



«АККРЕДИТТЕУ ЖӘНЕ РЕЙТИНГТИҢ
ТӘУЕЛСІЗ АГЕНТТІГІ» КЕМ

НУ «НЕЗАВИСИМОЕ АГЕНТСТВО
АККРЕДИТАЦИИ И РЕЙТИНГА»

INDEPENDENT AGENCY FOR
ACCREDITATION AND RATING

REPORT

on the results of the external expert commission work for the evaluation
the Asian Medical Institute named after S.Tentishev on compliance with
the standards of institutional accreditation of medical educational
institutions (Kyrgyz Republic) (WFME / AMSE) IAAR

Date of visit: from "26" to "28" October 2021

INDEPENDENT AGENCY FOR ACCREDITATION AND RATING
EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION

Address to
IAAR Accreditation Council



REPORT

**on the results of the external expert commission work for the evaluation the Asian Medical
Institute named after S.Tentishev on compliance with the standards of institutional
accreditation of medical educational institutions (Kyrgyz Republic) (WFME / AMSE)**
IAAR

Date of visit: from "26" to "28" October 2021

Kant

October 28, 2021

CONTENT

I. LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS	3
II. INTRODUCTION	4
III. REPRESENTATION of the AzMI.....	5
IV. DESCRIPTION OF THE PREVIOUS ACCREDITATION PROCEDURE	6
V. DESCRIPTION OF THE EEC VISIT	6
VI. COMPLIANCE WITH INSTITUTIONAL ACCREDITATION STANDARDS	8
6.1. Mission and Final Results Standard	8
6.2. Standard «Educational Programs»	11
6.3. Student Assessment Standard	13
6.4 «Learner» standard	14
6.5 Standard «Academic Staff/Teachers»	16
6.6 «Educational Resources» Standard	17
6.7. «Evaluation of the Educational Program» Standard	19
6.8. «Management and Administration» Standard	22
6.9. Continuous Improvement Standard	25
VII. OVERVIEW OF STRENGTHS/BEST PRACTICE FOR EACH STANDARD	27
VIII. OVERVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS FOR IMPROVING QUALITY FOR EACH STANDARD	27
IX. OVERVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE AzMI DEVELOPMENT	31
Appendix 1. Evaluation table «PARAMETERS OF INSTITUTIONAL PROFILE»	32



I. LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS

AzMI – Asian Medical Institute named after S. Tentishev
AMS – Administrative and Managerial Staff.
PRS – Point-rating system.
WHO – World Health Organization.
SAC – State Attestation Commission.
MCH – Municipal Clinical Hospital.
SES – State Educational Standard.
FSA – Final State Attestation.
MPI – Medical and Prophylactic Institution.
M3 KP – Ministry of Health of the Kyrgyz Republic.
ID – International Department.
MoES of KR – Ministry of Education and Science of the Kyrgyz Republic.
MC – Medical Center.
NH MoH of KR – National Hospital of the Ministry of Health of the Kyrgyz Republic.
CME – Continuing medical education.
CPD – Continuing professional development.
RDB – Research and Development Board.
RLA - Regulatory legal acts
HO – Healthcare Organization.
EQD – Education quality department.
IRD – International Relations Department.
MEP – Main Educational Program.
HETP – Higher-education teaching personnel.
QMS – Quality Management System.
TTA – Technical training aids.
ADW – Academic and Discipline Work.
CID – Curriculum & Instruction Department.
AC – Academic Council.
FPC – Family Practice Center.
MCI – Medical Council of India.
NEET – National Eligibility Entrance Test.
PMDC – Pakistan Medical and Dental Council.
SWOT-analysis – Strength, weaknesses, opportunities, threats.
HKD - housekeeping department;
QG - qualified graduate;
CC - competency catalog;
CA - corrective action;
MI - methodical instruction;
HR - Human Resource
SPD – Student Personnel Department
TSS - teaching support staff;
QMC – quality management center
CIIED – system of intra-institutional educational documentation
IST – Institute standards
SD – structure division
SPE - Secondary Professional Education
AAEPO - Agency for Accreditation of Educational Programs and Organizations
LO - Learning Outcomes

II. INTRODUCTION

In accordance with the order No. 123-21-OD dated 17.09.2021. Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating (hereinafter - IAAR) at the Asian Medical Institute named after S. Tentishev (hereinafter - AzMI), an external expert commission assessed the compliance of educational activities for compliance with the standards of institutional accreditation of medical educational organizations (Kyrgyz Republic) (WFME/AMSE) IAAR.

External Expert Commission's memberships:

Chairman of the IAAR – Bauyrzhan Kadenovich Omarkulov, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, "Karaganda Medical University" NJSC (Republic of Kazakhstan, Karaganda);

International Expert of the IAAR – Elena Sergeevna Bogomolova, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Federal State Budgetary Educational Institution of Higher Education, "Privolzhsky Research Medical University" of the Ministry of Health of Russia (Russian Federation, Nizhny Novgorod);

International Expert of the IAAR – Mahmudzoda Khayyom Ruziboy, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Director of the Center for Strategic Development and Management of the Tajik State Medical University named after Abuali ibn Sino (Tajik Republic, Dushanbe);

National Expert of the IAAR – Akmaral Kamchibekovna Tentimisheva, Kyrgyz-Uzbek International University named after B. Sydykov, (Kyrgyz Republic, Osh);

IAAR Employer – Urimzhan Ismailovich Ismailov, Republican Center for Mental Health (Kyrgyz Republic, Bishkek);

IAAR Student – Asel Nurdinovna Usupbekova, Faculty of Medicine, General Medicine, Ala-Too International University (Kyrgyz Republic, Bishkek);

Observer from the MES KR – Damira Kakenovna Alibaeva, Chief Specialist of the Department of Vocational Education of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Kyrgyz Republic;

Observer from the Agency – Alissa Satbekovna Jakenova, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Head of Medical Projects of the Agency (Republic of Kazakhstan, Nur-Sultan).

III. REPRESENTATION of the AzMI

The Asian Medical Institute named after S. Tentishev (hereinafter AzMI) was established in 2004 and registered with the Ministry of Justice of the Kyrgyz Republic, registration number 2507-3308-U-e, OKPO 23394562, TIN 0060220010113, GPU No. 0023850, dated February 6, 2004, for delivering the higher professional education in the field of medicine on the following degrees: Medical Care and Dentistry, and secondary vocational education. AzMI is included in the list of the World Health Organization's World Directory of Medical Schools.

The Ministry of Education and Science of the Kyrgyz Republic issued a license for the AzMI No. LS210000855, registration number No. D2021-0004 dated 14.05.2021, in degrees Dentistry 5 years, General Medicine 6 years, "Experimental curriculum of General Medicine" 5 years. Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Kyrgyz Republic No. 711-1, dated 14.05.2021. The license is valid for an unlimited period.

The AzMI independently determines the content of educational work programs and curriculum in accordance with state educational standards. The Academic Council approves curricula and their changes.

In a relatively short cut of development, the AzMI has gone through a complicated, but innovative path of formation. The Institute is registered in the main leading international organizations for medical education: World Health Organization (WHO), Foundation for Advancement of International Medical Education and Research (FAIMER), Association for Medical Education in Europe (AMEE), as well as in other organizations.

The AzMI trains not only citizens of the Kyrgyz Republic, as well as countries of the near and far abroad, such as Russian Federation, Kazakhstan, Uzbekistan, Tajikistan, Azerbaijan, Afghanistan, Turkey, Lebanon, Somalia, Malaysia, Nepal, Bangladesh, Libya, Nigeria. The Institute has good traditions and is rightfully proud of its staff and students.

At the same time, the overwhelming majority of students at AzMI are students from India and Pakistan.

In this regard, training at the AzMI delivers not only in the official language, but also in English.

The high rank of the Medical Institute the AzMI confirms by providing the quality of education and the quality of material and technical base of the educational process.

The institute implements professional and educational programs of higher and secondary vocational medical education, carries out scientific research, trains specialists of medical doctors and dentists, as well as nurses, being a scientific and methodological center.

The facilities and resources of the institute is located in 5 buildings with a total area of 55,000 m²:

- The AzMI territory includes the student dormitories with a total area of 7605 m², and one of them for students arrived from Pakistan, and another one for students from India (according to the requirements of the steak holders – the embassies of these countries).

- Outside the AzMI, in the center of Kant, there is a dormitory for students from neighboring countries with an area of 542 m².

- Cooks from India and Pakistan work in student canteens, who prepare dishes according to Indian and Pakistani recipes.

Lecture theaters are equipped with interactive whiteboards that provide a modern level of multimedia lecture presentation. In the learning process, an interactive table "Pirogov" is used, as well as the program installed on the cathedral laptops, which are connected to LED TVs with Smart TV support.

There are software tools applications and automated workstations to provide conducting trainings in computer classes.

The AzMI has 157 PCs with computer programs that are used in the educational process, and the Bank of Test Tasks used to students' knowledge assessment.

A new administrative and educational facility was built, which houses two computer classrooms, a testing and examination class, 12 lecture halls, 163 study rooms, a library (delivery

desk and a reading room). The library has a library stock of 13339 exemplars, library loan including dental literature of 1115 exemplars. In addition, the lecture theatres and classrooms of the Institute are located in the building at the address Kant, Sovetskaya St. 3.

Totally, during the existing period the AzMI trained 628 doctors including 465 graduating students on General Medicine, 163 dentists who work overall of Kyrgyzstan and abroad, engaged in health care organizations, as well as in scientific and educational institutions.

As at date June 1, 2021, 4,681 students study at the AzMI, including 4,588 medical and 93 at the dental faculties (of which 4,614 are students from far abroad countries and 30 near abroad, 37 are from Kyrgyzstan), 5 medical resident (1 of Pakistan, 4 from Kyrgyzstan), 2 post-graduate students (from Kyrgyzstan).

At 5 academic departments, 250 employees carry out educational, scientific and medical activities, including 17 professors, 14 doctors of sciences and 57 candidates of sciences, 2 honored physicians.

Additionally, trainings conduct at the AzMI Medical Center – a clinic equipped with modern equipment, in which outpatient acceptance of patients is carried out by 19 specialties. The clinic covers an area of 2378 m² in Bishkek.

The Institute has a license to conduct educational activities in the field of vocational education: series No. LD 170001409 register. No. 17/0341, dated 16.02.2017, perpetual license, order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Kyrgyz Republic No. 189/1; series no. LD 180000512, register no. No. 18/0278 dated 02.08.2018, perpetual license, order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Kyrgyz Republic No. 1005/1; series No. LD 150000576, registration No. 15/0252 dated 02.07.2015, perpetual license, Protocol of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Kyrgyz Republic No. 9/1.

The Asian Medical Institute named after Satkynbaya Tentishev has the right to carry out educational activities in the field of higher professional education in the areas (specialties), levels of education and for a period in accordance with the above licenses, subject to compliance with the fixed control standards and the maximum contingent of students. License expiration dates: perpetual.

IV. DESCRIPTION OF THE PREVIOUS ACCREDITATION PROCEDURE

International program accreditation according to the IAAR standards has not previously been carried out.

V. DESCRIPTION OF THE EEC VISIT

The External Expert Commission (hereinafter referred to as EEC) visit to the AzMI was organized and held from October 26 to October 28, 2021 in accordance with the Program approved by the Director General of IAAR, Ms. A. Zhumagulova, and agreed by Mr. T. Selpiev, Rector of the AzMI.

During the visit, the EEC studied the regulatory and educational/methodological documents for the accredited educational program, educational/methodological complexes of disciplines, methodological documents, visited the structural units and departments declared in the program that ensure implementation the training program, and also checked the operation of the ZOOM information systems.

AzMI ensured the presence of all employees and persons specified in the Visit Program. The three-day EEC Program for International Institutional Accreditation was completed in full, in accordance with the activities distribution by day.

On the first day, October 26, 2021, a preliminary meeting of the Chairman and members of the EEC IAAR took place, during which the goals, program, responsibilities of the EEC members were announced.

On the first day of the visit, a meeting was held with the rector, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor Toychubek Tulekovich Selpiev, who spoke about AzMI and its strategic

development directions. Further, according to the visit program, the IAAR external experts met with the administrative director Chyngyz Kachkynbekovich Alakov, vice-rectors Amanbai Karimovich Matisakov, Janat Asylbekovich Edigeev, Mishra Prashant Ranjan, deans of faculties Kamchibek Askarbekovich Uzakbaev, Shakhriza Satkynovna Kachiyeva, heads of structural divisions: with the academic secretary Zhumabubu Amanbekovna Doskeeva, Head of CID Safina Rifovna Bikkulatova, Inspector of the Department for the Quality of Education and Labor Discipline Daniyar Tologonovich Tologonov, Head of the International Department Amir Khayat, Financial Director Irina Nikolaevna Malorodnya, Inspector of the Human Resources Department Zarema Kazimovna Kanatayeva, Inspector of the Student Personnel Department Zhyldyz Zarylbekovna Kozhonalieva, Lawyer Azamat Idirisov, Head of the Science Department Almira Salmoorbekovna Ashyrbekova, Librarian Nargiza Kanybekovna Dzhusupbaeva, System Administrator Kairat Kanybekovich Orozbaev. During the interviews, EEC members were acquainted with each member of the team, during which everyone has spoken about the type of activity they supervise and the main achievements.

According to the EEC visit program, interviews were conducted with Main Educational Program leaders, heads of the therapeutic disciplines departments Tamila Akhmatovna Shakhanova, Honorary Professor of the AzMI named after S.Tentishev, Head of the natural and humanitarian disciplines department Meerim Sharypbekovna Karagulova, head of the morphological disciplines department Bakyt Bekzhanovich Kulambaev, Candidate of Medical Sciences, head of the Surgical Disciplines Department Nabievich Lyukhurov Ruslan, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Head of the Dentistry Department Toychubek Tulekovich Selpiev, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor (since T.T. Selpiev holds the position of rector, the head teacher of the department was invited for an interview).

