

# **REPORT**

on the results of the work of the external expert commission on the evaluation of educational programs

7M04104 Digital Public Administration and Services, 7M06107 Media Technology, 8D04101 Project Management, 8D06101 Computer Science

# ASTANA IT UNIVERSITY LLP

for compliance with the requirements of the standards of primary specialized accreditation (EX-ANTE) of higher and (or) postgraduate education

Date of visit: from 17 to 19 April 2024

# INDEPENDENT AGENCY FOR ACCREDITATION AND RATING External Review Committee

Addressed Accreditation IAAR Council



#### **REPORT**

on the results of the work of the external expert commission on the evaluation of educational programs

7M04104 Digital Public Administration and Services, 7M06107 Media Technology, 8D04101 Project Management, 8D06101 Computer Science

#### ASTANA IT UNIVERSITY LLP

for compliance with the requirements of the standards of primary specialized accreditation (EX-ANTE) of higher and (or) postgraduate education

Date of visit: from 17 to 19 April 2024

Astana

April 19 2024

# Content

(I) LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS	3
(II) INTRODUCTION	4
(III) INTRODUCTION OF THE EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION	5
(IV) DESCRIPTION OF THE PREVIOUS ACCREDITATION PROCEDURE	8
(V) DESCRIPTION OF THE EEC VISIT	9
(VI) COMPLIANCE WITH SPECIALIZED ACCREDITATION STANDARDS	10
6.1. Standard "Management of the Educational Program"	10
6.2. Standard "Information Management and Reporting"	14
6.3. Standard "Development and Approval of the Educational Program"	17
6.4. Standard "Continuous Monitoring and Periodic Evaluation of Educational Programs"	
6.5. Standard "Student-Centered Learning, Teaching and Assessment"	
6.6. Standard "Students"	
6.7. Standard "Teaching Staff"	27
6.8. Standard "Educational Resources and Student Support Systems"	29
6.9. The "Public Information" Standard	32
(VII) REVIEW OF STRENGTHS/BEST PRACTICES FOR EACH STANDARD	35
(VIII) REVIEW OF THE QUALITY IMPROVEMENT RECOMMENDATION FOI	
EACH STANDARD	36
OVERVIEW OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE	HE 20
EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION	38
RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE ACCREDITATION COUNCIL	39
(IX) Annex 1. EVALUATION TABLE "PARAMETERS OF THE SPECIALIZED PROFILE"	40
Appendix 2. PROGRAM OF THE VISIT TO THE EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATI	
Appendix 3. RESULTS OF THE SURVEY OF TEACHERS	
Appendix 5. RESCETS OF THE SCRIEF OF TEACHERS	61

### (I) LIST OF NOTATIONS AND ABBREVIATIONS

**AITU LLP** – Astana IT University Limited Liability Partnership

IAAR - Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating

**DB** – Databases

**CCFES** – Committee for Control in the Field of Education and Science

**ICT** – Information and Communication Technologies

**R&D Center - Scientific and Innovation Centers** 

**EP** – Educational Programs

**RUP** – Working Curriculum

UMCD - educational and methodological complex of the discipline

AC – Academic Council

EMC – Educational and Methodological Council

**DIC-** Department of International Cooperation

IC – Individual Curriculum

**EW** – Educational Work

State Educational Standards - the state compulsory standard of education

**SPDES** – State Program for the Development of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan

**UNT** – Unified National Testing

**ECTS** – European Credit Transfer and Accumulation System

**OC** – optional component

CTO – credit technology of education

**CED** – Catalogue of Elective Disciplines

**MEP** – Modular Educational Programs

**R&D** – research work

**SRWS/SRM** – research work of students/undergraduates

**NQF** – National Qualifications Framework

STC – Scientific and Technical Council

**GED** – general education disciplines

**MD** – Major Disciplines

**QMS** – Quality Management System

IWU – independent work of undergraduates

**IWS** – independent work of students

**IWST** – independent work of students under the guidance of a teacher

**EMC** – Educational and Methodological Complex

**PhD** – PhD/PhD in Philosophy

**AMP** – Administrative and Managerial Personnel

#### (II) INTRODUCTION

In accordance with No 60-24-OD dated 02/05/2024. From April 17 to April 19, 2024, an external expert commission assessed the compliance of the Limited Liability Partnership "Astana IT University" (hereinafter referred to as AITU) with the standards of primary specialized accreditation of EP of higher and postgraduate education of the IAAR (dated May 25, 2018 No 68-18/1 – OD, first edition).

The report of the External Expert Commission (EEC) contains an assessment of the compliance of AITU activities within the framework of the primary specialized accreditation of educational programs 7M04104 Digital Public Administration and Services, 7M06107 Media Technologies, 8D04101 Project Management, 8D06101 Computer Science with the IAAR criteria, recommendations of the EEC for further improvement of the parameters of the specialized profile.

The report of the external expert commission contains an assessment of the compliance of the activities of Astana IT University Limited Liability Partnership within the framework of primary specialized accreditation with the IAAR criteria, recommendations of the EEC for further improvement of the parameters of the specialized profile.

# **Composition of the EEC:**

Chairman of the EEC – Andrey Alexandrovich Bratsikhin, Doctor of Technical Sciences, Rector of the Izhevsk State Agricultural Academy (Izhevsk, Udmurt Republic, Russian Federation); Off-line participation

IAAR expert – Nastasenko Veaceslav, PhD, Associate Professor, Technical University of Moldova (Chisinau, Moldova); Off-line participation

IAAR Expert – Andrey Valerievich Tamyarov, Candidate of Technical Sciences, Associate Professor, Ulyanovsk State Technical University (Ulyanovsk, Russian Federation); On-line participation

IAAR expert – Urmashev Baidaulet Amantayevich, Candidate of Physical and Mathematical Sciences, Associate Professor, Al-Farabi Kazakh National University (Almaty); Off-line participation

IAAR Expert – Alexandra Olegovna Potapenko, PhD, Associate Professor, Toraigyrov University (Pavlodar); Off-line participation

*IAAR expert, employer* – Sergey Vladimirovich Sovetkin, founder and director of a digital agency, with the current status of "Google Premier Partners" (Astana); *Off-line participation* 

IAAR expert, student - Rakhmetov Artur Armanuly, 2nd year student of the EP Information Technologies of S. Seifullin Kazakh Agrotechnical Research University (Astana); Off-line participation

*IAAR expert, student* – Abdibekov Gaziz Zhalgasbayevich, 2nd year master's student EP 7M01503 - Informatics of NJSC "Aktobe Regional University named after K. Zhubanov" (Aktobe); *On-line participation*;

IAAR EEC Coordinator - Dinara Bekenova, IAAR Project Manager (Astana); Off-line participation

*IAAR EEC Coordinator* – Bagdat Medetov, Head of the Legal Department of IAAR (Astana); *Off-line participation* 

IAAR EEC Coordinator – Zhulduz Auezkhanova, IAAR Post-Accreditation Monitoring Project Manager (Astana); Off-line participation

# (III) <u>INTRODUCTION OF THE EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION</u>

Astana IT University was opened in 2019 as part of the implementation of the state program "Digital Kazakhstan" for the development of human capital in the field of higher and postgraduate education.

The University provides educational services of higher and postgraduate education in accordance with the Classifier of Areas of Training with Higher and Postgraduate Education, approved by the Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 13, 2018 No 569 and the State Compulsory Standards of Higher and Postgraduate Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan, approved by the Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 31, 2018 No 604.

Currently, the University trains personnel in 15 bachelor's degree programs in the context of 4 areas of training, 6 master's degree programs, 2 doctoral educational programs included in the Register of Educational Programs of Higher and Postgraduate Education.

The total contingent is 4952 undergraduate students, including 4546 on an educational grant, 406 on a paid basis, 33 foreign students; master's programs: 405 people, including 392 on an educational grant, 13 on a paid basis; doctoral studies – 5 people studying within the framework of an educational grant.

The qualitative and quantitative composition of the teaching staff of the EP "6B06107 Mathematical and Computational Sciences", "6B07101 Industrial Internet of Things", "6B07102 Electronic Engineering", "7M04104 Digital Public Administration and Services", "7M06107 Media Technologies", "8D04101 Project Management", "8D06101 Computer Science" for the 2023–2024 academic year is 45% for bachelor's programs, 70% for master's programs, and 100% for doctoral programs.

The high level of training of specialists was confirmed by the Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating (IAAR). In 2020, the university passed institutional and specialized (program) accreditation in the National Agency for Accreditation and Rating (IAAR) for a period of 5 years. In 2022, all master's programs for a period of 5 years underwent specialized accreditation.

The university has concluded over 150 agreements on professional practice at enterprises, including with such enterprises as Transtelecom JSC, National Information Technologies JSC, the Ministry of Digital Development, Innovation and Aerospace Industry of the Republic of Kazakhstan (MDDIAI), Astana International Financial Center, NC KAZAKHSTAN GARYSH SAPARY JSC, etc.

Graduates of the world's leading foreign universities work at the university, including: University of Southern California (USA), Boston University (USA), The University of Chicago (USA), University College London (UK), Imperial College London (UK), Robert Gordon University (UK), Humboldt University (Berlin, Germany), University of Bristol (UK), The University of Sheffield (UK).

In 2022, the first graduation was organized: 523 students, of which 86 entered the master's program, 385 were employed (employment rate - 92%). In 2023 - the second graduation: 1111 students, including 1082 bachelors, 29 masters (employment rate - 96%).

The University carries out research activities on the basis of the certificate of accreditation as a subject of scientific and (or) scientific and technical activities No005956 dated December 11, 2019.

One of the criteria for the effectiveness of scientific activities of scientists and employees is publication activity, especially in high-ranking journals included in the Web of Science and Scopus databases: the number of publications over the past 5 years in the Web of Science database is 97, in the Scopus database - 279.

5

Currently, AITU publishes the Scientific Journal of Astana IT University in the following areas:

- Information security;
- IT in education and training;
- Information and communication technologies (ICT);
- IT in Management, Management, Finance and Economics;
- Project management.

Since 2022, the Scientific Journal of Astana IT University has been included in the database of journals recommended by the Committee for Quality Assurance in Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan in two areas: ICT and IT in Education and Training.

Since 2021, the University has been organizing and holding an international conference in a mixed format IEEE 2021 IEEE International Conference on Smart Information Systems and Technologies. In 2023, more than 1000 authors from Kazakhstan, near and far abroad (17 participating countries) took part in the conference. Published and indexed in SCOPUS database 106 articles.

Within the framework of the memorandum of understanding and cooperation dated October 11, 2019, signed between Astana IT University and Cisco, a training laboratory with a hardware and software solution for Cisco Webex distance learning was opened at the university. Within the framework of the memorandum of understanding and cooperation dated September 27, 2019, signed between Astana IT University and Huawei, the Huawei ICT Academy was opened. Within the framework of the memorandum of understanding and cooperation signed between Astana IT University and Kaspersky Lab, an authorized training center has been opened.

In order to increase the social activity of students, the university has 50 interest clubs. The activities of student clubs are aimed at organizing and conducting cultural events that contribute to the disclosure of creative potential and the spiritual and moral education of students.

One of the tasks of the university is the development and expansion of international relations with higher educational institutions, scientific organizations of near and far abroad, with leading transnational companies and other enterprises in the field of education, science and innovation.

More than 50 memorandums of understanding and cooperation with foreign academic partners have been concluded. The university invited foreign specialists to implement the internationalization program and conduct training sessions.

In the 2022-2023 academic year, 80 students were sent to partner universities for academic mobility: INHA University, South Korea – 22, Kyungpook National University, South Korea – 7, University of Latvia, Latvia – 3, Beijing Institute of Technology, China – 10, Schmalkalden University of Applied Sciences, Germany – 21, Istanbul Aydin University, Turkey – 3, University of Ankara, Turkey – 1, Lawrence technological University, USA – 12, Cracow University of Technology, Poland – 1.

At the end of 2023, 68 international students from 11 countries (Afghanistan, Bangladesh, China, Mongolia, Nigeria, Pakistan, Russia, USA, Turkey, Uzbekistan, Ukraine) are studying at AITU.

In accordance with paragraphs 26-23 of paragraph 2 of Article 22 of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Defense and the Armed Forces", by the joint order of the Ministry of Defense and the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan No21, a military department has been operating at the University since January 20, 2020.

Educational activities are carried out on the basis of a general license No KZ67AA00019559 dated 12.04.2019, issued by the Committee for Control in the Field of Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan (http://stanait.edu.kz). In accordance with the license, the University has the right to award academic degrees in accredited educational programs in accordance with the appendix to the license No KZ67LAA00019559 dated January 18, 2021, issued by the Committee for the control in the field of education and science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The university

fully owns the academic resources to carry out educational activities under the educational programs submitted for accreditation.

The academic policy of the university is a system of measures, rules and procedures for planning and managing educational activities and the effective organization of the educational process aimed at implementing student-oriented education and improving the quality of education.



# (IV) <u>DESCRIPTION OF THE PREVIOUS ACCREDITATION PROCEDURE</u>

Educational programs 7M04104 Digital Public Administration and Services, 7M06107 Media Technologies, 8D04101 Project Management, 8D06101 Computer Science Astana IT University LLP undergo primary accreditation for compliance with the standards of primary specialized accreditation of an educational program of higher and (or) postgraduate education (Exante).



#### (V) DESCRIPTION OF THE VISIT OF THE EEC

The work of the EEC was carried out on the basis of the approved Visit Program of the Expert Commission for Specialized Accreditation of Educational Programs of Astana IT University in the period from April 17 to April 19, 2024.

In order to coordinate the work of the EEC, an orientation meeting was held on 15.04.2024, during which powers were distributed among the members of the commission, the schedule of the visit was clarified, and an agreement was reached on the choice of examination methods.

In accordance with the requirements of the standards, the program of the visit included meetings with vice-rectors, heads of structural divisions, dean, directors of departments of the university, teachers, students and employees from structural divisions, interviews and questionnaires of teachers and students. A total of 158 people took part in the meetings (Table 1).

Table 1 - Information about employees and students who took part in meetings with the IAAR EEC:

Category of participants	Quantity
Rector	1
Vice-Rectors	2
Heads of structural divisions	16
Deans of faculties	1
Heads of Departments (Directors of Departments)	4
Teachers	36
Undergraduates, undergraduates	98
Graduates	0
Employers	0
Altogether	158

The visual inspection was carried out in order to get a general idea of the organization of educational, scientific and methodological processes, material and technical base, to determine its compliance with standards, as well as to get an idea of the workplaces of teaching staff, employees and students. Experts inspected the faculty and its four departments, as well as structural divisions.

Educational buildings, educational laboratories and specialized classrooms equipped with modern high-tech equipment, research and innovation centers were visited: Smart City Research Center, Industry 4.0 Research Center, Big Data and Blockchain Technology Research Center, AgroTech Research Center, EdTech Research Center, reading rooms and library, computer classes, multimedia classes, etc.

In accordance with the accreditation procedure, a survey of 16 teachers and 25 students was conducted.

In order to confirm the information provided in the Self-Assessment Report, the working documentation of the university was requested and analyzed by external experts. In particular, the EP Development Program, RUE for Master's and Doctoral Studies, EP 7M06107 Media Technologies, plans and minutes of the Academic Council, UMKD, etc.

All conditions were created for the work of the EEC, access to all necessary information resources was organized. The staff of Astana IT University ensured the presence of all persons specified in the visit program, in compliance with the established time.

As part of the planned program, recommendations for improving the accredited educational programs of Astana IT University, developed by the EEC based on the results of the examination, were presented at a meeting with the management on 04/19/2024.

EEC members attended seminars on cluster 2 according to the program of the visit.

### (VI) COMPLIANCE WITH SPECIALIZED ACCREDITATION STANDARDS

#### 6.1. Standard "Management of the Educational Program"

- The organization of higher and (or) postgraduate education must have a published quality assurance policy. Quality assurance policies should reflect the link between research, teaching and learning.
- The organization of higher and (or) postgraduate education must demonstrate the development of a culture of quality assurance, including in the context of EP.
- Commitment to quality assurance should apply to any activities performed by contractors and partners (outsourcing), including the implementation of joint/double-degree education and academic mobility.
- The management of the EP demonstrates its readiness to ensure transparency in the development of the EP development plan based on the analysis of its functioning, the real positioning of the EP and the focus of its activities on meeting the needs of the state, employers, students and other stakeholders.
- The management of the EP demonstrates the functioning of the mechanisms for the formation and regular review of the EP development plan and monitoring its implementation, assessing the achievement of learning goals, meeting the needs of students, employers and society, and making decisions aimed at continuous improvement of the EP.
- The management of the SE should involve representatives of stakeholder groups, including employers, students and faculty, in the formation of a plan for the development of the SE.
- The management of the EP must demonstrate the individuality and uniqueness of the EP development plan, its consistency with national priorities and the development strategy of the organization of higher and (or) postgraduate education.
- The organization of higher and (or) postgraduate education should demonstrate a clear definition of those responsible for business processes within the EP, an unambiguous distribution of staff responsibilities, and the delineation of functions of collegial bodies.
- The management of the EP must provide evidence of the transparency of the educational program management system.
- The management of the SOE must demonstrate the existence of an internal quality assurance system for the SO, including its design, management and monitoring, their improvement, and fact-based decision-making.
- The management of the SE should manage risks, including within the framework of the SE undergoing initial accreditation, as well as demonstrate a system of measures aimed at reducing the degree of risk.
- The management of the programme should ensure the participation of representatives of employers, teaching staff, students and other stakeholders in the composition of the collegial management bodies of the educational programme, as well as their representativeness in decision-making on the management of the educational programme.
- The PO should demonstrate innovation management within the OP, including the analysis and implementation of innovative proposals.
- The EP management must demonstrate evidence of readiness for openness and accessibility for students, faculty, employers, and other stakeholders.
  - The management of the EP must be trained in education management programs.

#### Evidence

The Quality Assurance Policy of Astana IT University LLP (AITU) Система-внутреннегообеспечения-качества.pdf (astanait.edu.kz) has been published on the official website of the university. Astana IT University is a specialized university that contributes to the implementation of the national projects "Quality Education "Educated Nation" and "Technological Breakthrough through Digitalization, Science and Innovation" for the development of human capital in the field of higher and postgraduate education. The university's activities are aimed at training highly qualified personnel in the IT field on an interdisciplinary basis for the public sector, business, national and foreign companies in various sectors of the economy. The mission of the university is to train highly qualified personnel and commercialize research for the ICT sector as drivers of Kazakhstan's development.

