribution, storage, change of documentation and organization of document flow of the quality management system, as well as determines the responsible executors for the management of documentation.

Information management processes are in place, including a variety of methods for collecting and analyzing information, which are among the most important resources of the business.

The system of informing stakeholders includes the work of external and internal websites, accounts of universities and individual departments in social networks, corporate e-mail of students, teachers and university employees. The strategy of informing the public through the University website, social networks, based on the principle of transparency of activities, as well as information on employment opportunities for graduates is consistently implemented.

Within the framework of the joint educational program, both universities have implemented an effective system of electronic document flow, the participants of which are all parties of the educational process.

Learners participate in the evaluation of the curriculum structure through an anonymous questionnaire, assessing the educational value of the course in terms of the relevance of the course to the relevance of business education.

#### ***Strengths/best practices***

No strengths have been identified for this standard

#### ***VEC recommendations***

1. The SOP management should analyze and supplement the information on SOPs on the websites of KazNMU and SDU in terms of the specific content of these programs, conditions of their implementation, specifics of the admission policy and principles, positioning of the target audience of these educational programs, applied learning methods, final learning outcomes, as well as unify the scope and content of information on SOPs posted on the websites of the two universities (deadline - by the end of 2023).

#### ***EQC conclusions:(strong/satisfactory/predicting improvement/unsatisfactory)***

*strengths - 0,*

*satisfactory - 9,*

*suggests an improvement - 1,*

*unsatisfactory-0.*

### ***6.9. Standard "QUALITY ASSURANCE"***

KazNMU and SDU approved the Academic Policy for Quality Assurance, which is part of strategic management. The policy is intended for students, faculty, managers and employees of structural units of the University, as well as all interested parties.

A quality management system has been introduced to improve performance results and provide a solid basis for sustainable development-oriented initiatives. The developed Standards of internal quality assurance define the quality policy, which is aimed at ensuring the principle of openness and transparency of the educational process, opportunities for dialog between its participants and receiving "feedback" from them. The main principles of quality assurance are the

promotion of academic integrity and academic freedom, compliance of activities with legislative and regulatory requirements and ESG recommendations.

The quality management system is constantly improving through the revision of policies, objectives, guidelines in the field of quality, documented procedures, regulations on units and collegial bodies, criteria for assessing the effectiveness of processes, the introduction of new and removal of irrelevant quality procedures. The work is carried out to ensure the revision of the content of curricula and training programs, taking into account changes in the market, the wishes of students and teachers and involving in decision-making representatives of employers, students, teachers and stakeholders who are members of the Advisory Board, whose activities are regulated by the internal regulations of the Advisory Board.

### ***Analytical part***

Quality management in the framework of jointly implemented educational programs is based on the process approach, strategic and operational planning, implementation and control of management decisions and their analysis. The main characteristics of the quality culture are effective organizational culture, orienting the team to the result; participation of team members in the management of the university; high motivation of teachers and staff; compliance with the norms and principles of corporate ethics; high academic reputation of the university; well-thought-out social policy in relation to the teaching staff and students; high quality standards in education and research; favorable internal environment for the implementation of intellectual and scientific research; high quality of education and research; high quality of education and research; and a favorable internal environment for the implementation of intellectual and scientific research.

The quality culture is based on the principles of mutual respect and partnership, mutual compliance with obligations on the part of the management, teachers, students, which is facilitated by the adopted policy of dispute resolution.

In order to study the needs and opinions about the quality of graduate training, a questionnaire survey of representatives of all stakeholders (students and employers) is conducted. At the same time, it should be noted that the policy and implementation of joint (with the participation of both Universities) internal quality assurance processes of joint educational programs is not obvious. The process of forming a joint quality policy, the elements of which can be targeted to the jointly implemented educational program, is insufficient. Unobvious, including in connection with the above, is the formation of the policy, its implementation and control, taking into account the possible interest and peculiarities of each of the two partner universities.

