



«АККРЕДИТТЕУ ЖӘНЕ РЕЙТИНГТІҢ  
ТӘУЕЛСІЗ АГЕНТТІГІ» КЕМ

НУ «НЕЗАВИСИМОЕ АГЕНТСТВО  
АККРЕДИТАЦИИ И РЕЙТИНГА»

INDEPENDENT AGENCY FOR  
ACCREDITATION AND RATING

# REPORT

on the results of the work of the external expert commission on the evaluation of joint educational programs  
7M10113 "Cosmetology pharmaceutical" (scientific and pedagogical direction - 2 years) and  
7M10114 "Cosmetology pharmaceutical" (profile direction – 1 year) in the NAO "Kazakh National Medical University named after S.D. Asfendiyarov" (Almaty, Republic of Kazakhstan) implemented jointly with University of Information Technology and Management, Rzeszow, Republic of Poland for compliance with the requirements of IAAR standards  
by international specialized accreditation  
from 26 to 28 April 2023

**INDEPENDENT ACCREDITATION AND RATING AGENCY  
EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION**

*Addressed to  
Accreditation  
To the IAAR Council*



**REPORT**

**on the results of the work of the external expert commission on the evaluation  
of joint educational programs  
7M10113 "Cosmetology pharmaceutical" (scientific and pedagogical direction - 2 years)  
and  
7M10114 "Cosmetology pharmaceutical" (profile direction – 1 year)  
in the NAO "Kazakh National Medical University named after S.D. Asfendiyarov"  
(Almaty, Republic of Kazakhstan)  
implemented jointly with University of Information Technology and Management,  
Rzeszow, Republic of Poland for compliance with the requirements of IAAR standards  
by international specialized accreditation  
from 26 to 28 April 2023**

**Almaty – 2023**

**(I) LIST OF DESIGNATIONS AND ABBREVIATIONS**

PhD – Doctor of Philosophy  
 QS – Quality System  
 AIS - automated information system  
 JSC – Joint Stock Company  
 HEI – Higher education institution  
 EEC – external expert commission  
 GOEP – group of educational programs  
 TSCSE – The State compulsory standard of education  
 KazNMU – Kazakh National Medical University named after S.D. Asfendiyarov  
 COEP - Committee of Educational Programs  
 CED – catalog of elective disciplines  
 MH RK - Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan  
 MES RK – Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan  
 IARA – Independent Accreditation and Rating Agency  
 NPJSC – Non-profit Joint Stock Company  
 RI - Research Institute  
 Research and development – research work  
 RWMS/ERWMS – research / experimental research work of a master's student  
 SPD – scientific and pedagogical direction  
 SC – scientific center  
 EPHPE - Educational programs of higher and (or) postgraduate education  
 DMDS – Department of Master's and Doctoral Studies  
 EP – Educational program(s)  
 TS – Teaching staff  
 RK – Republic of Kazakhstan  
 LO – learning outcomes  
 QMS – Quality Management System  
 CIS – Commonwealth of Independent States  
 SOP – Standard Operating Procedures  
 IWMS – Independent work of a master's student  
 IWS/UWT – independent work of a student/undergraduate with a teacher  
 USA – United States of America  
 LLP - Limited Liability Partnership  
 UITM – University of Information Technology and Management Rzeszow, Poland  
 UMCD – educational and methodical complex of disciplines  
 SHF – School of Pharmacy

## (II) INTRODUCTION

In accordance with Order No. 32-23-OD dated 02/20/2023 of the Independent Accreditation and Rating Agency, from April 26 to 28, 2023, an external expert commission assessed compliance with the standards of the international specialized (program) accreditation of the SOP of the magistracy 7M10113 "Pharmaceutical Cosmetology" (scientific and pedagogical direction - training for 2 years) and 7M10114 "Pharmaceutical Cosmetology" (profile direction – 1 year of study).

The report of the External Expert Commission (EEC) contains an assessment of the submitted SOPs to the IARA criteria, recommendations of the EEC for further improvement of the SOPs and evaluation parameters.

The composition of the VEC:

IAAR expert, Chairman of the EEC – Svetlana Leonidovna Boyko, PhD, Grodno State Medical University (Republic of Belarus, Grodno) Off-line participation;

IAAR Expert – Voronov Dmitry Aleksandrovich, MD, Associate Professor, National Medical Research Center of Obstetrics, Gynecology and Perinatology named after V.I. Kulakov, (Russian Federation, Moscow), Off-line participation;

IAAR expert – Bachinsky Nikolay Georgievich, MD, Professor of the State University of Medicine and Pharmacology named after Nicolae Testemitanu" (Republic of Moldova, Chisinau), On-line participation;

IAAR Expert – Torlanova Botagoz Ongarovna, Ph.D., JSC "South Kazakhstan Medical Academy" (Republic of Kazakhstan, Shymkent), Off-line participation;

IAAR expert – Berdesheva Gulshara Aitkalievna, PhD, NPJSC "West Kazakhstan University named after M. Ospanov" (Republic of Kazakhstan, Aktobe), Off-line participation;

IAAR expert - Sekenova Raushan Kozganbaevna, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor of the NPJSC "Astana Medical University" (Republic of Kazakhstan, Astana), Off-line participation;

IAAR expert, EEC employer -- Yeseneev Olzhas Brimzhanovich, Master of Business Administration in Healthcare, GU Hospital with Polyclinic of the Police Department of the North Kazakhstan Region (Republic of Kazakhstan, Petropavlovsk), On-line participation;

IAAR expert, EEC student – Kuzyakova Valentina Alekseevna, student of the NAO "Medical University of Karaganda", (Republic of Kazakhstan, Karaganda), On-line participation;

IAAR expert, EEC student - Orazayeva Bayan Bolatkalikyzy, Master's student, NAO "Semey Medical University" (Republic of Kazakhstan, Semey), On-line participation;

IAAR expert, EEC student – Bazaralieva Aigerim Bakytzhanovna, Master's student, Al-Farabi Kazakh National University (Republic of Kazakhstan, Almaty), Off-line participation;

IAAR Coordinator – Alisa Satbekovna Dzhakenova, PhD, Head of Medical Projects of the Agency (Republic of Kazakhstan, Astana), Off-line participation.

### **(III) REPRESENTATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION**

The Kazakh National Medical University named after Sanzhar Jafarovich Asfendiyarov (hereinafter KazNMU) was opened by the Decree of the SNK of the RSFSR on December 2, 1930. In 2018, by the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the university was transformed from the RSE on PCV into the NPJSC "Kazakh National Medical University named after S. D. Asfendiyarov".

KazNMU has a license to carry out educational activities in educational programs of higher (bachelor's, internship) and postgraduate education (master's, doctoral and residency) No. KZ74LAA00017008 dated 09/19/2019 with appendices 001 - 006, issued by the Committee for Control in the Field of Education and Science of the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan; license for medical activity No. 19014500 with appendices 001-020 issued by the Department of Entrepreneurship and Investments of the Akimat of Almaty city dated 05.07.2019.

Educational activities at KazNMU are carried out in accordance with the Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 27, 2007 "On Education" and other by-laws and legal acts of the Ministry of Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

Since 2006, KazNMU has started training bachelors, masters, PhD doctors based on the principles of trinity (education, science, practice). Being a signatory of the Great Charter of Universities, in 2011, in accordance with the principles of the Bologna Process, he made the transition to the credit technology of undergraduate education, supported by the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan. KazNMU has 6 schools, 2 faculties and a department of master's and doctoral studies; Collegial bodies: the Board of Directors, the Board of KazNMU, the Academic Council and the councils accountable to it in areas of activity, the Disciplinary Commission, 7 Committees of Educational Programs (hereinafter referred to as the IWMS) and 6 Quality Assurance Commission (hereinafter referred to as the IWMS).

The implementation of SOP 7M10113 – Pharmaceutical Cosmetology (scientific and pedagogical direction - 2 years) and 7M10114 - Pharmaceutical Cosmetology (profile direction – 1 year), which are part of the group of educational programs "Pharmacy", is carried out at the School of Pharmacy (SF).

The basis of the development and implementation of new SOP is a comparative analysis of joint educational programs "Cosmetology pharmaceutical" of leading universities of the far and near abroad. As a result of the analysis, master's degree programs in the areas of Pharmacy training were developed and approved by the collegial bodies of the SOP. At the same time, students are offered cycles of elective disciplines developed jointly with a partner university - the University of Information Technology and Management in Rzeszow, Poland, allowing them to gain in-depth knowledge and skills along specific trajectories.

The accredited joint educational programs are implemented in Russian. Currently, SOP 7M10113 – Pharmaceutical cosmetology (scientific and pedagogical direction - 2 years) is being implemented – the enrollment of students in the 2022-2023 academic year was 11 people. The start of the implementation of SOP 7M10114 - Pharmaceutical Cosmetology (profile direction – 1 year) is planned for the 2023-2024 academic year, since there was no enrollment of students in this direction in the 2022-2023 academic year.

The implementation of SOP 7M10113 – Pharmaceutical cosmetology (scientific and pedagogical direction - 2 years) is carried out through research, dual training, which consists in conducting guest lectures by leading specialists, field classes at pharmaceutical profile bases, including on-site training.

International cooperation is actively developing in the SHF. SHF teachers participate in the Visiting Professors program with lectures, master classes for students of foreign universities (Ph.D., Associate Professor Sakipova Z.B., Ph.D., Professor Datkhaev U.M., Ph.D., Professor

Shopabaeva A.R., prof. Ustenova G.O.) and completed a scientific internship under the Bolashak program (Doctor of Pharmacy, Associate Professor Ustenova G.O., Doctor of Pharmacy, Associate Professor Boshkaeva A.K., Candidate of Pharmacy, Associate Professor Sayakova G.M.). More than 60 foreign specialists and scientists from 16 countries in the USA, Europe, Southeast Asia and the CIS. 6 foreign scientists from CIS countries worked in the staff of the departments of the faculty.

KazNMU School of Pharmacy has contracts with foreign universities.

At the departments of the SF, dual training has been introduced, the algorithm of implementation of which includes several stages, including:

- 1st stage - conducting "guest lectures";
- 2nd stage - conducting field classes at the bases of medical and pharmaceutical profile;
- Stage 3 - conducting 50-70% of classes at the bases of medical and pharmaceutical profile to employers working part-time at the departments of the university;
- Stage 4 – management and supervision of undergraduates with the appointment of a scholarship, provision of practice and further employment.

For SHF students in a number of compulsory and elective disciplines, classes are held at the bases of the pharmaceutical profile: JSC "Scientific Center for Anti-infectious Drugs"; LLP "Kazkelunpharm"; LLP "Phytoleum"; LLP Scientific and Production Enterprise "Antigen", etc.

Despite the fact that, in general, over the past 5 years, the School has achieved great results, the School sets itself priorities for the opening of new specialties, the introduction of double diplomas at all levels of education, the introduction of the applied bachelor's degree model, the system of credit transfer under the ECTS system, etc.

#### **(IV) DESCRIPTION OF THE PREVIOUS VISIT OF THE EEC**

Accreditation of SOP 7M10113 – Pharmaceutical Cosmetology (scientific and pedagogical direction - 2 years) and 7M10114 - Pharmaceutical Cosmetology (profile direction – 1 year), which are part of the group of educational programs "Pharmacy", is held for the first time.