The EEC members conducted an interview with HETP of the AzMI, during which they were asked questions, and an online survey of HETP was conducted on the subject of satisfaction with organization the educational process, teaching methods, knowledge and skills control.

All materials requested by the EEC were provided by AzMI representatives in a timely manner. In order to obtain objective information on assessment the AzMI activities, the EEC members carried out a visual inspection of the educational organization main building. Structural divisions and educational and lecture halls were examined: computer class, personnel department, student personnel department, visa department, department of dentistry, dining room, dean's office, inspection department, accounting department, international department, CID, science department, academic secretary, legal department, rector's office, lecture halls and classes of the Department of Therapeutic and Surgical Disciplines, lecture halls and classes of the Department of Morphological Disciplines, simulation center, Pirogov's anatomical table, library, sport hall, assembly hall.

Further, the laboratory building, the educational building in the MIS building were examined, and a visual inspection of the student campuses was carried out. The EEC Members got acquainted with the living conditions of students in dormitories.

At the end of the first day, the EEC members summed up the day results, with discussion the key issues; additional information was identified that needs to be requested from AzMI structural divisions for validation and confirmation of the reliability of information/data during accreditation.

On the second day of the visit, 27.10.2021, according to the visit program, the AzMI practice bases were visited: Chui United Regional Hospital, Municipal Hospital No. 6, Dentistry LLC, Dentistry No. 4 in Bishkek, Maternity Hospital No. 2, Center for General Medical Practice of the Issykatsinsky District.

The EEC members also visited the site where the construction of a 500-bed university hospital with a maternity and children's department and a polyclinic has begun. A dormitory for students and HETP will also be built here.

The EEC experts conducted interviews with students majoring in General Medicine, conducted a survey on their satisfaction with the organization of the educational process, teaching methods, knowledge and skills control.

Also, the EEC experts were working with the departments' documents and attending classes according to the schedule in the Pathological Anatomy disciplines Group 15, 3rd year, teacher E. Abduvaliev, a practical lesson on the topic Acute Inflammation, discipline "Urinary system", teacher A.Tuliyeva, group 16, 3rd year, practical lesson on the topic "Pathophysiol. of Glomerular", Biology (practical lesson); discipline "Obstetrics and gynecology", group 44, 5th year, teacher A. Mekdabekova, practical lesson on the topic "Menstrual cycle"; discipline "Internal Diseases 2", 11th group, 3rd year, teacher I. Frolova, practical lesson on the topic "Auscultation of the lungs".

On the second day, according to the visit program, the EEC experts organized a meeting with employers from Ittefaq Hospital, Alkhidmat Hospital, Serwar General Hospital Sharif Park Kot Abdul Malik, Federal Government Polyclinic Hospital Islamabad, Guru Shri Gorakhnath Chikitsalaya, Medihub Hospital Deoria Tiraha Gorakhpur, BLK HOSPITAL.

A very interesting meeting was held with AzMI graduates of different years of graduation, starting from 2016, and 2020, who work in the leading clinics of their country: Alkhidmat hospital, Ittefaq(trust)hospital, Serwar General Hospital Sharif Park Kot Abdul Malik, Federal Government Polyclinic Hospital Islamabad, ESI HOSPITAL, BLK HOSPITAL, Deen Dayal Upadhy Hospital, Ram Manohar Lohia Hospital, Sardar Bhallav Bhai Patel Hospital, Primary Health Center Nawada, Narayana Superspeciality Hospital, District Hospital, Ram Manohar Lohia Combined Lucknow, etc.

The third day of the EEC work (October 28, 2021), as well as certain periods of the EEC work on previous days, was aimed at discussing the expertizing results, determining parameters and developing recommendations. On the third day, at the appointed time, a final meeting was held with the AzMI leadership, employees of administrative and managerial personnel, MEP leaders, where the experts shared their impressions and voiced recommendations developed by the EEC members based on the results of the work done.

According to the questionnaire survey results:

In general, students positively assessed the AzMI activities in implementation the educational program. For the most part, students say that the dean's office is accessible, they are satisfied with the relationship with the dean's office, with level of accessibility and responsiveness of the university management, and availability of academic, individual counseling (more than 94%). Indicators of the library funds stock availability, the quality of services provided in libraries and reading rooms, the availability of computer classes, the content and information content of the website of educational organizations in general and the faculty in particular, lounges, scientific laboratories, dormitories, in addition to positive answers, also have a certain percentage of unsatisfied answers. (on average from 1.4% to 4.1%).

The HETP survey results indicate high and good satisfaction rates for all processes used in AzMI to implement the educational program.

VI. COMPLIANCE WITH INSTITUTIONAL ACCREDITATION STANDARDS

6.1. Mission and Final Results Standard

Evidence-based part

An updated mission of the institute has been developed and approved, the text of which is posted on the official website www.asmi.kg, as well as on all information stands, in classrooms, in administrative offices and in the AzMI dormitories. The AzMI Mission takes into account and reflects the population health issues, the needs of appropriate medical care for the population through training of highly qualified competitive specialists, by integrating the best world practice in education, science and clinics, based on the principles of evidence-based medicine.

Based on the institute mission, the MEP goals in the field of training and education of specialties of higher and secondary vocational education are formulated.

The [AzMI Development Policy and Strategy](#) for 2021-24 was revised and approved, and the [Action Plan for the AzMI Development Strategy implementation](#) was drawn up. The university has identified 10 strategic directions.

The primary mission of the institute and the development strategy for the previous period were developed in 2018 as part of implementation the national accreditation agency recommendation based on the results of program accreditation ([Protocol No. 18 of 01.12.18](#)). In 2021, during preparing for international institutional accreditation, work was carried out to modify the Policy, Strategy, Vision, and the Action Plan for the development strategy implementation of the institute was updated.

The content of the Mission and Goals were discussed at cathedral meetings, at curatorial hours, at meetings of the student parliament, the Rector's Council and the Academic Council. All AzMI activities are aimed at achieving the results of the declared Mission in all areas of strategic development. The AzMI has achieved particular success in building up the material and technical base, stimulating HETP and students. A special place is occupied in the institute by the fight against any manifestations of corruption, as the main factor hindering high-quality, clear medical education.

The ways and methods of advancing medical research in the field of biomedical, clinical, behavioral and social sciences are reflected in the Mission formulation and in the Vision and goals, and particularly, in the strategic plan, as well as fixed in the [AzMI Charter](#). Scientific studies are reflected in strategic directions 2 and 3 aimed at introducing modern educational programs; new learning technologies; use the scientific achievements in the field of biomedical, clinical, social research in the educational process.

In accordance with the [AzMI Charter](#), the right to participation of students and higher-education teaching personnel in discussion and resolution of issues related to the AzMI activities is assuring.

In order to ensure collegial management of the educational process and the quality of education in the AzMI, the following public bodies function: [Academic Council, Educational and Methodological Council](#), Scientific and Technical Commission; Rectorate Council; Board of Regents, Student Parliament (India, Pakistan, Kyrgyzstan). Through the decisions of the collegiate bodies, HETP influences the AzMI strategy and structural divisions. Students participate in the process of planning, implementing, monitoring the institute activities through the Student Parliaments, the [student leadership system \(headmen\)](#).

During the development of the AzMI Mission and the Policy of Quality Assurance in Education, consultations were held with international experts: PhD, Professor Srivastava Anand Shanker, Chairman and Co-Founder of the innovative research institute "Global Institute of Stem Cell Therapy and Research (GIIOSTAR)", in San Diego, USA, Pilay Radhakrishna Gopal is an MA in Bioinformatics from the University of London.

As a private educational organization, AzMI has sufficient institutional independence (financial autonomy, self-government). Independently determines the content of educational work programs, curricula in accordance with state educational standards, within the framework of credits allocated to the variable part of each block of disciplines.

The final outcomes of graduate education are defined in the main educational programs and the [list of graduate competencies](#), which include general and special (professional) competencies.

Assessment of the learning final outcomes is carried out by the Final State Attestation (FSA) of graduates in accordance with the [Regulations on the Final State Attestation of Graduates of Higher Educational Institutions of the Kyrgyz Republic](#), approved by the Provision of the Government of the Kyrgyz Republic No. 346 of 29.05.2012 and the [Regulations on the Final Interdisciplinary Examination of the AzMI Graduates](#). The composition of the State Attestation Commission (SAC) is formed from among the AzMI higher-education teaching

personnel and specialists of healthcare organizations.

Annually, the AzMI graduates confirm the license obtained after testing at NLE (Pakistan), NEXT (India), MDCN (Nigeria), AMC (Afghanistan), etc. A successful license renewal is a compelling indicator of the clinical competence of our graduates.

Analytical part

Based on the documents analysis results and visual inspection under the conditions of the hybrid form of the visit, the EEC notes that the educational organization has clearly defined the mission, policy and development strategy for the next 5 years. The text of the mission is made available to all interested parties of the educational process. The curators work plans of academic groups reflect the issues of familiarizing students with the ideology of the institute, within the framework of which students are familiarized with the mission and strategic goals of the institute. The institute development strategy covers all activity areas of the educational organization and healthcare. In the approved MEP specialties, the learning outcomes and competencies by type of activity of a specialist are spelled out. Graduate competencies are developed on the basis of the state educational standard and a model catalog of graduate competencies.

It should be noted the insufficient work of the institute to involve all stakeholders in development of the mission, policy and development strategy of the institute, in improving educational programs, which was confirmed by the documents analysis results of collegiate bodies and meetings with focus groups representatives. In addition, the availability of the policy and strategy for the institute development, the MEP of specialties and the final learning outcomes for a wide range of stakeholders is not ensured, and the procedure for communicating information has not been developed. An analysis of the institute activities showed that its main strategy is aimed at foreign customers. Despite this, the institute official website is maintained in Russian, only some information is given in two languages (Mission, oath of a freshman, graduate).

The institute report and the EEC does not provide materials for updating and evaluating the implementation of the previous development strategy, analysis of the real positioning of the institute, which show the lack of systematic work to collect, accumulate and analyze information about its activities. The EEC notes inconsistency of the operational work plans (annual, monthly) of the educational and organizational structural units with the strategic plan for the institute development.

In the EEC course of the work, it was revealed that the institute does not sufficiently provide academic freedom to its employees and students: the names of specific disciplines are written in the section of working curricula "courses of students' choice", no offered alternative options. During the visit, the experts were provided with documents on creation of an elective disciplines catalog and planning a funfair of elective courses.

In the process of questioning, teachers rated the degree of academic freedom of the teaching staff as "very good" - 32 (47.1%), "good" - 32 (47.1%), "relatively good" - 2 (2.9%) , "poor" - 1(1.5%), "very bad" - 1(1.5%)

Strengths/best practice:

No strengths identified for this standard.

EEC recommendations:

1. From the 2022-2023 academic year, the AzMI leadership should organize training for managers and specialists of relevant structures on the quality assurance system of an educational organization, in particular, conducting and assessing the strengths and weaknesses of the institute, the frequency and procedure for monitoring the strategy implementation, the procedures for documenting the quality system;
2. From the 2022-2023 academic year, the AzMI leadership should develop and implement

mechanisms for involving all stakeholders in the discussion and adjustment of the institute concept documents;

3. Since 01.01.2022, the AzMI leadership, in order to ensure transparency and inform stakeholders, improve the institute official website work, with the possibility of providing information in Kyrgyz, Russian and English;

4. Since 01.01.2022, the AzMI leadership is to review the operational plans of all structural divisions in accordance with the approved plan for implementation the AzMI Development Strategy for 2021-2025;

5. Since 01.01.2022, MEP managers should develop mechanisms for generating a list of elective courses and organizing the procedure for choosing them by students;

6. As of 01.03.2022, the AzMI Vice-Rector for Academic and Scientific Affairs to develop a regulation on implementation of the teachers' research results to improve teaching and content of subjects.

EEC conclusions on this standard: strong positions – 0, satisfactory– 22, suppose to be improve –5.

6.2. Standard «Educational Programs»

Evidence-based part

The AzMI educational program model includes general and professional competencies and is included in the structure of the corresponding modular educational programs.

The Working Curriculum (WC) contains fundamental, general, social/humanitarian and specialized clinical disciplines, divided into compulsory, optional and elective courses.

The total labor intensity of the MEP "General Medicine" is 360 credits.

The educational program development methodology is partly based on the introduction of the European educational system, according to which the modular-rating technology "Regulations on organizing the educational process in the AzMI using the modular-rating learning technology" with the current and final control of progress has been determined.

The learning process implementation represents a logical sequence of disciplines in the educational process with their integration horizontally and vertically, with a progressive complication the theoretical information and practical skills.

The constant self-improvement process of students covers all the competencies of graduate. Various forms of training are applicable for achieving above: training based on a clinical case, interactive, problem-based, lectures, team training, lectures-symposia; attending scientific and practical, pathological and anatomical conferences; writing and presentation reference paper and projects, development of algorithms and schemes for patient management, recording of medical reports, teachers consultations outside lesson hours, work in scientific group, preparation of articles, abstracts, independent work with electronic databases of evidence-based medicine.

The teaching methods include cohort lectures, and practice work in small groups.

Based on modern teaching principles that stimulate, prepare and support learners and ensure that learners are responsible for their learning process. Thanks to the systematic ideological work of teachers and curators, each AzMI student clearly and intelligibly understands and realizes the responsibility of future profession, as well as the importance and necessity of constantly deepening knowledge and improving skills.

In the AzMI educational program, the biomedical sciences are represented by the following disciplines: anatomy, histology, embryology, cytology, microbiology, virology, immunology, physiology, biology, biochemistry, basic pharmacology, pathophysiology, through which students receive the basic knowledge necessary in the future to study clinical disciplines.