### ***Strengths/best practices***

There are no strengths under this standard

### ***VEC recommendations***

2. The JOP management should harmonize certain processes and indicators of the quality management system of the mentioned programs in terms of mutual (on the part of partner universities) evaluation of jointly implemented educational programs, their concept and content, including those that take into account possible interests and peculiarities of each of the partner universities (deadline - by the end of 2023).

### ***EQC conclusions:(strong/satisfactory/predicting improvement/unsatisfactory)***

*strengths - 0,*

*satisfactory - 8,*

*suggests an improvement - 1,*

*unsatisfactory-0.*

### *6.10. Standard "Ongoing MONITORING AND PERIODIC EVALUATION OF THE JOINT EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM"*

#### ***Evidentiary part***

The University regularly conducts a survey, collects, analyzes and uses the received data from stakeholders about the educational program. Students are involved in the process of evaluation of educational programs by expressing their opinions and wishes at the end of the course of study or mastering a particular discipline or by anonymous questionnaires to identify opinions and take into account comments, suggestions of direct consumers.

The process of monitoring and evaluation of the educational program is regulated by the SOP "Procedure and forms of feedback". Participants of the educational process can express their opinion by means of questionnaires and interviews. The questionnaire "The teacher through the eyes of the student", questionnaires, including questions about the expectations and actually obtained competencies of graduate students, the environment of the educational program, the availability of information resources and conditions, the results of the analysis of the contents of the trust boxes reflect the mechanisms of participation of students and faculty in the monitoring of the program. Information about the results of the questionnaire is communicated to the faculty at the meetings of the department.

Changes in the developed educational programs are made as necessary in accordance with the requirements of legislative and regulatory documents of the Republic of Kazakhstan in the field of higher professional education, modern needs of society development and labor market. The results of these processes are aimed at continuous improvement of educational programs. In addition, new elective disciplines reflecting the current state of the economy are periodically included.

#### ***Analytical part***

Partner HEIs attach great importance to the development of stakeholder feedback in order to study the requirements, expectations and satisfaction of the main stakeholders with the quality of educational services. Feedback from employers and other stakeholders is monitored and is the basis for revising the goals, objectives and activities of the university and the content of joint educational programs.

The main indicators of functioning of the renewal processes are monitored in the process of internal audits. The content of both compulsory and elective disciplines is adjusted annually. Elements of educational programs are regularly revised taking into account changes in the external environment and labor market requirements. The adjustments made take into account changes in the labor market, reflect the interests of the employer, and together with all types of practices are aimed at preparing for professional activity.

The opinion of all stakeholders (including students, teachers, employers) regarding the structure and quality of joint educational programs, as well as the conditions of its implementation is regularly studied (mainly through questionnaires). At the same time, according to the results of the questionnaires and interviewing conducted during the EEC visit, there is insufficient awareness of stakeholders-participants of these surveys about the results of the questionnaire, as well as about the decisions taken by the management, specific corrective and anticipatory actions, changes introduced or proposed, or, on the contrary, about the decision on the inexpediency of any actions (changes) in relation to a particular issue appearing in the feedback forms. In a number of cases, the awareness of stakeholders about the results of consideration of their feedback is of a point character. Participants of the questionnaire processes express clear confidence that their opinion is brought to the heads of educational programs and HEI administration, but they cannot always indicate exactly what specific points were taken (or not taken) into account and what specific actions were taken based on the results of the analysis.

#### ***Strengths/best practices***

There are no strengths under this standard



**VEC recommendations**

1. To the management of DIS to develop and implement an accessible system of regular informing of all stakeholders-participants of joint MBA/EMBA educational programs about the results of analysis of feedback forms, the main identified problems, decisions taken, specific corrective actions and terms of their implementation (deadline - by the end of 2023).