#### **(V) DESCRIPTION OF THE EEC VISIT**

The work of the EEC was carried out on the basis of the Program of the visit of the IAAR / IAAR expert commission within the framework of the international specialized (program) accreditation of joint educational programs in the period from April 26 to 28, 2023.

In order to coordinate the work of the EEC, an introductory meeting was held on 04/24/2023, during which powers were distributed among the members of the commission, the schedule of the visit was clarified, and an agreement was reached on the choice of examination methods.

In order to obtain objective information on the evaluation of the university's activities, the members of the EEC used such methods as visual inspection, observation, interviewing employees of various structural divisions, teachers, students, questionnaires of teaching staff, students.

The meetings of the EEC with the target groups were held in accordance with the specified Program of the visit, in compliance with the established time interval. On the part of the KazNMU staff, the presence of all persons specified in the visit program was ensured as much as possible.

In accordance with the requirements of the standards, in order to obtain objective information about the quality of the implementation of educational programs and the entire infrastructure of the university, to clarify the content of self-assessment reports, meetings were held with the rector, vice-rectors (of the 4 declared vice-rectors, 2 vice-rectors were present, the rest were absent for objective reasons), heads of structural divisions, deans of relevant Schools,

developers of SOP, heads of departments, teachers of departments participating in the implementation of the SOP declared for accreditation, students. Interviews and questionnaires of teachers and students were conducted. Meetings with graduates and employers were not planned, since accredited educational programs are being implemented from the 2022-2023 academic year and they have not had a graduation yet. In total, 45 people took part in the meetings on both SOP "Cosmetology Pharmaceutical".

Table 3 - Information about employees, students, employers, graduates who took part in meetings with the IAAR / IAAR

Category of participants / number								
University Management		Heads of structural divisions	Deans	TS	Heads of the EP, head of departments	Students	Employers	Graduates
rector	vice-rector							
1	2	16	1	11	3	11	-	-

According to the program of the EEC visit, an on-line and off-line tour of the university was also conducted, during which experts visited: the Registrar's Office, a Test Computer Center; Concordia KazNMU; the KazNMU Library, a Scientific Genomic Laboratory. The experts visited the Scientific and Educational Laboratory of Parapharmaceutical Products, the Scientific and Practical Laboratory of Chemistry and Pharmacognosy, the Pharmacy Simulation Center, the Drug Technology Training Laboratory, the Cosmetic Laboratory, the Laboratory of Pharmaceutical Chemistry, Botany and Pharmacognosy of the Department of Pharmaceutical and Toxicological Chemistry, Pharmacognosy and Botany. Members of the EEC visited the bases of industrial practice for SOP: JSC "Scientific Center of Anti-infectious Drugs"; Pharmacy No. 2, and also got acquainted with videos of such practice bases as "Phytoleum" LLP and "Antigen" Scientific and Production Enterprise LLP.

During the visit, the members of the VEC attended a lesson at the Department of Organization, Management and Economics of Pharmacy and Clinical Pharmacy on the discipline "Innovative entrepreneurship", the topic "Entrepreneur responsibility", during the lesson demonstrated the qualified use of an interactive whiteboard, work in small groups, discussion technologies for consolidating knowledge, presented the educational and methodological complex of the discipline, an electronic journal, scientific works (monographs, methodological recommendations) Teaching staff used by students during the lesson.

According to the program "Informatization Roadmap – 2021" (order of the acting Rector No. 30 dated 07.02.2017). in order to improve the methods and forms of independent work of students, KazNMU has carried out a lot of work on digital transformation using modern IT technologies: platforms and resources: Google Classroom, Youtube, Microsoft Teams, Cisco Webex for discussion and independent work in groups; the LMS Moodle distance learning portal integrated with the Sirius AIS information system, as well as with anti-plagiarism systems Turnitin, Strike Plagiarism. A proctoring system has been introduced for exams in the form of online testing.

Work has been carried out to improve the equipment of educational and medical equipment for the development of practical and clinical skills, training programs for the entire list of practical skills, which was confirmed during an interview with teaching staff. There is a positive trend in terms of the introduction of new information technology systems and distance learning, procedures for monitoring and evaluating the effectiveness of the use of innovative teaching methods (the Power BI application in the Microsoft office 365 package).

The answers received to the questions of the EEC members by the teaching staff and the heads of the SOP departments confirm the work carried out to train the university staff in the methodology and management of scientific research. The EEC presents materials that confirm

the presence of positive dynamics in terms of activating internal and external academic mobility of KazNMU teaching staff, on attracting international partners to conduct joint scientific research.

The WI-FI network of the university has been modernized, 140 points have been installed on the territory of the main building and in six dormitories. At the meeting with various focus groups of the EEC, measures were presented to equip the university structures with the necessary educational and medical equipment, high satisfaction of the staff of the departments with equipment for the next two years with computers and components was noted.

The organization of feedback from students and teaching staff on the quality of the educational process is carried out at the end of the academic semesters, in the middle of the cycle of study of the discipline and after its completion. The questionnaire format is electronic, in AIS "Sirius". The analysis of the survey results is carried out by the UAC. The results of the survey are provided to all structural units involved in the organization of the educational process, discussed at meetings of departments, the IWMS, the Commission on academic quality, in a generalized form at meetings of the Academic Committee.

Since the implementation of SOP 7M10113 – Pharmaceutical cosmetology (scientific and pedagogical direction - 2 years) is carried out only for the first year, the survey of students at KazNMU is planned according to approved internal procedures for the end of the academic year. The implementation of the joint EP 7M10114 - Pharmaceutical Cosmetology (profile direction – 1 year) is planned for the 2023-2024 academic year due to the absence of a set of students.

The results of the implementation of the certification and evaluation of teaching staff, the rules of competitive substitution of teaching staff and HP at the university are presented.

In order to confirm the information provided in the Self-Assessment Report, external experts requested and analyzed working documentation on the implementation of both SOP. Along with this, the experts studied the information on the official website of the university <https://kaznmdu.edu.kz/rus/>. However, the members of the EEC note that the website for applicants, students and teaching staff is not a source of information about SOP 7M10113 – Pharmaceutical Cosmetology (scientific and pedagogical direction - 2 years) and 7M10114 – Pharmaceutical Cosmetology (profile direction - 1 year), included in the group of educational programs "Pharmacy".

## **(VI) COMPLIANCE WITH THE STANDARDS OF SPECIALIZED ACCREDITATION**

### **6.1. The standard "Right to participate. Acceptability»**

#### ***The evidentiary part***

The University carries out its activities on the basis of the Charter, local regulations, strategic development plan developed in accordance with the regulatory and strategic documents adopted in the Republic of Kazakhstan.

In an interview with the developers of both joint ops, it was revealed that the basis for the development of the EP "Cosmetology pharmaceutical" was the participation of KazNMU in the international project "Cosmetic Valley-International Scientific and Implementation Cooperation at the Cosmetology Department ("Cosmetic Valley – International scientific and practical cooperation in the Cosmetology Department"), funded by the Polish National Academic Exchange Agency (NAWA), project number PPI/APM/2018/1/00042/ U/001 dated 30.01.2019, as well as a Memorandum of Cooperation concluded with the Higher School of Informatics and Management in Rzeszow for No. 406-1/08.18 from 14.08.2018. This school is part of the University of Information Technology and Management (hereinafter – UITM).

On the basis of this Memorandum, in order to implement the University Development Program and the new State Program for the Development of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2020-2025, the primary task of which is to update educational



programs based on professional standards, SOP were developed: SOP 7M10113 – "Pharmaceutical Cosmetology" (scientific and pedagogical direction), SOP 7M10114 – "Pharmaceutical Cosmetology" (profile direction), which are included in the GP "Pharmacy".

Familiarization during the visit of the EEC with the material resources, teaching staff of the University showed that they are used specifically in the implementation of the goals and objectives formulated in the joint EP. Thus, when developing a joint EP with UITM, special attention was paid to compliance with the national qualifications framework in higher education and, consequently, the qualifications framework in the European Higher Education Area (FQ-EHEA), as well as the requirements of the labor market.

Thus, according to the national qualifications framework in higher education, after mastering SOP 7M10113 "Pharmaceutical Cosmetology" of the scientific and pedagogical direction (for 2 years) and successfully defending a master's thesis, graduates are awarded an academic degree - Master of Medical Sciences in the group of educational programs "Pharmacy", graduates of SOP 7M10114 "Pharmaceutical Cosmetology" of the profile direction (training – 1 year) is awarded an academic degree – Master of Health in the group of educational programs "Pharmacy".

Thus, the University of Information Technology and Management in Rzeszow, within the framework of ESG, meets the goals and requirements of national contexts to achieve a common understanding of quality assurance in Europe

### ***Analytical part***

Analyzing the compliance of the submitted SOPs with the standards for international specialized (program) accreditation with the IAAR standards, it should be noted that the accredited SOPs correspond in all parameters (Mission of the university, material resources, teaching staff, indicators of international cooperation, recognition of the university in the educational space, etc.) to the criteria of the standard "Right to participate. Acceptability". The master's degree program "Cosmetology Pharmaceutical" (scientific, pedagogical and specialized areas) was developed with the participation of a partner university, which is recognized by the relevant authorities of the country. The academic degree awarded corresponds to the national qualification system of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The participation of leading teachers of the School of Pharmacy, foreign scientists (UITM, Rzeszow, Poland) and employers in the development and management of the EP ensures its quality.

### ***Strengths / Best practices***

The strong side is fruitful cooperation with such a partner university as the University of Information Technology and Management, Rzeszow, Republic of Poland, which allowed the School of Pharmacy of KazNMU named after S.D. Asfendiyarov to develop a master's degree program in the specialty "Pharmaceutical Cosmetology" of scientific and pedagogical (2 years of study) and profile (1 year of study) directions.

### ***Recommendations of the EEC***

There are no recommendations for this standard.

The conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria: strong positions – 1, satisfactory – 9, suggest improvements – 0, unsatisfactory – 0.

## **6.2. Standard "Learning Outcomes»**

### ***The evidentiary part***

The educational activity of KazNMU is based on the basic principles of the development of medical and pharmaceutical education: quality, competent approach, integration with science and practice, flexibility, competitiveness, social responsibility. This is evidenced by the clear formulation of the Mission of both SOP is to train professionally qualified specialists in the field

of pharmaceutical cosmetology, in demand in healthcare organizations, including pharmacies and enterprises for the production and quality control of perfumery and cosmetic products, as well as in universities and research institutes in the profile.

The training of undergraduates of the scientific and pedagogical direction is carried out in the amount of 12 credits for 2 years, for the profile direction, training is provided in the amount of 60 credits for 1 year. In the 3rd semester for the scientific and pedagogical master's degree, and for the profile master's degree in the 2nd semester, training in the UITM within the framework of the RWMS is provided/ERWMS (5 credits) and research/professional practice (3 credits).

In 2022-2023, there was no enrollment of students for the Master's degree program 7M10114 "Cosmetology pharmaceutical" (profile direction).

