REPORT

on the results of the work of the external expert commission to assess the compliance with the requirements of the Standards for International Initial Accreditation of Master's Programs in Health (based on WFME/ AMSE/ESG) of the educational program "7M10102 Management in Healthcare" (profile direction) of the
NJSC " Asfendiyarov Kazakh National Medical University"
from April 16 to April 18, 2024

Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating
External Expert Commission

Addressed to the
Accreditation Council IAAR

«АККРЕДИТТЕУ ЖӘНЕ РЕЙТИНГТІҢ
ТӘУЕЛСІЗ АГЕНТТІГІ» КЕМ

НУ «НЕЗАВИСИМОЕ АГЕНТСТВО
АККРЕДИТАЦИИ И РЕЙТИНГА»

INDEPENDENT AGENCY FOR
ACCREDITATION AND RATING

REPORT

on the results of the work of the external expert commission to assess the compliance with the requirements of the Standards for International Initial Accreditation of Master's Programs in Health (based on WFME/AMSE/ESG) of the educational program "7M10102 Management in Healthcare" (profile direction) of the NJSC " Asfendiyarov Kazakh National Medical University"   from April 16 to April 18, 2024

Almaty   **April 18, 2024**

CONTENTS

(I)LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

- PRS - Point-Rating System
- SFA State Final Attestation
- APE - Additional Professional Education
- USIMS - Unified State Information Monitoring System
- C.S - Credit Units
- LRA - Local Regulatory Acts
- persons with disabilities - Persons with Disabilities
- MTS - Material and Technical Support
- MoH RK - Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
- persons with disabilities - Persons with Disabilities
- EP - Educational Program
- MPEP - Main Professional Educational Program
- IA - Intermediate Attestation
- FTS - Faculty and Teaching Staff
- PEAP - Financial and Economic Activity Plan
- WP - Working Program
- WPD - Working Program of the Discipline
- PP - Practice Program
- WEP - Working Educational Plan
- EMM - Educational and Methodological Management
- ATF - Assessment Tools Fund
- FRMO - Federal Register of Medical Organizations
- CSMC - Coordinating Scientific and Methodological Council
- CMC - Cycle Methodological Commission
- EIEE- Electronic Information and Educational Environment

(II) INTRODUCTION

In accordance with Order No. 48-24-OD dated February 2, 2024, the Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating (IAAR) conducted an assessment of compliance with the Standards for International Initial Accreditation of Master's Programs in Health (based on WFME/AMSE/ESG) for the educational program "7M10102 Health Management" (profile direction) of the NJSC "Asfendiyarov Kazakh National Medical University" (hereinafter – KazNMU, Order No. 150-22-OD dated December 21, 2022, third edition) in a hybrid format from April 16 to April 18, 2024.

The report of the external expert commission (EEC) contains an assessment of the educational program according to IAAR criteria, recommendations of the EEC for further improvement of the educational program, and parameters of the educational program profile.

EEC Composition:

IAAR Expert, EEC Chair - Elena Sergeevna Bogomolova, MD, Privolzhsky Research Medical University, Ministry of Health of Russia (Russian Federation, Nizhny Novgorod), *offline participation*;

IAAR Expert - Saltanat Esengalievna Uzbekova, Candidate of Medical Sciences, NJSC "Semey Medical University" (Republic of Kazakhstan, Semey), *offline participation*;

IAAR Expert - Aigul Maratovna Nugmanova, MD, NPO "Kazakh-Russian Medical University" (Republic of Kazakhstan, Almaty), *offline participation;*

IAAR Expert - Aigul Amanzholovna Ismailova, MD, Professor, Academician of the International Academy of Sciences, NJSC "Astana Medical University" (Republic of Kazakhstan, Astana), *offline participation*;

IAAR Expert - Gulnar Dostanovna Sultanova, Candidate of Medical Sciences, NJSC "West Kazakhstan Medical University" (Republic of Kazakhstan, Aktobe), *offline participation*;

IAAR Expert - Aizhat Ashimkhanovna Seydakhmetova, Candidate of Medical Sciences, JSC "South Kazakhstan Medical Academy" (Republic of Kazakhstan, Shymkent), *offline participation;*

IAAR Expert- Zhanara Kuanyshbekovna Buribayeva, MD, Associate Professor, Kazakh Medical University "Higher School of Public Health" (Republic of Kazakhstan, Almaty), *offline participation;*

IAAR Expert - Zhenisbek Zharilkasinovich Zharilkasin, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, NJSC "Karaganda Medical University" (Republic of Kazakhstan, Karaganda), *offline participation;*

IAAR Expert, EEC Employer - Aigul Asenkyzy Asen, PhD, Director of the State Enterprise "City Polyclinic No. 7" (Republic of Kazakhstan, Almaty), *offline participation;*

IAAR Expert, **EEC Employer**- Ernar Erkinbekovich Koishyman, Deputy Chief Physician of LLP "Neurorehabilitation Center 'Luch'" (Republic of Kazakhstan, Karaganda), *online participation*;

IAAR Expert, EEC Student- Radana Olegovna Karbayeva, 4th-year student of the "General Medicine" program, Kazakh National University (Republic of Kazakhstan, Almaty), *offline participation;*

IAAR Expert, EEC Student - Aizhan Nurzhanovna Baytuganova, Master of Medical Sciences, 2nd-year doctoral student of the "Nursing Science" program, NJSC "Astana Medical University" (Republic of Kazakhstan, Astana), *online participation;*

IAAR Expert, EEC Student- Nurzhan Nurtasuly Nurakhimov, 2nd-year master's student of the "Health Management" program, NJSC "Semey Medical University" (Republic of Kazakhstan, Semey), *online participation;*

IAAR Expert, EEC Student- Aigerim Serikpaikyzy Makulbek, 1st-year master's student of the "Public Health" program, NJSC "Karaganda Medical University" (Republic of Kazakhstan, Karaganda), *online participation.*

Coordinator from the Agency - Alisa Satbekovna Dzhekenova, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Head of Medical Projects at the Agency for Institutional and Specialized Accreditation of Medical Educational Organizations (Astana), *offline participation.*

(III) GENERAL INFORMATION ABOUT THE EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION

The non-profit joint-stock company " Asfendiyarov Kazakh National Medical University" (hereinafter – KazNMU or the University) is the largest medical university in the country, providing

quality training for specialists at all levels of higher and postgraduate education in all areas of healthcare.

Asfendiyarov KazNMU was established by the decree of the Council of People's Commissars of the RSFSR "Network, structure, and intake of higher educational institutions under the jurisdiction of the RSFSR for the 1930/1931 academic year" dated December 2, 1930.

The university's development strategy is aimed at implementing state policy in the field of healthcare and medical education, providing the industry with highly qualified medical personnel, and improving the quality and accessibility of medical care for all segments of the population.

Educational activities at KazNMU are carried out in accordance with the Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education", the State Program for the Development of Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan for

2011–2020, and the National Project "Quality and Accessible Healthcare for Every Citizen Healthy Nation" (Resolution of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 12, 2021, No 725).

Since 2006, KazNMU has been preparing bachelors, masters, and PhD doctors based on the principles of the triad (education, science, practice). As a signatory of the Magna Charta Universitatum, in 2011, in accordance with the principles of the Bologna Process, the university transitioned to the credit-based learning technology for undergraduate education, supported by the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

Asfendiyarov KazNMU employs renowned Kazakhstani scientist-educators, academicians of the National Academy of Sciences of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Russian Academy of Medical Sciences, the Academy of Preventive Medicine of the Republic of Kazakhstan, international academies, honored scientists and educators, and distinguished doctors and pharmacists.

The status of a research university creates conditions for the integration of scientific activities, the educational process, and clinical practice.

Asfendiyarov KazNMU has cooperation agreements with universities from far and near abroad, including: Nagasaki University (Nagasaki, Japan), Asia-Pacific University (Beppu, Japan), Parkway College (Singapore); University of Perugia (Perugia, Italy), Danube University Krems (Krems, Austria); Kyrgyz State Medical Academy (Bishkek, Kyrgyz Republic), Bogomolets National Medical University (Kyiv, Ukraine), National Pharmaceutical University (Kharkiv, Ukraine), I.M. Sechenov First Moscow State Medical University (Moscow, Russia), among others. University staff actively participate in conducting research projects under international programs and grants.

The educational program "7M10102 Health Management" (profile direction) was developed and included in the Register of educational programs of higher and postgraduate education in 2019. The educational program "7M10102 Health Management" (profile direction) at KazNMU is implemented in accordance with Annex No. 002 of the State License for Educational Activities No. KZ74LAA00017008 dated September 19, 2019. The structure and content of the educational program are developed according to the requirements of the State Compulsory Standards for education levels in healthcare (Order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 4, 2022, No. КР ДСМ-63) and standard curricula for medical and pharmaceutical specialties (Order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated January 9, 2023, No. 4).

The accredited educational program was developed and implemented to meet new needs for professionally trained specialists in health management in the context of healthcare system transformation. The educational program follows the implementation of the University's Mission and reflects the educational strategy in accordance with the Concept of Healthcare Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan until 2026.

The educational program is a sequentially structured document developed in accordance with the current and prospective requirements of the educational market for the training of health managers.

The planned learning outcomes of the educational program include basic and professional competencies of graduates according to relevant training blocks. The levels of formation of these

5

competencies are aligned with the working programs of disciplines, practices, research work, assessment and methodological materials, and final certification.

The characteristics of the educational program include: goal, duration of the program, level of higher education, types of professional activities for which graduates are trained, planned learning outcomes, and more. The program is implemented in Russian and Kazakh languages. The program's qualifications and profile characteristics are correctly presented with sufficient detail. The included disciplines reveal the essence of current issues in healthcare.

The educational process of the program involves the use of active and interactive forms of training sessions. The program is sufficiently supported by an experienced teaching staff. Evaluation of the educational program allows for the conclusion that the level of methodological support is adequate. The content of the disciplines corresponds to the competency model of the graduate. The resource provision of the educational program, presented in sections on staff, informational-library, methodological, and material-technical support, meets the standards. The assessment system within the educational program is clearly defined and specified for each discipline of current, intermediate, and final control.

(IV) DESCRIPTION OF THE PREVIOUS ACCREDITATION PROCEDURE

The initial specialized accreditation of the educational program "7M10102 Health Management" (profile direction) was conducted in 2021 by the Autonomous Organization "Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating."

(V) DESCRIPTION OF THE EEC VISIT

The work of the External Evaluation Commission (EEC) was carried out based on the approved Program for the hybrid visit of the expert commission for the international accreditation of basic medical and pharmaceutical education programs at the Non-profit Joint-stock Company "Asfendiyarov Kazakh National Medical University" (Almaty) from April 16 to April 18, 2024 (Appendix 1).

To coordinate the work of the EEC, an inaugural meeting was held on April 16, 2024, during which the powers were distributed among the commission members, the visit schedule was clarified, and consensus was reached on the choice of evaluation methods.

In order to obtain objective information about the quality of educational programs and the entire university infrastructure, and to clarify the content of the self-assessment reports, meetings were held with the rector, vice-rectors of the university in various areas of activity, heads of structural divisions, department heads, faculty members, students, graduates, and employers. A total of 293 representatives participated in the meetings (Table 1).

Table 1 – Information on Staff and Students Participating in Meetings with the IAAR EEC:

Category of Participants	Number
Rector	1
Vice-rectors	3
Heads of structural divisions	27
Acting Deans	6
Department Heads	51
Faculty Members	103

Students, Master's Students, PhD Students	95
Graduates	5
Employers	2
Total	293

During the meetings between the IAAR EEC and the university's target groups, the mechanisms for implementing the university's policy and specific data presented in the self-assessment report were clarified.

The EEC members visited the practical training bases of the accredited educational program. During the site inspections, the EEC members familiarized themselves with the condition of the material and technical resources of the clinical and theoretical department practice bases:

1. Technological Park, 94 Tolebi St.
2. Simulation Center of Asfendiyarov KazNMU, 100 Shevchenko St.
3. Scientific Genomic Laboratory, 94 Tolebi St.
4. City Clinical Hospital No. 4, 220 Papanina St.
5. City Clinical Hospital No. 5, 220 Dostyk Ave.
6. Polyclinic No. 10, 5V Zhuldyz Microdistrict
7. Children's City Infectious Diseases Hospital, 229a Baizakova St.
8. Emergency Medical Care Center, 40 Manas St.
9. Department of Sanitary and Epidemiological Control, 3a Zhibek Zholy Ave.
10. National Center of Expertise, 3 Zhibek Zholy Ave.
11. National Center of Expertise, 3 Zhibek Zholy Ave.
12. Academy of Nutrition, 66 Klochkov St.
13. Keruet "Medicus", 45/1 Bukhar Zhyrau Blvd.

The clinical bases are represented by multidisciplinary, well-equipped, highly specialized medical facilities providing the population with high-quality specialized inpatient and consultative medical care.

The practical bases are represented by accredited laboratories in the National Center of Expertise under the Committee for Sanitary and Epidemiological Control of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan. These laboratories conduct comprehensive sanitary-bacteriological, parasitological, radiological, hygienic, and epidemiological studies in the field of sanitary and epidemiological well-being of the population.

External experts requested and analyzed the university's working documentation to confirm the information presented in the Self-Assessment Report. Additionally, the experts reviewed the university's online presence via the official website https://www.kaznu.kz/.

During the visit, the EEC studied the regulatory and educational-methodological documents related to the accredited educational program, educational-methodological materials of the disciplines, and other methodological documents. The commission visited the structural units and departments listed in the program, which support the educational process, and verified the operation of the information systems used by KazNMU for conducting online classes.

All materials requested by the commission were provided by university representatives in a timely manner. To obtain objective information for assessing KazNMU's activities, EEC members conducted visual inspections of classrooms, laboratories, the library, clinical bases, the university's own clinics, and other facilities that support educational activities. They also conducted observations, interviews with staff from various structural units, faculty members, employers, and administered surveys to the teaching staff and students.   KazNMU ensured the presence of all employees and

7

individuals specified in the visit program. The three-day Program for conducting the EEC programmatic accreditation was fully completed as planned, with activities distributed over the days.

On the first day, April 16, 2024, a preliminary meeting was held between the Chair and members of the IAAR EEC, during which the goals, program, and responsibilities of the EEC members were discussed.

Key issues were addressed by the EEC members, and additional information was identified that needed to be requested from KazNMU's structural units for validating and confirming the accuracy of information/data during the accreditation process.

A meeting with KazNMU Rector M.E. Shoranov was held as scheduled, including an oral presentation on KazNMU's current activities. Meetings were also held with KazNMU's Vice-Rectors: Zh.A. Kalmatayeva (Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs), U.M. Datkhaev (Vice-Rector for Social Affairs and Digitalization), S.E. Sultangazieva (Vice-Rector for Clinical Affairs), I.R. Fakhradiev (Vice-Rector for Research and Head of the KazNMU Scientific and Technological Park).

Meetings were conducted with the Deans of KazNMU: S.Kh. Izmailova (Acting Dean of the School of General Medicine-1), G.A. Shopaeva (Acting Dean of the School of General Medicine-2), N.Zh. Zhardemalieva (Acting Dean of the International Faculty), K.D., M. Altynbekov (Acting Dean of the School of Dentistry), R.R. Aipov (Dean of the School of Pediatrics), K.B. Karibaev (Dean of the School of Public Health), and N.N. Ivanchenko (Head of the Department of Master's and Doctoral Studies).

Meetings were held with the heads of KazNMU's structural units, including: A.B. Tashetova, Head of the Department of Academic Work (DAW), G.S. Kodekova, Deputy Head of DAW, E.L. Stepkina, Head of the Department of Strategic Development and International Cooperation, M.B. Zhakupova, Acting Head of the Simulation Center, M.Zh. Zhumadilov, Managing Director, A.Kh. Utebaliyeva, Acting Head of the Scientific Library, A.B. Alchimbaev, Head of the Department of Digitalization, S.S. Iskakova, Head of the Admissions Office, Z.B. Abdrakhmanova, Head of the Department of Social and Educational Work, M.B. Turgunbaev, Head of the Administrative Department, S.A. Beysenova, Head of the State Procurement Department, A. Akhmet, Acting Head of the Legal Department, Zh.U. Kubeeva, Chief Accountant, A.G. Shamsutdinova, Head of the Science Department, A.G. Nagasbekova, Head of the Department of Human Resources Development, A.E. Kosaliev, Head of the Career and Alumni Center, M.T. Zhangirbaev, Head of the Quality Management System Department, A.T. Kutysheva, Head of the Educational-Methodical Department, A.E. Tumanbaeva, Head of the Department of Educational-Methodical Process Organization, Zh. Iskakova, Acting Head of the Testing Center, M.S. Sagatbekova, Acting Head of the Registrar's Office. A.A. Abdresheva, Head of the Student Office, A.E. Abylgazina, Head of the Academic Quality Department, K.K. Jailobaev, Head of the Operational Works Department, M.T. Abydkerova, Acting Head of the Department of Clinical Work, A.Sh. Ibraeva, Deputy Head of the Scientific-Technological Park. M.A. Tian, Head of the Press Service.