The principles of building the AITU internal quality assurance system are: Maintaining academic honesty and freedom, intolerance to any forms of corruption and discrimination; a clear definition of responsibility for processes, quality and standards; application of the process approach and the principles of risk-based thinking; making important management decisions based on a comprehensive analysis of data and information; continuous improvement of the quality assurance system and the development of a quality culture; application of external and internal independent control and evaluation; ensuring transparency and availability of information for stakeholders.

EEC members were convinced that there is a development of a culture of quality assurance, including in the context of the EP. This is confirmed, for example, by taking into account the need of modern society for highly qualified and competitive personnel, which, in turn, affected the organizational structure of the university and the directions of its activities. As a result, the university has modernized its management system and introduced the principles of corporate management. In the course of development, the Academic Council and the Academic Council have been created at the university, the efficiency of the Academic Council and student self-government bodies has been increased, and the interest of employers has increased. A strategic planning system has been introduced. The Code of Corporate Governance, the Code of Student Honor, and the Anti-Corruption Policy have been developed and approved. Annual monitoring of satisfaction with the university management system among employees and faculty (hereinafter referred to as the faculty) allows improving the corporate governance system. The quality of educational services is assessed by conducting a survey among employers.

Experts noted that the coordination of the tasks of quality training of specialists and increasing the satisfaction of the needs of students is provided by the system of internal quality assurance. The university has developed and operates a system of internal regulatory documents astanait.edu.kz.

Any interested person can familiarize themselves with the rules and regulations developed at the university. For example, "Rules for the organization and conduct of students' internships" (06/30/2021). Changes in the regulatory legal acts of the Republic of Kazakhstan are reflected in the internal regulatory documents of the university by making changes and amendments.

The effectiveness of the mechanism for internal quality assessment and examination of the SE is confirmed. Information on the implementation of goals and objectives for the quality of the EP is posted on social networks and on the official website of the university.

The EEC confirms that the university is working to establish a link between research, teaching and learning. As a result of the research work (hereinafter referred to as R&D) of the teaching staff, new elective disciplines have been introduced in the EP.

EEC members confirm that each accredited programme has a development programme developed and approved in accordance with the rules established at the university. For example, the development program EP 8D04101 – Project Management was developed in accordance with the Development Strategy of Astana IT University LLP for 2022-2025, and approved at a meeting of the Academic Council of the University. The program for the development of accredited educational programs consists of: Analysis of the current situation of the educational program: Market research, Analysis of the internal environment; SWOT analysis; the plan for the development of the EP; Change registration sheet. Development programs are developed in accordance with the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the AITU Charter, the AITU Development Strategy for 2020-2025 "Education and Innovation for Digital Transformation", the AITU Academic and HR Policy, the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in Higher Education in the European Higher Education Area (ESG), the Guidelines for the Use of ECTS.

Experts note the dynamism of the goals of the EP, the coordination of the EP Development Plans, the content of the EP with employers who participate in determining the list of elective modules for the specialty, elective disciplines, in the provision of practice bases and in the final assessment of graduates.

Development programs contain information about the uniqueness of the EP (in the context of the educational trajectories provided to students), as well as the educational results and areas of possible employment of EP graduates. Also unique is the brief summary of all the sub-items of this EP development program. The EP development program consists of the following sections: 1. Introduction; 2. Analysis of the current situation: 2.1. Market research: a) market needs, b) Graduate Competence Model); 2.2. Analysis of the internal environment: A) Student body, B) Personnel management of the EP, C) Educational and methodological support of the EP, d) Research and development work, e) Services, f) partnerships (international and domestic), practice bases, branches of the EP in "production"; academic mobility of students (full-time and external), joint UMD and NDI; joint EPs (including double degree programmes); 3. SWOT analysis; 4. EP DEVELOPMENT PLAN: 1. Academic excellence in continuous IT education and high demand for graduates, 2. Research leadership, 3. National and international recognition, 4. Implementation of the "Smart and Digital University" model.

Information about the development programmes of the programme, on the adoption of collegial decisions is brought to the attention of interested parties through the university website, during meetings of the rector with students, interviews of the management in the media, on television, as well as by posting information on stands. The management of the EP systematically requests, analyzes and summarizes the opinions of stakeholders, conducts surveys, makes adjustments to the content of the EP, teaching methods, and improvement of the material and technical base.

The EEC confirms the existence of a mechanism for responding to the identified problems by collegial bodies, determining responsible persons and deadlines.

Those responsible for the implementation of the points of the development programs of the EP are appointed by the decision of the meeting of the departments. Reports on the implementation of EP development programs are included in the departmental annual reports with critical analysis.

Experts confirm the existence of the following mechanisms for collecting, storing and analyzing information on the implementation of the EP: self-assessment of the EP in preparation for accreditation; self-assessment of the EP for compliance with the criteria of accreditation organizations; constant self-assessment of the processes that ensure the implementation of the EP; questionnaires, etc.

Measures to control the quality of the educational process are recorded in the form of records, acts, certificates, reports, etc., and are discussed at meetings of departments and the Academic Council. On the basis of the analysis and assessment of control indicators, preventive and corrective measures are developed. Interested persons have the opportunity to make an appointment with the management of the OP.

Experts confirm the presence of educational and distance portals in the Moodle and digital university systems at the university. The educational portal provides educational documentation for students. QED, UMKD for all disciplines are available both in paper form and on electronic media. Students have access to the full database of electronic educational publications, updated by the University library staff, as well as republican and international electronic databases of educational and scientific literature, including the Web of Science database.

EEC members confirm that in order to effectively implement student-centered learning, the university's teaching staff conduct their own research in the field of teaching methods.

The experts also made sure that the leadership of the EP is trained in education management organized by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Heads of structural divisions completed the "Educational Leadership" advanced training course organized by Nazarbayev University from May 11 to June 22, 2021. Also, the top management of the university received certification of IPMA level D project managers conducted by the Certified

Center of the Kazakhstan Project Management Association Head of EP 7M04104 Digital Public Administration and Services, EP 7M06107 Media Technologies, EP 8D04101 Project Management - Professor Ha Jin Hwang and the head of OP 8D06101 Computer Science - Professor Praveen Kumar have a certificate of the international regional seminar "Innovative teaching and learning strategy: methods, technologies and tools".

## Analytical part

The quality assurance policy has been published, the link between research, teaching and learning has been identified, the assessment system and the main approaches to the development of EP have been improved. In general, this confirms the development of a culture of quality assurance, including in the context of EP. Experts consider the work of the EP management to ensure the transparency of the development plan of the EP based on the analysis of its functioning, the real positioning of the university and the focus of its activities on meeting the needs of the state, employers, stakeholders and students to be satisfactory. A mechanism for updating strategic documents for the development of EPs has been developed. Employers, students and teaching staff are involved in the management of the EP. The EEC notes the consistency of the development programs of the EP with national development priorities and with the Development Strategy of Astana IT University LLP for 2022-2025. The Commission was provided with evidence of a clear definition of those responsible for business processes within the OP, an unambiguous distribution of staff duties, and the delineation of functions of collegial bodies. The analysis and implementation of innovative proposals is carried out in the management of educational programs.

An analysis of the documents, an interview with the university administration, heads of structural divisions, and the management of the EP showed that a risk analysis is carried out, and many factors from the external environment that affect the implementation of the EP are taken into account when assessing them, because economic, technological and other factors also affect the management of the EP and can provoke certain types of risks.

In this regard, the experts noted the compliance of all areas of the content of the programme for the development of the programme with the strategic development of the university. The leadership of the EP has developed a program for the development of the EP, taking into account the strategic directions of the university, an analysis of the relevance of the program in accordance with the development of the region, the republic and the IT industry as a whole, target indicators, time criteria and those responsible for their achievement are given, risk analysis and SWOT analysis are presented.

Qualitative risk analysis involves, for example, the determination of such parameters as: causes (source of occurrence), conditions of probability of occurrence, possible indicators of the upcoming onset of risk and other qualitative information. Quantitative analysis assumes the value of the probability of the occurrence of risks for their detailed assessment. The analysis of the submitted plans for the development of the EP made it possible to establish the lack of information about the uniqueness of each EP and the individuality of the plan for its development.

A survey of teaching staff conducted during the visit of the IAAR EEC showed that the reflection of the mission and strategy of the university in various aspects of the university's activities and organizational issues, according to the estimates of the teaching staff, is more than 93%. To the question "To what extent does the content of the educational program meet your needs?" 87.6% of the teaching staff gave a positive assessment. Involvement in the process of making managerial and strategic decisions is good -50% (8 ppp), very good -43.8% (7 ppp), relative -6.3% (1 ppp).

#### Strengths/Best Practices:

The EP management has developed logically structured and content-filled EP development programs, which provide target indicators, time criteria and those responsible for their achievement, risk analysis and SWOT analysis.

#### Recommendations of the EEC:

Based on the SWOT analysis, the EP management should provide a section on the establishment of competitive or distinctive features of EPs in the structure of the EP Development Plan to determine their uniqueness, as well as the individuality of the EP development plans, their consistency with national priorities in the relevant areas of knowledge and the University Development Program until January 1, 2025.

# Conclusions of the EEC on the following criteria:

According to the standard "Management of the educational program " there are 1 strong ones, 13 satisfactory ones, and -1 improvement is expected.

#### 6.2. Information Management and Reporting Standard

- The GS should demonstrate that it has a system for collecting, analysing and managing information using modern information and communication technologies and software and that it uses a variety of methods to collect and analyse information in the context of the LO.
- The management of the SOs should demonstrate the existence of a mechanism for the systematic use of processed, adequate information to improve the internal quality assurance system.
  - The management of the OP must demonstrate fact-based decision-making.
- Within the framework of the EP, a system of regular reporting should be provided, reflecting all levels of the structure, including an assessment of the effectiveness and efficiency of the activities of divisions and departments, scientific research.
- The EI should establish the frequency, forms and methods of assessing the management of the educational program, the activities of collegial bodies and structural units, top management, and the implementation of scientific projects.
- The NGO must demonstrate the determination of the procedure and ensuring the protection of information, including the identification of persons responsible for the reliability and timeliness of information analysis and data provision.
- An important factor is the availability of mechanisms for involving students, employees and teaching staff in the processes of collecting and analyzing information, as well as making decisions based on them.
- The management of the EP must demonstrate the existence of a mechanism for communication with students, employees and other stakeholders, as well as mechanisms for resolving conflicts.
- The PO should demonstrate that there are mechanisms in place to measure the degree of satisfaction of the needs of faculty, staff and trainees within the OB.
- The GS should provide for an assessment of performance and effectiveness, including in the context of the OP.
- The information to be collected and analyzed within the framework of the OP should take into account:
  - *key performance indicators;*
  - the dynamics of the contingent of students in the context of forms and types;
  - the level of academic performance, student achievements and expulsion;
- students' satisfaction with the implementation of the EP and the quality of education at the university;
  - the availability of educational resources and support systems for students;
- The NGO must confirm the implementation of procedures for processing personal data of students, employees and teaching staff on the basis of their documentary consent.

#### Evidence

EEC members confirm the existence of a system of collection, analysis and management. Information collection, analysis and management systems at AITU are an integral part of the

planning system, quality system, financial activity, process approach, and management of individual EPs. Maintaining the mission, goals, objectives and assessing their effectiveness is carried out in accordance with the current documented procedures, according to which the university collects and analyzes data to assess the effectiveness of activities, determine the degree of implementation of the mission, goals and objectives, and opportunities for continuous improvement of the service provided.

The visit of the EEC showed that in all departments of the university, records management is carried out in accordance with the approved nomenclature of cases, the safety and archiving of documents is ensured, and work is underway to switch to its own electronic system for supporting the educational process.

In the process of collecting and processing information, the university uses modern information systems, information and communication technologies and software. The information support includes the following information tools: Automated information system for managing the educational process "Platonus", Moodle, Abitur, automated information system for accounting "1C Accounting", Digital University, electronic internal document management "Thesis", the official website of the university and social networks AITU.

The university has one dean's office, which works on the principle of "one window" and provides students with appropriate services on administrative, educational and advisory issues, which facilitates electronic document management. The Vice-Rector for Academic and Educational Affairs and the Head of the Human Resources Department confirmed the facts that the teaching staff and university employees confirm their consent to the processing of personal data.

Members of the EEC were convinced that the university has developed principles on the basis of which the monitoring of educational results within the framework of the EP is carried out. The minutes of departmental meetings and annual reports reflect the results of the analysis of the achievement of the goals of the EP. Any changes in the plan for the development of the program and plans to change it are brought to the attention of students and employers through the AITU website, official correspondence. The university systematically analyses information on the implementation of the programme and conducts a comprehensive self-analysis. The effectiveness of EP is analyzed annually based on quantitative learning outcomes. Indicators of the effectiveness of achieving the goals of the EP are the results of monitoring, both external and internal. Decisions made by the Academic Council, the International Council and the Rector are brought to the attention of the teaching staff in the relevant extracts from the minutes of the meetings. All employees and teaching staff have a clearly defined range of obligations and rights, which are reflected in the Regulations on subdivisions and job descriptions. Job descriptions exclude duplication of responsibilities and rights, ensure the delineation of functions of collegial bodies participating in the implementation of the EP.

The form of participation of teaching staff and students in making management decisions is, for example, participation in meetings of the rectorate, the Academic Council and departments. Faculty and employees have the opportunity to make proposals for improving their activities at meetings, meetings with the rector, vice-rectors, and dean. Students participate in the process of planning and development of EP through university-wide youth organizations, participation in collegial management bodies.

The participation of universities from near and far abroad in joint development is provided for in the programmes for the development of programme programmes. The directors of the two departments are South Korean and Indian nationals. Scientists from foreign countries also participated in the research work of the university.

The information obtained from these sources of information is annually used in the analysis by the University management and the implementation of corrective actions, which affects the revision of the EP Development Plan. On the basis of the information and software complex "Digital University", academic support of students is carried out for the entire period of study up

to the receipt of a diploma and a diploma supplement in three languages: Kazakh, Russian and English.

It should be noted that in connection with the "Digital Kazakhstan" program, AITU is striving to transition to a "Digital University". For this purpose, work is underway to develop its own software for an electronic circulation document. In the context of the implementation of the state program "Digital Kazakhstan", the Academic Council of the University adopted the "Digital University" model.

The official website operates in three languages: Kazakh, Russian and partially English.

The analysis and monitoring of students' satisfaction with the educational program and the quality of teaching is carried out in accordance with the Sociological Research Plan. The degree of satisfaction with the teaching staff of the EP is carried out by the university by monitoring the opinions of the staff of students through direct and anonymous questionnaires.

The university administration pays special attention to the prevention of conflicts of interest and relationships. As part of prevention, various measures are taken, including those aimed at improving the material well-being of teaching staff, supporting initiative, encouraging scientific activities of teaching staff and students. A mechanism for managing conflicts of interest and relations has been developed.

The analysis of the questionnaire demonstrated 92% (23 students) of complete satisfaction of students with the level of accessibility and responsiveness of the university administration.

# Analytical part

The experts concluded that the information collected and analyzed by the university takes into account key performance indicators. Students, employers and teaching staff are involved in the processes of collecting, analyzing information and making decisions, the work is carried out on a systematic basis. The satisfaction of the needs of faculty, staff and students within the framework of the EP at the university is regularly measured. In order to conduct scientific research, teaching staff and students have access to information in the relevant fields of science.

The Commission notes that the official website of the university and the faculty are widely used as sources of informing students. An analysis of the site showed that up-to-date information about teaching staff is not always provided, and it is also noted that, for example, information about the results of training in EP on the site and in the documentation differs. A comparison of the information on the learning outcomes and professional competencies of the EP contained in the sections of the educational programme and their development plans with similar information published on the university's website made it possible to establish their inconsistency with each other. In this regard, it is necessary to ensure the completeness of the site based on the results of training from official documents that were submitted by the EEC IAAR.

According to the results of the survey, 88% (22 students) of the respondents are completely satisfied with the usefulness of the website of educational organizations in general and the faculty in particular; 80% (20 trainees) of survey participants are completely satisfied with the clarity of the procedure for taking disciplinary measures. 76% (19 students) of respondents are convinced that the library is well equipped and has a fairly good collection of books.

# Strengths/Best Practices:

Strengths have not been identified.

#### Recommendations of the EEC:

Heads of the programme should update information regarding the learning outcomes for each degree programme on the university's website at least once a year.

#### Conclusions of the EEC on the following criteria:

According to the standard "Information Management and Reporting" satisfactory - 16.

#### 6.3. Standard "Development and Approval of the Educational Program"

- The CA should define and document the procedures for the development of the CA and their approval at the institutional level.
- The management of the EP must ensure that the developed EPs comply with the established goals, including the expected learning outcomes.
- The management of the OP must demonstrate the existence of mechanisms for revising the content and structure of the OP, taking into account changes in the labor market, the requirements of employers and the social demand of society.
- The management of the EP should ensure the availability of developed models of the EP graduate, describing the learning outcomes and personal qualities.
- The management of the SE must demonstrate the conduct of external examinations of the content of the EP and the planned results of its implementation.
- Qualifications awarded at the end of the EP must be clearly defined and correspond to a certain level of NSC and OF-EHEA.
- The management of the EP should determine the influence of disciplines and professional practices on the formation of learning outcomes.
  - An important factor is the possibility of preparing students for professional certification.
- The management of the EP must provide evidence of the participation of students, faculty and other stakeholders in the development of the EP and ensuring their quality.
- The management of the EP must ensure the content of academic disciplines and learning outcomes at the level of study (bachelor's, master's, doctoral studies).
- The structure of EP should provide for various types of activities that ensure the achievement of the planned learning outcomes by students.
- An important factor is the correspondence of the content of the EP and the learning outcomes of the EP implemented by higher and (or) postgraduate education organizations in the EHEA.