Each SOP submitted for specialized (program) accreditation presents the developed learning outcomes (LO), the development of which is provided by the disciplines presented in the Curricula in the appropriate amount of credits. Currently, the LO of each EP can be found in the Register of Educational Programs of the Bologna Process Center. The University's Self-assessment Report says that the curriculum of the SOP "Pharmaceutical Cosmetology" of the scientific and pedagogical direction, indicating the disciplines, was developed in coordination with the partner university." Also in the Self-assessment Report it is written that "Due to the lack of admission for the 2022-2023 academic year of undergraduates in the EP "Cosmetology pharmaceutical" of the profile direction, the curriculum was not drawn up. Disciplines and results of training in the EP "Pharmaceutical Cosmetology" of scientific, pedagogical and profile areas are presented on the University's website." However, it should be noted that the Curricula for both SOPs were posted on the KazNMU website only during the visit of the EEC. Previously, this information was previously unavailable to interested parties (students, parents, employers, etc.).

KazNMU has a highly qualified teaching staff consisting of doctors and candidates (medical, pharmaceutical, chemical, technical) sciences, PhD doctors and masters to form the general and professional competencies listed in the SOP, ensuring the success of future professional activity and the development of skills, as well as their implementation in practice.

Actually, the educational process in the master's degree in SOP 7M10113 "Pharmaceutical Cosmetology" of the scientific and pedagogical direction of training provides for training at the bases of partner universities: three semesters (1-2 and 4th semesters) at KazNMU. In the 3rd semester, an internship is provided at the University of Information Technology and Management (UITM) in Rzeszow, Poland.

Since the completion of undergraduates' studies is planned at KazNMU – the defense of a master's thesis after the 4th semester. scientific guidance of undergraduates is carried out in accordance with the regulatory acts of the Republic of Kazakhstan in the field of science and higher/postgraduate education, including in accordance with the State Budget of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan (Order No. 63 of 2020). Based on this, the processes of choosing a research topic for a graduate student, discussing and approving the candidacy of a supervisor are regulated by the internal standard operating procedures (SOPs) of KazNMU. At the same time, as co-heads or scientific consultants of dissertations in this specialty at KazNMU, undergraduates can choose leading teachers/specialists from among the teaching staff of the UITM, Rzeszow, Poland.

In the developed SOPs of both directions, the professional competencies and qualifications of undergraduates are combined into modules (learning paths) and are reflected in syllabuses of basic and profiling, basic and elective disciplines, which are posted on the University's website. The members of the VEC also conducted an analysis of the LO presented in the syllabuses. Comparative analysis has shown that SOP are formed both at the level of the entire Master's degree program, and at the level of individual modules or academic disciplines. The members of the EEC conducted a comparative analysis of the formulated LO in each educational program "Cosmetology pharmaceutical" – scientific, pedagogical and specialized areas of training. During

the visit of the EEC, the formulations of LO in SOP 7M10114 "Pharmaceutical Cosmetology" (profile direction) were changed, but the total number of LO in SOP (LO-1 – LO-8) did not change.

The analysis of the two directions of training formulated in the SOP includes the possession of knowledge in a market economy and skills in the organization and implementation of information and analytical activities, providing advice to the population on the use of perfumes and cosmetics, as well as their rational use. The types of professional activity of a graduate of the master's degree program of the SOP "Cosmetology pharmaceutical" include rehabilitation, consulting, preventive, aesthetic and hygienic, organizational and managerial and industrial. The inclusion in the SOP of such biomedical disciplines as "Introduction to dermatology", "Assessment of the safety of perfumery and cosmetic products", etc. are aimed at the formation of professional competencies and for future professional activity are aimed at ensuring the quality, safety and effectiveness of cosmetics and perfumes in accordance with the current legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan in the field of healthcare and appropriate pharmaceutical practitioners. Each discipline included in the SOP, in both areas of specialist training, adequately participates in the formation of competencies at a certain level, thus, both profiling and basic disciplines are equally responsible for the competence of the graduate. At the same time, students have the opportunity, based on the use of the Catalog of elective disciplines, to form an individual learning trajectory according to the graduate model "Cosmetology pharmaceutical".

According to the national qualifications framework, graduates who have mastered SOP 7M10113 "Pharmaceutical Cosmetology" of the scientific and pedagogical direction within 2 years, after successfully defending a master's thesis, are awarded an academic degree - Master of Medical Sciences in the group of educational programs "Pharmacy", after mastering SOP 7M10114 "Pharmaceutical Cosmetology" of the profile direction (training – 1 year), graduates are awarded academic degree – Master of Health in the group of educational programs "Pharmacy".

Graduates of these SOP have the opportunity in their further professional activities to systematically improve their qualifications and expand their professional level by studying at advanced training courses in various areas in the field of practical pharmacy and cosmetology.

#### ***Analytical part***

During the visit (work with documents, interviews with target groups, including employers), the VEC experts conducted a detailed analysis of the accredited SOPs for compliance with the requirements of the modern education market, defined the principles and methods of organizing the educational, research and educational processes of the University, focused on meeting the interests of students and all participants in the educational process. The content and form of the SOP, the decisions taken by the SOP management are coordinated with the strategic documents of the university and the regulatory documents of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The expected SOP in each SOP give students an idea of the educational goals of the program as a whole, as well as the goals of each module and discipline. This makes it possible for students to orient themselves in choosing an individual learning trajectory; the role of each discipline as a component of the educational program is determined. At the same time, the coordinators and developers of both SOPs are tasked with determining objective criteria for evaluating the content of the program, its consistency and consistency within the modules and the program as a whole.

#### ***Strengths / Best practices***

There are no strengths according to this standard.

#### ***Recommendations of the EEC***

There are no recommendations for this standard.

***The conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:*** strong positions – 0, satisfactory – 5, suggest improvements – 0, unsatisfactory – 0.

### **6.3. Standard "Development and approval of the program"**

#### ***The evidentiary part***

Earlier it was said that the basis for the development of SOP was the participation of KazNMU in the international project "Cosmetic Valley-International Scientific and Implementation Cooperation at the Cosmetology Department" ("Cosmetic Valley – international scientific and practical cooperation in the Department of Cosmetology") and Memorandum of Cooperation No. 406-1/08.18 dated "14" 08. 2018 between partner universities: KazNMU (Almaty) and UITM Rzeszow. In an interview with the developers of the OP, it was found that at the same time an analysis of the needs of the labor market in the field of therapeutic and preventive cosmetology was carried out.

The developed SOP 7M10113 and 7M10113 "Pharmaceutical Cosmetology" of the two areas of training were agreed, in accordance with the internal procedures approved at the University, with the vice-rector of the academic block, Dean of the School of Pharmacy, as well as the head of the Laboratory of Cell and tissue Culture of the UITM in Rzeszow, with the chairman of the IWMS (Protocol No. 10 of 03.05.2022), considered at a meeting of the Committee quality assurance (Protocol No. 12 of 06/18/2022) and approved at a meeting of the Senate of KazNMU (Protocol No. 23/6 of 06/28/2022 – supporting documents – extracts from the protocols).

When forming WC's, their content, the complexity of the theoretical and practical components of training, the module of final certification were taken into account. The academic year consists of two academic periods of 15 weeks each. For all types of classroom classes, the academic hour is set to last 50 minutes. Vacations are granted to undergraduates after each academic period.

The main criterion for the completion of the educational process in the master's degree is the development by students of at least 120 credits (scientific and pedagogical direction, training - 2 years), including 24 credits of research work of a graduate student, including internship and completion of a master's thesis, 5 credits of research practice and 12 credits of final certification. Students form individual curricula with the help of a supervisor. Within the framework of R&D (3 credits) and research practice (5 credits), undergraduates are trained (in the 3rd semester for the scientific and pedagogical direction of training and in the 2nd semester for the profile direction of training) at the University of Information Technology and Management (UITM) in Rzeszow, Poland.

The accredited SOPs contain prerequisites for transferring from course to course. These include such disciplines as "Technology of perfumery and cosmetics", "Assessment of the safety of cosmetics", "Regulatory framework in the organization and operation of beauty salon services", the study of which makes a significant contribution to the formation of the LO stated in the above-mentioned SOP magistracy.

The main criterion for the completion of the educational process in the master's degree of the profile direction is the development by students of at least 60 credits (training – 1 year), including 13 credits of experimental research work of a graduate student, including an internship in the 2nd semester at the University of Information Technology and Management in Rzeszow (Poland), as well as 12 credits of final certification.

Students form their individual curricula with the help of a supervisor. Currently, both Universities are carrying out organizational work and coordination on this issue.

To teach specialized disciplines, the University attracts leading specialists in the field of pharmacy and cosmetology (implementation of the Schedule of inviting visiting professors

approved for the 2022-2023 academic year). So, during the visit of the EEC IARA (from April 26 to May 12, 2023), the Vice-Dean of the Faculty of Pharmacy with the Department of Medical Analytics, Head of the Department of Microbiology of the Medical University of Lublin (Poland), Doctor of Pharmacy, Professor Anna began giving lectures for undergraduates of the SOP "Pharmaceutical Cosmetology" (scientific and pedagogical direction) Malm.

To develop and improve the practical skills of undergraduates, contracts were concluded with production bases with which the departments of the SF cooperate, relevant supporting documents were submitted – signed contracts, and an excursion in the format of on-line and on-line to the bases of industrial practice was conducted: JSC "Scientific Center for Anti-Infectious Drugs"; Pharmacy No. 2. Members of the VEC also We got acquainted with the videos of such practice bases as "Phytoleum" LLP and "Antigen" Scientific and Production Enterprise LLP.

Thus, SOP 7M10113 and OP 7M10114 – Cosmetology pharmaceutical have developed WC and CED for joint training of undergraduates at the University of Information Technology and Management in Rzeszow. The participation of foreign scientists, teaching staff and employers in the development and management of SOP ensures its quality. The content, scope, logic of building an individual educational trajectory of students, the influence of disciplines and professional practices on the formation of professional competence of students meets all the requirements of the implementation of SOP.

The system of monitoring and evaluation of SOP 7M10113, 7M10114 "Cosmetology pharmaceutical" includes all aspects of the organization, implementation and evaluation of SOP, namely the development, approval of SOP, organization and conduct of the educational process, the achievement of final goals by students, analysis of the results of external and internal audit of educational programs and the educational process at the university, feedback from all participants of the educational process. The frequency, forms of providing and receiving feedback at the University level are discussed at meetings (workshops) Academic Quality Department, Academic Work Department, etc., are approved at meetings of the Academic Committee and are carried out at least 2 times during one academic year (1 time during one academic period).

Since SOP 7M10113 is being implemented only for the 1st year (there was no graduation yet), and there was no enrollment of students at EP 7M10114 in 2022, it is not possible to get acquainted with the feedback results in the 2022-2023 academic year with such participants in the educational process as employers. The members of the EEC are presented with an analysis of questionnaires of students (from 9 undergraduates) to determine satisfaction with training in the discipline "Quality control of perfumery and cosmetic products based on plant raw materials" of the SOP "Cosmetology Pharmaceutical", 1st semester of the 2022-2023 academic year for 1st year undergraduates (6 Appendix No. 6), which was discussed at a meeting of the Department of Pharmaceutical and Toxicological Chemistry, pharmacognosy and botany of January 20, 2023, Protocol No. 6/2 (Head of the Department G.T. Zhumashova).