Meetings were also held with the heads of the relevant departments: L.K. Kosherbaeva, Head of the Department of "Health Policy and Management" and Director of the educational program 7M10102 «Management in Healthcare», A.A. Maukenova, Associate Professor of the Department of "Health Policy and Management", A.B. Kumar, Professor of the Department of "Health Policy and Management", A.Sh. Aimakhanova, Head of the Department of "Biostatistics and Basics of Scientific Research", Zh.A. Kozhekenova, Head of the Department of "Public Health", A.E. Tumanbayeva, Head of the Department of "Communication Skills".

During the meeting with the EEC experts, the representatives of the relevant departments actively participated and highlighted the main areas of their activities, including organizing the educational process, developing, implementing, and managing educational programs, working with students and faculty, and interacting with the rectorate and other KazNMU structures.

Information about the implementation of the educational process in the departments, the conditions provided by the university for their activities, motivation, and stimulation of faculty, recruitment and career advancement, financial support for faculty, and other aspects were obtained during interviews.

During meetings with KazNMU faculty, the EEC experts inquired about the implementation of educational, scientific, and clinical processes at KazNMU, career growth opportunities, faculty incentives, provision of necessary resources for the educational process (material-technical, informational, etc.), and interaction with administrative and management structures. Faculty also participated in a survey.

During the visual inspection of KazNMU's material and technical facilities, the EEC experts visited lecture halls and classrooms, as well as the Simulation Center, Scientific Genomic Laboratory, Scientific Library, Testing Center, Concordia (Congress Hall), Academy Hall, KazNMU Technopark, and the KazNMU Museum. During the visual inspection, the EEC members familiarized themselves with the state of the material-technical bases of the basic departments.

During the site visit to the departments of the educational program "7M10102 Health Management," members of the EEC attended practical classes at the Department of "Health Policy and Management" and reviewed the syllabi of individual courses and resource maps. They examined instructional materials for students, lesson plans, assessment tools, and literature for independent study.

The EEC members also visited the practice base of the accredited program at the "Keruen-Medicus" Medical Center, established in 2000. The clinic is one of the largest private medical organizations in Kazakhstan. The multidisciplinary medical center "Keruen-Medicus" is located in the central part of Almaty and occupies 8 floors. The medical center provides the following services: Adult clinic: consultations with specialists (therapist, cardiologist with ECG recording, ophthalmologist, urologist, dermatologist, surgeon, neurologist, otolaryngologist, mammologist, gastroenterologist), pregnancy care.

- Children's health center, providing care for children from 0 to 1 year old (the "Baby" program), consultations with pediatricians (pediatrician, neurologist, orthopedist, ophthalmologist, ENT).

- Children's hospital, private maternity hospital, and diagnostic and consultative services, including ultrasound diagnostics, fetal cardiotocography, video endoscopy, X-ray services. - Surgical department, 24-hour inpatient facility, 24-hour procedure room, laboratory, and physiotherapy department.

On April 17, 2024, the EEC experts met with KazNMU students. The meeting was conducted in an interview format, addressing issues of student support at the university, the functioning of student representation, student participation in university activities, and the development of educational programs. Students expressed their positive opinions about the departments, administration, and support units of the university, as well as the educational process.

In accordance with the accreditation procedure, a survey was conducted among 27 faculty members and 30 students, including both junior and senior students.

A meeting with employers was also held, where it was revealed that the university closely collaborates with clinical bases, implements clinical training at these bases, and graduates work in these organizations. Job fairs help in selecting and inviting young specialists for employment. Employers participate in the formation of the educational program, partially through their familiarization with it.

(VI) COMPLIANCE WITH SPECIALIZED ACCREDITATION STANDARDS

STANDARD 1: "MISSION AND OUTCOMES"
Evidential Part

The mission of the educational program (EP) "7M10102 – Management in Healthcare" in the profile direction (PD) is to train a new generation of leaders capable of comprehensively solving

management and healthcare economics tasks, developing strategies for the development of medical business, forming a team of professionals, and effectively using the latest business and IT solutions.

To ensure the connection between the EP and healthcare issues, the University maintains constant and effective communication with practical healthcare organizations. The Atchabarov Research Institute of Fundamental Medicine operates under the University, coordinating the main directions, forms, and content of the University's scientific work. The University's research work, an important component of the EP, is based on fundamental and applied research, aligns with national policy priorities in education, science, and innovation development, the University's mission and strategy, and is carried out through grants, government funding, and on a contractual basis.

In the framework of implementing the EP " Management in Healthcare " PD, the University has a sufficient material and technical base, ensuring the conduct of all types of disciplinary and interdisciplinary training, practical and research work of master's students, as provided by the University's curriculum. The University has classrooms and laboratories equipped with modern instruments, computers, and appropriate software for teaching.

The mission of the EP is realized by providing each master's student access to databases, library collections, and electronic libraries, formed according to the full list of disciplines of the main educational program, and the Internet. All disciplines are provided with educational and methodological documentation, including syllabi, educational plans, lists of control and individual tasks, programs of current and final control, scientific and educational literature for all types of classes in quantities necessary for the implementation of the educational process.

Master's students have the opportunity for prompt information exchange with domestic universities, enterprises, and organizations, and access to library collections of major domestic and foreign academic and industry journals related to their training profile.   The mission undergoes a phased approval process involving all interested parties, including the department, KOP, Academic Council, Scientific Council, and University Board, as evidenced by meeting minutes presented in Appendix 1.3 and internal regulatory documents (Regulation on Educational Programs of S.D. Asfendiyarov KazNMU, Regulation on Employers' Council of Schools/Faculties of NJSC KazNMU, Standards for Internal Quality Assurance of Educational Activities of S.D. Asfendiyarov KazNMU).

To implement the Mission and Vision, policies, and quality objectives, the University has developed strategic directions for KazNMU's development, including plans to improve the quality of master's programs, agreed upon with senior management and university staff directly involved in their development, across major areas of activity.

KazNMU guarantees academic freedom to its staff and master's students regarding the current EP, allowing reliance on various viewpoints in describing and analyzing management, economics, and business issues; the use of new research results to enhance the study of specific disciplines/issues without expanding the educational program; and improving disciplines, lecture topics, and research themes.

Master's program leaders and students are free to choose and participate in research (creative) projects, choose publication venues for research results in domestic scientific journals and/or foreign peer-reviewed journals, and participate in national and international conferences and symposia related to their field.

The use of new research results within the educational program has led to an improved organization of the educational process: from knowledge transfer to the formation of professional competencies and revising the teaching methods used. To develop specific competencies in master's students, teachers have used innovative, practice-oriented teaching methods: group discussion method, portfolio, combined survey, small group teaching method, and presentations.

Innovative teaching methods are characterized by maximum proximity to real professional situations and allow the most effective formation of professional competencies and master's students' responsibility for learning outcomes. Multimedia technologies are widely used for visualizing lecture material in departments. All lecture halls are equipped with the necessary multimedia equipment.

The final learning outcomes that master's students should demonstrate after completing the EP «Management in Healthcare» PD are assessed in the context of a competency-based approach,

10

which forms the ability to solve professional problems and perform professional activities. To acquire a complex of professional, intercultural, and communication competencies, a master's student must master the knowledge of a set of basic and profile disciplines, both mandatory and elective components, in full. Graduates should be able to make managerial decisions according to the changing healthcare market environment, analyze the condition of the studied object, determine priorities, plan over time, organize, lead, and control the production process; consider economic and geographical aspects; and socially, morally, and psychologically adapt to changing conditions and various types of professional activities.

After completing the master's program in the educational program "Management in Healthcare" PD, graduates can continue their careers outside medical organizations and apply the competencies formed during the master's program: critical and analytical thinking, innovative activities, the ability to independently set relevant and prospective research tasks and solve them using modern methodologies and information technology techniques; skills in independent research work (literature analysis on the topic, development of conceptual and methodological research foundations, problem justification, object and subject definition, goal, tasks, hypothesis formulation, selection of adequate research methods); the ability to conduct the necessary theoretical and empirical research, analyze results, make significant theoretical and professional-practical conclusions; and the ability to transfer new technologies and synthesize new ideas.

Analytical Part

The mission and goal of the EP correspond to the mission and goal of KazNMU and are reflected in the Academic Policy of KazNMU. The University's mission reflects the educational strategy following the KazNMU Development Program for 2024–2028, approved by the Government of Kazakhstan on August 16, 2023, No. 682.

To create conditions for the development of medical science, training systems, and the retraining and advanced training of healthcare personnel, the Concept for the Development of Integrated Academic Medical Centers in strategic partnership with leading international universities and medical organizations is being developed. The EP mission contributes to the development of medicine and healthcare in Kazakhstan through the accelerated practical implementation of breakthrough scientific discoveries, the introduction of innovative diagnostic and treatment technologies, the training of future science and practice leaders, and the promotion and use of evidence-based, personalized, and preventive medicine to improve health, quality of life, and longevity.

KazNMU demonstrates the ability to dynamically respond to rapid changes in the external environment and lead people. One example is our commitment to implementing the principles of the Bologna Process, complying with ISO international standards, accreditation standards, and national and international ranking criteria.

The EP «Management in Healthcare» PD mission is formulated following state education standards, state and market needs, university strategy, employer demands, and student wishes, based on studying theoretical and practical healthcare issues.

The EP foundation allows for the implementation of individual educational trajectories, strengthening interdisciplinary training within the tasks of implementing relevant priority development areas with the possibility of transforming individual blocks according to employer requests for the formation of specific professional competencies. This approach aims to ensure the effective integration of master's students into the modern scientific and professional community.

To discuss with all stakeholders, the EP, including the mission, is annually discussed with stakeholders. To correct and update the mission of educational programs, information on state and market needs, employer demands, and student wishes will be systematically collected.

Regarding the first standard, the following aspects are satisfactory: the focus of the educational program "Management in Healthcare" PD on employer and labor market expectations; the presence of necessary conditions for realizing intellectual and creative abilities of master's

11

students; teaching in state, Russian, and English languages; compliance with the State Mandatory Education Standard; and continuous qualitative updating of the material and technical base.

However, standard 1.3.3 needs improvement in terms of more specific definition of learning outcomes for the EP.

Strengths/Best Practices:
No strengths were identified for this standard.

EEC Recommendations:
It is recommended that university leadership improve the EP: formulate learning outcomes more clearly and measurably, and build a system for achieving learning outcomes through disciplines and final attestation. Review period: April 2025.

EEC Conclusions by Criteria:
➢ Strong positions: 0
➢ Satisfactory: 11
➢ Require improvement: 1
➢ Unsatisfactory: 0

STANDARD 2. "EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM"

Evidence
Upon completing the «Management in Healthcare» Master's program, graduates can pursue careers in the healthcare management sector, including medical organizations. They can apply the competencies formed during the program: critical and analytical thinking, innovative activities, the ability to set current and prospective research tasks independently, and solve them using modern methodologies and information technology skills. Graduates will also have skills in independent research work (analyzing literature on the topic, developing conceptual and methodological research foundations, substantiating problems, defining objects and subjects, formulating goals, tasks, hypotheses, and selecting adequate research methods). They can conduct necessary theoretical and empirical research, analyze results, draw significant theoretical and practical conclusions, and have the ability to transfer new technologies and synthesize new ideas.

The research practice bases for the «Management in Healthcare» program include management structures of healthcare organizations (human resources departments, statistical departments, etc.), the National Research Center for Health and Welfare, the European WHO Center for Primary Health Care, the Health Departments of cities and regions of Kazakhstan, research institutes within KazNMU (Kazakh Research Institute of Oncology and Radiology, Research Institute of Eye Diseases, etc.), and medical organizations. The material and technical capabilities of clinical bases are constantly expanding and can also be used in the educational process for training healthcare managers. For instance, in the 2022-2023 academic year, the practice base included IP Yeshimbetova.

To analyze results and develop measures to improve the educational process, internal commissions (award commission, tariff commission, expert commissions, etc.) are formed. The results of the commissions' work are reviewed at the Academic Council meetings and serve as a basis for measuring and improving the overall effectiveness of the University.

Competencies directly related to strategic planning will be acquired and consolidated by students through studying hospital management issues and strategic planning as one of the management functions in courses such as "Strategic Management," "Policy and Organization of Medical Organization Activities," and "Healthcare Management." These competencies are particularly relevant for healthcare managers with managerial experience who participate in developing and analyzing the strategic plan of an organization at the departmental level.

The University has created a favorable environment for the broad application of practical activities in educational process organizations at all levels of education. At KazNMU, the following are implemented:

- The Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan's project "Strategic Human Resource Management";

- The Healthcare Development Concept of the Republic of Kazakhstan until 2026; - The Higher Education and Science Development Concept of the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2023 – 2029;

- The Development Program of the non-commercial joint-stock company "Asfendiyarov Kazakh National Medical University" for 2024 – 2028;

- KazNMU's Human Resources Policy.

The research environment for master's students is represented by the Research Institute of Fundamental and Applied Medicine named after B.A. Atchabarov, established in 2010, which provides research facilities, including scientific-educational and clinical-experimental laboratories, a department for implementing scientific technologies in healthcare practice, and a fundraising department.

Teaching and learning critical assessment of literature, articles, and scientific data, as well as the application of scientific developments in the «Management in Healthcare» program, are reflected in case-based learning methods, management case solutions, and other assignments. Thus, interactive technology courses help form scientific thinking, determine causal relationships based on evidence, and apply scientifically-based evidence in practice, including conducting relevant literature searches and critically evaluating published medical literature.

The "«7M10102 – Management in Healthcare» " Master's program involves comprehensive approaches to developing professional and personal qualities. This includes acquiring knowledge necessary for effective professional activities, specific practical skills of a healthcare manager, critical thinking skills, basics of scientific research, effective management activities, effective communication with medical staff and patients, knowledge of healthcare legal frameworks, and building one's educational trajectory throughout life.

Analytical Section

The approach to training master's students fully meets market requirements since the learning outcomes of the «Management in Healthcare» program and elective courses are regularly discussed with practical healthcare representatives, members of professional associations, and other stakeholders interested in improving learning outcomes. To ensure the connection between the program and healthcare issues, the University maintains constant and effective communication with practical healthcare organizations. The use of innovative technologies in the educational process enhances the relevance and quality of training.

In order to ensure communication between the educational program (OP) and healthcare issues, the University maintains constant and effective communication with practical healthcare organizations. The use of innovative technologies in the University's educational process relies on a strong material and technical base, which is continuously updated in accordance with current requirements.

Ensuring appropriate attention to patient and family safety is guaranteed by including disciplines such as management psychology, scientific research methodology, and healthcare quality assurance in the educational program. Furthermore, knowledge reinforcement occurs through both theoretical and practical training during internships supervised by practice leaders, where professional, intercultural, and communicative competencies are honed and improved. Communicative competence of students is also assessed in specialized disciplines.

The educational program reflects the sequence of goals, structure, content, teaching and learning methods, quality, academic level, and achievements of master's students, as well as the adequacy of resources for its support and enhancement. The master's program is structured and includes: (1) theoretical education covering basic and specialized discipline cycles; (2) practical

training of master's students through various internships and professional placements; (3) research work, including the completion of a master's thesis for specialized programs; (4) experimental research work, also including the completion of a master's thesis for specialized programs; (5) intermediate and final assessments.

According to the second standard, satisfactory aspects include: the professional level of resource provision for achieving the goals and objectives of the educational program; the orientation of the program towards employer expectations and the labor market; the structured focus of joint programs on providing master's students with necessary competencies; a wide range and in-depth study of economic and management disciplines within the professional module; availability of state grants for the «Management in Healthcare» educational program; involvement of employers with extensive practical experience in healthcare and medical education in teaching various disciplines.

Strengths/best practices according to this standard: None identified.

Recommendations from the External Evaluation Committee (ВЭК): None.

