



«АККРЕДИТТЕУ ЖӘНЕ РЕЙТИНГТИҢ  
ТӘУЕЛСІЗ АГЕНТТІГІ» КЕМ

НУ «НЕЗАВИСИМОЕ АГЕНТСТВО  
АККРЕДИТАЦИИ И РЕЙТИНГА»

INDEPENDENT AGENCY FOR  
ACCREDITATION AND RATING

# REPORT

on the results of the work of the external expert commission for evaluation  
on compliance with the requirements of the standards of specialised  
accreditation of educational programmes

7M04103 State and local government

7M04104 State and local government

6B04105 Accounting and audit

7M04107 Accounting and audit

7M04108 Accounting and audit

INSTITUTIONS "ESIL UNIVERSITY"

in the period from 1 to 3 April 2024

**INDEPENDENT ACCREDITATION AND RATING AGENCY**  
**External Expert Commission**

***Addressed to the IAAR  
Accreditation Board***



**«АККРЕДИТТЕУ ЖӘНЕ РЕЙТИНГТИҢ  
ТӘУЕЛСІЗ АГЕНТТІГІ» КЕМ**

**НУ «НЕЗАВИСИМОЕ АГЕНТСТВО  
АККРЕДИТАЦИИ И РЕЙТИНГА»**

**INDEPENDENT AGENCY FOR  
ACCREDITATION AND RATING**

**REPORT**

**on the results of the work of the external expert commission for evaluation  
on compliance with the requirements of the standards of specialised accreditation of  
educational programmes**

***7M04103 State and local government***

***7M04104 State and local government***

***6B04105 Accounting and audit***

***7M04107 Accounting and audit***

***7M04108 Accounting and audit***

**INSTITUTIONS "ESIL UNIVERSITY"**

**in the period from 1 to 3 April 2024**

**2024**

## **(I) LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS**

**AIS – Automated information system**

**BD – Basic disciplines**

**HEI – Higher educational institution**

**EEC – External expert commission**

**CMI - Chartered Management institute**

**IS – Information systems**

**KazEU named after T.Ryskulov – Kazakh Economic University named after T.Ryskulov**

**KKSON – Committee for quality control in the system of education and science**

**CQAFES – Committee for quality assurance in the field of education and science**

**CED – Catalog of elective disciplines**

**MES – Ministry of Education and Science**

**MEP – Modular educational program**

**MSHE – Ministry of Science and Higher Education**

**MFU – Multifunctional device**

**EP – Educational program**

**IAAR – Independent agency for accreditation and rating**

**TS – Teaching staff**

**RK – Republic of Kazakhstan**

**WC – Working curriculum**

**JEP – Joint educational program**

**UMKD – Educational and methodological complex of the discipline**

**PhD - Ph.D**

## **(II) INTRODUCTION**

In accordance with the order No. 52-24-OD dated 02.02.2024 of the Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating, from April 1 to 3, 2024, an external expert commission assessed the compliance of educational programs 7M04103 Public and Local Administration, 7M04104 Public and Local Administration, 6B04105 Accounting and Audit, 7M04107 Accounting and Audit, 7M04108 Accounting and Audit of the Institution "Esil University" with the specialized accreditation standards of IAAR (dated "16" June 2020 No. 57-20-OD, sixth edition) in a hybrid format.

The report of the external expert commission (EEC) contains an assessment of the submitted educational programs according to the IAAR criteria, the EEC recommendations for further improvement of educational programs and the parameters of the profile of educational programs.

### **Composition of the EEC:**

**1. Chairperson of the IAAR Commission** – Marina Vladimirovna Pogrebetskaya, Candidate of Pedagogical Sciences, M. Kozybaev North Kazakhstan University (Petropavlovsk);

**2. IAAR expert** – Elena Evgenievna Sokolova, PhD in Economics, National Aviation University (Kyiv, Ukraine);

**3. IAAR Expert** – Carolina Timko, PhD, Associate Professor, Technical University of Moldova (Chisinau, Moldova);

**4. IAAR expert** – Sultanova Zamzagul Khamitovna, PhD in Economics, West Kazakhstan Agrarian and Technical University named after Zhangir Khan (Uralsk, Republic of Kazakhstan);

**5. Expert IAAR** - Kairdenov Serik Syrlybaevich, Ph.D., associate professor, Kokshetau University named after Sh. Ualikhanova (Kokshetau, Republic of Kazakhstan);