#### Evidence

The implementation of educational programs submitted for accreditation is carried out in accordance with the provisions of regulatory legal acts in the field of higher and postgraduate education, as well as in accordance with the documentation developed by the University to ensure transparency and clarity in the implementation of the directions of the university's development strategies. The assessed EPs are focused on students acquiring academic knowledge and skills that are aimed at their personal development and are used in their future careers.

At the same time, all relevant subjects of the University, teaching staff, departments, faculty, divisions, etc., are involved. The scientific level and goals of educational programs meet the requirements, are consistent with the mission of the university and meet the needs of potential consumers.

The experts made sure that the procedures for the development of EPs and their approval at the institutional level at the university are determined in accordance with the internal quality assurance system. The process of developing EPs is preceded by an analysis of trends in education, a study of the dynamics of the development of the main indicators of the labor market, and an analysis and forecasting of the demand for personnel.

EEC members confirm the existence of the following stages of the development and development of the EP: development of the draft EP by a working group from among the faculty departments and partner employers; discussion of the draft EP at a meeting of departments; examination of the programme, its relevance, competencies and expected learning outcomes at a meeting of the Academic Council; development of recommendations for amendments and additions to the EP; updating the EP (in terms of elective disciplines) by modules; adjustment of the content of EP (modules for achieving learning outcomes) taking into account modern

requirements; identifying teaching, learning and assessment methods that ensure the achievement of learning outcomes; development of assessment tasks to measure the results of learning in EP, etc.) The leading role in the development and updating of the EP is assigned to relevant departments, faculty, students, heads of structural divisions, employers (Rules for the Development of Educational Programs of Higher and Postgraduate Education of Astana IT University LLP (DP AITU-17)).

The process of developing and approving educational programs of the university is regulated by: Model Rules for the Activities of Educational Organizations Implementing Educational Programs of Higher and (or) Postgraduate Education, approved by the Order of the Ministry of Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 12.10.2023; State Educational Standards of Higher and Postgraduate Education, approved by the order of the Minister of the Ministry of Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 20, 2022, No 2; Rules for the organization of the educational process on credit technology of education, approved by the order of the Minister of the Ministry of Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan, as amended on 25.07.2023; Academic Policy, Internal Quality Assurance Policy and Standards, as well as Internal Regulatory Documents of the University (AITU IRD).

The experts made sure that the accredited EPs were developed with the participation of interested parties, discussed at meetings of the graduating departments, the Methodological and Academic Councils of the university. EPs received positive feedback from external experts, agreed with employers and approved in accordance with the rules established at the university. Reviews are presented as an external examination of EP 7M04104 Digital Public Administration and Services represented by Arykbekova Umitzhan Shapaevna, Director of the Department of Digital Solutions of the Ministry of Digital Development, Innovation and Aerospace Industry of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Iskendirov Askhat Batyrzhanovich, Director for Debureaucratization of the State Apparatus and Assessment and Control over the Quality of Public Services of the Agency of the Republic of Kazakhstan for Public Affairs Service; Gul Dzhusupov, Director of the Department for Information Security, Protection of State Secrets and Mobilization Work of the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan; Aitbayev Aigul Serikovna, Head of the Department of Consolidated Analysis and Project Activities of the Department of Strategic Analysis and Development of the Ministry of Economy of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Reviews are presented as an external examination of OP 7M06107 Media Technologies from the Director of Genesys LLP Askar Murat, from the Director of Astana Publicity LLP Anuar Syzdykov. Reviews from Darkhan Birzhanov, General Director of E-Commerce Center LLP, Magzhan Patteev, Director of Ditum Group LLP, and Medet Koshtayev, CFO of Advanced Payment Solutions LTD, were presented on OP 8D04101 Project Management. Reviews are presented as an external examination of EP 8D06101 Computer Science from the General Director of Softrack LLP Sanzhar Aubakirov, from the General Director of AsylAli Group LLP Musylmanbayev Eldos.

The Rules for the Development of Educational Programs contain a list of the main criteria for assessing AITU EPs. The structure of the EP implements a systematic approach in terms of coordinating the content and logical sequence of the presentation of disciplines. Prerequisites and post-requisites are determined at the departmental level, taking into account the educational achievements of students. The acquired knowledge, skills, competencies, and the development of personal qualities are the basis for the development of the EP Graduate Model of the relevant relevant Department responsible for the development of EP. These models implement the basic and professional competencies of a graduate

Experts note the presence of developed models of a graduate of an EP, characterized by the ability to carry out professional activities at a given level of quality and including knowledge, skills, and competencies. The model of a graduate of accredited EPs was developed at the graduating departments, the teaching staff of the departments, employers, and students took part in its development. EEC members made sure that the development of the EP is carried out taking into account the proposals of teaching staff and employers based on the results of professional

internships, and is discussed at a meeting of departments. The qualification obtained upon completion of the EP is defined and recorded in the EP graduate model, it corresponds to a certain level of NSC.

The representativeness of employers is justified by the level of interest in cooperation.

Experts noted that each cycle of disciplines consists of a mandatory component and an elective component. The component for the choice of each cycle of the EP provides universities with the opportunity to independently determine the trajectory of the educational program, through the independent formation of a course of elective disciplines, taking into account the specifics of the socio-economic development of the state, the development of Digital Kazakhstan, as well as in accordance with the needs of the labor market of a particular region. The expected learning outcomes in the disciplines are reflected in the syllabuses. There is a sequence of studying disciplines based on the principles of science and continuity, rational distribution of disciplines from the standpoint of the uniformity of the student's workload, effective use of the personnel and material and technical potential of the university.

The content of the EP modules is developed taking into account professional standards and the mandatory involvement of employers and representatives of the business community, which makes it possible to correctly formulate the competencies necessary for the assignment of a particular qualification.

The main criterion for the completion of the Master's degree program is the completion of at least 120 ECTS academic credits by the student for the entire period of study, including all types of educational activities of the Master's student. Based on the identification of the needs of the labor market, the requests of employers, according to the National Qualifications Framework, industry qualifications frameworks, professional standards, the State Educational Standards of Higher Education and the State Educational Standards of Postgraduate Education, the persons responsible for the development of the EP determine a set of required professional competencies and form a Graduate Model of the educational program

According to EP 7M06107 Media Technologies, basic competencies form the disciplines of the DB cycle as, Foreign Language (Professional), Pedagogy of Higher Education, Psychology of Management, Pedagogical Practice, History and Philosophy of Science, Production Processes and Production of Audiovisual Media Content / Game Design Theory, Context and Processes of Project Management / Artificial Intelligence in Media, Business Analytics / Product Management / Audit of Processes in Information Security. Core competencies are formed within the framework of PD disciplines, such as Media, Technology and Culture, Research Methodology, Directing, Sustainable Development and Media Technology, Research Practice, Advanced Scriptwriting for Media Projects / Advanced Graphics and Interaction, Advanced Information Visualization / Process and Risk Management in Media, IT Project Management / Business Process Analysis / Information Security Management.

In accordance with the individual curriculum, students use an individual login and password to log in to their personal account and select training modules within the selected elective courses, taking into account their personal needs and capabilities. The AIS Digital University program automatically outputs an individual student curriculum formed for the academic year, scheduled by semesters. Students of the first year of study begin the registration procedure after professional and academic orientation, which is carried out within the established time frame in order to explain the principles of the credit system of study and the prospects for future professional activity. The registration algorithm has been developed and is successfully functioning.

#### Analytical part

The experts concluded that the university has defined and documented the procedures for the development and approval of the EP. The leadership of the EP provided the experts with evidence of the participation of faculty, students and employers in the development of EPs, ensuring their quality, and the availability of developed models of EP graduates. At the same time, it should be noted that the quality of the reviewers for the EP, who are the heads of the organization, should be noted.

The competence model of an AITU graduate consists of four competence areas: Social, Instrumental, Industrial.

The Commission notes that in the structure of EP 7M06107 Media Technologies, it is advisable to increase the number of disciplines that form IT and other professional competencies, taking into account the requirements of the professional standard "Testing Web and Multimedia Applications". The qualification level should be harmonized with the level of education (master's degree) of this educational program with the job functions described in the specified professional standard. The main emphasis should be on solving the following tasks: Design and development of a web resource; Integration testing of a web resource with external services and accounting systems; Development of technical specifications for the web resource; Analysis of requirements for a web resource and their formalization.

The university has memorandums and cooperation agreements. It is necessary to work on harmonizing the content of educational programs with other Kazakhstani and foreign universities.

An analysis of the studied documents shows that it is necessary to update information regarding the learning outcomes for each educational program at least once a year. Align the learning outcomes and competencies reflected in the Graduate Model on the university's official website with the information from the Bachelor's Programme and the Media Technologies development programme.

#### Strengths/Best Practices:

Strengths have not been identified.

## Recommendations of the EEC:

To bring the competencies reflected in the "Graduate Model" on the official website of the university into line with the graduate model from the "Media Technologies" program. Deadline - until 01.09.2024

The management of the SE to clarify the professional qualification of the EP 7M06107 Media Technologies, taking into account the level of education being implemented and to bring the content of the EP in line with the learning outcomes and professional qualifications determined by the national qualification system of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Deadline - until 01.09.2024.

To bring the content of academic disciplines and the planned results of the EP in line with the revised professional qualifications. Deadline - until 01.09.2024

## Conclusions of the EEC on the following criteria:

According to the standard "Development and approval of educational programs" for the EP "7M04104 Digital Public Administration and Services", "8D04101 Project Management", "8D06101 Computer Science": strong – 1, satisfactory – 11;

for the EP "7M06107 Media Technologies": satisfactory - 10, implying improvements -2.

#### 6.4. Standard "Continuous Monitoring and Periodic Evaluation of Educational Programs"

- The EI should determine the mechanisms for monitoring and periodic evaluation of the EP to ensure the achievement of the goal and meet the needs of students, society and show the focus of the mechanisms on the continuous improvement of the EP.
  - Monitoring and periodic evaluation of the OP should include:
- the content of the programs in the light of the latest scientific achievements in a particular discipline to ensure the relevance of the discipline taught;
  - changes in the needs of society and the professional environment;
  - workload, academic performance and graduation of students;

- the effectiveness of student assessment procedures;
- expectations, needs and satisfaction of students with EP training;
- the educational environment and support services and their relevance to the objectives of the LO.
- The management of the SE should demonstrate a systematic approach to monitoring and periodic assessment of the quality of the EP.
- The GO, the management of the SO should establish a mechanism for informing all stakeholders of any planned or taken actions in relation to the AO.
  - All changes made to the OP must be published.

#### **Evidence**

The university has determined the procedure for monitoring, analyzing and revising educational programs. Based on the results of the visit and the meetings held, the commission notes that the monitoring uses a feedback mechanism (survey, interview, questionnaire of students). Monitoring and periodic evaluation of the evaluated educational programs are aimed at achieving its goals, the full formation of the planned learning outcomes. Updating the content of the University's educational programs on a systematic basis is carried out with the participation of external experts and consumers of the EP represented by employers, representatives of large ICT companies, students and other stakeholders to adjust the EP. Continuous improvement of the content and structure of the EP is also carried out through the participation of teaching staff and students in the work of the collegial bodies of the University, the UMC, the Rectorate, on the agenda of which issues of improving the content and conditions for the implementation of the EP of the university are regularly considered. (considered at the meeting of the CS (Minutes No 8 of 10 of 31.03.22).

An accessible educational resource environment has been created for training, including computer equipment, software products - licensed and purchased, websites, computer classes, a reading room, a book fund, a fund of educational digital materials, etc.

Interviews with students showed that conditions are created for participation in competitions, competitions and subject Olympiads; student self-government bodies work; all conditions are created for research work.

Information about the planned and taken actions is available to all interested parties and is presented on the official website of the university. The information collected as a result of monitoring is analyzed and brought in line with modern requirements, the latest scientific achievements in a particular discipline, and the changing needs of society.

Educational programs submitted for accreditation are updated in connection with changes in the state compulsory standards of higher education and professional standards, the introduction of new directions and elective courses. Educational programmes are updated by the decision of the Academic Council in accordance with the requests of interested parties.

The monitoring and periodic evaluation of the assessed EPs were confirmed in the minutes of departmental meetings and the minutes of meetings of the Academic Council. An Institutional Research Plan of the University has been developed, in accordance with which a survey of students "Teacher through the eyes of students", "Satisfaction with the quality of teaching", etc. (Minutes of the Rectorate meeting No11 of 17.01.22; No 17 of 11.04.22; No 8 of 8.12.20; 9 of 21.12.20; No 16 of 4.05.21); Meeting of the International Council. (Minutes No 4 of 27.11.21).

The interviews showed that the university periodically monitors the satisfaction of teaching staff and students with the learning process as a whole, as well as the system of motivation for scientific achievements, overfulfillment of the teaching load, which is confirmed by a survey conducted by the EEC commission.

#### Analytical part

The analysis of the studied documents, as well as the results of interviews with students, teaching staff allowed us to conclude that the content of academic disciplines within the framework

of educational programs is subject to regular relevance. At the same time, it is noted that participants in educational relations and stakeholders are not specifically informed about the changes made to the EP. Only those stakeholders who initiated them are aware of the changes, since they are the ones who participate in the consideration of the updated EP at meetings of the academic committees and the Academic Council of the university, while other employers, students and faculty can only see the updated EP on the website without specifying which sections of the EP have been changed. During interviews with employers, students, and graduates, a desire was also expressed to increase the number of loans for guidance for undergraduates. The university staff noted that fewer credits are allocated for guidance in the master's degree than in the bachelor's degree, while the master's thesis is more laborious than the bachelor's thesis and is aimed at conducting research with the establishment of its scientific novelty.

The Commission found that changes are periodically made to the OP. However, during the interview, it turned out that interested parties are not always informed and are aware of the changes that are being made to the OP.

A survey of students conducted during the visit of the EEC IAAR showed that:

- the level of speed of response to feedback from teachers regarding the educational process is fully satisfactory - 72%; partially - 20%; 84% are completely satisfied with the quality of teaching.

#### Strengths/Best Practices:

Strengths have not been identified.

#### **EEC** Recommendations

The university administration should ensure that all stakeholders are informed about the changes made and planned to be made to the EP, with the ability to establish the nature of the decisions made on the website of the educational institution. The deadline is no later than two weeks from the date of making changes.

#### Conclusions of the EEC on the following criteria:

According to the standard "Constant monitoring and periodic evaluation of educational programs" satisfactory - 9, improvement -1 is expected.

# 6.5. Standard "Student-Centered Learning, Teaching and Assessment"

- The management of the EP should ensure respect and attention to various groups of students and their needs, providing them with flexible learning paths.
- The management of the EP should ensure the use of various forms and methods of teaching and learning.
- An important factor is the availability of our own research in the field of teaching methods of educational disciplines of educational programs.
- The management of the EP should demonstrate the existence of a feedback system on the use of various teaching methods and assessment of learning outcomes.
- The EP leadership must demonstrate support for the autonomy of learners while providing guidance and assistance from the teacher.
- The management of the program must demonstrate the existence of a procedure for responding to students' complaints.
- The PO should ensure that the learning outcome assessment mechanism for each EP, including appeal, is consistent, transparent and objective.
- The EI must ensure that the procedures for assessing the learning outcomes of students of the EP comply with the planned results and goals of the program, and that the criteria and methods

of assessment are published in advance.

- The EI should determine the mechanisms for ensuring the achievement of learning outcomes by each graduate of the EP and ensure the completeness of their formation.
- Assessors must be proficient in modern methods of assessing learning outcomes and regularly improve their qualifications in this area.

#### Evidence

AITU pursues a policy of individual, attentive and respectful attitude in its work with students, which is reflected in the relevant internal documents of the university - "Academic Policy", "Internal Quality Assurance System", "Rules for the Organization of the Educational Process on the Credit Technology of Education...", "Regulations on the Student Assessment System...", "Rules for Conducting the Final Certification of Students...".

In its activities, the university constantly supports students who take an active part in the activities of public organizations, students with special educational needs, foreign students, working youth, student athletes, as well as those who come from socially vulnerable groups of the population, annually providing them with assistance and discounts on tuition fees in accordance with the "Regulationm on the procedure for providing grants and discounts to students on a paid basis...". An interview conducted on April 18, 2024 with students of accredited EPs confirmed that the university takes into account the interests and needs of students in its work.

Academic streams and groups at the university are: study stream of 40..100 and academic groups of 15..20 students.

In order to maintain the quality of teaching at a high level, AITU has signed more than 50 memorandums of understanding and cooperation with foreign academic partners, including for joint research work with foreign partner universities.

Each accredited EP contains a QED indicating the purpose of the study, a brief content and the expected results of the study for each component. When choosing and signing up for an ED (creating an individual study plan), it will need to be linked to the AITU academic calendar.

Students' learning results are evaluated in AITU on a 100-point scale and are marked in the form of points. The final score for the discipline (from 0 to 100%) is equal to the sum of the current and mid-term control/boundary controls, in which the mid-term control is a maximum of 60% and the final control is a maximum of 40%.

Transfer, reinstatement, expulsion and granting of academic leave to students is regulated by the AITU "Rules for the Transfer, Restoration, Expulsion and Granting of Academic Leave to Students...".

The university regularly organizes advanced training for the teaching staff of accredited EPs in the field of modern methods of assessing learning outcomes, which is confirmed by the relevant certificates.

To manage, control, record and analyze educational processes, AITU has developed and uses a corporate information system "Digital University", which stores data on students, curricula, including individual curriculum, and other academic information of the university.

### Analytical part

Based on the analysis of the documents, visits, meetings and surveys provided by AITU, the commission concludes that students are the main participants in the implementation of accredited EPs and their interests and requests for ensuring the quality of the educational process are taken into account by the university in the first place.

The management of accredited EPs provides equal opportunities for students to form an individual educational program aimed at forming professional competencies, skills and learning outcomes in EP.

Each student at AITU has the opportunity to form an individual educational trajectory within the framework of the EP and prepare individual curricula by asking for help from advisors.

Faculty members of specialized departments use various forms and methods of training in

their activities - lectures, seminars, practical classes, office hours, case-study, independent and group projects and term papers, research projects that allow you to gain knowledge and instill skills through self-study and many active methods and new approaches to teaching.

The university takes the necessary measures to ensure that persons assessing the knowledge and skills of students have modern methods of assessing the results of their learning.