Conclusion of the External Evaluation Committee (ВЭК) based on criteria:
➢   ***Strong positions – 0***
➢   ***Satisfactory – 18***
➢   ***Suggesting improvements – 0***
➢   ***Unsatisfactory – 0"***

STANDARD 3. "STUDENT ASSESSMENT POLICY":

Evidential Part

The University's system for monitoring students' academic achievements includes ongoing and milestone assessments, midterm and final certifications. Students' achievements in all types of assessments are evaluated according to assessment sheets and translated into a grade-rating letter system and a traditional grading scale, presented in table form. The assessment of students' academic achievements is conducted through various forms of assessment as determined by the department, aligning with teaching methods and reflected in syllabi, with the final assessment form detailed in academic plans. The list of mandatory disciplines for final assessment during interim certification is regulated by completed disciplines reflected in the curriculum. According to the number of credits completed in disciplines, a technical specification is compiled – a matrix of test tasks specifying the number of test questions.

The policy and methods of student assessment are reviewed and approved at the School of Public Health's Educational Programs Committee (EPC). The overall policy, principles, and methods for assessing master's students are reflected in the following internal regulatory documents: Academic Policy; Regulations on ongoing, midterm, and final assessment of students at the National Academy of Medicine (KazNMU); SOP: Organization and conduct of written exams, including in distance mode; SOP: Development and approval of the system for assessing academic achievements; SOP: Rules for ongoing assessment of student progress. Student academic achievements are assessed based on competence level indicators developed by the departments.

Assessment methods are fully aligned with teaching methods and cover the assessment of all student competencies during practical sessions and exams. Departments develop assessment tools such as control questions, situational tasks, and others for evaluating academic achievements. Methods used to assess student competencies are defined in discipline syllabi discussed at departmental meetings and EPC. Assessment criteria are communicated to students during the first session of each discipline and are included in the syllabus according to SOP: Preparation, discussion, and approval of syllabi. SOP defines the procedure for forming, discussing, and approving discipline/module syllabi.

14

To implement principles of academic integrity and transparency in organizing and controlling the educational process, the University has an appeals system according to KazNMU's Academic Policy. Feedback surveys with students are conducted via the "Sirius" system upon completion of a discipline and after passing an exam, through the student's personal account twice a year following the end of the semester. The frequency, forms of receiving/providing feedback, analysis of results, and corrective action plans are discussed at Academic Council meetings, followed by proposals for improvement.

Policy and methods of student assessment are reviewed and approved at the School of Public Health's Educational Programs Committee (EPC). The overall policy, principles, and methods for assessing master's students are reflected in a complex of internal regulatory documents.

From the 2019-2020 academic year, due to distance learning during the pandemic, documents were developed and implemented for conducting exams in distance mode. Methods for assessing ongoing progress, milestones, midterm, and final assessments in the working curriculum are developed by departments (oral interviews, written surveys, project assessment, portfolio assessment, etc.). Examination questions and lists of practical skills are also developed by University departments, discussed at department meetings, reviewed and approved at EPC, Academic Council, and Scientific Council meetings. Tasks for ongoing, milestone, and final assessments are updated annually by departments (up to 30%).

During the first session of each discipline, teachers inform students of the criteria for assessing academic achievements in that discipline. The assessment policy is reflected in the discipline's syllabus. Since the 2017-2018 academic year, the University has transitioned to electronic journals on the "Sirius" platform, where students' grades for all types of assessments are promptly recorded (promoting transparency in grade assignment) and automatic calculation of the exam result rating is conducted. Starting from this academic year, the University has begun transitioning to the new "Hero" platform.

Assessment of students' academic achievements is based on competence level indicators developed by departments. The system for monitoring students' academic achievements at KazNMU includes ongoing, milestone, and final assessments of students' progress and final state certification. Students' knowledge is assessed through control questions (Appendix 3.1), tickets, situational tasks, and practical skills through problem-solving, presentations, essays, and others.

During ongoing progress assessments, students' academic achievements are evaluated on a 100-point scale for each completed assignment (answers in class, completion of assignments for independent student work, practical skills, etc.). The procedure for assigning grades (ongoing, milestone, final assessment) is detailed in discipline syllabi.

Students are transferred to the next year based on the results of the academic year (taking into account the results of the summer semester). The transfer of students from year to year is formalized by the order of the University's Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs. A mandatory condition for transferring students from year to year is the absence of debts in prerequisite disciplines; for first-year students, the absence of debts in disciplines of the first academic period; students with academic debts not exceeding 12 ECTS credits; absence of financial debts. Full automation of the assessment process and openness in assessment methods and policies of student academic achievements help to avoid conflicts of interest at KazNMU.

The Registrar's Office (hereinafter referred to as the Registrar's Office) is responsible for maintaining a record of students' academic achievements throughout their studies and documenting them in an academic transcript (a document of established form in the University containing a list of completed disciplines for the corresponding period of study, with grades and credits according to the curriculum). Individuals who have completed their studies and passed the final certification are awarded an academic degree and issued a state diploma with an appendix (transcript). The transcript specifies the latest ratings in the grade-rating letter system for all academic disciplines, final assessment, and their volume in academic credits.

Implementation of the Master's program in the educational program «7M10102 – Management in Healthcare» is conducted using a complex of educational activities and methods.

15

Analytical Part

Assessment methods are fully aligned with teaching methods and cover the assessment of all student competencies during practical sessions and exams. Assessment of academic achievements includes the use of assessment tools developed by departments in various forms (control questions, situational tasks, etc.).

Methods used to assess student competencies are defined in discipline syllabi discussed at departmental meetings and EPC. Assessment criteria are communicated to master's students during the first session of each discipline as presented in the syllabus.

To implement principles of academic integrity and transparency in organizing and controlling the educational process, the University has an appeals system according to KazNMU's Academic Policy.

According to the third standard, satisfactory aspects include the availability of clearly developed regulatory documents regulating unified criteria and principles for assessing students' academic achievements, methods and tools for controlling and assessing knowledge, use of reliable, valid diverse assessment methods focused on assessing final learning outcomes and students' competencies; application of an integrated approach to assessing academic achievements.

However, standard 3.2.1 needs improvement in aligning planned learning outcomes with final assessment outcomes, i.e., applying comprehensive final assessment aimed at examining graduates' achievement of educational program outcomes.

Strengths/Best Practices:
No strong points were identified according to this standard.

Recommendations from the External Evaluation Committee (EEC):
The university management is recommended to improve the educational program by developing checklists for assessing the results of master's project defenses, focusing on the achievability of the educational program's learning outcomes. Enhancing discipline assessment with an orientation toward assessing learning outcomes is also recommended. Review period: April 2025.

Conclusions of the External Evaluation Committee (VЭK) by criteria:
➢ *Strong positions – 0*
➢ *Satisfactory – 9*
➢ *Suggesting improvements – 1*
➢ *Unsatisfactory – 0*

Standard 4: "LEARNERS"

Evidence-based Part

Aligning with its mission "to prepare competitive healthcare professionals," KazNMU has defined admission policies for the Master's program in "7M10102 - Healthcare Management" in order to select the best candidates for enrollment, adhering to legislative requirements regarding educational equality and ethical aspects.

To meet employers' medical staffing needs with scientific and pedagogical personnel, the University periodically analyzes admission policies based on current labor market demand data, actively engaging in developing proposals for state-funded training placements with the Ministry of Education and Science, Ministry of Health, and local executive bodies. The Ministry of Health establishes the volume of state-funded places for medical personnel training across medical universities based on competition results among higher educational institutions for state-funded placements.

KazNMU has established mechanisms for career guidance aimed at selecting candidates for enrollment in the Master's program "7M10102 - Healthcare Management." Career guidance activities are conducted at the department level during the final years of bachelor's degree and for interns seeking in-depth theoretical and research knowledge in healthcare management.

Information about the commencement of the admissions committee is available to all interested parties on the KazNMU website. An annual "Open Day" is held to provide applicants with comprehensive information about Master's degree programs: program objectives and outcomes, acquired competencies, further educational opportunities (following completion of the Master's program, there is an opportunity to continue education in the PhD program), as well as education quality, employment programs, the University's research environment, etc.

The cohort formation of Master's students is based on the state educational order for training scientific and pedagogical personnel, as well as tuition fees paid by citizens or other sources. Admission to the Master's program with specified training specialties is announced through mass media.

The University provides comprehensive support to Master's students throughout their education, including continuous counseling, technical and informational support. Support for students includes academic supervision and advisory services. Within two months of enrollment, each Master's student is assigned a research supervisor (academic consultant) for guiding the Master's thesis.

According to KazNMU's Academic Policy, the University determines the main principles in academic activities by providing all students with equal opportunities to receive quality and accessible education; ensuring academic freedom for students in choosing elective disciplines and tracking their own progress on the e-learning portal; adhering to anti-corruption standards and standards of academic honesty, and demonstrating intolerance towards any forms of corruption and discrimination; ensuring transparency and accessibility of information for stakeholders, contributing to achieving planned learning outcomes.

Analysis of employers' needs for scientific and pedagogical personnel is conducted based on interviews with representatives of universities in Kazakhstan, graduates of the University's program, and representatives of the RSE on PHV "National Research Center for Maternal and Child Health" of the Ministry of Health of Kazakhstan, regional health departments of Kazakhstan, etc.

KazNMU has established career guidance mechanisms aimed at selecting candidates for enrollment in the Master's program "7M10102 - Healthcare Management." Career guidance activities aimed at selecting candidates for enrollment in the Master's program "7M10102 - Healthcare Management" are conducted at the department level during the final years of bachelor's degree and for interns seeking in-depth theoretical and research knowledge in healthcare management.

The university has defined admission criteria based on established typical admission rules for the Master's program in "7M10102 - Healthcare Management."

Assessment of the applicant's level of preparation for education in the educational program «Management in Healthcare» is carried out on profile disciplines. The list of disciplines, the content of test questions, the level of difficulty, the number of tasks, etc. are indicated on the official website of the University.

Together with copies of documents, their originals are provided for verification, conducted in the presence of the applicant. After verification, the originals of the documents are returned. If an incomplete list of documents is provided, the admissions committee does not accept documents from applicants.

Analytical Part

KazNMU's activities are aimed at developing and implementing educational, research, and scientific programs in such a way as to provide Master's students with all the skills necessary for both professional growth and personal development.

Master's students are provided with the opportunity to form their own educational trajectory, taking into account knowledge needs through the choice of elective discipline. Disciplines included

17

in the Curriculum and Educational Program reflect the current directions of development in the studied area, taking into account the prospective scientific directions of the releasing department, the modern development of the region, employers' needs, adaptation to the labor market, and students' requests. The Curriculum and Educational Program are reviewed annually based on proposals received from stakeholders during working meetings, discussions, surveys, etc.

Master's students are involved in the development of educational programs through participation in program discussions (invited to department meetings, stakeholder meetings), using survey methods to assess the quality of implemented programs, the degree of satisfaction of Master's students with the educational services provided, organizing various types of work, etc. The data obtained from the survey will be used to improve the educational programs and their implementation processes.

To meet employers' medical staffing needs with scientific and pedagogical personnel, the University periodically analyzes admission policies based on current labor market demand data, actively engaging in developing proposals for state-funded training placements with the

Ministry of Education and Science, Ministry of Health, and local executive bodies. The Ministry of Health establishes the volume of state-funded places for medical personnel training across medical universities based on competition results among higher educational institutions for state-funded placements.

Regarding Standard 4.3.5, improvements are needed to expand students' opportunities in implementing an individual educational trajectory, including the inclusion and expansion of distance learning forms in this educational program.

Strengths/Best Practices
No strengths were identified for this standard.

Recommendations of the Expert Commission
The university management is recommended to take measures to expand students' opportunities in implementing an individual educational trajectory, including the inclusion and expansion of distance learning forms in this educational program. Review deadline: April 2025**.**

Expert Commission Findings by Criteria
  ➢ *Strong positions – 0*
  ➢ *Satisfactory – 16*
  ➢ *Expected improvements – 1*
  ➢ *Unsatisfactory – 0*

STANDARD 5. "ACADEMIC STAFF / TEACHERS"

Evidence part
To create conditions for forming a cohesive and highly competitive academic staff at the University, a new personnel policy has been developed. This policy has effectively fostered human resources development and implemented a fair policy for each employee's development.

The University implements its personnel policy to ensure that the profile of the teaching staff strictly corresponds to the range and balance of pedagogical skills. This is achieved through constant monitoring and regulation of the ratio of academic staff teaching basic and specialized disciplines.

At KazNMU, in order to continuously improve the quality of educational services, a policy for recruitment and formation of the staff is implemented in accordance with the changing needs and qualification characteristics of the staff. The performance assessment of the academic staff is conducted during recruitment in accordance with the qualifications required for teachers as defined in job descriptions. The selection for positions in the academic staff is based on the Rules for

Competition for the Positions of Teaching and Research Staff of KazNMU (academic staff, researchers).

The effectiveness of teaching at the medical university is determined not only by a high level of competence in medical knowledge but also by pedagogical competencies. Enhancement of teaching competencies among the academic staff is achieved through the Pedagogical Mastery Course (formerly the H.S. Nasybullina Center/School of Pedagogical Mastery) in full compliance with the developed author's "Model of Competencies of KazNMU Teacher." This approach ensures that each academic staff member undergoes training in pedagogical competencies at least once every five years.

Research competence is realized through annual planning and reporting on scientific research activities within the departments, including publication activities, participation in scientific research, presentations at conferences with publications, patenting inventions, and implementation acts based on clinical and scientific research outcomes. Scientific competence is centrally implemented with the assistance of the B. Atchabarov Scientific Research Institute for the implementation of the Development Program of Asfendiyarov Kazakh National Medical University for 2024-2028. The goal of the B. Atchabarov Institute is to create a mobile infrastructure for university science based on the development of professional education, the use of modern methods of research management, and the training of highly qualified scientific personnel with effective implementation of research results in applied medicine.

When forming the academic staff, the University takes into account the merits of candidates measured by their level of qualification, professional experience, results of research activities, and teaching experience. Priority is given to individuals possessing skills in scientific and pedagogical activities who acknowledge the mission of KazNMU.

As a result of the academic staff assessment, employees receive an additional part of their basic salary determined based on the specific evaluation received by the employee according to the established scale of key performance indicators of this profession. In accordance with the "Rules for Attestation of the Academic Staff of the National Autonomous Organization "Asfendiyarov Kazakh National Medical University," employees of the Department of Health Policy and Management receive a stimulating allowance.

By the results of 2023, the Department of Health Policy and Management took 2nd place among all departments of KazNMU and was awarded the "Leader of KazNMU" certificate, and bonuses were paid to the department's employees.

In addition to academic activities, teachers of the Department of Health Policy and Management engage in scientific activities. As of the beginning of the 2023-2024 academic year, the composition of the academic staff included 61% (of which 17% have an H-index and 13% have citations). In addition, academic staff participating in the competitions of scientific and technical projects (hereinafter - STP) funded by the Ministry of Health (hereinafter - MoH RK) and the Ministry of Science and Higher Education (hereinafter - MoSHE RK) of the Republic of Kazakhstan, including international organizations.

The development of the academic staff management system includes training, support, and motivation programs for teachers. The University ensures mandatory professional development for academic staff every five years, offering opportunities and promoting career growth and professional development. The "Rules for Training and Professional

Development of Personnel of the National Autonomous Organization Asfendiyarov KazNMU" regulate this process. Training and certification courses for medical and pharmaceutical personnel are conducted by the Institute of Additional and Professional Education.

Within the framework of the ERASMUS project "Euro Speak," two department employees underwent training in IELTS. The University reimbursed the costs incurred for taking the exam.

Since 2006, KazNMU has been training bachelors, masters, and PhD doctors based on the principles of trinity (education, science, practice). As a signatory of the Great Charter of Universities, in 2011, in accordance with the principles of the Bologna Process, the university transitioned to a credit technology for bachelor's education supported by the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

19

In addition to academic activities, teachers of the Department of Health Policy and Management engage in scientific activities. As of the beginning of the 2023-2024 academic year, the composition of the academic staff included 61% (of which 17% have an H-index and 13% have citations). Additionally, academic staff participating in competitions of scientific and technical projects (hereinafter - STP) funded by the Ministry of Health (hereinafter - MoH RK) and the Ministry of Science and Higher Education (hereinafter - MoSHE RK) of the Republic of Kazakhstan, including international organizations.

In accordance with the "Internal Regulations of the University," pedagogical workers have the right to moral and material encouragement in their pedagogical activities in the form of state awards, honorary titles, bonuses, and named scholarships in the manner provided by the current legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The balance between pedagogical, scientific, and professional qualifications contributes to the high quality of teaching in the educational program "7M10102 - Healthcare Management" PN.