**EQC conclusions:(strong/satisfactory/predicting improvement/unsatisfactory)**

*strengths - 0,*

*satisfactory - 3,*

*suggests an improvement - 1,unsatisfactory-0.*

**6.11. Standard "PERIODICAL EXTERNAL QUALITY ASSURANCE PROCEDURES"****Evidentiary part**

The processes of monitoring and evaluation of the joint educational program in the partner universities are carried out not only through the internal quality monitoring system, but also through periodic passing through the procedures of external quality assessment of educational programs.

In order to strengthen the position and recognition of Kazakhstani education in the world, increase its image and recognition, KazNMU and SDU constantly participate in ratings, improving quality assurance systems, including through participation in academic ratings of universities and educational programs conducted by recognized national and foreign international agencies.

**Analytical part**

According to the results of the National Rating of the best universities of Kazakhstan - 2019, conducted by the Independent Agency for Quality Assurance in Education (IAQA), KazNMU took the 1st place in the institutional rating in the category of medical universities. In the rating of websites of Kazakhstani universities, the website of KazNMU took 10th place among 116 universities of Kazakhstan, in the QS World University Rankings 2023 ranking takes the place 651-700.

In the National Rating of the best medical universities of Kazakhstan KazNMU in 2017, 2018, 2020 and 2022 took the 1st place.

In the National Ranking of the best multi-disciplinary universities in Kazakhstan, conducted by the Independent Agency for Quality Assurance in Education (IAQA), SDU moved up from 14th place in 2017 to 7th place in 2020, thus improving its position 2-fold.

In the QS Emerging Europe & Central Asia University Ranking, SRU will be ranked 351-400 in 2022.

**Strengths/best practices**

There are no strengths under this standard

**VEC recommendations**

There are no VEC recommendations on this standard

**EQC conclusions:(strong/satisfactory/predicting improvement/unsatisfactory)**

*strengths - 0,*

*satisfactory - 2,*

*suggests an improvement - 0,*

*unsatisfactory-0.*

## **(VII) REVIEW OF STRENGTHS / BEST PRACTICES FOR EACH STANDARD**

### *7.1 Standard "RIGHT TO PARTICIPATE (ACCEPTANCE)"*

1. National and international recognition of both partner universities, leading or high positions of the universities in national and international rankings.

### *7.2 Standard "LEARNING RESULTS"*

No strengths have been identified for this standard

### *7.3 Standard "PROGRAM DEVELOPMENT AND APPROVAL"*

No strengths have been identified for this standard

### *7.4 Standard "Admission, Success, Recognition and CERTIFICATION of Learners"*

No strengths have been identified for this standard

### *7.5. Standard "STUDENT-CENTERED LEARNING, TEACHING AND ASSESSMENT OF LEARNING"*

No strengths have been identified for this standard

### *7.6. Standard "Support for Learners"*

No strengths were identified for this standard.

### *7.7. Standard "RESOURCES"*

1. High level of profile education, recognition as National and international experts, experience in implementing international educational programs, high degree of international academic mobility and international internships of the teaching staff implementing joint MBA/EMBA educational programs.

2. Significant degree of digitalization of the joint educational program, including ensuring access and mastering by students of various medical information, management and financial and economic digital solutions, which, along with the previous point, potentially allows in the course of MBA/EMBA programs to form complex competencies combining competencies of medical management, business management and strategic business planning.

### *7.8. Standard "PROSPECTIVITY AND DOCUMENTATION"*

No strengths have been identified for this standard

### *7.9. Standard "QUALITY ASSURANCE"*

No strengths have been identified for this standard

### *7.10. Standard "Ongoing MONITORING AND PERIODIC EVALUATION OF THE JOINT EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME"*



No strengths have been identified for this standard

*7.11. Standard "PERIODIC EXTERNAL QUALITY ASSURANCE PROCEDURES".*

No strengths have been identified for this standard

## **(VIII) REVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS FOR QUALITY IMPROVEMENT**

### **8.1. Standard "RIGHT TO PARTICIPATE (ACCEPTANCE)"**

1. SOP management to amend the admission and selection policy in terms of clearly defining the criteria of the initial academic, professional and competence level of students required for admission to MBA/EMBA educational programs (deadline - August 2023).

