



«АККРЕДИТТЕУ ЖӘНЕ РЕЙТИНГТІҢ  
ТӘУЕЛСІЗ АГЕНТТІГІ» КЕМ

НУ «НЕЗАВИСИМОЕ АГЕНТСТВО  
АККРЕДИТАЦИИ И РЕЙТИНГА»

INDEPENDENT AGENCY FOR  
ACCREDITATION AND RATING

# REPORT

on the results of the work of the external expert commission for  
assessment of compliance with the requirements of Standards for  
international program accreditation of basic medical and pharmaceutical  
education abroad (based on WFME/AMSE standards)

program accreditation of educational programs

31.05.01 General Medicine (specialist degree)

31.05.02 Pediatrics (specialist degree)

31.05.03 Dentistry (specialist degree)

32.05.01 Preventive Medicine (specialist degree)

33.05.01 Pharmacy (specialist degree)

FSBEI HE «Bashkir State Medical University»  
of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Russian Federation  
from «31» October to «2» November 2023

**INDEPENDENT AGENCY FOR ACCREDITATION AND RATING**  
**External Expert Commission**

*Addressed to  
the IAAR Accreditation  
Council*



**REPORT**

**on the results of the work of the external expert commission for assessment  
of compliance with the requirements of Standards for international program accreditation  
of basic medical and pharmaceutical education abroad  
((based on WFME/AMSE standards) program accreditation  
of educational programs  
31.05.01 General Medicine (specialist degree)  
31.05.02 Pediatrics (specialist degree)  
31.05.03 Dentistry (specialist degree)  
32.05.01 Preventive Medicine (specialist degree)  
33.05.01 Pharmacy (specialist degree)  
FSBEI HE «Bashkir State Medical University»  
of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Russian Federation  
from «31» October to «2» November 2023**

**Ufa «2» November 2023**

## CONTENTS

(I) NOTATIONS AND ABBREVIATIONS .....	3
(II) INTRODUCTION .....	4
(III) GENERAL INFORMATION ABOUT EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION .....	5
(V) DESCRIPTION OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION VISIT .....	6
(VI) COMPLIANCE WITH THE STANDARDS OF SPECIALIZED ACCREDITATION .....	9
6.1. Standard «Mission and results» .....	9
6.2 Standard «Educational program» .....	13
6.3. Standard «Assessment of students» .....	18
6.4. Standard «Students» .....	22
6.5. Standard «Academic staff/teachers» .....	27
6.6. Standard «Educational resources» .....	30
6.7. Standard «Evaluation of the educational program» .....	33
6.8 Standard «Management and administration» .....	36
6.9 Standard «Constant updating» .....	39
(VII) OVERVIEW OF STRENGTHS/BEST PRACTICES FOR EACH STANDARD .....	42
(VIII) REVIEW OF QUALITY IMPROVEMENT RECOMMENDATIONS .....	42
(IX) OVERVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE ORGANIZATION OF EDUCATION .....	44
(X) RECOMMENDATION TO THE ACCREDITATION COUNCIL .....	44
Appendix 1. Evaluation table «PROGRAM PROFILE PARAMETERS» .....	45

**(I) NOTATIONS AND ABBREVIATIONS**

BRS	—	Point-rating system
GIA	—	State final certification
GIS Contingent	—	Unified federal interdepartmental accounting system for the contingent of students
DPO	—	additional vocational education
EGISM	—	Unified State Information monitoring system
CU	—	Credit units
LNA	—	Local normative act
Persons with disabilities	with—	Persons with disabilities
MTO	—	Logistical support
Ministry of Health of Russia	—	Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation
OVZ	—	Disabilities
OP	—	Educational program
OPOP	—	The main professional educational program
PA	—	Intermediate certification
PPS	—	Teaching staff
PFHD	—	Financial and economic activity plan
RP	—	Work program
RPD	—	The work program of the discipline
PP	—	Internship program
RUP	—	Working curriculum
UMU	—	Educational and methodological management
FAC	—	Federal Accreditation Center
FGOS VO	—	Federal State Educational Standard of Higher Education
FIS GIA and admission	—	The Federal information system of the state final certification and admission
FIS FRDO	—	Federal Information System "Federal Register of information on educational documents and (or) qualifications, training documents"
FOS	—	Fund of appraisal funds
FRMO	—	Federal Register of Medical Organizations
KNMS	—	Coordinating Scientific and Methodological Council
CMK	—	Cyclical Methodical Commission
EIOS	—	Electronic information and educational environment

## **(II) INTRODUCTION**

In accordance with Order 132-23-OD dated 28.08.2023 of the Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating from October 31 to November 2, 2023 an external expert commission assessed the compliance of educational programs 31.05.01 General Medicine (specialist degree), 31.05.03 Dentistry (specialist degree), 31.05.02 Pediatrics (specialist degree), 32.05.01 Preventive Medicine (specialist degree), 33.05.01 Pharmacy (specialist degree) of the Federal State budgetary educational institution of Higher Education "Bashkir State Medical University" of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Russian Federation (hereinafter – BSMU) standards for international accreditation of basic medical and pharmaceutical education programs (based on WFME/AMSE/ESG) IAAR (No.150-22-OD dated December 21, 2022, third edition) in a hybrid format.

The report of the external expert commission (EEC) contains an assessment of the submitted educational programs according to the IAAR criteria, recommendations of the EAC for further improvement of educational programs and parameters of the profile of educational programs.

### **EEC team:**

**IAAR expert – Head of the EEC** - Kurmangaliev Kairat Bolatovich, West Kazakhstan Medical University named after Marat Ospanov, (Republic of Kazakhstan, Aktobe), Off-line participation;

**IAAR expert** – Kiseleva Elena Aleksandrovna, MD, Professor Kemerovo State University of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation (Kemerovo, Russian Federation), Off-line participation;

**IAAR expert** – Iglikova Asiya Erbulatovna, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, Al-Farabi Kazakh National University (Republic of Kazakhstan, Almaty), Off-line participation;

**IAAR expert** - Ismailova Aigul Amanzholovna, MD, Professor, Academician of the International Academy of Sciences, Astana Medical University (Republic of Kazakhstan, Astana), On-line participation;

**IAAR expert** – Bylova Nadezhda Alexandrovna, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, N.I. Pirogov Russian National Research Medical University (Moscow, Russian Federation), On-line participation;

**IAAR expert** – Lapova Natalia Valeryevna - Candidate of Pharmaceutical Sciences, Associate Professor, Vitebsk State Medical University (Republic of Belarus, Vitebsk), On-line participation;

**IAAR expert - EEC Employer**– Shits Polina Vladimirovna, Director of LLC "Medicine Plus" (Russian Federation, Smolensk), On-line participation;

**IAAR expert - EEC Student** — Fayrushina Adelia Ildarovna, postgraduate student of 4 years of study in the specialty "Cell Biology, Cytology, Histology", Ufa University of Science and Technology (Russian Federation, Republic of Bashkortostan, Ufa), Off-line participation;

**Coordinator IAAR** – Dzhakenova Alisa Satbekovna, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Head of Medical Projects of the Agency (Republic of Kazakhstan, Astana) Off-line participation.

### **(III) GENERAL INFORMATION ABOUT EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION**

The Federal State Budgetary Educational Institution of Higher Education "Bashkir State Medical University" of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation was founded on March 25, 1932, is a leading educational institution, the center of medical and pharmaceutical science in the Republic of Bashkortostan, the Volga Federal District and is part of the Nizhnevolzhsky Scientific and Educational medical cluster.

The University's development strategy is aimed at implementing state policy in the field of healthcare and medical education, providing the industry with highly qualified medical personnel, improving the quality and accessibility of medical care for all segments of the population.

Due to the constant work to improve the quality of education and the implementation of research results, the university occupies worthy places in world rankings. Thus, the University is included in the international rating of THE-Times Higher Education Impact Ranking 2022, holds leading positions in the field of achieving individual sustainable development goals, as well as in the top 100 of the National Aggregated Rating of Russian universities. BSMU ranks sixth in the ranking of medical universities in Russia.

The structure of BSMU includes: 5 faculties, 79 departments, medical college, BSMU clinic, clinical dental clinic, All-Russian Center for Eye and Plastic Surgery, Ufa Scientific Research Institute of Eye Diseases, Federal Accreditation Center for the development of practical skills, Institute of Additional Professional Education (12 departments and 29 courses), research Institute rehabilitation Medicine and Balneology of BSMU (Research Institute of VMiK), Research Institute of Oncology, Research Institute of New Medical Technologies, Institute of Urology and Clinical Oncology, biobank, Research Institute of Cardiology, laboratory of cell cultures, central research Laboratory (TSNIL), pharmacy of LPU No. 2, 2 small innovative enterprises, youth scientific society, museum of the history of medicine, sanatorium-dispensary, sports and recreation camp (SOL), center for pre-university training and career guidance.

As of August 1, 2023, BSMU employs 4,409 people, including clinics. BSMU has a high pedagogical personnel potential: 1,169 of them (877 are main employees and 292 are part-time; 44 are researchers) teachers, 74.6% of teaching staff have an academic degree, including 276 doctors of Sciences and 597 candidates of Sciences, 2 are academicians of the Russian Academy of Sciences (V.N. Pavlov, M.A. Kurtzer), 1 Corresponding Member of the Russian Academy of Sciences (V.M. Timerbulatov), 6 academicians of the Academy of Sciences of the Republic of Bashkortostan, 2 Corresponding members of the Academy of Sciences of the Republic of Bashkortostan, 1 Professor of the Academy of Sciences of the Republic of Bashkortostan.

The share of staff in the age category younger than 65 years is 85.6%, the share of staff in the age category younger than 40 years is 32%.

In the 2022-2023 academic year, 2102 students were enrolled full-time in the programs of vocational education, higher education (bachelor's degree, specialist degree, master's degree), residency and postgraduate studies at the expense of the federal budget. The average USE score of students enrolled in 2022 is 72.5.

Areas of training. 147 programs are being implemented at the following levels of training: specialty (7 programs), bachelor's degree (3 programs), master's degree (10 programs), secondary vocational education (5 programs), residency (77 programs), postgraduate studies (46 programs). In the field of additional professional education, educational programs for advanced training are being implemented - 155, advanced training within the framework of the system of continuing medical education (CME) – 490 and professional retraining programs – 60.

Students. The number of students as of 01.08.2023 is 13,029 people (682 of them according to vocational education programs, 9686 according to HE programs, 2528 residents, 133 graduate students).

BSMU provides training in higher education programs for all regions of the Russian Federation, countries of the near and far abroad.



**(V) DESCRIPTION OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION VISIT**

The visit of the external expert commission (hereinafter referred to as the EEC) to BSMU was organized and held from October 31 to November 2, 2023. in accordance with the Program approved by the director of "IAAR" Zhumagulova A.B. and coordinated with the rector of BSMU V.N. Pavlov.

The preliminary meeting was held online on October 27, 2023, which was attended by all members of the EEC.

During the visit, the EEC studied the normative and educational and methodological documents for the accredited university, educational and methodological materials of disciplines, methodological documents, visited the structural units and departments stated in the program that ensure the implementation of the educational process, and also checked the operation of information systems used by BSMU for online classes.

All materials requested by the commission were provided by representatives of the university in a timely manner. In order to obtain objective information on the assessment of the activities of BSMU, the members of the EEC carried out: a visual inspection of classrooms, laboratories, libraries, clinical bases and their own clinics and other premises providing training sessions; observation, interviewing employees of various structural divisions, teachers, employers, questionnaires of the teaching staff (PPS) and students.

The BSMU ensured the presence of all employees and persons specified in the Visit Program. The three-day Program for conducting the EEC program accreditation has been completed in full, in accordance with the distribution of activities by day.

On the first day, October 31, 2023, a preliminary meeting of the Head and members of the IAAR EEC took place, during which the goals, program, and responsibilities of the EEC members were announced.

The EEC members discussed key issues, identified additional information that should be requested from the structural divisions of BSMU for validation and confirmation of the reliability of information/data during accreditation.

The meeting with the rector of BSMU V.N. Pavlov took place according to the program, an oral presentation on the current activities of BSMU was presented. A meeting was held with the vice-rectors of BSMU (Valishin D.A. – Vice-rector for Academic Work; Bakirov A.A. - Vice-rector for medical work; Viktorov V.V. - Vice-rector for Regional Health Development; Akhatov I.Sh. – Vice-rector for Scientific and International Activities; Mustafin A.T. – Vice-rector for educational and Social work; Taipov M.A. – Vice-Rector for Administrative and Economic Work).

A meeting was held with the heads of structural divisions of BSMU (Nazmieva L.R. – Head of the Personnel Department; Zagainova E.V. – Acting head of the Planning and Financial Department; Sukhova E.G. - Head of the organizational and Legal Department; Abdrakhimov R.V. – Head of the International Department; Tsyglin A.A. – Head of the Department for Regulatory Support of the University's statutory activities; Bilyalov A.R. – Head of the Information Technology Department; Matuzov G.L. – Head of the Department of Labor Protection, Fire and Environmental Safety; Melnikova A.Ya. – Head of the educational and methodological department; Imelbaeva A.G. – head of the graduate Career and employment Center; Chingizova G.N. – Executive secretary of the admissions committee; Kobzeva N.R. – head of the scientific library; Zigitbaev R.N. – Head of the residency department; Khusaenova A.A. – Head of the Department of Education Quality and monitoring).

A meeting was held in the interview mode with the heads of faculties (head of OP 31.05.01 «General Medicine» – Farshatova E.R. – Dean of the Faculty of General Medicine; head of OP 31.05.02 «Pediatrics» – Malievsky V.A. – acting Dean of the Faculty of Pediatrics; head of OP 31.05.03 «Dentistry» – Kabirova M.F. – Dean of the Faculty of Dentistry; head OP 32.05.01 "Medical and preventive care" – Galimov Sh.N. – acting dean of the Faculty of Medicine and Prevention with the Department of Biology; head of OP 33.05.01 «Pharmacy» - Kudashkina N.V. – Dean of the Faculty of Pharmacy), in particular, they actively participated in the meeting with

the experts of the Higher School of Economics and highlighted the main directions of their activities in terms of organizing the educational process, developing, implementing and managing educational programs, working with students and teaching staff, interacting with the rector's office and other structures of BSMU.

Subsequently, a meeting was held with the heads of departments of BSMU, basic and specialized disciplines.

During the interview with them, information was obtained about the implementation of the educational process at the departments, the conditions that the university provides for their activities, answers were received to questions about the motivation and stimulation of teaching staff, admission and career growth, financial support for teaching staff and other aspects.

At the meeting with the teaching staff of the departments of BSMU, in particular with representatives of basic biomedical sciences, behavioral and social sciences, medical ethics, medical jurisprudence, clinical and professional disciplines, the VEK experts asked questions about the implementation of educational, scientific and clinical processes at BSMU, career opportunities, stimulating teaching staff, providing the educational process with the necessary resources (financially-technical, information, etc.), interaction with administrative and management structures. Then the teaching staff took part in the survey.

During a visual inspection of the material and technical equipment of BSMU, EEC experts visited BSMU's own clinics, the Federal Accreditation Center of the Federal State Budgetary Educational Institution of Higher Education Bashkir State Medical University of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation.

EEC members visited the practice bases of accredited programs and during a visual inspection, EEC members got acquainted with the state of the material and technical bases of clinical departments: BSMU Clinic, Institute of Urology and Clinical Oncology, BSMU Dental Clinic, City Children's Dental Clinic No. 3.

The BSMU clinic provides primary health care, specialized, including high-tech medical care to adults and children as planned within the framework of the Program of state guarantees for the provision of free medical care to citizens. The hospital has a bed capacity of 705 beds, the capacity of a specialized consulting and diagnostic center is 750 visits per shift. The structure is organized in such a way that full continuity in the patient's treatment is ensured: from the stage of diagnosis and treatment to rehabilitation, eliminating the need to seek additional help from other medical organizations. Thanks to the use of innovative technologies using robotic systems, the entire range of minimally invasive surgical interventions is performed, including in oncological pathology, which makes the Clinic's activities noticeable in the global community. More than 7,500 minimally invasive surgical procedures are performed annually, surgical activity is more than 90%.

The medical organization actively participates in the testing of methods of prevention, diagnosis, treatment and rehabilitation, carries out the practical application of developed and previously unused methods in the provision of medical care to confirm evidence of their effectiveness.

9 departments of BSMU are located on the basis of the Clinic, clinical studies of medicines in patients with oncological pathology, with blood diseases, etc. are jointly conducted.

The clinical bases are represented by multidisciplinary, well-equipped, highly specialized medical centers providing highly qualified specialized inpatient and advisory medical care to adults.

Students studying in the specialty "General Medicine" are admitted to all departments of the somatic and surgical profile for the supervision of patients, intensive care units and operating units, have the opportunity to attend surgical interventions, during instrumental research. Computers are installed in the classrooms and there is Internet access. The PACS platform provides free access to the database of medical images (X-ray, CT, MRI). The entrance to the Republican Medical Information and Analytical System (RMIAS) for familiarization with the electronic patient card is carried out from the workplace of teachers who are part-time employees at the RDCB and have their own accounts in the RMIAS.



During the training, students also get acquainted with the basics of working in electronic systems. Due to the large number of students, a work schedule has been developed in 2 shifts (from 9:00 to 14:00 and from 14:00 to 19:00), it is provided that when implementing the discipline in 2 semesters, training in one semester goes to the morning shift, and in the other to the evening shift.