Analytical Part:

For systematic evaluation of the competence of teachers, the university administration conducts attestation of the academic staff in accordance with the rules of MoSHE RK on attestation of university teachers. The composition of the attestation commission is approved annually, which includes vice-rectors, deans of faculties, heads of structural units, and the chairman of the trade union committee. The attestation format includes analysis of educational and methodical and scientific achievements of the teacher over 5 years, assessment of student and managerial opinions, professional growth, and expert examination of the quality of teaching by independent experts. Based on the results obtained, the attestation commission draws conclusions on the compliance of the teacher with the position held and makes recommendations for further improvement of professional development.

The preparation and qualification of the academic staff correspond to the direction of the implemented educational programs and the level of positions they hold. The educational process involves university teachers with the appropriate academic degree, academic title, work experience, or those working part-time in relevant organizations.

Professional development of the academic staff is carried out in various directions. The choice of directions is determined by the need to improve pedagogical mastery, introduce innovative teaching technologies into the educational process according to the educational program of the department, and improve the content of taught disciplines in accordance with modern scientific requirements. Academic staff in the educational program «Management in Healthcare» have improved their qualifications in the directions of "Business Analyst."

In order to exchange experience and improve pedagogical qualifications, academic mobility programs are regularly implemented by inviting foreign specialists as visiting professors.

The preparation and qualification of the academic staff correspond to the direction of the implemented educational programs and the level of positions they hold. The educational process involves university teachers with the appropriate academic degree, academic title, work experience, or those working part-time in relevant organizations.

The development of the academic staff management system includes training, support, and motivation programs for teachers. The University ensures mandatory professional development for academic staff every five years, offering opportunities and promoting career growth and professional development. Training and certification courses for medical and pharmaceutical personnel are conducted by the Institute of Additional and Professional Education.

According to the fifth standard, satisfactory aspects include: maintaining the optimal level of qualitative and quantitative composition of the academic staff; monitoring the quality of teaching disciplines; monitoring the professional progress of teachers; maintaining the optimal level of qualitative and quantitative composition of the academic staff; effective management of KazNMU staff activities aimed at supporting academic staff in realizing their maximum professional and personal potential, career growth.

Strengths/Best Practices:
No strong points identified for this standard.

Recommendations from the VEC: None

Conclusions of the VEC by Criteria:
➢ Strong positions - 0
➢ Satisfactory - 9
➢ Suggest improvements - 0
➢ Unsatisfactory - 0

STANDARD 6. "EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES"

Evidence Part
KazNMU has sufficient material and technical resources for faculty and students to ensure high-quality implementation of educational programs. The University's infrastructure includes lecture halls, classrooms, educational and research laboratories, a library, IT facilities, cultural and social areas, and university clinics.

The Asfendiyarov KazNMU has a total area of 58,876.1 sq. m. consisting of 9 educational buildings and the "Aybolit" educational center: 47,976.1 sq. m. of owned space and 10,900 sq. m. of leased space. It also includes a sports hall covering 1,361.0 sq. m. and 8 dormitories with 3,269 beds. By a decree of the government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 1, 2013, the KazNMU acquired the RKDB "Aksai" with 300 beds. Additionally, the auditorium facilities include 3 leased buildings totaling 10,653.7 sq. m.: Kazakh Academy of Nutrition, Kluchkov Street 66 – 1200 sq. m.; building (Shevchenko Street 100) – 5692.9 sq. m., building (Zheltoqsan Street 37) – 3760.8 sq. m.

Lecture halls are equipped with necessary technical equipment such as stationary multimedia projectors and are designed for 1218 seats. To foster a unified corporate culture among students and university staff, 9 lecture halls have been named after distinguished individuals whose professional lives were closely associated with the University.

Classrooms accommodate from 10 to 60 seats and are located within educational buildings and clinical bases, fully equipped for seminars, practical and laboratory sessions, including necessary furniture, educational equipment, aids, and technical teaching resources, including personal computers.

Laboratories: Educational and research laboratories are located in the building of the Research Institute of Fundamental Medicine (RIFM) named after B.A. Atchabarov, a structural unit of Asfendiyarov KazNMU. RIFM includes: a scientific-practical control-analytical laboratory of chemistry and pharmacognosy, an experimental medicine laboratory, a scientific clinical-diagnostic laboratory, a "Collective Use Center" scientific laboratory, an experimental pharmacology center, and a vivarium, with a total area of 1,296.6 sq. m.

Social and Domestic Facilities: Social and domestic facilities include student dormitories, public catering enterprises, medical and preventive facilities, leisure facilities, and a sports hall.

Student Dormitories: Students of the daytime form of education reside in 8 dormitories of KazNMU. Dormitories are equipped with lounges for relaxation, reading rooms for self-study, utility and storage rooms, toilets, showers, and domestic facilities.

Public Catering Enterprises: In 2012, a major reconstruction and redesign of the student cafeteria on the University campus was carried out. The public catering enterprise operates on a self-service basis.

Medical and Preventive Facilities: Students can receive medical services at the University clinics: Clinic of Internal Diseases, Institute of Dentistry, Professor's Clinic.

For educational purposes, facilities of the sports complex are used, including a mini-stadium with an area of 1,320 sq. m., of which 1,200 sq. m. is the area of the volleyball court, wrestling mat,

21

and football field. Information provision of educational work is carried out through the University's website, electronic ticker; television monitors in the foyers of educational buildings; notice boards of the rectorate, deaneries; notice boards in dormitories and departments of KazNMU; broadcasting on the University campus.

Leisure Facilities: The University has a significant material and technical base for the leisure activities of students: "Hall of Fame" for 180 seats; "Concordia" Theater for 1,200 seats; "Conference Hall" for 70 seats; rooms for storing musical instruments and costumes totaling 35 sq. m.

Museum: An important aspect of educating the younger generation is the Museum of Medicine, located on the first floor of educational building No. 1. Its total area is 280 sq. m. Exhibition halls, each of 150 sq. m.

The University has signed cooperation agreements with 148 medical organizations: including 5 subsidiary organizations (Research Institutes), 3 NCs, 3 Research Institutes, 17 stationary organizations, 6 maternity hospitals, 2 tuberculosis organizations, 33 PMC organizations, 64 private medical centers, 2 central district hospitals, and 7 other medical organizations.

The capabilities of KazNMU's local network have been expanded: the access channel speed to the Internet is increasing annually: if in 2022 it was 500 Mbit/s, in 2023 - 2 Gbit/s, and planned for 2024 - 3.5 Gbit/s. Projects to cover the infrastructure with a wireless network have also been implemented. As of now, there are 428 Wi-Fi access points installed in the educational buildings and dormitories of the University. The Wi-Fi project implementation continues. As of now, the KazNMU computer park has been updated by 80%.

The "SalemOffice" electronic document management system of the "Sirius" AIS operates effectively, allowing paperless document flow with the use of electronic digital signatures for signing documents, handling applications from teachers and other university structures for various services.

The portal "Center of Digital Services", developed by the Department of Digitalization, represents a unified virtual Center of Digital Services and ensures the implementation of the "one-stop shop" principle in providing services to students, listeners, and applicants. A distance learning portal providing effective tools for organizing the educational activities of students in organizing OOP and OMP of students.

To ensure the development of cloud technologies and virtualization, a transition to "cloud technologies" has begun since 2020: a perpetual academic license for MS Office 365 has been acquired and actively used.

Library websites provide access to information resources, educational services available, and electronic content; Readers with an IP address can access and use literature from anywhere and from any device. There is also access to global electronic databases.

The StrikePlagiarism plagiarism detection system allows checking all student written works. The system is integrated with the "Sirius" AIS and distance learning portal. The validity and reliability of tests are checked by the Iteman test validation system, integrated with the "Sirius" AIS "Testing" module.

MS Teams and Zoom video streaming systems, actively used for online consultations and online classes, are functioning. Each student has access to all necessary information resources, electronic services, and services through the "Sirius" AIS Personal Account.

Since 2019, the system for identifying books using barcodes in the library has been operating at KazNMU, which has optimized the receipt and issuance of books; the network structure has been updated, and network modernization continues.

To carry out all procedures for electronic intermediate knowledge control, the Testing Center equipped with modern computer equipment operates.

Leading research institutes and scientific centers in the main areas of medicine (Kazakh Scientific Research Institute of Oncology and Radiology, Scientific Center of Obstetrics, Gynecology and Perinatology, Scientific Center of Pediatrics and Pediatric Surgery, Scientific Research Institute of Cardiology and Internal Medicine, National Scientific Surgery Center named after A.N. Syzganov) have been included in KazNMU, significantly enhancing the University's potential in scientific, clinical, and educational activities.

The collective of KazNMU has significant innovative potential. Scientific research, technical programs, and various competitive projects in KazNMU have been carried out under 21 programs, 11 of which are currently completed.

The Quality Assurance Commission (KOK) has been established in the WHOZ to ensure the quality of the OOP.

Since 2011, KazNMU, supported by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, has undertaken commitments to implement the parameters of the Bologna Process through the programs "Academic Mobility of Students and PPS" and "Visiting Professor KazNMU". The implementation of these programs, aimed at internationalizing education and integrating into the global educational space, is accompanied by the use of modern educational technologies in the education of KazNMU students at leading universities around the world or invited foreign scholars. Activities have been implemented for academic exchange of students with partner universities.

Analytical Part

Based on the results obtained, measures are planned and implemented to improve the working conditions of University staff. Annually, the Scientific Library fund is updated by 5–10%, according to applications for the purchase of literature. Continuous work is carried out to improve IT technologies and KazNMU infrastructure. Uninterrupted Internet access is ensured, a local computer system has been created, a system for broadcasting lectures via video transmission in classrooms has been developed and implemented, and a unique computer product AIS KazNMU has been developed.

Overall, KazNMU has transitioned from using individual computers to an intramural computer network. A local network has been built at the University, connecting the main infrastructure objects of KazNMU: educational buildings via fiber-optic communication lines, dormitories and clinical bases via VPN. Thus, an unlimited data transmission channel has been created between the buildings and departments of the University for access to internal information resources and information exchange.

KazNMU operates a system of financing and support for scientific activities. Competitions for obtaining university research grants for PPS, scientists, and doctoral students are regularly held. All grant applications undergo internal and independent external (international) expertise, the results of which are used for selecting applications for subsequent funding.

According to the sixth standard, satisfactory aspects include: collaboration with leading research institutes/NCs and agreements with specialized organizations as part of industrial practice implementation, with foreign universities as part of internships for master's students; The strong point of the Educational Program «Management in Healthcare» is the presence of several research grants in this specialty area (inter-university and internal grants), involving both faculty members and master's students. For instance, from 2019 to 2024, 6 projects have been implemented. Specifically, the grant project "Development of technology for assessing the effectiveness of healthcare systems from an inter-industry perspective and its regional impact" was implemented from 2021 to 2023, and the grant project "Integration of children with autism spectrum disorder into the socio-educational environment based on comprehensive support: challenges and advantages" is scheduled for 2023-2025.

Strengths/Best Practices:

Presence of several research grants in this specialty area involving both faculty members and master's students.

Recommendations from the External Evaluation Committee (EEC): None

Conclusions of the EEC on criteria:
➢ **Strong positions – 1**

➢ *Satisfactory – 13*
➢ *Suggest improvements – 0*
➢ *Unsatisfactory – 0*

STANDARD 7. "EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM"

Evidence Section

The university has an effective, continuous monitoring mechanism that involves constant tracking of class attendance, student performance, dissertation writing, and more. To control and evaluate teaching quality, peer observations and open classes are conducted, with results discussed in department meetings and faculty council sessions. The quality of classes, teaching materials, timely issuance of assignments for independent study (SRO), and the organization of student performance assessments are analyzed in department meetings and School Council sessions.

To monitor and improve the quality of educational services, student surveys are conducted to identify stakeholders' needs, study educational processes, and improve the activities of all university departments. Surveys are systematically carried out throughout the entire period of study. Questionnaires may vary depending on the respondent category, covering all aspects of student learning and life: knowledge levels, learning conditions, material and technical support, methodological and informational support, living conditions, dining conditions, etc.

A mechanism aimed at monitoring the implementation of the educational program and student progress is the continuous feedback from students and faculty. The participants in the educational process, including master's students and faculty, are directly interested in the implementation of the educational program and can express their opinions through surveys and interviews. The "Student Feedback" questionnaire, which includes questions about student expectations and actual competencies gained, the environment of the educational program, accessibility of information resources, and conditions, as well as the analysis results of suggestion boxes, reflect mechanisms for student and faculty participation in program monitoring.

Student surveys are a mechanism for periodic review, study, and evaluation of implemented educational programs, ensuring the quality of program management processes. Achieving final results by students is also a mechanism for evaluating the educational program and student progress, as they are valid and reliable methods requiring essential data on the educational program.

Student knowledge, skills, abilities, and competencies across all forms of assessment are determined by the grading system, which has a directly proportional relationship. The application of new or changed criteria and methods for evaluating student knowledge is possible only based on the decision of the Public Health School's Curriculum Committee. Evaluation criteria and methods proposals are prepared by department heads and reviewed at Academic Council meetings.

The use of feedback is systematic in making changes to the educational program. For the functioning of the feedback system, which includes the prompt presentation of information on student knowledge assessment results, the "SIRIUS" electronic educational system is utilized. Created content can be used by students to obtain information on their knowledge assessment results.

The methods and forms of objective evaluation of results for each discipline are specified in the syllabi, where checklists are provided for evaluating master's students' knowledge based on various assessed tasks (oral response, written response, presentation, etc.), ensuring the objectivity of learning outcomes assessments.

The content of both mandatory and elective disciplines is adjusted annually, incorporating the results of teacher professional development. The curriculum of the profiling cycle considers the latest changes in the labor market, reflecting employer interests, and, along with all types of practices, aims to prepare students for professional activities.

The revision of the mission and final results of existing programs at all educational levels in the university is conducted transparently, involving all parties: academic staff, master's students,

administrative structures at the department, OMI (Organization and Methodological Unit), and university levels.

If updates or restructuring of the program and elective course content are necessary, current societal needs, national healthcare system priorities, medical science, and education are considered.

To monitor and improve the quality of educational services, student surveys are conducted systematically throughout the study period to identify stakeholder needs, study educational processes, and improve the activities of all university departments. Surveys cover all aspects of student learning and life: knowledge levels, learning conditions, material and technical support, methodological and informational support, living conditions, dining conditions, etc. The university regularly conducts surveys, collects, analyzes, and uses data from stakeholders about the educational program. Students can participate in the evaluation process by expressing their opinions and wishes at the end of a course or specific discipline or through anonymous surveys to gather feedback and suggestions from direct consumers. Student participation in the evaluation of the educational program also contributes to the improvement of student self-governance in the university. The survey process has been authorized for convenience and efficiency on the educational portal, creating a "Survey" module that allows full coverage of the student body, electronic counting, and dissemination of survey results to students.

Thus, student surveys are a mechanism for periodic review, study, and evaluation of implemented educational programs, ensuring the quality of program management processes. Achieving final results by students is also a mechanism for evaluating the educational program and student progress, as they are valid and reliable methods requiring essential data on the educational program.

Student knowledge, skills, abilities, and competencies across all forms of assessment are determined by the grading system, which has a directly proportional relationship. The application of new or changed criteria and methods for evaluating student knowledge is possible only based on the decision of the Public Health School's Curriculum Committee. Evaluation criteria and methods proposals are prepared by department heads and reviewed at Academic Council meetings.

Accepted criteria and methods for student knowledge assessments cannot be changed during the semester. Revisions are possible only at the beginning of a new academic period. Developing feedback with stakeholders to study requirements, expectations, and satisfaction with the quality of educational services is highly emphasized. Feedback from employers and other stakeholders is monitored and serves as the basis for revising the university's goals, objectives, and activities, as well as the program content.

Improving the monitoring and evaluation processes of the educational program at the university is conducted not only through the internal monitoring system, including department self-evaluation, university self-evaluation, internal audits of structural units, intra-departmental control, ongoing, mid-term, and final student assessments, and faculty certification, but also through periodic external evaluations of educational program quality via institutional and specialized accreditation.

After external evaluation of educational programs, the Academic Council holds an extended meeting to analyze comments and recommendations for program improvement, if necessary, drafting a corrective action plan and appointing responsible persons for implementing the plan's activities.

Research advisors can participate in organizing the specialty's educational program through direct discussions and approvals of work programs and elective course lists at department and Curriculum Committee meetings.