2. The SOP management to develop an action plan to expand academic mobility of students on MBA/EMBA programs, including in relation to universities teaching similar programs in English and to set target indicators (target indicators) for the implementation of the plan (deadline - by the end of 2023).

### **8.2. Standard "LEARNING RESULTS"**

There are no recommendations for this standard

### **8.3. Standard "PROGRAM DEVELOPMENT AND APPROVAL"**

There are no recommendations for this standard

### **8.4. Standard "Admission, Success, Recognition and CERTIFICATION of Learners"**

To the management of SOP to objectify and formalize the criteria and system of evaluation of entrance exam results (deadline - August 2023).

### **8.5. Standard "STUDENT-CENTERED LEARNING, TEACHING AND ASSESSMENT OF LEARNING"**

There are no recommendations for this standard

### **8.6. Standard "Support for Learners"**

There are no recommendations for this standard

### **8.7. Standard "RESOURCES"**

There are no recommendations for this standard

### **8.8. Standard "PROSPECTIVITY AND DOCUMENTATION"**

To the management of SOP to analyze and supplement the information on joint educational programs on the websites of KazNMU and SDU in terms of specific content of these programs, conditions of their implementation, peculiarities of the policy and principles of admission, positioning of the target audience of these educational programs, applied methods of training, final results of training, as well as to unify the scope and content of information on joint educational programs posted on the websites of the two universities (deadline - until the end of 2023).

### **8.9. Standard "QUALITY ASSURANCE"**

The JOP management should harmonize certain processes and indicators of the quality management system of the mentioned programs in terms of mutual (on the part of partner

universities) evaluation of jointly implemented educational programs, their concept and content, including those that take into account possible interests and peculiarities of each of the partner universities (deadline - by the end of 2023).

**8.10. Standard "Ongoing MONITORING AND PERIODIC EVALUATION OF JOINT EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME"**

To the management of DIS to develop and implement an accessible system of regular informing of all stakeholders-participants of joint MBA/EMBA educational programs about the results of analysis of feedback forms, main identified problems, decisions taken, specific corrective actions and terms of their implementation (deadline - by the end of 2023).

**8.11. Standard "PERIODIC EXTERNAL QUALITY ASSURANCE PROCEDURES"**

There are no recommendations for this standard

**(IX) REVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION**

No recommendations

**(X) RECOMMENDATION TO THE ACCREDITATION COUNCIL**

The members of the external expert commission came to the unanimous opinion that the double-diploma educational programs of Master's degree 7M04104 MBA Management in Healthcare (2 years) and 7M04105 EMBA "Management in Healthcare" (1 year), implemented jointly by the Kazakh National Medical University named after S.D. Asfendiyarov and Suleyman Demirel University can be accredited for 5 years within the framework of international accreditation. S.D. Asfendiyarov and Suleyman Demirel University can be accredited for 5 years within the framework of international accreditation.

