



«АККРЕДИТТЕУ ЖӘНЕ РЕЙТИНГТІҢ
ТӘУЕЛСІЗ АГЕНТТІГІ» КЕМ

НУ «НЕЗАВИСИМОЕ АГЕНТСТВО
АККРЕДИТАЦИИ И РЕЙТИНГА»

INDEPENDENT AGENCY FOR
ACCREDITATION AND RATING

REPORT

on the results of the work of the external expert commission for the
evaluation of the educational program
8D10104 «Nursing Science» for compliance with the requirements of the
standards of international primary accreditation
of the non-profit Joint stock Company
«Kazakh National Medical University named after S.D.Asfendiyarov»

from «16» to «18» April 2024

INDEPENDENT ACCREDITATION AND RATING AGENCY
External Expert Commission

***Addressed to
To the IAAR
Accreditation Council***



REPORT

on the results of the work of the external expert commission for the evaluation of the educational program 8D10104 «Nursing Science» for compliance with the requirements of the standards of international primary accreditation of the non-profit Joint stock Company «Kazakh National Medical University named after S.D.Asfendiyarov»

from «16» to «18» April 2024

Almaty

April 18, 2024

CONTENT

(I) LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS	3
(II) INTRODUCTION	4
(III) REPRESENTATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION	5
(IV) DESCRIPTION OF THE PREVIOUS ACCREDITATION PROCEDURE	6
(V) DESCRIPTION OF THE VEC VISIT	6
(VI) COMPLIANCE WITH SPECIALIZED ACCREDITATION STANDARDS	8
Standard 1 «RESEARCH ENVIRONMENT»	8
Standard 2 «PREPARATION RESULTS»	11
Standard 3 «POLICY AND CRITERIA FOR THE SELECTION OF APPLICANTS»	13
Standard 4 «TRAINING PROGRAM»	16
Standard 5 «SCIENTIFIC GUIDANCE»	18
Standard 6 «DISSERTATION»	20
Standard 7 «THE DISSERTATION EVALUATION»	21
Standard 8 «SCHOOL STRUCTURE AND MANAGEMENT»	23
(IX) REVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE DEVELOPMENT OF EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION	26
(X) RECOMMENDATION TO THE ACCREDITATION BOARD	26
Appendix 1. Evaluation table «SPECIALIZED PROFILE PARAMETERS»	27



(I) LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS

AIS	Automated information system
BD	Basic disciplines
SCSE	The state compulsory standard of education
DMS	Doctor of Medical Sciences
IWP	Individual work plan
IC	Individual curriculum
CMS	Candidate of Medical Sciences
CEP	Committee of Educational Programs
LEC	Local Ethics Commission
MESRK	Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
NPJSC	Non profit Joint stock Company
RWDS	Research work of a doctoral student
SC	Scientific Committee
SCS	Scientific Commission of the Senate
STP	Scientific and technical project
NCSSTE	National Center for State Scientific and Technical Expertise
DMDS	Department of Master's and Doctoral Studies
EP	Educational program
OHPE	Organization of higher and postgraduate education
SP	Specialized disciplines
TS	Teaching staff
QMS	Quality management System
IWDS	Independent work of a doctoral student
IWDSGT	Independent work of a doctoral student under the guidance of a teacher
MC	Model curriculum
ERWDS	Experimental research work of a doctoral student
WoS	Web of Science

(II) INTRODUCTION

In accordance with the order of the Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating (hereinafter - IAAR) No. 48-24-OD dated 02.02.2024, an external expert commission assessed the compliance of educational activities with the standards of accreditation of the IAAR educational program 8D10104 – Nursing Science from April 16 to 18, 2024 at the Kazakh National Medical University named after S.D.Asfendiyarov.

The report of the external expert commission (hereinafter referred to as the EEC) contains an assessment of the educational program 8D10104 – Nursing Science according to the criteria of the IAAR, recommendations of the EEC on further improvement of the activities of KazNMU, parameters of the profile of the educational program.

The composition of the EEC:

IAAR expert, Chairman of the EEC - Bogomolova Elena Sergeevna, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs of the Volga Research Medical University of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation (Russian Federation, Nizhny Novgorod) offline participation;

IAAR expert – Uzbekova Saltanat Esengaliyevna, PhD, Dean of the School of Medicine of the JSC «Semey Medical University» (Republic of Kazakhstan, Semey) offline participation;

IAAR expert – Nugmanova Aigul Maratovna, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of Pediatrics with the course of Pediatric Infectious Diseases of the Kazakh-Russian Medical University (Republic of Kazakhstan, Almaty) offline participation;

IAAR expert – Ismailova Aigul Amanzholovna, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Academician of the Academy of Sciences, Professor of the Department of Public Health and Epidemiology of the National Academy of Sciences «Astana Medical University» (Republic of Kazakhstan, Astana), offline participation;

IAAR expert – Sultanova Gulnar Dostanovna, PhD, Dean of the Faculty of Dentistry, Nursing, PH, Pharmacy and medical and preventive care, JSC «West Kazakhstan Medical University» (Republic of Kazakhstan, Aktobe) offline participation;

IAAR expert – Seidakhmetova Aizat Ashimkhanovna, PhD, Associate Professor, Dean of the Faculty of Medicine, Head of the Department of Emergency Medicine and Nursing of JSC South Kazakhstan Medical Academy (Republic of Kazakhstan, Shymkent), offline participation;

IAAR expert – Buribayeva Zhanara Kuanyshbekovna, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, Head of the Department of Epidemiology, Evidence-based Medicine and Biostatistics, Kazakhstan Medical University «Higher School of Public Health» (Republic of Kazakhstan, Almaty), offline participation;

IAAR expert – Zharylkasyn Zhenisbek Zharylkasynuly, PhD, Associate Professor, Professor of the School of Public Health of the National Academy of Sciences «Medical University of Karaganda», (Republic of Kazakhstan, Karaganda), offline participation;

IAAR expert, EEC employer - Asen Aigul Asenkyzy, MBA, Director of the KGP at the Municipal Polyclinic No. 7 (Republic of Kazakhstan, Almaty), offline participation;

IAAR expert, EEC employer - Koishyman Yernar Yerkinbekuly, Deputy Chief Physician of «Luch» Neurorehabilitation Center LLP (Republic of Kazakhstan, Karaganda), online participation;

IAAR expert, EEC student – Karbaeva Radana Olegovna, 4th year student of «General Medicine», Kazakh National University (Republic of Kazakhstan, Almaty) offline participation;

IAAR expert, student of the Higher School of Economics – Baituganova Aizhan Nurzhanovna, Master of Medical Sciences, doctoral student of 2 years of study at the «Nursing Science» JSC «Astana Medical University» (Republic of Kazakhstan, Astana) online participation;

IAAR expert, student of the Higher School of Economics – Nurzhan Nurtasuly Nurakhimov, 2-year master's student of the «Management in Healthcare» JSC «Semey Medical University» (Republic of Kazakhstan, Semey) online participation;

IAAR expert, student of the EEC – Makulbek Aigerim Serikpaikyzy, 1-year master's student of the OP «Public Health», JSC «Medical University of Karaganda» (Republic of Kazakhstan, Karaganda) online participation;

The coordinator from the Agency - Alisa Satbekovna Dzhakenova, PhD, Head of Medical projects of the Agency for Institutional and Specialized Accreditation of Medical Educational Organizations (Astana), offline participation.

(III) REPRESENTATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION

JSC KazNMU named after S.D.Asfendiyarov is a leader in the field of medical and pharmaceutical education. Since 2010, KazNMU has started to prepare a PhD (doctorate) in the specialty 8D10101 (6D110200) – «Public Health». Currently, KazNMU trains specialists in Kazakh and Russian languages on the basis of available state licenses. The University is a signatory to the Magna Charta of Universities, in 2011, in accordance with the principles of the Bologna Process, it made the transition to a credit learning technology supported by the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

School of Public Health named after H. Dosmukhamedova carries out educational activities in the specialty «Healthcare». The faculty was established in 1943 on the basis of the Almaty Medical Institute as a sanitary and hygienic faculty by order of the NKZ of the USSR №234 dated May 14, 1943. From 1964 to 1985 he was a member of the Karaganda Medical Institute. Since 1985, it has been a part of the Medical University of Almaty again. In 2004 By the decision of the Academic Council of the Faculty (Protocol №2 of 12.10.2004), on the basis of renaming the specialty «Hygiene and Epidemiology» to «medical and preventive medicine», the faculty was renamed the medical and Preventive Faculty. Since September 2013, it has been transformed into the Faculty of Public Health.

The teaching staff of the SoPH is represented by: 1 academician, 7 doctors of sciences, 25 candidates of sciences, 10 PhD doctors, 15 masters, 2 holders of the international scholarship of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan «Bolashak». The settlement of the PPP of the SCO is 45%, 14% of the PPP has a non-zero h-index. Over the past year, the departments of the SCO have implemented 5 scientific/research programs and projects, 19 articles have been published, indexed in the Web of Science, Scopus database.