**6. Expert IAAR** - Zakirova Dilnara Ikramkhanovna, PhD, University "Turan" (Almaty, Republic of Kazakhstan);

**7. Expert IAAR** - Aikenova Dina Maratovna, PhD, Executive Director of ID-research (Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan);

**8. Expert IAAR** - Danila Vladimirovich Tatarinov, PhD, Kazakh National University named after al-Farabi (Almaty, Republic of Kazakhstan);

**9. Expert IAAR** – Kartbaev Timur Saattinovich Doctor PhD, Academician MAIN, Kazakh National Women's Pedagogical University (Almaty, Republic of Kazakhstan);

**10. IAAR Employer Expert** – Yuriy Aleksandrovich Pilipenko, Chairman of the Board of Directors, International Association of Manufacturers of Goods and Services "EXPOBEST" (Almaty, Republic of Kazakhstan);

**11. IAAR Employer Expert** – Abdikadirova Akniet Maratovna, Head of the Human Capital Development Department of the Chamber of Entrepreneurs "Atameken" of Shymkent (Shymkent, Republic of Kazakhstan);

**12. Expert-student IAAR** - Kuzmina Anastasia Sergeevna, 3rd year student OP Finance, NAO "Kostanai Regional University named after A. Baitursynova" (Kostanai, Republic of Kazakhstan);

**13. IAAR student expert** – Rakhmetov Artur Armanuly, 2nd year student of the Information Technology program of the S. Seifullin Kazakh Agrotechnical Research University (Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan);

**14. Expert student IAAR** - Karabayeva Zhansaya Smagulovna, PhD student, 2nd year OP 8D04103 Finance, University of International Business named after Kenzhegali Sagadieva (Almaty, Republic of Kazakhstan);

**15. Expert-student IAAR** - Turdieva Kamilla Takhirovna, 1st year student OP Tourism, University "Turan" (Almaty, Republic of Kazakhstan);

**16. Coordinator of IAAR** - Dinara Kairbekovna Bekenova, head of the IAAR project (Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan).

### **(III) REPRESENTATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION**

The institution "Esil University" was initially established in 1999 as a branch of the Kazakh State Academy in Astana, then renamed into a branch of KazEU named after T.Ryskulov. According to the order of the Committee for Supervision and Certification in Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated September 14, 2006 No. 679, the "Kazakh University of Economics, Finance and International Trade" was relocated to the capital and merged with the branch of KazEU named after T.Ryskulov. Subsequently, the university acquired the status of an independent educational institution and was renamed into the educational institution "Kazakh University of Economics, Finance and International Trade". In 2021, as a result of rebranding, the university was renamed into the institution "Esil University", as a result of which the rebranding process took place.

According to the results of the ranking of educational programs of the Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating of the Republic of Kazakhstan (IAAR) of the General Rating "Top-20", the university took 15th place at the end of 2023.

Esil University has partnerships with universities in neighboring and far abroad countries, supported by more than 100 agreements and contracts.

The student body consists of 2843 people, including 2560 undergraduate students, 277 graduate students and 6 doctoral students, including 60 students studying on the basis of a state educational order. The material and technical base of the university includes 2 academic buildings, a dormitory for 170 people, and a library. The university is implementing 9 grant research projects for a total of 600 million tenge. Since 2009, the university has been publishing the journal "Bulletin of the Kazakh University of Economics, Finance and International Trade", which, by order of the Chairman of the Committee for Quality Assurance in Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 527 dated 06.25.2021, was included in the list of publications recommended for publishing the main results of scientific activity.

### **(IV) DESCRIPTION OF THE PREVIOUS ACCREDITATION PROCEDURE**

In accordance with the order No. 7-19-OD dated 24.01.2019 of the Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating, from February 5 to 7, 2019, an external expert commission assessed the compliance of educational programs 6M050700 "Management", 6M051000 "State and Local Government", 5B090200 "Tourism" of the Kazakh University of Economics, Finance and International Trade with the standards of specialized accreditation IAAR.

At the meeting of the IAAR Accreditation Council on April 5, 2019, a decision was made on the international specialized reaccreditation of educational programs 6M051000 "Public and Local Administration" for a period of 5 years.