**Annex 1: Evaluation table "PARAMETERS OF SPECIALIZED PROFILE"**

№	Standards and criteria for international specialized (program) accreditation of joint educational program of higher and/or postgraduate education	Position of the joint educational program			
		Strong	Satisfactory	Assumes improvement	Unsatisfactory
<b>Standard 1. "Eligibility. Eligibility."</b>					
1.	Educational organizations planning to implement a joint educational programme must be recognized by the relevant authorities of the country in which they are located.	+			
2.	Participation in the implementation of a joint educational program, awarding of a joint academic degree must comply with national normative acts		+		
3.	The academic degree(s) awarded should be in line with the national qualification system of the countries in which the AOs are located		+		
4.	A joint educational program should be developed and implemented with the involvement of all partner educational organizations		+		
5.	The conditions for the development, implementation of a joint educational program should be clearly stated in the agreement on cooperation between partner educational organizations		+		
<i>The following shall be set forth in the cooperative document:</i>					
6.	information on the academic degree (qualification, degrees) awarded upon mastering (completion) of the joint educational program		+		
7.	coordination and responsibility of involved partner education organizations with regard to management and financial organization (including funding, cost and revenue sharing, etc.)		+		
8.	rules of admission and selection of students			+	
9.	mobility of students and teachers			+	
10.	rules of examinations, methods of assessment of achieved results of students, recognition of ECTS credits and procedures for awarding joint academic degrees		+		
<b>Total standard</b>		<b>1</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Standard 2. "Learning Outcomes."</b>					
1.	The cooperative education program must be designed in accordance with established objectives, including intended learning outcomes		+		
2.	The qualifications resulting from the joint educational program should be clearly defined, explained and correspond to a certain level of the national qualifications framework in higher education and therefore to the qualifications framework in the European Higher Education Area (FQ-EHEA).		+		
3.	The disciplines of the joint educational program should ensure the achievement of planned learning outcomes, including knowledge, skills and competencies of the relevant field(s) of education		+		
4.	The joint educational program should ensure the achievement of planned learning outcomes by each student		+		

5.	The joint educational program, if relevant, shall take into account the minimum agreed learning conditions specified in the European Union Directive 2005/36/ EC or the relevant common learning framework established in accordance with the Directive		+		
<b>Total standard</b>		0	5	0	0
<b>Standard 3. "Program Development and Approval"</b>					
1.	The structure and content of the joint educational program should be defined and developed on the basis of a student-centered approach in training to ensure the achievement of planned results		+		
2.	The joint educational program should be developed with the participation of learners and other stakeholders		+		
3.	The European Credit Transfer System (ECTS) should be applied correctly and the distribution of credits should be clear		+		
4.	The joint educational program ensures coverage of the required workload. A bachelor's program is at least 180-240 ECTS credits; a joint master's program is at least 90-120 ECTS credits and must not be less than 60 ECTS credits at the second level of the cycle (credit ranges according to FQ-EHEA); no credit range is specified for joint PhD programs		+		
5.	The cooperative education program has mechanisms to control the teaching load and the average time to complete the program		+		
<b>Total standard</b>		0	5	0	0
<b>Standard 4. "Admission, Performance, Recognition, and Certification of Learners"</b>					
1.	Partner educational organizations must have predetermined, published and consistently applied admission policies and related requirements for applicants			+	
2.	Selection procedures should be appropriate to the level of the joint educational program, regulating all periods of the "life cycle" of learning, i.e. admission, performance, recognition and certification		+		
3.	Recognition of qualifications and periods of study (including recognition of prior learning) should be applied in accordance with the Lisbon Recognition Convention and supporting documents		+		
<b>Total standard</b>		0	2	1	0
<b>Standard 5. "Student-Centered Learning, Teaching, and Assessment of Learning"</b>					
1.	The joint educational program should be developed in accordance with the planned learning outcomes		+		
2.	The learning and teaching approaches used should be appropriate for their achievement of the intended learning outcomes		+		
3.	The joint educational program should take into account the diversity of learners, respect their needs, including potentially different cultural backgrounds of learners		+		
4.	Examination rules and assessment of achieved learning outcomes should be consistent with the intended learning outcomes		+		
5.	Examinations and assessment of the results achieved by students should be conducted by partner educational organizations in accordance with the established rules		+		
<b>Total standard</b>		0	5	0	0
<b>Standard 6. "Supporting Learners."</b>					
1.	Partner education organizations should ensure that appropriate learner support services are in place to support the achievement of the intended learning outcomes		+		
2.	Learner support services should support the achievement of planned learning outcomes		+		