During the day, discussions and exchange of expert opinions were held, as well as policy development and identification of issues to obtain the necessary information. On 02.11.2023, the experts of the EEC met with the students of BSMU.

The meeting was held in the form of an interview, the issues of student support at the university, the functioning of the student representative office, the participation of students in the activities of the university, in the development of educational programs and other issues were revealed.

Later, the students took part in the survey. Visual inspection and attendance of classes were conducted at the departments of BSMU. The departments demonstrated classes with students of 4-5 courses, methodological materials for students, lesson plan, control tools, literature for self-study.

There was a conversation with students, they expressed their positive opinion about the activities of departments, clinics, departments, the university as a whole, the educational process.

EEC experts selectively visited the production practice bases for accredited BSMU OP.

A meeting with employers was held. There is evidence that the university closely cooperates with clinical bases, implements clinical training at clinical bases, graduates work in these organizations, through such events as a job fair, young specialists are selected and invited to work, employers participate in the formation of an educational program partly by familiarizing them.

A total of 239 representatives of BSMU took part in face-to-face meetings (Table 1).

Table 1 - Information about employees and students who took part in meetings with the EEC  
IAAR:

Category of participants	Quantity
Rector	1
Vice-rectors	6
Heads of structural divisions	13
Deans of faculties	5
Heads of departments	15
Teachers	120
Students	25
Graduates	29
Employers	25
<b>Total</b>	<b>239</b>

119 representatives of teaching staff and 112 students took part in the survey (30 – OP General Medicine, 23 – OP Dentistry, 15 – OP Pediatrics, 24 – OP Pharmacy, 20 – OP Preventive medicine).

According to the results of the survey: 88.1% rated the level of communication between management and teaching staff as very good and good; 94% of teaching staff are satisfied with the level of attention that the management of the educational institution pays to the content of the educational program; 93.3% of teaching staff are satisfied with the availability of necessary scientific and educational literature in the library for teachers, 92% - openness and accessibility of management for teaching staff, 81% - involvement of teaching staff in the process of making managerial and strategic decisions, 89.2% - equal opportunities for all teaching staff, 89.2% are completely satisfied with the attitude of the university management to teaching staff. The results of the student survey showed that students are completely satisfied with the level of accessibility of the dean's office in 93% of cases, the availability of academic counseling – in 61.8% of cases,

the availability of counseling on personal problems – in 77%, the level of accessibility of library resources – 89.5%, the overall quality of educational programs - in 88.3%, teaching methods in general – 91.3%.

During the three days of the work of the EEC, also after the end of all interviews and visits, the experts discussed the university's indicators for their compliance with the parameters of program accreditation, developed recommendations.

02.11.2023 upon completion of the work, the EEC experts met with the management and responsible persons of the university, shared their impressions and familiarized with the recommendations developed based on the results of the work carried out.

## **(VI) COMPLIANCE WITH THE STANDARDS OF SPECIALIZED ACCREDITATION**

### **6.1. Standard «Mission and results**

#### ***The evidentiary part***

The University's mission is closely linked to the regional component, in particular, the presence in the region of a well-developed pharmaceutical industry. To implement the global mission, the priority directions of the university's development have been identified, as set out in the University's Development Program for 2021-2030 as part of the implementation of the strategic academic leadership program "Priority 2030". BSMU declares the integration of the results of scientific research and clinical practice into the educational process, ensuring the implementation of innovative educational strategies.

The missions of the OP "General Medicine", OP "Pediatrics", OP "Dentistry", OP "Preventive Medicine", OP "Pharmacy" were approved by the Academic Council, which includes teachers, students and employers.

The mission of the OP "General Medicine" is to train globally competitive personnel in the specialty of Medical business, integrated into the international educational space, the formation of learning trajectories with the possibility of lifelong education. The mission is based on the dissemination and application of innovative developments in the field of healthcare, improvement and introduction of high technologies in the field of medical science and clinical practice, which is the basis for further professional growth and development of medical specialists. The educational results of the program should ensure the further professional development of the graduate based on the formed universal, general professional and professional competencies, mastered all types of medical practice, research skills, knowledge of the basics of healthcare organization.

The mission of OP Pediatrics is the training of globally competitive pediatric staff integrated into the international educational space, the formation of learning trajectories with the possibility of lifelong education.

The mission of the OP "Medico-preventive business" is aimed at training globally competitive personnel in the field of preventive medicine, integrated into the international educational space, the formation of learning trajectories with the possibility of lifelong education.

The mission of OP Pharmacy is to provide high-quality, affordable higher pharmaceutical education that meets the level of leading Russian and foreign universities using modern practice-oriented educational technologies, fundamental and applied scientific research in the field of pharmaceutical sciences integrated into education and healthcare systems, practical pharmacy and pharmaceutical industry aimed at disease prevention, improving the health and quality of life of the population. The final learning outcomes of OP Pharmacy are determined at the level of the federal state educational standard of higher education in this specialty. The final learning outcomes of OP Pharmacy have been brought to the attention of all interested parties, which was revealed during interviews with students, teachers and employers. It was also noted during the interview that employers, being employees of BSMU, participate in the development of the final learning outcomes.

The mission of OP Dentistry is to train competitive dental personnel integrated into the international educational space, to form learning trajectories with the possibility of lifelong education. The mission is based on the creation, application and dissemination of innovative developments in the field of healthcare, improvement and introduction of high technologies in the field of medical science and clinical practice, which is the basis for further professional growth and development of medical specialists.

Proper norms of behavior of students are regulated by the Internal Regulations of BSMU students, adopted by the Academic Council of BSMU on 26.12.2016 Protocol No. 12.

The OP is developed by teachers of departments, as well as working groups including members of the Academic Council, Cyclic Methodological Commissions, the Coordinating Scientific and Methodological Council with the involvement of practical health workers and students, coordinated with the educational and methodological department and approved by the decision of the Academic Council of BSMU.

When developing the OP, faculties have sufficient independence in choosing the number of biomedical, behavioral, and clinical disciplines, including elective disciplines (elective disciplines), and types of practices, i.e. maximizing their compliance with national and international requirements.

Students participate in scientific research as part of the work of student scientific circles, which is demonstrated during visits to departments (students performing the experiment worked in laboratories), as well as when interviewing students. The results of the study are presented in the portfolio of students posted on the university's website in open access.

Annually, on September 1, the Personnel Department analyzes the provision of both departments and programs with professional personnel. To organize the educational process in clinical disciplines, the capabilities of the Federal Accreditation Center are used, which provides simulation training for students to practice practical skills, form clinical skills based on situation modeling, which allows students to obtain the right basic safety skills for patients, while reducing risks in providing medical care in the future. There are phantoms for the use of dental manipulations, technologies for controlling the correctness of tooth preparation, injection, etc.

The competencies of university graduates who have successfully completed their training in the OP and passed the primary accreditation procedure allow them to find a job in accordance with the order of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation "On approval of qualification requirements for medical and pharmaceutical workers with higher education in the field of training "Healthcare and Medical Sciences" and the professional standard.

As a result of mastering the specialist degree programs, graduates should have universal, general professional and professional competencies of the Federal State Educational Standard for Higher Education.

In 2022, the IDPO BSMU conducted training in 76 specialties in the field of Healthcare, 419 additional professional development programs and 60 additional professional retraining programs for specialists were implemented, in addition, continuing medical education advanced training in 500 programs. The main forms of education are full-time on-the-job, part-time and part-time, including the use of distance learning technologies.

The assessment of the final results of mastering the OP in the form of the formation of all competencies fixed in the educational program is carried out at the State final certification of graduates. According to the results of the GIA, the commission, in addition to making decisions on the assignment of appropriate qualifications, forms a report in which it reflects its opinion on the level of training of students, the main shortcomings in their training. These data are reported and analyzed at the academic council, where an action plan is adopted to eliminate the comments of the chairmen of the GEC on the relevant specialty (Protocol No. 3 of 31.08.2022). This assessment is a direct feedback for BSMU on the formation of clinical competencies among its graduates.

In order to study the needs and expectations of consumers of educational services of BSMU and all interested parties, improve the quality of education within the framework of the quality management system, internal independent assessment of the quality of education, questionnaires

have been developed and questionnaires are being conducted among students, teachers, employers and graduates (sociological research).

The survey process is automated for the convenience and efficiency of information collection. The results are discussed at meetings of the Academic Council of BSMU, presented at educational and methodological conferences and used to improve the curriculum and educational program as a whole.

The involvement of stakeholders in the process of improving the formulation of the mission and goals takes place during the discussion of health and medical education issues at meetings with the Head of the Republic ("Zdravchas" weekly), meetings of the State Assembly – Kurultai of the Republic of Bashkortostan.

When forming the OP development plan, transparency of processes was noted, while information about the content of the OP is communicated to interested parties.

OP of the specialties are publicly discussed with representatives of all interested parties, taking into account the identified shortcomings, comments and suggestions, correct and introduce amendments.

The BSMU maintains the procedure for approval, periodic review (revision) and monitoring of educational programs and documents regulating this process. All processes regulating the implementation of the OP are documented. Each employee knows their responsibilities, functions and rights.

As a result of consultations with interested parties, a number of additions were made to the educational program, in particular, students took an optional course on the diagnosis and treatment of a new coronavirus infection, professional retraining in IT technologies at the digital department of BSMU, industrial practice "Preparation for medical activities in conditions of epidemiological distress".

The University is the holder of the basic part and a grant on the track "Territorial and (or) industry leadership" within the framework of the federal program "Priority 2030". The main scientific research is carried out within the framework of four strategic projects, including the Breakthrough Transfer of Medical Knowledge and Health-saving Technologies.

### ***The analytical part***

EEC experts note that within the framework of the "Mission and Results" standard for accredited specialties of BSMU, during the work of the expert commission and the analysis of the submitted documentation, compliance with the requirements of the standard was revealed. All stakeholders participated in the development and approval of the Mission: teaching staff, students, representatives of the practical sphere, employers.

The analysis of the compliance of the activities of BSMU and faculties with the criteria of this standard indicates the presence of a Development Strategy in BSMU that corresponds to the mission and vision of the university. The management carries out a number of activities on target indicators of areas of activity, monitoring and improvement measures. The members of the VEC note that the missions of the OP specialties are brought to the attention of interested parties through notification in the media, by e-mail distribution to all departments of BSMU, teaching staff, students, by placing on information stands of departments. However, the EEC experts note that during interviews with faculty, students, employers and graduates, the mission and vision were not fully interpreted.

Accredited OP are designed on the basis of missions and taking into account the requirements of the Federal State Educational Standard, and allow you to prepare a competent doctor capable of the following types of professional activities: medical, organizational and managerial, research. This allows graduates of the OP to choose career paths.

When a graduate is oriented to a medical type of professional activity, he has the opportunity, after receiving a certificate, to find a job in medical institutions as a doctor or to continue his studies in residency, to carry out research activities in the process of studying under postgraduate or doctoral programs, preparation and defense of scientific and qualification work.



The main stakeholders in the formulation of the mission and learning outcomes are teaching staff, students, representatives of health authorities (Ministry of Health of the Republic of Bashkortostan) and employers (Chief Physicians, heads of departments of medical organizations). The formulation of the mission and expected results of the educational program is the main content of the activity of the teaching staff. Students are attracted through student public organizations (the Council of Students and the trade union committee of students of BSMU). Representatives of the health authorities (Ministry of Health of the Republic of Bashkortostan) and employers (chief doctors, heads of departments of medical organizations) take part in discussions at regular meetings with the Minister of Health, deputy Ministers, meetings of the Pediatric Council of the Ministry of Health, meetings of the Republican Commission on the analysis of cases of child and Infant Mortality.

In addition to the main stakeholders, BSMU consults with the executive and legislative authorities (the Government of the Republic of Bashkortostan, the Administration of the Head of the Republic, the State Assembly – Kurultai of the Republic of Bashkortostan, Roszdravnadzor, Rospotrebnadzor, the Ministry of Family, Labor and Social Protection of the Population of the Republic of Bashkortostan) in terms of coordinating the institutional mission of BSMU, taking into account the socio-economic, demographic and epidemiological situation in Russia and the Republic of Bashkortostan.

The specialty surveys are publicly discussed with representatives of all interested parties, considering the identified shortcomings, comments and suggestions, they are corrected and amendments are introduced.

At the same time, the members of the EEC note that some stakeholders (students and employers, etc.) found it difficult to clearly reproduce the mission of the OP during interviews with members of the EEC and give specific examples of what exactly their personal participation in the development of the mission and vision of BSMU and OP was. During the visit and the interview, the members of the EEC did not receive a complete and detailed idea of exactly what events were held at BSMU in order to discuss the mission and final results of the OP in the specialty "Dentistry".

The available material resources are used responsibly, in order to adequately implement the fulfillment of the designated mission and goals of the OP.

The members of the EEC note that great importance is attached to the formation of proper behavior among students in relation to colleagues, teachers, administration, patients and their relatives.

According to the "Mission and final Results" standard, we would like to note that the success of the implementation of the OP is determined mainly on the basis of a systematic, purposeful and effective implementation of the OP development plan, which, accordingly, should be the most transparent and accessible to all interested parties.

The OP is constantly being developed and adjusted considering the needs of interested persons and students. When developing the OP, they comply with national development priorities and the university's development strategy.

Satisfactory ratings were given by the members of the EEC on those items that formally meet the standard but require increased attention while meeting the criteria of the standards.

***Strengths/best practices:***

According to this standard, no strengths have been identified.

***Recommendations of the EEC: none***

***The conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:***

- ***strong positions – 0***
- ***satisfactory – 13***
- ***suggest improvements – 0***
- ***unsatisfactory – 0***



## 6.2 Standard «Educational program»

### ***The evidentiary part***

Educational activities in the specialty 31.05.01 «General Medicine» are carried out on the basis of the Federal State Educational Standard for the specialist degree and the professional standard "District internist", considering the needs of the regional labor market, the requirements of federal executive authorities and relevant industry requirements. The duration of the implementation of the OP is 6 years.

Educational activities in the specialty 31.05.02 «Pediatrics» are carried out on the basis of the Federal State Educational Standard for the specialist degree and the professional standard "District Pediatrician", considering the needs of the regional labor market, the requirements of federal executive authorities and relevant industry requirements. The duration of the implementation of the OP is 6 years.

Educational activities in the specialty 31.05.03 «Dentistry» are carried out on the basis of the Federal State Educational Standard specialist degree and professional standard "Dentist", taking into account the needs of the regional labor market, the requirements of federal executive authorities and relevant industry requirements. The duration of the implementation of the OP is 5 years.

Educational activities in the specialty 32.05.01 "Preventive Medicine" are carried out on the basis of the Federal State Educational Standard "Specialist in the field of medical and preventive medicine", taking into account the needs of the regional labor market, the requirements of federal executive authorities and relevant industry requirements. The duration of the implementation of the OP is 6 years.

Educational activities in the specialty 33.05.01 "Pharmacy" are carried out on the basis of the Federal State Educational Standard specialist degree and the professional standard "Pharmacist", taking into account the needs of the regional labor market, the requirements of federal executive authorities and relevant industry requirements. The duration of the implementation of the OP is 5 years.

All educational programs include a combination of frontal, cyclic and block-cyclic (block-modular) ways of organizing the educational process. With the frontal method, the system allows you to alternate academic pairs with rest breaks. The cyclic method of organizing the educational process is a continuous period of study time corresponding to the total duration of academic hours in a semester allocated to practical and laboratory classes in one academic discipline, and divided by academic days.

The block-cycle (block-modular) method of organizing the educational process is lecturing and conducting practical classes in blocks (modules), regular assessment of students' knowledge and skills is carried out using ongoing monitoring of learning outcomes and ends with final control in the form of intermediate certification in the block.

The total volume of the OP "General Medicine", "Preventive Medicine", "Pediatrics" (curricula 2023) contains 360 credit units (CU) and consists of three blocks. The volume of contact work is at least 60% of the total volume of the specialist degree program.

The total volume of the OP "Dentistry" and "Pharmacy" (curricula 2023) contains 300 credit units (CU). The volume of contact work is at least 60% of the total volume of the specialist degree program.

The OP is designed in accordance with legal requirements and assumes a traditional linear model. The elements of modular or spiral design are not identified in the documents.

The dean's office of the relevant faculty and the educational and methodological department of BSMU carry out the development and control of the implementation of educational programs.

The content of elective disciplines is determined by specialized departments based on the existing topical problems of medicine and healthcare. The scope and content of practical training

of students and the forms of its control are defined in the Federal State Educational Standard and curricula.

In accordance with the Regulations developed at the university on the procedure for choosing elective and optional disciplines, BSMU provides students with the opportunity to choose and master elective and optional disciplines.

The development, approval and implementation, as well as amendments to the OP, are carried out in accordance with external and internal organizational, legal, regulatory, administrative and methodological documents, such as: "Regulations on the development and approval of basic professional educational programs of higher education - bachelor's degree programs, specialist degree programs, master's degree programs", "Regulations on development and approval of the work program of the discipline (module) of the main professional educational programs of higher education - bachelor's degree programs, specialist degree programs, master's degree programs" and "Regulations on the implementation of the procedure for organizing and implementing educational activities for educational programs of higher education – bachelor's degree programs, specialist degree programs, master's degree programs".

The departments determine the modernity and relevance of the material in the disciplines taught, make changes and additions to the curricula, which are approved by the cyclic methodological commission, the educational and methodological council for the relevant specialties, the coordinating scientific and methodological Council, the Academic Council of the university and are reflected in the curricula.

Training on accredited educational programs is carried out in accordance with the curricula approved by the Academic Council of BSMU.