In order to train highly specialized public health specialists and exchange international experience and information, visiting professors were invited: Director of the Institute of Psychotherapy and Medical Psychology of the Russian Academy of Sciences. Karvasarsky Nazarov R.K.; PhD, Associate Professor of the International Higher School of Medicine Dzhusupov K. O.; MD, Professor, Head of the Department of Scientific Foundations of the organization of outpatient care Federal State Budgetary Institution «Central Research Institute of Organization and Informatization of Healthcare» Evdakov V. A.; PhD, Head of the LUNZ Training Center Egle Vaizgeliene conducted training on the topic: «Fundamentals of research methodology»; PhD, MPH, Associate Professor at the University of Michigan Elizabeth King; Master of Medicine and Professional Qualification doctor Zilvinas Dambrauskas; PhD, Professor at the LUNZ Faculty of Family Medicine, head of the Family Medicine Clinic at the LUNZ University Clinic Leonas Valius; D.M.Sc., Professor at the Faculty of Public Health of the Lithuanian University of Health Sciences (LUNZ) Zilvinas Padaiga; PhD, Professor at the School of Pharmacy and Pharmaceutical Sciences, Trinity College Dublin Fabio De Sousa Menezes Boylan; BSc, MSc, Epidemiologist, Leuven University Sally Jackson; MD, PhD, Professor, Chairman of the Department of Public Health, Wroclaw Medical University (2006) and the Department of Internal Medicine and Allergology, Central Clinical Hospital, MSW in Warsaw, Wroclaw Medical University Andrzej Mariusz Fal; Duke University staff Elina Urli Hodges and Deborah Engle visited KazNMU in order to create an assessment office at KazNMU using the example of Duke; Michael Joseph, Associate Professor, Department of Epidemiology and Biostatistics, SCO, Downstate SUNY Medical Center, Brooklyn, New York, USA; David Odegaard, MPH, Director of Education, Downstate SUNY Medical Center; Jack DeHovits, Micheal Joseph, David Odegard, Recai Yucel, Syed Ali; Vishna Devi V Nadarajah, D.biol.of Sciences, Prof. International Medical University Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia, School of Public

Health; Jack Alan DeHovitz, PhD, Prof. Honored Professor University of Medicine Albany, SUNY School of Public Health; Knyazev Evgeny Gennadievich, MD, PhD. societies. Health and Public Health, SCO International Medical School at FSBI; Vytenis Kalibatas, Assoc.Prof. Kaunas School of Health, Lithuania LUNZ. The Dosmukhamedov School of Economics has a significant material and technical base for conducting the educational process in doctoral studies. In particular, the classroom fund is represented by classrooms, lecture halls, classrooms for heads of departments, classrooms for teachers.

The classroom fund includes: lecture halls, study rooms, laboratory rooms, a room for teachers and assistants, a room for professors and associate professors, offices for heads of departments, computer classes. The lecture halls are equipped with the necessary technical equipment – stationary multimedia projectors and are designed for 100 seats. The study rooms are designed for 12 to 60 seats. The study rooms are located inside the academic buildings and in the buildings of the clinical bases.

(IV) DESCRIPTION OF THE PREVIOUS ACCREDITATION PROCEDURE

The primary specialized accreditation of the educational program «8D10104 – Nursing Science» was conducted by the IAAR accreditation agency. Accreditation period: 04/16/2021-04/15/2024

(V) DESCRIPTION OF THE VEC VISIT

The visit of the external expert commission (hereinafter referred to as the EEC) to KazNMU was organized from April 16 to 18, 2024 in accordance with the Program approved by the Director General of «IAAR» Zhumagulova A.B. and coordinated with the Vice-rector of KazNMU, MD, Professor Kalmataeva Zh.A.

The preliminary meeting was held online on April 15, 2024, which was attended by all members of the EEC.

During the visit, the EEC studied normative and educational and methodological documents on educational programs, educational and methodological complexes of disciplines, methodological documents, visited the structural units and departments stated in the program that ensure the implementation of the educational process, and also checked the operation of information systems used by KazNMU for conducting classes

All materials requested by the commission were uploaded to Google drive by KazNMU representatives in a timely manner. In order to obtain objective information on the assessment of KazNMU's activities, the members of the EEC carried out: a visual inspection of academic buildings, laboratories, libraries, clinical bases providing training sessions, observation, interviewing employees of various structural divisions, teachers, students, questionnaires of the teaching staff and students.

KazNMU ensured the presence of employees and persons specified in the Visit Program. The three-day EEC Program has been completed in full, in accordance with the distribution of activities by day.

On the first day, April 16, 2024, a preliminary meeting of the Chairman and members of the EEC IAAR took place, during which the following were announced: goals, program, responsibilities of VEC members and clustering of accredited EP:

Four main EEC clusters have been identified:

Cluster 1: 6B10116 Medicine (primary accreditation)

6B10117 Pediatrics (primary accreditation)

6B10118 Dentistry (primary accreditation)

6B10119 Preventive medicine (primary accreditation)

Cluster 2: 7M10122 Nutritionology (primary accreditation)

Cluster 3: 7M10102 Healthcare Management (core area) (primary accreditation)

7M10101 Healthcare Management (scientific and pedagogical direction)

Cluster 4: 8D10104 Nursing Science (primary accreditation)

Key issues were discussed, additional information was identified that should be requested from the structural divisions of KazNMU for validation and confirmation of the reliability of information/data during accreditation.

Then, in accordance with the EEC program, a meeting was held with the rector of KazNMU – Chairman of the Board Shoranov Marat Edigeevich, a presentation was presented on the current activities of the university over the past two years, followed by a meeting with vice-rectors: Vice-rector for Academic Affairs - Kalmataeva Zh.A., Vice-rector Datkhaev U.M. D.F.N., professor (Block social development and digitalization), Vice-rector Sultangazieva S.E., PhD, (Clinical unit).

After that, a meeting was held with the deans of the EEC: Acting Dean of the School of General Medicine - 1 – Izmailova Slu Khabibievna, Acting Dean of the School of General Medicine-2 – Shopaeva Gulzhan Amangeldyevna, Acting Dean of the International Faculty – Dzhardemalievna Nurzhamal Zhenisovna, Acting Dean of the School of Dentistry – Altynbekov Kubeisin Duisenbaevich, Dean of the School of Pediatrics – Aipov Rasulbek Rahmanberdievich, Dean of the School of Public Health – Karibayev Kuanysh Bolatovich, Head of the Department of Master's and Doctoral Studies – Ivanchenko Nellya Nikolaevna. Next, a meeting was held with the heads of structural divisions, heads of EP, heads of departments.

In the afternoon, a visual inspection of the university took place, the material and technical equipment, the VEK experts visited the library, museum, practical skills center, genomic laboratory, Department of Anatomy, etc. Next, a meeting was held with the teaching staff (hereinafter referred to as the faculty). The first day ended with a survey of teaching staff (online).

On the second day of the visit (April 17, 2024) - a visit to the practice bases of the EP by clusters, according to OP 8D10104 Nursing Science, a meeting was held with the chief nurse of the city polyclinic No. 20 of Almaty, an inspection of the office of admission of nursing specialists of the academic bachelor's degree, since the dissertation work of a first-year doctoral student is devoted to delegating the powers of doctors to nursing specialists business. The chief nurse of the polyclinic noted that the reforms in nursing in practical healthcare are carried out in close cooperation with the head of the department and the staff of the Department of Nursing. Then we visited the Department of Nursing, based at the Institute of Nutrition. The staff of the department and the doctoral student of the third year of study showed documentation, an electronic journal, methodological materials for students, a lesson plan, control tools, literature for self-study, an individual doctoral student's plan. After lunch, interviews with students of the EP were conducted, and students were surveyed. The students expressed their positive opinion about the activities of departments, clinics, departments, the university as a whole, and the educational process.

On the third day, the work of the EEC consisted in the development and discussion of recommendations, work was carried out on collegial coordination and preparation of an oral preliminary review of the results of the visit to KazNMU, the development of recommendations based on the results of the visit of an External Expert Commission.

At the final meeting of the EEC with the leadership of KazNMU, recommendations were made to improve the activities of educational programs of accredited specialties (1-4 clusters), developed by members of the EEC based on the results of the work carried out.

A total of 239 representatives of KazNMU took part in face-to-face meetings (Table 1).

Table 1 - Information about employees and students who participated in meetings with the EEC IAAR:

Category of participants	Number
Rector	1
Vice-Rectors	4
Heads of structural divisions	27
Deans of faculties	7
Heads of departments, heads of EP	51
Teachers	98

Students	66
in total	254

115 students took part in the anonymous survey of students, including doctoral students of the EP Nursing Science -1 (0.9%). 79.1% of all respondents were completely satisfied with their relations with the dean's office, 67.8% were completely satisfied with the level of accessibility and responsiveness of the university management; 56.5% of respondents were completely satisfied with the level of accessibility of library resources.

2.6% are not satisfied with the availability of computer classes and Internet resources. 8.7% are not satisfied with the rest rooms for students; 2.6% are partially dissatisfied with the overall quality of educational programs; 5.2% are partially dissatisfied with the quality of teaching; complete disagreement with the statement – the teacher uses effective teaching methods expressed 0.9%,

1.7% disagree with the statement - The teacher stimulates the creative thinking of students, the Library is well equipped and has a fairly good collection of books – 2.6% disagree. The students wrote that there are few books in the state language, that more rooms for students to relax and coworking centers are needed.

99 people took part in the anonymous survey conducted by the Faculty of KazNMU, 4.0% of the respondents in Nursing Science. 58.6% were satisfied with the content of the educational program; 3% of teaching staff noted a poor degree of academic freedom, 1% of teaching staff noted a very poor organization of health care and disease prevention at the university; 1% noted the poor sufficiency and accessibility of the necessary scientific and educational literature in the library, 2% noted the poor organization of professional development activities of teaching staff, 3% of teaching staff noted that the university and its management poorly support the research work of the teaching staff, 2% of teaching staff noted the low ability of teaching staff to combine teaching with practical activities, 5.1% of the teaching staff answered the question of conducting master classes and practical exercises as part of their course poorly. 3% of the teaching staff noted that the successes and achievements of the administration were not recognized.

4% do not support suggestions and comments, 4% poorly assessed the activities of the university administration.

5.1% of respondents rated the involvement of teaching staff in managing changes in the university's activities as relatively poor; 10.1% were not satisfied with the provision of benefits: rest, sanatorium treatment. 17.2% of respondents are not satisfied with the organization of meals at the university and its quality. Organization of health care and quality of medical services – 12.1%.