Following the specialized reaccreditation procedure, the external expert commission issued recommendations to improve the quality of the university's activities and the educational services provided. In order to implement these recommendations, the university developed an action plan for their implementation (approved by the rector of the university on 21.05.2019). The results of the implementation were reflected in the report on the implementation of the recommendations of the EEC within the framework of the specialized reaccreditation of educational programs submitted to the IAAR within the established time frame.

On June 20, 2023, post-accreditation monitoring was carried out as part of the action plan for the implementation of the recommendations of the EEC.

## 2.1. Standard "Management of the educational program"

### 2.1.1 In order to effectively implement strategic objectives, implement a KPI (key performance indicators) system for all levels of departments and positions.

The university annually defines the KPI of the teaching staff for scientific activity in order to stimulate publication activity, obtain documents confirming copyright, publication in high-ranking journals and increase citation rates.

In 2022, the Esil Patriot Regulation was developed for the KPI system, which provides for a system of rewarding teaching staff and employees based on the results of career guidance work.

In the 2022-2023 academic year, the "Regulation on Key Performance Indicators" was developed (approved by the rector on June 30, 2022). The full text of the regulation is not provided.

*The recommendation is being implemented to a sufficient extent 60%*

### 2.1.2 Systematize the process of monitoring the implementation of innovations introduced in the EP.

The university conducts an annual audit of the educational program. The results of the analysis and monitoring of the educational program for 2021 and 2022 are not presented. Extracts from the minutes of the meeting of the Academic Committee are presented, but they do not include questions related to monitoring the innovations being implemented.

Methodological seminars are regularly held for teaching staff in order to improve the quality of teaching disciplines, including those related to innovative approaches and teaching methods.

Information on the systematization of the process of monitoring the implementation of innovations introduced in the EP is not provided.

*The recommendation is being implemented to a sufficient extent 60%*

### 2.1.3 Conduct training for heads of departments and educational programs in the field of risk management, implement risk management at the level of structural departments, processes and educational programs.

The report provides information on the completion of courses and training of EP managers on management programs in education. Since the course programs are not provided, it is impossible to determine whether risk management training was provided. Information on completion of risk management courses is not provided.

According to the report: "... for the purpose of effective management of the EP ... a Risk Management Plan has been developed and approved, according to which risk management is carried out", however, the plan and documents confirming risk management in terms of the EP have not been presented.

The expert group conducting the first post-accreditation monitoring recorded partial implementation of this recommendation.

*The recommendation is being implemented to a sufficient extent 80%*

## 2.2. Standard "Information Management and Reporting"

### 2.2.1 Develop a unified procedure for assessing the effectiveness and efficiency of the EP, within which the criteria that distinguish these categories are clearly defined.

The university has developed methodological recommendations for conducting an audit of the educational program "State and Local Government" (approved on August 25, 2022), but they do not mention the assessment of the effectiveness and efficiency of the educational program, and their criteria are not defined.

Extracts from the minutes of the meeting of the Academic Committee are presented, however, they do not include questions related to the assessment of the effectiveness and efficiency

of the EP.

The expert group conducting the first post-accreditation monitoring recorded partial implementation of this recommendation.

*The recommendation is being implemented to a sufficient extent 80%*

### **2.2.2 Use key performance indicators (KPIs) in the process of collecting and analyzing information.**

In the 2022-2023 academic year, the "Regulation on Key Performance Indicators" was developed (approved by the rector on June 30, 2022). The full text of the regulation is not provided, in this regard, it is impossible to determine which indicators are supposed to be collected.

The expert group conducting the first post-accreditation monitoring recorded partial implementation of this recommendation.

*The recommendation is not being implemented actively enough 30%*

### *2.3. Standard "Development and approval of the educational program"*

#### **2.3.1 The management of the EP must provide students with the opportunity to prepare for professional certification.**

In April 2023, a round table entitled "Universities in the Professional Certification System: Entering the International Level" was held, within the framework of which a memorandum was signed between Esil University and the professional management association CMI (Great Britain), which provides an opportunity for students studying economic specialties to obtain an international certificate. Также в университете имеется договор о сотрудничестве с ТОО «НМЦ «ZIAT» до 2025 г. о профессиональной сертификации обучающихся.