Both developed SOP received a positive review from the Director of Business Development of LLP "Aminomed" K.med.n. Dyusembieva G.A. (a supporting document is presented).

Confirmation of the positive result of the external examination is the inclusion of the SOP of both areas of training in the Register of educational programs of the Bologna Center, since it is known that this examination is usually carried out by an expert group formed from among representatives of educational and methodological associations in the specialties of technical and vocational, post-secondary education. The procedure for conducting an examination and entering into the SOP register is regulated by the order of the acting The Minister of Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 7, 2022 No. 417 "On approval of the Rules for maintaining the register of educational programs implemented by organizations of technical and vocational, post-secondary education, as well as the grounds for inclusion in the Register of Educational programs and exclusion from it". The fact that both SOPs have successfully passed an external examination and were included in the Register of Educational programs is also

confirmed by the fact that 11 students were recruited to SOP 7M10113 "Pharmaceutical Cosmetology" of the scientific and pedagogical direction in 2022 on the basis of a state grant.

***Analytical part***

The developers of both SOP in their work relied on the approved standard operating procedure (SOP) "Evaluation and analysis of educational programs of KazNMU" for timely identification of emerging problems and making appropriate decisions. Thus, during the development of the Master's degree program "Cosmetology Pharmaceutical", modules and a list of disciplines were discussed with the partner university, the University of Information Technology and Management in Rzeszow (Poland). In the submitted supporting documents (Curricula) of joint educational programs for both areas of training. The modules are formed in such a way that a clear logical sequence of studying disciplines is observed in accordance with the basic requirements for the formation of learning outcomes at the output. It also provides for a systematic update of the SOP, taking into account the interests of employers. Thus, the content of both SOP corresponds to the TSCSE and provides training of highly qualified personnel with innovative and creative type of thinking, having a sufficient level of knowledge, skills and abilities in professional activity. The formation of professional competencies is facilitated by conducting active types of training (practical exercises, solving production tasks, business games and cases, working with documentation, analyzing and solving problem situations, solving situational tasks, practices: pedagogical, research); assessment methods: diagnostic assessment, formative assessment, criterion assessment. summative assessment; levels of mastering practical skills/manipulations, procedures.

***Strengths / best practice according to the standard "Evaluation of the educational program"***

There are no strengths according to this standard.

***Recommendations of the EEC***

There are no recommendations for this standard.

***The conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:*** strong positions – 0, satisfactory – 5, suggest improvements – 0, unsatisfactory – 0.

**6.4. The standard "Admission, academic performance, recognition and certification of students"**

***The evidentiary part***

The selection policy and criteria for admission of students to KazNMU according to the SOP comply with the current legislation and are implemented on the basis of a number of documents of the state and local levels.

Admission of undergraduates to the university is carried out by placing a state educational order for training in the scientific and pedagogical direction, as well as paying for training at the expense of students' own funds and other sources within the framework of the profile direction. Applicants can find out about the rules for accepting documents and conducting CT on the university's website.

Applicants for admission to the magistracy are required to have the prerequisites necessary for mastering the corresponding Master's degree program. Prerequisites are mastered on a paid basis through the Institute of Postgraduate Training of KazNMU during 1 year of study. Prerequisites for admission to the Master's degree in accredited joint OP "Cosmetology pharmaceutical" are the disciplines "Management of Pharmacy economics and drug technology" and "Pharmaceutical chemistry and Pharmacognosy", that is, the disciplines that are taught at the bachelor's degree in EP "Pharmacy". There is also recognition of certificates and credits obtained through non-formal education.

An Admissions Committee is created for admission to the University, which is approved annually by the order of the rector and is an independent structural unit (self-assessment report). The admission policy and procedures to KazNMU are necessarily published in three languages (Russian, Kazakh, English) and are available to everyone on the KazNMU website, through social networks and mass media (newspapers, booklets for applicants, etc.). Detailed information can be obtained on the official website of the University in the section "For applicants - Postgraduate education - Master's degree" by calling the call center.

KazNMU constantly conducts career guidance work among university graduates, employees of scientific research centers (research institutes) for admission to SOP 7M10113 "Pharmaceutical Cosmetology" (scientific and pedagogical direction) and to SOP 7M10114 "Pharmaceutical Cosmetology" (profile direction). An annual "Open Day" is held, where the applicant is explained all the information on the rules of admission to the master's degree and the educational program, as well as the quality of education, the employment program, the research environment of the university, etc. So, during the visit of the VEC NAAR to KazNMU, a planned "Open Day" was held (April 27, 2023).

The Graduate Career Center, which exists in KazNMU, annually holds a "Job Fair" with the participation of representatives of the Health Departments of the Republic of Kazakhstan, pharmaceutical companies, the Health Department, and also provides assistance in the independent distribution of graduates to work.

### ***Analytical part***

KazNMU has a policy of admission and recruitment of students on the basis of state regulations, including for admission and recruitment of students for the Master's degree program. Training is possible both at the expense of the state budget (state grants) and within the framework of contracts for the provision of paid educational services. Transparency of the admission procedure is achieved by informing applicants and their representatives (parents) on the official website of KazNMU, as well as in the information and telecommunications network "Internet".

KazNMU has developed in accordance with the "Rules for the recognition of learning Outcomes" of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan (Order No. 508 of 28.09.2018) and approved the "Rules for the recognition of learning outcomes obtained through informal and formal education". KazNMU implements the paradigm of knowledge accumulation throughout life, including recognition of the results of teaching disciplines studied within the framework of academic mobility, foreign language courses, with an IELTS, TOEFL certificate; courses studied at another university or on online educational platforms (knowledge acquired by students in non-formal education); studied disciplines during the transfer and restoration of students to the same or another EP; educational program of postgraduate education of the pedagogical profile of the scientific and pedagogical master's degree, established as prerequisites for admission of the master of the profile direction to the PhD doctoral program. The documents for the transfer of training results are certificates of completion of courses; transcript of the student; a state-issued diploma of education with an appendix and/or other documents of the established procedure.

To monitor the educational achievements of students after each examination session, a report is compiled containing an analysis of the results of the session, which are discussed at the meetings of the department.

### ***Strengths / Best practices***

There are no strengths according to this standard.

### ***Recommendations of the EEC.***

There are no recommendations for this standard.

***The conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:*** strong positions – 0, satisfactory – 3 suggest improvements – 0, unsatisfactory – 0.

### **6.5. The standard "Student-centered learning, teaching and assessment of academic performance"**

#### ***The evidentiary part***

KazNMU has implemented a system of versatile measures aimed at improving the quality of students' knowledge and teaching academic disciplines, that is, a student-centered approach is being implemented, which includes openness of communication, freedom of learning, individualization of personality development, updating the functionality of scientific supervisors and consultants. Such an organization of training of the subjects of the educational process is maximally focused on their individual characteristics. In these conditions, there is not only the transfer of knowledge, the development of skills, but also the formation of the orientation of the scientific interests of the graduate student, value orientations, the development of the personal potential of the subjects of the educational process of the university. As part of the implementation of the student-centered approach, undergraduates independently form individual curricula based on the chosen trajectory. To do this, undergraduates are offered a CED, which can be found on the KazNMU website in the section "Educational programs".

In order to create conditions for the full development of students, as well as for the realization of academic freedom of students, increasing motivation and involvement of students in the educational process, the teaching staff uses active teaching methods using technical training tools. So, during the inspection of classrooms, lecture halls at the departments of the School of Pharmacy, interactive whiteboards were demonstrated to the members of the EEC. During the inspection of the laboratories (according to the program of the visit of the EEC IARA), it was found that the University has created conditions for carrying out research and experimental research work. Classes in the master's degree in the SOP "Cosmetology pharmaceutical" are conducted by trained teaching staff, so the heads of departments of the School of Pharmacy Ustenova G.O., Sakipova Z.B., Zhakipbekov K.S. and leading teachers (total 19 people) in the period from 12.04.2023. on 19.4.2023, they completed courses on the additional professional educational program "Active cosmetics in pharmacy" at the St. Petersburg Chemical and Pharmaceutical University (Russian Federation) in the amount of 36 hours (Certificates of advanced training are presented).

The topics of master's studies (dissertations), as well as the candidacies of scientific supervisors of undergraduates at KazNMU are approved by the regulatory acts of the Republic of Kazakhstan (relevant orders of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan). Candidates for scientific supervisors are approved from among the teaching staff who have a high level of publication activity in both domestic and foreign publications.

Leading scientists from near abroad (St. Petersburg State University of Chemistry and Pharmacy, St. Petersburg, Russia) and far abroad (UITM, Rzeszów, Poland) are involved in KazNMU as co-heads or scientific consultants of dissertations in this specialty.

In the developed SOP of both directions, the professional competencies and qualifications of undergraduates are combined into modules (learning paths) and are reflected in syllabuses of basic and profiling, basic and elective disciplines, which are posted on the KazNMU website. For each discipline, each module, LO has been developed, which are aimed at the formation of final LO for graduates who have mastered the SOP data. However, during the comparative analysis of the formulated LO in each SOP "Cosmetology pharmaceutical" of scientific and pedagogical and profile areas of training, it was revealed that individual LO in the EP of the profile direction are completely identical to the LO presented in the EP of the scientific and pedagogical direction (LO-1, LO-2 are identical to LO-1 and LO-2, LO-8 is identical to LO-7, LO-6 is identical to LO-8), however, the volume of disciplines aimed at their formation is 2 times less (2 credits in the profile master's degree, 4 credits in the master's degree of scientific and pedagogical direction). During the visit of the EEC, the formulations of LO in EP 7M10114



"Pharmaceutical Cosmetology" (profile direction) were changed, but the total number of LO in EP (LO-1 – LO-8) did not change.

***Analytical part***

In accordance with the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education", the University has created conditions for self-improvement, lifelong learning at all levels of education, free development of their abilities, including the right to choose the form of education, within the framework of ensuring a student-centered approach in the provision of educational services. education within the limits provided by the education system, taking into account their individual development characteristics. Familiarization with the SOP and syllabuses showed that KazNMU uses the system of point-rating assessment of knowledge adopted in the Republic of Kazakhstan. A visit by the members of the EEC IARA to a practical lesson showed that the teacher puts grades in an electronic journal directly in the classroom – each teacher has a laptop in the classroom. The use of an electronic journal in AIS "Sirius" guarantees transparency of knowledge control and its objectivity according to the Standard of internal quality assurance of KazNMU activities. The educational portal contains the information necessary for students. Various active teaching methods are used in the classroom – brainstorming, discussions, etc. This is a confirmation that students are the main participants in the implementation of educational programs and the organization of the educational process is aimed at taking into account their interests.

The following main types of educational activities are regulated in KazNMU: practical training, research work, including a master's thesis, research, professional, pedagogical practice (for SOP SPD). Teaching staff of all departments of the SF provide undergraduates with information on the discipline in full: syllabuses, methodological recommendations for practical classes, current tasks, test and examination questions, control tasks, tasks for independent work and additional information. Directly in practical classes, teachers use the method of problem presentation, discussions, group work, business and role-playing games, the method of brainstorming, the method of critical thinking, the method of projects, e-learning. For the formation of skills and the development of skills to apply the acquired knowledge in practice, a project approach is used to solve problem problems.