The AzMI behavioral sciences are presented in the courses Psychology, Psychiatry and Narcology, Childhood Diseases-3.

In each clinical discipline, during studying the methods of collecting anamnesis, physical examination, and observation of patients, the issues of patient behavior, features of communication with patients and relatives are considered in detail. Much attention is paid to the issues of communication with severe patients and their relatives.

There are also considered the communication and behavioral issues in the field of palliative medicine.

Analytical part

The Institute management constantly involves interested parties in the development of educational programs, to evaluate its effectiveness, analysis is carried out by international experts.

The educational programs actualization is carried out taking into account the development and needs of healthcare.

The analysis demonstrated that the Working Curriculum implemented in AzMI has a modular-credit structure. In the course of mastering the EP, the graduate must acquire 17 universal competencies and 30 professional competencies, which is voluminous and unrealistic to provide in the learning process with the capabilities of the institute.

The final outcomes of the training program are not clearly articulated. When analyzing and interviewing target groups, it was found that assessment methods, training methods and final outcomes are not comparable with each other.

The AzMI educational process is carried out according to the SES HPE and consists of the following cycles of disciplines: general humanitarian and socio-economic, general mathematical and natural science, professional and work experience internship. The total labor intensity of mastering the MEP "General Medicine" is 360 credits (credit units). SES HPE "General Medicine" requires in the structure of the EP to be included in the block "disciplines (modules)" in the amount of 325, "Practice" 25 credits and "State final certification" 10 credits. However, in the "Medicine" curriculum in AzMI, these indicators are less than the required volume in relation to the standard, the number of credits in the discipline/module block has been increased by 19 credits, and credits for practice and State final certification have been reduced in volume.

Strengths/best practice

The content of the AzMI educational programs (EP) contributes to development of students professional competencies and achievement the learning goals.

The AzMI conducts a regular revision of the educational program with the aim of introducing modern achievements

EEC recommendations:

1. MEP managers for the 2022-2023 academic year should bring the total volume of educational programs in line with the volume norms of the international and state standards.
2. MEP managers for the 2022-2023 academic year to determine the learning outcomes of educational programs and curricula (syllabuses) based on the Dublin descriptors;
3. MEP managers for the 2022-2023 academic year, taking into account the final results of each MEP, develop and implement appropriate innovative teaching methods and technologies;
4. MEP managers to develop and include in the educational programs the discipline "scientific research design", in order to teach the elements of fundamental and applied research;
5. As of 01.01.2022, the AzMI leadership, in order to ensure the achievement of the final learning outcomes, create a collegial advisory body (Committee of Educational Programs), including representatives of all interested parties, whose functions are to develop the concept and manage educational programs;
6. As of 01.01.2022, the AzMI leadership is to introduce into the educational process modern teaching methods and technologies ("Case-study" technology) aimed at the ability to apply theoretical knowledge to solving a practical problem, forming motivation for independent

clinical and analytical thinking of students.

EEC conclusions on this standard: strong positions – 0, satisfactory– 36, suppose to be improve –7.

6.3. Student Assessment Standard

Evidence-based part

There are clearly defined types of control (current, intermediate, final) and assessment criteria in the AzMI. These assessment criteria are included into the academic and methodological complex and syllabuses of subjects. The syllabuses are available for students in the first lesson, and are displayed in each classroom. The assessment criteria clearly and in detail describes the criteria for assessing students' answers, the distribution of points by type of control and how all collected points are calculated in the final grade. The students' knowledge assessment in the studied disciplines is carried out by computer testing, oral and combined control and is divided into current, midterm and final control, which meets the state educational standards requirements.

During examinations (testing, practical skills, Final State Attestation), the video observation is conducted, the recordings of which, if necessary, can be shown to students, their parents and other interested persons.

In AzMI the educational process, several assessment methods are used: Ongoing assessment – daily control, supervision and assessment of the skills and knowledge training of students. For this purpose, methods of oral questioning, individual written work, group assignments and control knowledge assessments are used.

Monitoring of the academic load, progress of students in the basic educational program is carried out by the CID, the dean's office, departments, the department of education quality and labor discipline. The educational plans, educational process schedule, the curriculum of disciplines/modules and class schedule are documents for analyzing the academic load of students. The number of exams corresponds to the number of disciplines, excepting the Physical Education discipline. For example: according to the professional cycle, the following disciplines are presented in the basic part of the WC: general and clinical biochemistry, normal anatomy, histology, embryology, cytology, normal physiology, microbiology, virology and immunology, basic pharmacology, pathological anatomy, pathological physiology, infectious diseases, i.e. 9 disciplines and 9 exams are presented. The therapy block includes 6 disciplines: propedtherapy, endocrinology, occupational diseases, hematology, internal medicine, outpatient therapy, and according to the WC, students take an exam in internal medicine.

Analytical part

In the submitted documents and in the AzMI self-assessment report, as well as during the interview of the teaching staff and students, the methods for assessing the quality of student learning used during the educational process were described in the form of: oral and written exams, testing in writing or using computers, passing practical skills. In accordance with the curriculum, the knowledge gained, including the independent work of students, is checked and evaluated during the semester (current assessment), as well as during the examination session (summarized /final assessment). The types of assessment are determined in accordance with the goals and objectives of the learning process.

The AzMI departments are not working to revise assessment tools for key assessment values (validity, reliability, fairness, development, timeliness, efficiency), assessment characteristics.

During the analysis, the experts did not find evidence that the assessment methods have undergone a validation procedure, the introduction of new effective methods that allow to

objectively identifying both theoretical knowledge and formed competencies and skills.

Strengths/best practice

Throughout the Students Assessment Standard, no strengths were identified.

EEC recommendations:

1. As of 01.01.2022, the AzMI leadership to introduce the application of the criteria-based assessment principles to achieving the learning outcomes based on certain, approved and published assessment criteria;
2. Until 01.01.2022, the AzMI leadership is to optimize the system for assessing learning outcomes, taking into account the adequacy, reliability and validity of assessment methods, with the formation of a high-quality mechanism for assessing the competence of a graduate using an objective structured practical and clinical exam (Objective Structured Practical Examination and Objective Structured Clinical Examination);
3. Until 01.01.2022, the AzMI leadership is to train the HETP of clinical departments in modern assessment methods.

EEC Conclusions by Criteria: Strong – 0, satisfactory – 4, suppose to be improve – 8.

6.4 «Learner» standard

Evidence-based part

The recruitment policy of applicants to the Institute is carried out in accordance with the requirements of the regulatory legal acts of the Kyrgyz Republic ["On the approval of regulations governing the admission of applicants to Higher Educational Institutions of the Kyrgyz Republic" No. 256 dated 27.05.2011](#), ["On approval of regulatory and legal acts regulating the activities of educational organizations of higher and secondary vocational education of the Kyrgyz Republic" No. 53 dated February 3, 2004](#)", On the basis of regulatory legal acts, the ["Rules on Admission of Applicants to AzMI"](#) were developed, approved by the rector of AzMI on June 16, 2021, ["Regulations on Admission and Training foreign citizens"](#), approved by the decision of the AzMI Academic Council dated 09.03.2019 No. 20. The student admission policy is reviewed annually. The admission rules provide for the possibility of accepting students with disabilities. Reception of foreign citizens from far abroad is carried out in cooperation with intermediary firms.

The transfer of students from other universities is carried out in accordance with the regulatory legal acts of the Kyrgyz Republic and on the basis of the ["Regulations on the procedure for the transfer, restoration and expulsion of students of the Asian Medical Institute. S. Tentishev"](#), approved by the rector of AzMI on 02.06.2021. The transfer policy does not restrict the transfer of students from other universities.

The material and technical capabilities of the institute, the academic potential of the institute regulate the admission of students. The enrollment plan for students is determined on the basis of the License for the right to conduct educational activities, which limits the maximum number of students: in the specialties of General Medicine (5 years) - up to 3500 students, in the specialty General Medicine (6 years) - up to 2500 students, in the specialty Dentistry - up to 500 students. The contingent of students is coordinated with the Ministry of Health of the Kyrgyz Republic.

The AzMI has a system of academic counseling for students. Curators and heads of departments, HETP, on social and financial issues - by the vice-rector for educational work and the legal department, on visa issues and academic mobility - by the International Relations Department, carry out consulting on the educational process.

The student leadership system (course leaders, stream leaders, group leaders) and the "Senior-to-Junior" System (mentoring system for senior students) are actively working in the

AzMI. For example, Zabih Ullah, 6th year student, opened a YouTube channel and a website for junior students. Mohammad Awais, 5th year student, also opened a YouTube channel, where he advises junior students. Senior students conduct consultations, additional classes and can lead classes as a teacher for junior students (Co-teaching Method).

The Institute provides support to students: medical care and annual medical examinations at the AzMI Medical Center; financial support in the form of grants, nominal scholarships, tuition discounts, payment for academic mobility and organized events; a system of benefits and free education for socially vulnerable students is used. The Institute provides psychological support to students. According to the Rector's Order No. 5 dated 02.02.2019 "On encouraging students", students are provided with discounts on tuition from 30 to 100%. For 2019-2021 the institute for holding conferences and competitions for students has allocated 30,500 soms. The AzMI student, Priyanki Chahal, holder of a 1st degree diploma in the international competition "The Best Student of the CIS", her trips to all conferences are funded by the Institute, and she was given a 100% discount on tuition.

Students have their own representation in the AzMI collegial advisory body - members of the Academic Council of the Institute are 2 students (Abishek Nagar, 5th year student, N. Alymjonov, 4th year student), who participate in the development, management, evaluation, control and monitoring of educational programs. The AzMI has a student self-government body - the Student Parliament, which participates in organizing the social, cultural, educational and scientific life of the institute. All information about incentive measures for students is specified in the "Regulations on incentive measures for students of the AzMI named after S. Tentishev", approved by the rector of the institute on 20.11.2018.

Analytical part

The processes of admission and selection of students organized at the Institute meet the criteria of the standard. The students admission policy, including those with disabilities, has been defined and implemented, including selection criteria, a system for appealing admission decisions. The admissions policy is reviewed annually. The number of accepted students corresponds to the material and technical capabilities of the institute and the license for the right to conduct educational activities.

The Institute has a system of academic counseling for students. At the same time, students are not informed about the choice of electives, the choice of specialty and preparation for residency training, the issues of planning a professional career, which was found out during meetings with students.

The Institute has representation of students in a collegial advisory body - the Academic Council. At the same time, the representation of students in the Academic Council is insufficient, which makes it difficult for students to participate in development, management and evaluation the educational programs.

Strong points

The strong point of the institute is the student support programs that are aimed at social, financial and personal needs. Resources are allocated to support students: a system of tuition discounts of 20 - 100% caused by good and excellent academic performance, scholarships, academic mobility, and events - holidays, competitions, festivals. Medical care is provided for students at the institute's clinic, including medical examinations.

EEC recommendations:

1. Until 01.01.2021, the AzMI leadership, in order to organize a full-fledged system of academic consulting, include in the staff of dean's offices staff units of advisors or mentors who will perform advisory functions and career guidance counseling among students.
2. The AzMI leadership for the 2022-2023 academic year to create a Career Center to form and implement an effective career path for a student, graduate, specialist on the principle of

lifelong learning.

3. The AzMI leadership for the 2022-2023 academic year to expand the representation of students in the Academic Council of the Institute and other collegiate advisory bodies.

In general, according to Standard 4 "Learners", the AzMI's activities meet the criteria of the Standard.

EEC Conclusions by Criteria: strong – 2, satisfactory – 14, suppose to be improve – 2.

6.5 Standard «Academic Staff/Teachers»

Evidence-based part

The personnel policy is built in accordance with the requirements of the regulatory legal acts of the Kyrgyz Republic and the Regulations on the procedure for the selection of personnel and hiring, approved by the administrative director of AzMI on 06/08/2021. In the process of recruiting [candidates](#) for the Higher-education teaching personnel (HETP), attention is paid to such criteria activities, such as competence, work experience, candidate development potential, team spirit, etc. Priority is given to persons with higher qualifications, scientific degree and scientific title, skills and experience of pedagogical and scientific work, clinical work experience in the relevant specialty discipline and others (characteristics, awards, recommendations, etc.).

The AzMI employs HETP, which has the necessary qualifications and professional experience. 250 employees are involved in the educational process, of which 191 people (76.4%) are full-time employees, 59 people (23.6%) are part-time employees. The ratio between medical and non-medical teachers is 3.1:1, between full-time and part-time teachers is 2.8:1, between full-time teachers and part-time teachers is 3.2:1. The share of employees with academic degrees and titles is 41%.

The teacher's workload is 1500 hours per year. When taking into account the individual workload, hours are provided for implementation the educational, educational/methodological, research, medical diagnostic and social work, which involves the performance of all types of compulsory work by the academic staff.

The teacher-student ratio is 1:18.

To ensure continuous professional development, teachers undertake courses "Improvement of pedagogical skills", advanced training courses in their specialty in third-party educational organizations.

The AzMI provides a system of material and non-material incentives for teachers:

- annual [salary increment](#) (from 2018 to 2021 was at least 140%);
- premium (bonuses) to wages;
- the best employees at the end of the year go on vacation at the institute expense;
- sending to foreign business trips for the purpose of advanced training, internships, medical work, etc.;
- free postgraduate education and preferential residency training for full-time employees.

The institute has developed a HETP reward system for special achievements in research activities.

Analytical part

The Institute has defined and implemented a policy for selection and admission of employees, there are standard transparent procedures for admission and selection the HETP on a competitive basis and in accordance with qualification requirements. The level of English language proficiency is taken into account.

In the AzMI, there is an imbalance between the teaching, scientific and service functions of employees due to a small staff of teaching staff, a large number of students and a high teaching load, as a result of which teachers do not conduct enough clinical work and are limited in time in conducting research work. This is evidenced by the lack of scientific activity, confirmed in the

course of interviews with employees.