*The recommendation has been implemented 100%*

#### **2.3.2 Expand the list of joint and/or double-degree programs with foreign universities.**

Cooperation with the European University (Switzerland, Spain) ended in 2022 and was not extended because the cost of education at this university increased. Work continues with the Baltic International Academy (Latvia), Kangnam University (South Korea), Tomas Bata University in Zlin (Czech Republic), University of Economics and Humanities (Poland), University of Florence (Italy), Woosong University (Korea), International Center for Education and Scientific Information (Germany), Astrakhan State Technical University (Russian Federation).

Information on the conclusion of new contracts for the period under review is not provided.

*The recommendation is being implemented to a sufficient extent 60%*

### *2.4. Standard "Continuous monitoring and periodic evaluation of educational programs"*

#### **2.4.1 Reflect the work done to monitor the main business processes of the EP on the university website.**

Information on the progress of the EP implementation, presented on the university website, is kept up to date.

*The recommendation is being implemented to a sufficient extent 80%*

#### **2.4.2 Ensure that development plans for all educational programs accredited by the EP are posted on the website.**

For 7M04103/7M04104 "State and Local Government", development plans for 2022-2025 are posted on the website.

### *2.5. Standard "Student-centered learning, teaching and assessment of academic performance"*

#### **2.5.1 Conduct your own research in the field of teaching academic disciplines of the educational program.**

The Department of Management annually holds an educational and methodological conference "Organization of educational methodological scientific work in the learning process". In October 2022, PhD Valieva S.N. held a methodological seminar on the topic "On the methodological support and quality of conducting seminars and practical classes by teachers of the department in the context of online learning."

*According to EP 7M0410405/7M04106 "Management", 7M04103/7M04104 "State and Local Government", the recommendation is being implemented to a sufficient extent. 60%*

## *2.6. The "Learners" standard*

**2.6.1 Develop a targeted program of academic mobility and activate external academic mobility of students, taking into account the analysis of their financial capabilities, and also assist them in obtaining external grants for education.**

The Department of Management has developed an Academic Mobility Program for 2021-2025 (approved on August 26, 2022).

As part of the academic mobility of master's students in an online format for the 1st semester of the 2022-2023 academic year, a lecture on the subject "Legal support of public administration" was given by PhD in Law, Associate Professor of the Department of Taxes and Tax Administration of the Faculty of Taxes, Audit and Business Analysis of the Financial University under the Government of the Russian Federation E.V. Ryabova for 1st year master's students of the OP 7M04104 "State and Local Government".

*The recommendation is being implemented to a sufficient extent. 70%*

**2.6.2 The leadership of the educational institution should actively encourage students to self-educate and develop outside the main program (extracurricular activities).**

Updated information on additional courses, seminars, trainings, etc. completed by students during the analyzed period is not provided. Incentive activities are also not described.

The expert group conducting the first post-accreditation monitoring recorded partial implementation of this recommendation.

*The recommendation is not being implemented actively enough. 50%*

## *2.7. Standard "Teaching staff"*

**2.7.1 To stimulate the participation of teachers in academic mobility programs, joint scientific research with foreign partners and international projects.**

Head of the EP "State and Local Government" PhD Chereeva B.T. completed a scientific internship at the Ural State Agrarian University from September 5 to October 7, 2022. No supporting documents were submitted.

The University acted as a co-organizer of the 1st International Scientific and Practical Conference "Professional, Technological and Economic Training of Students in the Context of Modernization and Standardization of Education" in October 2022 with the Volgograd State Social and Pedagogical University. In November 2022, the International Round Table "New Trends in the Development of Socio-Economic Processes in the Post-Pandemic Period: the View of Young Scientists" was held jointly with the Russian State Social University. In January 2023, a round table seminar "Problems and Challenges of Modern Business Education through the Eyes of International Experts" was held, in which the speakers were professors of the Cambridge Business School - Shahzad Ansari and Hamza Mudassir.

Also, the TS EP has joint publications with foreign scientists.

*The recommendation is being implemented to a sufficient extent. 70%*

**2.7.2 Expand the involvement of the best foreign and domestic teachers in the educational process.**

As part of academic mobility in the 1st semester of the 2022-2023 academic year, a lecture on the subject "Project Quality Management" was given by Candidate of Sciences (Econ.),



Associate Professor of the Department of Management, Service and Tourism of the Institute of Economics, Management and Service of Tambov State University named after G.R. Derzhavin A.A. Kostylev for 1st-year master's students of the educational program 7M04106 "Management"; a lecture on the subject "Legal Support of Public Administration" by Candidate of Sciences (Law), Associate Professor of the Department of Taxes and Tax Administration of the Faculty of Taxes, Audit and Business Analysis of the Financial University under the Government of the Russian Federation E.V. Ryabova for 1st-year master's students of the educational program 7M04104 "Public and Local Government".