During practical training, the following educational technologies are used: educational video, solving situational problems, business and role-playing educational game, analysis of clinical cases, brainstorming method, small group method, case method, round tables, discussions, duty in the departments of the medical base, preparation of medical history, portfolio, work on training simulators, etc.

When studying disciplines aimed at the formation of competencies, including research activities, students' research work is widely used (compiling an information review of literature on the proposed topic, preparing an abstract, preparing an essay, a report, writing a term paper, preparing educational schemes, tables), student's educational and research work, work in the LPU archive. Also, trainings, master classes of experts and specialists in practical healthcare, visits to medical conferences and consultations, participation in scientific and practical conferences, meetings with representatives of Russian and foreign companies, government and public organizations are widely used.

One of the forms of independent work is the formation of a student's portfolio. According to the Regulation on EIOS, in the personal account, which the student receives access to from the moment of admission to BSMU, the formation of an "Electronic Student Portfolio" is available, including the preservation of the student's works, reviews and evaluations of these works by any participants in the educational process. The formation of a portfolio develops students' ability to analyze and evaluate the process of their own development.

The OP "Preventive Medicine", "General Medicine, "Pediatrics", "Dentistry, "Pharmacy" provides for the multiple formation of one competence in various disciplines.

Learning outcomes (competence formation) are evaluated continuously throughout the learning process. In accordance with the "Regulations on the ongoing monitoring of academic performance and intermediate certification of students", the assessment of the quality of mastering the educational program is carried out through ongoing monitoring of academic performance, intermediate certification of students and the state final certification of graduates.

The BSMU has implemented a system of point-rating assessment (BRS) of student academic performance. The main objectives of the BRS are: to increase the motivation of students to master educational programs; to activate (stimulate) the daily and systematic work of students; to increase the effectiveness of regular independent work of students; to reduce the role of randomness and to

ensure a more accurate and objective assessment of the level of knowledge and practical training of students during intermediate certification.

Scientific research by students is carried out under the guidance of teaching staff as part of the work of the Student Scientific Society (SNO). In the period from 2021-2023, members of the SNO participated in more than 60 scientific conferences. The SNO asset took part in the organization of more than 45 scientific events. Students participate in the annual All-Russian scientific conference of students and young scientists with international participation "Issues of theoretical and practical medicine", which is attended by students, residents, graduate students and teachers from different cities of Russia, Kazakhstan, Belarus, Uzbekistan, etc. The conference materials are published in the online edition "Bulletin of BSMU". More than 1,400 people take part in 18 scientific sites annually. The average number of scientific reports by young scientists is 200. More than 100 meetings of scientific circles are held during each academic year.

The university's research schools operate on the principle of "open doors" and students are actively involved in their work. The research results are being implemented in the educational process at the university departments. The structure of lectures and practical classes includes information on the results of research carried out within the framework of dissertations.

However, the members of the EEC were not fully convinced of the use of the possibilities of conducting research work, in particular an educational experiment, in the classroom. Measures for the development of this area include: updating the curricula of departments with the mandatory introduction of elements of educational research and educational experiment in accordance with the topics of the curriculum; strengthening control over the implementation of the results of scientific research and development of BSMU staff in educational and clinical work.

To support students who take an active part in research, various support measures are applied, including: the appointment of an increased state academic scholarship, the transfer from a paid to a budget form of education, financing trips of students to participate in scientific events at the expense of the university.

The OP includes the disciplines of simulation training focused on the problems of ethics and doctor-patient contact and clinical disciplines aimed at preparing for the initial accreditation of specialists, which establishes the compliance of knowledge, skills and abilities of the accredited with the requirements of the standard, which allows a university graduate after completing the 5th or 6th year of admission to professional activity.

The BSMU has a department responsible for organizing both direct postgraduate education (residency) and continuing medical education (additional professional programs) – the Dean's office of the Faculty of Training Highly qualified Personnel and additional professional Education. One of the tasks of the department is constant interaction with the regional administration and practical healthcare in order to assess the need for specialists in certain specialties.

The staffing of BSMU includes the position of Vice-rector for Regional Health Development and Vice-rector for Scientific and International Work, who organizes and oversees work in these areas. This allows the teaching staff to provide a link between basic medical education and the subsequent stage of professional training of a specialist.

### ***The analytical part***

During the visit, the Members of the EEC conducted a detailed analysis of accredited educational institutions in the specialties "General Medicine", "Pediatrics", "Dentistry", "Preventive Medicine" and "Pharmacy" for compliance with the requirements of the modern education market, principles and methods of organizing educational, research and educational processes aimed at satisfying the interests of students and all participants in the educational process of the OP.

OP is implemented in accordance with the principles of equality (there is no discrimination based on gender, age, presence/absence of disability, religion, culture, nationality, citizenship, etc.), which is confirmed during interviews and when attending classes at departments.

The curriculum of the OP "Preventive Medicine" is an example of horizontal and vertical integration. An example of horizontal interdisciplinary integration is the study of specialized



academic disciplines "General hygiene" (3rd year), "Radiation hygiene" (4th year), "Occupational hygiene", "Hygiene of children and adolescents", "Communal hygiene", "Hygiene of children and adolescents" (5th, 6th year). All these disciplines have the form of intermediate control in the form of an exam.

An example of vertical integration is the fact that the possibility of effective and successful study of the above disciplines is determined by a number of basic, as well as behavioral, social, legal and specialized disciplines previously studied by students: "Fundamentals of healthy nutrition", "Fundamentals of a healthy lifestyle", "Physics, Mathematics", "Chemistry" (1st year), "Biological Chemistry", "Normal Physiology" (2nd year), "Bioethics" (1st year), "Psychology and Pedagogy" (1st year). Already at the first lectures and practical classes in the profile discipline "General Hygiene" (3rd year), students are required to use previously acquired knowledge, skills and abilities in the field of sanitary and hygienic studies of environmental objects and their impact on human health using physical, chemical, and functional methods. Thus, the above-mentioned "bundle" of various academic disciplines, applied and correctly constructed in the curriculum, ensures the most effective study of more complex specialized disciplines in senior courses.

The University determines the content and scope of academic disciplines. In the curricula of the specialty "General Medicine", "Pediatrics", "Dentistry" and "Pharmacy", experts note the vertical construction of the curriculum with virtually no horizontal connections.

When conducting interviews with the administrative and managerial staff of the University, teaching staff, and students, it was revealed that teaching and learning methods based on the modern theory of adult education are not actively used in the educational process: TBL, CBL, RBL, integrated modules for systems or organs, spiral design.

The possibility of a phased introduction of a modular education system (in order to best adapt students and teaching staff) should be considered: this will allow students to immerse themselves more fully in the subject matter and consider the subject from the point of view of various disciplines, without receiving conflicting data and the suggestion to "forget what was studied in other departments." It is necessary to introduce this principle of learning in stages, since adaptation of both the educational organization itself and the students is necessary; introduction simultaneously in all courses will lead to the fact that senior students who have studied for 4-5 years on a linear system will need an emergency restructuring, which can lead to a decrease in academic performance without receiving all the advantages of modular training.

It is advisable to define the basic level topics as modules: chemistry-biology-physics, anatomy-histology-topographic anatomy, physiology-biochemistry, pathophysiology-path anatomy-pharmacology and clinical disciplines: cardiology (therapy, surgery, functional diagnostics, X-ray endovascular methods of diagnosis and treatment, pharmacology, intensive care). As a result, the University will be able to pay maximum attention to each topic, rationally distribute the load on students and teachers, studying on the principle from simple to complex will allow students to receive more information, as well as it will be possible to take into account the individual needs of students with the building of an individual educational trajectory.

The content of the work programs (RP) of the disciplines is updated annually in accordance with the latest achievements and changes in the discipline being studied. RP is discussed and approved at meetings of the department responsible for its development. The discussion participants are the heads of the department and the entire faculty, who make proposals for changing and supplementing the RP. The next stage of assessing the feasibility of making changes to the content of the RP is its discussion and approval at the KNMS.

Annual updates also relate to the information support of the RP. The content of the information and methodological part of the RP is annually corrected taking into account newly published and acquired educational publications, monographs, etc.

Individual assistance and advice to students on issues of the educational process are being traced, and conditions are being created for the effective learning of the educational program. The educational process takes into account the individual characteristics of students, provides support in the implementation of the educational process and maintains a monitoring system for their achievements.

The quality of training of specialists and their professional competencies is confirmed by the characteristics and feedback from the heads of medical institutions and employers.

Students can get advice from teachers, as well as write to the rector's blog, which is posted on the university's website and receive a detailed answer.

A set of basic characteristics of education (volume, content, planned results) and organizational and pedagogical conditions, which is presented in the form of a curriculum, a calendar curriculum, work programs of academic subjects, courses, disciplines (modules), evaluation and methodological materials, a work program of education, a calendar plan of educational work, forms of certification. All the above mentioned documents are publicly available on the official website of the University.

Experts note that for all accredited educational programs, mechanisms for monitoring students' independent work have not been developed – the lack of a full-fledged electronic educational environment does not allow documenting the time spent by students doing independent work, there is no analytical data on the time of students' independent work in the electronic library.

Teachers of the clinical departments of BSMU work at clinical bases and in medical and preventive institutions, which ensures a close relationship between the OP and the field of practical healthcare and the participation of students in the work of a team of specialists in providing various types of medical care. The members of the EEC note that practitioners are actively involved in the education of students. The quality of training of specialists and their professional competencies is confirmed by the characteristics and feedback from the heads of medical institutions and employers.

In the process of interviewing students and teaching staff by members of the EEC, the absence of a Catalog of elective disciplines was revealed, which dictates the need to intensify the work of the University, dean's office and departments in this area and the broad involvement of all stakeholders (students, teaching staff, employers, representatives of practical healthcare, graduates) in the process of developing QED in all accredited specialties.

Students have the opportunity to choose various elective subjects, which is determined by the "Position and order of students' choice of elective and elective subjects at BSMU. The choice of disciplines is carried out by students on their own voluntarily, taking into account individual educational needs. Registration for elective and optional subjects is carried out by making an application and submitting it to the dean's office. Based on the applications received, the dean's office forms lists of groups for the selected disciplines. Students have the right to make changes to the list of elective subjects for the next academic year.

However, it is worth paying attention to the fact that, for example, in the specialty "General Medicine" students have the opportunity to choose from 3-5 elective disciplines, which are often close in meaning:

- Interventional Cardiology
- Modern clinical recommendations for the diagnosis, treatment and rehabilitation of patients with acute coronary syndrome
- Modern clinical recommendations for the diagnosis, treatment and rehabilitation of patients with acute cerebrovascular accident
- X-ray endovascular diagnosis and treatment

Thus, the student receives a course on the problems of cardiovascular pathology, regardless of the chosen elective. This situation does not allow for the formation of an individual educational trajectory.

When visiting the bases of industrial practice in the specialties "Preventive Medicine", "General Medicine", "Pediatrics", "Dentistry" and "Pharmacy", it was noted that students receive briefings on occupational safety and health. However, during the examination in the specialty "Pharmacy", there were no journals confirming the completion of the briefings; for the rest of the specialties, magazines were provided that were properly designed. The completion of the briefings was confirmed by the students during the interview.



***Strengths/best practices not identified.***

According to this standard, no strengths have been identified.

***Recommendations of the EEC:***

1. OP heads are recommended to carry out a phased adaptation of the model (integrated modules for systems or organs, spiral design) of the educational program. The deadline is until 01.09.2025.
2. The university management is recommended to organize professional development of teaching staff on the use of modern educational technologies and assessment methods in the educational process. The deadline is until 01.09.2024.
3. It is recommended that the heads of the educational program include teaching and learning methods in the educational process, taking into account the best international practices (TBL, CBL, RBL, etc.) based on the principles of andragogy. The deadline is until 01.09.2024.
4. The heads of the educational program are recommended to develop a system for monitoring the independent work of students with the provision of materials for independent training of students, the ability to document the time spent by students doing independent work, analyzing data on the time of independent work of students in the electronic library of the University. The deadline is until 01.09.2024, then permanently.
5. It is recommended that the heads of the OP introduce horizontal integration of related sciences (integrated module, integrated program). The deadline is until 01.09.2025.
6. It is recommended that the university management develop and implement a system of academic counseling for students (an advisory service) on the choice of elective subjects and the formation of an individual educational trajectory. The deadline is until 01.12.2024.
7. The heads of the OP are recommended to create a Catalog of elective disciplines Due by 01.12.2024.
8. The heads of the OP are recommended to include issues of non-traditional and alternative medical practice in the Catalog of elective disciplines. The deadline is until 01.12.2024.
9. It is recommended that the management of OP Pharmacy ensure proper documentation of students' familiarization with safety techniques when mastering practical skills at practice bases. The deadline is 01.01.2024.

***The conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:***

- ***Strong – 0***
- ***Satisfactory – 23***
- ***Suggest improvements – 5***
- ***Unsatisfactory – 0***

**6.3. Standard «Assessment of students»*****The evidentiary part***

According to the OP "General Medicine", "Pediatrics", "Dentistry", "Preventive Medicine" and "Pharmacy", the policy and procedure for evaluating learning outcomes, forms of evaluating learning outcomes are regulated in accordance with external and internal regulatory legal acts.

Students can familiarize themselves with local regulations on the BSMU website. In addition, in order to inform students about the methods of teaching and assessment, the methodological guidelines for students for practical classes present assessment materials, types of contact and independent work, forms of knowledge control.

The assessment of students' knowledge, skills and abilities takes place at the following levels: current assessment in practical and final classes; intermediate certification – exams and tests upon completion of the study of disciplines and practices, state final certification.

The principles and methods of assessing students' knowledge in exams and tests are established by the Regulations on conducting ongoing monitoring of academic performance and

intermediate certification of BSMU students. The regulation establishes that "the main purpose of the intermediate certification is to assess the quality of students' achievement of the planned learning outcomes in the discipline (module) and practice." The planned learning outcomes for each discipline (module) and practice are knowledge, skills, and abilities that characterize the stages of competence formation and ensure the achievement of the planned results of mastering the main professional educational program.

The intermediate certification of students ensures the assessment of intermediate and final learning outcomes in disciplines (modules) and practical training. It is conducted in order to assess the quality of theoretical knowledge acquired, the development of practical skills, the ability to synthesize acquired knowledge and apply it to solving practical problems. Intermediate certification is carried out in accordance with the curricula in the areas and specialties of training in the form of tests, exams or semester certification, which is carried out at the end of the semester if the curriculum does not provide for a test or exam. Credits serve as a form of assessment and confirmation of the students' conscientious mastering of the educational material of practical, seminar classes and lectures in all disciplines of the curriculum of the specialty, as well as a form of checking the passage of educational and industrial practice and mastering the necessary skills in the process of these practices in accordance with the approved program.

The intermediate certification is carried out using the evaluation tools presented in the work program of the discipline. Evaluation tools for intermediate certification undergo internal (on cyclic methodological commissions) and external expertise, the results of which are issued in the form of a review, and annual updating of evaluation tools is carried out. The level of mastery of practical skills formed in practical classes is checked at the final (modular) practical skills classes, on thematic patients or on phantoms at the Federal Accreditation Center. Assessment sheets borrowed from the database of the Federal Methodological Center for Accreditation of Specialists are used to assess practical skills in simulated conditions (OCE). During the interim assessment, a five-point evaluation system is used.

The current monitoring of the progress of BSMU students is carried out daily, during the educational process, in the form of an oral survey, testing, written work, practical work, analysis of clinical cases, evaluation of the results of independent work of students. The current control of academic performance provides assessment during the development of disciplines and practical training, intermediate control - assessment of intermediate and final results of training in disciplines and practical training. The purpose of the state final certification of BSMU is to establish compliance of the results of mastering the basic educational programs by students with the relevant requirements of the federal state educational standard (approved by Order No. 984 of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation dated August 12, 2020).

Each discipline is provided with a work program and control and measuring tools. These documents are fundamental for the ongoing monitoring of academic performance and intermediate certification. The final assessment of graduates' knowledge is carried out on the basis of a state exam, which includes the assessment of fundamental, paraclinical and clinical knowledge necessary for the professional activities of future specialists.

The NPA regulates the processes of conducting current, intermediate and final attestation, describes the policy, principles and methods of assessment, appeal procedures, and retake policy. These fundamental documents are available to the public, including supervisors and regulators, faculty, students, and external stakeholders. Internal cathedral control by type of activity is carried out by the staff of the department in accordance with the Work Plan of the departments, as part of visits to lectures and training sessions.

Monitoring of the implementation of the OP is carried out by the educational and organizational department, the department of education quality and monitoring on the basis of the results of boundary control, intermediate certification, state final certification, analysis of test results, graduate examinations, questionnaires of students and teaching staff, employers, allowing to assess the achievement of the final results of the training of the OP. Monitoring of the implementation of the OP is carried out both within the framework of internal university control and during the internal and external audit of the activities of the teaching staff.

The final learning outcomes are divided into three categories – knowledge, skills, and skills (together constituting competencies). The programs of each academic discipline reflect a list of universal, general professional and professional competencies. One discipline can participate in the formation of a number of competencies.

Exams are taken during the periods of the test and examination sessions according to a schedule drawn up in accordance with the curricula and calendar study schedules approved by the order of the Rector for the interim certification at the University.

The Simulation Center allows students to assess the level of mastering practical skills and abilities, the purpose of which is a practice-oriented approach to medical education, training and practicing medical care skills using simulation educational technologies. The second stage of the comprehensive examination of the state final certification is the analysis of the clinical case (practical skills).