The quantitative ratio "teacher - student", which is 1:18 (against the recommended by international ISO standards - 1:12), is not observed.

The institute has a rather low proportion of teachers with academic degrees and titles (41%), which indicates the insufficiency of measures to stimulate research activities. The HETP qualification requirements are not always met.

Insufficient knowledge of teachers about teaching/learning methods was noted, there was no assessment of the competencies and activities of teachers, which was clarified during meetings with the teaching staff and during the evaluation of classes.

Strong points

None strengths/best practices.

EEC recommendations:

1. The AzMI leadership for the 2022-2023 academic year bring the teacher-student ratio to the ISO standards requirements.
2. The AzMI leadership to create a clear policy for the promotion, motivation, and encouragement of the institute employees.
3. The AzMI leadership for the 2022-2023 academic year to increase the "academic degree holders rate" of the teaching staff for development of the institute educational research policy.
4. The AzMI leadership should contribute to the development of scientific activity among the teaching staff, including in the field of medical education.
5. The AzMI leadership for the 2022-2023 academic year to conclude agreements/memorandums on cooperation with medical universities of near and far abroad in order to ensure academic mobility of teachers and students.
6. The AzMI leadership for the 2022-2023 academic year to organize training for teaching staff in new educational technologies (case study, etc.) with monitoring of their implementation in the educational process.
7. The AzMI leadership for the 2022-2023 academic year to introduce the rating assessment of teachers in order to improve the qualification level, the productivity of pedagogical and scientific work.

In general, according to Standard 5 "Academic Staff/Teachers", the AzMI activities meet the Standard criteria.

EEC Conclusions by Criteria: Strong – 0; satisfactory – 9; suppose to be improve – 3; unsatisfactory – 0.

6.6 «Educational Resources» Standard

Evidence-based part

The AzMI has created a material and technical base for the educational activities implementation. A new educational building, a medical center with 32 beds and 7 dormitories were built and put into operation. The material and technical base includes more than 200 classrooms, 16 lecture halls, 2 computer classes equipped with 157 computers, 2 libraries and 2 reading rooms, a simulation center. The total area of the premises is more than 55000m². There is a fleet of vehicles (10 minibuses and cars) for students' and HETPs transportation.

To develop the material and technical base of the institute, construction of a clinic for 800 people and a residential building for 120 apartments has begun.

The institute library has more than 17,000 copies of educational publications, a repository that includes publications of employees, access to electronic libraries [PubMed](#), [eLibrary](#), [Web of Science](#) (as stated in the report), which is not confirmed by the relevant agreements. The above

indicates a limited access to electronic educational opportunities for educational and scientific activities and may affect the quality of educational services.

For students to acquire clinical experience, the AzMI has signed 8 contracts with clinical sites with a capacity of 120 to 330 beds, a total of 2198 beds. Clinical sites include regional and city hospitals, city polyclinics, the Center for General Medical Practice, and a maternity hospital. Practical training is also carried out on the basis of the AzMI Medical Center.

The AzMI has a distributed type simulation center equipped with basic equipment, which does not allow for the development of students practical skills in conditions of limited access to patients.

To implement the AzMI strategy in using information technologies in the educational process, the [eBilim](#) Information Management System was developed and is being implemented, which provides for the automation of administrative activities, the learning process (monitoring attendance, academic performance and quality of education, current and final assessment of knowledge, electronic statements). There are 2 websites of the institute: www.asmi.kg , www.asmi.edu.kg.

The AzMI development strategy provides for priority scientific research in the field of fundamental and applied medicine. The Institute provides its own fund for research. The scientific research results are being introduced into the educational process and medical work by developing educational/methodological materials and including them in lectures and practical exercises.

The AzMI reviews educational programs to a limited extent, which is confirmed by the documents presented during the EEC visit - educational programs have only one review. To conduct an examination in the field of education, the Department of Quality in Education and Department of Labor Discipline were created. Research in the field is presented in only one collection of the AzMI scientific papers.

The Institute has defined a policy of cooperation with national and foreign universities. AzMI has memorandums of cooperation with national educational organizations and the University of the Republic of Kazakhstan: KazNMU named after Asfendiyarov, KSMA named after I.K. Akhunbaev, Osh State University, ZhaSU named after B. Osmonov, the Scientific Research Medical and Social Institute (SRMSI). However, these agreements are not enough for the full implementation the policy of cooperation at the international level.

Analytical part

Analysis based on the EEC visit results showed that AzMI has the material and technical base to ensure adequate development of the educational program and comfortable living conditions for students and teachers, as well as a safe environment for learning. The AzMI's development strategy provides for continuous improvement of the material and technical base and a separate budget has been allocated.

Students and teachers do not have wide access to external electronic library systems and international databases, which reduces the quality of education and makes it difficult to conduct scientific research, including in education.

Practical training is organized at the clinical sites and at the AzMI Medical Center; however, the available resources do not provide adequate clinical experience for 4500 trainees, primarily in terms of the number of patients. It is also difficult to develop practical skills for students in the context of a significant reduction in access to patients, both due to the coronavirus pandemic and due to the fact that the main contingent of students are foreign citizens.

The available resources are insufficient to provide practical training, especially in terms of trainees' access to specialized and highly specialized care. Under these conditions, the simulation center has a leading role; however, its equipment is insufficient, especially in terms of high-tech equipment. The simulation center needs to be upgraded and developed.

An analysis of the materials presented by the institute during the EEC work, and interviews in target groups showed that the research base of the Institute is not sufficiently formed. Priority research topics of the institute are of a framework nature. The Institute does not have a site for

conducting scientific research (for example, an accredited laboratory for collective use), which affects the range and quality of scientific research. A scientific library has not been formed, there are no access to international databases. research activity in the field of education is carried out at an insufficient level.

A promising direction for the institute development is the promotion of the institute scientific research, including in the field of education, which is impossible without cooperation with national and foreign medical universities, faculties, research centers, clinics.

Strong points

The AzMI has a good and constantly developing material and technical base to ensure a high-quality educational process and comfortable living conditions for students and employees: a new educational building, dormitories, and its own clinic.

EEC recommendations:

1. The AzMI leadership for the 2022-2023 academic year to expand the list of clinical sites, primarily clinics for specialized and highly specialized care, because the existing ones do not provide the required number and list of patients, which makes it difficult for students to access patients and develop appropriate professional competencies.

2. The AzMI leadership for the 2022-2023 academic year to plan a fund (resources) for the development of a simulation center, on the basis of which practical skills will be mastered in the relevant specialties.

3. The AzMI leadership for the 2022-2023 academic year to reduce the HETP teaching workload to provide the opportunity to engage in other activities - research, medical.

4. The AzMI leadership for the 2022-2023 academic year to modernize the library in terms of providing access to electronic library systems (national and international), electronic databases (national and international).

5. The AzMI leadership for the 2022-2023 academic year to create a scientific library.

6. The vice-rector for academic and scientific work and the heads of departments for the 2022-2023 academic year should formulate specific research areas and topics in the field of life sciences.

7. The AzMI leadership for the 2022-2023 academic year, allocate resources for creation an accredited laboratory for collective use.

8. The AzMI leadership for the 2022-2023 academic year, in order to ensure the proper level of international cooperation and promotion of the institute at the national and international levels, it is necessary, on the basis of agreements, to expand the AzMI interaction with universities, clinics and research centers, primarily foreign ones, in terms of joint research - research activities, academic mobility of teachers and students, introduction of the practice of network programs/double degree programs.

In general, according to Standard 6 "Educational Resources", the AzMI activity meets the Standard criteria.

EEC Conclusions by Criteria: Strong – 1; satisfactory – 14; suppose to be improve – 13; unsatisfactory – 0.

6.7. «Evaluation of the Educational Program» Standard

Evidence-based part

According to the self-assessment report, internal and external mechanisms are used in AzMI to monitor and evaluate the educational program. External mechanisms include independent graduate evaluation and specialized accreditation. For example, the AzMI uses an

external evaluation mechanism, which is documented by: Agency for Accreditation of Educational Programs and Organizations, EdNet.

Internal mechanisms include: assessment of students and teachers, self-assessment of the university; internal control of departments, as well as current, intermediate and final certification of students.

A systematic information collection on the satisfaction of the educational services consumer with respect to the program is carried out through a survey of students, graduates, and faculty. The survey is conducted anonymously once during the academic year. They have the opportunity to express their satisfaction, make suggestions for improvement through various anonymous surveys and group discussions at different levels, through direct participation in the administrative process. A report on the survey of students of the Faculty of Medicine for the 2020-2021 academic year on student satisfaction with the AzMI educational process has been presented. The questionnaire for students included 17 evaluation criteria, in total 3087 students took part in the survey, 8% of them were not satisfied, and it was proposed to improve the quality of teaching materials and expand the use of active teaching methods in senior courses. In addition, in order to evaluate and improve the educational process, the feedback from HETP and employees, as well as from the outside - from alumni and employers, is systematically studied through participation in various surveys, meetings and discussions.

The EP systematic evaluation is carried out in accordance with the requirements of the current regulatory documents (AzMI Charter, QMS Guidelines, Regulations on the Department of Education Quality Management and Labor Discipline of the Asian Medical Institute named after S. Tentishev, methodological guide "Monitoring and evaluation of the quality of the educational process at AzMI named after S. Tentishev", approved by the rector of the institute on 10.07.2021) and takes into account many criteria: the model, structure, content and duration of the EP, the use of mandatory and elective parts.

Evaluation of special components of the EP in terms of course content, teaching methods and assessment is an integral part of monitoring the provision of services.

The process of monitoring, control and evaluation is carried out using the following mechanisms: self-assessment (at the end of the course); assessment by colleagues in the department; assessment by management, heads of the department / department and assessment by students. Monitoring is also carried out by analyzing the assessment during open lessons, mutual visits, master classes, recordings of lessons from video cameras, assessment of video lessons. The assessment results of the EP special components are discussed at a meeting of the department/unit, depending on the circumstances, at the Academic Council, and are taken into account to improve the effectiveness of teaching activities, optimize educational and methodological activities. Corrective action is taken if necessary (as an example).

To assess and improve the EP, AzMI collects and monitors information on student and teacher satisfaction through participation in various surveys, discussion groups and advisory bodies.

The systematic comprehensive survey, which is conducted at the end of the semester, is anonymous.

At the end of each academic year, the EP is subject to discussion and updating as necessary, taking into account: the academic performance of students and graduates.

Analytical part

The EEC Members analyzed the institute internal documents on monitoring and assessing the quality of the educational process submitted by the institute: the methodological guide "Monitoring and assessing the quality of the educational process at AzMI named after S. Tentishev", approved by the rector of the institute on 10.07.2021 and a report on monitoring activities to implement the development strategy of the AzMI named after S. Tentishev for 2021-2024 approved by the rector of the institute on 07.09.2021.

Based on the analysis results of the submitted documents and work with focus groups, the

EEC members found that AzMI has not implemented an effective program for monitoring the main components, processes and results of MEP, including the collection and analysis of data on various aspects of MEP, analysis of students' educational achievements, mechanisms are not sufficiently developed receiving feedback from HETP and students. Accordingly, the possibilities for improving the structure, content and final results of the MEP are limited. In the AzMI, the system for assessing and improving the content of educational programs, teaching methods and student assessment does not meet the requirements.

In the presented methodological guide "Monitoring and evaluation of the educational process quality in AzMI named after. S. Tentishev", approved by the Rector of the Institute on 10.07.2021, there is no clearly and in detail described methodology for the internal evaluation of the curriculum as a whole and its components. It is not entirely clear how and with what tools a student's progress or regression is assessed.

The presented results of monitoring, questioning, as well as a sociological study on student satisfaction are offered on a Google drive and a website in Russian, which is not available for the institute foreign students, to express their opinion on assessment the EP, given that the educational process is in English. The EEC Members believe that AzMI's once-a-year feedback collection is not enough to see the "overall picture", to make visible all the shortcomings of the educational program or possible ways to improve it. The information provided in the self-report is that the student parliament participates in commissions for evaluation and monitoring of the teaching - learning - assessment process as representatives of this commission was not confirmed by documents and when interviewing students and graduates.

During the meeting and interviews with employers, the commission came to the conclusion that they were satisfied with the training quality of graduates, however, the institute at the required level could not demonstrate feedback from them on the educational program and clinical practice of graduates.

Strengths/best practice

According to the "Evaluation of the Educational Program" Standard the commission did not identify strengths.

EEC recommendations:

1. The AzMI leadership for the 2022-2023 academic year to determine the strategy and mechanisms for monitoring and evaluating the MEP processes and outcomes;
2. The AzMI leadership for the 2022-2023 academic year to optimize the assessment system and improve the content of educational programs, teaching methods and student assessment, taking into account the requirements of the international standard for internal quality assurance (by the ESG);
3. The AzMI leadership for the 2022-2023 academic year to develop and implement methods for assessing the validity, reliability and fairness of methods for assessing academic achievements of students and ensure accessibility for external expertise;
4. The AzMI leadership for the 2022-2023 academic year to create and ensure the continuous functioning of an impartial commission from among the interested parties to evaluate and improve the educational programs. Use the surveys analysis results and interviews of graduates on evaluating the educational programs effectiveness in improving the institute activities;
5. The AzMI leadership on a regular basis on the official website to publish reports on the stakeholders recommendations in planning the educational programs and improvements in the educational quality;
6. The AzMI leadership for the 2022-2023 academic year to determine and implement a policy on the use of expertise in development the teaching methods and student assessment;
7. The AzMI leadership to develop research in the field of medical education, to promote the teaching staff desire to improve the education quality;

8. By the end of the 2021-2022 academic year, the AzMI leadership to analyze and identify a range of stakeholders, including partner organizations and representatives of the public and healthcare systems from the students countries of origin to participate in discussions in development, revision and implementation of the MEP;

9. The AzMI leadership to provide feedback to students and HETP on an ongoing basis, which includes information about the MEP process and products, and information about bad practices or inappropriate behavior of HETP and students.