The faculty also noted in the comments that KazNMU is the best university with a wonderful future, a worthy past and that this university has high technologies, a strong base and applies the latest educational methods, the most relevant and in demand in the labor market. At the same time, it is noted that there are not enough facilities at clinical bases, not enough textbooks in the state language, and insufficient equipment with some equipment.

For the work of the EEC, access to the Google drive was provided, where the requested documents were placed.

(VI) COMPLIANCE WITH SPECIALIZED ACCREDITATION STANDARDS

Standard 1 «RESEARCH ENVIRONMENT»

The evidentiary part

KazNMU's research activities are conducted by students according to the Development Program of the non-profit joint stock company KazNMU and the strategic plan of KazNMU.

The KazNMU strategy defines the University's vision as «An innovative university, continuously developing on the principles of the academic health and science system, which

combines the efforts of professionals inspired by a single mission, sharing the same values, to generate, transfer and use knowledge about health and for the sake of human health.» The development of KazNMU into a world-class Medical University is carried out through the transfer of educational and scientific technologies within the framework of the «University Partnership» model. The partnership results in strengthening the research potential of doctoral students.

The research work of doctoral students at the university is carried out with the active participation of the teaching staff and doctoral students, with special attention being paid to priority areas of medical science. Competent teachers with academic degrees and titles are involved as scientific supervisors of doctoral students.

The organization of an effective and high-quality research environment is achieved through a combination of high competence of scientific consultants, as well as through cooperation with leading research medical organizations and institutions both in Kazakhstan and abroad.

Leading scientists of the university are participants in the educational process and implementers of scientific projects (ERASMUS+ projects: Accelerated and LMQS) this ensures the logical unity of science and education. One of the key features of the world's leading universities is a well-developed research system and the production of scientific products.

KazNMU actively strives to take its place among the leaders of the global educational and scientific community. This ambitious goal is achieved through the creation of a permanent, sustainable research environment, which is achieved through the effective integration of education, science and business. Special attention is paid to overcoming the historical gap in the field of scientific research in comparison with the leading universities in developed countries. The University focuses its efforts on innovation, international cooperation and the introduction of advanced scientific approaches, which contributes to increasing its competitiveness at the international level and makes a significant contribution to the development of world science and medicine.

Special attention is paid to the harmonious combination of global trends and national priorities in research activities. The results obtained in the course of these studies have a high degree of demand both domestically and internationally, which contributes to improving the reputation of KazNMU and strengthening its position as a leading educational and scientific center in the medical field. This, in turn, contributes to the integration of Kazakhstan into the world scientific community and the development of national medicine based on the best world practices.

The University has created conditions for future doctoral students to acquire the necessary knowledge and competencies. This is achieved through the study of basic and specialized disciplines, as well as through the formation of practical skills and abilities in the process of passing professional (pedagogical, research) practice and performing research work on approved topics of doctoral dissertations.

In the process of implementing the scientific and educational doctoral program in the specialty «Nursing Science», a high quality of education is achieved. This is ensured by providing doctoral students with compulsory disciplines and elective components (elective disciplines), as well as the opportunity to carry out scientific research. Doctoral students define specific scientific goals and objectives and make the right choice of methodology and methods to achieve them. An important role in this process is played by the presence of highly qualified scientific supervisors among students, who are leading domestic and foreign scientists.

Competent teachers with academic degrees and titles of the Republic of Kazakhstan, as well as leading scientists from foreign partner universities, are involved in the scientific guidance of doctoral students and as scientific consultants.

Doctoral students actively participate in international scientific projects of the ERASMUS+ program. The Department of Nursing implements 2 scientific projects of the ERASMUS+ program: Accelerated and LMQS. As part of these projects, the Faculty of the department, undergraduates and doctoral students completed internships in Lithuania, Finland, the Netherlands and Istanbul.

As part of the scientific and educational program of the doctoral program in the educational program «Nursing Science», in order to ensure high quality education and research, doctoral students clearly formulate their scientific goals. An important aspect is the choice of appropriate tasks and

methodologies to achieve the set goals. This is made possible by the presence of experienced scientific supervisors among doctoral students.

The University has a sufficient material and technical base (research institutes and scientific research centers of the republican level, the B. A. Atchabarov Research Institute of Fundamental Medicine, its own classroom fund, computer classes, laboratories, instrumentation, stock materials), corresponding to the current sanitary and technical standards and providing all types of theoretical and practical training provided by the educational the plan, as well as the effective implementation of the research and experimental research work of the doctoral student.

The educational, methodological and informational support of the educational process guarantees the possibility of high-quality mastering of the educational program by doctoral students. The implementation of the educational program is provided with free access to international information networks, electronic databases, library collections, computer technologies, educational, methodological and scientific literature.

The effectiveness of the doctoral program in the educational program «Nursing Science» at the university is guaranteed due to the presence of a strong and productive research environment. This environment plays a key role in the development and formation of research skills among doctoral students.

The international scientific conference of young scientists – Asfen Forum (New Generation) is held annually. Doctoral students have the opportunity to report the main results of their own research, publish abstracts, articles, and participate in master classes and seminars conducted by leading domestic and foreign scientists on the most important practical and scientific problems for the university and the region. In 2023, at the international conference Asfen Forum (New Generation), a doctoral student in the specialty «Nursing science» Isenova B.K. She received 1 prize in the best report nomination, as well as a cash prize in the amount of 200 thousand tenge.

The analytical part

Experts note that based on the materials provided by the staff of the department, information posted on the official website of the university, meetings with focus groups allow us to conclude that the current quality assurance policy of the university reflects the relationship between scientific research, teaching and learning. The experts also made sure that at the current stage of the university's management system is focused on the development of strategic planning, the use of modern management methods, improvement of the research environment, multilateral internal quality assessment and continuous improvement.

Chairman of the Board - Rector Shoranov Marat Edigeevich, at a meeting with the members of the EEC, presented information about the achievements of KazNMU over the past two years, especially noted the creation of an Endowment Fund to improve the material and technical base, which contributes to improving the quality of education and conducting research activities of employees, doctoral students, students. The creation of an Endowment Fund is the best practice, an example for medical universities in Kazakhstan.

The Department of Nursing of KazNMU actively and fruitfully cooperates with the Department of Nursing of the Lithuanian University of Health Sciences. The LSMU Department of Nursing is recognized as a demonstration center of the World Health Organization and stands out as a leading center for research activities. Doctoral students of the KazNMU educational program «Nursing Science» have the opportunity to conduct part of their dissertation work at this center. This collaboration significantly enriches the scientific experience of doctoral students and contributes to improving the quality of research in the field of nursing.

The result of partnership with foreign universities could be the development and promotion of new research projects with subsequent international recognition, improvement of the system of planning, management and evaluation of research activities, creation of an effective system integrating scientific activities. At this stage of cooperation, joint (dual) ops have not been developed.

Strengths/best practices

The existence of an Endowment Fund created in KazNMU, which allows to improve the material and technical base, which contributes to improving the quality of education and conducting research activities.

EEC Recommendations

The University management should assist the heads of the EP in the development of joint (dual) EP, providing for the possibility of obtaining joint scientific degrees. Term: during the 2024-2025 academic year.

The conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria: (strong / satisfactory/ suggest improvements/ unsatisfactory)

strong - 1

satisfactory - 4

suggest improvements - 1

unsatisfactory – none

Standard 2 «PREPARATION RESULTS»

The evidentiary part

The results of research work are published in reputable publications at the regional and international levels, including those with an impact factor; reported at various scientific forums, including those held at the international level; formalized in the form of intellectual property, which will ensure the integration of domestic science into the international scientific space. Participation in conferences and scientific seminars significantly expands the possibilities of the EP and ensures the individualization of the learning process.

The practice of conducting scientific internships in various research organizations will provide a huge contribution to the EP. In order to gain research experience, doctoral students, within the framework of academic policy, are sent to universities to take certain courses in various disciplines.

The subject of the dissertation research, as a rule, should correspond to national priorities, state programs or programs of fundamental and applied research, which is reflected in legislative acts. In this context, the results of the doctoral dissertation are focused on identifying and solving specific problems in the country's healthcare sector, as well as on introducing innovative approaches and scientifically sound recommendations aimed at improving the existing healthcare system.

As part of the curriculum, the doctoral student is offered the study of key disciplines such as «Advanced Qualitative Methods in Nursing» and «Advanced Quantitative Research Methods in Nursing». These courses provide doctoral students with the tools to independently analyze and interpret the results of their research, contributing to the development of their research competencies. In addition, doctoral students receive training in the course «Service design and its application for nursing development», which provides valuable knowledge for optimizing professional activities in the field of practical healthcare. This course is aimed at developing service design skills, which allows you to effectively innovate and improve the quality of nursing care.

The proof that doctoral students master the methods of scientific research well is confirmed by publications in CQAFES journals, abstracts in international conferences, as well as the presence of prizes in the framework of presentations. These are the results of the doctoral student's presentation.

Learning outcomes and competencies are achieved using such types and methods of teaching and learning as: project-problem types of work, practical skills training, teaching critical analysis techniques, analytical selection of scientific literature, analysis and interpretation of the data obtained, writing and presentation of the main stages of the dissertation work.

Research work in the doctoral program in EP D10104 - «Nursing Science» is planned in accordance with the needs of the university in the implementation of scientific and technical programs

covering the most relevant and socially significant problems at the regional and national levels, as well as scientific grants planned by specialized departments.

The educational program of the doctoral program provides an opportunity to develop the competencies necessary to participate in scientific discussions, speeches to the academic community and professionals in the field of practical healthcare.

Evidence of these competencies is provided by data on a significant number of successful performances of doctoral students in the specialty «Nursing Science». In addition, the achievement of prizes at international conferences testifies to the high recognition of doctoral students as specialists with certain skills in both academic and practical health circles.