The system provides a certain balance between formative and summative assessment, which allows you to objectively rank students when awarding prizes, scholarships, letters of commendation, etc. For high academic performance and extracurricular activity, students receive bonus points, which they need to enroll in residency in their chosen specialty. Student self-government bodies play an important role in the development of measures to encourage students for extracurricular activity: the Council of students, the trade union committee of students, the council of the student scientific society.

The BSMU uses a procedure for evaluating the validity of all methods used for both current and intermediate and final control – interview questions, professionally oriented situational tasks, tests.

However, attention is drawn to the fact that the electronic journal system is not implemented, that is, the student does not have the opportunity at any time to assess his academic performance, as well as the calculation of indices and academic performance ratings is carried out manually, which can lead to errors.

As part of taking into account the individual achievements of students, a portfolio is maintained throughout the entire period of study at the EIOS, however, it is worth paying attention to the responsible persons to verify the data entered in the portfolio.

A point-rating system has been developed and is being used, which students are familiar with. At the same time, as part of interviews with teachers and students, it was noted that BSMU does not have an automated rating calculation system and electronic journals through which students could familiarize themselves with their academic achievements.

For the test tasks used, an assessment of the difficulty was carried out, which is insufficient to determine their validity and reliability as a means of evaluating students' knowledge. The assessment of practical skills is carried out according to checklists, the assessment of the validity and reliability of which has not been presented.

To ensure transparency of the assessment results, exams (intermediate and GIA) are conducted with the involvement of external examiners – representatives from medical organizations of the Republic of Bashkortostan by agreement. The participation of external experts ensures the transparency of the assessment and independence. When analyzing academic achievements, an Alternative examiner has been introduced into practice, who is an independent person who assesses the level of knowledge and mastering the learning outcomes of undergraduates. External examiners (experts) are selected from among employers with at least 5 years of managerial experience in medical organizations.

The procedure for conducting the GIA is regulated by the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation "On approval of the procedure for conducting the state final certification of educational programs of higher education - Bachelor's degree programs, specialist degree programs and master's degree programs" dated June 29, 2015. N 636.

The University has developed a Regulation on the internal system for assessing the quality of education, regulating issues of internal and external control of knowledge, skills and abilities of students (order of BSMU dated 30.03.2022 No. 469-u).

In case of disagreement with the intermediate/final assessment, the student has the right to



submit an application to the appeals commission. The appeal procedures are prescribed in the regulations on the ongoing monitoring of academic performance and intermediate certification of students at BSMU and in the Regulations on State final certification, the program of State final certification. The Appeal commission of the university is created by the order of the rector of the University No. 217 dated 30.12.2022. According to the results of the students' interviews, the appeal is rarely used.

In order to receive feedback, a system of questioning students on the quality of the organization of practice, conditions at the bases for mastering the real volume of necessary practical skills is widely used.

The existing system makes it possible to effectively regulate the educational process at the university. According to the results of the student survey during the work of the EEC, 61% and 27% of respondents were "fully" and "partially satisfied" with the fairness of exams and intermediate certification; 76% and 18% of students were timely assessed; 69% and 20% explained the rules and strategy of the educational program; 73% and 18% the strategy of the educational program%; conducted tests and exams 57% and 24% of respondents, respectively. 66% and 26% of respondents are fully and partially satisfied with the relationship between students and teachers; 53% and 43% are objective and fair; 66% and 23% of students are informed about courses and educational programs, respectively.

### ***The analytical part***

According to the standard, it should be noted that the assessment of educational achievements of students in accredited specialties is carried out in compliance with regulatory legal acts in the field of education of the Russian Federation. In the process of analyzing the submitted documents, the results of interviewing teachers and students, it was revealed that there is evidence that the student assessment procedure is clearly defined and communicated to teachers and students.

When analyzing student achievements, a point-rating system is used, which helps students take responsibility for their learning process. At the same time, students can get acquainted with the grades only in the paper journals of teachers, which limits their ability to evaluate their rating in real time.

The forms of student control are transparent and accessible to interested parties of the educational program.

According to the results of the survey of students conducted during the visit of the EEC, 49% and 33% of respondents fully agree and partially agree that "the regular assessment (seminars, tests, questionnaires, etc.) reflects the content of the course", respectively. The evaluation criteria used by the teacher are fully and partially understood by 48% and 32% of the surveyed students, respectively. 41% and 39% of respondents, respectively, fully and partially agree that teachers objectively assess students' achievements.

According to the EEC, little attention is paid to determining the validity and reliability of assessment methods in educational programs. Assessment methods based on criteria and reasoning and special examinations taking into account the specifics of medical education (direct and indirect observation of operational and communication skills, mini-clinical examination (MiniCex), workplace assessment, etc.) should be used.

The student knowledge assessment system is continuously studied by the heads of departments and is an open environment for the introduction of new methods in this activity. However, it is necessary to use a wider range of assessment methods and formats, depending on their "utility assessment", which includes a combination of validity, reliability, impact on learning, acceptability and effectiveness of assessment methods and formats, using modern software. Familiarization with the examples of tasks in the test form for senior students revealed the predominance of tasks of a low cognitive level, the presence of defects made by the developers of tasks in the test form.

EEC experts note that BSMU needs to document and evaluate the reliability and validity of assessment methods, which requires the introduction of appropriate software and an appropriate quality assurance process according to existing assessment practices.

EEC experts note that BSMU needs to introduce new assessment methods in accordance with the need and current trends in medical education. It is recommended to establish a clear relationship between assessment and learning and to ensure an appropriate balance between formative and summative assessment. This will allow for more effective management of the student's learning and assessment of academic progress and establish rules for evaluating progress and their relationship to the assessment process.

EEC experts note that BSMU should ensure the provision of timely, specific, constructive and fair feedback to students based on the results of formative and summative assessments, document the assessment process using appropriate assessment forms, and make wider use of a variety of models and ways to receive feedback.

During interviews with the heads of the OP, teaching staff and the studying members of the EEC, it was recorded that there is a certain misunderstanding on the part of the participants of the focus groups on these issues.

Satisfactory ratings were given by the members of the EEC on those points that require increased attention in compliance with the standards.

### ***Strengths/best practices***

According to this standard, no strengths have been identified.

### ***Recommendations of the EEC:***

1. OP heads are encouraged to regularly use and document a wide range of methods for evaluating students' academic achievements and formats, depending on their "usefulness assessment", which includes a combination of validity, reliability, impact on learning, acceptability and effectiveness of assessment methods and format. The deadline is 01.09.2025.
2. The university management is recommended to ensure: documenting the process of evaluating students' academic achievements through the introduction of an electronic journal, accessibility and openness of student's academic achievements to all participants in the educational process. The deadline is until 01.12.2024.

### ***The conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:***

- ***strong positions*** – 0
- ***satisfactory*** – 8
- ***suggest improvements*** – 2
- ***unsatisfactory*** – 0

## **6.4. Standard «Students»**

### ***The evidentiary part***

Admission to the OP "General Medicine", "Pediatrics", "Dentistry", "Preventive Medicine" and "Pharmacy" at BSMU is carried out in accordance with the Rules of admission to the Federal State Budgetary Educational Institution of the Russian Federation on the basis of federal laws and orders of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation, orders of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation, and other departments.

The Government of the Russian Federation, federal executive authorities, the Ministry of Higher Education and Science of the Russian Federation, the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation, as the founder of the Federal State Budgetary Educational Institution of the BSMU of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation, determine the volume of admission, primarily within the admission control figures, distribute a detailed quota of targeted admission, determine



the requirements for the number of places and admission conditions, in particular including a special quota, other special, preferential and special conditions, and a general competition. The list of applicants without entrance examinations is separately detailed.

The University establishes a list of entrance tests for admission to higher education educational programs in accordance with the Order of the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Russian Federation dated 06.08.2021 No. 722 "On approval of the list of entrance tests for admission to higher education educational programs — bachelor's degree programs and specialist degree programs", the minimum number of points in BSMU for training in educational programs higher education – Bachelor's degree programs, specialist degree programs and master's degree programs for the 2023-2024 academic year approved by the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation.

Admission to higher education programs – specialty programs is carried out in accordance with regulatory legal acts (Admission rules, Regulations on the Admission Committee, Regulations on the Examination Commission, Regulations on the appeals Commission, detailing the issues of filing and considering an appeal), updated annually and in accordance with the Federal Law of December 29, 2012 No. 273-F3 "On Education in the Russian Federation", by Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation dated August 21, 2020 No. 1076 "On approval of the Procedure for admission to higher education educational programs - Bachelor's degree programs, specialist degree programs, master's degree programs", other regulatory legal acts of a higher level.

The Admissions Committee is responsible for the policy of selection and admission of students, the duties, powers and tasks of the members are regulated by the Regulations on the Admissions Committee.

The tuition fee is determined by the local regulations of the university, posted on the official website of BSMU in the section "Paid educational services". The tuition fee is posted on the official website of the university.

The University accepts from the applicant the documents necessary for admission when submitting an application for consent to the processing of his personal data, which contains, among other things, consent to the processing of personal data allowed by the applicant for distribution (disclosure to an indefinite circle of persons), given in accordance with Article 10.1 of Federal Law No. 152-FZ dated 27.07.2006 "On personal data" (Collection of Legislation of the Russian Federation, 2006, No. 31, Article 3451; 2021, No. 1, Article 58).

A separate competition is held for places set by the admission control figures for obtaining education on the terms of targeted training, in accordance with paragraph 1.6.5. Admission rules. The deadlines for accepting documents and enrolling applicants are set annually in accordance with paragraph 1.10 of the Admission Rules.

Admission of foreign citizens is carried out in accordance with paragraph 14 of the Rules of admission to BSMU for training in educational programs of higher education – bachelor's degree programs, specialist degree programs and master's degree programs for the 2023-2024 academic year.

According to the decision of the Admission Committee of the University, the applicant is awarded points for individual achievements in accordance with paragraph 5 of the Admission Rules, the applicant submits documents confirming the receipt of the results of individual achievements.

Transparency, objectivity, maximum accessibility and detailed information for applicants are the main principles of the University admission policy at all stages of admission to study. All information on the formation of the contingent is posted on the university's website.

The organization of work and the composition of the admissions committee are determined by the Regulations on the Admissions Committee (approved annually by the order of the BSMU). To ensure the conduct of entrance examinations for certain categories of citizens, including foreign citizens and stateless persons, BSMU has established examination commissions, the organization of which is determined by the Regulations on Examination Commissions, the Procedure for

conducting entrance examinations. Applicants can familiarize themselves with the entrance test Programs on the information platforms of BSMU.

Every year, the university conducts career guidance events in order to attract and select professionally oriented applicants. In the 2022-2023 academic year, in accordance with the order of the Rector of the University No. 81-a dated 10.02.2022 "On the composition of the Vocational Guidance Council in 2022", a 17-member Vocational Guidance Council was established, chaired by the Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs. The Council works throughout the school year. All University employees traveling to the regions of the Republic of Bashkortostan are working to attract the most trained and professionally oriented youth to study at the University and medical college.

The Center for Pre-university training and career Guidance has created an Educational and methodological complex "School-University", which includes specialized medical and chemical-biological classes of schools in the Republic of Bashkortostan. The school "Young Medic" for students of grades 8-9 in Ufa. systematically and objectively forms a conscious and stable motivation for the medical profession and its main specialties, as well as forms students' ideas about the specifics of the medical profession.

Admission to the first year is carried out on the basis of competitive selection, the competition is carried out on the basis of the total competitive score, which consists of points, entrance tests and points for individual achievements of the applicant, individual achievements are taken into account even if the competitive scores of applicants are equal. The list of individual achievements of applicants, which is approved annually in the Admission Rules, provides for consideration of the diverse interests and opportunities of applicants. Enrollment orders are discussed at the meetings of the admissions committee, the decision to enroll in the first year is collegial. At all stages of admission and enrollment and during the academic year, BSMU closely cooperates with applicants and their representatives, for which the technical staff of the admissions committee is created annually.

The university has conditions for conducting entrance tests for people with disabilities, an accessible environment has been created and is developing.

Those enrolled in training, if necessary, have the opportunity to transfer both between specialties within the university and between universities in accordance with the Regulations on the procedure and grounds for transfer, expulsion, restoration, and granting academic leave to students.

The Appeals Commission accepts and considers appeals submitted by applicants who have passed the entrance tests, which the University organizes independently. In case of disagreement with the mark, each applicant or his legal representative has the right to submit to the chairman of the admission committee a written application for reviewing the results of the entrance test in accordance with the local regulatory act - the Regulation on appeal commissions for reviewing appeals based on the results of the entrance tests.

All students are informed about the existence of an electronic trust box on the website and a section contacting the rector. There are internal regulations for students.

Regular meetings of students with curators, deans of faculties and the vice-rector for Academic Affairs are held, where academic performance issues are discussed. Regular coursework, group and individual conversations to find out the reasons for possible academic lag. According to the OP "General Medicine" there is an approved work program of education and a calendar plan of educational work.

For effective and safe study, the Anti-Corruption Commission has been established. Local regulations have been approved in the field of anti-corruption.

Proper norms of behavior of students are regulated by the Internal Regulations of BSMU students (adopted by the Academic Council on December 26, 2016 No. 12), which are posted on the University's website.

The development of the desired qualities and behavior of students was developed by teaching staff, staff of deaneries with the participation of representatives of the Council of Students of BSMU and the trade union Committee of students of BSMU, taking into account the Federal Law

"On Education in the Russian Federation" dated 28.12.2012 No. 273-FZ, the Procedure for applying disciplinary measures to students and removing them from students (approved by order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation Federation on 15.03.2013, No. 13), the BSMU Charter.

According to the Regulations on the organization and procedure for conducting practices, in accordance with paragraph 9 of the Regulations on the Organization and Procedure for conducting practices, payment of daily subsistence allowance and living expenses is provided.

BSMU uses various tools for feedback, in particular, regular surveys of teachers and students are conducted. The results are summarized and analyzed by the Department of Education Quality and monitoring of the University and submitted to the coordinating Scientific and methodological council of the Academic Council; meetings of deans with students, educational and methodological management with teachers are held.

Within the framework of the Cooperation Agreement, consultations with psychologists of the Republican Youth Psychological Center under the State Committee for Youth Policy are organized, they are invited to the University to meet with students. The following mechanisms are used to identify students in need of psychological, social and material support: surveys and questionnaires; observation and analysis of behavior by the curator of groups and the deputy dean for educational work; analysis of educational achievements; curatorial hours in 1st and 2nd courses.

Student self-government at BSMU is implemented through public student organizations run by students themselves. The policy of student representation is implemented in three directions: student self-government; student representation in collegial bodies of the university, which manage the educational process; representation of students in social projects that implement regional health objectives. The student scientific society becomes the starting point, the point of scientific growth and development of young scientists.

The range of public organizations includes: the Council of students – coordinates the initiatives of the studying youth and the leadership.

In order to take into account the opinions of students on University management issues and when adopting local regulations affecting their rights and legitimate interests, a Student Council was established on the initiative of students. The tasks of the council are to solve educational and social problems of students, promote a healthy and moral lifestyle, and develop self-government skills.

The Trade Union Committee of students of BSMU, together with the university management, is engaged in providing comfortable and favorable conditions for the development of student initiatives and education at the university.

Throughout their studies, university students are involved in various forms of socio-cultural activities, participate in socio-political life, and socially significant actions.

At all stages of training, the graduate and Career Employment Assistance Center carries out work on vocational guidance and temporary employment assistance for the period of study, including for students with disabilities. All organizations and structures providing advisory services operate within the framework of the law on the protection of personal data on the principles of confidentiality. The established system of support and support for students as a whole ensures that the requests and needs of students are met.

According to the results of a survey of students conducted during the visit of the EEC, 93% of respondents rate relations with the dean's office as "very good" and "good"; the level of accessibility of the dean's office - 95% of respondents; the level of accessibility and responsiveness of the university management - 93% of the respondents.

92% of respondents are fully and partially satisfied with the availability of academic counseling; 92% of respondents are satisfied with educational materials.

86% of respondents are fully and partially satisfied with the availability of counseling on personal problems and the clarity of procedures for taking disciplinary action. 86% of students are fully and partially satisfied with the work of financial and administrative services of BSMU. 87%



of respondents are fully or partially satisfied with the availability of health services for students and the quality of the student health service.

### ***The analytical part***

At BSMU, the requirements for the standard are met in sufficient volume. It can be noted that the selection and admission to the university is carried out in accordance with the Federal Law on Education in the Russian Federation, the admission procedure, and the Admission Rules. Information about admission conditions is publicly available and applicants are provided with equal, open and accessible conditions for admission. The most worthy applicants are selected for admission, determined by the sum of the points of the entrance tests and individual achievements.

Students are given the opportunity to participate in advisory bodies, in the evaluation and improvement of the training program.

BSMU establishes a relationship between student selection, mission, OP and the desired quality of graduates. The main criterion for passing the competition is the amount of competitive points, which is calculated as the sum of points for each entrance test, as well as for individual achievements.

Students are also given the opportunity to participate in advisory bodies, in evaluating and improving the training program. But at the same time, during interviews with students, it was revealed that students cannot specify how often a questionnaire is conducted on the formulation of the mission, content and implementation of the educational program.

Attention is drawn to the inability of students to build an individual educational trajectory: there is no system of advisors, there is no choice of elective disciplines, there is no catalog of elective disciplines.

During the interviewing of students and graduates of the OP, the members of the EEC found that during meetings with the heads of departments, the dean's office, students have the opportunity to express their opinions and wishes regarding their participation in the decision-making process, ensuring academic quality and other professional, financial and social issues. All issues raised and discussed at these meetings are resolved in a timely and appropriate manner.