Master's students can address the dean's office orally or in writing regarding the quality of the educational program and the fulfillment of the academic plan. The results of student feedback affect the organization and implementation of the educational program (choice of elective courses, faculty, academic base, etc.).

Feedback to master's students from teachers is provided during and at the end of each practical session, during the grading process.

Additionally, all written and oral complaints and claims from consumers are recorded, summarized, and analyzed. Written appeals received by the university are assigned for review by the relevant departments and officials.

25

The use of feedback is systematic in making changes to the educational program. For the functioning of the feedback system, which includes the prompt presentation of information on student knowledge assessment results, the "SIRIUS" electronic educational system is utilized. Created content can be used by students to obtain information on their knowledge assessment results.

The methods and forms of objective evaluation of results for each discipline are specified in the syllabi (Appendix 7.1), where checklists are provided for evaluating master's students' knowledge based on various assessed tasks (oral response, written response, presentation, etc.), ensuring the objectivity of learning outcomes assessments.

The program management guarantees that knowledge assessment is accurate and adequate. The objectivity of student knowledge assessments, transparency, and adequacy of the tools and mechanisms are ensured by regulatory documents for the organization of the credit learning technology at the university and the functional capabilities of "SIRIUS" at KazNMU. The program management ensures the objectivity of student knowledge assessments during exam sessions according to the SOP of interim certification. The content of both mandatory and elective disciplines is adjusted annually, incorporating the results of teacher professional development. The curriculum of the profiling cycle considers the latest changes in the labor market, reflecting employer interests, and, along with all types of practices, aims to prepare students for professional activities.

Analytical Section

The university has an effective, continuous monitoring mechanism that involves constant tracking of class attendance, student performance, dissertation writing, and more. To control and evaluate teaching quality, peer observations and open classes are conducted, with results discussed in department meetings and faculty council sessions. The quality of classes, teaching materials, timely issuance of assignments for independent study (SRO), and the organization of student performance assessments are analyzed in department meetings and School Council sessions.

Mechanisms for quality assurance in training, established at the university, include monitoring the educational program, ensuring the competence of the teaching staff, regularly conducting internal audits according to agreed criteria, and considering and analyzing employer and graduate opinions.

A mechanism aimed at monitoring the implementation of the educational program and student progress is the continuous feedback from students and faculty. The participants in the educational process, including master's students and faculty, are directly interested in the implementation of the educational program and can express their opinions through surveys and interviews.

Stakeholder involvement in program evaluation, as well as the role of other stakeholders in program evaluation and making changes to improve its quality, is carried out during the program development stage, through working group meetings, employer representative consultations, and program reviews by employer representatives.

The program development plan is created based on studying international experience in specialist training in education and practical workers, considering program functioning analysis and the university's real positioning.

The teaching staff, administrative staff, and accreditation agencies are involved in program evaluation activities.

The revision of the mission and final results of existing programs at all educational levels in the university is conducted transparently, involving all parties: academic staff, master's students, administrative structures at the department, OMI (Organization and Methodological Unit), and university levels.

According to the seventh standard, satisfactory aspects include: continuous improvement of information support, openness and accessibility of information on the university's website regarding program monitoring and evaluation mechanisms; a well-developed structure of units responsible for educational programs and achieving final learning outcomes; annual review of the organizational management structure in accordance with ongoing reforms in education and healthcare

Strengths/Best Practices:

26

No strengths were identified for this standard.

Recommendations by the External Evaluation Commission (EEC): None

EEC Conclusions by Criteria:
➢   ***Strong positions – 0***
➢   ***Satisfactory – 9***
➢   ***Require improvement – 0***
➢   ***Unsatisfactory – 0***

STANDARD 8. MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION

Evidentiary Part

The Asfendiyarov Kazakh National Medical University (hereinafter referred to as KazNMU) operates as a non-profit joint-stock company in accordance with its Charter. The university's structure, approved by the Board of Directors on November 3, 2023 (decision No. 12), is available on the official website under the "University" - "Organizational Structure" section. The highest governing body is the Board of Directors, and the collegial executive body is the Management Board, chaired by the Rector. The Management Board includes vice-rectors, the financial director, and the head of the Administration.

KazNMU's main structural units include schools/faculties, research institutes, university clinics, educational and research centers, departments, laboratories, a museum, a scientific library, a simulation center, departments, offices, services, and sectors, all operating in accordance with the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the KazNMU Charter, and regulations of structural units that determine their legal status and functions and are approved by the order of the Chairman of the Board-Rector.

The functional responsibilities of KazNMU employees are evenly distributed and reflected in job descriptions approved by the order of the Chairman of the Board-Rector, in accordance with the requirements of the quality management system.

The participation of the teaching staff (PPS) in the management of the University is ensured by their inclusion in the collegial management bodies. These collegial management bodies address various issues within the university's activities within their competencies. Teachers are mandatory members of all collegial bodies.

The main advisory bodies regulating teaching and learning processes, including research, are: the Order on the composition of the Academic Council (AC), the Educational Programs Committee, and the School Quality Assurance Commission.

The admission policy for master's students at KazNMU complies with the Model Rules for Admission to Education Organizations that Implement Educational Programs of Higher and Postgraduate Education, based on principles of openness and transparency, clear alignment with the university's mission and goals, and is reflected in the Academic Policy and admission rules for the master's program.

Stakeholder satisfaction assessment is conducted annually through sociological surveys, which include: annual student surveys on teaching quality, annual faculty surveys on the organization of the educational process, annual graduate surveys on the quality of educational services, and employer surveys on the quality of specialist training.

Master's students can participate in university governance through involvement in the Educational Programs Committee. KazNMU engages with employers to ensure the quality of master's programs through their involvement in assessing the quality of graduates during the state final attestation. External quality assessment of educational activities for the master's program is conducted within the state accreditation procedure to confirm compliance with the state standard, taking into account the corresponding educational program.

Schools/faculties of KazNMU are responsible for developing and implementing educational programs (EP), forming collegial bodies (Educational Programs Committees, Quality Assurance Commissions) for this purpose, functioning in accordance with approved regulations.

Each structural unit ensures the accuracy, timeliness, and completeness of information across all areas of activity using electronic document management systems like Salem, Microsoft Office 365, and the LMS Moodle learning management system (https://dis.kaznmu.edu.kz/), along with Google account services including corporate Gmail, Google calendars, Google Docs, and Google Meet. The introduction of the IS "Hero Study Space" and the project management system workspace.hero.study is planned.

Information about KazNMU, including its mission, vision, development strategy, structure, corporate documents, contacts, and other reference information, is available on the main page under the "About the University" section, accessible to all users without restriction. Additionally, information about the University, including a location map, virtual tour, and virtual tour of the Simulation Center, can be found under the "About Us" section.

The Department of Academic Work forms a list of implemented educational programs, approved by the Board of Directors and posted on the official website. In the sections "For Applicants," "Higher Education," and "Educational Programs," complete information about offered educational programs, degrees and specialties, admission conditions for each level of education, tuition fees, and admission rules and achievements is available. Information about all specialties and levels' educational programs is available in the "Educational Programs" section.

The information policy includes the annual report of the Chairman of the Board-Rector on the University's activities presented to the public, including students, parents, employers, social partners, and other stakeholders. The management system and decision-making processes are transparent and available on the KazNMU website. The Academic Council's work plan and decisions are publicly accessible. Announcements of public procurements, reports on the implementation of the financial development plan, cash flow, and balance sheets are posted on the KazNMU website.

For example, on April 26, 2024 (in Astana), a round table on healthcare management training is planned, organized by the Kazakhstan Association of Healthcare Managers, with participants from the Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Department of Personnel Management, healthcare departments of Astana and Almaty, and universities.

For participation in competitions for grant and program-targeted funding of research and other projects in medicine and healthcare, competitive budget applications are prepared and submitted to the Ministry of Science and Higher Education and the Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The KazNMU Quality Manual describes the model and internal quality assurance system of the University. The Quality Manual includes the University's organizational structure, processes and their interactions, necessary management resources, analysis of the existing quality management system (QMS), and its continuous improvement. The content of the QMS corresponds to the ISO 9001-2015 standard and mirrors its structure.

KazNMU leadership has a sufficient level of managerial competencies and is responsible for implementing all processes that ensure the achievement of the mission. The management system and its activities are open, transparent, and accessible. The University's leadership is ready and able to implement changes, ensuring effective management activities. The main governing body for the master's educational program is the Academic Council, the highest governing body for KazNMU's educational and methodological activities. The Academic Council is chaired by the Vice-Rector of the academic block, who is simultaneously the chairman of the council. In KazNMU, the leading role in managing educational programs is played by the graduating departments, which are involved in developing the master's programs in their respective fields.

According to the National Ranking of the Best Universities of Kazakhstan-2021, conducted by the Independent Agency for Quality Assurance in Education (IQAA), KazNMU ranked first in the institutional ranking in the category of medical universities. KazNMU achieved top positions in the 2023 Atameken educational programs ranking. The official KazNMU website ranks high in the

international Webometrics ranking, where KazNMU ranked 15th among 127 universities in Kazakhstan in January 2024. This high Webometrics ranking indicates the relevance, accessibility, and efficiency of the University in the online space. The University constantly develops website capabilities, with ongoing factoring and updating work.

The University publishes information about its activities, including the implementation of educational programs. The information provided to the public is clear, accurate, objective, current, and accessible. The Press Service of KazNMU, in collaboration with various structural units, ensures the implementation of the information policy, determining priority directions, forming plans for its implementation using all available information sources, ensuring information completeness and timeliness, developing existing and seeking new information means, and monitoring media to adjust information activities.

Analytical Part

KazNMU ensures the quality of student training in the master's program based on the standard, including through monitoring, periodic review of educational programs; developing objective procedures for assessing students' knowledge and skills, and graduates' competencies. Objectivity can be ensured through multi-faceted quality assessment mechanisms by the University and employers; ensuring faculty competence through integration with research institutes, high-tech companies, and employers.

The University operates an effective quality management system based on process and project management approaches. The financial units' business processes undergo regular review, improvement, and strengthening by the management as part of the QMS and other activities. The University engages constructively with the healthcare sector, societal structures, and the state.

The regulation of the faculty's remuneration system is aimed at improving the quality of educational and medical services, enhancing employee material incentives, fostering creative activity, encouraging professional growth, and increasing responsibility for the final result based on personal labor contribution and overall University performance.

KazNMU has an effective monitoring system developed according to international standards. Data analysis is conducted using measurements and information. All measurable indicators and quality characteristics are divided into internal quality indicators for process management and indicators obtained after external expertise (accreditation, certification, licensing, audit, and other external procedures).

The University's quality management system is organized so that all employees are involved in ensuring quality management and strive to improve educational activity management and the quality of educational services necessary for maintaining and, where possible, improving customer satisfaction. KazNMU has developed and approved a Quality Policy in accordance with its Mission, Strategy, goals, and objectives. The Policy aims to ensure openness and transparency of the educational process, opportunities for dialogue among its participants, feedback, and support for measures against corruption and academic dishonesty.

KazNMU's interaction mechanism as a state medical higher education institution with the healthcare sector is regulated by: the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan; agreements with healthcare management bodies; agreements with healthcare organizations; and written requests from authorized state bodies and healthcare institutions.

KazNMU conducts its activities based on transparency in the management system and decision-making. This is achieved through the participation of faculty, academic block staff, students, employers, and other stakeholders in discussing and making decisions on educational program content, organization, and evaluation of the educational process.

The University ensures public information about its activities through its official website and local and republican media.

Under the eighth standard, the following aspects are satisfactory: the annual review of the management organizational structure in line with ongoing reforms in the field of education and

29

healthcare in the Republic of Kazakhstan, as well as changes in global educational management practices; a clearly developed structure of units responsible for educational programs and achieving learning outcomes. Dedicated units have been established for the allocation of resources for planning and implementing teaching and learning methods, assessing educational programs, and training courses. Stable connections have been established with international partners on issues of training, specialization, and improvement of students' professional competencies.

A strong point under this standard is the presence of an Endowment Fund at KazNMU, consisting of invested capital, the income from which is used to support specific programs, research, scholarships, and other university initiatives. Additionally, the active participation of public organizations in the development and improvement of educational programs includes teaching, organizing round tables, seminars, and conferences.

Strengths/Best Practices:

The presence of an Endowment Fund at KazNMU, consisting of invested capital, the income from which is used to support specific programs, research, scholarships, and other university initiatives.

Recommendations of the External Evaluation Commission (EEC): None

EEC Conclusions by Criteria:
➢ Strong positions – 1
➢ Satisfactory – 12
➢ Require improvements – 0
➢ Unsatisfactory – 0

(VII)   REVIEW OF STRENGTHS/BEST PRACTICES FOR EACH STANDARD

Standard 6: "Educational Environment and Resources"
The presence of several research grants in this specialty, in which both the academic staff of the profile departments and master's students participate.

Standard 8: "Management and Administration"
The presence of an Endowment Fund at KazNMU, consisting of invested capital, the income from which is used to support specific programs, research, scholarships, and other university initiatives.

(VIII)   RECOMMENDATIONS FOR QUALITY IMPROVEMENT

Standard 1: "Mission and Learning Outcomes"
It is recommended that the university administration refine the educational programs (EP):
formulate learning outcomes more clearly and measurably, establishing a system for achieving the learning outcomes through the disciplines and during the final attestation.

Standard 3: "Student Assessment"
It is recommended that the university administration refine the EP: develop checklists for evaluating the results of master's project defenses, aimed at achieving the EP's learning outcomes. It is also recommended to improve the assessment of disciplines with a focus on evaluating the learning outcomes.

Standard 4: "Students"

It is recommended that the university administration take measures to expand the opportunities for students to implement individual educational trajectories, including the inclusion and expansion of distance learning forms in this EP.

(IX) RECOMMENDATION TO THE ACCREDITATION COUNCIL

The External Expert Commission unanimously decided to recommend that the IAAR Accreditation Council accredit the educational program «7M10102 – Management in Healthcare» (profile direction) of the NJSC "Asfendiyarov Kazakh National Medical University" for a period of 5 (five) years.

Appendix 1: Evaluation Table "Parameters of Specialized Profile"

№	№	EVALUATION CRITERIA	Position OE			
			Strong	Satisfactory	Suggests improvement	Unsatisfactory
Standard 1 «MISSION AND RESULTS»						
1.1.Defining the mission						
The organization of education must:						
1	1.1.1.	Define the mission of the postgraduate level EP and bring it to the attention of stakeholders and the health sector.		+		
2	1.1.2.	to define a training program that allows you to prepare a specialist at the level of postgraduate education in the field of healthcare: ▪ competent in any field of medicine, including all types of medical practice, management and organization of healthcare; ▪ able to work independently to work at a high professional level and in a team, if necessary; ▪ with a commitment to lifelong learning, including professional responsibility to support the level of knowledge and skills through performance assessment, auditing, studying one's own practice and recognized activities in the continuous professional development/continuing medical education.		+		
3	1.1.3	ensure that the mission covers the consideration of the health needs of the community or society, the needs of the health system and other aspects of social responsibility, if necessary.		+		
4	1.1.4.	to encourage the organization and conduct of scientific research of postgraduate students, as well as innovations in the educational process, allowing the development of broader competencies than the minimum required		+		
1.2.Institutional autonomy and academic freedom						
The organization of education must:						
5	1.2.1.	have a training process that is based on recognized basic medical and pharmaceutical education and contributes to strengthening the professionalism of the student		+		

6	1.2.2.	ensure that the training process promotes professional autonomy to enable the graduate to act in the best interests of the patient and society		+		
1.3.	**Learning outcomes**					
The organization of education must:						
7	1.3.1.	to determine the expected learning outcomes that students should achieve upon completion of their postgraduate level achievements in terms of knowledge, skills, professional behavior and thinking; the appropriate basis for a future career in their chosen field of medicine; their future roles in the health sector; commitment and skills in the implementation of continuing education; the health needs of society, the needs of the health system and other aspects of social responsibility			+	
8	1.3.2.	identify the general and specialty-specific components of learning outcomes that students need to achieve		+		
9	1.3.3.	to ensure proper professional behavior of students in relation to classmates, teachers, medical staff, patients and their relatives		+		
10	1.3.4.	to determine the expected learning outcomes based on the previous level of education.		+		
1.4.	**Participation in the formulation of the mission and learning outcomes**					
The organization of education must:						
11	1.4.1.	ensure the participation of key stakeholders in the formulation of the mission and expected learning		+		
12	1.4.2.	ensure that the stated mission and expected learning outcomes are based on the opinions/suggestions of other stakeholders.		+		
		Total	**0**	**11**	**1**	**0**
Standard 2 "EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM»						
2.1.	**The learning approach**					
The organization of education must:						
13	2.1.1.	to determine the approach to training based on the expected learning outcomes and official certificates of qualification provided as the basis for official recognition of a specialist in the chosen field of medicine at the national and international level.		+		
14	2.1.2.	to define an approach to teaching based on the results of basic medical education, systematically and transparently including and supporting the student in responsibility for their own learning process		+		
15	2.1.3.	describe the general and discipline-specific learning components, use teaching and learning methods that are suitable for both practice and theory, identify the		+		