Doctoral student Isenova B., is an hourly employee of the Department of «Nursing», is a mentor in practice for undergraduate students of the specialty «Nursing». This decision, approved by the teaching staff of the department, is aimed at providing B. Isenova with the opportunity to develop and apply her knowledge both in the academic and professional fields. After completing her doctoral dissertation, the algorithms and scientifically based recommendations developed by Isenova will be implemented not only in the practice of palliative centers, but also some of them will be integrated into educational materials for undergraduate students. This will allow students to deepen their knowledge in the field of nursing care for patients in need of palliative care.

In the first year of doctoral studies in the educational program «Nursing Science», doctoral students take the discipline «Research in the field of management and leadership in nursing», for which 4 credits are allocated. This provides doctoral students with a unique opportunity to deepen their knowledge and understanding of leadership within a scientific context, contributing to the development and improvement of their leadership skills.

The results of doctoral students' training according to the EP in the specialty «Nursing Science» are aimed at a common understanding of the entire healthcare system in the context of their qualifications, which allows doctoral students to have common concepts not only in nursing, but also on the issues of a properly scientific approach to research in healthcare and medicine.

The analytical part

KazNMU provides doctoral students with the necessary knowledge and competencies based on the study of basic and specialized disciplines, the formation of skills and abilities during professional (pedagogical, research) practice and research.

Research work in the doctoral program in OP D10104 - «Nursing Science» is carried out in accordance with the needs of the university in the implementation of scientific and technical programs covering the most relevant and socially significant problems at the regional and national levels, as well as scientific grants planned by specialized departments. The topics of doctoral dissertations correspond to the reform of nursing, which has been carried out for several years, the relevance of the topics is beyond doubt. The topics are related to the development of palliative care in Kazakhstan, the introduction of standards of operational procedures for nursing specialists in polyclinics in Almaty, the conduct of independent admission by nursing specialists.

The educational program of the doctoral program provides an opportunity to develop the competencies necessary to participate in scientific discussions, speeches to the academic community and professionals in the field of practical healthcare.

The modernization of the material and technical base of the departments is carried out annually, the university provides great opportunities for its teachers and doctoral students to use information and communication technologies in the implementation of the educational program of the doctoral program «Nursing Science».

Since 2021, KazNMU has been a participant in the AccelEd project, which is being implemented within the framework of the European Union's Erasmus+ program. The aim of the project is to strengthen the capacity of Nursing through the development of research resources of teaching staff, graduate students, doctoral students, and nurses. Thus, within the framework of the project, a program for statistical processing of qualitative research methods was purchased. Access to databases on nursing is provided.

As part of the curriculum, the doctoral student is offered the study of key disciplines that allow him to deepen knowledge and competencies in qualitative and quantitative methods in nursing. These courses provide doctoral students with the tools to independently analyze and interpret the results of their research, contributing to the development of their research competencies.

However, some of the expected learning outcomes of the EP are not designed according to the requirements specified in the guidelines for the development of the EP of higher and postgraduate education. In particular, LO should be formulated and begin with an active verb according to Bloom's taxonomy. The recommended number of LO EP is from 11 to 15. When developing learning outcomes, attention should be paid to the expected learning outcomes related to global health.

In syllabuses of disciplines, there is no connection between the results of OP training and the results of discipline training. There is no data on the assessment of the achievability of missile defense, which is comparable to the planned RO and teaching and learning methods that guarantee achievement of LO of the EP.

When conducting interviews with focus groups, it was not possible to find out from stakeholders about the expected learning outcomes.

Strengths/best practices

According to this standard, no strengths have been identified.

EEC Recommendations

1. The management of the EP, in accordance with the guidelines for the development of the EP of higher and postgraduate education, should bring the results of the training of the EP into line. The deadline is until the beginning of the 2024-2025 academic year.

2. In the 2025-2026 academic year, the management of the educational institution will apply more widely the principles, methods and practices of assessment that are comparable with the planned learning outcomes and teaching and learning methods that guarantee the achievement of learning outcomes of the educational program.

The conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria: (strong / satisfactory/ suggest improvements/ unsatisfactory)

Strong- none

satisfactory - 3

suggest improvements - 2

unsatisfactory - none

Standard 3 «POLICY AND CRITERIA FOR THE SELECTION OF APPLICANTS»

The evidentiary part

At KazNMU, the admission of candidates for doctoral studies is established in accordance with regulatory documents. Persons with a master's degree and at least 1 year of work experience or who have completed residency training in medical specialties are accepted for doctoral studies. Admission to the doctoral program with an indication of the training program is announced through the media and on the University's website no later than fifteen calendar days before the start date of accepting documents.

Admission to the doctoral program is carried out in two stages: pre-selection, entrance exams.

The preliminary selection of applicants for doctoral studies is carried out before the start of the entrance exams from February 1 to May 31 of the calendar year. The results of the pre-selection for training in the educational programs of the doctoral program are admission to the entrance exams.

Applications for doctoral studies are accepted from July 3 to August 3 of the calendar year. Entrance exams for groups of educational programs for doctoral studies are held from August 4 to August 20 of the calendar year. Enrollment is until August 28 of the calendar year.

For applicants to doctoral studies, the admission committee provides: advising applicants on the issues of the selected group of educational programs of postgraduate education, familiarization with the entrance exam procedure; organization of admission and verification of documents for applicants; organization of the entrance exam for groups of educational programs.

Applicants for doctoral studies provide international certificates confirming their proficiency in a foreign language in accordance with the pan-European competencies (standards) of foreign language proficiency.

The authenticity and validity of the submitted certificates are checked by the admissions committees of Organizations of Higher and postgraduate education.

The previous level of education of persons wishing to master the educational programs of doctoral studies in the educational program «Nursing Science»: postgraduate education in the profile of preparation for the corresponding profile of doctoral studies or higher medical education.

The procedure for admission of citizens to doctoral studies is established by the Standard Rules for admission to educational organizations that implement professional training programs of postgraduate education.

At the «entrance», the doctoral student must have all the prerequisites necessary to master the appropriate professional doctoral curriculum. The list of necessary prerequisites is determined by the higher education institution independently. In the absence of the necessary prerequisites, the doctoral student is allowed to master them on a paid basis. In this case, doctoral studies begin after the doctoral student has fully mastered the prerequisites. Each discipline has one non-repeating name. It should be mastered in one academic period, at the end of which doctoral students take the final control in the form of an exam.

The following persons can enter the doctoral program under the educational program «Nursing Science»: masters in the specialty «7M110100 – Medicine», «7M110200 – Public Health», «7M110300 – Nursing», «7M110400 – Pharmacy», «7M110500 – Preventive medicine», «7M110600 – Health management». According to the Rules of admission to the doctoral program 2023-2024, an oral interview within the framework of a planned scientific research and a written exam in electronic format on the basis of KazNMU named after S.D.Asfendiyarov are established as an admission exam.

The interview is conducted by members of the examination commissions to assess the level of preparedness of the applicant for independent research work. The candidate for doctoral studies defends the abstract of the planned scientific research before the commission (the time limit of the speech is 5-7 minutes).

As part of an oral interview, the members of the examination committee assess the relevance, scientific novelty and realism of the future doctoral dissertation. The duration of doctoral studies in the educational program «Nursing Science» is 3 years.

The dissertation work of a doctoral student in the PhD program in the specialty 8D10104 «Nursing Science» should be based on the latest achievements of the scientific community and include both theoretical conclusions and practical recommendations arising from the independent solution of management tasks of an integrated and cross-functional nature. A doctoral student's dissertation should demonstrate the independence of research, scientific novelty, reliability and practical significance of the results, and respect for academic integrity. Independence means that the dissertation is the result of the author's individual scientific work, reflecting his personal contribution to the development of the scientific field of nursing. The principle of internal unity ensures logical consistency and coherence of all parts of the work, ensuring that the conclusions, results and recommendations correspond to the goals and objectives of the study.

The plan of the doctoral dissertation with an indication of the deadlines for completing the work on the dissertation, the plan of scientific publications, internships are reflected in the individual work plan of the doctoral student.

At KazNMU named after S.D. Asfendiyarov, each doctoral student, after his enrollment, is engaged in the selection of a scientific consultant for 2 months. The candidacy of a scientific consultant is discussed at a meeting of the profile department and recommended for consideration by the Scientific Committee, then recommended for consideration by the Scientific Council and submitted for approval by the Academic Council, approval of scientific consultants is carried out in accordance with the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan №4 dated January 05, 2024 «On approval of qualification requirements for educational activities of organizations providing higher and (or) postgraduate education, and a list of documents confirming compliance with them.»

Scientific guidance is provided by scientific consultants who have an academic degree (DMS, CMS, PhD), conduct scientific research and have scientific and educational publications on the subject of the doctoral program

Scientific guidance implies the provision of scientific and methodological assistance in choosing a doctoral student's topic, guidance, control over the implementation of planned activities according to the educational program and the individual plan of the doctoral student. Scientific consultants ensure the completion of the doctoral dissertation and compliance with the principles of academic integrity, and timely submission of the dissertation work for defense.

Scientific consultants of the doctoral student, according to the academic calendar, at least once a year evaluate the academic preparation of the doctoral student, if necessary, make adjustments to his individual work plan and bring relevant information to the attention of departments, the department of master's and doctoral studies.

The analytical part

At the university, the requirements of the standard are met in sufficient volume. The self-report describes in detail the procedure for selection and admission to doctoral studies. Admission to the doctoral program is carried out in accordance with the established regulatory documents of the University and the orders of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The University conducts career guidance work in order to attract doctoral students to the OP.

Information about admission conditions is publicly available and applicants are provided with equal, open and accessible conditions for admission. The most worthy applicants are selected for admission, determined by the sum of the entrance exam scores and individual achievements.

The previous level of education of persons wishing to master the educational programs of doctoral studies in the EP «Nursing Science»: postgraduate education in the profile of preparation for the corresponding profile of doctoral studies or higher medical education.