The results of the student survey showed high (over 90%) satisfaction rates in terms of the attitude and level of accessibility of the dean's office, accessibility and responsiveness of the university management, support of educational materials in the learning process, accessibility of counseling on personal problems, financial and administrative services of the educational institution, the level of accessibility of library resources, the quality of services provided in libraries and reading rooms, the existing educational resources of the university, the usefulness of the website of educational organizations in general and faculties in particular, the clarity of the procedure for taking incentive and disciplinary measures, the overall quality of curricula, teaching methods in general, and the quality of teaching.

During the interview, there was no confirmation of the implementation at BSMU of a certain system of academic counseling for students (permanent advisors service) on the choice of elective disciplines, the formation of an individual educational trajectory, preparation for postgraduate studies and professional career planning.

Responsibility for ensuring the professional behavior of the student is assigned to the head of the group (in accordance with the Internal Regulations, paragraph 2.9.3). The provision of socio-psychological support to students is entrusted to the Department of Educational and Social Work together with the Department of Cultural and Mass Work and psychologists of the Department of Pedagogy and Psychology. During meetings with students, it was revealed that in order to solve issues of psychological and social assistance, the student must first contact the head of the group and tell about his problem; then to the curator, then to the head of the department of educational and social work, who, using personal contacts, directs the student to regional services. When visiting the Department of Pediatrics, it was revealed that teachers also conduct conversations with students, if necessary. Thus, confidentiality is not respected when consulting. At the same time, attention is drawn to the low number of students seeking help – about 5 requests per year. There is no registration of these requests.

In accordance with the strategy of medical and pharmaceutical education, BSMU annually increases the admission of students, including from foreign countries (SCO, BRICS, CIS and EU), by budgetary and extra-budgetary forms of education, more than 3,500. This requires a comprehensive approach to solving the issues of the educational process and personality formation, in conditions of social instability and the growth of crisis interventions. Due to the changing requirements for psychological services, it is necessary to organize work aimed at helping students adapt, psychological counseling and developing students' skills to maintain their mental health. The creation of such a structure will contribute to students' awareness of the development of their personal and professional path during their studies, increase psychological stability during difficulties in the learning process. Also, strengthening the profile orientation ensures a reduction in the cost of the manifestation of antisocial phenomena and their negative consequences among students.

#### ***Strengths/best practices***

According to this standard, no strengths have been identified.

#### ***Recommendations of the EEC:***

1. The management of the university is recommended to organize work on socio-psychological support for students with ensuring confidentiality of counseling on personal needs. The deadline is until 01.12.2024.
2. The university management is recommended to systematically collect information, analyze the results of feedback from students on the formulation of the mission, content and implementation of the educational program and use the results to improve their quality. The deadline is until 01.09.2024, then at least once a year.

#### ***The conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:***

- ***strong positions – 0***
- ***satisfactory – 14***
- ***suggest improvements – 2***
- ***unsatisfactory – 0***

#### **6.5. Standard «Academic staff/teachers»**

##### ***The evidentiary part***

There are positions of pedagogical and scientific workers, engineering and technical, administrative and economic, industrial, educational and auxiliary, medical, pharmaceutical and other employees of the University at BSMU.

The policy of selection and admission of academic staff to BSMU is carried out in accordance with the Labor Code of the Russian Federation, the regulation "On the procedure for filling positions of teaching staff belonging to the teaching staff", approved by Order No. 749 of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation dated 23.07.2015, the Nomenclature of positions of teaching staff of organizations engaged in educational activities, positions of heads of educational organizations, approved by Decree of the Government of the Russian Federation No. 225 dated 21.02.2022, Order of the Ministry of Health and Social Development of the Russian Federation No. 1n dated 11.01.2011 "On approval of the Unified Qualification Directory of positions of managers, Specialists and Employees, section "Qualification characteristics of positions of managers and specialists of higher professional and additional professional education" and the charter of BSMU, approved by Order of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation from 23.06.2016 No. 409.

BSMU has an open procedure for recruitment and selection of personnel, the objectivity of competitions in the selection of applicants for scientific and pedagogical positions. Teaching staff must have higher education corresponding to the academic discipline taught, training in Pedagogy (every 3 years), specialty (every 5 years), IT technology (every 3 years), inclusive education (every



3 years), first aid (every 3 years). Applicants for the position of head of the department, professor and associate professor must have a doctorate or PhD degree.

The announcements of the competitions are publicly available on the university's website, which allows both university employees and third-party applicants to participate in the competition.

For the implementation of the OP "General Medicine", "Pediatrics", "Dentistry", "Preventive Medicine" and "Pharmacy", a staff of teaching staff is formed on the basis of curricula, which is approved by the staffing table. The number of teaching staff is planned based on the needs of the educational process, the standard of the teaching load on the teacher, the contingent of students in all OP. The balance of the academic staff of basic biomedical sciences, behavioral and social sciences, and medical and pharmaceutical sciences, as well as the balance between academic and non-academic staff is formed based on the curriculum of the specialty.

The total number of BSMU teaching staff is 1,169 people, of whom 877 (75%) are the main employees. The number of full-time teachers is 707. 170 full-time teachers work on a part-time basis. Every year, highly qualified managers and employees of practical healthcare and pharmacy, whose activities are related to the direction of the implemented OP, are admitted on the terms of external co-operation. Currently, their number is 292 (25%) teachers.

The staff includes 63 heads of departments, 168 professors, 522 associate professors, 120 senior lecturers and 292 assistants. The share of employees under the age of 39 in the total number of teaching staff is 32.8%.

The responsibility of teachers is monitored by analyzing the implementation of job descriptions, an individual plan reflecting the scope and timing of educational, educational, methodological, scientific and other types of work, as well as annual certification of educational, therapeutic and scientific work.

During interviews with teachers and heads of departments, it was noted that the individual plan of the teacher is discussed at the cathedral meeting and approved by the head of the department. Every year, at the end of the academic year, an analysis of the performance of indicators within the framework of an individual plan is carried out at a meeting of the department.

The criteria for the certification of teaching staff on educational and methodological work and organizational and methodological work are presented in the appendix to paragraph 2.6. Regulations on the certification of the teaching staff of the departments of BSMU. The commission for the certification of teaching staff includes: the vice-rector for academic affairs, the head of the educational and methodological department, the heads of the methodological, educational and organizational departments, the department of education quality and monitoring, the department of regulatory support for educational activities, licensing and accreditation, leading specialists of the methodological department.

The criteria for certification of teaching staff in medical work and scientific work are reflected in the relevant orders of BSMU (Order No. 103-a dated 13.02.2023 "On reports on the medical work of clinical departments for 2022"; Order No. 28 dated 19.03.2018 "On approval of criteria for evaluating the effectiveness of scientific and innovative activities of scientific and pedagogical workers").

The balance between teaching, research and other functions is determined by Order No. 1601 of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation dated December 22, 2014 "On the working hours (norms of hours of pedagogical work for the salary rate) of teaching staff and on the procedure for determining the educational load of teaching staff stipulated in the employment contract" and the Regulation on planning the amount of educational work Teaching staff by type of contact work.

Teaching staff at all levels – from teacher/assistant to professor, Doctor of Sciences, head of the department have the same teaching load – 900 hours per year.

In addition to the teaching load, teachers' working hours include all other types of work provided for by Federal Law No. 273-FZ dated 29.12.2012 (as amended on 17.02.2021) "On Education in the Russian Federation", provided for by official duties and (or) an individual plan.

According to the results of the survey of students conducted during the visit of the EEC,

positive responses ("very good" and "good") 93% of respondents reported that teachers use effective teaching methods; own the taught material – 99%; present the material in an understandable form – 99%; present the material in an interesting way – 91%; meets the requirements in terms of personal development and professional formation of future specialists – 98%; stimulate student activity – 97%; stimulate creative thinking of students – 92%; demonstrate a positive attitude towards students – 96%; speak a professional language – 99%.

During interviews with teachers, it was noted that they take advanced training courses in a timely manner in accordance with the requirements of regulatory documents.

In order to develop the communication skills of teaching staff with foreign students, English language training is conducted annually by the staff of the Department of Foreign Languages with a Latin language course on the course "English for teaching staff". During the period 2018-2023, 707 people completed advanced training in English among the teaching staff.

According to the results of the survey during the visit of the EEC, 100% of the teachers participating in it rated the opportunity for professional development "very good" and "good".

The university annually approves the number of groups with the number of students in each specialty by order of the rector. The university's self-assessment report noted that the teacher-student ratio is 8-10 students per 1 teaching staff when calculating the teaching staff. When visiting the departments, it was noted that the number of students in the academic group is 10-15 people.

According to the results of interviews and questionnaires of teaching staff, some respondents' wishes regarding the imbalance of the academic load by semester (31% of respondents) and overcrowding of study groups (24% of respondents) were revealed.

At the university, the effectiveness of the teaching staff is constantly evaluated, promising employees are stimulated and financially encouraged, a personnel reserve is formed, which allows for career advancement. The University promotes promising employees who are capable of filling higher managerial positions based on their business, professional and personal qualities.

100% of the teaching staff participating in the survey are satisfied with the opportunities provided by the university for the career growth of teachers.

### ***The analytical part***

The University has defined and brought to the attention of all employees the policy of selection and admission of academic staff. The personnel policy ensures equality and accessibility to vacancies available at the university and guarantees equal opportunities and an objective assessment of applicants' professional qualities.

The formed academic staff makes it possible to fully implement the OP, which is ensured by the high degree of teaching staff (more than 60%) and the experience of scientific, pedagogical and clinical work for 15 years and more (50% of teaching staff).

The University regularly monitors the responsibility of teachers in accordance with local regulations.

The analysis of the information received from the heads of departments and teachers showed that the university does not differentiate the volume of academic and other types of teaching staff from their positions, which makes it difficult for professors and associate professors to create new lectures, master new educational technologies, monitor the work of young teaching staff, develop new elective disciplines and introduce teaching methods into the educational process and training based on the best international practices (TBL, CBL, RBL, etc.) based on the principles of andragogy.

The analysis of information obtained during interviews and questionnaires also showed that the university provides training and advanced training for teachers.

The documents indicate that the teacher-student ratio is taken into account when planning the staff of teaching staff. The University strives to maintain this ratio close to 1 to 10.

The BSMU has implemented a policy of activity and development of teaching staff, which guarantees recognition of the activities of employees, which is carried out, among other things, in the form of promotion.

***Strengths/best practices***

According to this standard, no strengths have been identified.

***Recommendations of the EEC:***

1. The university management is recommended to consider the possibility of a differential approach in planning the scope of the main types of work of the teaching staff (educational, methodological, scientific, educational, therapeutic), depending on the position held. The deadline is until 01.12.2024.

***The conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:***

- ***strong positions – 0***
- ***satisfactory – 7***
- ***suggest improvements – 1***
- ***unsatisfactory – 0***

**6.6. Standard «Educational resources»*****The evidentiary part***

For the implementation of the OP "General Medicine", "Pediatrics", "Dentistry", "Preventive medicine" and "Pharmacy", BSMU has sufficient material and technical base corresponding to the current rules and regulations, ensuring all types of disciplinary and interdisciplinary training, practical and research activities of students provided for in the curriculum.

To implement the educational process, 65 real estate objects with a total area of 166,603.6 m<sup>2</sup> are on the balance sheet of BSMU, including academic buildings, educational and lecture halls equipped with modern technical equipment, premises of clinical departments and laboratories located in medical clinics, own clinics, a library, 10 dormitories for students, gyms and playgrounds for sports with the appropriate inventory, places of catering (dining room, buffets). The analysis of the material and technical equipment of the classroom fund for the development of the educational program showed full compliance with the requirements of the Federal State Educational Standard.

All facilities comply with fire safety and sanitary standards.

The results of the student survey indicate that 92% of respondents are satisfied with the classrooms, 97% with the existing scientific laboratories, and 90% with dormitories. 82% – sports facilities, 96% – safety and modern equipment.

During interviews with managers and teachers, the timeliness of updating equipment and equipment based on purchase requests was noted.

BSMU has a multi-profile accreditation and simulation center, on the basis of which the Federal Accreditation Center of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation was established.

Accredited educational institutions, in accordance with the Federal State Educational Standard, include a number of educational and industrial practices. The largest medical and pharmaceutical organizations of Ufa and the Republic of Bashkortostan (362 contracts concluded), as well as other regions of the Russian Federation (188 contracts) are used as bases for the practice of BSMU students.

When visiting the practice bases, the availability of the necessary equipment, premises and the number of mentors for students to undergo practical training and consolidate their basic practical skills was confirmed.

To implement a unified policy in the field of informatization of the university's structural divisions, there is an information technology management department.

Library and information support for educational activities is provided by the BSMU library. The library's reference and bibliographic apparatus is represented by an electronic catalog and a traditional systematic catalog. The electronic catalog posted on the library's website has a total number of entries as of 31.12.2022 – 242,714.



A single corporate geographically distributed secure network has been deployed at BSMU, uniting the university campus and all structural divisions. All corporate systems have a single point of entry and authorization, there is a single security policy, and a role model of interaction between employees and trainees is implemented.

The BSMU information system is integrated into the work of the Federal EGISZ System of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation, as well as into the work of the Regional Ministry of Health of the Republic of Bashkortostan. A digital medicine hall has been created in which any BSMU student can see and analyze the health indicators of the Region in real time during classes. That is, the training of students, residents and doctors is based on real cases that teachers create on real data.

As part of the implementation of the federal academic leadership project "Priority 2030", a Digital department has been created at the university, where more than 1,000 students study annually. The Digital Department of BSMU implements 2 IT programs – "Data Mining in medicine based on the R programming language" and an advanced program "Mathematical and computer modeling in Biomedicine". The industrial partners of the department are the leaders of the Russian IT market – Rostelecom, Tesis, Fort Dialog, VR concept, Lexeme and others.

BSMU provides each student with individual unlimited access to electronic library systems (electronic libraries) from any point where there is access to the information and telecommunications network "Internet", both on the territory of the University and outside it, throughout the entire period of study. The University also provides students from persons with disabilities with electronic educational resources in forms adapted to their health limitations. Each student is provided with individual unlimited access to the Student Consultant EBS and the BSMU EIOS throughout the entire period of study.

The created Unified Educational Environment of the university has shown high efficiency during the COVID-19 pandemic. According to the results of a survey of students conducted during the visit of EEC, 99% of respondents noted the availability and quality of Internet resources provided by the university.

When interviewing employers, it was noted that the OPS were developed taking into account regional needs in the field of healthcare and pharmacy.

The research base of BSMU is used for scientific research: the central research laboratory, the laboratory of cell cultures, the Research Institute of Cardiology, the Research Institute of Oncology, the Research Institute of Restorative Medicine and Balneology, an innovative ophthalmological cluster with the international Center for Regenerative Medicine, the material and technical base of departments and medical organizations that are clinical bases of BSMU.

The University implements a number of research projects in the field of medicine and pharmacy, including within the framework of the "Priority 2030". At the same time, the submitted documents and interviews with heads of departments and teachers showed that the university practically does not conduct research in the field of medical and pharmaceutical education.

Various methods of encouragement are used to involve students in conducting scientific research in medicine: the appointment of an increased state academic scholarship, the transition to a budget form of education, the appointment of scholarships from the President of the Russian Federation, the Head of the Republic of Bashkortostan, additional points for admission to residency.

The results of scientific research of employees and students of the university are included in the OP, which is confirmed by the submitted acts of implementation in the educational process.

During the implementation of accredited educational programs, the university monitors the state and effectiveness of the processes of pedagogical activity, including a rating assessment of the activities of teachers, sociological studies of satisfaction of teachers, students and employers with the quality of the educational process at the university; external and internal audits.

BSMU cooperates with professors of other medical universities, with foreign colleagues in teaching clinical disciplines, issues of the latest scientific research in the field of medical education, theoretical and practical research in the field of medicine. Professional development of teaching staff is carried out with the participation of visiting professors from leading universities



in Russia and foreign countries as part of academic mobility. The Commission is presented with reviews from other universities on the assessment of individual elements of the OP.

As part of the interview with the heads of departments and teaching staff, it was noted that the university does not motivate employees to conduct research in medical education, there are no acts on the introduction of such research into the educational process.

Academic mobility programs for both students and teaching staff (with the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Republic of Uzbekistan, the Kyrgyz Republic, the People's Republic of China), including semester student exchanges, short-term exchanges (training in cycles/modules, summer/winter schools, internships), participation in international scientific events, are regularly implemented as part of the implementation of the OP, lectures, seminars, webinars, workshops, round tables, etc. BSMU pays active attention to holding various international events for both students and teaching staff of foreign educational organizations. This information is confirmed by information posted on the official website and during interviews with teaching staff and students, as well as graduates.

According to the results of the teaching staff survey, 100% of respondents are satisfied with the organization of academic activity at the university.

### ***The analytical part***

As part of the visit to the university's clinical bases, structures, and departments, the availability of the necessary material and technical base necessary for the implementation of the OP was confirmed. Satisfaction with the material and technical base and its availability was also established when interviewing teaching staff and students.

The material and technical base is regularly updated and expanded on the basis of a feedback system between departments and the university management on the completeness of the material and technical support of academic disciplines.

The University creates conditions for the development of clinical and practical skills by providing the educational process with simulation equipment and concluding contracts with practical healthcare and pharmacy as practice bases.

Visual inspection, the results of interviews and questionnaires indicate sufficient access to electronic information resources, health information systems in compliance with ethical standards and safety of teaching staff and students. The information educational environment of the university used has shown high efficiency.