33

		teaching and learning methods used that stimulate, prepare and support students to take responsibility for their learning process					
16	2.1.4.	to ensure that the educational program is implemented in accordance with the principles of equality		+			
17	2.1.5.	to guide the student through mentoring and regular assessment and feedback, to increase the degree of independent responsibility of the student as skills, knowledge and experience improve.		+			

2.2. The scientific method

The organization of education must:

18	2.2.1.	to instill in students the principles of scientific methodology according to the level of postgraduate education and to provide evidence that the student achieves knowledge and understanding of the scientific base and methods of the chosen field of medicine		+			
19	2.2.2.	provide evidence that the student is becoming familiar with evidence-based medicine as a result of broad access to relevant clinical/practical experience in the chosen field of medicine		+			
20	2.2.3.	to include in the EP official teachings on the critical assessment of literature and scientific data, the results of modern scientific research; to provide students with access to research activities; to adjust and change the content of scientific developments in the EP		+			

2.3. The content of the training

The organization of education must:

21	2.3.1.	to include in the learning process the practice and theory of biomedical, clinical, behavioral and social sciences, clinical solutions, communication skills, medical ethics, public health, medical jurisprudence, management disciplines		+			
22	2.3.2.	to organize an educational program with appropriate attention to patient safety		+			
23	2.3.3.	to make changes to the EP to ensure the development of knowledge, skills and thinking of the various roles of the graduate and the correspondence of the content of the EP to the changing conditions and needs of society and the health system		+			

2.4. The structure of the educational program, its composition and duration

The organization of education must:

24	2.4.1.	to describe the content, scope and sequence of courses and other elements of the educational program, to identify mandatory and selective components, to		+			

		combine practice and theory in the learning process, to ensure compliance with national legislation				
25	2.4.2.	to take into account the results of basic medical and pharmaceutical education in relation to the choice of the field of medicine, the requirements for performing various roles in the health care system for a future graduate		+		
2.5. The relationship between education and healthcare practice						
The organization of education must:						
26	2.5.1.	describe and observe the integration between theoretical training and professional development, guarantee the integration of training and professional internship, including through on-the-job training		+		
27	2.5.2.	to effectively organize the use of the capabilities of the health care system for training purposes, including in terms of providing practice in the workplace, to ensure that such training is additional and does not comply with the requirements for the provision of health services		+		
2.6. Learning Management						
The organization of education must:						
28	2.6.1.	define responsibilities and authorities for the organization, coordination, management and evaluation of the individual learning environment and learning process		+		
29	2.6.2.	Include proper representation from teaching staff, students and other key and relevant stakeholders in the planning and development of the educational program.		+		
30	2.6.3.	to guarantee a variety of study sites, coordinate multiple study sites to obtain appropriate access to different aspects of the chosen field of medicine, access to the resources necessary for planning and implementing teaching methods and evaluating students and introducing innovations in the training program		+		
		Total	**0**	**18**	**0**	**0+**
Standard 3 «STUDENT ASSESSMENT»						
3.1. Assessment methods						
The organization of education must:						
31	3.1.1.	Identify and approve the principles, methods and practices used to evaluate students, including the number of exams, criteria for setting passing scores, grades and the number of allowed retakes;		+		
32	3.1.2.	ensure that assessment procedures cover knowledge, skills, attitudes and professional behavior		+		

35

33	3.1.3.	use a wide range of assessment methods and formats depending on their "utility assessment", including a combination of validity, reliability, impact on learning, acceptability and effectiveness of assessment methods and format		+		
34	3.1.4.	to ensure that the assessment process and methods are open (accessible) for examination by external experts;		+		
35	3.1.5.	ensure that assessment methods and results avoid conflicts of interest and use a system to appeal student assessment results		+		
36	3.1.6.	to ensure the openness of the assessment procedure and its results, to inform students about the criteria and assessment procedures used		+		
37	3.1.7.	document and evaluate the reliability and validity of assessment methods, as well as involve external examiners, introduce new assessment methods in accordance with the need; encourage the examination process by external experts; if necessary, organize a "different opinion", a change of teaching staff or additional training		+		
3.2. The relationship between assessment and learning						
The organization of education must:						
38	3.2.1.	to use the principles, methods and practices of assessment that are comparable with the planned R and methods of teaching and learning, guarantee the achievement of the planned learning outcomes, facilitate the learning of students, ensure an appropriate balance of formative and final assessment for the direction of learning and decision-making on academic performance			+	
39	3.2.2.	adjust the number and nature of exams to encourage both knowledge acquisition and integrated learning		+		
40	3.2.3.	to provide timely, specific, constructive and fair feedback to students based on the assessment		+		
		Total	**0**	**9**	**1**	**0**
Standard 4 «STUDENTS»						
4.1. Admission and Selection Policy						
The organization of education must:						
41	4.1.1.	define and implement an admission policy based on the principles of objectivity and including a clear statement about the student selection process		+		
42	4.1.2.	to ensure a balance between learning opportunities and the admission of students, formulate and implement policies/rules for the selection of students according to established criteria		+		

43	4.1.3.	have a policy and implement the practice of admitting students with disabilities in accordance with current laws and regulatory documents of the country		+		
44	4.1.4.	have a policy and implement the practice of transferring students from other educational institutions, including foreign ones		+		
45	4.1.5.	to establish a link between the selection and the mission of the educational organization, the EP and the desired quality of graduates, to provide a mechanism for appealing admission decisions		+		
46	4.1.6.	to use the system of appealing decisions on the admission of students, to ensure transparency of the selection procedure, to periodically review the admission policy based on relevant social and professional data to meet the needs of healthcare and society		+		
4.2. Recruitment of students						
The organization of education must:						
47	4.2.1.	to determine the number of accepted students in accordance with the possibilities of the organization of education at all stages of the educational program		+		
48	4.2.2.	periodically regulate the number and contingent of accepted students, taking into account the views of stakeholders responsible for planning and developing human resources in the health sector in order to meet the medical needs of the population and society as a whole		+		
49	4.2.3.	periodically review the number and nature of accepted students in consultation with other stakeholders and adjust in order to meet the health needs of the population and society as a whole		+		
4.3. Advising and supporting students						
The organization of education must:						
50	4.3.1.	have a system of academic counseling for students		+		
51	4.3.2.	to offer students a support program aimed at social, financial and personal needs, allocating appropriate resources and ensuring confidentiality of counseling and support		+		
52	4.3.3.	have a feedback system with students to assess the conditions and organization of the educational process		+		
53	4.3.4.	provide students with documents confirming their qualifications (diploma) and diploma supplement (transcript)		+		
54	4.3.5.	take into account the needs of different groups of students and provide an opportunity for the formation			+	

37

		of an individual educational trajectory				
55	4.3.6.	provide academic counseling that is based on monitoring the student's academic performance and includes career planning issues; offers a student support program aimed at social, financial and personal needs; ensure confidentiality regarding counseling and support, support in case of a professional crisis		+		
4.4. Representation of students						
The organization of education must:						
56	4.4.1.	to develop and implement a policy of student representation and their proper participation in defining the mission, developing, managing and evaluating the educational program, and planning conditions for students		+		
57	4.4.2.	encourage students to participate in decision-making about learning processes, conditions and rules.		+		
		Total	**0**	**16**	**1**	**0**
Standard 5 «ACADEMIC STAFF/TEACHERS»						
Personnel selection policy						
The educational organization should develop and implement a staff selection and recruitment policy that:						
58	5.1.1.	It contains criteria for the scientific, pedagogical and clinical/professional merits of applicants, including the appropriate ratio between pedagogical, scientific and professional qualifications		+		
59	5.1.2.	defines the responsibilities of teachers, including the balance between teaching, scientific and other functions, taking into account the mission of the educational institution, the needs of the education system and the needs of the health system.		+		
60	5.1.3.	takes into account the necessary work experience		+		
61	5.1.4.	to determine the responsibility of the academic staff in terms of its participation in postgraduate education; to determine the level of remuneration for participation in postgraduate education;		+		
62	5.1.5.	to ensure that teachers have practical experience in the relevant field, that teachers of narrow specialties, if necessary, are approved for appropriate periods of study, depending on their qualifications.		+		
5.2. Employee commitment and development						
The educational organization should develop and implement a staff activity and development policy aimed at:						
63	5.2.1.	a guarantee that teachers have enough time for training, counseling and independent development		+		
64	5.2.2.	the presence of a structure responsible for the		+		

38

		development of the academic staff, ensuring periodic assessment of the academic staff				
65	5.2.3.	to develop and implement a policy of support for academic staff on issues of pedagogy and professional development for further professional development; to evaluate and recognize the scientific and academic achievements of teachers		+		
66	5.2.4.	take into account the teacher-student ratio depending on the various components of the EP, taking into account the features that ensure close personal interaction and monitoring of students.		+		
		Total	**0**	**9**	**0**	**0**
Standard 6 «EDUCATIONAL ENVIRONMENT AND RESOURCES»						
6.1. Logistics and equipment						
The organization of education must:						
67	6.1.1.	Ensure that sufficient, accessible and goal-appropriate learning resources are available		+		
68	6.1.2.	to improve the learning environment by regularly updating, expanding and strengthening the material and technical base and equipment to maintain the appropriate quality of education at the postgraduate level		+		
6.2. Educational environment						
The organization of education must:						
69	6.2.1.	provide the necessary resources to provide students with appropriate clinical/practical experience, including: • quality and categories of patients/consumers of services, • number and categories of clinical/production bases; • monitoring the practice of students		+		
70	6.2.2.	when choosing a learning environment, ensure appropriate experience in all aspects of the chosen specialty, including training in organization and management in the field of health and disease prevention		+		
6.3. Information technology						
The organization of education must:						
71	6.3.1.	develop and implement policies aimed at the effective and ethical use and evaluation of relevant information and communication technologies		+		
72	6.3.2.	provide access to websites or other electronic media		+		
73	6.3.3.	optimize access for teachers and students to relevant patient data and health information systems using existing and relevant new information and communication technologies for self-study, access to		+		

		information, patient databases and work with health information systems				
6.4.	**Research in the field of medicine/pharmacy and scientific achievements**					
The organization of education must:						
74	6.4.1.	to use research activities and scientific achievements in the field of medicine and pharmacy as the basis for an educational program		+		
75	6.4.2.	formulate and implement policies that strengthen the relationship between scientific research and education; provide information on the research base and priority areas in the field of scientific research of the organization of education		+		
76	6.4.3.	to ensure that the relationship between scientific research and education is taken into account in teaching, encourages and prepares students to participate in scientific research in the field of health	+	+		
6.5.	**Expertise in the field of education**					
The organization of education must:						
77	6.5.1.	have access to educational expertise of the processes, practices and problems of medical and pharmaceutical education with the involvement of specialists, educational psychologists, sociologists at the university, interuniversity and international levels; develop and implement an expertise policy in the development, implementation and evaluation of an educational program, development of teaching methods and assessment		+		
78	6.5.2.	demonstrate evidence of the use of internal or external educational expertise in staff development, taking into account current experience in medical/pharmaceutical education and promoting the interests of staff in conducting research in education		+		
6.6.	**Exchange in the field of education**					
The organization of education must:						
79	6.6.1.	formulate and implement policies on national and international cooperation with other educational organizations, including staff and student mobility, as well as transfer of educational credits and learning outcomes		+		
80	6.6.2.	to facilitate the participation of teachers and students in academic mobility programs at home and abroad and allocate appropriate resources for these purposes		+		
		Total	**1**	**13**	**0**	**0**
Standard 7 «EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM»						
7.1. Monitoring, control and evaluation mechanisms of the program						

		The organization of education must:				
81	7.1.1.	have regulated procedures for monitoring, periodic evaluation of the educational program and learning outcomes, progress and academic performance of students		+		
82	7.1.2.	to develop and apply an educational program evaluation mechanism that examines the program, its main components, students' academic performance, identifies and solves problems, ensures that the relevant evaluation results affect the EP		+		
83	7.1.3.	periodically evaluate the program, comprehensively considering the educational process, components of the educational program, expected learning outcomes and social responsibility		+		
7.2. Feedback from the teacher and the student						
The organization of education must:						
84	7.2.1.	systematically conduct, analyze and respond to feedback from teachers and students		+		
85	7.2.2.	use the feedback results to improve the educational program		+		
7.3. Educational achievements of students						
The organization of education must:						
86	7.3.1.	analyze the academic performance of students and graduates in accordance with the mission and expected learning outcomes, the training program and the availability of resources		+		
87	7.3.2.	analyze the academic performance of students and graduates, taking into account the conditions of their previous education, the level of preparation for admission; use the results of the analysis to interact with the structural unit responsible for selecting students, developing an educational program, advising students		+		
7.4. Approval and control of the educational environment						
88	7.4.1.	provide evidence that the EP has been approved by the competent authority on the basis of: clearly defined criteria; evaluation of the program; compliance with qualification requirements		+		
89	7.4.2.	develop and implement a system for monitoring the educational environment and other educational facilities, including site visits and other relevant resources		+		
		Итого	**0**	**9**	**0**	**0**
Standard 8. «MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION»						
8.1. Management						

41

		The organization of education must:			
90	8.1.1.	to ensure that the EP is implemented in accordance with the rules regarding the admission of students; the structure and content, the assessment process		+	
91	8.1.2.	document the completion of training by issuing degrees, diplomas, certificates or other official certificates of qualification provided as the basis for official recognition of a specialist in the chosen field of health care.		+	
92	8.1.3.	to be responsible for quality assurance processes, to ensure continuous evaluation of the EP		+	
93	8.1.4.	to ensure that the EP meets the needs of society in terms of health and the health system, to ensure transparency of the work of management structures and their decisions		+	

8.2. Academic leadership

		The organization of education must:			
94	8.2.1.	to define the responsibility of the academic leadership in relation to the development and management of the educational program.		+	
95	8.2.2.	periodically evaluate academic leadership in relation to achieving the mission of the EP and expected learning outcomes		+	

8.3. Financing and allocation of resources

		The organization of education must:			
96	8.3.1.	have a clear distribution of responsibility and authority to provide resources for the educational program, including budget management of EP		+	
97	8.3.2.	manage the budget in a way that is consistent with the mission and results of the EP, ensuring the functional responsibilities of the academic staff and students.	+		

8.4. Administrative staff and management

		The organization of education must:			
98	8.4.1.	have administrative and professional staff to implement the educational program and related activities, ensure proper management and allocation of resources		+	
99	8.4.2.	to ensure the participation of all departments of the educational organization in the processes and procedures of the internal quality assurance system		+	

8.5. Requirements and regulations

		The organization of education must:			
100	8.5.1.	comply with national legislation regarding the number and type of recognized specialties in the field of health care for which approved EP is being developed		+	
101	8.5.2.	to approve postgraduate medical education programs in		+	

		cooperation with all interested parties				
8.6.	**Informing the public**					
The organization of education must:						
102	8.6.1.	to publish complete and reliable information about the educational program and its achievements on the official website of the educational organization and in the media		+		
		Total	1	12	0	0
		TOTAL IN TOTAL	2	97	3	0

Appendix 2. The program of the visit to the educational organization

Program
VISIT OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION INDEPENDENT ACCREDITATION AND RATING AGENCY (IAAR)
TO ASFENDIYAROV KAZAKH NATIONAL MEDICAL UNIVERSITY within the framework
OF INTERNATIONAL SPECIALIZED ACCREDITATION
Dates of the visit: April 16-18, 2024

Cluster 1: 6B10116 Medicine (primary accreditation)
6B10117 Pediatrics (primary accreditation)
6B10118 Dentistry (primary accreditation)
6B10119 Preventive Medicine (primary accreditation)
Cluster 2: 7M10122 Nutritionology (primary accreditation)
Cluster 3: 7M10102 Healthcare Management (profile direction) (primary accreditation)

44

7M10101 Healthcare Management (scientific and pedagogical direction)
 Cluster 4: 8D10104 Nursing Science (primary accreditation)