Analyzing the goals, objectives and final results of training, the EP noted a great similarity with different duration of training, including the purpose of future specialists - scientific, pedagogical and profile direction. The final results of the training should reflect the parties concerning the solution of pharmaceutical issues of cosmetic products (composition, technological aspects of production, combination and compatibility of active substances, selection of excipients) and not affect the issues of clinical aspects of the procedures themselves for the use of cosmetic and parapharmaceutical products. It is necessary to align the content of the EP (modules, elective disciplines) with the number of credits allocated.

***Strengths / Best practices***

There are no strengths according to this standard.

***Recommendations of the EEC***

The management of the SF is recommended for SOP 7M10114 "Pharmaceutical Cosmetology" (master's degree in the profile direction – 1 year of study) together with a group of developers (heads of departments, teaching staff, employers) to discuss, rework and concretize the results of training in accordance with the list of disciplines included in the content of this SOP, taking into account their volume in loans. To this end, it is necessary to carry out a clearer definition of the tasks of the SOP, the final results of training and future professional skills, based on the role of these specialists in the healthcare system (until the beginning of the 2023-2024 academic year).

***The conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:*** strong positions – 0, satisfactory – 4, suggest improvements – 1, unsatisfactory – 0.

## 6.6. The standard "Student Support"

### *The evidentiary part*

After admission to the EP Pharmacy group, undergraduates, both specialized and scientific and pedagogical directions, taking into account their interests and scientific potentials, can choose the SOP "Cosmetology Pharmaceutical", which is included in the EP "Pharmacy". To do this, the official website of KazNMU contains general information about EP, including SOP, implemented at the University, for preliminary information of interested parties.

As part of the implementation of the Master's degree program "Cosmetology pharmaceutical" (scientific, pedagogical and specialized areas), KazNMU and UITM have sufficient material and technical base to ensure the conduct of all types of disciplinary and interdisciplinary training, practical and experimental research work of undergraduates provided for by the curriculum of the University, classrooms and laboratories equipped with modern devices, computers and appropriate teaching software, which are described by SOP. All disciplines are provided with educational and methodological documentation, including syllabuses, curricula, a list of control and individual tasks, current and final control, scientific and educational literature on all types of classes in quantities necessary for the implementation of the educational process, which are described in syllabuses, which are presented in previous standards and the EP itself.

Undergraduates are provided with the possibility of rapid exchange of information with domestic and foreign universities, enterprises and organizations, access to library collections of the main domestic and foreign academic and industry journals on the profile of training is provided. The cost of updating information resources and funding for the purchase of educational literature is growing every year.

UITM is a leader in the use of information technology among Polish universities. Thus, UITM was one of the first in Poland to introduce an integrated university management system, the benefits of which UITM students feel every day using a virtual university. UITM was the first in Poland to introduce electronic student cards, as well as e-indexes instead of paper ones. Currently, thanks to the full automation of all stages of the educational process through the Sirius system, KazNMU has all kinds of electronic services and services for students, teaching staff and employees (provision of transcripts, certificates, organization of a competition for vacant educational grants, provision of places in a dormitory, etc.).

In addition to classrooms, 3 laboratories are involved in the educational process (the Scientific and Educational Pharmacopoeia Center, the Scientific and Practical Control and Analytical Laboratory of Chemistry and Pharmacognosy, the scientific and educational laboratory of parapharmaceutical products), while the devices of the Scientific and Practical Control and Analytical Laboratory of Chemistry and Pharmacognosy are regularly verified (certificates of verification of the main control and analytical laboratories are presented).measuring instruments and equipment, valid until 09/20/2023). Classrooms for practical classes are equipped with appropriate chemical, physico-chemical equipment, equipment, chemical reagents, furniture, as well as other means in accordance with the requirements of the SanPiN approved by the Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated August 5, 2021 No. KR DSM-76.

The costs of the university are increasing annually, which amount to about 30%, which is explained by the constant introduction into the educational process and the use of modern educational resources and technologies.

It should be noted that KazNMU and UITM pay special attention to creating conditions for learning for people with disabilities. Thus, conditions have been created in the UITM for people with musculoskeletal disorders, hearing disorders, and visual impairment. The Department of the Authorized Rector for Work with Persons with Disabilities functions in the UITM. During interviews with target groups (deans, teaching staff. students) it was found that they are annually awarded a scholarship and individual training is organized.

The allocation of resources to support this program is carried out in accordance with the stages of its implementation, which are described in the joint SOP "Cosmetology Pharmaceutical".

Undergraduates of the SOP "Cosmetology Pharmaceutical", as well as in other SOP, have the opportunity to choose and discuss the topic of the dissertation at a meeting of the departments of specialized disciplines, having previously studied the literature data and other necessary material, including previously completed dissertations, together with the supervisor. The topics of the dissertation, as a rule, are harmonized with the scientific topic of the cathedral, contain elements of modern professional orientation, and at the same time correspond to the profile of the SOP of the magistracy. For example, the topics of master's theses on the SOP "Pharmaceutical Cosmetology" are focused on the development of formulations and technologies of cosmetics based on phytopreparations, that is, using active substances isolated from medicinal plant raw materials. Further, undergraduates and potential supervisors, after discussing the chosen topic, examine it for relevance, scientific novelty and practical significance. And only then, at the meeting of the department, the topic and the supervisor are approved. Special attention when choosing a topic is paid to modern achievements of science and practice, as the main criterion for the significance of the chosen topic of the dissertation

The SOP of the scientific and pedagogical direction provides for research practice, the purpose of which is to familiarize with the latest theoretical, methodological and technological achievements of domestic and foreign science, with modern methods of scientific research, processing and interpretation of experimental data in dissertation research. In the SOP of the profile direction, the final work is a master's project, which is based on experimental research work. At the same time, the University has determined the places of research practice: Phytolum LLP, ZHANAFARM PLP LLP, Bioton LLP, Antigen LLP, Zhaiyk-AS LLP (based on the submitted contracts with practice bases). The terms of research practice are determined by the State Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the individual work plan of a master's student in a specialty determined by the curriculum. The content of the research practice is determined by the topic of the dissertation research. It is also planned to perform separate fragments of research work during the internship at the UITM in the 3rd semester (for the scientific and pedagogical direction) and in the 2nd semester (for the profile direction).

Within the framework of free choice, undergraduates in SOP undergoing research and production practices (scientific, pedagogical and specialized areas) under the guidance of the supervisor, depending on the topic and direction of the dissertation, individually conclude contracts with the bases of practical training, with which the University has concluded Contracts and Agreements. At the end of the internship, undergraduates submit reports and characteristics from the supervisor from the practice. The list of practice bases is updated annually.

Within the framework of academic mobility, annual foreign internships of students are provided. So, currently, the internship of undergraduates mastering the SOP "Cosmetology Pharmaceutical" (SPD) is scheduled for the 3rd semester (2023-2024 academic year) in accordance with the Memorandum concluded between KazNMU and UITM.

In order to implement the principles of academic integrity and transparency of the organization and control of the educational process, KazNMU provides for an appeal system.

Undergraduates can apply orally or in writing to the Department of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs on quality issues of the SOP for the implementation of the curriculum.

### ***Analytical part***

The EEC confirms the availability of support systems for students, including support through the university's website, through personal appeals to the dean, vice-rector, department staff, scientific supervisor, etc. During the interview, undergraduates expressed full satisfaction with the conditions provided for training, interest in acquiring theoretical and practical skills, familiarization with the skills of pedagogical activity, stimulation to participate in scientific research and the implementation of master's theses, interest in the publication of scientific papers

and incentives for good studies, doing scientific work. The University, in the framework of joint cooperation with UITM, supports undergraduates in the implementation of academic mobility for the implementation of the program, mastering practical skills and the latest methods of developing cosmetic products, performing part of scientific research for the implementation of a master's thesis.

The members of the EEC believe that the existing material and technical base of the university contributes to the expansion of forms and methods of attracting students to participate in scientific research in the field of medicine and pharmacy, publication activity.

Analyzing the compliance of the submitted SOPs with the standards for international specialized (program) accreditation in accordance with the IAAR standards, it should be noted that they correspond to the parameters of the "Student Support" standard.

KazNMU has created conditions for the implementation of student-centered learning, evaluation of the effectiveness and efficiency of the learning process, as well as a system for monitoring the achievements of undergraduates in order to train highly qualified personnel for the implementation of scientific, pedagogical and profile activities.

***Strengths / Best practices***

There are no strengths according to this standard.

***Recommendations of the EEC***

There are no recommendations for this standard.

***The conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:*** strong positions – 0, satisfactory – 4, suggest improvements – 0, unsatisfactory – 0.

**6.7. The Resources Standard**

***The evidentiary part***

The teaching staff of the departments of SHF KazNMU includes competent professors, associate professors, lecturers, teachers and assistants, as well as deans of faculties and heads of departments, most of whom hold the main staff positions. The competence of teaching staff is constantly being improved through participation in various national and international grants, programs for the development of new technologies with the publication of scientific achievements in international journals with an impact factor, in monographs, textbooks, through training courses for professional and pedagogical qualifications (supporting documents - certificates and certificates are presented), as well as through participation in the work of international scientific and practical conferences with reports and publications (articles, theses). Academic mobility of teaching staff with participation in international conferences, internships, etc. contributes to this in many ways.

KazNMU has:

- clear, transparent and objective criteria for hiring employees (including teachers of practitioners), appointments, promotions, dismissals (Rector's Order No. 281 dated 05.06 2020 "Qualification requirements for the positions of the teaching staff of the NPJSC "KazNMU named after S.D. Asfendiyarov");
- Measures to encourage scientific activity to strengthen the link between education and scientific research (Board Decision Protocol No. 118 of 12/21/2020 "Regulations on awards of the NAO "KazNMU named after S.D. Asfendiyarov", responses of target groups in interviews with members of the EEC IARA);
- a local computer network connecting the main infrastructure facilities of the university: through a physical fiber-optic communication line - academic buildings, through VPN – dormitories and clinical bases;

- the software and technology infrastructure is represented by the following systems: the official website at <https://kaznmu.edu.kz/>, which reflects the mission, goals and objectives of the University, the unified automated information system (AIS) "Sirius";

- feedback from students is carried out through automated surveys through the module "Questionnaire" AIS "Sirius" (questionnaires for students are presented. For employers, analysis of students' results based on the results of the 1st half of the 2022-2023 academic year for undergraduates of the 1st year of study);

- a systematically implemented approved Schedule for inviting visiting professors from far and near abroad (a supporting document is presented - an approved Schedule, as well as a thematic lecture plan by visiting Professor Anna Malm from the University of Lublin (Poland) from April 26 to May 12, 2023). So, during the visit of the EEC IARA for the period from 04/26/2023 to 05/12/2023, the Vice-Dean of the Faculty of Pharmacy of the University of Lublin (Poland), Doctor of Pharmacy, Professor, Anna Malm arrived at the University with a series of lectures for undergraduates on SOP 7M10113 "Pharmaceutical Cosmetology". As a supporting document, the Training program of educational, clinical and scientific work of visiting Professor Anna Malm on the discipline "Research work of PhD students and undergraduates" for the period from 26.04. to 12.05.2023 is also presented. The total number of hours is 72" (Appendix 7A dated 04/24/2023).