EEC Conclusions by Criteria: Strong – 0, satisfactory – 7, suppose to be improve – 16.

6.8. «Management and Administration» Standard

Evidence-based part

The AzMI is a non-profit educational institution with a private form of ownership, acting on the basis of the [Charter of the Asian Medical Institute](#), which sets out the main provisions on the [organizational structure](#), types of activities and legal details.

The AzMI Founder makes the main decisions on the management and choice of directions of the institute's activities. The Administrative Director carries out the management of the Institute for financial and economic issues and is an accountable person of the Founder.

The main advisory body of the AzMI management is the Academic Council, which is chaired by the rector.

The main governing body in solving, organizing and fulfilling the current tasks of the AZMI development is the [Rector's Council](#), whose functions include coordination, analysis, generalization and assessment of various areas of the AZMI activity, its individual divisions, as well as decision-making on issues of relations with state education and health authorities, other educational institutions, international organizations, employers.

The Academic Council includes the presidents of the student parliaments of India, Pakistan, Kyrgyzstan, representatives of public health, as well as employers (Mukayeva R.M., Kydykeev R.B., Aralbaeva A.R.).

According to the AzMI Charter, the rector, vice-rector for education quality and labor discipline, vice-rector for academic and scientific work, and vice-rector for educational work are responsible for development and management the educational program.

The leading developer of the educational program is the academic staff with coordination the departments heads work on fundamental and clinical disciplines. Direct management and control of the development, management and monitoring of the educational program are entrusted to the educational and methodological council, the dean's office and the educational and methodological department ([Regulation on the dean's office](#), [Regulation on the educational and methodological council](#)).

As a private, non-profit educational organization, the institute has full autonomy in implementing the institute financial policy, in receiving and spending financial and material resources in accordance with the budget of income and expenses. The administrative director carries out management of the institute economic and financial activities. The budget is formed in accordance with the estimate of income and expenses of the institute, which is approved by the administrative director in agreement with the AzMI Founder based on the Charter. The administrative director ensures implementation the estimate of income and expenses of the institute, considering the feasibility of certain cost items for the efficiency and effectiveness of the educational programs provision.

The AzMI financing system is based on the priority directions of the institute development, related to implementation the mission and goals of the organization. The efficiency and effectiveness of the financial management system is assessed by taking into account external and internal factors affecting the AzMI activities, with identification of prospects, risks and challenges. The AzMI structural divisions independently plan their needs for financial support

for effective activities, draw up applications that are considered and discussed at production meetings and collegial bodies.

The AzMI independently establishes remuneration for each employee individually according to the operation results, in accordance with the regulation on motivation and stimulation the academic staff creative and effective activity, which lays down the criteria for material and non-material incentives ([Regulation on salary incentive increments](#)).

It provides for the allocation of grants for scientific research of the academic staff and students, for holding scientific and practical conferences and seminars, funds are also allocated to finance the participation of students in international conferences (travel, accommodation).

In 2018, the Department of the Independent Inspection was renamed into the Education Quality Department and Labor Discipline (hereinafter referred to as EQLD), in order to make the transition from disparate tools for monitoring and improving the quality of education to a holistic quality management system. The Education Quality Department is directly subordinate to the founder and carries out planning and monitoring of the quality characteristics of the processes.

The QMS is a tool for systematizing and documenting all processes for regular monitoring and improvement of all areas of activity, for which the European Center for Professional Development conducted an introductory training course for personnel "Change Management (Quality Systems)" on May 7, 2021 for the Institute staff.

The quality of the MEP is ensured through monitoring the MEP implementation. The monitoring process involves both higher-education teaching personnel, administrative structures. Departments and administrative divisions are engaged in collection and storage of information, and its primary analysis.

Based on the [Order of the Ministry of Health of the Kyrgyz Republic dated 09.29.2018 No. 680](#) "On approval of the list of clinical sites of higher and secondary medical educational institutions of the Kyrgyz Republic", AzMI concluded agreements with 8 clinical sites, including national medical centers, research institutes, republican and city hospitals, and maternity hospitals in which clinical training is conducted.

The AzMI cooperation with clinical sites is carried out in accordance with the [Action Plan for implementation the AzMI Development Strategy 2021-2024](#) (on task number 4.2 "Interaction with clinical sites"), which provides for the provision a regulatory framework, close integration with practical health care and material and technical support of clinical bases, classrooms and laboratories.

The AzMI carries out close cooperation with the leading republican and city health authorities. The institute specialists take part in provision of medical care through the air ambulance, emergency medical care, in complex checks of the medical care quality at the outpatient and inpatient level. The AzMI employees took an active part in the fight against COVID-19, working in the "Red Zone" in the medical institutions of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Kyrgyz Republic (doctors Talantbekov TT, Mirzaev UB, Kasymov AA, Dononbaeva NA, Zhumabekov A Sh., Etc.)

Students, together with their teachers, annually take an active part in medical-prophylactic and sanitary-educational events of the city and republican level, such as AIDS Day, Diabetes Day, Cardiovascular Disease Prevention Day, Donor Day. For charitable purposes and for the provision of medical assistance, visits to nursing homes and children's homes are carried out annually.

Analytical part

The Institute Academic Council, as the main advisory management body, conducts its activities in accordance with the [Regulations on the Academic Council](#) of a higher educational institution of the Kyrgyz Republic, approved by the Decree of the Government of the Kyrgyz Republic dated May 29, 2012. The composition of the Academic Council was agreed with the Deputy Minister of Education and Science of the Kyrgyz Republic and approved by the rector of the institute. The staff included the heads of administrative and academic structures, teachers, the

director of the Center for General Medical Practice and the head of the dentistry department of the Center for General Medical Practice of the Issyk-Ata region and 3 representatives of the institute student parliament. The meetings plan of the Academic Council was approved, which provides for 10 meetings per academic year.

There are developed and approved a number of internal regulations governing the main institute activities. Normative legal documents are posted on the AzMI official website.

The EEC notes the institute work in monitoring the educational process quality, in accordance with the approved regulation. The survey results were discussed at the Academic Council meetings. The development procedure and the algorithm for monitoring and improving the MEP are defined.

The institute has complete autonomy in the distribution of resources, independently establishes additional payments to wages within the internal regulation framework on encouragement the AzMI employees. During the interview with the EEC and the results of the survey showed the satisfaction of teachers with the amount of remuneration.

At the same time, the EEC noted the imperfection of the management process, including in terms of personnel management, finance, EP, and transparency in decision-making. The institute does not assess the risks of financial activities, does not ensure the transparency of budget distribution and its effectiveness, and does not develop an internal audit system.

It should also be noted the lack of an established system and regularity of the Institute Academic Council work; a discrepancy between the number and content of meetings with the approved meeting plan was revealed (10 meetings are planned for 1 academic year, 8 meetings were held, planned issues for consideration do not coincide with the issues of AC protocols), attendance was not provided sheets confirming the AC members participation.

Among the Institute collegial bodies, only the work of the Academic Council and the Rector's Council is observed, although the text of the self-assessment report provides information about the presence of the Board of Trustees, student parliament, scientific, technical, educational and methodological councils. During the EEC visit, the activities of the above mentioned bodies were not confirmed. Accordingly, transparency of the management system, the Institute budget distribution is not ensured. The official website contains information about the composition and activities of only the Academic Council, and the decisions made are not published, not communicated to internal and external stakeholders. In the approved plans of the Academic Council, the issue of considering the AzMI financial activities is planned, but, in fact, the report was not heard, which was confirmed by the AC protocols analysis and a conversation with the academic secretary of the institute.

The institute interacts with alumni, however, during an online meeting with alumni, it turned out that the university-wide Alumni Association is actually not functioning.

In addition, the work on introduction of an internal system for ensuring the education quality has not been systematized. In 2018, the independent inspection department was renamed into the Education quality and labor discipline department, staffed with young personnel. According to the documents, the university plans to introduce a quality management system in accordance with ISO 9001:2015 standards, a number of regulatory documents have been developed, and monitoring studies have been carried out. During the visit and conversation with participants in the educational process, it was found that none of the employees of the education quality department and managers were trained in the education quality management system.

To the question "How does the management and administration of the university perceive criticism in their address?" answered: very good" - 19 (27.9%), "good" - 36 (52.9%), "relatively good" - 8 (11.8%), "bad" - 1 (1.5%) , "very bad" - 4 (5.9%).

Strengths/best practice:

No strengths identified for this standard.

EEC recommendations:

1. In order to ensure transparency in the Institute management, it is recommended:
 - Until 01.01.2022, the AzMI leadership should bring into line the documented procedure for the Institute Academic Council activities in accordance with the Regulations on the Institute Academic Council;
 - The AzMI leadership from 01.01.2022 to review activities and functions of the Board of Trustees, the Alumni Association, educational, methodological, scientific and technical councils and analyze the effectiveness of their activities;
 - Since 01.01.2022, the AzMI leadership to revise the composition of collegiate bodies, including representatives of all interested parties;
 - Since 01.01.2022, the AzMI leadership to develop and implement a procedure for informing all interested parties with the collegial bodies decisions;
 - During 2022, the AzMI leadership to create additional collegiate bodies (financial committee, academic council, etc.) within the Institute specifics;
 - The AzMI leadership should provide for the possibility of internal and external audit of the Institute financial activities.
2. Since 01.01.2022, the AzMI leadership to organize training for managers and employees of the administrative corps on the management system quality;
3. Prior to the beginning of the new academic year, the AzMI management should arrange the QMS documents in accordance with the selected quality model.

EEC conclusions on this standard: strong positions – 0, satisfactory – 10, suppose to be improve – 7.

6.9. Continuous Improvement Standard

Evidence-based part

As part of the action plan for implementation the Institute development strategy, the institute structure, job descriptions of employees, provisions of structural divisions have been revised, a number of regulations and questionnaires for interested parties have been developed. <https://cloud.mail.ru/public/eyik/1rSQZq67x>

In addition, within the framework of an external audit, the Institute has successfully passed two independent accreditations by the EdNet and Agency for Accreditation of Educational Programs and Organizations. Based on the above agencies recommendations the AzMI developed a [Plan of Activities and Measures for Quality Assurance within the AzMI named after S. Tentishev framework on independent public and professional accreditation of educational programs](#).

The Institute needs are analyzed and substantiated by the heads of departments in the form of submitting [statements](#) the administrative director, for continuous improvement of the material and technical base. The AzMI's budget is planned according to the Institute's Strategic Development Plan. According to the areas of use, resources are allocated for development and modernization the educational and scientific processes, development of the material and technical base, organization of specialists training in new areas, specializations and their educational and methodological support.

The institute updating and improving process is based on monitoring its own activities in accordance with the expected results defined in the [AzMI Mission and strategic development plan](#). (Development strategy 3.4). Constant renewal and improvement of all types Institute activities achieves by studying specialized literature on medical education. In addition, the updating and improving process is based on the international experience study through the academic mobility of teachers (Danilenko Yu.L. - Cameroon, Africa; Kasymov AA - Delhi, India, Vienna, Austria; Turdubaeva EK - Vienna, Austria; Edigeev JA - Berlin, Germany; and others) and partner universities by signing [memorandums](#) and visits.

The existing educational program structure promotes training and development of practical skills in order to form competent doctors with communication skills, regardless of the

specialization they choose. Students have a wide range of education materials, both required and recommended. For lectures and practical work, modern teaching methods are used (traditional and interactive, demonstration of microphotograms, electronograms, [virtual microscope](#)), multimedia tools, etc., updated every year with an emphasis on higher medical education and in accordance with the requirements of the labor market and scientific technical progress.

In connection with the COVID-19 pandemic, some additions have been made to the respiratory infections study in educational programs in microbiology, pathophysiology, pathological anatomy, forensic medicine, epidemiology, infectious diseases and tropical infections. At the same time, it is envisaged to introduce the modern approaches in teaching, in particular for the development of clinical and communicative teaching methods, use of a team teaching method in combination with the use of students as teachers. Additional programs have been developed for infection control, prevention, diagnosis and the COVID-19 treatment. The presence of practical experience among teachers involved in the treatment and counseling of the COVID-19 patients makes it possible to introduce the most relevant topics in training programs.

It should be noted the work of the Institute to modernize the AzMI activities processes, create favorable conditions for students and employees: a laboratory building has been built, the AzMI's Medical Center continues to be equipped with educational and medical equipment, vehicles for transporting students, 3 ambulances equipped according to class "C" for providing resuscitation assistance. The EEC members were shown the approved project of their own campus, where it is planned to build several clinics, an educational building, a hostel and a multi-storey building for employees. Also, as part of the visual inspection, the EEC members visited the construction site, which was at the excavation stage.

Analytical part

After analyzing the submitted documents and based on the interviews results with focus groups, the EEC members note the insufficiently effective work on planning and monitoring the effectiveness of their own research to ensure the educational process quality. The monitoring carried out by the Institute is not structured by levels, performers, methods, the continuity of this activity is not ensured, which does not allow to ensure the completeness and reliability of the results.

Despite the fact that AzMI has developed normative documents for the EP management, there is no systematic work to adapt the educational program model and methodological approaches. The EP management needs to be improved, especially when evaluating the effectiveness. Poor measurability and weak communication with consumers make the system ineffective. When evaluating the effectiveness, the EP goals, design approaches, the formation of EP development plans, employment results and other criteria, the role and quality of staff (students), communication with employers, etc. are not systematically taken into account.

The EEC members note that when interviewing representatives of different focus groups, no answer was received on how the educational program model will be adapted. Also, the documents submitted for analysis do not contain information on how the educational program model and methodological approaches will be adapted, taking into account modern theories in education, the methodology of adult education, and the principles of active learning.