Date and time	Work of an external expert commission with target groups	Position and Surname, first name, patronymic target group participants	The form of communication Filled in by an IAAR employee
15 april 2024			
16.00-17.00	A preliminary meeting of the EEC. Discussion of key issues related to the visit procedure.	External experts IAAR	Connect to the Zoom Conference https://us02web.zoom.us/j/5332046823 Conference ID: 533 204 6823 (only for the EEC)
Day 1: April 16, 2024		transfer to KazNMU	
9.00-9.30	Allocation of responsibility of experts, solution of organizational issues	External experts IAAR	Connect to the Zoom Conference https://us02web.zoom.us/j/5332046823 Conference ID: 533 204 6823 (only for the EEC) 118 office. 1st floor building of the rector's office
9.30–10.00	Meeting with the Rector	Chairman of the Board - Rector Shoranov Marat Edigeevich	Connect to the Zoom Conference https://us02web.zoom.us/j/5332046823 Conference ID: 533 204 6823 Small hall, 3rd floor, administration building

10.00-10.50	Meeting with Vice-rectors	1. Vice–rector - Kalmataeva Zhanna Amantaevna, MD, Professor (Academic block) 2. Vice–Rector - Datkhaev Ubaidilla Makhambetovich, Doctor of Ph.S, Professor (Block of Social Development and Digitalization) 3. Vice–rector - Davletov Kairat Kirgizbayevich Candidate of Medical Sciences (Scientific block) 4. Vice-Rector - Svetlana Sultangazieva, Candidate of Medical Sciences (Clinical Unit)	Connect to the Zoom Conference https://us02web.zoom.us/j/5332046823 Conference ID: 533 204 6823 Small hall, 3rd floor, administration building
10.50-11.40	Meeting with the deans	1. Acting Dean of the School of General Medicine-1 – Izmailova Slu Khabibievna 2. Acting Dean of the School of General Medicine-2 – Shopaeva Gulzhan Amangeldyevna 3. Acting Dean of the International Faculty – Dzhardemalieva Nurzhamal Zhenisovna 4. Acting Dean of the School of Dentistry – Altynbekov Kubeisin Duisenbaevich 5. Dean of the School of Pediatrics – Rasulbek Rahmanberdievich Aipov 6. Dean of the School of Public Health – Karibayev Kuanysh Bolatovich Head of the Department of Master's and Doctoral Studies – Ivanchenko Nellya Nikolaevna	Connect to the Zoom Conference https://us02web.zoom.us/j/5332046823 Conference ID: 533 204 6823 Small hall, 3rd floor, administration building
11.40-11.20	Technical break		
11.20-12.10	Meeting with heads of structural divisions of educational organizations	Appendix 1	Connect to the Zoom Conference https://us02web.zoom.us/j/5332046823 Conference ID: 533 204 6823 Hall of Fame

12.10-13.00	Meeting with the heads of the EP, heads of departments	Appendix 2	Connect to the Zoom Conference https://us02web.zoom.us/j/5332046823 Conference ID: 533 204 6823 Hall of Fame
13.00-14.00	Lunch (EEC members only)		
14.00-14.15	The work of the External Expert Commission	External experts IAAR	Connect to the Zoom Conference https://us02web.zoom.us/j/5332046823 Conference ID: 533 204 6823 (only for the EEC) 118 office. 1st floor building of the rector's office
14.15-16.00	Visual inspection of the educational organization	Application 3	Connect to the Zoom Conference https://us02web.zoom.us/j/5332046823 Conference ID: 533 204 6823
16.00-16.50	Meeting with the staff of the EP	Application 4	Connect to the Zoom Conference https://us02web.zoom.us/j/5332046823 Conference ID: 533 204 6823
16.00-17.00	Survey of teaching staff (in parallel)	Application 5	The link is sent to the teacher's email address personally
17.00-18.00	The work of the EEC. Summing up the results of the first day	External experts IAAR	Connect to the Zoom Conference https://us02web.zoom.us/j/5332046823 Conference ID: 533 204 6823 118 office. 1st floor building of the rector's office

	Day 2: April 17th, 2024	transfer to KazNMU	
9.00-9.15	The work of the EEC.	External experts IAAR	Connect to the Zoom Conference https://us02web.zoom.us/j/5332046823 Conference ID: 533 204 6823 (only for the EEC) 118 office. 1st floor building of the rector's office
9.15-12.00	Visiting the practice bases of the EP and attending classes according to the schedule	Application 6	Connect to the Zoom Conference https://us02web.zoom.us/j/5332046823 Идентификатор конференции: 533 204 6823
12.00-13.00	Working with department documents and attending teaching staff classes according to the schedule	https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1-spuPaX4JkD9aLbKGFRTrIUr55sDuql0?usp=drive_link	Connect to the Zoom Conference https://us02web.zoom.us/j/5332046823 Conference ID: 533 204 6823
13.00-14.00	Lunch (EEC members only)		
14.00-14.15	The work of the EEC.	External experts IAAR	Connect to the Zoom Conference https://us02web.zoom.us/j/5332046823 Conference ID: 533 204 6823 (only for the EEC)
14.15-15.00	Meeting with students of the EP (in parallel)	Cluster 1 (Appendix 8)	
		Cluster 2 (Appendix 8)	
		Cluster 3 (Appendix 8)	
		Cluster 4 (Appendix 8)	
14.15-15.30	Student survey (in parallel)	Appendix 9	The link is sent to the student's e-mail personally

48

15.00-15.20	Technical break		
15.20-17.00	The work of the EEC, discussion of the results of the second day and profile parameters (recording is underway)	External experts IAAR	Connect to the Zoom Conference https://us02web.zoom.us/j/5332046823 Conference ID: 533 204 6823 (only for the EEC) 118 office. 1st floor building of the rector's office
17.00-18.00	The work of the EEC is the development and discussion of recommendations (a record is being kept)	External experts IAAR	Connect to the Zoom Conference https://us02web.zoom.us/j/5332046823 Conference ID: 533 204 6823 (only for the EEC) 118 office. 1st floor building of the rector's office
Day 3: April 18, 2024		transfer to KazNMU	
09.00-11.30	The work of the EEC, development and recommendations	External experts IAAR	Connect to the Zoom Conference https://us02web.zoom.us/j/5332046823 Conference ID: 533 204 6823 (only for the EEC) 118 office. 1st floor building of the rector's office
11.30-12.30	Preparation of information by the Chairman based on the results of the external assessment	Chairman of the EEC	118 office. 1st floor building of the rector's office
12.30-13.00	Work of the EEC discussion, decision-making by voting (recording is underway)	External experts IAAR	Connect to the Zoom Conference https://us02web.zoom.us/j/5332046823 Conference ID: 533 204 6823 (only for the EEC)

49

			118 office. 1st floor building of the rector's office
13.00-14.00	Lunch (EEC members only)		
14.00-15.30	The work of the EEC	External experts IAAR	Connect to the Zoom Conference https://us02web.zoom.us/j/5332046823 Conference ID: 533 204 6823 (only for the EEC) 118 office. 1st floor building of the rector's office
15.00-15.40	The final meeting of the EEC with the leadership of the university	Heads of the university and structural divisions 1. Chairman of the Board - Rector - Shoranov Marat Edigeevich 2. Vice-rector - Kalmataeva Zhanna Amantaevna (Academic block) 3. Vice-Rector - Svetlana Sultangazieva (Clinical unit) 4. Vice-rector - Davletov Kairat Kirgizbayevich (Scientific block) 5. Vice-Rector - Datkhaev Ubaidilla Makhambetovich (Block of Social Development and digitalization) 6. Head of the Department of Academic Work – Tashetova Aigul Balabekovna 7. Acting Dean of the School of General Medicine-1 – Izmailova Slu Habibievna 8. Acting Dean of the School of General Medicine-2 – Shopaeva Gulzhan Amangeldyevna 9. Acting Dean of the School of Dentistry – Altynbekov Kubeisin Duisenbaevich 10. Dean of the School of Pediatrics – Rasulbek Rahmanberdievich Aipov 11. Acting Dean of the School of Public Health – Karibayev Kuanysh Bolatovich	Connect to the Zoom Conference https://us02web.zoom.us/j/5332046823 Conference ID: 533 204 6823 Small hall, 3rd floor, administration building

		12. Acting Dean of the International Faculty – Dzhardemalieva Nurzhamal Zhenisovna 13. Head of the Department of Master's and Doctoral Studies - Ivanchenko Nellya Nikolaevna 14. Head of the Academic Quality Department – Abylgazina Aigul Yessimzhanovna	
15.40-16.00	The work of the EEC, Discussion of the results of the quality assessment	External experts IAAR	118 office. 1st floor building of the rector's office
Departure of the EEC members			

Appendix 3. Results of the teacher survey

Total number of questionnaires: 99

1. What is your department/faculty?

Medicine	26(26,3%)
Pediatrics	19(19,2%)
Medical and preventive care	12(12,1%)
Dentistry	22(22,2%)
Management in Healthcare (Specialized direction and scientific and pedagogical direction) Master's degree	6(6,1%)
Nutritionology Master's degree	10(10,1%)
Nursing Science Doctoral Studies	4(4,0%)

2. Your Position (Ваша должность)

Professor (Профессор)	14(14,1%)
Associate Professor (Доцент)	45(45,5%)
Senior Teacher (Старший преподаватель)	10(10,1%)
Teacher (Преподаватель)	22(22,2%)
Head of the Department (Зав. кафедрой)	1(1,0%)
Lecturer (Лектор)	2(2,0%)
Assistant (Ассистент)	2(2,0%)
Assistant of the Department (Ассистент кафедры)	1(1,0%)
Head teacher of the department (Завуч кафедры)	2(2,0%)

3. Academic degree, academic title (Ученая степень, ученое звание)

Honoured Worker (Заслуженный деятель)	0(0%)
Doctor of Science (Доктор наук)	7(7,1%)
Candidate of Science (Кандидат наук)	43(43,4%)
Master (Магистр)	22(22,2%)
PhD (PhD)	7(7,1%)
Professor (Профессор)	4(4,0%)
Associate Professor (Ассоциированный профессор)	8(8,1%)
no (нет)	14 (14,1%)
Assistant (Ассистент)	1(1,0%)
Клин.ординатор (Clinical Resident)	1 (1,0%)

4. Work experience at this HEI (Стаж работы в данном вузе)

Less than 1 year	4(4,0%)
1 year- 5 years	6(6,1%)
More than 5 years	89(89,9%)

	Very well	Well	Relatively bad	Badly	Very bad
How well does the content of the educational program meet your needs?	58(58,6%)	39(39,4%)	2(2,0%)	0	0
How do you assess the opportunities that the university	47(47,5%)	47(47,5%)	4(4,0%)	1(1,0%)	0

provides for professional development of the teaching staff?					
How do you assess the opportunities provided by the university for teachers' career growth?	44(44,4%)	48(48,5%)	6(6,1%)	1(1,0%)	0
How do you assess the degree of academic freedom of the teaching staff?	41(41,4%)	52(52,5%)	3(3,0%)	3(3,0%)	0
To what extent can teachers use their own strategies?	42(42,4%)	53(53,5%)	2(2,0%)	2(2,0%)	0
To what extent can teachers use their own methods?	51(51,5%)	46(46,5%)	2(2,0%)	0	0
To what extent can teachers use their own innovations in the learning process?	54(54,5%)	41(41,4%)	4(4,0%)	0	0
How do you assess the organization of health care and disease prevention at the university?	43(43,3%)	51(51,5%)	4(4,0%)	0	1(1,0%)
What attention does the university administration pay to the content of the educational program?	58(58,6%)	38(38,4%)	3(3,0%)	0	0
How do you assess the sufficiency and accessibility of the necessary scientific and educational literature in the library?	58(58,6%)	38(38.4%)	2(2,0%)	1(1,0%)	0
Do you assess the level of conditions created that take into account the needs of different groups of students?	40(40,4%)	51(51,5%)	7(7,1%)	1(1,0%)	0
Evaluate the openness and accessibility of management for students	53(53,5%)	42(42,4%)	4(4,0%)	0	0
Evaluate the openness and accessibility of management for the teaching staff	48(48,5%)	47(47,5%)	4(4,0%)	0	0
What is the level of encouragement and involvement of young professionals in the educational process?	47(47,5%)	41(41,4%)	10(10,1%)	1(1,0%)	0
Evaluate the professional and personal growth opportunities created for each teacher and employee	50(50,5%)	41(41,4%)	7(7,1%)	1(1,0%)	0
Evaluate the adequacy of the recognition by the university management of the potential and abilities of teachers.	47(47,5%)	42(42,4%)	9(9,1%)	1(1,0%))	0
How academic mobility activities are organized	44(44,4%)	48(48,5%)	6(6,1%)	1(1,0%)	0

53

How is the professional development activity of teaching staff organized?	44(44,4%)	48(48,5%)	5(5,1%)	2(2,0%)	0
Evaluate how the university and its management support the research work of the teaching staff	41(41,4%)	52(52,5%)	3(3,0%)	3(3,0%)	0
Evaluate how the university and its management support the development of new educational programs / academic disciplines / teaching methods.	54(54,5%)	42(42,4%)	3(3,0%)	0	0
Evaluate the faculty's ability to combine teaching with scientific research	30(30,3%)	56(56,6%)	10(10,1%)	1(1,0%)	2(2,0%)
Evaluate the faculty's ability to combine teaching with practical activities	42(42,4%)	51(51,5%)	4(4,0%)	2(2,0%)	
Evaluate the faculty's ability to combine teaching with scientific research	43(36,1%)	61(51,3%)	13(10,9%)	2(1,7%)	0
Evaluate the faculty's ability to combine teaching with practical activities	54(45,4%)	57(47,9%)	6(5%)	1(0,8%)	1(0,8%)
Evaluate whether the knowledge acquired by students at the university meets the requirements of the modern labor market	41(41,4%)	52(52,5%)	5(5,1%)	1(1,0%)	0
How do the management and administration of the university perceive criticism	30(30,3%)	57(57,6%)	9(9,1%)	1(1,0%)	2(2,0%)
Assess how well your academic workload meets your expectations and capabilities	32(32,3%)	54(54,5%)	11(11,1%)	0	2(2,0%)
Evaluate the focus of educational programs/curricula on providing students with the skills of analyzing the situation and making forecasts	45(45,5%)	51(51,5%)	2(2,0%)	1(1,0%)	0
Evaluate how the content and quality of the educational program implementation meet the expectations of the labor market and the employer.	45(45,5%)	47(47,5%)	6(6,1%)	1(1,0%)	0

How often do you conduct workshops and practical exercises as part of your course?	28(28,3%)	46(46,5%)	20(20,2%)	5(5,1%)	0
How often are teachers invited from outside (local and foreign) to participate in the learning process?	18(18,2%)	58(58,6%)	21(21,2%)	2(2,0%)	0
How often do you encounter the following problems in your work	5(5,1%)	24(24,2%)	70(70,7%)	0	0
Unbalanced academic load by semester	5(5,1%)	38(38,4%)	56(56,7%)	0	0
Lack of necessary literature in the library	5(5,1%)	29(29,3%)	65(65,7%)	0	0
Overcrowding of study groups (too many students in a group)	6(6,1%)	29(29,3%)	64(64,6%)	0	0
Inconvenient schedule (Неудобный график	2(2,0%)	32(32,3%)	65(65,7%)	0	0
Inadequate facilities for classroom activities(не отвечающие требованиям условия для занятий в классе	6(6,1%)	20(20,4%)	73(73,5%)	0	0
Lack of internet access/poor internet connection (Отсутствие доступа в Интернет / плохое подключение к Интернету	8(8,1%)	42(42,4%)	49(49,5%)	0	0
Students lack of interest in the study(Отсутствие у студентов интереса к учебе	2(2,0%)	53(53,5%)	44(44,4%)	0	0
Late delivery of information about the events (Несвоевременное получение информации о событиях)	2(2,0%)	25(25,3%)	72(72,7%)	0	0
Absence of teaching aids in classrooms (Отсутствие учебных пособий в классах	5(5,1%)	20(20,2%)	74(74,7%)	0	0
There are many different aspects in HEI's life that affect every teacher and employee in one way or another. Assess how satisfied you are with: (В жизни вуза есть множество различных аспектов, которые так или иначе влияют на каждого преподавателя и сотрудника. Оцените, насколько вы удовлетворены	72(72,7%)	22(22,2%)	2(2,0%)	3(3,0%)	0
Relationships with direct management(Отношениями с непосредственным руководством)	82(82,8%)	15(15,2%)	1(1,0%)	1(1,0%)	0
Relationships with colleagues at the department(Отношениями с коллегами на кафедре	89(89,9%)	7(7,1%)	1(1,0%)	2(2,0%)	0