Periodic questioning of students at AITU is an important component of the feedback mechanism with them. During the session, before the start of each exam, as well as when necessary, an anonymous survey of students is carried out using the university's website online.

The Commission notes that there is its own information system developed by the university, which stores data on students, curricula and other data, which can be independently and easily adapted to changes in the procedures of the university's activities. The point system used in AITU is well known and understandable to students, as it is described in the "Regulations on the Student Assessment System...", which is published on the university's website, and during the sessions, the appeal committees are ready to consider students' applications.

If necessary, the student can always ask for advice, suggestions and/or complaints from the student public organization, the curator of the group, the dean, the head of the department, or through the website - the rector of AITU.

A great help is the university's information system "Digital University", with the help of which the dean's office, teaching staff and students are always aware of current academic success.

### Strengths:

Strengths have not been identified.

# Recommendations of the EEC:

There are none.

Conclusions of the EEC on the following criteria:

According to the standard "Student-centered learning, teaching and assessment" satisfactory - 10.

# 6.6. Standard "Students"

- The EI must demonstrate the existence of a policy for the formation of the contingent of students in the context of the EP, ensure the transparency and publication of its procedures regulating the life cycle of students (from admission to completion).
- The management of the EP should determine the procedure for the formation of the contingent of students based on:
  - minimum requirements for applicants;
  - maximum group size for seminar, practical, laboratory and studio classes;
  - forecasting the number of government grants;
  - analysis of available material and technical, information resources, human resources;
- analysis of potential social conditions for students, including the provision of places in the dormitory.
- The leadership of the program must demonstrate its readiness to conduct special adaptation and support programs for newly enrolled and foreign students.
- The NGO must demonstrate the compliance of its actions with the Lisbon Recognition Convention, the existence of a mechanism for the recognition of the results of academic mobility of students, as well as the results of additional, formal and non-formal education.
- The PO should cooperate with other educational organisations and national centres of the "European Network of National Information Centres for Academic Recognition and Mobility/National Academic Recognition Information Centres" ENIC/NARIC in order to ensure comparable recognition of qualifications.

- The EI should provide opportunities for external and internal mobility of students of the EP, as well as readiness to assist them in obtaining external grants for training.
- The management of the EP must demonstrate readiness to provide students with internships, promote the employment of graduates, and maintain contact with them.
- The EI should provide for the possibility of providing EP graduates with documents confirming the qualifications obtained, including the learning outcomes achieved, as well as the context, content and status of the education received and evidence of its completion.

#### Evidence

For all persons interested in admission to AITU, the university publishes and updates on its website and on web resources detailed information about accredited programs and how the learning process itself is organized from admission to graduation:

Instagram: https://www.instagram.com/astana\_it\_university/

Youtube: <a href="https://www.youtube.com/channel/UCRUN152kvKPdLiYvcpOyFkQ">https://www.youtube.com/channel/UCRUN152kvKPdLiYvcpOyFkQ</a> <a href="https://www.facebook.com/Astana-It-University-103800431081389">https://www.youtube.com/channel/UCRUN152kvKPdLiYvcpOyFkQ</a> <a href="https://www.facebook.com/Astana-It-University-103800431081389">https://www.facebook.com/Astana-It-University-103800431081389</a>

Telegram: @AITUMailingBOT

Youtube: <a href="https://www.youtube.com/c/AITUStudents">https://www.youtube.com/c/AITUStudents</a>

AITU accepts documents and enrolls future students in accordance with the "Model Rules for Admission to Study in Educational Organizations Implementing Educational Programs of Higher and Postgraduate Education... RK" No17650 dated October 31, 2018, "Rules for admission ... for undergraduate educational programs" of the university and in accordance with the AITU Development Strategy for 2020-25.

The process of admission and issuance of documents for applicants to the university is carried out by the AITU Admission Committee, and the transfer of students from one course (year of study) is carried out by the Dean's Office of the university.

AITU forms academic groups based on: (a) the number of state educational grants received, (b) the provision of EPs with qualified personnel in the areas of training, (c) the sufficiency of material and technical resources, (d) the availability of social conditions for future students.

Forecasting the contingent for the upcoming academic year is carried out by the heads of the EP together with the dean's office. Now the number of students in academic groups of accredited EPs is 15..20 students.

Material and technical support (tables, desks, blackboards in classrooms) of the learning process is entrusted to the Department of Economic Work of AITU, and the results of its activities are regularly considered at meetings of the rectorate and the Academic Council of the university.

At the beginning of each academic year, AITU organizes an introductory week for novice students, including a club fair, information meetings, round tables, and for foreign students - excursions around the university, around the city, round tables to get acquainted with the identity and culture of Kazakhstani society.

During this time, students get acquainted with the basics of the academic environment, with the structure of the university, with the Internal Regulations, the Rules of Academic Integrity, mechanisms for recognizing the results of learning in formal and non-formal education and other internal regulatory documents.

A tour of Astana equips foreign students with basic knowledge about the infrastructure, the location of socially significant cultural and entertainment facilities of the city.

AITU applies the technology of transferable credits in the educational process in accordance with the Bologna Declaration of 18-19.06.1999 and for this purpose has the required regulatory framework - "Academic Policy", "Regulations on Academic Mobility", "Rules for the Organization of the Educational Process on Credit Technology of Education...", "Rules for the Recognition of Learning Outcomes in Formal and Non-Formal Education".

The Department of International Cooperation of AITU coordinates the international academic activities of the university, including the academic mobility of students. The assessment and recognition of academic results of mobility is carried out by the Commission for the

Recognition of Learning Outcomes of Formal and Non-Formal Education of VHI.

The university actively promotes the academic mobility of students of accredited programs by concluding numerous cooperation agreements with national and foreign universities.

An important factor is the financing of academic mobility of students and at AITU it is carried out from the budget of the Republic of Kazakhstan, extra-budgetary funds of the university, grants, social partners, international funds, host country funds, grants from international organizations and private foundations, as well as from the personal funds of students.

The meeting of the EEC and the dialogue with students revealed a certain disproportion in the opportunities of master's students of the 'Digital Public Administration and Services' and 'Media Services' bachelor's programmes to take advantage of academic mobility compared to other bachelor's programmes in the accredited cluster.

The decision on ECTS credit/transfer of training courses, IEP, as well as those due to the academic mobility of students, is entrusted to the office of the AITU registrar.

One of the important components of the EP is the practice of students. In order to provide internship places for students under accredited EPs, AITU makes significant efforts to establish and maintain long-term relationships with such leading specialized organizations of Astana as National Information Technologies JSC, Digital Transformation PF, National Information Technologies JSC, Baiterek National Management Holding JSC, Digital Government Support Center of the Ministry of Digital Development and Aerospace Industry of the Republic of Kazakhstan, RSE on REM "Engineering and Technical Center of Administrative Affairs" President of the Republic of Kazakhstan Housing Company". JSC "National Company Kazakhstan Temir Zholy", JSC "Kazpost", RSE on REM "Institute of Information and Computing Technologies" of the Science Committee of the Ministry of Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan, etc.

Graduates of accredited EPs get a job based on the "Rules for Sending a Specialist to Work" and the Law "On Education" of the Republic of Kazakhstan. At the same time, AITU helps them find a job and these issues, as well as maintaining ties with graduates, is actively engaged in the university CCT.

Upon completion of formal and informal education at AITU, the graduate receives a diploma of the sample established by the regulations of the Republic of Kazakhstan and an appendix that lists the EP with the results, and if he has not completed the training - Academic transcript in Kazakh, English and Russian.

#### Analytical part

AITU forms the contingent of students under accredited EPs transparently and in accordance with the current legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan. AITU publishes university procedures for the formation of the contingent, as well as requirements for future students, both on its official website and on web resources popular among young people, which ensures their availability to all interested parties.

The formation of the contingent for accredited EPs and study groups at AITU is carried out through the optimal combination of educational grants received, the availability of qualified faculty, material, technical and social resources of the university, with the achievement of a sufficient level of financial profitability.

The university takes measures to quickly and effectively adapt, support and involve its applicants, including foreign ones, in the academic life of AITU and society.

In order to take into account the results of formal and non-formal education, AITU uses the technology of transferable credits, in accordance with the Bologna Declaration and the Lisbon Convention on the Existence of a Mechanism for the Recognition of the Results of Academic Mobility of Students. In this area, AITU closely cooperates with the Bologna Process and Academic Mobility Center of the Ministry of Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

As part of interviews with students, it was found that the number of academic mobility programs for master's students is significantly less than for bachelor's programs, which reduces

the ability of undergraduates to participate more actively in such programs with a fairly high demand for academic mobility on their part.

The University makes significant efforts to establish long-term relations with leading specialized organizations and enterprises to provide adequate places of practice for students in accredited EPs.

As a rule, these leading specialized organizations in the future become employers for graduates under accredited EPs, which is mutually beneficial for students, organizations, and enterprises.

Upon graduation, an AITU graduate receives a national-recognized document or transcript in several languages, including English.

#### Strengths/Best Practices:

Strengths have not been identified.

# Recommendations of the EEC:

The university administration should develop a plan for academic mobility of undergraduates of the bachelor's programs "Digital Public Administration and Services" and "Media Services", which provides for an annual increase in the number of students participating in mobility - until September 30, 2024.

# Conclusions of the EEC on the following criteria: According to the standard "Students" satisfactory - 12.

# 6.7. Standard "Teaching Staff"

- The NGO should have an objective and transparent personnel policy, including in the context of the OP, including recruitment, professional growth and development of personnel, ensuring the professional competence of the entire staff.
- The NGO must demonstrate the relevance of the staffing potential of the faculty to the specifics of the OP.
- The management of the SE must demonstrate an awareness of responsibility for its employees and the provision of favorable working conditions for them.
- The management of the EP must demonstrate a change in the role of the teacher in connection with the transition to student-centered education.
- The NGO should determine the contribution of the Faculty of Educational Programs to the implementation of the development strategy of the NGO, and other strategic documents.
- The EI should provide opportunities for career growth and professional development of the teaching staff of the EP.
- The leadership of the EP must demonstrate a willingness to involve practitioners in the relevant fields in teaching.
- The EI should demonstrate the motivation for the professional and personal development of EP teachers, including encouragement for the integration of scientific activities and education, the use of innovative teaching methods.
- An important factor is the readiness to develop academic mobility within the framework of the EP, to attract the best foreign and domestic teachers.

#### **Evidence**

The teaching staff is the main resource for the implementation of the mission of AITU. In order to effectively manage the teaching staff of accredited EPs, the university has set itself the task of being effective in planning, selecting, hiring, evaluating, retraining, paying and stimulating the work of its faculty.

In order to implement the personnel policy of the teaching staff, AITU has created a corporate regulatory framework - "Personnel Policy..", "Rules for Competitive Replacement of Positions of the Teaching Staff...", "Regulations on Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) of Teaching Staff and Employees...", "Regulations on Competitive Selection for High-Research Teacher Positions...", "Regulations on the System of Remuneration and Incentives for Labor and Social Support of Employees...".

AITU has the following teaching positions: Professor, Associate Professor, Senior Lecturer, Lecturer. In addition to them, the University has introduced the positions: High-research teacher and Research teacher, defining the qualification requirements for them.

The university hires faculty on a competitive basis, and their selection is dictated by the needs of the programme. The competition commission, its powers and term of action are approved by the rector of the university. Information about the competition, requirements for the experience and qualifications of the participant, documents submitted to the competition, and other data are published on the AITU website.

The Departments of accredited EPs employ faculty members who have received education or improved their qualifications in a number of prestigious higher educational institutions around the world – Mississippi State University, National University of Singapore, Illinois University of Chicago, London City University, Communication University of China, NIMS University of Jaipur, College University of London, etc.

AITU systematically attracts scientists and teachers of the Republic of Kazakhstan to conduct guest lectures, training seminars and master classes with students of the EP.

The conditions necessary for work - workplace, computer, Internet, equipment, tools, literature and technical documentation, access to the Web of Science database, Scopus, etc., are available attributes provided by the university to each faculty.

The student-centered education practiced by AITU has resulted in the modular structure of accredited EPs and the fact that teaching staff actively use interactive and problem-based methods, as well as new teaching methods - the "flipped classroom"; group, programmed, individual, communicative forms; interdisciplinary learning, STEM teaching methods, etc.

Periodic advanced training or internship of teaching staff organized by AITU is carried out at the university itself, teaching staff are sent to other universities or to specialized training centers of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

In order to link the knowledge gained at the university with practice, AITU attracts (part-time) teachers or specialists with experience from the companies "E-Commerce Center", "Ditum Group" and "Advanced Payment Solutions", "Facility Construction Directorate".

For the same purpose, the university periodically organizes webinars, where speakers from technology companies and scientific organizations from the IT industry of the Republic of Kazakhstan are invited.

AITU financially encourages teaching staff engaged in research and publishing scientific articles, monographs, textbooks, electronic textbooks, in accordance with the "Regulation on Stimulating Teaching Staff and the Remuneration System for Research Achievements" of the university.

At AITU, the academic mobility of teaching staff is focused primarily on inviting foreign scientists to the university, who conduct classes with students, master classes, and joint research. The mobility of the university's faculty includes the departure of teachers to international conferences.

#### Analytical part

AITU pursues a transparent policy of planning, selecting, hiring, evaluating, retraining, remunerating and stimulating the work of its faculty in accordance with corporate regulatory documents.

The university manages the human resources of teaching staff based on its development strategy, taking into account the characteristics of accredited educational programs, using certification of teaching staff, control visits to classes, sociological surveys of students, etc.

By involving a number of teaching staff who graduated from the world's leading universities in teaching EP, AITU improves both the quality and relevance of the disciplines taught in EP, and the authority of the EPs themselves.

It should be noted here that after the update of the Media Technologies Educational Program, it will be necessary to bring its personnel potential in line with the updates made to it.

Student-centered education at AITU has modified both the structure of the EP and the didactic teaching methods that use the teaching staff of the analyzed EPs. The university has taken measures to improve the qualifications of teaching staff in new teaching methods.

In addition to a workplace with everything necessary for work, AITU provides employees with a number of health care services, sports, provides teaching staff with the opportunity to live in service apartments of the university, as well as discounts on tuition fees for members of the teaching staff family.

AITU attracts specialists with practical experience of part-time work or as participants in webinars in the process of studying for accredited EPs.

AITU teaching staff are actively engaged in research activities and, as a result, their publication activity is high. This is facilitated by competitions for grant and program-targeted financing of the Ministry of Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan, as well as the wide participation of the university's faculty in national and international projects.

AITU creates the necessary conditions for the personal development of teaching staff by conducting advanced training courses, seminars, webinars, as well as training employees to work with modern domestic and foreign sources of scientific information.

At the same time, a survey of students revealed that a number of young teachers who teach disciplines within the framework of the EP do not always clearly explain the course program, use insufficiently effective teaching methods and do not always present the course material attractively to students, which was also noted by the EEC members after attending classes according to the schedule.

# Strengths:

Strengths have not been identified.

#### Recommendations of the EEC:

The management of accredited EPs should develop and implement measures aimed at systematic support and development of methodological and pedagogical competencies of young teachers. Deadline - until August 01, 2025.

#### Conclusions of the EEC on the following criteria:

According to the "Teaching Staff" standard, 8 satisfactory are satisfactory, 1 is expected to improve.

#### 6.8. Standard "Educational Resources and Student Support Systems"

- The EI should ensure that there are sufficient learning resources and student support services to ensure that the goal of the EI is achieved.
- The EI must demonstrate the sufficiency of material and technical resources and infrastructure, taking into account the needs of various groups of students in the context of the EP (adults, workers, foreign students, as well as students with disabilities).

- The EP management should demonstrate that there are procedures in place to support different groups of learners, including information and counselling.
- The management of the SE must demonstrate the compliance of information resources with the specifics of the SE, including:
- technological support for students and faculty (e.g., online learning, modeling, databases, data analysis programs);
- library resources, including a fund of educational, methodological and scientific literature on general education, basic and major disciplines on paper and electronic media, periodicals, access to scientific databases;
- examination of the results of research work, graduation works, dissertations for plagiarism;
  - access to educational Internet resources;
  - the functioning of WI-FI on the territory of the educational organization.
- The NGO demonstrates the planning of providing educational equipment and software similar to those used in the relevant sectors of the economy.

#### Evidence

AITU is located at the address: Astana, Mangilik El Avenue, building 55/11 EXPO pavilion C1. The university has a single educational and scientific complex, which, on the basis of trust management, includes an educational building, three dormitories for students and two houses for teaching staff and employees. The total area of the building is 37.6 thousand square meters (of which 18 thousand square meters are educational). The university dormitories are designed for 734 places.

AITU has 8 lecture and 27 classrooms, 37 computer classes, 17 educational and 4 specialized laboratories (Cisco, Huawei, Kaspersky, FabLab), which correspond to the number of students in the EP being implemented. Each academic building of AITU is equipped with a ramp, railings and a help call button for people with disabilities.

All classrooms of the university are equipped with tables, chairs, whiteboards, projectors, computer equipment and audio-video systems, as well as a modern Media Center with a television and radio broadcasting studio.

Nevertheless, the Higher Attestation Commission believes that the university will need to draw up a certain plan for updating the already used furniture from the lecture halls and bring it in line with the sanitary and hygienic requirements for the organization of the educational process of the EP.

The total number of computers in AITU is 1210 units. The university is equipped with IP telephony with a virtual PBX covering 120 IP phones.

All academic buildings of the university have the Internet, which is provided to students through corporate WiFi access points.

The territory of AITU is guarded, access to the inside of classrooms and laboratories is limited and is carried out by individual passes.

For the duration of their studies, each student at AITU receives individual access to books and library files, to the corporate information system "Digital University" and to the training materials of the university's LMS Moodle server.

To solve any question that has arisen in the field of study, such as how to develop an individual curriculum or how to enroll in courses, the student contacts the curator of the group, the dean's office, the office of the Registrar, the DAD or the VHI, and if the issue is related to the dormitory or the health of the student, the Social and Educational Department or the health center of the university.

In case of missing classes for a good reason, the dean's office can extend the deadlines for passing midterm and current tests, and if a student has a low GPA, he can re-study the discipline in an additional semester. The dean's office, in turn, monitors the results of midterm and current controls of students in order to prevent the occurrence of academic problems among students.