The submitted documents and the information obtained during the interview allow us to conclude that there is a relationship between scientific achievements in the field of medicine, pharmacy, including university staff and students, and implemented OP.

EEC experts note that the BSMU conducts an examination of the OP at various levels. At the same time, it was concluded that the university does not carry out research in the field of medical and pharmaceutical education, including the study of theoretical, practical and social issues, since no convincing data on the research was obtained during interviews with teaching staff.

In order to fulfill the goals of international policy, academic mobility programs for teaching staff and students are being implemented, and international scientific events are being held.

### ***Strengths/best practices***

According to this standard, no strengths have been identified.

### ***Recommendations***

1. The university management is recommended to identify the main directions of scientific research in medical and pharmaceutical education and to promote the aspirations and interests of employees in their conduct, including the study of theoretical, practical and social issues. The deadline is until 01.09.2025.

### ***The conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:***

- *strong positions* – 0
- *satisfactory* – 13
- *suggest improvements* – 1
- *unsatisfactory* – 0

### 6.7. Standard «Evaluation of the educational program»

#### ***The evidentiary part***

At BSMU, the monitoring of implemented educational programs in the specialties "General Medicine", "Pediatrics", "Dentistry", "Preventive Medicine" and "Pharmacy" and the results of their development is carried out on the basis of the Regulations on the implementation of the procedure for organizing and implementing educational activities in educational programs - bachelor's degree, specialist degree, master's degree programs in BSMU, Regulations on the ongoing monitoring of academic performance and intermediate certification of students of educational programs of higher education, Regulations on the point-rating system for assessing the quality and management of educational activities of students. UMU is responsible for regular monitoring of the OP.

The University, in its monitoring program and in the evaluation of educational programs, involves the main stakeholders: teaching staff, students and employers.

The monitoring function is the activity of collecting, processing, analyzing and storing information about the functioning of the university, ensuring continuous monitoring of its condition, timely correction and forecasting of development is carried out at 3 levels:

- Level I - intra-departmental monitoring (through the passport of the department);
- Level II - intra-faculty monitoring;
- Level III - intra-university monitoring.

The monitoring of the OP for accredited specialties is carried out in order to identify compliance with the requirements: the structure of the program; the ratio of the basic and variable parts; the availability of optional disciplines; types and types of practices; educational and methodological support; accessibility of the electronic information and educational environment (EIOS); staffing; logistical support; book provision. These components are evaluated through an internal independent evaluation with systematic monitoring, as well as accreditation of the educational program.

The provision of access to information on the results of the assessment of OP by specialties to all interested parties is provided by the content of the minutes of the cathedral meetings, Academic Councils of the university and faculties, the Cyclic Methodological Commission of faculties, the Coordinating Scientific and Methodological Council.

An organizational structure has been formed at BSMU to ensure the functioning of the internal education quality system – educational and methodological management with divisions of the Department of Education quality and monitoring, methodological department, educational and organizational department, practice department. Monitoring the quality of the educational process at the university is carried out simultaneously with the assessment of the quality of graduate training, which allows for timely correction of the educational process and, through this, strengthen the final result of educational activities. The quality system of education at the university provides for constant monitoring of goals and areas of influence and consists of the following components: quality audit of career guidance, pre-university training, selection of applicants; monitoring of the quality of resources; educational monitoring (internal quality audit); monitoring of the quality of training specialists.

The University collects and analyzes feedback from other stakeholders on the OP. An external assessment of the OP is regularly carried out, which is formalized by reviews from employers and an independent assessment of another specialized university. The Graduate Career and Employment Center annually monitors employers' satisfaction with the quality of BSMU

graduates' training through an electronic questionnaire on the university's website.

Dean's offices, UMU provide students with a real opportunity to participate in the formation of their study program, explain their rights and obligations to perform the OP. After studying each discipline, students have the opportunity to formulate and bring to the attention of the head of the department, deans, vice-rector and rector proposals on the structure, scope and content of the discipline being studied, as well as on methods and means of control by means of a questionnaire.

The main tasks in the preparation of accredited educational programs are the formation and development of professional, practice-oriented graduates. When mastering educational programs, universal, general professional and professional competencies are formed. Assessment of the formation of competencies is carried out at the final certification.

The assessment of current academic performance is carried out in accordance with the Regulations on the ongoing monitoring of academic performance and intermediate certification of students and with the Regulations on the point-rating system for assessing the quality and management of educational activities of students.

Academic performance is assessed based on the results of the session and in individual disciplines throughout the year. The assessment of students is carried out within the framework of ongoing control, final certification.

In addition to evaluating students' academic achievements (academic performance), participation in research work, SNO, conferences, and Olympiads is taken into account. These indicators are taken into account when setting the final grade for the discipline as a stimulating incentive. In the Regulations on Scholarship provision and other measures of financial support for students, in the Regulations on the Procedure for assigning and paying additional scholarships to categories of students who are winners, prize-winners of Olympiads and scored 100 points based on the results of the Unified State Exam and in the Regulations on Increased State Academic Scholarships, the Regulations on Social Security Measures, in the long-term programs of international academic mobility, the Regulations on Scholarship provision and other measures of material support for students reflect measures of financial support for students. This allows deans to support and motivate gifted students.

The main concept of educational activities implemented by BSMU is the creation of an intellectual environment through the planning and training of graduates capable of providing highly qualified multi-level medical care, pharmaceutical activities and the development of the healthcare system.

The quality policy is aimed at ensuring the Mission of the University: the quality of education determines the level of medical care and pharmaceutical activities; increasing the competitiveness of the university in the global education market.

The main forms of cooperation between the University and employers are: cooperation agreements, internship and internship agreements, participation in events (job fairs, presentations, seminars, round tables, master classes, etc.), joint medical activities, participation in the implementation of educational programs, in the certification of graduates during the GIA and in the scientific life of the university.

When implementing the OP in the declared specialties, an independent assessment is applied; experts from third-party organizations working in this field are included in the state examination commissions, their opinion is taken into account when planning measures to improve the OP. In addition, the opinions of other stakeholders obtained from official sources, analytical reports, roadmaps, etc. are taken into account.

### ***The analytical part***

EEC experts note that in the specialties "General Medicine", "Pediatrics", "Dentistry", "Preventive medicine" and "Pharmacy", during the work of the expert commission and the analysis of the submitted documentation, compliance with the requirements of the standard was mainly revealed. After analyzing the submitted documents and talking with the participants of the focus groups, the members of the EEC came to the conclusion that BSMU has a multi-level system for

evaluating the educational program in the declared specialties, which includes an internal assessment of the quality of education and consists of:

- current control over the organization and implementation of the educational process by the Dean's office (in the form of a monthly report of departments on the current academic performance and attendance of students);
- assessment of the quality of the educational process by the educational and organizational department and the Department of education Quality and monitoring in the form of an internal audit of educational units and processes;
- participation in the procedures of intermediate and final certification of independent experts;
- assessment of the quality of teaching teaching staff from students by means of a questionnaire;
- internal cathedral assessment of the quality of teaching in the form of mutual visits by staff to classes, etc.

The administration of BSMU periodically conducts an assessment of the educational program, including the content of disciplines, the organization of the educational process, material and technical resources, the learning environment, cultural and national characteristics.

At the same time, EEC experts note that BSMU needs to update the monitoring of processes and results, including the collection and analysis of data on key aspects of the educational program in the specialties "Preventive Medicine", "General Medicine", "Pediatrics", "Dentistry" and "Pharmacy".

The academic achievements of BSMU students are systematically analyzed in relation to the mission and final learning outcomes of educational programs, including the determination of indicators such as the average academic performance in disciplines and courses of study; absolute academic performance and qualitative performance indicator; the absolute number and proportion of students expelled. The conditions of study in the completed disciplines are analyzed. The administration of BSMU conducts periodic studies in the field of assessing the degree of satisfaction of students and teaching staff with educational programs and resource availability.

At the same time, the members of the EEC state that the processes of receiving feedback from students regarding the implemented OP in the specialties "Preventive Medicine", "General Medicine", "Pediatrics", "Dentistry" and "Pharmacy" are insufficient to develop corrective or preventive measures to improve OP.

The members of the EEC note that feedback on issues of evaluation and improvement of the OP is mainly presented in the form of a questionnaire; while the range of forms and methods should be expanded, taking into account the specifics of the OP (oral and written comments from stakeholders of the OP; reflective reviews; focus group interviews, chronological reports, etc.).

***Strengths/best practices not identified.***

According to this standard, no strengths have been identified.

***Recommendations of the EEC:***

1. The heads of the educational institution are recommended to involve professional associations (ROO, NGO) to evaluate the educational program in order to improve the quality of education. The deadline is until 01.09.2024.

***The conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:***

- ***Strong-0***
- ***Satisfactory – 8***
- ***Suggest improvements – 1***
- ***Unsatisfactory – 0***



## 6.8 Standard «Management and administration»

### ***The evidentiary part***

The University has autonomy and is independent in the implementation of educational, medical, scientific, administrative, financial, economic and international activities and the adoption of local regulations in accordance with the legislation of the Russian Federation, the Charter of the University (approved by Order of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation dated 23.06.2016 No. 409 (ed. dated 19.06.2018) "On approval of the Charter of the Federal State Budgetary educational institution of Higher Education Bashkir State Medical University of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation) (hereinafter referred to as the Charter), and is responsible for its activities to each student, society and the state.

The main governing body in the implementation of the OP "Preventive Medicine", "General Medicine", "Pediatrics", "Dentistry" and "Pharmacy" is the Academic Council of the University, headed by the rector of the University. The structure and functions of the Academic Council are presented in the Regulation on the Academic Council of BSMU dated 30.11.2016 No. 185 (amendments to the Order dated 22.12.2020 No. 174).

The Academic Council considers and makes decisions on the main areas of educational, scientific and medical activities of BSMU, as well as approves curricula and educational programs on the recommendation of the deans of faculties, submits candidates for academic titles, awards honorary titles, approves local regulations governing the main types of activities.

The structure of BSMU includes: 5 faculties, 79 departments, medical college, BSMU clinic, clinical dental clinic, All-Russian Center for Eye and Plastic Surgery, Ufa Scientific Research Institute of Eye Diseases, Federal Accreditation Center for the Development of Practical Skills, Institute of Additional Professional Education (12 departments and 29 courses), Research Institute rehabilitation Medicine and Balneology of BSMU, Research Institute of Oncology, Research Institute of New Medical Technologies, Institute of Urology and Clinical Oncology, Biobank, Research Institute of Cardiology, laboratory of cell cultures, central research laboratory, pharmacy of health care facility No. 2, 2 small innovative enterprises, youth scientific society, Museum of the history of medicine, sanatorium, sports and wellness a camp, a center for pre-university training and career guidance.

According to the organizational structure, vertical and horizontal interaction of structural divisions is carried out at BSMU. The general management and management of the activities is carried out by the rector. Vice-rectors and departments that ensure the processes of BSMU are directly subordinate to the rector.

At faculties, institutes, as well as in other educational (scientific-educational) and research units, collegial governing bodies are elected that carry out the general management of these structural units - academic councils of faculties/ institutes, medical councils of clinical departments of the University.

The interaction of structural and collegial departments with students and employees can be carried out in the electronic information educational environment of the university through corporate e-mail and electronic personal accounts, as well as using the 1C: Enterprise platform.

The University ensures the transparency of the management system through the development and communication to all stakeholders of the organizational structure and regulations defining the communication links and functions of departments. The list of local regulations is located in the electronic register of documents located on the official website.

External independent assessment of the quality of education is carried out on an ongoing basis in accordance with Federal Law No. 273-FZ dated December 29, 2012 "On Education in the Russian Federation", "Methodological recommendations for the organization and conduct in educational institutions of higher education of an internal independent assessment of the quality of education in educational programs of higher education - bachelor's degree programs, specialist degree programs and master's degree programs" (letter of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation dated February 15, 2018 No. 05-435), by order of the BSMU.

Regular self-assessment is carried out as part of an annual self-examination, as well as through an internal audit, which regulates internal activities and is designed to analyze and evaluate the functioning of the organization. The main objectives of internal audits at BSMU are: to assess the compliance of the SMK or its individual processes with the requirements of internal regulatory documents, international and national ISO 9001-2015 standards; to provide the organization's management with reliable data on the quality of educational, research and other processes; to analyze the effectiveness of corrective and preventive actions to eliminate identified inconsistencies.

BSMU carries out financial and economic activities in accordance with the charter approved by the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation, the Budget Code, federal laws, orders of the Government of the Russian Federation, other normative acts in force on the territory of the Russian Federation regulating educational activities and activities of budgetary institutions and on the basis of the Plan of Financial and Economic Activities of federal state institutions subordinate to the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation.

BSMU has the opportunity, in accordance with regulatory documents, to independently direct financial resources to achieve the final results of training. The amount of financing for the implementation of the educational program is determined in accordance with the standards established by the Government of the Russian Federation, taking into account the specifics of educational programs.

BSMU makes incentive payments to teachers: for high achievements in scientific and methodological activities; for the presence of state, departmental and university awards and distinctions; based on the results of rating quality control of their activities.

BSMU allocates funds to support students (financial assistance). The volume of financial resources spent on the remuneration of teachers is analyzed. Based on the results of the teachers' work, indicators are reviewed to determine an effective bonus system. It is planned to expand the indicators for evaluating the work of teachers in achieving the intended results in education if financial resources are available.

### ***The analytical part***

The management of the activities and interaction of the structural and collegial departments of BSMU is carried out in accordance with the University's charter and organizational structure.

According to the Charter, BSMU has the status of a federal state budgetary institution and receives funding to fulfill a state order. To conduct research and professional activities, graduates of the bachelor's degree program can continue their studies in training programs in residency and postgraduate studies.

The constructive interaction of the University with the healthcare sector is the basis for the successful functioning of the healthcare system in the region. Currently, the implementation of the provisions of the Decree of the President of the Russian Federation dated 07.05.2018 No. 204 "On National Goals and Strategic objectives for the development of the Russian Federation for the period up to 2024", which provides for the development and implementation of 12 National projects, which include the national projects "Healthcare" and "Demography".

The University actively participates in regional government programs: "Development of children's healthcare, including the creation of a modern infrastructure for providing medical care to children (Republic of Bashkortostan)" (approved by By the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Bashkortostan dated June 17, 2019 No. 356), "Development of healthcare in the Republic of Bashkortostan" (approved by Decree of the Government of the Republic of Bashkortostan No. 356 dated June 17, 2020) and the regional subprogram "Staffing of the healthcare system of the Republic of Bashkortostan".

In order to provide regulatory support for the process of interaction between the University and the healthcare sector at the regional level, a Four-party agreement on cooperation in the field of healthcare development of the Republic of Bashkortostan was signed in 2018 between BSMU, the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Bashkortostan, Bashkir TFOMS, Bashkir TO Roszdravnadzor.

In order to further improve the joint work of the University and regional healthcare, the Board of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Bashkortostan decided on August 03, 2018 to organize work on the formation of a scientific and educational medical cluster of the Republic of Bashkortostan. At the University, this activity is regulated by the order of the BSMU dated 17.10.2018 No. 175 "On the activities of the Federal State Budgetary Educational Institution of the BSMU of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation within the framework of the scientific and educational medical cluster of the Republic of Bashkortostan". 22 employees of BSMU from among the teaching staff are responsible for the work of the scientific and educational medical cluster.

The interaction between the University and the practice bases is carried out in accordance with the Agreements on the organization of practical training of students concluded between the educational organization and the medical organization, which identify those responsible both on the part of the University and the side of the medical organization.

In order to continuously improve the level of competencies of students throughout their lives as a key factor in the formation of professional responsibility, the Institute of Additional professional education operates at BSMU.

The improvement of the system of practical training of medical and pharmaceutical specialists is achieved by the high professionalism of the teaching staff, the presence of a well-developed material and technical base, modern educational technologies, a high level of informatization, and the practical orientation of the educational process.

BSMU independently carries out financial and economic activities, its financial autonomy correlates with the principles of responsibility to society for the quality of all professional training, research and service provision activities, with the effective management of funds and state property. The allocation of resources is implemented depending on the characteristics and needs of the OP, the specifics of the academic discipline, the conditions for conducting practical and laboratory classes, the need to attract standardized patients, etc. The current policy does not contradict the legislative acts of the Russian Federation, which ensures the institutional autonomy of BSMU.

In the process of interviewing the AUP of BSMU and the heads of departments, it was noted that the responsibility of the academic leadership in relation to the development and management of the educational program was determined.

During the conversation with the focus groups, an answer was received from the interviewers that the BSMU periodically evaluates the academic leadership regarding the achievement of its mission and the final learning outcomes.

According to the survey conducted during the EEC visit, 75% of respondents were completely satisfied with the attitude of the BSMU leadership towards teachers; 82% with direct management; 92% with colleagues at the department; 69% with the degree of participation in managerial decision-making; 84% with relationships with students.

80% of teaching staff were fully satisfied with the recognition of successes and achievements by the administration; 75% supported suggestions and comments; 73% supported the activities of the university administration; 70% of respondents were satisfied with the terms of remuneration.

71% of staff are fully satisfied with the working conditions, list and quality of services provided at the university; 73% are satisfied with labor protection and safety; 75% of respondents are satisfied with change management in the university's activities. 50% of teaching staff are fully satisfied with the provision of a social package (rest, sanatorium treatment, etc.); 61% are satisfied with the organization and quality of food at the university; 68% of respondents are satisfied with the organization and quality of medical care.