The procedure for admission of citizens to doctoral studies is established by the Standard Rules for admission to educational organizations that implement professional training programs of postgraduate education.

Admission to the doctoral program is carried out in two stages: pre-selection, entrance exams. According to the Rules of admission to doctoral studies, an oral interview within the framework of a planned scientific research and a written exam in electronic format are established as an admission exam.

The interview is conducted by members of the examination commissions to assess the level of preparedness of the applicant for independent research work. The candidate for doctoral studies defends the abstract of the planned scientific research in front of the commission (the time limit of the speech is 5-7 minutes).

As part of an oral interview, the members of the examination committee assess the relevance, scientific novelty and realism of the future doctoral dissertation

Strengths/best practices

According to this standard, no strengths have been identified.

EEC Recommendations

There are no recommendations for this standard.

The conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria: (strong / satisfactory/ suggest improvements/ unsatisfactory)

Strong- none

satisfactory - 8

suggest improvements - none

unsatisfactory - none

Standard 4 «TRAINING PROGRAM»

The evidentiary part

The educational program of the doctoral program in the specialty 8D10104 Nursing Science is designed to train qualified nursing specialists.

The purpose of the PhD program in nursing is to train nursing scientists who will be able to conduct in-depth research in the field of nursing, as well as be experts in the field of nursing pedagogy.

In accordance with the mission of the School of Public Health of the NPJSC «KazNMU named after S.D.Asfendiyarov» to train nursing staff as leaders in improving health outcomes through interprofessional practice and research, the mission of the PhD in Nursing program is to train nurses as researchers, to develop new interdisciplinary knowledge that will positive impact on the health of various population groups, support and develop higher education programs in the field of nursing, meeting the needs of healthcare in general and nursing in the Republic of Kazakhstan and in the world.

The purpose and objectives of the training are focused on the final result, which allows you to evaluate the progress of doctoral students, the development of their competencies. The objectives of the training and the final results of the educational program are known to all doctoral students, scientific supervisors, and the teaching staff of the University.

The educational program pays sufficient attention to the development and improvement of third-level descriptors for doctoral students.

In accordance with the requirements approved by the educational program (hereinafter -EP) of the doctoral program in the specialty 8D10104-»Nursing Science» (order of the Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs №366 dated 08/24/2020, Appendix 1) - Persons who have received a PhD degree in nursing science to deepen scientific knowledge, solve scientific and applied problems on a specialized topic performs a postdoctoral program or conduct scientific research under the guidance of a leading scientist selected by the university:

1. Cycle of basic disciplines (BD) - 17 credits
2. Pedagogical practice- 3 credits
3. Major disciplines - 20 credits
4. University component – 20 credits
5. Optional component – 10 credits
6. Doctoral student's research work, including internship and doctoral dissertation - 10 credits

Persons who have successfully passed the final certification for mastering the professional curriculum of higher education are awarded the academic degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) in the specialty 8D10104 «Nursing Science».

One of the components of the doctoral program is practical training, which includes a scientific internship. As part of the doctoral student's research work, the individual work plan of the doctoral student provides for the mandatory passage of a foreign scientific internship.

Within the framework of RWDS (ERWD), the individual work plan of a doctoral student for familiarization with innovative technologies and new types of production provides for mandatory internships in scientific organizations and (or) organizations of relevant industries or fields of activity, including abroad. The place of internship corresponds to the scientific direction of the educational program, the subject of the doctoral dissertation and the place of work of the foreign consultant.

Internships are carried out in leading foreign scientific organizations and higher education institutions occupying the first 1000 positions in international rankings or the first 200 positions in the relevant area (by Subject).

The university independently determines the timing of a doctoral student's foreign internship, and the duration of the internship is at least 30 calendar days.

KazNMU, together with the organization on the basis of which the internship takes place, approves the internship program and weekly plan. The internship program includes educational and scientific components.

The educational program ensures that all parts of the educational program include relevant disciplines, as well as approaches for integrating program components. KazNMU has established a system of planning, support, implementation and monitoring of all rotations included in the training program. Each doctoral student has an individual curriculum and an individual work plan, in accordance with which the educational program is implemented.

The analytical part

During the visit, experts carried out a detailed analysis of the EP for compliance with the requirements of the modern education market, principles and methods of organizing educational, research processes, focused on satisfying the interests of doctoral students and all participants in the educational process. It should be noted that the EP of doctoral studies is designed in such a way that it provides a holistic, systemic understanding of the processes of research and teaching activities, which provides for the formation of research, analytical and critical thinking, allowing for the training of personnel for the university. EP disciplines cover all areas of doctoral studies. When conducting interviews with students, doctoral students noted that upon completion of their doctoral studies they plan to stay at the university, engage in research, scientific and teaching activities.

The content and form of the EP, decisions made by the management of the EP are consistent with the strategic documents of the university and regulatory documents. According to materials received at the request of an EEC expert, the developed competencies of doctoral students coincide with the ongoing reforms. Modernization of educational programs involves high-quality training of competitive specialists, through the integration of the best global practices in education, science and practice. All standard procedures and assessment processes are prescribed and followed.

A survey of students and employers is being conducted in traditional formats, which was confirmed by focus group participants. The results, containing the evaluation of educational programs, are heard at meetings.

In general, the University monitors educational and other processes, for which appropriate procedures and regulations have been developed.

The University's policy on assessing the educational achievements of students, including the timing of assessment, methods and forms of implementation, is reflected in the syllabuses. Students' educational achievements (knowledge, abilities, skills) are assessed on a scale.

However, according to materials received at the request of EEC experts, the EP and syllabuses do not present a range of methods for assessing the learning outcomes of EP and disciplines, including the impact on the effectiveness of assessment methods and format. Traditional forms of assessment are presented.

In the syllabuses of disciplines, there is no connection and comparability of the EP learning outcomes with the discipline learning outcomes. Data are not provided on assessing the achievability of learning outcomes that are comparable to the planned learning outcomes and teaching and learning methods that guarantee the achievement of the EP learning outcomes. When conducting focus group interviews, it was not possible to find out from stakeholders about the expected learning outcomes.

Strengths/best practices

The doctoral program provides a holistic, systemic understanding of the processes of research and teaching activities, which provides for the formation of research, analytical and critical thinking, allowing for the training of personnel for the university.

EEC Recommendations

1. The management of the EP in the 2024-2025 academic year should use a wide range of methods for assessing the learning outcomes of EP and disciplines, including the impact on the effectiveness of assessment methods and format.

2. The management of the EP should reflect in the syllabuses the comparability of the learning outcomes of the EP with the learning outcomes of the disciplines. Deadline until the start of the 2024-2025 academic year.

The conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria: (strong / satisfactory/ suggest improvements/ unsatisfactory)

Strong- 1

satisfactory - 10

suggest improvements - 2

unsatisfactory - none

Standard 5 «SCIENTIFIC GUIDANCE»***The evidentiary part***

At KazNMU named after S.D. Asfendiyarov, each doctoral student, after his enrollment, spends 2 months selecting a scientific consultant. The candidacy of a scientific consultant is discussed at a meeting of the relevant department and recommended for consideration by the Scientific Committee, then recommended for consideration by the Scientific Council and submitted for approval by the Scientific Council, approval of scientific consultants is carried out in accordance with the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan №391 dated June 17, 2015.

Scientific supervision is carried out by scientific consultants who have an academic degree (MD, PhD, PhD), conduct scientific research and have scientific and educational publications on the subject of the doctoral program.

Scientific supervision implies the provision of scientific and methodological assistance in choosing a topic for a doctoral student, guidance, and control over the implementation of planned activities in accordance with the educational program and the doctoral student's individual plan. Scientific advisors ensure the completion of the doctoral dissertation and adherence to the principles of academic integrity, and the timely submission of the dissertation work for defense.

The doctoral student's scientific advisors, according to the academic calendar, at least once a year assess the doctoral student's academic preparation, if necessary, make adjustments to his individual work plan and bring the relevant information to the attention of departments, master's and doctoral studies departments.

Candidates for a scientific supervisor/consultant for a doctoral student in the educational program «Nursing Science» are considered at a meeting of the relevant department. The next stage is consideration at a meeting of the Scientific Committee, then the candidacy of a scientific consultant is considered at a meeting of the Scientific Council and subsequently the candidacy is considered at the Academic Council of KazNMU. S.D. Asfendiyarov, the candidacy is approved by order signed by the first head of the university.

The domestic scientific consultant performs the functions of a scientific consultant on the terms of the concluded contract. Scientific consultants are responsible for the observance of academic discipline by doctoral students, the implementation of an individual work plan and the timely submission of a dissertation work.

Scientific consultants consult on the dissertation work and monitor the degree of its completion with their doctoral students several times a month. During the consultations, the degree

and quality of the scientific research performed are evaluated, their compliance with the individual plan of the doctoral student, recommendations are given on theoretical and other issues of research.

Thus, the scientific consultant creates conditions for the successful implementation of the tasks set, conducts systematic monitoring at the stages of research, discusses the results, makes adjustments in the course of work and provides assistance at individual stages of the dissertation. This allows the supervisor to activate the process of mastering theoretical knowledge by doctoral students with their implementation in the performance of scientific work through a personality-oriented approach and to be applied.

According to the plan, lectures, seminars, trainings are held annually at the university with the invitation of foreign specialists under the Visiting Professor program, where issues of international standards of evidence-based scientific research, modern aspects of public health and healthcare are considered.

Among the professional competencies of scientific supervisors, special attention is paid to the abilities to: create conditions for the formation and development of research competence of doctoral students; develop and implement innovative projects; ensure expansion of the scope of application of advanced approaches in the development of regulations for key processes in professional activities; interact with various professional teams and communities, manage project and research activities; use innovative technologies in practical activities; take initiative and make adequate and responsible decisions in problematic situations; build your activities in accordance with moral, ethical and legal standards.