The Institute has defined general criteria for evaluating learning outcomes in a 100-point system in connection with introduction the internal local system "[eBilim](#)". However, the EEC notes the need to develop detailed assessment criteria for each type of student work, in accordance with changes in learning outcomes and teaching methods. According to the report for 2021-2022, the Institute plans to develop a regulation on an objective structured clinical exam, training in testology for teachers, however, these plans are not documented (contract, orders, etc.).

The survey results show that 48 (64.9%) students are completely satisfied, 22 (29.7%) are

partially satisfied with the available scientific laboratories.

In addition, in the survey, a recommendation was given from the student regarding the criteria for assessing the knowledge of students, the main obstacle of which is the language barrier of both students and teachers.

Strengths/best practice:

No strengths identified for this standard.

EEC recommendations:

1. Since 01.01.2022, the AzMI leadership, on a regular basis, should conduct HETP advanced training in the field of modern teaching methods and assessment of learning outcomes;
2. Since 01.02.2022, the AzMI leadership to revise the criteria for assessing learning outcomes, taking into account all types of classes and tasks;
3. Until 01.09.2022, the AzMI leadership is to systematize and document the processes of monitoring and evaluating educational programs in accordance with the quality management system requirements.

EEC conclusions on this standard: strong positions – 0, satisfactory – 11, suppose to be improve –4.

VII. OVERVIEW OF STRENGTHS/BEST PRACTICE FOR EACH STANDARD

6.2. Standard «Educational Programs»

1. The AzMI educational programs (EP) content contributes to the development of professional competencies of students and the achievement of learning goals;
2. The AzMI regularly revises and corrects educational programs with consideration of the modern scientific achievements.

6.6 «Educational Resources» Standard

1. The AzMI has a good and constantly developing material and technical base to ensure a high-quality educational process and comfortable living conditions for students and employees: a new educational building, dormitories, and its own clinic.

VIII. OVERVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS FOR IMPROVING QUALITY FOR EACH STANDARD

6.1. Mission and Final Results Standard

1. From the 2022-2023 academic year, the AzMI leadership should organize training for managers and specialists of relevant structures on the quality assurance system of an educational organization, in particular, conducting and assessing the strengths and weaknesses of the institute, the frequency and procedure for monitoring the strategy implementation, the procedures for documenting the quality system;
2. From the 2022-2023 academic year, the AzMI leadership should develop and implement mechanisms for involving all stakeholders in the discussion and adjustment of the institute concept documents;
3. Since 01.01.2022, the AzMI leadership, in order to ensure transparency and inform stakeholders, improve the institute official website work, with the possibility of providing information in Kyrgyz, Russian and English;
4. Since 01.01.2022, the AzMI leadership is to review the operational plans of all structural

divisions in accordance with the approved plan for implementation the AzMI Development Strategy for 2021-2025;

5. Since 01.01.2022, MEP managers should develop mechanisms for generating a list of elective courses and organizing the procedure for choosing them by students;

6. As of 01.03.2022, the AzMI Vice-Rector for Academic and Scientific Affairs to develop a regulation on implementation of the teachers' research results to improve teaching and content of subjects.

6.2. Standard «Educational Programs»

1. MEP managers for the 2022-2023 academic year should bring the total volume of educational programs in line with the volume norms of the international and state standards.

2. MEP managers for the 2022-2023 academic year to determine the learning outcomes of educational programs and curricula (syllabuses) based on the Dublin descriptors;

3. MEP managers for the 2022-2023 academic year, taking into account the final results of each MEP, develop and implement appropriate innovative teaching methods and technologies;

4. MEP managers to develop and include in the educational programs the discipline "scientific research design", in order to teach the elements of fundamental and applied research;

5. As of 01.01.2022, the AzMI leadership, in order to ensure the achievement of the final learning outcomes, create a collegial advisory body (Committee of Educational Programs), including representatives of all interested parties, whose functions are to develop the concept and manage educational programs;

6. As of 01.01.2022, the AzMI leadership is to introduce into the educational process modern teaching methods and technologies ("Case-study" technology) aimed at the ability to apply theoretical knowledge to solving a practical problem, forming motivation for independent clinical and analytical thinking of students.

6.3. Student Assessment Standard

1. As of 01.01.2022, the AzMI leadership to introduce the application of the criteria-based assessment principles to achieving the learning outcomes based on certain, approved and published assessment criteria;

2. Until 01.01.2022, the AzMI leadership is to optimize the system for assessing learning outcomes, taking into account the adequacy, reliability and validity of assessment methods, with the formation of a high-quality mechanism for assessing the competence of a graduate using an objective structured practical and clinical exam (Objective Structured Practical Examination and Objective Structured Clinical Examination);

3. Until 01.01.2022, the AzMI leadership is to train the HETP of clinical departments in modern assessment methods.

6.4 «Learner» standard

1. Until 01.01.2021, the AzMI leadership, in order to organize a full-fledged system of academic consulting, include in the staff of dean's offices staff units of advisors or mentors who will perform advisory functions and career guidance counseling among students.

2. The AzMI leadership for the 2022-2023 academic year to create a Career Center to form and implement an effective career path for a student, graduate, specialist on the principle of lifelong learning.

3. The AzMI leadership for the 2022-2023 academic year to expand the representation of students in the Academic Council of the Institute and other collegiate advisory bodies.

6.5 Standard «Academic Staff/Teachers»

1. The AzMI leadership for the 2022-2023 academic year bring the teacher-student ratio to the ISO standards requirements.

2. The AzMI leadership to create a clear policy for the promotion, motivation, and

encouragement of the institute employees.

3. The AzMI leadership for the 2022-2023 academic year to increase the "academic degree holders rate" of the teaching staff for development of the institute educational research policy.

4. The AzMI leadership should contribute to the development of scientific activity among the teaching staff, including in the field of medical education.

5. The AzMI leadership for the 2022-2023 academic year to conclude agreements/memorandums on cooperation with medical universities of near and far abroad in order to ensure academic mobility of teachers and students.

6. The AzMI leadership for the 2022-2023 academic year to organize training for teaching staff in new educational technologies (case study, etc.) with monitoring of their implementation in the educational process.

7. The AzMI leadership for the 2022-2023 academic year to introduce the rating assessment of teachers in order to improve the qualification level, the productivity of pedagogical and scientific work.

6.6 «Educational Resources» Standard

1. The AzMI leadership for the 2022-2023 academic year to expand the list of clinical sites, primarily clinics for specialized and highly specialized care, because the existing ones do not provide the required number and list of patients, which makes it difficult for students to access patients and develop appropriate professional competencies.

2. The AzMI leadership for the 2022-2023 academic year to plan a fund (resources) for the development of a simulation center, on the basis of which practical skills will be mastered in the relevant specialties.

3. The AzMI leadership for the 2022-2023 academic year to reduce the HETP teaching workload to provide the opportunity to engage in other activities - research, medical.

4. The AzMI leadership for the 2022-2023 academic year to modernize the library in terms of providing access to electronic library systems (national and international), electronic databases (national and international).

5. The AzMI leadership for the 2022-2023 academic year to create a scientific library.

6. The vice-rector for academic and scientific work and the heads of departments for the 2022-2023 academic year should formulate specific research areas and topics in the field of life sciences.

7. The AzMI leadership for the 2022-2023 academic year, allocate resources for creation an accredited laboratory for collective use.

8. The AzMI leadership for the 2022-2023 academic year, in order to ensure the proper level of international cooperation and promotion of the institute at the national and international levels, it is necessary, on the basis of agreements, to expand the AzMI interaction with universities, clinics and research centers, primarily foreign ones, in terms of joint research - research activities, academic mobility of teachers and students, introduction of the practice of network programs/double degree programs.

6.7. «Evaluation of the educational program Standard

1. The AzMI leadership for the 2022-2023 academic year to determine the strategy and mechanisms for monitoring and evaluating the MEP processes and outcomes;

2. The AzMI leadership for the 2022-2023 academic year to optimize the assessment system and improve the content of educational programs, teaching methods and student assessment, taking into account the requirements of the international standard for internal quality assurance (by the ESG);

3. The AzMI leadership for the 2022-2023 academic year to develop and implement

methods for assessing the validity, reliability and fairness of methods for assessing academic achievements of students and ensure accessibility for external expertise;

4. The AzMI leadership for the 2022-2023 academic year to create and ensure the continuous functioning of an impartial commission from among the interested parties to evaluate and improve the educational programs. Use the surveys analysis results and interviews of graduates on evaluating the educational programs effectiveness in improving the institute activities;

5. The AzMI leadership on a regular basis on the official website to publish reports on the stakeholders recommendations in planning the educational programs and improvements in the educational quality;

6. The AzMI leadership for the 2022-2023 academic year to determine and implement a policy on the use of expertise in development the teaching methods and student assessment;

7. The AzMI leadership to develop research in the field of medical education, to promote the teaching staff desire to improve the education quality;

8. By the end of the 2021-2022 academic year, the AzMI leadership to analyze and identify a range of stakeholders, including partner organizations and representatives of the public and healthcare systems from the students countries of origin to participate in discussions in development, revision and implementation of the MEP;

9. The AzMI leadership to provide feedback to students and HETP on an ongoing basis, which includes information about the MEP process and products, and information about bad practices or inappropriate behavior of HETP and students.

6.8. «Management and Administration» Standard

1. In order to ensure transparency in the Institute management, it is recommended:

- Until 01.01.2022, the AzMI leadership should bring into line the documented procedure for the Institute Academic Council activities in accordance with the Regulations on the Institute Academic Council;
- The AzMI leadership from 01.01.2022 to review activities and functions of the Board of Trustees, the Alumni Association, educational, methodological, scientific and technical councils and analyze the effectiveness of their activities;
- Since 01.01.2022, the AzMI leadership to revise the composition of collegiate bodies, including representatives of all interested parties;
- Since 01.01.2022, the AzMI leadership to develop and implement a procedure for informing all interested parties with the collegial bodies decisions;
- During 2022, the AzMI leadership to create additional collegiate bodies (financial committee, academic council, etc.) within the Institute specifics;
- The AzMI leadership should provide for the possibility of internal and external audit of the Institute financial activities.

2. Since 01.01.2022, the AzMI leadership to organize training for managers and employees of the administrative corps on the management system quality;

3. Prior to the beginning of the new academic year, the AzMI management should arrange the QMS documents in accordance with the selected quality model.

6.9. Continuous Improvement Standard

1. Since 01.01.2022, the AzMI leadership, on a regular basis, should conduct HETP advanced training in the field of modern teaching methods and assessment of learning outcomes;

2. Since 01.02.2022, the AzMI leadership to revise the criteria for assessing learning outcomes, taking into account all types of classes and tasks;

3. Until 01.09.2022, the AzMI leadership is to systematize and document the processes of monitoring and evaluating educational programs in accordance with the quality management system requirements.

IX. OVERVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE AzMI DEVELOPMENT

- the AzMI leadership to organize training for managers and employees of the administrative corps on the management system quality;
- the AzMI leadership to create additional collegiate bodies (financial committee, academic council, etc.) within the Institute specifics;
- The AzMI leadership should provide for the possibility of internal and external audit of the Institute financial activities.
- The AzMI leadership to intensify the work of the Board of Trustees, the Alumni Association, educational and methodological, scientific and technical councils and analyze the effectiveness of their activities;
- The AzMI leadership to expand the list of financial and non-financial forms of stimulation the employees research work.
- The AzMI leadership to conclude agreements/memorandums on cooperation with medical universities of near and far abroad in order to ensure academic mobility of teachers and students.
- The AzMI leadership to organize training for teaching staff in new educational technologies (case study, etc.) with monitoring of their implementation in the educational process.
- The AzMI leadership to expand the list of clinical sites, primarily clinics for specialized and highly specialized care, because the existing ones do not provide the required number and list of patients, which makes it difficult for students to access patients and develop appropriate professional competencies.
- The AzMI leadership to plan a fund (resources) for the development of a simulation center, on the basis of which practical skills will be mastered in the relevant specialties.