55

Degree of participation in management decisions (Степенью участия в принятии управленческих решений	67(67,7%)	26(26,3%)	4(4,0%)	2(2,0%)	0
Relationships with students(Отношениями со студентами)	95(96,0%)	4(4,0%)	0	0	0
Recognition of your success and achievements by administration (Признанием Ваших успехов и достижений со стороны администрации)	72(72,7%)	20(20,2%)	4(4,0%)	3(3,0%)	0
Support for your proposals and comments(Поддержкой ваших предложений и комментариев)	75(75,8%)	18(18,2%)	2(2,0%)	4(4,0%)	0
HEI administration's activities(Деятельностью администрации вуза)	70(70,7%)	22(22,2%)	3(3,0%)	4(4,0%)	0
Remuneration terms(Условиями оплаты труда)	45(45,5%)	43(43,4%)	9(9,1%)	2(2,0%)	0
Working conditions, list and quality of services provided in HEI (Удобством работы, услугами, имеющимися в вузе)	72(72,7%)	25(25,3%)	1(1,0%)	1(1,0%)	0
Occupational health and safety(Охраной труда и его безопасностью)	77(77,8%)	19(19,2%)	1(1,0%)	2(2,0%)	0
Management of changes in HEI's activities(Управлением изменениями в деятельности вуза)	66(66,7%)	26(26,3%)	2(2,0%)	5(5,1%)	0
Provision of a social package: recreation, sanatorium treatment, etc. (Предоставлением льгот: отдых, санаторное лечение и др.)	54(54,5%)	26(26,3%)	9(9,1%)	10(10,1%)	0
Arrangements for catering in HEI and its quality(Организацией питания в ВУЗе и его качеством)	39(39,4%)	35(35,4%)	8(8,1%)	17(17,2)	0
Arrangements for health care and quality of medical services (Организацией здравоохранения и качества медицинских услуг)	54(54,5%)	31(31,3%)	2(2,0%)	12(12,1%)	0

31. Why do you work in this particular HEI?(Why do you work at this particular university?)78 responses
National University
Leading university
prestige, prospects, native university, team, academic environment
The prestige of the University
I have been working for 16 years now, I am satisfied with the team of my superiors
Alma Mater

Prestige, academic integrity, compliance with all standards of the educational process

Patriot

is a huge base

It is the leading university in the country, where the quality of training is much higher than in other universities in the country

I like it, because I graduated from this university, defended my PhD, everything is honest, transparent, there are all conditions.

I like my University

The most popular medical university, I studied here, I know many employees

Admittedly, who if not Me.

KazNMU is my ALMA MATER, the values and mission of our University coincide with my inner beliefs, and I also have experience and knowledge in the field of dentistry with which I want to share, as well as the opportunity to develop as a person and a professional

KazNMU is the best university, with a wonderful future, a worthy past, and I believe that this university has high technologies, a strong base and applies the latest educational methods, the most relevant and in demand in the labor market.

KazNMU is a national university

My Alma Mater, the status of a national and international university, a strong clinical and scientific base

My favorite university

is perspective

The university is the leading one in the KZ

It has a national status, has a very powerful clinical base, students are shown all the novelties of medicine, since all major clinical centers of the city have our departments

National

The working conditions satisfy my requests

Priority in knowledge transfer

I am an adherent of this university

I like working at this university because it is my favorite university.

Career opportunities; national status of the university; good technical opportunities for students to study.

National status, career growth

The prestige of the university, clinical facilities, excellent staff

There are prospects for learning, the university supports all initiatives

I like my job

I am committed to this university

This is my Alma mater!

The best medical university of the Republic of Kazakhstan

I am satisfied with the advantages of the University, the prestige, the good staff of the University

Alma mater

Like

It is the best national medical university in the Republic of Kazakhstan

my inner beliefs coincide with the mission of the University, and I also want to share my experience and knowledge for the benefit of society, a wide opportunity for career and personal growth.

My alma mater, national university, good base, management

I like it and feel comfortable

My Alma Mater

This is my alma mater, I work at this university for 26 years, the work satisfies in all directions

KazNMU is the flagship of medical education in the country!

I'm loving it

A graduate of this university

I am a graduate of KazNMU, I have been working for about 40 years. I support my native university, I want to work as much as I can for the benefit of KazNMU

Stability

I find it difficult to answer

There is an opportunity to implement and combine educational, scientific and practical activities, the possibility of growth and development

Alma Mater, stability

Prestigious

I like working at our university

the leading medical university in the country

I am a graduate of ASMI in 1980, I love my profession and I want to share my knowledge with young people, I am trained. For many years she worked as a part-time and full-time employee of the department, after retiring to KazNMU, she had to work hourly. This academic year, she was accepted back into the staff of the department.

KazNMU is one of the leading universities, development prospects, friendly, professional team

I graduated from this university. Now, after a long experience in practical healthcare, I want to pass on the experience to students

Innovative University

I am satisfied with all the conditions of our KazNMU.

The leading advanced university, where the integration of academic education with science and practical health care is implemented

Firstly, Alma mater, secondly, I love my profession, and thirdly, I like working with students

the prestige and advantages of the University and the team

It is prestigious to work at this university

I work at KazNMU because I like to share my experience and knowledge with students

I like the profession

My specialty does not match

I really like the method of teaching students

This is my AlmaMater

Meets my requirements

It is the most prestigious medical university in Kazakhstan

Kazakhstan's leading University in medicine

This is my credo.

I have a good team and I like teaching in my specialty. Thanks to the increasing coefficients, a good salary is formed

Comfortable to work with

I share my practical experience with students of a large National university in the country

I am more satisfied with all the conditions of the university

I wanted to share my practical skills with a future doctor

 Other problems (Other problems)50 responses

No

No

There are no problems

there are insufficient premises at clinical bases

hourly staff

There are no other problems, all the conditions are there, they even teach English for free.the language.

lack of classrooms

Insufficient equipment with some equipment, materials, and demonstration models

There are not enough textbooks in the State language

no, you provide everything and timely management response to the necessary needs.

58

Non-essential

no

There are no problems, if there are, they are solved quickly

Problems to be solved

There are no problems, all conditions are satisfied

As everywhere, there are no special problems

No, we try to eliminate them in advance.

All problems that arise can be solved

A meager salary

It is cold in winter and hot in summer in classrooms, it is impossible to conduct classes by increasing the number of students, first of all it is necessary to provide modern conditions for classes and solve the issue of admission of students fully in clinics and operating rooms.Most of the students are literate, ambitious and decent, with the exception of some. D.B. University at the height

There were no problems

no problem

Partial implementation purchase

no problems

Equipped with new computers.

No

Appendix 4. Results of the student survey

Total number of questionnaires: 115

What is your educational program (specialty)/faculty/school?

Medicine	43(37,4%)
Pediatrics	20(17,4%)
Medical and preventive care	19(16,5%)
Dentistry	28(24,3%)
Management in healthcare (specialized area) Master's degree	0
Management in healthcare (Scientific and pedagogical direction) Master's degree	1(0,9%)
Nutritionology Master's degree	3(2,6%)
Nursing Science Doctoral Studies	1(0,9%)

Gender:

Male	29 (25,2%)
Female	86 (74,8%)

Rate how satisfied you are:

Questions	Great	Well	Satisfied	Not satisfied	Very bad
The level of accessibility of the dean's office (school, faculty, department)	91 (79,1%)	18 (15,7%)	6 (5,2%)		
The level of accessibility and responsiveness of the management (university, school, faculty, department)	78 (67,8%)	31 (27,0%)	6 (5,2%)		
The availability of academic counseling to you	68 (59,1%)	41 (35,7%)	6 (5,2%)		
Support of educational materials in the learning process	65 (56,5%)	38 (33,0%)	8 (7,0%)	4 (3,5%)	
The availability of counseling on personal issues	58 (50,4%)	46 (40,0%)	11 (9,6%)		
The relationship between a student and a teacher	67 (58,3%)	39 (33,9%)	9 (7,8%)		
The activities of the financial and administrative services of the university	53 (46,1%)	46 (40,0%)	15 (13,0%)	1 (0,9%)	
Accessibility of the health care service	66 (57,4%)	42 (36,5%)	6 (5,2%)	1 (0,9%)	
The quality of medical services at the university	65 (56,5%)	39 (33,9%)	10 (8,7%)	1 (0,9%)	
The level of accessibility of library resources	64 (55,7%)	38 (33,0%)	10 (8,7%)	2 (1,7%)	1 (0,9%)
The quality of services provided in libraries and reading rooms	65 (56,5%)	37 (32,2%)	11 (9,6%)	2 (1,7%)	

60

Satisfaction with the existing educational resources of the university	61 (53,0%)	44(38,3%)	9 (7,8%)	1 (0,9%))	
Availability of computer classes and Internet resources	50 (43,5%)	46 (40,0%)	17 (14,8%)	2 (1,7%)	
The availability and quality of Internet resources	56 (48,7%)	44 (38,3%)	11 (9,6%)	3 (2,6%)	1 (0,9%)
The usefulness of the website of educational organizations in general and faculties in particular	62 (53,9%)	47 (40,9%)	5 (4,3%)	1 (0,9%)	
Classrooms, classrooms for large groups	58 (50,4%)	39 (33,9%)	15 (13,0%)	2 (1,7%)	1 (0,9%)
Are there Student Rest Rooms (if available)	29 (25,2%)	33 (28,7%)	37 (32,2%)	10 (8,7%)	6 (5,2%)
Clarity of procedures for taking disciplinary action	63 (54,8%)	44 (38,3%)	8 (7,0%)		
The overall quality of the training programs	73 (63,5%)	39(33,9%)	3 (2,6%)		
The quality of educational programs at the university	82 (71,3%)	29 (25,2%)	2 (1,7%)	2 (1,7%)	
Teaching methods in general	74 (64,3%)	36 (31,3%)	3 (2,6%)	1 (0,9%)	1 (0,9%)
The speed of response to feedback from teachers on the educational process	72 (62,6%)	39 (33,9%)	3 (2,6%)	1 (0,9%)	
The quality of teaching	72 (62,6%)	36 (31,3%)	6 (5,2%)	1 (0,9%)	
Academic workload/student requirements	46 (40,0%)	57 (49,6%)	10 (8,7%)	2 (1,7%)	
The requirements of the teaching staff for the student	53 (46,1%)	53 (46,1%)	8 (7,0%)	1 (0,9%)	
Information support and clarification of the requirements for university applicants and the strategy of the educational program (specialty) before admission to the university	72 (62,6%)	38 (33,0%)	5 (4,3%)		
Informing the requirements that must be fulfilled for the successful completion of this educational program (specialty)	67 (58,3%)	44 (38,3%)	4 (3,5%)		
28. Conducted tests and exams	71 (61,7%)	35 (30,4%)	9 (7,8%)		
29. The objectivity of the assessment of knowledge, skills and other educational achievements	59 (51,3%)	46 (40,0%)	9 (7,8%)	1 (0,9%)	
30. Available computer classes	56 (48,7%)	34 (29,6%)	23 (20,0%)	2 (1,7%)	

	46 (40,0%)	45 (39,1%)	20 (17,4%)	2 (1,7%)	2 (1,7%)
31. Available scientific laboratories	46 (40,0%)	45 (39,1%)	20 (17,4%)	2 (1,7%)	2 (1,7%)
32. The objectivity and fairness of the teacher	58 (50,4%)	44 (38,3%)	11 (9,6%)		2 (1,7%)
33. Informing students about courses, educational programs, and academic degrees	66 (57,4%)	41 (35,7%)	8 (7,0%)		
34. Providing students with a dormitory	71 (61,7%)	38 (33,0%)	6 (5,2%)		

Rate how much you agree:

Statement	Full consent	I agree	I partially agree	I disagree	Complete disagreement	They didn't answer
The course program was clearly presented	66 (57,4%)	44 (38,3%)	5 (4,3%)			
The course content is well structured	60 (52,2%)	46 (40,0%)	7 (6,1%)	2 (1,7%)		
The key terms are sufficiently explained	61 (53,0%)	50 (43,5%)	3 (2,6%)	1 (0,9%)		
The material proposed by the Faculty is relevant and reflects the latest scientific and practical developments	58 (50,4%)	44 (48,3%)	12 (10,4%)	1 (0,9%)		
The teacher uses effective teaching methods	65 (56,5%)	40 (34,8%)	8 (7,0%)	1 (0,9%)	1 (0,9%)	
The teacher owns the taught material	78 (67,8%)	35 (30,4%)	1 (0,9%)	1 (0,9%)		
The teacher's presentation is clear	65 (56,5%)	45 (39,1%)	4 (3,5%)		1 (0,9%)	
The teacher presents the material in an interesting way	55 (47,8%)	44 (48,3%)	14 (12,2%)	1 (0,9%)	1 (0,9%)	
Knowledge, skills and other academic achievements are evaluated objectively	56 (48,7%)	49 (42,6%)	9 (7,8%)		1 (0,9%)	

The teacher meets your requirements and expectations regarding professional and personal development	60 (52,2%)	45 (39,1%)	9 (7,8%)		1 (0,9%)	
The teacher stimulates the activity of students	64 (55,7%)	39 (33,9%)	10 (8,7%)	1 (0,9%)	1 (0,9%)	
The teacher stimulates the creative thinking of students	55 (47,8%)	43 (37,4%)	13 (11,3%)	2 (1,7%)	2 (1,7%)	
The appearance and manners of the teacher are adequate	72 (62,6%)	38 (33,0%)	5 (4,3%)			
The teacher shows a positive attitude towards students	66 (57,4%)	41 (35,7%)	7 (6,1%)		1 (0,9%)	
The system of assessment of educational achievements (seminars, tests, questionnaires, etc.) reflects the content of the course	72 (62,6%)	37 (32,2%)	6 (5,2%)			
The evaluation criteria used by the teaching staff are clear and accessible	69 (60,0%)	42 (36,5%)	4 (3,5%)			
Teaching staff objectively assesses the achievements of students	55 (47,8%)	51 (44,3,%)	8 (7,0%)		1 (0,9%)	
The teacher speaks a professional language	75 (65,2%)	37 (32,2%)	2 (1,7%)	1 (0,9%)		
The organization of education provides sufficient opportunity for sports and other leisure activities	56 (48,7%)	42 (36,5%)	14 (12,2%)	1 (0,9%)	1 (0,9%)	1 (0,9%)
The facilities and equipment for students are safe, comfortable and modern	57 (49,6%)	39 (33,9%)	16 (13,9%)	2 (1,7%)	1 (0,9%)	
The library is well equipped and has a fairly good collection of books	55 (47,8%)	38 (33,0%)	18 (15,7%)	1 (0,9%)	3 (2,6%)	
Equal opportunities are provided to all students	73 (63,5%)	36 (31,3%)	6 (5,2%)			

Other problems regarding the quality of teaching: 61 responses

63

No
No
No
The quality of education is excellent, there are no problems
There were no problems
There would be more ice screens for each office, everything is in order and according to the norms It's okay, I like everything.
I have not encountered any problems regarding the quality of teaching. I am satisfied with the quality of teaching There is no reason for teaching In general, everything is fine, sufficient practice in the 1st year, a strong teaching staff, the dean's office is the support of students. Only some teachers do not rate according to the checklist.
No problems
To be honest, there are no problems. Teachers always explain the material clearly and fairly and adequately. Very often we are motivated
Frankly speaking, there is no significant problem related to teaching quality. Our university has provided us with all latest information and teachers can always be there for us. Justice is permanently appreciated in our walls, so everyone can learn and get their fair marks.
There are no problems
Everything is fine
There are no questions about the quality of teaching and teaching staff in general, I am glad that at the university, when questions arise in the educational program or in the assessment system, everything is decided according to the rules of academic honesty either at the department level or at the dean's office level ☛
There are no problems
No, don't have
I am completely satisfied with the quality of teaching. I have not encountered any problems with teaching.
The teachers know their job and do it perfectly.
There is no problem about the quality of teaching. I think all the teachers explain the topic clearly and clearly to us and to the questions that we have
I haven't noticed any problems.
Absent
There are no other teaching quality problems
I have not noticed any other problems yet regarding the quality of teaching without problems
I didn't notice any problems. I like and support the methods of conducting the lesson.
I do not observe any problems, I am completely satisfied.
No
Biased assessment, many teachers evaluate a student based on interactions with them (personal hostility, etc.).