At the University, a 3-party agreement is concluded between the university, the scientific consultant and the doctoral student, which clearly states the rights and responsibilities of doctoral students' scientific supervisors

Scientific advisors conduct regular consultations with their doctoral students, the frequency of which depends on the needs of each individual doctoral student. In addition, doctoral students are constantly in online communication with their consultants and can communicate remotely on all issues that arise, including career development and professional growth. Scientific advisors support doctoral students in developing their careers.

The policy of KazNMU is to maximize the use of the scientific potential of doctoral students and employ them at the university for the further growth of doctoral students, both in terms of career and personally.

Scientific advisers to doctoral students of the University act as co-supervisors of doctoral students from other universities, ass. The professor is a scientific consultant for doctoral students in the specialty «Public Health» of the West Kazakhstan Medical University named after. M. Ospanova is also the scientific secretary of the Dissertation Council of the Kazakh Medical University «GSPH».

The analytical part

The scientific supervision of doctoral students is carried out by scientific consultants who meet the requirements for scientific consultants.

Scientific guidance by consultants implies the provision of scientific and methodological assistance in choosing a topic for a doctoral student, guidance, and control over the implementation of planned activities in accordance with the educational program and the doctoral student's individual plan. Scientific advisors ensure the completion of the doctoral dissertation and adherence to the principles of academic integrity, and the timely submission of the dissertation work for defense.

The doctoral student's scientific advisors, according to the academic calendar, at least once a year assess the doctoral student's academic preparation, if necessary, make adjustments to his individual work plan and bring the relevant information to the attention of departments, master's and doctoral studies departments.

The duties and rights of the scientific supervisor are defined. Doctoral students are provided with assistance in determining the topic and plan of their dissertation research. Together with the doctoral student, an Individual Work Plan for the doctoral student (IWP) is developed, consultations on research work are systematically carried out, and evaluation of the implementation of research

work is systematically carried out. The doctoral student's timely and high-quality completion of research work and submission of research reports is ensured. Assistance is provided in the preparation and publication of research results in scientific journals.

Neither in the self-report, nor in interviews with focus groups, nor in the analysis of the provided documents, it was possible to find out whether training in effective teaching and assessment methods, methods of conducting scientific research is provided to doctoral students' scientific advisers, including foreign ones.

Strengths/best practices

According to this standard, no strengths have been identified.

EEC Recommendations

1. The management of the university should develop a plan of courses, seminars to train scientific advisers and potential supervisors in effective, innovative teaching methods, methods of conducting scientific research for doctoral students' scientific advisers, including foreign ones. Duration: during the 2024-2025 academic year.

The conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria: (strong / satisfactory/ suggest improvements/ unsatisfactory)

Strong- none

satisfactory - 11

suggest improvements - 1

unsatisfactory - none

Standard 6 «DISSERTATION»

The evidentiary part

Contents of doctoral dissertations completed at the NAO KazNMU named after. S.D. Asfendiyarov meets the requirements of the work instructions.

The doctoral student who submitted his doctoral dissertation for defense is the author and bears full responsibility for its content. The volume of a doctoral dissertation is, as a rule, at least 150 pages. The dissertation can be completed in the state language or in Russian or English in accordance with the Academic Policy of the University.

The literature review on the research topic, according to the instructions, refers to the main part of the dissertation work and is designated as the first chapter. The purpose of a literature review is to demonstrate familiarity with what is already known about the relevant topic. In the review, the doctoral student covers the subject areas of the main prevailing theory, as well as other theories that have been developed and their criticisms. The doctoral student is recommended to refer to the most recent, relevant literature on the chosen topic. The share of citations to international literature published in international peer-reviewed journals is also assessed.

The goals and objectives of the study must correspond to the topic of the study and contribute to the achievement of the final result. The introduction should contain an assessment of the current state of the scientific or practical problem (task) being solved, of a scientific and/or innovative nature, the basis and initial data for developing the topic, justification for the need to carry out this research (experimental research) work, information about the planned scientific -technical level of development, patent research and conclusions from them. The introduction should show: relevance; purpose of the study; object and subject; research objectives; research methods; scientific novelty; practical significance; main provisions – submitted for defense; volume and structure of the dissertation; approbation of the dissertation.

The main part of the dissertation provides data reflecting the essence, methodology and main results of the work performed.

The results, discussion, conclusion, implications and future prospects of the study are summarized in the conclusion section. The conclusion should contain conclusions based on the results of the dissertation research, an assessment of the completeness of solutions to the assigned problems, the development of recommendations and initial data on the specific use of the results, an assessment of the scientific level of the work performed in comparison with the best achievements in this field. In conclusion, it is also recommended to reveal the strengths and weaknesses of the dissertation work.

A doctoral dissertation is a qualifying scientific work of a doctoral student in a specific specialty of a professional educational doctoral program and the basis for the award by the Committee for Control in the Field of Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan to a graduate with the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD), doctor in the field.

The defense of a doctoral dissertation represents the culminating stage in a doctoral student's training. This process is intended to demonstrate the graduate's maturity as a scientist who is capable of creativity in formulating and solving scientific problems. The graduate must demonstrate his ability to make a meaningful contribution to the development of his chosen scientific field through original research, as well as contribute to the development of a knowledge-based society.

The analytical part

All standard procedures, processes for preparing a dissertation and its defense are prescribed and followed.

Experts note that the University creates all the conditions for choosing a dissertation topic in accordance with the ongoing reform and priority areas in nursing. The choice of topic is made by doctoral students together with scientific consultants. Research is conducted to study nursing issues and improve doctoral education.

The main results of the dissertation work are published in scientific, scientific-analytical and scientific-practical publications in accordance with the Rules for the award of academic degrees and academic titles.

Strengths/Best Practices

No strengths have been identified for this standard.

EEC recommendations

No recommendations.

The conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria: (strong / satisfactory/ suggest improvements/ unsatisfactory)

strong - none

satisfactory - 8

suggest improvements - none

unsatisfactory - none

Standard 7 «THE DISSERTATION EVALUATION»

The evidentiary part

Evaluation of PhD dissertations is a major component of the assessment of learning effectiveness, which demonstrates the university's environment for learning and achieving the university's mission and vision within the framework of the «Program».

The criteria for assessing the scientific work of a doctoral student are determined on the basis of the Rules for the Award of Degrees.

The conclusion on the dissertation on the recommendation for defense is drawn up in the form of an extract from the minutes of the meeting of the Scientific Committee, signed by the chairman and secretary of the meeting, and certified by the seal of the office.

The main regulatory document establishing the goals, objectives, functions, rights and responsibilities of the dissertation council (hereinafter referred to as the Council) at KazNMU is the «Regulations on the Dissertation Council» (Board decision dated 04.04.2023, protocol №6), developed on the basis of the Model Regulations on the Dissertation Council (Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated March 31, 2011 №126).

After receiving a positive conclusion from the meeting of the Scientific Committee, the doctoral student submits an application to the Rector of the University to select a dissertation council in which he will defend himself. If the doctoral student indicates the dissertation council of another university, then within 10 (ten) working days the university where the doctoral student studied sends his documents to the Dissertation Council. The rector of the university, based on the doctoral student's application, sends the dissertation work to the dissertation council for consideration.

The assessment of a doctoral dissertation in the educational program «Nursing Science» is carried out in accordance with the order «On approval of state compulsory standards of higher and postgraduate education.»

No later than 10 (ten) working days from the date of receipt of documents, the dissertation council determines the date of defense of the dissertation and appoints two official reviewers with an academic degree (Doctor of Science, Candidate of Science, Doctor of Philosophy (PhD), Doctor of Philosophy) or the academic degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD), a doctor in the field of study or a Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) degree, a doctor in the field of study, at least 5 (five) scientific articles in the field of doctoral research, of which 1 (one) article in the field of research in the international citation systems Web of Science or Scopus.

Official reviewers, one of whom must not be affiliated with the University, are approved by order of the rector based on the proposal of the chairman of the Dissertation Council in agreement with the vice-rector for research at least two months before the date of defense of the dissertation. When appointing official reviewers, the principle of independence of reviewers and scientific consultants from each other is observed.

The dissertation council is created for a period of 3 (three) calendar years in accordance with the list of PhD specialties, reports to the rector, and uses the seals and forms of the university. The dissertation council is responsible for the quality, objectivity and validity of decisions made on the defense of dissertations.

The dissertation council consists of a chairman, deputy chairman, scientific secretary and members of the Council.

In accordance with the mission of the School of Public Health of NJSC «Kazakh National Medical University named after S.D. Asfendiyarov» to prepare nurses as leaders in improving health outcomes through interprofessional practice and research, the mission of the PhD in Nursing program is to educate nurses as researchers, to develop new interdisciplinary knowledge that will have a positive impact on the health of various population groups, to support and develop higher education programs in the field of nursing that meet the needs of health care in general and nursing in the Republic of Kazakhstan and in the world.

The analytical part

At the university, the requirements for the standard are met to a sufficient extent. The self-report describes in detail all procedures according to the standard, assessment processes and the algorithm for defending the dissertation. Evaluation of PhD dissertations is a major component of the assessment of learning effectiveness, which demonstrates the university's environment for learning and achieving the university's mission and vision within the framework of the «Program».

The criteria for assessing the scientific work of a doctoral student are determined on the basis of the Rules for the Award of Degrees. The evaluation of a doctoral dissertation involves several stages. A preliminary examination of the dissertation is carried out at the department where the dissertation was carried out, then at a meeting of the Scientific Committee - a preliminary discussion of the dissertation work with the involvement of all interested specialists in accordance with the topic of the dissertation. After receiving a positive conclusion from the meeting of the Scientific Committee, the doctoral student submits an application to the Rector of the University to select a dissertation council in which he will defend himself. The rector of the university sends the dissertation work to the dissertation council for consideration. The dissertation committee determines the date of the dissertation defense and appoints two official reviewers. Upon admission to defense, the doctoral student prepares a presentation for public defense presenting the main results of the dissertation research.