Appendix 1. Evaluation table «PARAMETERS OF INSTITUTIONAL PROFILE»

AzMI Institutional Profile Parameters

Sr.No.	Assessment criteria	Position of the Educational Organization			
		Strong	Satisfactory	Suggests improvement	Unsatisfactory
	MISSION AND FINAL RESULTS				
	DEFINITION OF THE MISSION				
1.	Medical educational organization shall define its <i>mission</i> and bring it to the attention of stakeholders and the health care sector.		+		
2.	The mission statement shall contain goals and an educational strategy to learn the following competences for future health worker:				
	competent at the basic level;		+		
	with an appropriate foundation for a further career in any field of medicine, including all types of medical practice, administrative medicine and scientific research in medicine;		+		
	who is able to perform the role and function of a doctor in accordance with the requirements of the healthcare sector;		+		
	prepared for postgraduate studies, including residency, specialization;		+		
	with a commitment to lifelong learning, including professional responsibility to support the level of knowledge and skills through performance evaluation, audit, study of own practice and recognized activities in the Continuing Personal Development/Continuing Medical Education.		+		
3	Medical educational organization shall ensure that the stated mission includes the <i>problems of public health</i> , medical care system needs and other aspects of <i>social responsibility</i>		+		
4	Medical educational organization shall have a strategic development plan that corresponds to the stated mission, the objectives of the medical educational organization and approved by the consultative and advisory council of the university		+		
5	Medical educational organization shall systematically collect, accumulate and analyze information about its activities; to assess strengths and weaknesses of the university (SWOT-analysis), on the basis of which the rectorate together with the consultative and advisory council of the university shall determine policy and develop strategic and tactical plans.			+	
6	The mission and goals of Medical educational organization shall correspond to the available resources, market requirements. The ways to support them shall be defined. Access to information about the mission, the objectives of the medical educational organization for the public (availability of information in the media, on the university website) should be provided. The mission and objectives of the medical educational organization are approved at the consultative and advisory council of the university.		+		
7	Medical educational organization should ensure that the mission includes the achievements of medical research in the field of biomedical, clinical, behavioral and social sciences.		+		
8	Medical educational organization should ensure that the mission includes aspects of the global health and reflects main problems of global health		+		

	Participation in mission formulation				
9	Medical educational organization shall ensure that the <i>key stakeholders</i> are involved in the mission development.			+	
10	Medical educational organization should ensure that the stated mission is based on the opinions/suggestions of other <i>relevant stakeholders</i> .			+	
	Institutional autonomy and academic freedom				
11	Medical educational organization shall have <i>institutional autonomy</i> to develop and implement policies for which the higher-education teaching personnel and administration are responsible for, especially in relation to:				
	development of an educational program;		+		
	use the allocated resources necessary for implementation of the educational program.		+		
12	Medical educational organizations should guarantee <i>academic freedom</i> to its employees and students in the following:				
	in relation to the <i>current educational program</i> , in which it is allowed to rely on different points of view in the description and analysis the medicine issues;			+	
	in the possibility of using the new research results to improve the study of specific disciplines/issues without expanding the educational program.			+	
	Final learning outcomes				
13	Medical educational organization shall determine the expected <i>final learning outcomes</i> that students should exhibit upon completion, in relation to:				
	self-achievements at the basic level in terms of knowledge, skills and professional values, and relationships;		+		
	an appropriate foundation for a future career in any branch of medicine;		+		
	their future roles in the health sector;		+		
	their subsequent postgraduate training;				
	their commitment to lifelong learning;		+		
	medical and sanitary needs of society, the health system needs and other aspects of social responsibility;		+		
14	Medical educational organization shall ensure that student fulfills his/her obligations towards doctors, teachers, patients and their relatives in accordance with the Code of Conduct.		+		
15	Medical educational organization should :				
	determine and coordinate relationship of final learning outcomes required upon completion with those required in postgraduate education;		+		
	determine results of the students involvement in conducting research in medicine;		+		
	pay attention to final outcomes related to global health.		+		
	Total	0	22	5	0
	EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMS				
	MODEL OF EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM AND TRAINING METHODS				
16	Medical educational organization shall define an educational program model that includes an integrated model based on disciplines, organ systems, clinical problems and diseases, a model based on modules or spiral design.		+		
17	Medical educational organization shall determine the methods of teaching and learning used		+		
18	Medical educational organization shall ensure that the educational program develops the students' ability to learn throughout lives.		+		
19	Medical educational organization shall ensure that the educational program is implemented in accordance with the <i>principles of equality</i> .		+		
20	Medical educational organization shall use an educational program		+		

	and teaching and learning methods <i>based on modern teaching principles</i> that stimulate, learn and support students and ensure the formation of students' responsibility for their learning process.				
	Scientific method				
21	Medical educational organization shall teach students throughout the entire training program the following:				
	principles of scientific methodology, including methods of analytical and critical thinking;			+	
	scientific research methods in medicine;			+	
	evidence-based medicine, which require the <i>appropriate teachers competence and will be a mandatory part of the educational program with involving medical students in conducting or participating in small research project</i>			+	
22	Medical educational organization should include in the educational program <i>elements of fundamental or applied research, including mandatory or elective analytical and experimental research, thereby contributing to participation in the medicine scientific development as professionals and colleagues.</i>			+	
	Basic Biomedical Sciences				
23	Medical educational organization shall define and include in the educational program the following:				
	achievements of <i>basic biomedical sciences</i> for the formation of students' understanding the scientific knowledge;		+		
	concepts and methods that are fundamental for acquisition and application the clinical scientific knowledge.		+		
24	Medical educational organization should correct and introduce new achievements of biomedical sciences in the educational program for:				
	scientific, technological and clinical developments;		+		
	current and expected needs of society and the health care system.		+		
	Behavioral and social sciences and medical ethics				
25	Medical educational organization shall determine and include in the educational program the following achievements:				
	<i>behavioral sciences;</i>		+		
	<i>social sciences;</i>		+		
	<i>medical ethics;</i>		+		
	<i>medical jurisprudence</i>		+		
	<i>that will provide the knowledge, concepts, methods, skills and attitudes necessary to understand the socio-economic, demographic and cultural conditioning of the causes, spread and consequences of medical health problems, as well as knowledge about the national health system and patient rights, which will contribute to the analysis of public health problems, effective communication, clinical decision making and ethical practice.</i>		+		
26	Medical educational organization should correct and introduce new achievements in the behavioral and social sciences, as well as medical ethics in the educational program, regarding:				
	scientific, technological and clinical developments;			+	
	current and expected needs of society and the health care system;		+		
	changing demographic and cultural conditions.		+		
	Clinical Sciences and Skills				
27	Medical educational organization shall determine and implement the achievements of clinical sciences in the educational program and ensure that students:				
	acquire sufficient knowledge and clinical and <i>professional skills</i> to assume appropriate responsibilities, including activities <i>related to health promotion activities, disease prevention and patient care.</i>		+		
	conduct a <i>reasonable part (one third)</i> of the program in <i>planned contacts with patients, including consideration of an appropriate number of goals, and their sufficiency for training in appropriate clinical sites;</i>		+		

	carry out health promotion and prevention work;		+		
28	Medical educational organization shall set a certain amount of time for teaching <i>basic clinical disciplines, including internal medicine, surgery, psychiatry, general medical practice (family medicine), obstetrics and gynecology, and pediatrics.</i>		+		
29	Medical educational organization shall organize clinical training with appropriate attention to patient <i>safety, including monitoring the student's actions in the clinic.</i>			+	
30	Medical educational organization should correct and introduce new clinical sciences achievements in the educational program regarding:				
	scientific, technological and clinical developments;			+	
	current and expected needs of society and the health care system.		+		
31	Medical educational organization shall ensure that each student has <i>early contact with real patients, including his gradual participation in providing assistance to the patient, including responsibility for examining and/or treating the patient under supervision, which is carried out in the appropriate clinical sites;</i>			+	
32	Medical educational organization shall structure the various components of teaching <i>clinical skills</i> in accordance with a specific stage of the training program.		+		
Structure of the educational program, content and duration					
33	Medical educational organization shall describe the content, volume and sequence of courses and other educational program elements to ensure compliance with the appropriate relationship between the basic biomedical, behavioral and social and clinical disciplines.			+	
34	Medical educational organization should provide the following in the educational program:				
	ensure <i>horizontal integration</i> of related sciences and disciplines;		+		
	ensure <i>vertical integration</i> of clinical sciences with basic biomedical and behavioral and social sciences;		+		
	provide the opportunity for elective content (electives) and determine the balance between the <i>compulsory and elective</i> parts of the educational program, <i>including a combination of compulsory elements and electives or special components of choice;</i>			+	
	to determine the relationship with <i>complementary medicine, including nonconventional medicine, traditional or alternative practices.</i>		+		
Program management					
35	Medical educational organization shall determine a structural division responsible for educational programs, which, under the control of academic leadership, is responsible and <i>empowered</i> to plan and implement the educational program, <i>including the allocation resources for planning and implementing teaching and learning methods, evaluating students and evaluating the educational program and courses learning</i> to ensure the achievement of learning outcomes.		+		
36	Medical educational organization shall guarantee representation from teachers and students in the structural division responsible for educational programs.			+	
37	Medical educational organization shall plan and implement innovations in the educational program, through the structural division responsible for educational programs.			+	
38	Medical educational organization shall include representatives from other relevant stakeholders in the structural subdivision of Medical educational organization responsible for educational programs, <i>including other participants of the educational process, representatives from clinical sites, graduates of medical educational organizations, health professionals involved in the training process or other teachers of the university faculties.</i>			+	

Communication with medical practice and healthcare system					
39	Medical educational organization shall provide an <i>operational link</i> between the educational program and subsequent stages of professional training (residency, specialization, CPD/ CME) or practice, which the student will begin upon completion the study, <i>including the identification of health problems and definition of the required learning outcomes, a clear definition and description the curriculum elements their relationships at various stages of training and practice, with consideration the local, national, regional and global states, as well as feedback from the health sector and participation of teachers and students in a team of specialists during provision the health care.</i>		+		
40	Medical educational organization should ensure that the structural division responsible for the following educational program items:				
	considers the peculiarities in which graduates have to work and accordingly modify the educational program;		+		
	considers the educational program modification based on public feedback.	+	+		
	Total	1	28	12	0
ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS					
Assessment methods					
41	Medical educational organization shall :				
	define, approve and publish the <i>principles, methods and practices used to assess learners, including the number of exams and other tests, keep the balance of written and oral examinations, using criteria-based and reasoning-based assessment methods, and specific examinations (Objective Structured Clinical Examination or Mini-Clinical Examination), as well as determine the criteria for establishing passing scores, grades and the number of allowed retakes;</i>			+	
	ensure that the assessment covers knowledge, skills and professional values and attitudes.			+	
	use a wide range of assessment methods and formats depending on their <i>"usefulness assessment", which includes a combination of validity, reliability, impact on learning, acceptability and effectiveness of assessment methods and format;</i>			+	
	ensure that assessment methods and results avoid conflicts of interest;			+	
	ensure that the process and methods of assessment are clear (accessible) for examination by external experts.			+	
42	Medical educational organization should:				
	<i>document and evaluate the reliability and validity of assessment methods, which requires an appropriate quality assurance process for existing assessment practices;</i>			+	
	introduce new assessment methods in accordance with the need;			+	
	use the results assessment appeal system.			+	
Relationship between assessment and learning					
43	Medical educational organization shall <i>use the principles, methods and practice of assessment, including the students educational achievements and assessment of knowledge, skills, professional values of relationships, which:</i>				
	clearly comparable to teaching methods, instruction and learning outcomes;			+	
	ensure that students achieve learning outcomes; 12.3.3 facilitate learning;		+		
	provide an appropriate balance between formative and summative assessment in order to guide learning and <i>assess the student's academic progress, which requires the establishment of rules for assessing progress and their relationship to the assessment process.</i>		+		
	Medical educational organization should:		+		
44	<i>regulate examinations number and nature of various educational</i>				

	<i>program elements to facilitate the acquisition of knowledge and integrated learning to avoid negative impact on the learning process, and eliminate the need to study an excessive amount of information and the educational program overload;</i>				
	ensure feedback to learners based on the assessment results.		+		
	clearly comparable to teaching methods, instruction and learning outcomes;		+		
	Total		5	9	
	STUDENTS				
	Admission and Selection Policy				
45	The medical education organization shall:				
	define and implement an <i>admission policy</i> , including a <i>clear statement of the student selection process that includes rationale and selection methods such as high school learning outcomes, other relevant academic experience, other entrance examinations and interviews, assessment of motivation to become a doctor, including changes in needs related to a variety of medical practices; a variety of medical practices;</i>		+		
	have a <i>policy</i> and implement the <i>practice on admitting students with disabilities in accordance with the current laws and regulations of the Kyrgyz Republic;</i>		+		
	have a <i>policy</i> and implement the practice of transferring students from other programs and medical educational organizations;		+		
46	Medical educational organization shall:				
	to establish the relationship between the students selection and Medical educational organization mission, the educational program and the desired quality of graduates;		+		
	periodically review admission policies based on relevant public and professional input to <i>meet the health needs of the population and society as a whole, including considering enrollment based on gender, ethnicity and language, and the potential need for special admission policies for students from low incomes families and national minorities;</i>		+		
	use the system to appeal the admission decisions.		+		
	Recruitment of students				
47	Medical educational organization shall determine the number of admitted students in accordance with the material and technical capabilities at all stages of education and training. Making a decision on the students recruitment implies the need to regulate national requirements for the healthcare human resources. In the case when medical educational organizations do not control the number of recruited students it is necessary to demonstrate their obligations by explaining all relationships, paying attention to the consequences of decisions made (imbalance between the recruitment of students and material, technical, and academic capacity of the university).		+		
48	Medical educational organization should periodically consider the number and contingent of accepted students during the consultation <i>with the relevant stakeholders responsible for planning and development of human resources in the health sector, as well as with experts and organizations on the healthcare human resources global aspects (such as insufficient and unequal distribution the health care human resources, migration of doctors, opening of new medical universities)</i> and regulate in order to meet the population and society health needs as a whole.		+		
	Consulting and support for students				
49	Medical educational organization shall:				
	have a system of <i>academic counseling for their students, which includes issues related to the choice of electives, training the residency,</i>			+	

	<i>planning a professional career, appointment of academic instructors (mentors) for individual students or small groups of learners;</i>				
	<i>offer a student support program that addresses social, financial and personal needs, which includes support for social and personal problems and events, health and financial issues, health care accessibility, immunization programs and health insurance, and financial assistance services in the form of financial assistance, scholarships and loans;</i>	+			
	<i>allocate resources to support learners;</i>	+			
	<i>ensure confidentiality regarding counseling and support</i>		+		
50	Medical educational organization shall provide counseling that:				
	<i>based on monitoring student progress and addressing the social and personal needs of students, including academic support, support in relation to personal problems and situations, health problems, financial issues;</i>		+		
	<i>includes counseling and professional career planning.</i>			+	
Students representing					
51	Medical educational organization shall determine and implement a <i>policy of student representation</i> and their <i>appropriate participation</i> in the development, management and evaluation of the educational program, and other issues related to students, which includes <i>student self-government, participation of students' representatives in the councils of faculties, universities and other relevant bodies, and also in community activities and local health projects.</i>		+		
52	Medical educational organization shall <i>provide assistance and support</i> to student activities and student organizations, <i>including provision of technical and financial support to student organizations</i>		+		
	Total	2	12	2	0
ACADEMIC STAFF/TEACHERS					
Selection and recruitment policy					
53	Medical educational organization shall determine and implement <i>a policy of selection and admission of employees, which:</i>				
	<i>determines their category, responsibility and the balance of teaching staff/teachers of basic biomedical sciences, behavioral and social sciences, clinical sciences for adequate implementation of the educational program, including the proper correlation between medical and non-medical teachers, teachers working full-time and part-time and the balance between academic and non-academic staff;</i>		+		
	<i>contains criteria on the scientific, pedagogical and clinical merits of applicants, including the proper correlation between pedagogical, scientific and clinical qualifications;</i>		+		
	<i>identifies and monitors the responsibilities of academic staff / teachers of basic biomedical sciences, behavioral and social sciences, clinical sciences;</i>		+		
54	Medical educational organization should in its policy on selection and admission of employees consider such criteria as:				
	<i>attitudes to its mission, importance of local conditions, including gender, nationality, religion, language and other conditions relating to the medical educational organization and educational program;</i>		+		
	<i>economic opportunities that take into account institutional conditions for financing employees and the efficient use of resources..</i>		+		
Development Policy and Employee Activities					
55	Medical educational organization shall determine and implement a policy of development and employee performance which:				
	<i>allows to maintain the balance between teaching, scientific and service</i>			+	