The LMS Moodle platform is the most important element for interactive interaction between the teacher and the student throughout the entire course of study. Students and teaching staff have access to it through their account both from inside and outside the premises of the university. On this platform, course tasks are carried out, resources are exchanged, the level of knowledge of the student is assessed, etc.

AITU annually subscribes to the electronic information resources of EBSCO (4 sets of scientific journals and 5 sets of e-books) and RLIES.

In addition to its own collection of books and e-books, the university library provides students and faculty with personal access to information sources such as Scopus, Web of Science, Science Direct, IEEE, Wiley Online Library, Directory of Open Access Journals and open access to zbMath, DOAJ, Openu.kz, ASEE, Annual Reviews, ArXiv.org, DOAB, etc.

To eliminate the dishonesty of students, with the help of the Strike Plaghiat platform, AITU checks all written and graduate works of students for plagiarism.

The AITU administration leaves to the relevant Department the decision to order specific hardware and software necessary for the retrofitting of the subdivision.

## Analytical part

The administration of AITU has made and continues to make significant efforts to provide the university with spacious, illuminated, protected, equipped and comfortable areas for the educational process and research.

AITU academic buildings provide students with convenient and fast access to the Internet and thereby to university information systems and information resources for learning.

Educational buildings and dormitories of the university comply with the sanitary and hygienic requirements of the Republic of Kazakhstan for the organization of the educational process of the EP.

As a result of the analysis of the internal regulatory documents of the university, regulating the procedure for organizing educational activities, certification, it was established that there is no information on the organization of such procedures for people with disabilities. In addition, it is noted that in order to ensure the accessibility of the educational environment for people with disabilities, certain changes in the infrastructure of the university are also necessary.

In an interview with students of accredited OCs, they noted the inconvenience of remote access to the electronic resources of the library system, as well as restrictions due to the reduced schedule of the library on Saturday.

The management of accredited EPs, together with other AITU structures, monitor the progress of students of EPs and take the necessary measures to support them.

At AITU, all written works of students must be checked for plagiarism.

# Strengths/Best Practices:

Strengths have not been identified.

#### Recommendations of the EEC:

The university administration should consider the possibility of organizing students' access to the library's information resources outside of school hours, including remotely. Deadline - September 01, 2024.

The management of the NGO should supplement the internal regulatory documents of the university, regulating the procedure for organizing educational activities, with sections in relation to persons with special educational needs, including persons with students with disabilities, as well as draw up an action plan to ensure the accessibility of the educational environment for such students. Deadline - until February 01, 2025.

#### Conclusions of the EEC on the following criteria:

According to the standard "Educational Resources and Student Support Systems",

## satisfactory - 8, requiring improvement - 1.

### 6.9. The "Public Information" Standard

- The NGO must publish reliable, objective, up-to-date information about the educational program and its specifics, which should include:
  - the expected learning outcomes of the educational program being implemented;
- qualification and (or) qualifications that will be awarded upon completion of the educational program;
- approaches to teaching, learning, as well as the system (procedures, methods and forms) of assessment;
  - information about passing scores and learning opportunities provided to students;
  - information on employment opportunities for graduates.
- The management of the OP should provide for a variety of ways to disseminate information, including the media, information networks to inform the general public and stakeholders.
- Public awareness should include support and explanation of the country's national development programmes and the system of higher and postgraduate education.
- The NGO must demonstrate the reflection on the web resource of information characterizing it as a whole and in the context of educational programs.
- An important factor is the availability of adequate and objective information about the teaching staff of the EP.
- An important factor is to inform the public about cooperation and interaction with partners within the OP.

# Evidence

AITU publishes information about the university and informs persons interested in information about accredited programs, guided by the corporate document – "Regulation on the AITU Information Policy".

The main technical means of informing is the corporate website in Kazakh, Russian and English. Here you can find most of the required information on the university and accredited EPs. The content is published on the AITU website in accordance with the corporate document - "Coverage of activities through the website, social networks and other media".

The AITU website contains information about academic opportunities, the educational process, information about the employment opportunities of graduates, the functions of the university's departments, vacancies and internships for students, as well as information about the university's partners, and much more.

In addition to the website and for the same purpose, the university actively uses social networks popular among young people: Facebook, Instagram University, Instagram College, Telegram, Youtube, TikTok.

In particular, the university's website contains information about each accredited programme:

7M04104 Digital Public Administration and Services

7M06107 Media Technologies

8D04101 Project Management

8D06101 Computer Science,

where you can find a description of the EP, its goals and objectives, a general description of the subjects studied, how exactly learning outcomes are assessed, what are the qualifications assigned to a graduate of the EP and what are their career opportunities, etc.

The main page of the university's website reflects the relationship between the goals and objectives of AITU and the national development program "Digital Kazakhstan".

The VHI is responsible for the formation of priorities of the information policy and plans for its implementation, for the completeness and efficiency of information, the development of

existing and the search for new media, as well as for monitoring the media in order to adjust the information activities of AITU.

The VHI annually approves a plan for covering the university's events for the corresponding academic year.

For convenience, the key departments of AITU have their own separate pages on the website to track the content published on the website, it is classified into categories – news, reputation, communication, entertainment and selling.

Information about educational grants, selection criteria and student applicants is published in the "Student Service Center" section and duplicated in the news feed of the main page of the AITU website.

AITU press releases published in regional, republican and international media should be considered an additional technical means of informing the university. The partners of the university in the implementation of the information policy are: PF "Nursultan Nazarbayev Educational Foundation", QAZEXPOCONGRESS, JSC "National Infocommunication Holding "Zerde", with which memorandums of cooperation have been concluded.

Information about the main partners of AITU in accredited educational programs - Qazaq Cybersport Federation and Academy Esports LLP, Kolesa Group, Lenovo Kazakhstan, Qaztech Ventures JSC, HP Branch, Asbis Kazakhstan LLP, Chocofamily Group, KPMG, EPAM Kazakhstan, Senim Group of Companies, Nitec, KazInfoSystems, Kazinfosystems, Canvas Technologies, Intetics, Akvelon, Korkem telecom, Epam Kazakhstan, Tsarka, TTC Transtelecom, Kazdream technologies, Zerde PF and others and forms of multifaceted cooperation is presented on the pages of science, the Career Center and VHI of the university's website.

# Analytical part

The official website of AITU is the main tool of the university for reliable, objective and upto-date informing the public about the accredited EPs – goals and objectives, subjects studied, methods for assessing learning outcomes, qualifications awarded and career opportunities of the graduate.

The information presented on the university website is well structured and up-to-date, the user interface is easy to navigate and quickly find the required data.

Nevertheless, the EEC believes that the information on the accredited EP presented on the AITU website should be supplemented with a list of disciplines, as well as information about teachers, courses taught by them, their work experience, field of scientific activity, and information about their publication activity. This information is not publicly available and is available only to authorized users from among the employees and students of the university.

Also, based on the recommendation of the EEC on Standard 3 to clarify the professional qualifications of the EP "Media Technologies", the management of the EP will need to bring the description of the expected learning outcomes published in the "Learning Outcomes" section of the university's website into line with the learning outcomes from the updated EP "Media Technologies".

In addition to the website, AITU uses social networks that are popular among young people. The university also actively cooperates with regional, republican and international media to inform the public about its activities.

Those interested in information about partners (organizations, universities, etc.) with whom AITU cooperates in the context of accredited programs, as well as about specific forms of this cooperation, can find it on the university's website.

#### Strengths/Best Practices:

Strengths have not been identified.

#### Recommendations of the EEC:

Align the description of the expected learning outcomes published in the Learning Outcomes

on the official website of the university with the updated learning outcomes from the Media Technologies EP. Deadline: September 01, 2024.

By the end of the 2023-2024 academic year, the university administration should provide **all stakeholders with access** to complete and up-to-date information about the faculty on the official website of the university, including: a list of disciplines taught, work experience, field of scientific activity, information on publication activity, etc.

Conclusions of the EEC on the following criteria:

According to the "Public Information" standard ,  $\bf 8$  satisfactory are satisfactory, and  $\bf 2$  require improvement.

for the EP "7M04104 Digital Public Administration and Services", "8D04101 Project Management", "8D06101 Computer Science": satisfactory – 9, expected improvement – 1; according to the EP "7M06107 Media Technologies": satisfactory - 8, improvement -2 is expected.

### (VII) OVERVIEW OF STRENGTHS/BEST PRACTICES FOR EACH STANDARD

#### Strengths/Best Practices

# According to the "Educational Program Management" standard:

The EP management has developed logically structured and content-filled EP development programs, which provide target indicators, time criteria and those responsible for their achievement, risk analysis and SWOT analysis.

According to the "Information Management and Reporting" standard:

Strengths have not been identified.

According to the standard "Development and approval of educational programs": Strengths have not been identified.

According to the standard "Continuous Monitoring and Periodic Evaluation of Educational Programs":

Strengths have not been identified.

According to the standard "Student-Centered Learning, Teaching and Assessment": Strengths have not been identified.

### According to the "Students" standard:

Strengths have not been identified.

# According to the standard "Teaching staff":

Strengths have not been identified.

According to the standard "Educational Resources and Student Support Systems": Strengths have not been identified.

# According to the "Public Information" standard:

Strengths have not been identified.

### (VIII) <u>OVERVIEW OF QUALITY IMPROVEMENT RECOMMENDATIONS FOR</u> <u>EACH STANDARD</u>

EEC Recommendations for EP 7M04104 Digital Public Administration and Services, 7M06107 Media Technologies, 8D04101 Project Management, 8D06101 Computer Science:

#### According to the standard "Management of the educational program"

Based on the SWOT analysis, the EP management should provide a section on the establishment of competitive or distinctive features of EPs in the structure of the EP Development Plan to determine their uniqueness, as well as the individuality of the EP development plans, their consistency with national priorities in the relevant areas of knowledge and the University Development Program until January 1, 2025.

#### According to the standard "Information Management and Reporting"

Heads of the programme should update information regarding the learning outcomes for each degree programme on the university's website at least once a year.

#### According to the standard "Development and approval of the educational program"

To bring the competencies reflected in the "Graduate Model" on the official website of the university into line with the graduate model from the "Media Technologies" program. Deadline - until 01.09.2024.

The management of the EP to clarify the professional qualification of EP 7M06107 Media Technologies, taking into account the level of education being implemented, and to bring the content of the EP in line with the learning outcomes and professional qualifications defined in the national qualification system of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Deadline - until 01.09.2024.

To bring the content of academic disciplines and the planned results of the EP in line with the revised professional qualifications. Deadline - until 01.09.2024.

## According to the standard "Continuous monitoring and periodic evaluation of educational programs"

The university administration should ensure that all stakeholders are informed about the changes made and planned to be made to the EP, with the ability to establish the nature of the decisions made on the website of the educational institution. The deadline is no later than two weeks from the date of making changes.

### According to the standard "Student-centered learning, teaching and assessment" None identified.

#### According to the "Students" standard

The university administration should develop a plan for academic mobility of undergraduates of the bachelor's programmes "Digital Public Administration and Services" and "Media Services", which provides for an annual increase in the number of students participating in mobility. Deadline - September 30, 2024.

#### According to the standard "Teaching staff"

The management of accredited EPs should develop and implement measures aimed at systematic support and development of methodological and pedagogical skills of young teachers. Deadline - until August 01, 2025.

#### According to the standard "Educational Resources and Student Support Systems"

The university administration should consider the possibility of organizing students' access to the library's information resources outside of school hours, including remotely - until September

01, 2024.

The management of the NGO should supplement the internal regulations of the university, which regulate the procedure for organizing educational activities, with sections in relation to persons with special educational needs, including persons with disabilities, as well as draw up an action plan to ensure the accessibility of the educational environment for such students. Deadline - until February 01, 2025.

#### According to the "Public Information" standard

The management of the programme should bring the description of the expected learning outcomes published in the 'Learning Outcomes' on the official website of the university in line with the updated learning outcomes from the 'Media Technologies' programme. Deadline: September 01, 2024.

By the end of the 2023-2024 academic year, the university administration should provide all stakeholders with access to complete and up-to-date information about the faculty on the official website of the university, including: a list of disciplines taught, work experience, field of scientific activity, information on publication activity, etc.

# OVERVIEW OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION

Not developed



#### RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE ACCREDITATION COUNCIL

The external expert commission made a unanimous decision to recommend to the Accreditation Council to accredit educational programs 7M04104 Digital Public Administration and Services, 7M06107 Media Technologies, 8D04101 Project Management, 8D06101 Computer Science of Astana IT University LLP for a period of 5 years.



# (IX) <u>Appendix 1. EVALUATION TABLE "PARAMETERS OF THE SPECIALIZED PROFILE"</u>

# Conclusion of the external expert commission on quality assessment educational programs 7M04104 Digital Public Administration and Services, 8D04101 Project Management, 8D06101 Computer Science Astana IT University LLP

No p\n	№ p\n	Evaluation criteria	Position of the educational organization			<b>;</b>
			Strong	Satisfying	Involves the improvement of	Unsatisfactory
Stan	dard 1 "	Management of the Educational Program'				
1	1.	The organization of higher and/or postgraduate education must have a published quality assurance policy that reflects the relationship between research, teaching and learning		+		
2	2.	The organization of higher and (or) postgraduate education must demonstrate the development of a culture of quality assurance, including in the context of EP		+		
3	3.	Commitment to quality assurance should apply to any activities carried out by contractors and partners (outsourcing), including the implementation of joint/double-degree education and academic mobility		+		
4	4.	The management of the OP demonstrates transparency in the development of the EP development plan, containing the timing of the start of implementation, based on the analysis of its functioning, the real positioning of the EP and the focus of its activities on meeting the needs of the state, employers, students and other stakeholders (include additional criteria in addition to the general criteria)		+		
5	5.	The management of the EP demonstrates the existence of mechanisms for the formation and regular review of the EP development plan and monitoring its implementation, assessing the achievement of learning goals, meeting the needs of students, employers and society, and making decisions aimed at continuous improvement of the EP	+	0		
6	6.	The management of the SE should involve representatives of stakeholder groups, including employers, students and faculty, in the formation of the EP development plan		+		
7	7.	The management of the EP must demonstrate the individuality and uniqueness of the EP development plan, its consistency with national priorities and the development strategy of the organization of higher and (or) postgraduate education			+	
8	8.	The organization of higher and (or) postgraduate education should demonstrate a clear definition of those responsible for business processes within the EP, an unambiguous distribution of staff responsibilities, and the delineation of functions of collegial bodies		+		
9	9.	The management of the programme must provide evidence of transparency in the management system of the educational programme		+		
10	10.	The management of the SOE must demonstrate the existence of an internal quality assurance system for the SO, including its design, management and monitoring, their improvement, and fact-based decision-making		+		
11	11.	The management of the SE should manage risks, including within the framework of the SE undergoing initial accreditation, as well as demonstrate a system of measures aimed at reducing the degree of risk		+		
12	12.	The management of the programme should ensure the participation of representatives of employers, faculty, students and other stakeholders in the		+		

	1		•	•	•	1
		composition of the collegial governing bodies of the educational				
		programme, as well as their representativeness in decision-making on the				
		management of the educational programme				
13	13.	The PO should demonstrate innovation management within the OP,		+		
		including the analysis and implementation of innovative proposals				
14	14.	The EP management must demonstrate evidence of readiness for openness		+		
1.	1 1.	and accessibility for students, faculty, employers and other stakeholders	55   +			
15	15.	The leadership of the EP should be trained in educational management				
13	13.			+		
		programs	4	10	-	
G.		Total according to the standard	1	13	1	
		Information Management and Reporting"				
16	1.	The GS should demonstrate that it has a system for collecting, analysing and		+		
		managing information using modern information and communication				
		technologies and software and that it uses a variety of methods to collect and				
		analyse information in the context of the LO				
17	2.	The management of the SOE must demonstrate that there is a mechanism		+		
		for the systematic use of processed, adequate information to improve the				
		internal quality assurance system				
18	3.	OP leadership should demonstrate fact-based decision-making		+		
19	4.	The state of the s				
19	4.	Within the framework of the EP, a system of regular reporting should be		+		
		provided, reflecting all levels of the structure, including an assessment of				
	ALC: N	the effectiveness and efficiency of the activities of divisions and				
		departments, scientific research				
20	5.	The EI should establish the frequency, forms and methods of assessing the		+		
		management of the EP, the activities of collegial bodies and structural units,				
		top management, and the implementation of scientific projects				
21	6.	The NGO must demonstrate the determination of the procedure and ensuring		+		
		the protection of information, including the identification of persons				
		responsible for the reliability and timeliness of information analysis and data	1			
	1	provision				
22	7.	An important factor is the availability of mechanisms for involving students,		7+		
22	/ ·	employees and teaching staff in the processes of collecting and analyzing				
				h		
22	0	information, as well as making decisions based on them				
23	8.	The management of the EP must demonstrate the existence of a mechanism		+		
	_	for communication with students, employees and other stakeholders, as well				
		as mechanisms for resolving conflicts				
24	9.	The PO should demonstrate that there are mechanisms in place to measure		+		
		the degree of satisfaction of the needs of faculty, staff and trainees within				
		the EP				
25	10.	The PA should provide for an assessment of the effectiveness and efficiency		+		
	1	of activities, including in the context of the OP				
		The information to be collected and analyzed within the framework of the				
	1	OP should take into account:				
26	11.	Key Performance Indicators		+		
27	12.	dynamics of the contingent of students in the context of forms and types		+		
28	13.	Academic Achievement, Student Achievement, and Expulsion		+		
29	14.					
<u> </u>	14.	students' satisfaction with the implementation of the EP and the quality of		+		
20	1.5	education at the university				
30	15.	Availability of educational resources and support systems for students		+		
31	16.	The NGO must confirm the implementation of procedures for processing the		+		
		personal data of students, employees and teaching staff on the basis of their				
		documentary consent				
		Total according to the standard	0	16	0	
Stan	dard 3 "	Development and Approval of the Educational Program"				
32	1.	The PA should define and document the procedures for the development of		+		
		the OP and their approval at the institutional level				
33	2.	The management of the EP should ensure that the content of the EP is		+		
		consistent with the established goals, including the expected learning		'		
		outcomes				
34	3.	The management of the OP must demonstrate the existence of mechanisms		<del>  .</del>		
J4	٥.			+		
		for revising the content and structure of the OP, taking into account changes				