*According to EP 7M04103/7M04104 "State and Local Government", the recommendation is implemented to a sufficient extent 60%*

### **2.7.3 More actively involve the TS in the implementation of the university strategy and other strategic documents.**

There is no information other than that provided during the first post-accreditation monitoring period.

The expert group conducting the first post-accreditation monitoring recorded partial implementation of this recommendation.

*The recommendation is not being implemented actively enough. 50%*

### **2.7.4 To motivate the professional and personal development of teachers of the EP to apply advanced innovative teaching methods and information and communication technologies in the educational process.**

The University has developed a Regulation on Key Performance Indicators (minutes No. 18 of the Academic Council meeting dated June 30, 2022). The Regulation has not been submitted.

The Department of Management annually holds an educational and methodological conference "Organization of educational and methodological scientific work in the learning process".

More detailed information and documents confirming the use of advanced innovative teaching methods and information and communication technologies in the educational process are not provided.

*The recommendation is not being implemented actively enough. 50%*

## **2.8. Standard "Educational Resources and Student Support Systems"**

### **2.8.1 Ensure the sufficiency of material and technical resources and infrastructure of the university.**

The construction of a new university building is planned for the summer of 2023. Starting from the new academic year, the university plans to rent a 3-story building for an academic building.

There is no information other than that provided during the first post-accreditation monitoring period.

*The recommendation is not being implemented actively enough. 40%*

## **2.9. Standard "Informing the Public"**

**There are no recommendations for this standard.**

## **2.10. Standard "Standards in the context of individual specialties"**

**There are no recommendations for this standard.**

In accordance with the order No. 7-19-OD dated 24.01.2019 of the Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating, from February 5 to 7, 2019, an external expert commission assessed the compliance of educational programs 5B050800-"Accounting and Audit", 6M050800-"Accounting and Audit" of the Kazakh University of Economics, Finance and International Trade

with the standards of specialized accreditation of IAAR.

At the meeting of the Accreditation Council of the IAAR on April 5, 2019, a decision was made on the international specialized re-accreditation of educational programs 5B050800-"Accounting and Audit", 6M050800-"Accounting and Audit" for a period of 5 years.

Following the specialized reaccreditation procedure, the external expert commission issued recommendations to improve the quality of the university's activities and the educational services provided. In order to implement these recommendations, the university developed an action plan for their implementation (approved by the rector of the university on 21.05.2019). The results of the implementation were reflected in the report on the implementation of the recommendations of the EEC within the framework of the specialized reaccreditation of educational programs submitted to the IAAR within the established time frame.

On June 20, 2023, post-accreditation monitoring was carried out as part of the action plan for the implementation of the recommendations of the EEC.

**Recommendations to the university within the framework of the previous accreditation procedure for educational programs 5B050800-"Accounting and Audit", 6M050800-"Accounting and Audit (2019).**

### *2.1 Standard "Educational Program Management"*

**2.1.1 Conduct an assessment of the risks of developing the educational program in full compliance with the University Development Strategy and develop a mechanism for reducing them.**

It follows from previous reports that, in accordance with the University Development Strategy, the Academic Councils discuss the risk management issues of the EP (ASOP EP "Accounting and Audit", minutes No. 4 of March 10, 2020, ASOP EP "Assessment", minutes No. 4 of February 14, 2020, ASOP EP "Assessment", minutes No. 4 of February 14, 2020, ASOP EP "Customs Affairs", minutes No. 4 of February 17, 2020). In the 2022-2023 academic year, based on the Order of the Ministry of Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 2 of July 20, 2022, the Academic Committee was formed (Rector's Order No. 01-29/81 of August 31, 2022).

At the same time, the VEC experts were unable to familiarize themselves with the current procedure for identifying, measuring, preventing and reducing risks. We also noted the lack of involvement in the risk management system of all members of the educational process for 7M04103-State and Local Government, 7M04104-State and Local Government, 6B04105-Accounting and Audit, 7M04107-Accounting and Audit, 7M04108-Accounting and Audit.