Since 2022-2023, the Digital Services Center portal has been launched, which represents a single virtual digital Services Center and ensures the implementation of the "one window" principle in the provision of services to students, trainees, applicants.

For the development of various competencies of SHF students, there are: a pharmacy Simulation center; a Vivarium; a Laboratory of parapharmaceutical products; a Scientific and practical control and analytical laboratory of chemistry and pharmacognosy.

In the Simulation Center for Pharmacy, pharmaceutical development of various dosage forms used in cosmetology is carried out. In the Scientific and Practical Control and Analytical Laboratory of Chemistry and Pharmacognosy, undergraduates and researchers of KazNMU evaluate the quality of active pharmaceutical substances, excipients, intermediates formed at different stages of the technological process of preparation of medicines and finished products, including perfumery and cosmetic products. It is possible to conduct validation studies of new techniques used in assessing the quality of prepared pharmaceutical, parapharmaceutical perfumes and cosmetics. The vivarium has a sufficient base for conducting non-clinical studies (safety assessment) of pharmaceutical and parapharmaceutical products (active substances, medicines, perfumes and cosmetics).

The created unified information and educational environment of the university is a complex of modern innovative educational resources equipped with the necessary methodological, technological and technical (including telecommunications) support. It implements at the modern level the functions of not only training, but also the management of the educational process and its quality (from the recruitment of students and marketing of educational services to the formation and implementation of educational programs with the release of the final product – a competitive, highly qualified specialist).

### ***Analytical part***

During the work of the EEC IARA – during visits to departments, educational laboratories, laboratories of the research institute and practice bases, analysis of the submitted documentation, it was revealed that the material and technical base used for organizing the learning process, acquiring skills of pedagogical, scientific and practical activities is sufficient, meets the requirements for the full implementation of the SOP "Cosmetology pharmaceutical". The implementation of SOP at all levels of training (bachelor's, master's, doctoral, etc.) at the University is provided with free access for each student to information resources and library collection. During interviews with the heads of departments and teaching staff, the members of the EEC were convinced of competence, professional attitude to work, readiness to improve

knowledge and competencies in the field of pharmaceutical cosmetology, including within the framework of academic mobility to ensure modern conditions in the preparation of undergraduates in a new and promising specialty. KazNMU is the only educational center in the Republic that provides undergraduates with the opportunity to acquire a new specialty to solve professional problems in the field of healthcare and cosmetology. To implement the SOP, the faculty increases its theoretical and scientific potential through the passage of appropriate specialization courses in the Republic and abroad, participation in scientific conferences, by publishing scientific achievements at prestigious scientific forums, including with the involvement of undergraduates. In many ways, the joint plan of visiting professors of UITM and other foreign universities contributes to the implementation of SOP at the required level, which ensures the professional level of teaching staff and training of undergraduates in new methods of analyzing the quality, composition and development of pharmaceutical and parapharmaceutical perfumery and cosmetics.

The experts of the EEC IARA state that within the framework of the "Resources" standard, the University has the necessary teaching staff for the implementation of SOP in these specialties of the master's degree. The teaching staff of the departments is involved in providing methodological materials and recommendations, implementing scientific and methodological work based on research and generalization of best practices, in the long-term development of the learning process, improving its content and teaching methods, searching for new principles, patterns, methods, forms and means of organizing and technology of the educational process. It should be noted that thanks to close cooperation with foreign Universities, undergraduates are trained at a modern level, and the planned visits involve the expansion and development of new practical skills in pharmaceutical cosmetology. Equipping scientific laboratories with modern equipment and instruments creates the necessary conditions for carrying out research and experimental research work and writing master's theses.

#### ***Strengths / Best practices***

A schedule of visiting professors of the Department of Engineering Disciplines and Good Practices for the 2022-2023 academic year has been developed, approved and implemented, which includes leading scientists and teachers of foreign universities.

To carry out research work of undergraduates, doctoral students, PhD students and teaching staff with verified results, the University has an accredited Scientific and Practical Control and Analytical Laboratory of Chemistry and Pharmacognosy, equipped with modern equipment, which systematically passes state verification.

#### ***Recommendations of the EEC:***

There are no recommendations for this standard

***The conclusions of the VEC according to the criteria:*** strong positions – 2, satisfactory – 5, suggest improvements – 0, unsatisfactory – 0.

### **6.8. Standard "Transparency and documentation»**

#### ***The evidentiary part***

All participants in the educational process comply with the accepted standards and norms of academic policy and academic integrity. KazNMU has a special information resource (website, portal, etc.) through which information is distributed (including relevant) regarding the formation and implementation of the development plan of the EP. Instagram Facebook and Instagram are also the pages of the university on social networks. To ensure the openness of the discussion of problems and ideas for teaching undergraduates, the rector's blog is available on the official website of KazNMU. At UITM, after the start of the entrance campaign, students register in the university's online registration system. Admission to training is based on the provision of a complete set of documents, which can be found on the UITM website.

The Graduate Career Center supports and promotes the mission of KazNMU, promotes the effective employment of graduates and their adaptation to modern labor market requirements. Registration and employment of students is carried out through the Enbek website.

KazNMU has developed mechanisms and criteria for systematic evaluation of the effectiveness of the quality of teaching: intra-departmental control, open classes, mutual visits to classes, questionnaires of students, etc. The results of open classes are discussed at the meetings of departments, SOP. Journals of mutual visits are kept at the departments. The effectiveness of the quality of teaching is assessed by the coverage of thematic issues, the participation of students in the practical lesson, interest, activity, motivation of students in the educational process, the quality of academic performance, the assimilation of practical skills. The results of practical understanding of innovative forms of education are discussed at meetings of departments, methodological seminars, scientific and practical conferences. In order to determine the level of competence of a pedagogical worker to the qualification requirements, certification of teaching staff is carried out in KazNMU.

Every year, KazNMU conducts a survey of undergraduates through Sirius. In addition, syllabuses, teaching materials, and progress logs are available for students on AIS Sirius. For the development of communication skills, the ability to engage in publishing activities, a library with sections of an electronic catalog is located in Sirius KazNMU.

To assist the university in the field of training and employment of students, improving the quality of education, effective interaction with enterprises and organizations, clinical bases in the areas of training specialists, a regulation on the Council of Employers of Schools / Faculties (stakeholders) has been developed. Based on the analysis of world experience in the field of quality assurance systems of higher education, an internal quality assurance system has been developed in accordance with the requirements of ESG standards. The procedures and principles of assessing the quality of educational activities by the participants of the process are defined, where the analysis of the quality of the educational process, satisfaction of external and internal stakeholders, accreditation and rating are studied. Organization, conduct and control of work on the development of pedagogical competencies, advanced training courses on pedagogical skills of teaching staff and university staff.

To ensure effective information and software support of the university's processes, the sustainable functioning of the software and information technology environment using modern digital technologies to improve the quality of educational and other services provided by the university, the Department of Digitalization has been established at KazNMU. UITM was among the first in Poland to introduce an integrated university management system, the advantages of which UITM students experience every day using a virtual university. KazNMU has developed the SOP "Accounting, maintaining and current storage of personal files of students during the period of study at the University" for accounting, maintaining and current storage of personal files of students.

The regime of confidentiality of information related to relations arising in the process of attracting teachers to teaching activities is regulated by the norms of contracts for the provision of paid services. Students confirm their consent to the processing of personal data when concluding an agreement on the provision of educational services. This information is stored in the Department of Master's and Doctoral Studies. The Security Policy of the University of Information Technology and Management in Rzeszow is the responsibility of the Director for Security of the UITM. Its task is to carry out systematic preventive, educational and organizational activities aimed at ensuring security and public order at the university.

### ***Analytical part***

During the accreditation process, the experts of the EEC IARA made sure that all participants in the educational process comply with the accepted standards and norms of academic policy, an information system for discussing problems and ideas for teaching undergraduates was created, mechanisms and criteria for systematic evaluation of the

effectiveness of teaching quality were developed, conditions were created for the development of communication skills and the ability to engage in scientific activity, an internal quality assurance system was developed in accordance with the requirements of ESG standards. The management system of the university, academic management, the budget for training and allocation of resources, administrative staff and management correspond to the tasks of implementing the educational program at the level corresponding to state and international quality standards.

During the visit, the members of the EEC noted the transparency of information about the new SOP "Cosmetology Pharmaceutical" (University website). The possibilities of the new specialty include the prospects for the development of the cosmetology industry in the field of pharmacy. Since the SOP "Pharmaceutical Cosmetology" is a new direction in the formation of scientific, pedagogical and specialized personnel for practical healthcare, additional targeted explanations about the possibilities and purposes of this specialty are needed. In order to achieve the relevant goals, it is necessary to conduct career guidance work to inform graduates of the bachelor's degree and ensure wider awareness and transparency in the process of attracting potential candidates for enrollment in the SOP "Cosmetology Pharmaceutical", especially in the profile direction. The improvement of SOP in these areas, especially after the complete completion of SOP training and receiving feedback from graduates and employers, will undoubtedly contribute to the transparency and optimization of SOP documents to improve the implementation of the mission and objectives of SOP "Cosmetology Pharmaceutical" scientific, pedagogical and profile areas. Undoubtedly, this will be facilitated by further close and fruitful cooperation within the framework of the signed Memorandum with the UITM. Rzeszow (Poland), including opportunities for research practice in leading foreign scientific laboratories and practical centers.

After reviewing the "Development Program of NPJSC "KazNMU" for 2019-2023" posted on the University's website, the members of the EEC note that it does not prescribe specific measures for academic mobility (hereinafter – AM). Thus, the Program says "The University will attract leading foreign specialists, scientists and teachers to academic and scientific work on an ongoing basis, and will also pay the necessary attention to the academic mobility of its employees," which does not allow tracking its implementation by the timing and number of students and teaching staff participating in the AM.

Having familiarized themselves with the Graduate Model (LO in each EP), with the content of both EP submitted for accreditation, the members of the EEC note that 7 out of 8 LO in both programs are identical. A similar pattern is observed in the lists of elective disciplines offered in both EP. The list of elective disciplines in the EP SPD differs only in the presence of another discipline – "Aesthetic and decorative cosmetology".

Thus, the members of the EEC IARA believe that the management of the SHF needs to allocate information on each EP, based on the scientific, pedagogical and profile direction with a clear distinction between the goals, objectives and final results of training, as well as the features of each future specialty for a clear representation of students, parents and practical organizations of their professional activities.

#### ***Strengths / Best practices***

No strengths have been identified according to this standard.

#### ***Recommendations of the EEC***

The management of the SHF should ensure accessibility and transparency for all interested parties (students, parents, public organizations, etc.) of the plan for the implementation of academic mobility in the magistracy, as well as other information on the implementation of the SOP "Cosmetology Pharmaceutical" by posting it on the University's website on pages available for free viewing by all interested parties (until the beginning of the 2023-2024 academic year).



***The conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:*** strong positions – 0, satisfactory – 9, suggest improvements – 1, unsatisfactory – 0.