Doctoral students in the educational program «Nursing Science» will defend dissertations for the award of the degree of Doctor of Philosophy PhD in the specialty «Nursing Science» in the dissertation council «Nursing Science». Based on the results of the dissertation defense, a grade is assigned according to a point-rating letter system.

Since 2019, KazNMU has been a university with a special status and independently creates dissertation councils (Evaluation Committee) for educational programs.

The university is guided by the principles of integration of research activities, clinical practice and the educational process, which corresponds to the principle of a unified academic healthcare environment and is at the present stage the main way to graduate specialists with a high level of training and provide technologically modern medical care.

Evaluation of PhD dissertations is a major component of the assessment of learning effectiveness, which demonstrates the university's environment for learning and achieving the university's mission and vision within the framework of the «Program». The criteria for assessing the scientific work of a doctoral student are determined on the basis of the Rules for the Award of Degrees. The evaluation of a doctoral dissertation involves several stages.

Strengths/Best Practices

No strengths have been identified for this standard.

EEC recommendations

No recommendations.

The conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria: (strong / satisfactory/ suggest improvements/ unsatisfactory)

strong - none

satisfactory - 8

suggest improvements - none

unsatisfactory - none

Standard 8 «SCHOOL STRUCTURE AND MANAGEMENT»

The evidentiary part

The Department of Master's and Doctoral Studies of NJSC «KazNMU» in its activities on training PhDs or doctors in the field is guided by clear goals, principles and policies in the field of ensuring the quality of the doctoral educational program, regulated in the internal documents of the university.

To ensure a common vision of culture and quality issues, commitment to common values of priority of quality and sharing of the common responsibility of management and all employees for compliance with the principles of quality, a quality policy is developed with the participation of all

stakeholders, both external and internal. At the same time, the quality assurance system for doctoral educational programs covers all aspects of educational activities, all stages of the implementation of doctoral programs and all stages of the doctoral student training cycle.

The policy in the field of quality of doctoral education programs is based on the quality culture of KazNMU and ensures compliance with the priority and cultivation of the principles of quality, academic integrity and academic freedom in the strategy, vision and values of the top management and staff of the university through oral and written declaration and communication of principles, activities and achievements in quality issues through formal and informal sources (social media, informal meetings); verbal and written reprimand of cases of violation of principles, rules and requirements for compliance with a quality culture and demonstrating intolerance for such violations.

Doctoral students, teaching staff and staff of KazNMU clinics are familiar with and comply with the «Code of Academic Honesty of Students», «Code of Honor for the Faculty of KazNMU and Employees of NJSC «KazNMU named after. S.D. Asfendiyarov», which are the norms of corporate ethics and are included in the brochure «Traditions and Values of the University», transmitted annually and available in all departments and divisions of the university. The Code of Honor is signed annually at the beginning of the year by each student upon enrollment and by each newly hired teacher and employee. All provisions of the Code must be strictly followed. The functioning Ethics Council and Disciplinary Commission are involved in the analysis of existing problems and the prevention of violations among students and teachers.

KazNMU has a monitoring program for educational activities, processes and learning outcomes, including routine collection of data on key aspects of the educational program. The purpose of monitoring is to ensure the quality of the educational process and identify areas requiring intervention. Mechanisms for assessing the quality of educational activities and training of students in the doctoral educational program are determined within the framework of internal assessment systems and external assessment systems.

KazNMU guarantees the quality of training of students during the implementation of the doctoral program based on the standard, including through: monitoring, periodic review of educational programs; development of objective procedures for assessing the level of knowledge and skills of students, competencies of graduates; objectivity can be ensured through the implementation of mechanisms for multilateral assessment of the quality of training on the part of the university and employers; ensuring the competence of teaching staff through integration with scientific institutes, high-tech companies and employers.

Schools/faculties of KazNMU are responsible for the development and conditions for the implementation of EP; for this purpose, collegial bodies (Educational Program Committees, Quality Assurance Commissions) are formed at schools, which function in accordance with the approved Regulations.

Assessment of students and achievement of final learning outcomes for all programs is carried out on the basis of a final certification. Every year, the rector's order is issued on the conduct of the IA and the composition of the certification commission (Order No. 10 of 01/08/2024 «On approval of the composition of the State Examination, Final Certification and Appeal Commissions for the 2023-2024 academic year»).

KazNMU operates on the basis of the principle of transparency of the management system and decisions made. This is ensured through the participation of the university faculty, employees of structural divisions of the academic block, students, representatives of employers, and other interested parties in discussing and making decisions regarding the content of the EP, the organization of the educational process and its evaluation. The results of the discussion of these issues are documented by the minutes of meetings of the advisory bodies with their subsequent bringing to the attention of all university employees by posting on the KazNMU website, familiarization through orders/instructions on the approval of internal regulatory documents, with filling out the familiarization sheet and subsequent monitoring of execution by the head of the structural unit .

The analytical part

Management of activities and interaction of structural and collegial divisions is carried out in accordance with the regulatory documents of the University and the organizational structure.

The requirements for the quality policy regulating the activities of doctoral studies are reflected in internal regulatory documents. The policy in the field of ensuring the quality of the doctoral educational program ensures the fulfillment of the mission and strategic goals of the university, corresponds to the priorities of postgraduate education at the national level and modern trends in the development of third cycle programs at the international level. The doctoral educational program determines the place and role of doctoral programs in the academic and research strategy of NJSC KazNMU.

The implementation of the educational program takes place at the departments that directly implement the cycle of basic and specialized disciplines - Nursing, Public Health and Healthcare. For improving the quality of the doctoral educational program, along with the department of postgraduate education, AK SD, UD SD, NPKK (NK), and the Scientific Council are responsible.

The results of academic activities, the effectiveness of modern forms of management of the educational process, prospects for further improving management and improving the quality of education are reviewed and discussed at meetings and conferences.

Strengths/Best Practices

No strengths have been identified for this standard.

EEC recommendations

No recommendations.

The conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria: (strong / satisfactory/ suggest improvements/ unsatisfactory)

strong - none

satisfactory - 5

suggest improvements - none

unsatisfactory - none

(VII) OVERVIEW OF STRENGTHS/BEST PRACTICES FOR EACH STANDARD

Standard 1 «RESEARCH ENVIRONMENT»

The presence of an Endowment Fund created at KazNMU, which allows to improve the material and technical base, which helps improve the quality of education and conduct research activities.

Standard 4 TRAINING PROGRAM

The doctoral program provides a holistic, systemic understanding of the processes of research and teaching activities, which provides for the formation of research, analytical and critical thinking, allowing for the training of personnel for the university.

(VIII) OVERVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS FOR IMPROVING QUALITY FOR EACH STANDARD

Standard 1 «RESEARCH ENVIRONMENT»

The university management should assist the heads of educational programs in the development of joint (double) educational programs, providing for the possibility of obtaining joint scientific degrees. Duration: during the 2024-2025 academic year.

Standard 2 «PREPARATION RESULTS»

1. The management of the EP, in accordance with the guidelines for the development of EP of higher and postgraduate education, must align the learning outcomes of the EP. Deadline before the start of the 2024-2025 academic year.

2. In the 2025-2026 academic year, the leadership of the EP should more widely apply the principles, methods and practices of assessment that are comparable to the planned learning outcomes and teaching and learning methods that guarantee the achievement of the learning outcomes of the EP.

Standard 3 «POLICY AND CRITERIA FOR SELECTION OF APPLICANTS»

There are no recommendations for this standard.

Standard 4 «TRAINING PROGRAM»

1. The management of the EP in the 2024-2025 academic year should use a wide range of methods for assessing the learning outcomes of EP and disciplines, including the impact on the effectiveness of assessment methods and format.

2. The management of the EP should reflect in the syllabuses the comparability of the learning outcomes of the EP with the learning outcomes of the disciplines. Deadline until the start of the 2024-2025 academic year.

Standard 5 «SCIENTIFIC MANAGEMENT»

1. The management of the university should develop a plan of courses, seminars to train scientific advisers and potential supervisors in effective, innovative teaching methods, methods of conducting scientific research for doctoral students' scientific advisers, including foreign ones. Duration: during the 2024-2025 academic year.

Standard 6 «DISSERTATION»

No recommendations.

Standard 7 «THE DISSERTATION EVALUATION»

No recommendations.

Standard 8 «SCHOOL STRUCTURE AND MANAGEMENT»

No recommendations.

(IX) REVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE DEVELOPMENT OF EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION

No recommendations available.

(X) RECOMMENDATION TO THE ACCREDITATION BOARD

Members of the EEC came to a unanimous opinion that OP 8D10104 «Nursing Science» (initial accreditation) is recommended for accreditation for a period of 5 years».