The recommendation is recognized as not fully implemented.

**2.1.2 The management should facilitate the creation of opportunities for the development and implementation of innovative teaching technologies in the educational process.**

During post-accreditation monitoring, the degree of implementation of this recommendation was estimated at 50%. Based on the analysis of the syllabi of academic disciplines, the experts of the IAAR EEC noted a low share of innovative classes in the composition of classes and agree with the previous assessment of colleagues.

**2.1.3 Practice training the heads of the university and accredited educational programs in educational management programs.**

The experts familiarized themselves with the certificates of the heads of graduating departments and heads of EP.

**2.1.4 Take comprehensive measures for the planned transition of the university to trilingual education and introduce the practice of teaching specialized disciplines in English.**

As interviews with the heads of graduating departments and heads of EP and a study of the class schedule showed, teaching is carried out only in the state and Russian languages.

### **2.1.5 Strengthen work on the formation and implementation of double-degree education and academic mobility.**

In fact, there are no double-degree or joint EP-s being implemented.

## *2.2 Standard "Information Management and Reporting"*

### **2.2.1 Provide analysis of information on the quality and implementation of educational programs in order to identify and predict risks.**

It was not possible to get acquainted with the information on the quality of the implementation of the EP in terms of identifying and predicting risks; the university does not have a document on the risk management system.

### **2.2.2 Planned activities and expected results in the EP Development Plans for the long-term and short-term periods of time should be reviewed from the point of view of measurability, assessment of effectiveness and efficiency.**

The EP development plans of the cluster are drawn up in different forms and for different periods, which requires systematization of work on planning the development of the EP at the institutional level.

### **2.2.3 Intensify work on involving all categories of university personnel: students, employees and TS in the process of collecting and analyzing information, as well as making decisions based on them.**

A survey of the TS and stakeholders is being carried out, but it was not possible to get acquainted with the system for making specific decisions based on the survey results.

### **2.2.4 Review the hierarchy of approval of the Development Plan of reaccredited educational programs for long-term and short-term periods.**

In general, the procedure for drafting, reviewing and approving Development Plans of EP requires systematization at the university level.

## *2.3 Standard "Development and approval of the educational program"*

### **2.3.1 Intensify work on harmonizing the content of educational programs with similar educational programs of leading foreign and Kazakh educational organizations.**

It follows from the report that an agreement on cooperation on the cluster was concluded with the Kyrgyz State Technical University named after I. Razzakov, Bishkek, Kyrgyzstan, as well as an agreement on cooperation on the educational program "Customs Affairs" with the Federal State Budgetary Educational Institution of Higher Education "Astrakhan State Technical University" (agreement dated November 27, 2020). However, work on harmonizing the content of the EP with the EPs of other universities requires continuation.

### **2.3.2 Consider the possibility of developing joint educational programs with foreign educational organizations.**

There are developed double-degree EPs, but they are not implemented, although 5 years have passed since the last accreditation.

## *2.4. Standard "Continuous monitoring and periodic evaluation of educational programs"*

### **2.4.1 On an ongoing basis, monitor the labor market, external environment, employers' requests when developing and updating the content and structure of the EP using SWOT and PESTEL analyses to identify changes.**

It was not possible to verify the implementation as well as the implementation of SWOT and PESTEL analyses to identify changes.

## *2.5. Standard "Student-centered learning, teaching and assessment of academic performance"*

**2.5.1 Continue work on conducting our own research in the field of teaching methods of academic disciplines in the context of the EP.**

It was not possible to fully verify the implementation of our own research in the field of teaching methods of academic disciplines in the context of the cluster EP.

*2.6. Standard "Students"*

**2.6.1 Strengthen work on external and internal (incoming and outgoing) academic mobility of students through various sources in online and online learning modes.**

It was not possible to get acquainted with all the supporting documents on the implementation of student mobility (agreements, orders, transcripts and certificates), however, as evidenced by the data provided in the Report, the EP management is working on the implementation of this recommendation of the JAAR experts.

*2.7 Standard "Teaching Staff"*

**2.7.1 Develop and implement a long-term plan for the development of academic mobility of the teaching staff and the attraction of leading lecturers from foreign universities.**

It was not possible to fully familiarize ourselves with the long-term plan for the development of academic mobility of the teaching staff and the attraction of leading lecturers and with the records confirming the regular monitoring of its implementation due to technical problems with access to files on the mail.ru cloud.