3.	Learner support services should take into account possible specific problems of mobility learners		+		
4.	Support services should consider the needs of different groups of learners (mobility learners, adults, working adults, distance learners, and learners with disabilities) and take into account the principles of student-centered learning and teaching in the allocation, planning, and provision of educational resources		+		
<b>Total standard</b>		0	4	0	0
<b>Standard 7. "Resources."</b>					
1.	The teaching staff should be sufficient and adequate (qualification, professional and international experience) to implement the joint educational program	+			
2.	The facilities provided should be sufficient and appropriate in relation to the intended learning outcomes		+		
<i>Partner educational organizations are responsible for the quality of their staff and for providing an enabling environment for them to work effectively. Therefore, educational organizations recognizing the importance of teaching should:</i>					
3.	Develop clear, transparent and objective criteria for hiring, appointment, promotion and dismissal of employees and adhere to them in their activities		+		
4.	provide opportunities for career growth and professional development of teachers		+		
5.	encourage scientific activities to strengthen the link between education and research		+		
6.	Promote innovative learning and teaching methods and the use of advanced technologies		+		
7.	The GS should strive to ensure that the educational equipment and software tools used to ensure that students achieve the planned outcomes of the joint educational program are similar in the relevant industries	+			
<b>Total standard</b>		2	5	0	0
<b>Standard 8. "Transparency and Documentation."</b>					
1.	Relevant information about the joint educational program should be documented and published, taking into account the specific needs of mobility learners			+	
2.	Information about the cooperative education program should address admission requirements and procedures, course/discipline catalog, examination and grading procedures, etc.		+		
3.	Educational organizations-partners should have and implement mechanisms for collecting and analyzing information on their own activities, on the activities of the partner in the framework of the joint educational program and use the obtained information in the work of the internal quality assurance system.		+		
4.	The AO should ensure the involvement of trainees and staff in collecting, analyzing information and planning follow-up procedures		+		
<i>The CBO should consider the following when collecting information:</i>					
5.	key performance indicators		+		
6.	student population		+		
7.	level of academic performance, student achievement and dropout rates		+		
8.	satisfaction of students with the quality of implementation of the joint educational program		+		

9.	Accessibility of educational resources and learner support services		+		
10.	graduate employment		+		
<b>Total standard</b>		0	9	1	0
<b>Standard 9. "Quality Assurance."</b>					
1.	Partner education organizations should have a published quality assurance policy that is part of their strategic management		+		
2.	Quality assurance policies are more effective when they reflect the link between learning, teaching, research and take into account the national contexts in which partner educational organizations operate.		+		
3.	Internal stakeholders should develop and implement these policies through appropriate structures and processes, involving external stakeholders.		+		
4.	Partner education organizations should apply joint internal quality assurance processes in accordance with Part One of the ESG		+		
<i>The quality assurance policy supports</i>					
5.	organizing a quality assurance system involving joint internal quality assurance processes of partner educational organizations			+	
6.	to departments, schools, faculties, institutes and other units, as well as the leadership of the educational organization, staff and students with quality assurance responsibilities		+		
7.	Academic integrity and freedom, and intolerance of academic dishonesty of all kinds		+		
8.	processes that provide intolerance of any kind or discrimination against learners and teachers		+		
9.	Involvement of external stakeholders in quality assurance		+		
<b>Total standard</b>		0	8	1	0
<b>Standard 10 "Ongoing monitoring and periodic evaluation of the cooperative education program"</b>					
1.	Partner educational organizations should monitor and periodically evaluate the joint educational program to ensure that it achieves its purpose and confirms its relevance to the needs of learners and society		+		
2.	The results of these processes should lead the CBOs to continually improve the joint educational program		+		
3.	All stakeholders should be informed of any actions planned or taken in relation to the joint education program			+	
4.	The joint education program should be regularly evaluated and revised with the involvement of learners and other stakeholders		+		
<b>Total standard</b>		0	3	1	0
<b>Standard 11: "Periodic External Quality Assurance Procedures"</b>					
1.	Partner education organizations should undergo external quality assurance procedures in accordance with European Standards and Guidelines (ESG) on a regular basis		+		
2.	The educational organization shall endeavour to ensure that the progress made since the last external quality assurance procedure is taken into account in preparing for the next procedure		+		
<b>Total standard</b>		0	2	0	0
<b>TOTAL</b>		3	55	6	0