## **6.9. The "Quality Assurance" standard**

### ***The evidentiary part***

The quality assurance policy reflects the relationship between scientific research, teaching and learning and takes into account the contexts, both national, in which the NGO works, and intra-university. The system of internal quality assurance of education at the university is regulated in the Standards for the system of internal quality assurance of KazNMU. These standards are:

- describe the process of creating certain conditions that ensure their compliance with the established goals and the required level of quality, the development of a culture of continuous improvement of quality;
- reflect the relationship between teaching, learning and research, and takes into account both the national and intra-university context;
- developed in accordance with the criteria of ESG standards and are an information guide for managers and employees, including external users, and is intended to demonstrate management mechanisms for improvement and effective use.

Quality assurance, the process of creating certain conditions and allocating the necessary resources to ensure that educational programs, educational opportunities and funds meet the established goals and the required level of quality. The work of the Quality assurance Commission is a set of organizational structures, norms and rules, forms and methods of diagnostic and evaluation procedures that provide a unified assessment of the quality of educational activities and training of the student, expressed in the degree of their compliance with state mandatory standards and the needs of participants in educational relations.

Innovative teaching methods are introduced at the departments by conducting open classes. Teaching staff, employees, students and representatives of practical pharmacy are involved in the process of managing educational programs through their inclusion in the advisory bodies. The teaching staff is responsible for the high-quality preparation of the educational program, and the university management is responsible for the allocation of resources necessary for its implementation. In accordance with the policy of the university, when drawing up an educational program, the needs of the labor market, the requirements of international standards, etc. are taken into account, and it is also possible to make changes of up to 20% to the content of the SES. Undergraduates are involved in the process of evaluating educational programs by expressing their opinions and wishes at the end of the course of study or mastering a specific discipline and/or by means of a questionnaire to identify opinions and take into account comments, suggestions of direct consumers. The analysis of the received comments and suggestions on the organization of the educational process (schedule of classes, etc.), the curriculum for elective disciplines, the list of elective disciplines, the library fund and other issues related directly to the learning process is carried out. Based on the results of monitoring, corrective measures are being carried out, applications for the purchase of resources for educational, methodological, material and technical support of the educational process are being developed, which are discussed and approved by the Council of the SHF.

The University has developed mechanisms and criteria for the systematic evaluation of scientific and pedagogical personnel, their level of competence, and the professional potential of the staff. The University annually checks schools and departments on educational and methodological work, an internal audit is conducted annually on the integrated quality management system of KazNMU ([kaznmu.edu.kz](https://kaznmu.edu.kz)). KazNMU conducts various activities to motivate and stimulate employees: ensuring working conditions in accordance with labor legislation PK [https://kaznmu.edu.kz/rus/wp-content/uploads/2021/08/standarty-vnutrennego-obespecheniya-kachestva\\_-rus.pdf](https://kaznmu.edu.kz/rus/wp-content/uploads/2021/08/standarty-vnutrennego-obespecheniya-kachestva_-rus.pdf)[https://kaznmu.edu.kz/rus/wp-content/uploads/2021/08/standarty-vnutrennego-obespecheniya-kachestva\\_-rus.pdf%20](https://kaznmu.edu.kz/rus/wp-content/uploads/2021/08/standarty-vnutrennego-obespecheniya-kachestva_-rus.pdf%20),

employment contract and collective agreement, timely remuneration and payment of incentive allowances for quality work; teachers annually take advanced training courses on the basis of the Institute of Additional and Vocational Education, the Institute of DPO at the expense of the university; systematic referral of employees for advanced training outside the university; training and specialization of teaching staff abroad, including under the Bolashak program Grant programs of KazNMU (kaznmnu.edu.kz ). The Faculty of KazNMU constantly cooperates with the Association for the Support and Development of Pharmaceutical Activities of the Republic of Kazakhstan, providing advisory assistance.

As a monitoring of the implementation of the SOP, a Plan for the development of joint OPS was developed, approved on 05.09.2022, where the tasks, deadlines and stages of further improvement and development of the SOP are clearly spelled out (Annex 22). Since the reporting program is being implemented for the first time, a risk analysis will be given at the end of 1 year of study based on a questionnaire of undergraduates, teaching staff involved in the implementation of SOP, meetings and discussions of SOP with employers.

#### ***Analytical part***

The experts of the EEC made sure that the model of the quality management system of KazNMU is aimed at creating and improving mechanisms for the formation of internal guarantees to ensure the quality of educational services. At the same time, various tools and methods of quality management are used: monitoring the compliance of the educational process with the state standards of the main educational programs (through internal audits, open classes, intra-departmental mutual visits), assessing the satisfaction of students and teaching staff (questionnaires), monitoring and assessing the maturity of the quality management system of the structural units of the university (with external audit by a certification body), analysis of the effectiveness and efficiency of the QMS (external supervisory and recertification audits). KazNMU has established and successfully operates an internal control system through the activities of internal auditors who check the activities of structural units for compliance with the requirements of international quality standards.

#### ***Strengths according to this standard***

There are no strengths according to this standard.

#### ***Recommendations of the EEC***

There are no recommendations for this standard.

***The conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:*** strong positions – 0, satisfactory – 9, suggest improvements – 0, unsatisfactory – 0.

### **6.10. The standard "Continuous monitoring and periodic evaluation of a joint educational program"**

#### ***The evidentiary part***

The Master's degree SOPs 7M10113 and 7M10114 "Pharmaceutical Cosmetology" (scientific, pedagogical and profile areas) were developed for the first time in the 2019-2020 academic year (information from the Self-Assessment Report, p. 89), in the spring of 2022 they were updated (approved) at meetings of the relevant collegial bodies of the School of Pharmacy (meeting of the IWMS "Pharmacy and TFP" dated 03.05.2022 G., extract from Protocol No. 10) and the University (extract from the minutes of the Senate meeting of the NAO "KazNMU named after S.D.Asfendiyarov" No. 23/6 dated 06/28/2022). The first set of applicants (11 people) for a master's degree in the accredited SPD took place only in the 2022-2023 academic year and is currently being implemented by partner universities: KazNMU named after S.D. Asfendiyarov, Almaty, Republic of Kazakhstan, and the University of Information Technology

and Management, Rzeszow, Republic of Poland. An EP Development Plan has been drawn up. The University guarantees the quality of graduate training by evaluating, monitoring and reviewing educational programs.

The joint EP submitted for accreditation reflect the key professional competencies, the powers of graduates to carry out pharmaceutical activities. Within the framework of the Round Table with employers and other interested parties, the CED for all EP for the field of "Healthcare" was discussed and approved, including for the Master's degree program "Cosmetology Pharmaceutical". All elective disciplines of this SOP were developed according to the proposals of employers, students and partner universities.

Monitoring and evaluation of the educational program includes an annual review of the educational program to make suggestions and comments formulated by employers and other stakeholders with subsequent review, addition of the list of specialized, elective and practice-oriented disciplines and modules, implementation of the results of scientific research of the faculty of the department, systematic questioning of students and employers in order to determine the degree of satisfaction of employers with the level of training of students and others

It should be noted that the master's degree in SOP 7M10113 "Cosmetology pharmaceutical" is carried out only the first year and only the 2nd semester and the data of complex monitoring are accumulated. A more complete assessment of the monitoring and quality of the EP is possible only after the implementation of the first graduation of undergraduates and evaluation by employers.

#### ***Analytical part***

During the accreditation process, the experts made sure that KazNMU evaluates, monitors and periodically reviews Master's degree programs in order to obtain information on the degree of compliance with the requirements and updating the requirements for the design and implementation of SOP. The university has developed a procedure for approval, periodic review (revision) and monitoring of educational programs and documents regulating this process.

#### ***Strengths according to this standard***

There are no strengths according to this standard.

#### ***Recommendations of the EEC***

There are no recommendations for this standard.

***The conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:*** strong positions – 0, satisfactory – 4, suggest improvements – 0, unsatisfactory – 0.

### **6.11. Standard "Periodic quality assurance procedures»**

#### ***The evidentiary part***

The members of the EEC are presented with supporting documents that KazNMU has successfully passed institutional accreditation for compliance with IARA standards (certificate AB 3324, including certificates AB 3310 and 3311 for pharmaceutical industry technology), and also annually occupies leading places in various national rankings of universities in the country. The EEC members had the opportunity to get acquainted with the UITM website in Rzeszow, Poland, which has many certificates confirming the quality of education, management and organization. Thus, the constant participation of KazNMU and UITM. G. in ratings of various scales, it contributes to the improvement of the intra-university quality assurance system, including through participation in academic ratings of universities and educational programs conducted by recognized national and foreign/international agencies.

#### ***Analytical part***

During the accreditation process, the EEC experts made sure that for the successful implementation of the Master's degree programs 7M10113 and 7M10114 "Cosmetology Pharmaceutical", KazNMU and UITM undergo external quality assurance procedures in accordance with European standards and recommendations, striving to ensure progress in quality assurance. focusing on leading international universities.

***Strengths according to this standard***

There are no strengths according to this standard.

***Recommendations of the EEC***

There are no recommendations for this standard.

***The conclusions of the VEC according to the criteria:*** strong positions – 0, satisfactory – 2, suggest improvements – 0, unsatisfactory – 0.

**(VII) OVERVIEW OF STRENGTHS/BEST PRACTICES FOR EACH STANDARD**

**6.1. The standard "Right to participate. Acceptability"**

The strong side is the fruitful cooperation with such a partner university as the University of Information Technology and Management, Rzeszow, Republic of Poland, which allowed SHF KazNMU to develop a master's degree program in the specialty "Cosmetology pharmaceutical" of scientific and pedagogical (2 years of study) and profile (1 year of study) directions.

**6.2. Standard "Learning Outcomes"**

There are no strengths according to this standard.

**6.3. Standard "Development and approval of the program"**

There are no strengths according to this standard.

**6.4. The standard "Admission, academic performance, recognition and certification of students"**

Has no strengths according to this standard.

**6.5. The standard "Student-centered learning, teaching and assessment of academic performance"**

There are no strengths according to this standard.

**6.6. 6.6. The standard "Student Support"**

There are no strengths according to this standard.

**6.7. The Resources Standard**

A schedule of visiting professors of the Department of Engineering Disciplines and Good Practices for the 2022-2023 academic year has been developed, approved and implemented, which includes leading scientists and teachers of foreign universities.

To carry out research work of undergraduates, doctoral students, PhD students and teaching staff with verified results, the University has an accredited Scientific and Practical Control and Analytical Laboratory of Chemistry and Pharmacognosy, equipped with modern equipment, which systematically passes state verification.

**6.8. Transparency and Documentation Standard»**

There are no strengths according to this standard.

**6.9. The "Quality Assurance" standard**

There are no strengths according to this standard.

**6.10. The standard "Continuous monitoring and periodic evaluation of a joint educational program"**

There are no strengths according to this standard.

**6.11. Standard "Periodic external quality assurance procedures"**

There are no strengths according to this standard.

**(VIII) OVERVIEW OF QUALITY IMPROVEMENT RECOMMENDATIONS****6.1. The standard "Right to participate. Acceptability»**

There are no recommendations for this standard.

**6.2. Standard "Learning Outcomes»**

There are no recommendations for this standard.

**6.3. Standard "Development and approval of the program»**

There are no recommendations for this standard.