**2.7.2 Develop and implement a plan for the development of young teachers.**

Support for the development of young teachers is carried out on the basis of P EsU 27-02 "Regulations on the School of Young Teachers".

**2.7.3 Ensure the multilingual competence of the TS in order to implement trilingual education at the university.**

Trilingual education is not provided at the university.

*2.8 Standard "Educational Resources and Student Support Systems"*

**2.8.1 Consider the possibility of expanding the area of classrooms, as well as ensure that literature on the disciplines of the cluster's EP is updated to reflect the latest achievements in science and technology.**

It is planned to build a new academic building, and a plot of land has been allocated for construction.

*2.9 "Public Informing"*

**2.9.1 Use a variety of methods of disseminating information to inform the general public and stakeholders about the work being carried out in all EP.**

The report provides information on a wide range of actions taken to inform stakeholders about changes in all educational programs. However, as shown by familiarization with the university's website, the actions are not posted on the website.

*2.10 Standard "Standards for Individual Specialties"*

**2.10.1 Develop and implement a dual training format for individual disciplines of the EP.**

The university has business contacts with employers.

In general, it should be noted that academic mobility is being implemented, agreements have been concluded on the implementation of educational programs jointly with leading foreign universities. The leadership of the EP demonstrated facts of attracting foreign and domestic teachers to the educational process in the profile of the EP, but did not show quantitative data on

how various events held at the university actually stimulated teachers to participate in academic mobility programs, in joint scientific research with foreign partners.

The members of the EEC conclude that the recommendations of the previous EEC of the IAAR have not been fully implemented.

#### **(V) DESCRIPTION OF THE VISIT OF THE EEC**

The work of the EEC was carried out on the basis of the approved Program of the visit of the expert commission for specialized accreditation of educational programs of the Esil University Institution from April 1 to April 3, 2024.

In order to coordinate the work of the EEC, an online kick-off meeting was held on March 29, 2024, during which powers were distributed among the members of the commission, the schedule of the visit was clarified, and an agreement was reached on the selection of examination methods.

In order to obtain objective information on the quality of educational programs and the entire infrastructure of the university, to clarify the content of self-assessment reports, meetings were held with the rector, vice-rectors of the university in areas of activity, heads of structural divisions, heads of departments, teachers, students, graduates, employers. A total of 122 representatives took part in the meetings (Table 1).

Table 1 - Information on employees and students who took part in the meetings with the IAAR EEC:

<b>Category of participants</b>	<b>Quantity</b>
Rector	1
Vice-rector's corps	2
Heads of structural divisions	16
Deans of faculties	2
Heads of departments and heads of accredited educational programs	14
Teachers	29
Students	42
Graduates	24
Employers	10
<b>Total</b>	<b>122</b>

During the visual inspection, the members of the EEC got acquainted with the state of the material and technical base, visited classrooms, the 1C-Accounting laboratory, the State Management research laboratory, the V.K. Radostovets research laboratory, the courtroom and the forensic science office, the library, the assembly hall and the dormitory.

At the meetings of the IAAR EEC with the target groups of the university, the mechanisms for implementing the university policy were clarified and individual data presented in the university self-assessment report were specified.

The members of the EEC visited the practice bases of the accredited programs: the Akimat of the Saryarka District of Astana and Kazakhstan Social Medical Company Zhanuya LLP. The EEC members planned to attend a class on the subject "Accounting in Tourism and Hotel Business" by PhD, Associate Professor Tusibaeva G:S., but due to illness, this class was postponed to another day.

In accordance with the accreditation procedure, a survey of 42 teachers and 134 students was conducted.

In order to confirm the information provided in the Self-Assessment Report, external experts requested and analyzed the university's working documentation. Along with this, the experts studied the university's online positioning through the official website of the university [https:// esil.edu.kz /](https://esil.edu.kz/).

As part of the planned program, recommendations for improving the accredited educational programs of the Esil University Institution, developed by the EEC based on the results of the examination, were presented at a meeting with the management on 03.04.2024.