		in the labor market, the requirements of employers and the social demand of				
35	4.	The management of the EP should ensure the availability of developed		+		
		models of the EP graduate, describing the results of learning and personal qualities				
36	5.	The management of the SE must demonstrate the conduct of external examinations of the content of the EP and the planned results of its		+		
37	6.	implementation  Qualifications awarded at the end of the EP should be clearly defined and				
		correspond to a certain level of NSC and QF-EHEA		+		
38	7.	The management of the EP should determine the impact of disciplines and professional practices on the formation of learning outcomes		+		
39	8.	An important factor is the possibility of preparing students for professional certification (IS)		+		
40	9.	The management of the EP must provide evidence of the participation of students, faculty and other stakeholders in the development of the EP and ensuring its quality		+		
41	10.	The management of the EP must ensure that the content of academic		+		
		disciplines and the planned results correspond to the level of study (bachelor's, master's, doctoral studies)				
42	11.	The structure of the EP should provide for various types of activities that ensure the achievement of the planned learning outcomes by students		+		
43	12.	An important factor is the correspondence of the content of the EP and the		+		
		learning outcomes of the EP implemented by higher and (or) postgraduate education organizations in the EHEA				
		Total according to the standard	0	12	0	
	dard 4 rams''	"Continuous Monitoring and Periodic Evaluation of Educational				
44	1.	The EI should determine the mechanisms for monitoring and periodic		+		
	1 /	evaluation of the EP to ensure the achievement of the goal and meet the				
		needs of students, society and show the focus of the mechanisms on the continuous improvement of the EP	-0			
		Monitoring and periodic evaluation of the OP should include:				
45	2.	the content of the program in the light of the latest scientific achievements in a particular discipline to ensure the relevance of the discipline taught		+		
46	3.	changes in the needs of society and the professional environment		+		
47	4.	workload, academic performance and graduation of students		+		
48	5.	Effectiveness of Student Assessment Procedures		+		
49	6.	expectations, needs and satisfaction of students with EP training		+		
50	7.	the educational environment and support services, and their relevance to the objectives of the EP		+		
51	8.	The management of the SE should demonstrate a systematic approach to monitoring and periodic assessment of the quality of the EP		+		
52	9.	The GO, the management of the SO should establish a mechanism for		+		
		informing all stakeholders of any planned or taken actions in relation to the LO				
53	10.	All changes made to the OP must be published			+	
G:	1 1	Total according to the standard	0	9	1	
Stand 54	dard 5 '' 1.	Student-centered learning, teaching and assessment'  The management of the EP should ensure respect and attention to various				
		groups of students and their needs, provide them with flexible learning paths		+		
55	2.	The EP management should provide for the use of various forms and methods of teaching and learning		+		
56	3.	An important factor is the availability of our own research in the field of teaching methods of educational disciplines of EP		+		
57	4.	The management of the EP should demonstrate the existence of feedback		+		
		mechanisms on the use of various teaching methodologies and assessment of learning outcomes				
58	5.	The management of the EP must demonstrate the existence of mechanisms		+		
		to support the autonomy of students with simultaneous guidance and assistance from the teacher				

59	6.	The management of the EP must demonstrate the existence of a procedure for responding to students' complaints		+		
60	7.	The PO should ensure consistency, transparency and objectivity of the		+		
61	8.	learning outcome assessment mechanism for each EP, including the appeal The EI must ensure that the procedures for assessing the learning outcomes				
01	0.	of students of the EP comply with the planned results and goals of the		+		
		program, and that the criteria and methods of assessment are published in				
		advance				
62	9.	The EI should determine the mechanisms for ensuring the achievement of		+		
		learning outcomes by each graduate of the EP and ensure the completeness				
		of their formation				
63	10.	Assessors must be proficient in modern methods of assessing learning outcomes and regularly improve their qualifications in this area		+		
		Total according to the standard	0	10	0	
Stand	dard 6 "	Students"	U	10	U	
64	1.	The EI must demonstrate the existence of a policy for the formation of the		+		
		contingent of students in the context of the EP, ensure the transparency and				
		publication of its procedures governing the life cycle of students (from				
		admission to completion)				
	1	The management of the EP should determine the procedure for the				
65	2.	formation of the contingent of students based on: minimum requirements for applicants		+		
66	3.	maximum group size for seminar, practical, laboratory and studio classes		-		
67	4.	forecasting the number of state grants		+		
68	5.	analysis of available material and technical, information resources, human		+		
00	5.	resources		+		
69	6.	analysis of potential social conditions for students, including the provision		+		
		of places in the dormitory		B.		
70	7.	The leadership of the EP must demonstrate readiness to conduct special		+		
		adaptation and support programs for newly enrolled and foreign students				
71	8.	The EI must demonstrate the compliance of its actions with the Lisbon		+		
		Recognition Convention, the existence of a mechanism for the recognition of the results of academic mobility of students, as well as the results of				
	,	additional, formal and non-formal education				
72	9.	The PO should cooperate with other educational organizations and national		+		
		centres of the "European Network of National Information Centres for				
		Academic Recognition and Mobility/National Academic Recognition				
		Information Centres" ENIC/NARIC in order to ensure comparable				
73	10.	recognition of qualifications  The EI should provide an opportunity for external and internal mobility of				
13	10.	students of the EP, as well as readiness to assist them in obtaining external	1	+		
	1	grants for training				
74	11.	The management of the EP must demonstrate its readiness to provide		+		
		students with internship places, promote the employment of graduates, and				
7.	10	maintain contact with them				
75	12.	The EI should provide for the possibility of providing EP graduates with documents confirming the qualification obtained, including the learning		+		
		outcomes achieved, as well as the context, content and status of the				
		education received and evidence of its completion				
		Total according to the standard	0	12	0	
		Teaching Staff"				
76	1.	The NGO should have an objective and transparent personnel policy,			+	
		including in the context of the OP, including recruitment, professional growth and development of personnel, ensuring the professional				
		competence of the entire staff				
77	2.	The NGO must demonstrate the compliance of the staffing potential of the		+		
		faculty with the specifics of the OP				
78	3.	The management of the SE must demonstrate an awareness of responsibility		+		
=-	<u> </u>	for its employees and the provision of favorable working conditions for them				
79	4.	The leadership of the programme must demonstrate a change in the role of		+		
		the teacher in connection with the transition to student-centred learning				

80	5.	The NGO should determine the contribution of the teaching staff of the SE		+		
		to the implementation of the development strategy of the NGO, and other				
		strategic documents				
81	6.	The NGO should provide opportunities for career growth and professional				
01	0.			+		
	_	development of the teaching staff of the EP				
82	7.	The leadership of the EP must demonstrate its readiness to involve		+		
		practitioners from the relevant sectors of the economy in teaching				
83	8.	The EI must demonstrate the motivation for the professional and personal		+		
		development of EP teachers, including encouragement for the integration of				
		scientific activities and education, the use of innovative teaching methods				
84	9.	An important factor is the readiness to develop academic mobility within the		+		
0.	· ·	framework of the EP, to attract the best foreign and domestic teachers				
	L		0	8	1	
G.	1 1011	Total according to the standard	U	ð	1	
		Educational Resources and Student Support Systems"				
85	1.	The EI should ensure that there are sufficient learning resources and student		+		
		support services to ensure that the goal of the EI is achieved				
86	2.	The EI must demonstrate the sufficiency of material and technical resources			+	
		and infrastructure, taking into account the needs of various groups of				
		students in the context of the EP (adults, workers, foreign students, as well				
	- 1	as students with disabilities)				
87	3.	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		<del>  .</del>	1	
0/	3.	The EP management must demonstrate that there are procedures in place to		+		
		support different groups of learners, including information and counselling			1	
		The management of the SE must demonstrate the compliance of information				
		resources with the specifics of the SE, including:				
88	4.	technological support for students and faculty (e.g., online learning,		+		
		modeling, databases, data analysis programs)				
89	5.	library resources, including the fund of educational, methodological and		+		
	J.	scientific literature on general education, basic and major disciplines on				
		paper and electronic media, periodicals, access to scientific databases				
00						
90	6.	examination of the results of research work, graduation works, dissertations		+		
		for plagiarism	_			
91	7.	access to educational Internet resources		+		
92	8.	Functioning of Wi-Fi on the territory of the educational organization		+		
93	9.	The PO demonstrates the planning of providing the EP with educational		+		
		equipment and software similar to those used in the relevant sectors of the				
		economy				
		Total according to the standard	0	8	1	
Clare	Jand 0 !!		U	0	1	
Stand	dard 9 ''	Public Awareness''				
1		The NGO must publish reliable, objective, up-to-date information about the				
		educational program and its specifics, which should include:				
94	1.	Expected learning outcomes of the educational program being implemented		+		
95	2.	qualification and/or qualifications to be awarded upon completion of the		+		
	7	degree programme				
96	3.	approaches to teaching, learning, as well as the system (procedures, methods		+		
, 0	] 5.	and forms) of assessment		'		
97	4.	information about passing scores and learning opportunities provided to	<del> </del>			<del>                                     </del>
<i>71</i>	4.			+		
00		students		-		-
98	5.	Information on employment opportunities for graduates		+		
99	6.	The management of the OP should provide for a variety of ways to		+		
		disseminate information, including the media, information networks to				
		inform the general public and interested parties				
100	7.	Public awareness should include support and explanation of the country's	1	+		
	' '	national development programmes and the system of higher and		1		
		postgraduate education				
101	0	1 0	<u> </u>	<u> </u>	-	
101	8.	The EI must demonstrate the reflection on the web resource of information		+		
		characterizing it as a whole and in the context of educational programs	1		1	
102	9.	An important factor is the availability of adequate and objective information			+	
	<u> </u>	about the teaching staff of the EP	<u> </u>			
103	10.	An important factor is to inform the public about cooperation and interaction		+		
		with partners within the OP				
		Total according to the standard	0	9	1	
		ALTOGETHER	1	97	5	

# Conclusion of the external expert commission on quality assessment of the educational program 7M06107 Media Technologies Astana IT University LLP

No p\n	№ p\n	Evaluation criteria	Position of the educational organization		)	
			Strong	Satisfying	Involves the improvement of	Unsatisfactory
Stand	dard 1 ''	Management of the Educational Program''				
1	16.	The organization of higher and/or postgraduate education must have a published quality assurance policy that reflects the relationship between research, teaching and learning		+		
2	17.	The organization of higher and (or) postgraduate education must demonstrate the development of a culture of quality assurance, including in the context of EP		+		
3	18.	Commitment to quality assurance should apply to any activities carried out by contractors and partners (outsourcing), including the implementation of joint/double-degree education and academic mobility		+		
4	19.	The management of the OP demonstrates transparency in the development of the EP development plan, containing the timing of the start of implementation, based on the analysis of its functioning, the real positioning of the EP and the focus of its activities on meeting the needs of the state, employers, students and other stakeholders ( <i>include additional criteria in addition to the general criteria</i> )		+		
5	20.	The management of the EP demonstrates the existence of mechanisms for the formation and regular review of the EP development plan and monitoring its implementation, assessing the achievement of learning goals, meeting the needs of students, employers and society, and making decisions aimed at continuous improvement of the EP	+			
6	21.	The management of the SE should involve representatives of stakeholder groups, including employers, students and faculty, in the formation of the EP development plan	7	+		
7	22.	The management of the EP must demonstrate the individuality and uniqueness of the EP development plan, its consistency with national priorities and the development strategy of the organization of higher and (or) postgraduate education			+	
8	23.	The organization of higher and (or) postgraduate education should demonstrate a clear definition of those responsible for business processes within the EP, an unambiguous distribution of staff responsibilities, and the delineation of functions of collegial bodies		+		
9	24.	The management of the programme must provide evidence of transparency in the management system of the educational programme		+		
10	25.	The management of the SOE must demonstrate the existence of an internal quality assurance system for the SO, including its design, management and monitoring, their improvement, and fact-based decision-making		+		
11	26.	The management of the SE should manage risks, including within the framework of the SE undergoing initial accreditation, as well as demonstrate a system of measures aimed at reducing the degree of risk		+		
12	27.	The management of the programme should ensure the participation of representatives of employers, faculty, students and other stakeholders in the composition of the collegial governing bodies of the educational programme, as well as their representativeness in decision-making on the management of the educational programme		+		

13	28.	The PO should demonstrate innovation management within the OP, including the analysis and implementation of innovative proposals		+		
14	29.	The EP management must demonstrate evidence of readiness for openness and accessibility for students, faculty, employers and other stakeholders		+		
15	30.	The leadership of the EP should be trained in educational management programs		+		
		Total according to the standard	1	13	1	
Stan	dard 2 "	Information Management and Reporting"	_	10	_	
16	10.	The GS should demonstrate that it has a system for collecting, analysing and		+		
		managing information using modern information and communication				
		technologies and software and that it uses a variety of methods to collect and				
		analyse information in the context of the LO				
17	11.	The management of the SOE must demonstrate that there is a mechanism		+		
		for the systematic use of processed, adequate information to improve the				
18	12.	internal quality assurance system  OP leadership should demonstrate fact-based decision-making				
				+		
19	13.	Within the framework of the EP, a system of regular reporting should be provided, reflecting all levels of the structure, including an assessment of		+		
		the effectiveness and efficiency of the activities of divisions and				
	1	departments, scientific research				
20	14.	The EI should establish the frequency, forms and methods of assessing the		+		
		management of the EP, the activities of collegial bodies and structural units,	h.			
		top management, and the implementation of scientific projects				
21	15.	The NGO must demonstrate the determination of the procedure and ensuring		+		
		the protection of information, including the identification of persons				
		responsible for the reliability and timeliness of information analysis and data				
22	16.	provision  An important factor is the availability of mechanisms for involving students,				
22	10.	employees and teaching staff in the processes of collecting and analyzing		+		
		information, as well as making decisions based on them				
23	17.	The management of the EP must demonstrate the existence of a mechanism		/+		
		for communication with students, employees and other stakeholders, as well				
		as mechanisms for resolving conflicts				
24	18.	The PO should demonstrate that there are mechanisms in place to measure		+		
	_	the degree of satisfaction of the needs of faculty, staff and trainees within the EP				
25	10.	The PA should provide for an assessment of the effectiveness and efficiency		+		
23	10.	of activities, including in the context of the OP				
		The information to be collected and analyzed within the framework of the				
		OP should take into account:				
26	11.	Key Performance Indicators	/	+		
27	12.	dynamics of the contingent of students in the context of forms and types		+		
28	13.	Academic Achievement, Student Achievement, and Expulsion		+		
29	14.	students' satisfaction with the implementation of the EP and the quality of		+		
30	15.	education at the university  Availability of educational resources and support systems for students		+		
31	16.	The NGO must confirm the implementation of procedures for processing the		+		
J1	10.	personal data of students, employees and teaching staff on the basis of their		'		
		documentary consent				
		Total according to the standard	0	16	0	
Stan	dard 3 ''	Development and Approval of the Educational Program'				
32	13.	The PA should define and document the procedures for the development of the OP and their approval at the institutional level		+		
33	14.	The management of the EP should ensure that the content of the EP is		+		
		consistent with the established goals, including the expected learning				
		outcomes				
34	15.	The management of the OP must demonstrate the existence of mechanisms		+		
		for revising the content and structure of the OP, taking into account changes				
		in the labor market, the requirements of employers and the social demand of				
<u> </u>		society				

35	16.	The management of the EP should ensure the availability of developed models of the EP graduate, describing the results of learning and personal qualities		+		
36	17.	The management of the SE must demonstrate the conduct of external examinations of the content of the EP and the planned results of its implementation		+		
37	18.	Qualifications awarded at the end of the EP should be clearly defined and correspond to a certain level of NSC and QF-EHEA		+		
38	19.	The management of the EP should determine the impact of disciplines and professional practices on the formation of learning outcomes			+	
39	20.	An important factor is the possibility of preparing students for professional certification (IS)		+		
40	21.	The management of the EP must provide evidence of the participation of students, faculty and other stakeholders in the development of the EP and ensuring its quality		+		
41	22.	The management of the EP must ensure that the content of academic disciplines and the planned results correspond to the level of study (bachelor's, master's, doctoral studies)			+	
42	23.	The structure of the EP should provide for various types of activities that ensure the achievement of the planned learning outcomes by students		+		
43	24.	An important factor is the correspondence of the content of the EP and the learning outcomes of the EP implemented by higher and (or) postgraduate education organizations in the EHEA		+		
		Total according to the standard	0	10	2	
	dard 4 rams''	"Continuous Monitoring and Periodic Evaluation of Educational				
44	11.	The EI should determine the mechanisms for monitoring and periodic evaluation of the EP to ensure the achievement of the goal and meet the		+		
		needs of students, society and show the focus of the mechanisms on the continuous improvement of the EP				
		Monitoring and periodic evaluation of the OP should include:				
45	12.	the content of the program in the light of the latest scientific achievements in a particular discipline to ensure the relevance of the discipline taught		+		
46	13.	changes in the needs of society and the professional environment		+		
47	14.	workload, academic performance and graduation of students		+		
48	15.	Effectiveness of Student Assessment Procedures		+		
49	16.	expectations, needs and satisfaction of students with EP training		+		
50	17.	the educational environment and support services, and their relevance to the objectives of the EP		+		
51	18.	The management of the SE should demonstrate a systematic approach to	/	+		
50	10	monitoring and periodic assessment of the quality of the EP				
52	19.	The GO, the management of the SO should establish a mechanism for informing all stakeholders of any planned or taken actions in relation to the LO		+		
53	20.	All changes made to the OP must be published			+	
~ ·		Total according to the standard	0	9	1	
		Student-centered learning, teaching and assessment"				
54	11.	The management of the EP should ensure respect and attention to various groups of students and their needs, provide them with flexible learning paths		+		
55	12.	The EP management should provide for the use of various forms and methods of teaching and learning		+		
56	13.	An important factor is the availability of our own research in the field of teaching methods of educational disciplines of EP		+		
57	14.	The management of the EP should demonstrate the existence of feedback mechanisms on the use of various teaching methodologies and assessment		+		
<b>5</b> 0	1.5	of learning outcomes				
58	15.	The management of the EP must demonstrate the existence of mechanisms to support the autonomy of students with simultaneous guidance and		+		
59	16.	assistance from the teacher  The management of the EP must demonstrate the existence of a procedure		+		
		for responding to students' complaints				