**6.4. The standard "Admission, academic performance, recognition and certification of students»**

There are no recommendations for this standard.

**6.5. The standard "Student-centered learning, teaching and assessment of academic performance»**

The management of the SHF is recommended for SOP 7M10114 "Pharmaceutical Cosmetology" (master's degree in the profile direction – 1 year of study) together with a group of developers (heads of departments, teaching staff, employers) to discuss, rework and concretize the results of training in accordance with the list of disciplines included in the content of this SOP, taking into account their volume in loans. To this end, it is necessary to carry out a clearer definition of the tasks of the SOP, the final results of training and future professional skills, based on the role of these specialists in the healthcare system (until the beginning of the 2023-2024 academic year).

**6.6. The standard "Student Support»**

There are no recommendations for this standard.

**6.7. The Resources Standard**

There are no recommendations for this standard.

**6.8. Transparency and Documentation Standard»**

The management of the SHF should ensure accessibility and transparency for all interested parties (students, parents, public organizations, etc.) of the plan for the implementation of academic mobility in the magistracy, as well as other information on the implementation of the SOP "Cosmetology Pharmaceutical" by posting it on the University's website on pages available for free viewing by all interested parties (until the beginning of the 2023-2024 academic year).

**6.9. Standard "Quality assurance»**

There are no recommendations for this standard.

**6.10. The standard "Continuous monitoring and periodic evaluation of a joint educational program"**

There are no recommendations for this standard.

**6.11. Standard "Periodic external quality assurance procedures»**

There are no recommendations for this standard.

**(IX) OVERVIEW RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE ORGANIZATION OF EDUCATION**

There are no recommendations.

**(X) RECOMMENDATION TO THE ACCREDITATION COUNCIL**

The members of the EEC came to the unanimous opinion that the SOP of the magistracy 7M10113 – Pharmaceutical Cosmetology (scientific and pedagogical direction, training - 2 years) and 7M10114 – Pharmaceutical Cosmetology (profile direction, training - 1 year), included in the group of educational programs "Pharmacy", implemented by the Non-profit Joint Stock Company "Kazakh National Medical University named after S.D. Asfendiyarova" and the University of Information Technology and Management, Rzeszow, Republic of Poland, can be accredited for a period of 5 years.



**Appendix 1. Parameters for primary specialized SOP accreditation:  
7M10113 "Pharmaceutical Cosmetology" (2 years) and 7M10114 "Pharmaceutical  
Cosmetology" (1 year)**

№	Standards and criteria of the international specialized (program) accreditation of the joint educational program of higher and (or) postgraduate education	The position of the joint educational program			
		Strong	Satisfactory	Suggests improvement	Unsatisfactory
<b>Standard 1. "The right to participate. Acceptability"</b>					
1.	Educational organizations planning to implement a joint educational program must be recognized by the relevant authorities of the country in which they are located		+		
2.	Participation in the implementation of a joint educational program, assignment of a joint academic degree must comply with national regulations		+		
3.	The academic degree(s) to be awarded must correspond to the national qualifications system of the countries in which the protected areas are located		+		
4.	A joint educational program should be developed and implemented with the involvement of all partner educational organizations	+			
5.	The conditions for the development and implementation of a joint educational program should be clearly stated in the agreement on cooperation between partner educational organizations		+		
<i>The cooperation document should set out the following:</i>					
6.	information about the academic degree (qualifications, degrees) awarded for the development (completion) of a joint educational program		+		
7.	coordination and responsibility of the involved partner educational organizations in relation to management and financial organization (including financing, cost and income sharing, etc.)		+		
8.	rules for admission and selection of students		+		
9.	mobility of students and teachers		+		
10.	rules for conducting exams, methods for evaluating students' results, recognition of ECTS credits and procedures for awarding joint academic degrees		+		
<b>Total according to the standard</b>		<b>1</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Standard 2. "Learning outcomes»</b>					
1.	The joint educational program should be developed in accordance with the established goals, including the expected learning outcomes.		+		
2.	The qualifications obtained as a result of the development of a joint educational program should be clearly defined, explained and correspond to a certain level of the national qualifications framework in higher education and, consequently, the qualifications framework in the European Higher Education Area (FQ-EHEA)		+		
3.	The disciplines of the joint educational program should ensure the achievement of the planned learning outcomes, including knowledge, skills and competencies of the relevant field(s) of education		+		
4.	The joint educational program should ensure the achievement of the planned learning outcomes by each student		+		
5.	The joint educational program, if relevant, should take into account the minimum agreed learning conditions specified in the European Union Directive 2005/36/EC, or the corresponding general learning framework established in accordance with the Directive		+		
<b>Total according to the standard</b>					

<b>Standard 3. "Development and approval of the program»</b>					
1.	The structure and content of the joint educational program should be defined and developed on the basis of a student-centered approach in teaching to ensure the achievement of the planned results		+		
2.	A joint educational program should be developed with the participation of students and other stakeholders		+		
3.	The European Credit Transfer System (ECTS) should be applied correctly, and the distribution of loans should be clear		+		
4.	The joint educational program provides coverage of the required workload. The bachelor's degree program is at least 180-240 ECTS credits; the joint master's program is at least 90-120 ECTS credits and should not be less than 60 ECTS credits at the second level of the cycle (credit ranges according to FQ-EHEA); for joint PhD programs, the range of credits is not specified		+		
5.	The joint educational program has mechanisms to control the workload and the average time to complete the program		+		
<b>Total according to the standard</b>		0	5	0	0
<b>Standard 4. "Admission, academic performance, recognition and certification of students"</b>					
1.	Partner educational organizations must have pre-defined, published and consistently applied admission rules and relevant requirements for applicants		+		
2.	Selection procedures should correspond to the level of the joint educational program, regulate all periods of the "life cycle" of training, i.e. admission, academic performance, recognition and certification		+		
3.	Recognition of qualifications and periods of study (including recognition of prior studies) should be applied in accordance with the Lisbon Recognition Convention and supporting documents		+		
<b>Total according to the standard</b>		0	3	0	0
<b>Standard 5. "Student-centered learning, teaching and assessment of academic performance"</b>					
1.	The joint educational program should be developed in accordance with the planned learning outcomes			+	
2.	The applied approaches to teaching and learning should be adequate for their achievement of the planned learning outcomes		+		
3.	A joint educational program should take into account the diversity of students, respect their needs, including potentially different cultural characteristics of students		+		
4.	The rules of the examinations and the assessment of the achieved learning outcomes should correspond to the expected learning outcomes		+		
5.	Examinations and evaluation of the achieved results by students should be conducted by partner educational organizations in accordance with the established rules		+		
<b>Total according to the standard</b>		0	4	1	
<b>Standard 6. "Support for students"</b>					
1.	Partner educational organizations should ensure the functioning of appropriate student support services that contribute to achieving the planned learning outcomes		+		
2.	Student support services should contribute to achieving the planned learning outcomes		+		
3.	Student support services should take into account the possible specific problems of students on mobility		+		
4.	Support services should, when allocating, planning and providing educational resources, take into account the needs of various groups of students (mobility students, adults, working, distance learning, as well as students with disabilities) and take into account the principles of a student-centered approach in teaching and learning		+		
<b>Total according to the standard</b>		0	4	0	0
<b>Standard 7. "Resources"</b>					



1.	The teaching staff must be sufficient and adequate (qualifications, professional and international experience) to implement a joint educational program	+			
2.	The conditions provided must be sufficient and adequate, taking into account the expected learning outcomes		+		
<i>Partner educational organizations are responsible for the quality of their employees and providing favorable conditions for their effective work. Therefore, educational organizations recognizing the importance of teaching should:</i>					
3.	develop clear, transparent and objective criteria for hiring, appointment, promotion, dismissal and comply with them in their activities		+		
4.	provide opportunities for career growth and professional development of teachers		+		
5.	encourage scientific activities to strengthen the link between education and research		+		
6.	encourage the use of innovative teaching methods, teaching and the use of advanced technologies		+		
7.	The NGO should strive to ensure that the educational equipment and software used to ensure that students achieve the planned results of a joint educational program are similar in the relevant industries	+			
<b>Total according to the standard</b>		2	5	0	0
<b>Standard 8. "Transparency and documentation"</b>					
1.	Relevant information about the joint educational program should be documented and published taking into account the specific needs of students on mobility			+	
2.	Information about the joint educational program should take into account the requirements and admission procedures, the catalog of courses/disciplines, examination and evaluation procedures, etc.		+		
3.	Partner educational organizations should have and implement mechanisms for collecting and analyzing information about their activities, about the partner's activities within the framework of a joint educational program and use the information obtained in the work of an internal quality assurance system		+		
4.	The NGO should ensure the involvement of students and employees in the collection, analysis of information and planning of subsequent procedures		+		
<i>When collecting information, the NGO should take into account the following:</i>					
5.	key performance indicators		+		
6.	information about the contingent of students		+		
7.	the level of academic performance, achievements of students and dropout		+		
8.	satisfaction of students with the quality of implementation of a joint educational program		+		
9.	availability of educational resources and student support services		+		
10.	employment of graduates		+		
<b>Total according to the standard</b>		0	9	1	0
<b>Standard 9. "Quality assurance"</b>					
1.	Partner educational organizations should have a published quality assurance policy that is part of their strategic management		+		
2.	The quality assurance policy is more effective if it reflects the relationship between learning, teaching, and scientific research and takes into account the national contexts in which partner educational organizations operate		+		
3.	Internal stakeholders should develop and implement this policy through appropriate structures and processes involving external stakeholders		+		
4.	Partner educational organizations should apply joint internal quality assurance processes in accordance with Part One of the ESG		+		
<i>The quality assurance policy supports</i>					
5.	the organization of a quality assurance system, which provides for joint internal quality assurance processes of partner educational organizations		+		

6.	to departments, schools, faculties, institutes and other departments, as well as the management of the educational organization, employees and students performing quality assurance duties		+		
7.	academic integrity and freedom, as well as intolerance to manifestations of various kinds of academic dishonesty		+		
8.	processes that provide intolerance of any kind or discrimination of students and teachers		+		
9.	participation of external stakeholders in quality assurance		+		
<b>Total according to the standard</b>		0	9	0	0
<b>Standard 10. "Continuous monitoring and periodic evaluation of the joint educational program"</b>					
1.	Partner educational organizations should monitor and periodically evaluate the joint educational program to achieve their goals and confirm compliance with the needs of students and society		+		
2.	The results of these processes should lead the NGO to the continuous improvement of the joint educational program		+		
3.	All stakeholders should be informed of any planned or undertaken actions regarding the joint educational program		+		
4.	The joint educational program should be regularly evaluated and reviewed with the involvement of students and other stakeholders		+		
<b>Total according to the standard</b>		0	4	0	0
<b>Standard 11. "Periodic external quality assurance procedures"</b>					
1.	Partner educational organizations should undergo external quality assurance procedures in accordance with European Standards and Recommendations (ESG) on a regular basis		+		
2.	The educational organization should strive to ensure that the progress made since the last external quality assurance procedure is taken into account when preparing for the next procedure		+		
<b>Total according to the standard</b>		0	2	0	0
<b>IN TOTAL</b>		3	59	2	0