Appendix 1. Evaluation table «SPECIALIZED PROFILE PARAMETERS»

№ I\II	№	CRITERIA FOR EVALUATION	Position of the educational organization			
			Strong	Satisfactory	Suggests improvement	Unsatisfactory
Standard 1 «RESEARCH ENVIRONMENT»						
The educational organization must:						
1	1.1.	guarantee the availability of sufficient, accessible and appropriate resources for conducting scientific research, including for carrying out independent educational and research work, carrying out scientific projects, which must be relevant and adequate to the goals and objectives of the doctoral/postgraduate program	+			
2	1.2.	ensure that scientific research is carried out in accordance with international ethical standards and is approved by the appropriate competent ethical committee		+		
3	1.3.	demonstrate evidence of readiness to provide students with the opportunity to complete a fragment of the program in another institution, including abroad		+		
4	1.4.	demonstrate evidence of willingness to collaborate with other NGOs, laboratories, research centers and/or institutes to ensure high quality doctoral/postgraduate programs		+		
5	1.5.	demonstrate evidence of readiness to develop joint (double) educational programs that provide the possibility of obtaining joint scientific degrees			+	
6	1.6.	ensure that the mission includes advances in medical research in the biomedical, clinical, behavioral and social sciences		+		
Total			1	4	1	
STANDARD 2 «PREPARATION RESULTS»						
The educational organization must ensure that:						
8	2.1.	The doctoral/postgraduate educational program will provide applicants with the knowledge and skills to become competent researchers capable of conducting responsible, independent and original scientific research in accordance with the principles of best practice in research practice			+	
9	2.2.	the content and results of the educational program take into account the interests and preferences of doctoral students/postgraduate students regarding further career		+		

		growth, including outside the academic or clinical institution				
10	2.3.	- The content and results of the educational program are aimed at acquiring competencies such as:		+		
11	2.4.	<input type="checkbox"/> critical analysis and ability to solve problems, transfer of new technologies to practice and industry, synthesis of new ideas;		+		
12	2.5.	<input type="checkbox"/> systematic understanding of the subject area on the research topic and mastery of scientific research methods in their professional field;			+	
Total			0	3	2	
STANDARD 3 «POLICY AND CRITERIA FOR SELECTION OF APPLICANTS»						
The educational organization must:						
13	3.1.	have a policy and implement procedures for selecting candidates for a doctoral/postgraduate program based on the principle of transparent (open) competition		+		
14	3.2.	demonstrate evidence of willingness to accept applicants based on their previous level of education that meets legal requirements		+		
15	3.3.	- have pre-defined, published and consistently applied rules governing all periods of the program's «life cycle», including allowing for the assessment of:		+		
	3.4.	<input type="checkbox"/> quality and realism of the scientific project that the applicant plans to carry out;		+		
16	3.5.	<input type="checkbox"/> the opportunity to obtain new scientific results that will be sufficient to write a dissertation of established quality during the period provided for by the program		+		
17	3.6.	<input type="checkbox"/> degree of novelty and creativity of the scientific project		+		
18	3.7.	<input type="checkbox"/> qualifications of scientific consultants/supervisors		+		
19	3.8.	ensure the availability of sufficient, accessible and appropriate support services for doctoral/postgraduate students		+		
Total			0	8	0	
STANDARD 4 «TRAINING PROGRAM»						
The educational organization must:						
20	4.1.	demonstrate evidence of readiness to define procedures for the development, approval and revision of the OP in accordance with legal requirements			+	
21	4.2.	demonstrate evidence of readiness to implement training programs based on original research, courses and other activities that involve the development of analytical and critical thinking	+			
22	4.3.	ensure that educational programs are carried out in accordance with the standards and requirements for quality control of education, and research is carried out under the guidance of supervisors/supervisors			+	
23	4.4.	ensure that educational programs develop students' knowledge and skills in the field of research ethics and proper conduct in scientific research		+		

24	4.5.	provide opportunities for students to complete part of their research/program at another institution, including in other countries		+		
25	4.6.	ensure that doctoral/postgraduate educational programs carried out in parallel with clinical or other professional training have the same/equal time for research and training as provided for standard/other doctoral/postgraduate programs		+		
26	4.7.	demonstrate evidence of readiness to ensure openness of the assessment procedure and its results, inform students about the criteria and assessment procedures used		+		
27	4.8.	provide for the possibility of doctoral students/postgraduate students taking relevant educational courses in another organization or acquiring other experience		+		
28	4.9.	provide for leave at the place of work from clinical duties to take training courses for doctoral students/graduate students working as clinicians when different types of activities coincide		+		
29	4.10.	demonstrate evidence of readiness to provide confidential consultation to students regarding the educational program, scientific advising, as well as personal issues		+		
30	4.11.	demonstrate evidence of willingness to form a committee/board to review dissertation work and research findings to evaluate the student's progress and achievements		+		
31	4.12.	ensure that student representatives interact with school/faculty/university management regarding the management and evaluation of doctoral programs (postgraduate programs); Encourage participation of trainees and their organizations to strengthen the program		+		
32	4.13.	demonstrate evidence of a willingness to provide an appeal mechanism allowing students to challenge decisions regarding the educational program and thesis defense		+		
Total			1	10	2	

STANDARD 5 «SCIENTIFIC GUIDELINES»

The educational organization must:

33	5.1.	ensure that each doctoral student has a supervisor/consultant and, if necessary, a co-supervisor to cover all aspects of the program		+		
34	5.2.	ensure that the number of doctoral/postgraduate students per supervisor is compatible with the workload of the supervisor		+		
35	5.3.	have policies and implement objective and transparent recruitment processes that ensure that supervisors are		+		

		competent and qualified and are active scientists in the relevant field				
36	5.4.	demonstrate evidence of readiness that supervisors regularly advise their doctoral/postgraduate students.		+		
37	5.5.	have mechanisms (courses, seminars) aimed at training supervisors and potential supervisors			+	
38	5.6.	have a policy regulating the relationship between the supervisor (consultant) and the doctoral student/postgraduate student, built on the principles of mutual respect, planned and agreed upon shared responsibility, and the contribution of both to the implementation of scientific research		+		
39	5.7.	demonstrate evidence of a willingness to define the responsibilities of each supervisor and have a documented policy for defining the rights and responsibilities of all supervisors		+		
40	5.8.	ensure that supervisors have ample opportunities to introduce doctoral/postgraduate students into the scientific community.		+		
41	5.9.	ensure that supervisors have the opportunity to assist and assist in the career development of doctoral students/postgraduate students		+		
42	5.10.	demonstrate evidence of readiness to ensure the conclusion of contracts describing the management process, responsibility, which is signed by the supervisor, doctoral student/graduate student and the administration of the public organization or faculty/school		+		
43	5.11.	ensure, when approving supervisors, that the principal supervisor, at a minimum, has experience advising doctoral students and/or formal training as a supervisor		+		
44	5.12.	provide that supervisors can act as co-supervisors of doctoral students from other organizations both domestically and internationally		+		
Total			0	11	1	
STANDARD 6 «DISSERTATION»						
The educational organization must:						
45	6.1.	ensure that the doctoral dissertation is the basis for assessing the doctoral student's acquisition of skills in conducting independent, original and evidence-based research and critically evaluating the results of scientific research in the field		+		
46	6.2.	demonstrate evidence of readiness to determine the period of study in doctoral/postgraduate studies, the result of which should be publications recommended by the committee/commission under the authorized body in the field of education and in internationally recognized peer-reviewed publications		+		
47	6.3.	ensure that the thesis meets the basic requirements for scientific research and includes a complete review of the literature on relevant topics, the purpose and objectives of the study, methodological apparatus,		+		

		reliable results, discussion, conclusions and further prospects for the study				
48	6.4.	ensure that if the dissertation is submitted in other formats, such as a single monograph, the evaluation committee must ensure that the scientific contribution is equivalent to the dissertation (if acceptable in the country according to government requirements)		+		
49	6.5.	to encourage international recognition, provide for the writing and defense of dissertations in English, if this does not contradict national standards; abstracts/abstracts of dissertations must be published in English		+		
50	6.6.	provide that co-author statements must document that the doctoral student has made a significant and independent contribution to the publication when publishing jointly		+		
51	6.7.	provide for the publication of dissertations on the PA website in a secure format; in the event that copyright legislation does not allow the publication of dissertations on the website, the abstract of the dissertation must be publicly available		+		
52	6.8.	provide for posting on the PA website a brief abstract of the dissertation in the state language		+		
Total			0	8	0	
STANDARD 7 «DISSERTATION EVALUATION»						
The educational organization must:						
53	7.1.	demonstrate evidence of readiness to provide the dissertation work evaluation process through dissertation review and public defense with presentation of the dissertation research results in the form of a presentation		+		
54	7.2.	ensure that the degree of doctor/candidate of sciences is awarded based on the decision of the evaluation committee of the educational institution, which assessed the dissertation and the oral defense of the dissertation if the dissertation meets the requirements described in standard 6		+		
55	7.3.	demonstrate evidence of a willingness to ensure that the evaluation committee is composed of scientists actively conducting research, unrelated to the doctoral student's research, conflict of interest. At least two of the members of the evaluation committee must be representatives of other organizations		+		
56	7.4.	ensure that, to avoid conflicts of interest, scientific supervisors do not take part in the work of the evaluation committee		+		
57	7.5.	ensure that in the event of a negative decision on a dissertation submitted in writing, the doctoral student/postgraduate student has the right to finalize the dissertation; in the case of a negative decision on an oral defense, there is the right to change it (if it does not contradict local legislation). In some cases, the		+		

		evaluation committee may reject the dissertation without the right to re-defend it				
58	7.6.	ensure that the oral defense of a dissertation is an open, public procedure		+		
59	7.7.	demonstrate evidence of readiness to implement the internationalization policy, including at least one representative from another country on the evaluation committee		+		
60	7.8.	demonstrate evidence of readiness to evaluate the competencies during the defense that the doctoral student/graduate student received during doctoral/postgraduate studies		+		
Total			0	8	0	
STANDARD 8 «SCHOOL STRUCTURE AND MANAGEMENT»						
The educational organization must:						
61	8.1.	have a published quality assurance policy that forms part of its strategic management; ensure that internal stakeholders develop and implement this policy through appropriate structures and processes, with the involvement of external stakeholders		+		
62	8.2.	provide a governance structure for the doctoral/postgraduate program that is transparent and accessible to all stakeholders, consistent with the mission and functions of the institution, and ensures its sustainability		+		
63	8.3.	ensure that appropriate information is collected, analyzed and used for the effective management of the doctoral program		+		
64	8.4.	demonstrate evidence of a commitment to informing the public about its activities (including programs). The information provided must be clear, reliable, objective, relevant and accessible.		+		
65	8.5.	demonstrate evidence of readiness to open and constantly update a section on its website dedicated to doctoral/postgraduate programs in the state and English languages		+		
Total			0	5	0	
TOTAL OVERALL			2	57	6	