60	17.	The PO should ensure consistency, transparency and objectivity of the		+		
<i>c</i> 1	10	learning outcome assessment mechanism for each EP, including the appeal				
61	18.	The EI must ensure that the procedures for assessing the learning outcomes		+		
		of students of the EP comply with the planned results and goals of the				
		program, and that the criteria and methods of assessment are published in advance				
62	19.	The EI should determine the mechanisms for ensuring the achievement of				
02	19.	learning outcomes by each graduate of the EP and ensure the completeness		+		
		of their formation				
63	20.	Assessors must be proficient in modern methods of assessing learning		+		
0.5	20.	outcomes and regularly improve their qualifications in this area		i '		
		Total according to the standard	0	10	0	
Stand	lard 6 "	Students"			Ů	
64	13.	The EI must demonstrate the existence of a policy for the formation of the		+		
		contingent of students in the context of the EP, ensure the transparency and				
		publication of its procedures governing the life cycle of students (from				
		admission to completion)				
	(1)	The management of the EP should determine the procedure for the				
		formation of the contingent of students based on:				
65	14. 🦯	minimum requirements for applicants		+		
66	15.	maximum group size for seminar, practical, laboratory and studio classes		+		
67	16.	forecasting the number of state grants		+		
68	17.	analysis of available material and technical, information resources, human		+		
	1,.	resources		i i		
69	18.	analysis of potential social conditions for students, including the provision		+		
		of places in the dormitory				
70	19.	The leadership of the EP must demonstrate readiness to conduct special		+		
		adaptation and support programs for newly enrolled and foreign students		h.		
71	20.	The EI must demonstrate the compliance of its actions with the Lisbon		+		
		Recognition Convention, the existence of a mechanism for the recognition				
		of the results of academic mobility of students, as well as the results of				
		additional, formal and non-formal education				
72	21.	The PO should cooperate with other educational organizations and national		+		
		centres of the "European Network of National Information Centres for				
		Academic Recognition and Mobility/National Academic Recognition				
		Information Centres" ENIC/NARIC in order to ensure comparable				
73	22.	recognition of qualifications  The EI should provide an opportunity for external and internal mobility of		+		
13	22.	students of the EP, as well as readiness to assist them in obtaining external				
		grants for training				
74	23.	The management of the EP must demonstrate its readiness to provide		+		
		students with internship places, promote the employment of graduates, and				
		maintain contact with them				
75	24.	The EI should provide for the possibility of providing EP graduates with		+		
		documents confirming the qualification obtained, including the learning				
		outcomes achieved, as well as the context, content and status of the				
		education received and evidence of its completion				
-		Total according to the standard	0	12	0	
		Teaching Staff"				
76	10.	The NGO should have an objective and transparent personnel policy,			+	
		including in the context of the OP, including recruitment, professional				
		growth and development of personnel, ensuring the professional				
77	11	competence of the entire staff  The NCO must demonstrate the compliance of the staffing notantial of the		<del> </del>		
77	11.	The NGO must demonstrate the compliance of the staffing potential of the		+		
78	12.	faculty with the specifics of the OP  The management of the SE must demonstrate an awareness of responsibility		-		
10	12.	for its employees and the provision of favorable working conditions for them		+		
79	13.	The leadership of the programme must demonstrate a change in the role of		+		
'	13.	the teacher in connection with the transition to student-centred learning		「		
L		the teacher in connection with the transition to student centred learning	l	1	l .	

80	14.	The NGO should determine the contribution of the teaching staff of the SE		+		
		to the implementation of the development strategy of the NGO, and other				
		strategic documents				
0.1	1.5					
81	15.	The NGO should provide opportunities for career growth and professional		+		
		development of the teaching staff of the EP				
82	16.	The leadership of the EP must demonstrate its readiness to involve		+		
	practitioners from the relevant sectors of the economy in teaching					
83	17.	The EI must demonstrate the motivation for the professional and personal		+		
03	17.	development of EP teachers, including encouragement for the integration of		'		
		scientific activities and education, the use of innovative teaching methods				
84	18.	An important factor is the readiness to develop academic mobility within the		+		
		framework of the EP, to attract the best foreign and domestic teachers				
		Total according to the standard	0	8	1	
Stone	dond Q !!		•		_	
		Educational Resources and Student Support Systems"				
85	1.	The EI should ensure that there are sufficient learning resources and student		+		
		support services to ensure that the goal of the EI is achieved				
86	2.	The EI must demonstrate the sufficiency of material and technical resources			+	
		and infrastructure, taking into account the needs of various groups of				
		students in the context of the EP (adults, workers, foreign students, as well				
	_					
0.7		as students with disabilities)	-		<del>                                     </del>	
87	3.	The EP management must demonstrate that there are procedures in place to		+		
		support different groups of learners, including information and counselling	h			
		The management of the SE must demonstrate the compliance of information				
		resources with the specifics of the SE, including:				
88	1					
88	4.	technological support for students and faculty (e.g., online learning,		+		
		modeling, databases, data analysis programs)				
89	5.	library resources, including the fund of educational, methodological and		+		
-		scientific literature on general education, basic and major disciplines on				
		paper and electronic media, periodicals, access to scientific databases				
90	6.					
90	0.	examination of the results of research work, graduation works, dissertations		+		
		for plagiarism				
91	7.	access to educational Internet resources		+		
92	8.	Functioning of Wi-Fi on the territory of the educational organization		+		
93	9.	The PO demonstrates the planning of providing the EP with educational		+		
, ,	[ ]	equipment and software similar to those used in the relevant sectors of the				
		economy				
		Total according to the standard	0	8	1	
Stand	dard 9 ''	Public Awareness'				
		The NGO must publish reliable, objective, up-to-date information about the				
1		educational program and its specifics, which should include:				
94	1					
	1.	Expected learning outcomes of the educational program being implemented			+	
95	2.	qualification and/or qualifications to be awarded upon completion of the		+		
	1	degree programme				
96	3.	approaches to teaching, learning, as well as the system (procedures, methods		+	I	<u> </u>
	-	and forms) of assessment				
97	4.	information about passing scores and learning opportunities provided to		+		
<i>)</i>	''	students		'		
00	_			_	1	
98	5.	Information on employment opportunities for graduates		+		
99	6.	The management of the OP should provide for a variety of ways to		+		
		disseminate information, including the media, information networks to				
		inform the general public and interested parties				
100	7.	Public awareness should include support and explanation of the country's		+	<u> </u>	1
100	/ ·			-		
		national development programmes and the system of higher and				
		postgraduate education				
101	8.	The EI must demonstrate the reflection on the web resource of information		+		
		characterizing it as a whole and in the context of educational programs				
102	9.	An important factor is the availability of adequate and objective information			+	
	- *	about the teaching staff of the EP			l .	
102	10			<b>.</b>	1	
103	10.	An important factor is to inform the public about cooperation and interaction		+		
		with partners within the OP				
		Total according to the standard	0	8	2	
		ALTOGETHER	1	94	8	



#### Appendix 2. PROGRAM OF THE VISIT TO THE EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION





# PROGRAM VISIT OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION INDEPENDENT AGENCY FOR ACCREDITATION AND RATING (IAAR) AT ASTANA IT UNIVERSITY LLP

(international program accreditation)

Date of the visit: April 17-19, 2024

Cluster 1 (accreditation)	6B06107 Mathematical and Computational Sciences, 6B07101 Industrial Internet of Things, 6B07102 Electronic Engineering
Cluster 2 (accreditation)	7M04104 Digital Public Administration and Services, 7M06107 Media Technologies, 8D04101 Project Management, 8D06101 Computer Science

Date and	EEC work with target	Position and Surname, Name, Patronymic of the participants	Contact Form
time	groups	target groups	000000000000000000000000000000000000000
		April 16, 2024	
<b>15.00–16.00</b> (time to be specified)	Preliminary meeting of the EEC (discussion of key issues and the program of the visit)	IAAR External Experts	Connect to a Zoom meeting <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969</a> Conference ID: 464 173 2969
On track during the day	Arrival of members of the	External Expert Commission	
18.00	Supper	IAAR External Experts	
		Day 1: April 17, 2024	
10.00-10.30	Distribution of responsibility of experts, solution of organizational issues	IAAR External Experts	Cabinet / room No S1.2.358 (EEC office) Connect to a Zoom meeting <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969</a> Conference ID: 464 173 2969
10.30-11.00	Meeting with the Rector	Omirbayev Serik Maulenovich - Doctor of Economic Sciences, Professor	Dissertation Hall Room. S1 - 2–340 Connect to a Zoom meeting <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969</a> Conference ID: 464 173 2969
11.00-11.15	Technical break		
11.15-12.00	Meeting with Vice- Rectors	Kumalakov Bolatzhan Armenovich – PhD, Vice-Rector for Academic and Educational Work  Andrey Beloshchitsky – Doctor of Technical Sciences, Professor, Vice-Rector for Science and Innovation  Danil Lebedev – PhD, Vice-Rector for Digitalization  Aryn Abay Mukhtarovich – Financial Director	(Dissertation Hall, room C1 - 2-340)  Connect to a Zoom meeting <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969</a> Conference ID: 464 173 2969
12.00-12.10	Technical break		

12.10-12.50	Meeting with the heads of structural divisions of the NGO	Gulzhan Soltan – Director of the Department of Academic Activities; Adil Faizullin - Director of the Strategy and Corporate Governance Department; Khanat Kassenov - Director of the Quality Assurance Department; Abay A. Amandykov – Director of the Human Resources Management Department; Alem Ibrayeva – Director of the Department of Financial and Economic Planning and Analysis; Leila Salykova – Director of the International Cooperation Department; Temirlan Zhanay – Director of the Marketing and Public Relations Department; Nurakhov Edil Sergazievich - Director of the Department of Information Technologies; Nurkhat Zhakiyev – Director of the Department of Science and Innovation; Kenzhebekov Arman Zhandykovich – Director of the Department of Social and Educational Work; Kanat Koshkenov – Director of the Department for Economic Work; Sapar Toksanov – Director of the Center for Competence and Excellence; Koitanova Aliya Zhenisovna - Head of the Registrar's Office; Zhunusova Gulbanu Kenesovna – Head of the Student Affairs Department Madina Mukaliyeva – Head of the Career and Employment Center Akhmetova Maral - Director of the Scientific Library	(Dissertation Hall, room C1 - 2-340) Connect to a Zoom meeting <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969</a> Conference ID: 464 173 2969
12.50-13.00	Exchange of views of members of the external Expert Commission		Cabinet / room No S1.2.358 (EEC office) Connect to a Zoom meeting <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969</a> Conference ID: 464 173 2969
13.00-14.00	Dinner		
14.00-14.15	EEC Work	IAAR External Experts	
14.15-15.00	Meeting with Deans of Accredited Programs	Syzdykova Zuleikha Anvarovna - Dean	(Dissertation Hall, room C1 - 2-340) Connect to a Zoom meeting

			https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969
			Conference ID: 464 173 2969
15.00-15.15	EEC Work	IAAR External Experts	
15.15-16.00	Meeting with Directors of Departments of Educational Programs	Muslim Sergaziev – Director of the Department of Computing and Data Science;  Rzayeva Leyla Hummetovna – Acting Director of the Department of Intelligent Systems and Cybersecurity.  Ha Jin Hwang - Director of the School of Creative Industries;  Praveen Kumar - Director of the Department of Computer Engineering	(Dissertation Hall, room C1 - 2-340) Connect to a Zoom meeting <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969</a> Conference ID: 464 173 2969
16.00-16.10	Technical break		
16.10-17.00	Meeting with the teaching staff of the OP	Cluster 1 (Appendix No1) (room No C1.3.234, session hall zoom 1)  Cluster 2 (Appendix No1) (room No, C1.2.340 session hall zoom 2)	(Dissertation Hall, room C1 - 2-340) Connect to a Zoom meeting <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969</a> Conference ID: 464 173 2969
17.00-18.00	Survey of teaching staff (in parallel)	Annex 2	The link is sent to the teacher's e-mail personally
17.00-17.50	Visual inspection of the EP and the material, technical, educational and laboratory base only for the objects under the accredited EP		
17.50-18.00	EEC Work: Discussion of the Results of the First Day	IAAR External Experts	Room NoC1.2.358 Connect to a Zoom meeting <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969</a> Conference ID: 464 173 2969
18.00-19.00	Supper	IAAR External Experts	
		Day 2: April 18, 2024	

10.00-10.30	EEC Work	IAAR External Experts	Room NoC1.2.358 Connect to a Zoom meeting <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969</a> Conference ID: 464 173 2969
10.30-13.00	Scheduled attendance of teaching staff classes	* Classes for the master's degree program 7M04104 Digital Public Administration and Services, 7M06107 Media Technologies start from 18.00 to 21.50 according to the schedule.  According to the academic calendar, the theoretical course on the EP of doctoral studies 8D04101 Project Management, 8D06101 Computer Science has been completed.	
10.30-13.00	Work with documents of departments (documents must be uploaded to the cloud by clusters in advance, if necessary, heads of departments will be invited to the online Zoom room)		
13.00-14.00	Dinner		
14.00-14.20	Technical break		
14.20-15.20	Meeting with students of the programme	1 cluster (Appendix No3) (room No C1.3.234, session hall zoom 1)  Cluster 2 (Appendix No3) (room No C1-2–340, session hall zoom 2)	Room NoC1.2.340/C1.3.234 Connect to a Zoom meeting <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969</a> Conference ID: 464 173 2969
15.20-16.20	Questioning of students (in parallel)	Annex 4	The link is sent to the student's e-mail personally
16.20–19.00	Operation of the EEC, profile parameters	IAAR External Experts	Room No NoC1.2.358 Connect to a Zoom meeting

	(recording. Discussion of the results of the second day.		https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969 Conference ID: 464 173 2969
19.00-20.00	Supper	IAAR External Experts	
		Day 3: April 19, 2024	
10.00-11.30	Work of the EEC, development and discussion of recommendations	IAAR External Experts	Room No NoC1.2.358 Connect to a Zoom meeting <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969</a> Conference ID: 464 173 2969
11.30-11.40	Technical break		
11.40-13.00	EEC work: development and discussion of recommendations (recorded)	IAAR External Experts	Room No NoC1.2.358 Connect to a Zoom meeting <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969</a> Conference ID: 464 173 2969
13.00-14.00	Dinner		
14.00-16.00	EEC work: discussion, decision-making by voting (recorded)		Room No NoC1.2.358 Connect to a Zoom meeting <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969</a> Conference ID: 464 173 2969
16.00-16.30	Final meeting of the EEC with the leadership of the university		Room No C1.2.340 Connect to a Zoom meeting <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969</a> Conference ID: 464 173 2969
16.30-18.00	Work of the EEC, Discussion of the results of the quality assessment	IAAR External Experts	
18.00-19.00	Supper	IAAR External Experts	

#### Reduce

IAAR - Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating

EEC – IAAR External Expert Commission

BA – Bachelor's Degree Program

MA – Master's Degree Program

GO – Educational Organization

PLO – Basic Educational Program

Teaching staff

Doctor of Economics – Doctor of Economics

Doctor of Technical Sciences – Doctor of Technical Sciences

Ph.D. – Candidate of Physical and Mathematical Sciences

Candidate of Pedagogical Sciences – Candidate of Pedagogical Sciences

Ph.D. in Law - Ph.D. in Law

Ph.D. in Economics – PhD in Economics

#### **Appendix 3. RESULTS OF THE SURVEY OF TEACHERS**

#### Faculty Questionnaire Astana IT University

#### **Total number of questionnaires: 16**

#### 2. Position, %

<b>2.1</b> 05101011, 70	
Professor	5 (31,3%)
Associate Professor/Associate	
Professor	1 (6,3%)
Senior Lecturer	6 (37,5%)
Teacher	1 (6,3%)
Assistant Professor	1 (6,3%)
Senior Lecturer	1 (6,3%)

3. Academic degree, academic title

Phd	1 (6,3%)
Phd	2 (12,5%)
Master	8 (50%)
PhD	5 (31,3%)
Professor	1 (6,3%)

4. Work experience at this university

Less than 1 year	5 (31,3%)
1 year – 5 years	10 (62,5%)
Over 5 years	1 (6,3%)

№	Questions	Very good	Ok	Relatively bad	Not good	Very bad	Did not respond
1	To what extent does the content of the educational program meet your scientific and professional interests and needs?	11 (68,8%)	3 (18,8%)	2 (12,5%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
2	How do you assess the opportunities provided by the University for the professional development of teaching staff?	12 (75%)	4 (25%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
3	How do you assess the opportunities provided by the University for the career growth of teaching staff?	9 (56,3%)	7(43,8%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)