### ***Strengths/best practices***

Constructive interaction with the healthcare system and sectors of society and government related to health, including foreign organizations.

### ***Recommendations of the EEC***



*There are no recommendations for this standard*

*The conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:*

- *Strong – 1*
- *satisfactory – 12*
- *suggest improvements – 0*
- *unsatisfactory – 0*

#### 6.9 Standard «Constant updating»

##### *The evidentiary part*

BSMU is a dynamically developing and socially responsible educational organization, which has developed and implemented procedures for continuous monitoring and improvement of fundamental functioning processes.

The process of constant updating and improvement is carried out through the introduction of new learning technologies in connection with changing external conditions, as well as the use of modern technologies: interactive lectures, discussions, case-based learning, project-based learning to solve interdisciplinary interaction, case methods, problem-oriented learning.

Monitoring of the implementation of educational programs and achievements is carried out on the basis of the results of academic performance, questionnaires, reports of departments and structural divisions.

Responsibility for the quality of training of specialists is assigned to vice-rectors in the areas of training, universities, institutes, deans, the Council for the quality of education, academic councils of specialties, departments. Students contribute to ensuring the quality of the educational process through participation in the work of the University's Education Quality Council, the Council of students, as well as in the work of the councils of specialties, the academic council of the university.

The process of updating educational programs is based on constant study of trends in medical science, in the field of medical education, participation in conferences, seminars in this field, issues of accreditation, preparation of educational programs, improvement of the quality of education.

Monitoring of the implementation of educational programs in the specialties "Preventive Medicine", "General Medicine", "Pediatrics", "Dentistry" and "Pharmacy" and their compliance with the requirements of professional standards is carried out on the basis of the results obtained: academic performance on current, intermediate certification, GIA, questionnaires of students, graduates, discussion at departments, reports of commissions, advice. Students participate in the evaluation of the program.

Monitoring the implementation of the main educational program includes: 1) the self-examination procedure; 2) the internal audit procedure of the SMK ; 3) surveys of stakeholders in order to identify requirements for learning outcomes; 4) analysis of the results of entrance control (testing, USE); 5) feedback from employers; 6) the results of all types of practice.

Documentation of inconsistencies and shortcomings in the work of departments and the faculty as a whole is carried out during internal and external audits of the CMK. Based on the results of the audits, in order to eliminate the causes of the identified inconsistencies and prevent their recurrence, the departments develop plans for corrective and preventive measures. According to the results of the academic year, all departments, councils, commissions prepare reports on the results of the implementation of plans and processes at the Faculty of Dentistry. These results are analyzed by the Department of Education Quality and Monitoring, the dean's office of the Faculty, the leadership of BSMU to make decisions for future periods, and are also reflected in the strategic development plans of the faculties and BSMU as a whole.

For the university, the experience of teaching foreign students, familiarity with the organization of the educational process in different countries is important, as well as the assessment of educational activities by expert groups with the participation of representatives.

The training of competitive specialists is based on the constant introduction of modern



innovative technologies, interdisciplinary approaches and principles of evidence-based medicine and pharmacy in teaching fundamental and clinical disciplines.

For the successful implementation of the educational program, it is necessary to provide sufficient departments, structural units of BSMU involved in educational activities with material, technical, information resources (availability of classrooms, office equipment, equipment of classrooms, etc.), human resources.

The process of updating educational resources is carried out in accordance with changing needs, the development of research areas in medicine, innovative technologies for surgical intervention, treatment of many diseases, as well as socio-economic requirements of the labor market in the field of medical services, which involves updating the program, the introduction of new compulsory and elective disciplines, electives, based on promising and their own research, global trends in the study of this area. The dynamic adjustment of educational resources is based on new trends in basic, clinical, behavioral, and social sciences, taking into account the level of morbidity, mortality, health status in society, government assignments, and the profile of specialists, and the correction of the inclusion of new knowledge contributes to improving socio-economic indicators of living standards in the country and in the world.

The educational process is organized using modern technologies. Many classrooms are equipped with interactive whiteboards and equipment necessary for video conferencing. Students have access to extensive online library resources and international databases.

One of the important tasks of BSMU in the near future is to establish compliance with international standards by integrating higher medical education, research work and qualified clinical activities into the educational process; harmonizing the traditions of the national medical school with international standards in the field of medical education.

### ***The analytical part***

After analyzing the submitted documents and meeting with the participants of the focus groups, the members of the EEC came to the conclusion that BSMU, as a dynamically developing and socially responsible organization of higher medical education, initiates procedures for regular review and revision of the content of the OP "General Medicine", "Pediatrics", "Dentistry", "Preventive Medicine" and "Pharmacy", learning outcomes/competencies, assessment and learning environment. At the same time, it is necessary to carefully review the functions of structural and functional units and process maps, document and eliminate deficiencies in the accredited OP "Dentistry", taking into account the fact that BSMU constantly allocates resources for continuous improvement.

An important area of activity for the adjustment of programs is interaction with employers on the formation of professional competencies.

The educational programs of BSMU are undergoing a process of updating in order to timely reflect the development of clinical, pharmaceutical, biomedical, social sciences, as well as the needs of the healthcare system and society, taking into account the recommendations and requests of employers. The university's documents reflect the results of monitoring and analyzing the satisfaction of employers and graduates. The University responds quickly to recommendations from stakeholders.

Revision of changes in programs and technologies for teaching certain disciplines is carried out in an open manner, with the participation of all parties involved: teaching staff, students, departments, faculty, councils of specialties, university administration.

The university has adopted the practice of regular meetings of the rector with students, where issues of the content of educational programs, the organization of the educational process, university regulations on educational activities, issues of increasing the availability of library resources, the material and technical base of the university, infrastructure are discussed. Students meet with vice-rectors, deans and their deputies, employees of various services.

Interested parties have the opportunity to contact the university administration via e-mail on various issues, which provides effective feedback to consumers. On the basis of appeals, questionnaires, plans of corrective and preventive measures are being developed that contribute to

the elimination of all identified inconsistencies and the prevention of problematic situations, which is especially important in a complex epidemiological situation around the world.

The educational programs of BSMU meet the requirements of the development of medical and pharmaceutical education and provide an opportunity to realize the main mission of the university.

Due to the difficult epidemiological situation, advanced training programs on the prevention, diagnosis and treatment of COVID-19 coronavirus infection have been developed and implemented in senior courses of specialist degree programs for all residency programs and in the system of continuing medical education.

Quality system audits are conducted annually in all areas of activity and in all structural divisions of BSMU, evaluation of the results of program development, intermediate certification, assessment methods, achievements, and development of clinical competencies is given.

The main purpose of this activity is the monitoring of educational activities by students/employers/graduates and teachers aimed at constant updating.

The content of the disciplines is reviewed and compiled taking into account the final goals aimed at the labor market, the latest achievements of science and practice, the use of their own scientific research, and the active involvement of students in the educational process.

When monitoring the internal situation, the mission, goals, structure, content of educational programs, teaching technologies in modern conditions, and the quality of the teaching staff are taken into account. The results of an internal independent assessment of the quality of educational programs and suggestions for improvement are discussed with all participants in the educational process. Self-examination of the university is conducted annually, evaluation of the quality of programs is carried out based on the results of the GIA, reports of state examination commissions, primary and specialized accreditations, reports of departments, faculty, councils, identification of strengths and weaknesses in the implementation of the program.

The modernization of the university's educational activities, the adjustment of the content of programs, the system for evaluating the quality of educational activities, the development of the main educational directions - all this is reflected in the program

***Strengths/best practices:***

***There are no strengths***

***Recommendations of the EEC:***

***There are no recommendations for this standard***

***The conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:***

- ***Strong – 0***
- ***satisfactory – 12***
- ***suggest improvements – 0***
- ***unsatisfactory – 0***

**(VII) OVERVIEW OF STRENGTHS/BEST PRACTICES FOR EACH STANDARD****Standard «Mission and results»**

Not revealed

**Standard «Educational program»**

Not revealed

**Standard «Assessment of students»**

Not revealed

**Standard «Students»**

Not revealed

**Standard «Academic staff/teachers»**

Not revealed

**Standard «Educational resources»**

Not revealed

**Standard «Evaluation of the educational program»**

Not revealed

**Standard «Management and administration»**

Constructive interaction with the healthcare system and sectors of society and government related to health, including foreign organizations.

**Standard «Constant updating»**

Not revealed

**(VIII) REVIEW OF QUALITY IMPROVEMENT RECOMMENDATIONS****Standard «Mission and results»**

There are no recommendations

**Standard «Educational program»**

1. OP heads are recommended to carry out a phased adaptation of the model (integrated modules for systems or organs, spiral design) of the educational program. The deadline is until 01.09.2025.
2. The university management is recommended to organize professional development of teaching staff on the use of modern educational technologies and assessment methods in the educational process. The deadline is until 01.09.2024.
3. It is recommended that the heads of the educational program include teaching and learning methods in the educational process, taking into account the best international practices (TBL, CBL, RBL, etc.) based on the principles of andragogy. The deadline is until 01.09.2024.
4. The heads of the educational program are recommended to develop a system for monitoring the independent work of students with the provision of materials for independent training of students, the ability to document the time spent by students doing independent work, analyzing data on the time of independent work of students in the electronic library of the University. The deadline is until 01.09.2024, then permanently.

5. It is recommended that the heads of the OP introduce horizontal integration of related sciences (integrated module, integrated program). The deadline is until 01.09.2025.
6. It is recommended that the university management develop and implement a system of academic counseling for students (an advisory service) on the choice of elective subjects and the formation of an individual educational trajectory. The deadline is until 01.12.2024.
7. The heads of the OP are recommended to create a Catalog of elective disciplines Due by 01.12.2024.
8. The heads of the OP are recommended to include issues of non-traditional and alternative medical practice in the Catalog of elective disciplines. The deadline is until 01.12.2024.
9. It is recommended that the management of OP Pharmacy ensure proper documentation of students' familiarization with safety techniques when mastering practical skills at practice bases. The deadline is 01.01.2024.

**Standard «Assessment of students»**

1. OP heads are encouraged to regularly use and document a wide range of assessment methods and formats, depending on their "utility assessment", which includes a combination of validity, reliability, impact on learning, acceptability and effectiveness of assessment methods and format. The deadline is 01.09.2025.
2. The university management is recommended to ensure: documenting the process of evaluating students' academic achievements through the introduction of an electronic journal, accessibility and openness of student's academic achievements to all participants in the educational process. The deadline is until 01.12.2024.

**Standard «Students»**

1. The management of the university is recommended to organize work on socio-psychological support for students with ensuring confidentiality of counseling on personal needs. The deadline is until 01.12.2024.
2. The university management is recommended to systematically collect information, analyze the results of feedback from students on the formulation of the mission, content and implementation of the educational program and use the results to improve their quality. The deadline is until 01.09.2024, then at least once a year.

**Standard «Academic staff/teachers»**

1. The management of the university is recommended to consider the possibility of a differential approach in planning the scope of the main types of work of the teaching staff (educational, methodological, scientific, educational, therapeutic), depending on the position held. The deadline is until 01.12.2024.

**Standard «Educational resources»**

1. The university management is recommended to identify the main directions of scientific research in medical and pharmaceutical education and to promote the aspirations and interests of employees in their conduct, including the study of theoretical, practical and social issues. The deadline is until 01.09.2025.

**Standard «Evaluation of the educational program»**

1. The heads of the educational institution are recommended to involve professional associations (ROO, NGO) to evaluate the educational program in order to improve the quality of education. The deadline is until 01.09.2024.

**Standard «Management and administration»**

There are no recommendations

**Standard «Constant updating»**

There are no recommendations



**(IX) OVERVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE ORGANIZATION OF EDUCATION**

There are no recommendations.

**(X) RECOMMENDATION TO THE ACCREDITATION COUNCIL**

The external expert Commission made a unanimous decision to recommend to the IAAR Accreditation Council to accredit the educational programs of the Bashkir State Medical University of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation:

- 31.05.01 General Medicine (specialist degree) — for a period of 5 (five) years
- 31.05.03 Dentistry (specialist degree) — for a period of 5 (five) years
- 31.05.02 Pediatrics (specialist degree) — for a period of 5 (five) years
- 32.05.01 Preventive medicine (specialist degree) — for a period of 5 (five) years
- 33.05.01 Pharmacy (specialist degree) — for a period of 5 (five) years



**Appendix 1. Evaluation table «PROGRAM PROFILE PARAMETERS»****Parameters of the international program accreditation of educational programs**

- 31.05.01 General Medicine (specialist degree)
- 31.05.03 Dentistry (specialist degree)
- 31.05.02 Pediatrics (specialist degree)
- 32.05.01 Preventive Medicine (specialist degree)
- 33.05.01 Pharmacy (specialist degree)

No.	№	No. of criterion	EVALUATION CRITERIA	The position			
				Strong	Satisfactory	Suggests improvement	Unsatisfactory
Standard 1 "MISSION AND RESULTS"							
1.1 Definition of the mission							
The organization of education must:							
1	1	1.1.1.	Define the mission of the OP and bring it to the attention of stakeholders and the health sector.		+		
2	2	1.1.2.	The mission of the OP reflects the goals and educational strategy that allow to prepare a competent specialist at the level of higher education in the field of healthcare with an appropriate basis for further career in any field of healthcare, including all types of practice, administrative medicine and scientific research in healthcare; able to perform the role and functions of a specialist in accordance with the established requirements of the healthcare sector; prepared for postgraduate education and committed lifelong learning		+		
3	3	1.1.3.	ensure that the mission includes research achievements in the fields of biomedical, clinical, pharmaceutical, behavioral and social sciences, aspects of global health and reflects major international health issues.		+		
1.2. Institutional autonomy and academic freedom							
The organization of education must:							
4	4	1.2.1.	have institutional autonomy in order to develop and implement a quality assurance policy, for which the administration and teachers are responsible, especially with regard to the development of the educational program and the allocation of resources necessary for the implementation of the educational program		+		
5	5	1.2.2.	provide academic freedom for employees and students to implement an educational program and use the results of new research to improve the study of specific disciplines/issues without expanding the OP		+		
1.3. Education outcomes							
The organization of education must:							
6	6	1.3.1.	determine the expected learning outcomes that students should achieve upon completion of their studies provides an opportunity for achievements at a basic level in terms of knowledge, skills and professional relationships; an appropriate basis for a future career in any field of the healthcare industry; future roles in the healthcare sector; subsequent postgraduate training; lifelong learning commitments; the health needs of society, the needs of the health care system and other aspects of social responsibility		+		

7	7	1.3.2.	ensure proper behavior of students towards classmates, teachers, medical staff, patients and their relatives		+		
8	8	1.3.3.	publish the expected learning outcomes of the OP		+		
9	9	1.3.4.	identify and coordinate the relationship of the learning outcomes required upon completion with those required in postgraduate studies		+		
10	10	1.3.5.	provide for the possibility of students' participation in research in the relevant field of health		+		
11	11	1.3.6.	pay attention to the expected learning outcomes related to global health		+		
1.4. Participation in the formulation of the mission and learning outcomes							
The organization of education must:							
12	12	1.4.1.	ensure the participation of key stakeholders in the formulation of the mission and expected learning outcomes		+		
13	13	1.4.2.	ensure that the stated mission and expected learning outcomes are based on the opinions/suggestions of other stakeholders.		+		
<i>Total</i>				<b>0</b>	<b>13</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
Standard 2. EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM							
2.1. Educational program model and teaching methods							
The organization of education must:							
14	1	2.1.1.	define the OP specifications, including a statement of expected learning outcomes, a curriculum based on a modular or spiral structure, and qualifications obtained as a result of mastering the program			+	
15	2	2.1.2.	use <i>teaching and learning methods</i> that stimulate, prepare and support students to take responsibility for the learning process			+	
16	3	2.1.3.	ensure that the OP is implemented in accordance with the principles of equality.		+		
17	4	2.1.4.	develop students' lifelong learning abilities		+		
2.2. The scientific method							
The organization of education must:							
18	5	2.2.1.	throughout the training program, to instill in students the principles of scientific methodology, including methods of analytical and critical thinking; research methods in healthcare and evidence-based medicine		+		
19	6	2.2.2.	include the results of modern scientific research in the OP		+		
2.3 Basic Biomedical sciences							
The organization of education must:							
20	7	2.3.1.	identify and include in the OP the achievements of basic biomedical sciences in order to form students' understanding of scientific knowledge, concepts and methods that are the basis for the acquisition and practical application of clinical scientific knowledge		+		
21	8	2.3.2.	change the educational program, taking into account the achievements of biomedical sciences, reflecting scientific, technological, medical and pharmaceutical developments, current and expected needs of society and the health system		+		
2.4. Behavioral and Social Sciences, Medical/Pharmaceutical ethics and jurisprudence							
The organization of education must:							
22	9	2.4.1.	identify and include achievements in behavioral sciences, social sciences, medical/pharmaceutical ethics and jurisprudence in the survey		+		
23	10	2.4.2.	change the OP, taking into account the achievements of behavioral and social sciences, medical/pharmaceutical ethics and jurisprudence, including modern scientific, technological and medical and pharmaceutical developments, current and expected needs of society and the health system; changing demographic and cultural context		+		
2.5. Clinical/Pharmaceutical Sciences and Skills							
The organization of education must:							