	<i>functions, which includes the establishment of time for each activity, taking into account needs of the medical educational organization and professional qualifications of teachers</i>				
	guarantees <i>recognition of its academic activity</i> , with a corresponding emphasis on pedagogical, research and clinical qualifications and <i>is carried out in the form of awards, promotion and/or remuneration;</i>		+		
	ensures that clinical activity and research is used in teaching and learning				
	guarantees <i>sufficient knowledge by each employee of the educational program, which includes knowledge of teaching/learning methods and general content of the educational program and other disciplines, and subject areas in order to stimulate cooperation and integration;;</i>			+	
	<i>includes training, development, support and evaluation of teachers, which involves all teachers, not only newly recruited, but also teachers drawn from hospitals and clinics.</i>		+		
56	Medical educational organization shall:				
	Consider the teacher-student ratio depending on the various components of the educational program.			+	
57	Medical educational organization shall				
	develop and implement the policy for the promotion and career growth of employees.		+		
	Total	0	8	3	0
	EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES				
58	Material and technical resources				
	Medical educational organization shall:				
	have a sufficient material and technical base for teachers and students to ensure adequate implementation of the educational program;		+		
	provide a <i>safe environment</i> for staff, students, patients and those who look after them, including providing the necessary information and <i>protection from harmful substances, microorganisms, compliance with safety regulations in the laboratory and in the use of equipment..</i>		+		
59	Medical educational organization shall improve the learning environment of students through regular updating, expansion and strengthening of material and technical base, which have to be consistent with the development in the practice of teaching.	+			
	Resources for Clinical Training				
60	Medical educational organization shall provide the necessary resources for students to acquire adequate clinical experience, including sufficient:				
	number and categories of patients;		+		
	number and categories of <i>clinical sites, which include clinics (primary, specialized and highly specialized medical care), outpatient services (including primary medical care), primary medical care facilities, healthcare centers and other facilities of provision of medical care for population, and also clinical skills centers/laboratories that allow to conduct clinical training, using the capabilities of clinical bases and to provide rotation in the main clinical disciplines;</i>			+	
	observation of clinical practice of students		+		
61	Medical educational organization should <i>study and evaluate</i> , adapt and improve resources for clinical training to meet the needs of the population served, which will include <i>relevance and quality for clinical training programs regarding clinical sites, equipment, number and category of patients and clinical practice, supervision as a mentor and administration.</i>		+		
	Information technology				

62	Medical educational organization shall determine and implement the policy that aims at <i>the effective use and evaluation of relevant information and communication technologies in the educational program.</i>		+		
63	Medical educational organization shall provide teachers and students with opportunities to use information and communication technologies:				
	for self-study;		+		
	access to information;		+		
	management of patients;		+		
	healthcare work.		+		
64	Medical educational organization should ensure that students have access to relevant patient data and healthcare information systems.		+		
Research in the field of medicine and scientific achievements					
65	Medical educational organization shall:				
	conduct research in the field of medicine and have scientific achievements as a basis for the educational program			+	
	identify and implement a policy that promotes interconnection between research and education;			+	
	provide information on the research base and priority areas in the field of scientific research of the medical education organization.			+	
	Medical educational organization should ensure that interconnection between research and education:				
	is taken into account in teaching;		+		
	encourages and prepares students to participate in medical research and development.		+		
Expertise in a medical sphere					
66	Medical educational organization shall:				
	have access to educational expertise, where necessary, and conduct an examination that studies the processes, practice and problems of medical education and can involve doctors with experience in research in medical education, psychologists and sociologists in the field of education, which is provided by the department of medical education development of the university or by bringing in experts from other national and international institutions			+	
67	Medical educational organization shall determine and implement a policy on the use of expertise in the field of education:				
	in the development of an educational program;			+	
	in the development of teaching methods, assessment of knowledge and skills.			+	
68	Medical educational organization should:				
	present evidence of the use of internal or external expertise in medical education to develop the potential of employees;			+	
	pay due attention to the development of <i>expertise in educational evaluation and research in medical education as a discipline, including the study of theoretical, practical and social issues in medical education;</i>			+	
	promote aspirations and interests of staff in conducting research in medical education.			+	
Exchange in educational area					
69	Medical educational organization shall identify and implement <i>the policy for:</i>				
	cooperation at the national and international levels <i>with other medical universities, public healthcare schools, faculties of dentistry, pharmacy and other university faculties;</i>			+	
	<i>transfer and mutual offset of educational loans, which includes</i>		+		

	<i>consideration of the volume limits of the educational program, which can be transferred from other educational organizations and which can be facilitated by the conclusion of agreements on mutual recognition of educational program elements and active coordination of programs between universities and the use of a transparent system of credit units and flexible course requirements.</i>				
70	Medical educational organization should:				
	promote regional and international exchange of staff (academic, administrative and teaching staff) and students by providing appropriate resources;			+	
	ensure that exchange is organized in accordance with the objectives, taking into account the needs of employees, students, and in compliance with ethical principles.				
	Total	1	14	12	0
	ASSESSMENT EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM				
	Mechanisms for monitoring and program evaluation				
71	Medical educational organization shall have a program to monitor the educational program, processes and results, including regular data collection on key aspects of the educational program in order to ensure that the educational process is carried out appropriately and to identify any areas requiring interventions, as well as data collection is a part of the administrative procedures in connection with admission of students, student assessment and study completion.		+		
72	Medical educational organization should establish and apply mechanisms for evaluating the educational program, which:				
	are focused on the educational program and its <i>main components, including the model of the educational program, structure, content and duration of the educational program, and the use of mandatory and elective parts (Standard "Educational program")</i> ;		+		
	are focused on student progress;		+		
	<i>identify and consider problems, including insufficient achievement of expected learning outcomes and involve the collection of information on final learning outcomes. They identify deficiencies and problems and used as feedback in conducting activities and corrective action plans to improve the educational program and training discipline programs.</i>		+		
73	Medical educational organization should periodically conduct comprehensive evaluation of the educational program aimed:				
	<i>at the context of the educational process, which includes organization and resources, learning environment and culture of the medical educational organization;</i>		+		
	<i>at special components of the educational program, which include a description of the discipline methods of teaching and learning, clinical rotations and assessment methods;</i>		+		
	<i>at general final outcomes that will be measured by national examination results, benchmarking procedures, international examinations, career choices and postgraduate studies;</i>		+		
	at its social responsibility.				
	Teacher and student feedback				
74	Medical educational organization shall systematically collect, analyze and provide teachers and students with <i>feedback that includes information about the process and products of the educational program, as well as include information about unfair practices or improper behavior of teachers or students with and/or legal consequences.</i>		+		

75	Medical educational organization should use feedback results to improve the educational program.			+	
Academic achievements of students and graduates					
76	Medical educational organization shall analyze <i>educational achievements of students and graduates</i> in relation to:				
	its mission and final learning outcomes of the educational program, <i>which includes information on the average duration of training, grades, the frequency of passing and failures in examinations, cases of successful completion and exclusion, students' reports on the conditions of training in completed courses, the time spent to study areas of interest, including optional components, as well as interviews with students studying at repeated courses, and interviews with students who are leaving the educational program;</i>		+		
	an educational program;		+		
	resource allocation.		+		
77	Medical educational organization should analyze <i>educational achievements</i> of students regarding:				
	<i>their prior experience and conditions, including social, economic, cultural conditions;</i>		+		
	the level of training at the time of admission to the medical educational organization.		+		
78	Medical educational organization should use the analysis of students' educational achievements to provide feedback to the structural units responsible for:				
	student selection;		+		
	planning of an educational program;		+		
	student consultation.		+		
Stakeholder involvement					
79	Medical educational organization in its program of monitoring and evaluation of the educational program shall involve:				
	teaching staff and students;			+	
	its administration and management			+	
	Medical educational organization should for other stakeholders, <i>including other representatives of teaching and administrative staff, public representatives, authorized bodies in the field of education and health, professional organizations, as well as those responsible for post-graduate education:</i>				
	provide access to the evaluation results of the course and educational program;			+	
	demonstrate feedback from them on clinical practice of graduates;			+	
	demonstrate feedback from them on the educational program.			+	
	Total	0	16	6	0
MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION					
Management					
80	Medical educational organization shall determine the management structures and functions, including their <i>interactions with the university, if the medical educational organization is a part or a branch of the university.</i>		+		
81	Medical educational organization shall in its management structures determine <i>structural units with establishment of the responsibility of each structural unit</i> and include in their composition:				
	representatives of academic staff;			+	
	students;			+	
	<i>other stakeholders including representatives of the Ministry of Education and Health, the healthcare sector and the public.</i>			+	
82	Medical educational organization shall ensure transparency of the			+	

	management system and decisions, which are published in bulletins, posted on the website of the university, included in the protocols for review and execution.				
	Academic leadership				
83	Medical educational organization shall clearly define the responsibility of <i>academic leadership</i> in the development and management of the educational program.		+		
84	Medical educational organization shall clearly define the responsibility of <i>academic leadership</i> in the development and management of the educational program.		+		
	Budget for training and resource allocation				
85	Medical educational organization shall:				
	have a clear set of responsibilities and authority for providing the educational program with resources, including a targeted budget for training;		+		
	allocate resources necessary for the implementation of the educational program and allocate educational resources in accordance with their needs.		+		
86	The system of financing the medical educational organization shall be based on the principles of efficiency, effectiveness, priority, transparency, responsibility, differentiation and independence of all levels of budgets.		+		
87	Medical educational organization should:				
	provide sufficient autonomy in the allocation of resources, including decent remuneration of teachers in order to achieve final learning outcomes;		+		
	in allocation of resources, take into account scientific advances in medicine and problems of public health and their needs.		+		
	Administrative staff and management				
88	Medical educational organization shall have <i>appropriate administrative and academic staff, including their number and composition in accordance with the qualifications</i> in order to:				
	ensure the implementation of the educational program and relevant activities;			+	
	guarantee proper management and allocation of resources;			+	
89	Medical educational organization shall develop and implement an internal quality assurance management program, including consideration of needs for improvement, and conduct regular <i>management review and analysis</i> .			+	
	Interaction with the healthcare sector				
90	Medical educational organization shall have <i>a constructive interaction with the healthcare sector, with related healthcare sectors of society and government, including exchange of information, cooperation and initiatives of the organization, which helps to provide qualified doctors in accordance with the needs of society</i> .		+		
91	Medical educational organization shall give an official status to cooperation with partners in the healthcare sector, which includes the conclusion of formal agreements with the definition of the content and forms of cooperation, the conclusion of a joint contract, the creation of a coordinating committee and conduct of joint activities.		+		
	Total	0	10	7	0
92	CONTINUOUS IMPROVEMENT				
	Medical educational organization shall as a dynamic and socially responsible institution:				
	initiate procedures for regular review;		+		
	review the structure and functions;		+		
	allocate resources for continuous improvement.		+		
93	Medical educational organization should :				

	base the update process on prospective research, analyzes and on the results of own study and evaluation, medical educational literature;			+	
	ensure that the process of renewal and restructuring leads to a revision of its policy and practice in accordance with previous experience, current performance and future prospects, and guides the process of renewal to the following questions:		+		
94	Adaptation of the regulations of the mission and final outcomes to scientific, socio-economic and cultural development of society;		+		
95	Modification of the graduates' final learning outcomes in accordance with the documented needs of the postgraduate training environment, including clinical skills, training in public health issues and participation in the process of providing medical care to patients in accordance with the responsibilities that are assigned to graduates after graduation.		+		
96	Adaptation of the educational program model and methodological approaches to ensure that they are relevant and appropriate and that they take into account modern theories in education, the methodology of adult education, the principles of active learning;			+	
97	Adjustment of the elements of the educational program and their interconnection in accordance with achievements in biomedical, behavioral, social and clinical sciences, with changes in the demographic situation and the state of health/morbidity structure of population and socio-economic, cultural conditions. The adjustment process shall ensure the inclusion of new relevant knowledge, concepts, methods and exclude outdated ones.		+		
98	Development of assessment principles and methods and the number of examinations in accordance with the changes in final learning outcomes and methods of teaching and learning;			+	
99	Adaptation of the student recruitment policy and student selection methods to meet changing expectations and circumstances, human resource requirements, changes in the pre-university education system and the needs of the educational program;		+		
100	Adaptation of the recruitment policy and the formation of academic staff in accordance with changing needs;		+		
101	Updating educational resources to meet changing needs, such as enrollment, number and profile of academic staff, an educational program;		+		
102	Improving the process of monitoring and evaluating the educational program;			+	
103	Improving the organizational structure and management principles to ensure effective operations in changing circumstances and needs, and, in the long term, to meet the interests of various groups of stakeholders.		+		
	Total	0	11	4	0
	Total in sum	4	126	60	0