4	How do you assess the degree	10 (62,5%)	6	0 (0%)	0	0	0
	of academic freedom of the		(37,5%)		(0%)	(0%)	(0%)
	faculty?						
	To what extent teachers can						
5	• Learning Strategies	11 (68,8 %)	5	0 (0%)	0	0	0
3	- Learning Strategies	11 (00,0 %)	(31,3%)	0 (0%)	(0%)	(0%)	(0%)
6	Teaching methods	7 (43,8%)	9	0 (0%)	0	0	0
	8	( - , ,	(56,3%)	(***)	(0%)	(0%)	(0%)
7	Educational Innovation	10 (62,5%)	6	0 (0%)	0	0	0
			(37,5%)		(0%)	(0%)	(0%)
8	How do you assess the work	1 (6,3%)	13	2	0	0	0
	on the organization of		(81,3%)	(12,5%)	(0%)	(0%)	(0%)
	medical care and disease						
•	prevention at the university?	11 (60 00())	4 (250()	1 (6 00/)	0	0	0
9	What attention does the	11 (68,8%)	4 (25%)	1 (6,3%)	0	0	0
	management of the				(0%)	(0%)	(0%)
	educational institution pay to the content of the educational						
	program?						
10	How do you assess the	6 (37,5%)	8 (50%)	2	0	0	0
10	sufficiency and availability of	(67,670)	0 (00/0)	(12,5%)	(0%)	(0%)	(0%)
	the necessary scientific and						, ,
	educational literature in the						
	library?						
11	Assess the level of conditions	4 (25%)	11	1 (6,3%)	0	0	0
	created that take into account		(68,8%)		(0%)	(0%)	(0%)
	the needs of different groups						
	of students?						
	Evaluate the openness and accessibility of the guide						
12	• Students	9 (56,3%)	7	0 (0%)	0	0	0
			(43,8%)		(0%)	(0%)	(0%)
13	• Teachers	9 (56,3%)	7	0 (0%)	0	0	0
			(43,8%)		(0%)	(0%)	(0%)
14	Assess the involvement of	7 (43,8%)	8 (50%)	1 (6,3%)	0	0	0
	faculty in the process of				(0%)	(0%)	(0%)
	making managerial and strategic decisions						
15	How are the innovative	6 (37,5%)	9	1 (6,3%)	0	0	0
13	activities of faculty members	0 (37,370)	(56,3%)	1 (0,570)	(0%)	(0%)	(0%)
	encouraged?		(30,370)		(0,0)	(070)	(070)
16	Assess the level of feedback	7 (43,8%)	8 (50%)	1 (6,3%)	0	0	0
	from the faculty to the		,		(0%)	(0%)	(0%)
	management						, ,
17	What is the level of	9 (56,3%)	7	0 (0%)	0	0	0
	stimulation and involvement		(43,8%)		(0%)	(0%)	(0%)
	of young professionals in the						
4 =	educational process?	- /		0.40.4		_	
18	Evaluate the professional and	6 (37,5%)	10	0 (0%)	0	0	0
	personal growth opportunities		(62,5%)		(0%)	(0%)	(0%)
	created for each faculty						

19 A	Assess the adequacy of the recognition by the university management of the potential	4 (25%)	10	2	0	0	0
r r a	recognition by the university	. (23/0)	10	_ <i>-</i>			
r			(62,5%)	(12,5%)	(0%)	(0%)	(0%)
а			(02,570)	(12,370)	(070)	(070)	(070)
	and abilities of teachers						
	How the work is set up						
	Academic Mobility	7 (43,8%)	9	0 (0%)	0	0	0
	Treatment in the same of	, (15,575)	(56,3%)	0 (070)	(0%)	(0%)	(0%)
21 •	For advanced training of	6 (37,5%)	9	1 (6,3%)	0	0	0
	teaching staff	, , ,	(56,3%)	( ) /	(0%)	(0%)	(0%)
	Evaluate the support of the						
	university and its						
r	management						
22 •	Research Initiatives of the	8 (50%)	8 (50%)	0 (0%)	0	0	0
	Faculty				(0%)	(0%)	(0%)
	Development of new	9 (56,3%)	6	1 (6,3%)	0	0	0
_	educational		(37,5%)		(0%)	(0%)	(0%)
	programs/academic						
	disciplines/teaching						
	methods						
	Assess the level of faculty's						
	ability to combine teaching with scientific research	6 (37,5%)	8 (50%)	2	0	0	0
24	with scientific research	0 (37,3%)	0 (30%)	(12,5%)	(0%)	(0%)	(0%)
25 •	with practical activities	5 (31,3%)	10	1 (6,3%)	0	0	0
25	with practical activities	3 (31,370)	(62,5%)	1 (0,570)	(0%)	(0%)	(0%)
<b>26</b> A	Assess how the knowledge of	7 (43,8%)	9	0 (0%)	0	0	0
	students received at the	( - , ,	(56,3%)	( ( ) ( )	(0%)	(0%)	(0%)
υ	university corresponds to the				` /		` /
r	realities of the requirements						
	of the modern labor market						
	How do the management and	5 (31,3%)	10	1 (6,3%)	0	0	0
	administration of the		(62,5%)		(0%)	(0%)	(0%)
	university perceive criticism						
	addressed to them?	5 (01 00)	0 (500()	2	0		0
	Assess how your study load	5 (31,3%)	8 (50%)	(19.90()	0	0	0
	meets your expectations and			(18,8%)	(0%)	(0%)	(0%)
	capabilities? Assess the focus of	4 (25%)	11	1 (6 20/)	0	0	0
	educational	4 (23%)	(68,8%)	1 (6,3%)	(0%)	(0%)	(0%)
	orograms/curricula on the		(00,070)		(070)	(0/0)	(0/0)
	formation of students' skills						
	and abilities to analyze the						
	situation and make forecasts?						
	Assess how the educational	6 (37,5%)	10	0 (0%)	0	0	0
	orogram meets the	· , · · · ,	(62,5%)	/	(0%)	(0%)	(0%)
	expectations of the labor				` ′		` /
	market and employers in						
	terms of content and quality						
	of implementation					<u> </u>	

Career growth, high salary, relatively flexible schedule

Study in English

Good working conditions

Location, language of instruction

Opportunity to realize your potential, ideas, freedom of teaching, salary, openness of management

I should go to our university, the students here are all strong, the average score on the UNT is like 106 points and of course the salary is high, and the university also provides housing. I live in a 3-room apartment at our university

1. High salary 2. Flexible working hours 3. Students with a good level of English also enroll students with good UNT scores

High level of salary in comparison with other universities of the Republic of Kazakhstan, as well as free attendance

Good salary

There are many professionals, great for developing interdisciplinary skills Jalaqysy jagsy, talanytty seýdentter ogrydy, ogý ornynyń basshylygy men ákimshiligi

salystyrmaly bureaucrat emes, oqyttýshylarga jaqdai jasalgan.

Good payment, accommodation

Team, flexibility, location

New Opportunities, Salary, English-Speaking Environment

High salary

#### 32. How often do you have workshops and practitioners as part of your course?

very often	often	sometime s	very rare	never
1 (6,3%)	7 (43,8%)	6 (37,5%)	2 (12,5%)	1 (6,3%)

## 33. How often do external teachers (domestic and foreign) participate in the learning process?

very often	often	someti	very rare	never
very often		mes		
2 (12 50/)	10 (62,5%)	4	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
2 (12,5%)		(25%)		

### 34. How often do you encounter the following problems in your work: (please give an answer in each line)

Questions	Often	Sometimes	Never	No response
Lack of classrooms	1 (6,3%)	6 (37,5%)	9 (56,3%)	0 (0%)
Imbalance of the teaching load by	2 (12,5%)	4 (25%)	10	0 (0%)
semesters			(62,5%)	
Unavailability of the necessary	0 (0%)	5 (31,3%)	11	0 (0%)
literature in the library			(68,8%)	
Overcrowding of study groups (too	0 (0%)	3 (18,8%)	13	0 (0%)
many students in a class)			(81,3%)	
Inconvenient schedule	1 (6,3%)	11 (68,8%)	4 (25%)	0 (0%)
Inappropriate classroom conditions	0 (0%)	9 (56,3%)	7 (43,8%)	0 (0%)
No Internet access/weak internet	0 (0%)	8 (50%)	8 (50%)	0 (0%)
Students' lack of interest in learning	0 (0%)	10 (62,5%)	6 (37,5%)	0 (0%)

Late receipt of information about	0 (0%)	4 (25%)	12 (75%)	0 (0%)			
events							
Lack of technical means of training	0 (0%)	3 (18,8%)	13	0 (0%)			
in classrooms			(81,3%)				
Other issues	There is a lack of materials for laboratory classes						
	Sometimes it is not possible to find the key to the						
	lecture room in time, due to the late delivery of the						
	keys by the previous teacher						
	Sometimes there are problems with air conditioners						
	Lack of personal offices for teaching staff, canteen						
	opening ho	urs					

# 35. There are many different aspects and aspects in the life of a university, which in one way or another affect each teacher and staff. Rate how satisfied you are:

Questions	Highly satisfied (1)	Partially satisfied (2)	Dissatisfied (3)	Difficult to answer (4)
The attitude of the university	11 (68,8%)	4 (25%)	1 (6,3%)	0 (0%)
administration to you				
Relations with direct management	11 (68,8%)	5 (31,3%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
Relations with colleagues at the department	14 (87,5%)	2 (12,5%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
The degree of participation in managerial decision-making	11 (68,8%)	4 (25%)	1 (6,3%)	0 (0%)
Relations with students	12 (75%)	3 (18,8%)	1 (6,3%)	0 (0%)
Recognition of your successes and achievements by the administration	11 (68,8%)	2 (12,5%)	2 (12,5%)	1 (6,3%)
Support for your suggestions and comments	8 (50%)	6 (37,5%)	2 (12,5%)	0 (0%)
Activities of the university administration	10 (62,5%)	5 (31,3%)	1 (6,3%)	0 (0%)
Terms of remuneration	12 (75%)	4 (25%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
Working conditions, list and quality of services provided at the university	11 (68,8%)	5 (31,3%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
Occupational health and safety	14 (87,5%)	1 (6,3%)	0 (0%)	1 (6,3%)
Management of changes in the activities of the university	11 (68,8%)	3 (18,8%)	0 (0%)	2 (12,5%)
Provision of a social package: recreation, sanatorium treatment, etc.	4 (25%)	10 (62,5%)	0 (0%)	2 (12,5%)
Organization and quality of food at the university	3 (18,8%)	8 (50%)	4 (25%)	1 (6,3%)
Organization and quality of medical care	6 (37,5%)	4 (25%)	2 (12,5%)	4 (25%)

#### **Annex 4. RESULTS OF THE STUDENT SURVEY**

#### Student questionnaire Astana IT University

**Total number of questionnaires: 25** 

**Educational program (specialty):** 

Educational program (specialty).	
Mathematical and Computational Sciences	18 (72%)
Industrial Internet of Things	1 (4%)
Electronic Engineering	6 (24%)
7M04104 Digital Public Administration and	0 (0%)
Services	
7M06107 Media Technologies	0 (0%)
8D04101 Project Management	0 (0%)
8D06101 Computer Science	0 (0%)

#### Floor:

Male	12 (48%)	
Female	13 (52%)	

#### Rate how satisfied you are:

Questions	Completely satisfied	Partially satisfied	Partially dissatisfied	Not satisfied	<b>Difficult</b> answer
1. Relations with the dean's office (school, faculty, department)	10 (40%)	12 (48%)	2 (8%)	1 (4%)	0 (0%)
2. The level of accessibility of the dean's office (school, faculty, department)	13 (52%)	9 (36%)	2 (8%)	1 (4%)	0 (0%)
3. The level of accessibility and responsiveness of the management (university, school, faculty, department)	12 (48%)	11 (44%)	1 (4%)	1 (4%)	0 (0%)
4. Availability of academic counseling	12 (48%)	12 (48%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	1 (4%)
5. Support with educational materials in the learning process	13 (52%)	7 (28%)	3 (12%)	1 (4%)	1 (4%)
6. Availability of counseling on personal problems	10 (40%)	10 (40%)	3 (12%)	2 (8%)	0 (0%)
7. Student-teacher relationship	11 (44%)	10 (40%)	3 (12%)	1 (4%)	0 (0%)

8. The activities of the financial and administrative	10	7	3	2 (00)	2 (122()
services of the educational institution	(40%)	(28%)	(12%)	2 (8%)	3 (12%)
9. Access to health services	10 (40%)	6 (24%)	7 (28%)	1 (4%)	1 (4%)
10. Quality of medical care at the university	8 (32%)	8 (32%)	4 (16%)	2 (8%)	3 (12%)
11. The level of accessibility of library resources	14 (56%)	7 (28%)	2 (8%)	0 (0%)	2 (8%)
12. Quality of services provided in libraries and reading rooms	16 (64%)	6 (24%)	1 (4%)	0 (0%)	2 (8%)
13. Existing educational resources of the university	12 (48%)	10 (40%)	1 (4%)	2 (8%)	0 (0%)
14. Accessibility of computer labs	10 (40%)	8 (32%)	3 (12%)	2 (8%)	2 (8%)
15. Accessibility and quality of Internet resources	10 (40%)	10 (40%)	2 (8%)	2 (8%)	1 (4%)
16. The content and information content of the website of educational organizations in general and faculties (schools) in particular	11 (44%)	11 (44%)	2 (8%)	0 (0%)	1 (4%)
17. Classrooms, classrooms for large groups	11 (44%)	9 (36%)	1 (4%)	2 (8%)	2 (8%)
18. Student lounges (if any)	9 (36%)	5 (20%)	4 (16%)	3 (12%)	4 (16%)
19. Clarity of procedures for taking disciplinary measures	12 (48%)	8 (32%)	3 (12%)	1 (4%)	1 (4%)
20. The quality of the educational program as a whole	9 (36%)	12 (48%)	1 (4%)	3 (12%)	0 (0%)
21. Quality of Curricula in EPs	11 (44%)	10 (40%)	2 (8%)	2 (8%)	0 (0%)
22. Teaching methods in general	10 (40%)	10 (40%)	3 (12%)	2 (8%)	0 (0%)
23. Quick response to feedback from teachers on the educational process	11 (44%)	7 (28%)	5 (20%)	1 (4%)	1 (4%)
24. Overall quality of teaching	11 (44%)	10 (40%)	1 (4%)	3 (12%)	0 (0%)
25. Academic Load/Student Requirements	9 (36%)	12 (48%)	4 (16%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
26. Faculty requirements for students	10 (40%)	9 (36%)	2 (8%)	1 (4%)	3 (12%)
27. Information support and explanation of the admission rules and strategy of the educational program (specialty) before entering the university	11 (44%)	8 (32%)	6 (24%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
28. Informing the requirements in order to successfully complete this educational program (specialty)	11 (44%)	10 (40%)	2 (8%)	0 (0%)	2 (8%)
29. Quality of examination materials (tests and examination questions, etc.)	13 (52%)	9 (36%)	3 (12%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
30. Objectivity of assessment of knowledge, skills and other educational achievements	11 (44%)	8 (32%)	3 (12%)	2 (8%)	1 (4%)
31. Existing computer labs	11	7	3	2 (8%)	2 (8%)

	(44%)	(28%)	(12%)		
32. Existing scientific laboratories	13	5	3	1 (4%)	3 (12%)
	(52%)	(20%)	(12%)	` ′	, í
33. Objectivity and fairness of teachers	14	6	3	2 (8%)	0 (0%)
	(56%)	(24%)	(12%)	2 (070)	0 (070)
34. Informing students about courses,	12	7	4	0 (00/)	2 (90/)
educational programs and academic degrees	(48%)	(28%)	(16%)	0 (0%)	2 (8%)
25 Description of the state of the state of	10	6	3	3	2 (120/)
35. Providing students with a dormitory	(40%)	(24%)	(12%)	(12%)	3 (12%)

Assess how much you agree:

Assess how much you agree:	1			ı	ı	
Assertion	Complete	I agree	Partially agree	I disagree	Full disagreement	Did not respond
36. The course program was clearly presented	9 (36%)	8 (32%)	6 (24%)	2 (8%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
37. The course content is well structured	12 (48%)	6 (24%)	4 (16%)	2 (8%)	1 (4%)	0 (0%)
38. The key terms are sufficiently explained	12 (48%)	6 (24%)	6 (24%)	0 (0%)	1 (4%)	0 (0%)
39. The material proposed by the teacher is relevant and reflects the latest achievements of science and practice		9 (36%)	6 (24%)	0 (0%)	1 (4%)	0 (0%)
40. The teacher uses effective teaching methods	8 (32%)	7 (28%)	6 (24%)	3 (12%)	1 (4%)	0 (0%)
41. The teacher knows the material taught	12 (48%)	6 (24%)	4 (16%)	(12%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
42. The teacher's presentation is clear	9 (36%)	9 (36%)	5 (20%)	2 (8%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
43. The teacher presents the material in an interesting way	8 (32%)	6 (24%)	5 (20%)	6 (24%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
44. Objectivity of assessment of knowledge, skills and other educational achievements	11 (44%)	9 (36%)	2 (8%)	3 (12%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
45. Timeliness of assessment of students' educational achievements	10 (40%)	9 (36%)	4 (16%)	2 (8%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
46. The teacher meets your requirements and expectations for professional and personal development	9 (36%)	7 (28%)	6 (24%)	3 (12%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
47. The teacher stimulates the activity of students	10 (40%)	8 (32%)	3 (12%)	4 (16%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
48. The teacher stimulates students' creative thinking	8 (32%)	8 (32%)	4 (16%)	4 (16%)	1 (4%)	0 (0%)
49. The appearance and manners of the teacher are adequate	13 (52%)	7 (28%)	4 (16%)	1 (4%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
50. The teacher shows a positive	9 (36%)	9	6	1 (4%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)

		(0.50/)	(2.40/)	1	1	
attitude towards students		(36%)	(24%)			
51. The system of assessment of educational achievements (seminars, tests, questionnaires, etc.) reflects the content of the course	10 (40%)	8 (32%)	5 (20%)	2 (8%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
52. The evaluation criteria used by the teacher are clear and accessible	12 (48%)	9 (36%)	2 (8%)	2 (8%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
53. The teacher objectively evaluates the students' achievements	10 (40%)	9 (36%)	3 (12%)	3 (12%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
54. The teacher speaks the professional language	9 (36%)	8 (32%)	6 (24%)	2 (8%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
55. The organization of education provides sufficient opportunities for sports and other leisure activities	10 (40%)	8 (32%)	6 (24%)	0 (0%)	1 (4%)	0 (0%)
56. Facilities and equipment for students are safe, comfortable and modern	10 (40%)	8 (32%)	6 (24%)	1 (4%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
57. The library is well equipped and has a sufficient fund of scientific, educational and methodological literature	13 (52%)	6 (24%)	5 (20%)	0 (0%)	1 (4%)	0 (0%)
58. Equal opportunities for the development of EP and personal development are provided to all students	13	4 (16%)	7 (28%)	1 (4%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)

#### Other problems regarding the quality of teaching:

Problem with the selection of teachers

I would like undergraduates not to be allowed to study students. They undergo practical training and it is inconvenient that they change 2 times per trimester increase the teaching staff in basic subjects

Mugalimderdiń jetispeyshiligi boldy,2 trimesterde calculus 2 disciplinasynan lektor bolmady, sol jagynan qıynshylyq týdy.

nothing and everything

Why in an IT university, where the main emphasis is on the technical base, teachers in the humanities believe that their subject is the most important and mandatory.