24	11	2.5.1.	identify and include the achievements of clinical/pharmaceutical sciences in the OP to ensure that students, upon completion of their studies, have acquired sufficient knowledge, clinical and professional skills to take appropriate responsibility in subsequent professional activities;		+		
25	12	2.5.2.	ensure that students spend a sufficient part of the program in planned contacts with patients, consumers of services in appropriate clinical/industrial settings and gain experience in health promotion and disease prevention		+		
26	13	2.5.3.	determine the amount of time devoted to the study of the main clinical/specialized disciplines		+		
27	14	2.5.4.	organize training with appropriate attention to the safety of the learning environment and patients, including monitoring of the actions performed by the student in the conditions of clinical/industrial bases		+		
28	15	2.5.5.	change the OP, taking into account the achievements of scientific, technological, medical and pharmaceutical developments, current and expected needs of society and the healthcare system		+		
29	16	2.5.6.	ensure that each student has early contact with real patients, consumers of services, including his gradual participation in the provision of services and including responsibility: - in terms of examination and/or treatment of the patient under supervision in appropriate clinical conditions; - in the procedures of sanitary and epidemiological supervision in terms of inspection and/ or inspection of the object under supervision, which is carried out in the relevant production bases (sanitary and epidemiological examination centers, territorial departments of sanitary and epidemiological control, including transport, disinfection organizations and medical facilities); - in terms of advising the patient on the rational use of medicines, which is carried out in appropriate production conditions		+		
30	17	2.5.7.	structure the various components of training in clinical, hygienic skills for monitoring environmental and industrial factors and other production skills in accordance with a specific stage of the training program.		+		
<b>2.6. The structure of the educational program, its content and duration</b>							
The organization of education must:							
31	18	2.6.1.	describe the content, scope and sequence of disciplines/modules, including compliance with the appropriate ratio between basic biomedical, behavioral, social and clinical/specialized disciplines.		+		
32	19	2.6.2.	provide horizontal integration of related sciences and disciplines;			+	
33	20	2.6.3.	provide vertical integration of clinical/specialized sciences with basic biomedical and behavioral and social sciences		+		
34	21	2.6.4.	provide an opportunity for elective content (electives) and determine the balance between the mandatory and elective part of the OP			+	
35	22	2.6.5.	determine the relationship with complementary medicine, including non-traditional, traditional or alternative practices, occupational medicine, including aspects of the impact of the environment and man-made production loads, the social situation on the health of the population.			+	
<b>2.7. Program management</b>							
The organization of education must:							
36	23	2.7.1.	define procedures for the development, approval and revision of the OP		+		



37	24	2.7.2.	Identify a committee under the management of academic leadership responsible for planning and implementing the OP to ensure that the expected learning outcomes are achieved.		+		
38	25	2.7.3.	ensure the representation of teachers, students, representatives from other stakeholders, including representatives from clinical, industrial bases, graduates of the university, healthcare professionals involved in the learning process in the university committee responsible for the OP.		+		
39	26	2.7.4.	through the committee responsible for the OP, plan and implement innovations in the OP.		+		
2.8. Connection with medical/pharmaceutical practice and the healthcare system							
The organization of education must:							
40	27	2.8.1.	ensure continuity between the OP and the subsequent stages of professional training or practical activity, which the student will begin upon graduation		+		
41	28	2.8.2.	takes into account the specifics of the conditions in which graduates will have to work and accordingly modify the OP		+		
<i>Total</i>				<b>0</b>	<b>23</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>0</b>
Standard 3. ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS							
3.1. Assessment methods							
The organization of education must:							
42	1	3.1.1.	define and approve the principles, methods and practices used to evaluate students, including including the number of exams, criteria for establishing passing scores, grades and the number of allowed retakes;		+		
43	2	3.1.2.	ensure that assessment procedures cover knowledge, skills, attitudes, and professional behavior		+		
44	3	3.1.3.	use a wide range of assessment methods and formats depending on their "utility assessment", including a combination of validity, reliability, impact on learning, acceptability and effectiveness of assessment methods and format			+	
45	4	3.1.4.	ensure that the assessment process and methods are open (accessible) for examination by external experts			+	
46	5	3.1.5.	ensure that assessment methods and results avoid conflicts of interest and use a system to appeal student assessment results		+		
47	6	3.1.6.	ensure the openness of the assessment procedure and its results, to inform students about the criteria and assessment procedures used		+		
48	7	3.1.7.	provide for the possibility of documenting and evaluating the reliability and validity of assessment methods, as well as the involvement of external examiners		+		
3.2. The relationship between assessment and learning							
The organization of education must:							
49	8	3.2.1.	use the principles, methods and practices of assessment that are comparable with the planned RO and methods of teaching and learning, guarantee the achievement of the planned learning outcomes, facilitate the learning of students, ensure an appropriate balance of formative and final assessment for the direction of learning and decision-making on academic performance		+		
50	9	3.2.2.	provide for the possibility of adjusting the number and nature of exams in order to stimulate both knowledge acquisition and integrated learning		+		
51	10	3.2.3.	provide timely, specific, constructive and fair feedback to students based on the assessment results		+		
<i>Total</i>				<b>0</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>0</b>
Standard 4. STUDENTS							
4.1. Admission and selection policy							
The organization of education must:							

52	1	4.1.1.	define and implement an admission policy based on the principles of objectivity and including a clear statement about the student selection process		+		
53	2	4.1.2.	have a policy and implement the practice of admitting people with disabilities		+		
54	3	4.1.3.	have a policy and implement the practice of transferring students from other educational institutions, including foreign ones		+		
55	4	4.1.4.	establish a link between the selection and the mission of the educational organization, the educational program and the desired quality of graduates; periodically review the admission policy		+		
56	5	4.1.5.	use the system of appealing decisions on the admission of students		+		
4.2. Recruitment of students							
The organization of education must:							
57	6	4.2.1.	determine the number of accepted students in accordance with the possibilities of organizing education at all stages of the educational program		+		
58	7	4.2.2.	periodically regulate the number and contingent of accepted students, taking into account the views of stakeholders responsible for planning and developing human resources in the health sector in order to meet the medical needs of the population and society as a whole		+		
59	8	4.2.3.	provide for the possibility to periodically review the number and nature of accepted students in consultation with other stakeholders and regulate in order to meet the health needs of the population and society as a whole		+		
4.3. Advising and supporting students							
The organization of education must:							
60	9	4.3.1.	have a system of academic counseling for students		+		
61	10	4.3.2.	offer students a support program aimed at social, financial and personal needs, allocating appropriate resources and ensuring confidentiality of counseling and support			+	
62	11	4.3.3.	have a feedback system with students to assess the conditions and organization of the educational process		+		
63	12	4.3.4.	provide students with documents confirming their qualifications (diploma) and diploma supplement (transcript)		+		
64	13	4.3.5.	take into account the needs of different groups of students and provide an opportunity to form an individual educational trajectory		+		
65	14	4.3.6.	provide academic advice based on monitoring the student's academic performance and includes issues of professional orientation and career planning		+		
4.4. Representation of students							
The organization of education must:							
66	15	4.4.1.	develop and implement a policy of student representation and their appropriate participation in mission definition, development, management and evaluation of the educational program and other issues related to students			+	
67	16	4.4.2.	provide an opportunity to encourage and provide assistance and support to student activities and student organizations		+		
<i>Total</i>				<b>0</b>	<b>14</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>0</b>
Standard 5. ACADEMIC STAFF/TEACHERS							
5.1. Recruitment and selection policy							
The educational organization should develop and implement a staff selection and recruitment policy that:							
68	1	5.1.1.	defines their category, responsibility and <i>balance of academic staff/teachers</i> of basic biomedical sciences, behavioral and social sciences and medical/pharmaceutical sciences for the adequate implementation of the OP, including the appropriate ratio between teachers of medical, non-medical, pharmaceutical profiles, full-time or part-time		+		

			teachers, as well as the balance between academic and non-academic staff				
69	2	5.1.2.	takes into account the criteria of scientific, educational and clinical achievements, including the relationship between teaching, research and "service" functions		+		
70	3	5.1.3.	defines and monitors the responsibilities of academic staff/teachers of basic biomedical sciences, behavioral and social sciences and clinical, hygienic, pharmaceutical sciences.		+		
71	4	5.1.4.	provides an opportunity in the selection and recruitment policy to take into account such criteria and features as attitude to the mission and economic opportunities of the educational organization, as well as significant features of the region		+		
<b>5.2. Staff activity and development policy</b>							
The educational organization should develop and implement a staff activity and development policy aimed at:							
72	5	5.2.1.	maintaining a balance of opportunities between teaching, research and "service" functions, ensuring recognition of worthy academic activities with an appropriate focus on teaching, research and professional qualifications			+	
73	6	5.2.2.	provision of sufficient knowledge by individual employees of the entire educational program, as well as training and advanced training of teachers, their development and evaluation		+		
74	7	5.2.3.	the ability to take into account the teacher-student ratio depending on the various components of the educational program		+		
75	8	5.2.4.	career development of the staff		+		
<i>Total</i>				<b>0</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Standard 6. EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES</b>							
<b>6.1. Material and technical base</b>							
The organization of education must:							
76	1	6.1.1.	have sufficient material and technical base to ensure adequate implementation of the educational program, as well as create a safe learning environment for staff, students, patients and their relatives		+		
77	2	6.1.2.	improve the learning environment by regularly updating and expanding the material and technical base to meet changes in educational practice		+		
<b>6.2. Resources for practical training</b>							
The organization of education must:							
78	3	6.2.1.	provide the necessary resources to provide students with appropriate clinical/practical experience, including: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>quality and categories of patients/consumers of services</li> <li>number and categories of clinical/production bases</li> <li>monitoring the practice of students</li> </ul>		+		
79	4	6.2.2.	evaluate, adapt and improve clinical/practical training conditions to meet the needs of the population		+		
<b>6.3. Information technology</b>							
The organization of education must:							
80	5	6.3.1.	develop and implement policies aimed at the effective and ethical use and evaluation of relevant information and communication technologies		+		
81	6	6.3.2.	provide access to websites or other electronic media		+		
82	7	6.3.3.	provide teachers and students with access to relevant patient data and health information systems using existing and relevant new information and communication technologies for self-study, access to information, patient databases and work with health information systems		+		
<b>6.4. Research in the field of medicine/pharmacy and scientific achievements</b>							
The organization of education must:							

83	8	6.4.1.	use research activities and scientific achievements in the field of medicine and pharmacy as the basis for an educational program		+		
84	9	6.4.2.	formulate and implement policies that strengthen the relationship between scientific research and education; provide information on the research base and priority areas in the field of scientific research of the organization of education		+		
85	10	6.4.3.	provide for the relationship between scientific research and education is taken into account in teaching, encourages and prepares students to participate in scientific research in the field of health		+		
<b>6.5. Expertise in the field of education</b>							
The organization of education must:							
86	11	6.5.1.	have access to educational expertise of the processes, practices and problems of medical and pharmaceutical education with the involvement of specialists, educational psychologists, sociologists at the university, interuniversity and international levels; develop and implement an expertise policy in the development, implementation and evaluation of an educational program, development of teaching methods and assessment		+		
87	12	6.5.2.	demonstrate evidence of the use of internal or external educational expertise in staff development, taking into account current experience in medical/pharmaceutical education and promoting the interests of staff in conducting research in education			+	
<b>6.6. Exchange in the field of education</b>							
The organization of education must:							
88	13	6.6.1.	formulate and implement a policy on national and international cooperation with other educational organizations, including staff and student mobility, as well as transfer of educational credits		+		
89	14	6.6.2.	facilitate the participation of teachers and students in academic mobility programs at home and abroad and allocate appropriate resources for these purposes		+		
<i>Total</i>				<b>0</b>	<b>13</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Standard 7. EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM</b>							
<b>7.1. Monitoring and evaluation mechanisms of the program</b>							
The organization of education must:							
90	1	7.1.1.	have regulated procedures for monitoring, periodic evaluation of the educational program and learning outcomes, progress and academic performance of students		+		
91	2	7.1.2.	develop and apply an educational program evaluation mechanism that examines the program, its main components, student performance, identifies and solves problems, ensures that the relevant evaluation results affect the educational process		+		
92	3	7.1.3.	periodically evaluate the program, comprehensively considering the educational process, components of the educational program, expected learning outcomes and social responsibility		+		
<b>7.2. Feedback from the teacher and the student</b>							
The organization of education must:							
93	4	7.2.1.	systematically conduct, analyze and respond to feedback from teachers and students		+		
94	5	7.2.2.	use the feedback results to improve the educational program		+		
<b>7.3. Educational achievements of students</b>							
The organization of education must:							
95	6	7.3.1.	analyze the academic performance of students and graduates in accordance with the mission and expected learning		+		



			outcomes, the training program and the availability of resources				
96	7	7.3.2.	analyze the academic performance of students and graduates, taking into account the conditions of their previous education, the level of preparation for admission to the university; use the results of the analysis to interact with the structural unit responsible for selecting students, developing an educational program, advising students		+		
7.4. Stakeholder engagement							
The organization of education must:							
97	8	7.4.1.	involve key stakeholders in the monitoring and evaluation of the educational program			+	
98	9	7.4.2.	provide interested parties with access to the results of the evaluation of the program, to collect and study feedback from them on the practical activities of graduates and feedback on the educational program		+		
<i>Total</i>				<b>0</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>0</b>
Standard 8. MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION							
8.1. Management							
The organization of education must:							
99	1	8.1.1.	identify the structural units and their functions, including relationships within the university		+		
100	2	8.1.2.	define committees in the management structure, their responsible composition, reflecting the representation of the main and other stakeholders, ensuring transparency of the work of management bodies and their decisions		+		
8.2. Academic leadership							
The organization of education must:							
101	3	8.2.1.	describe the responsibilities of the academic leadership in defining and managing the educational program		+		
102	4	8.2.2.	periodically evaluate academic leadership in relation to achieving its mission and expected learning outcomes		+		
8.3. Budget for training and allocation of resources							
The organization of education must:							
103	5	8.3.1.	have a clear allocation of responsibility and authority to provide resources for the educational program, including the target budget for training		+		
104	6	8.3.2.	allocate the resources necessary for the implementation of the OP and allocate educational resources in accordance with their needs		+		
105	7	8.3.3.	provide an opportunity to allocate resources independently, including remuneration for teachers who properly achieve the planned learning outcomes; when allocating resources, take into account scientific achievements in the field of health and public health problems and their needs.		+		
8.4. Administrative staff and management							
The organization of education must:							
106	8	8.4.1.	have administrative and professional staff to implement the educational program and related activities, ensure proper management and allocation of resources		+		
107	9	8.4.2.	ensure the participation of all departments of the educational organization in the processes and procedures of the internal quality assurance system		+		
8.5. Interaction with the health sector							
The organization of education must:							
108	10	8.5.1.	carry out constructive interaction with the healthcare system and sectors of society and government related to health, including foreign ones	+			
109	11	8.5.2.	give official status to cooperation, including the involvement of employees and students, with partners in the health sector		+		
8.6. Informing the public							
The organization of education must:							

110	12	8.6.1.	publish complete and reliable information about the educational program and its achievements on the official website of the educational organization and in the media		+		
111	13	8.6.2.	publish objective information on the employment and demand for graduates on the official website		+		
<i>Total</i>				<b>1</b>	<b>12</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Standard 9. CONSTANT UPDATING</b>							
The organization of education must:							
112	1	9.1.1.	as a dynamic and socially responsible organization, initiate procedures for regular review and updating of the process, structure, content, results/competencies, evaluation and learning environment of the program, eliminate documented deficiencies, allocate resources for continuous updating		+		
113	2	9.1.2.	base the updating process on prospective health research and on the results of one's own study, assessment and literature on medical/pharmaceutical education;		+		
The educational organization must ensure that the process of renewal and restructuring leads to a review of policies and practices in accordance with previous experience, current activities and future prospects, and provide for the opportunity to address the following issues during the renewal process:							
114	3	9.1.3.	adapting the mission for the scientific, socio-economic and cultural development of society		+		
115	4	9.1.4.	changes in the expected learning outcomes of graduates in accordance with the documented needs of the environment in which they will be located. modification of learning outcomes in accordance with the documented needs of the postgraduate training environment, including clinical skills, training in public health issues and participation in the provision of medical care to patients in accordance with the responsibilities assigned to graduates after graduation		+		
116	5	9.1.5.	adaptation of the OP model and teaching methods to ensure their adequacy and relevance		+		
117	6	9.1.6.	adjustments of OP elements and their interrelation in accordance with advances in biomedical, behavioral, social and clinical, hygienic, pharmaceutical sciences, with changes in the demographic situation and health status/morbidity structure of the population and socio-economic and cultural conditions, and the adjustment process will ensure the inclusion of new relevant knowledge, concepts and methods, and the exclusion of outdated ones		+		
118	7	9.1.7.	development of assessment principles, methods and number of exams in accordance with changes in the intended learning outcomes and teaching methods		+		
119	8	9.1.8.	adaptation of the student admission policy and methods of their selection, taking into account changing expectations and circumstances, human resource needs, changes in the pre-university education system and the needs of the educational institution		+		
120	9	9.1.9.	adapting the recruitment policy and the formation of academic staff in accordance with changing needs		+		
121	10	9.1.10.	updating educational resources in accordance with changing needs, i.e. the recruitment of students, the number and profile of academic staff and the educational program;		+		
122	11	9.1.11.	improving the monitoring and evaluation of programmes		+		
123	12	9.1.12.	development of an organizational structure, as well as leadership and management, to cope with changing circumstances and needs and, over time, adapt to the interests of various stakeholder groups		+		
<i>Total</i>				<b>0</b>	<b>12</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>IN TOTAL</b>				<b>1</b>	<b>110</b>	<b>12</b>	<b>0</b>