## **(VI) COMPLIANCE WITH SPECIALISED ACCREDITATION STANDARDS**

### *6.1. Standard "Educational Programme Management"*

- ✓ The university must demonstrate the development of the goal and strategy for the development of the educational programme based on the analysis of external and internal factors with the wide involvement of various stakeholders.
- ✓ The quality assurance policy must reflect the connection between scientific research, teaching and learning.
- ✓ The university demonstrates the development of a quality assurance culture.
- ✓ Commitment to quality assurance must apply to any activities carried out by contractors and partners (outsourcing), including the implementation of joint/dual diploma education and academic mobility.
- ✓ The management of the educational programme ensures the transparency of the development plan for the educational programme based on the analysis of its functioning, the real positioning of the university and the focus of its activities on meeting the needs of students, the state, employers and other stakeholders.
- ✓ The head of the EP demonstrates the functioning of mechanisms for the formation and regular revision of the EP development plan and monitoring of its implementation, assessment of the achievement of learning objectives, compliance with the needs of students, employers and society, decision-making aimed at continuous improvement of the EP.
- ✓ The head of the EP should involve representatives of stakeholder groups, including employers, students and teaching staff, in the formation of the EP development plan.
- ✓ The head of the EP should demonstrate the individuality and uniqueness of the EP development plan, its consistency with national development priorities and the development strategy of the educational organization.
- ✓ The university should demonstrate a clear definition of those responsible for business processes within the EP, the distribution of job responsibilities of personnel, and the delineation of the functions of collegial bodies.
- ✓ The head of the EP ensures the coordination of the activities of all persons participating in the development and management of the EP, and its continuous implementation, and also involves all stakeholders in this process.
- ✓ The head of the EP must ensure the transparency of the management system, the functioning of the internal quality assurance system, including its design, management and monitoring, and the adoption of appropriate decisions.
- ✓ The head of the EP must implement risk management.
- ✓ The head of the EP must ensure the participation of representatives of stakeholders (employers, faculty, students) in the collegial bodies governing the educational program, as well as their representativeness in decision-making on issues of educational program management.
- ✓ The university must demonstrate innovation management within the educational program, including the analysis and implementation of innovative proposals.
- ✓ The head of the EP must demonstrate its openness and accessibility to students, faculty, employers and other stakeholders.
- ✓ The head of the EP confirms the completion of training in educational management programs.
- ✓ The head of the EP must strive to ensure that the progress achieved since the last external quality assurance procedure is taken into account when preparing for the next procedure.

#### **Evidential part**

Educational programs 7M04103-State and Local Government, 7M04104-State and Local Government, 6B04105-Accounting and Audit, 7M04107-Accounting and Audit, 7M04108-Accounting and Audit at the university are implemented on the basis of license KZ081LAA00032358, issued by the Committee for Control in Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated April 1, 2022.

The activities of the accredited educational programs are aimed at training qualified personnel. Thus, the goal of EP 7M04104-“State and Local Government” (specialized area) is “training highly qualified specialists capable of participating in the processes of preparation, adoption, implementation, evaluation and expert support of management decisions in government bodies”, the goal of EP 7M04103-“State and Local Government” (scientific and pedagogical area) is “training scientific and pedagogical personnel capable of conducting scientific research in the areas of state and local government and education and applying it in the process of professional activity”.

The objective of EP 7M04107 / 7M04108- "Accounting and Audit" is "development of personal qualities in master's students that contribute to the growth of their professional competencies, allowing the graduate to be practice-oriented in the field of accounting, auditing and analysis and constantly in demand in the labor market of relevant enterprises and organizations, to have applied professional skills", the objective of EP 6B04105- "Accounting and Audit" (bachelor's degree) is "training highly qualified specialists for sectors of the economy, capable of carrying out professional activities in organizing accounting, auditing and taxation and in the field of economic and business management".

The basis of the internal quality assurance system of the EP is formed by the Internal Quality Assurance Policy, Academic Policy and internal regulatory documents governing the key

business processes within the EP. The internal quality assurance policy of the Esil University institution (P EsU 01-07 (<https://esil.edu.kz/dokumenty>)) reflects “the relationship between scientific research, teaching, learning and takes into account both the national and intra-university context” and is implemented through shared responsibility “between the university management, faculties, departments and structural divisions.”

Key aspects of the development, audit of the EP, the choice of the educational trajectory, other issues related to the management of the EP and the coordination of all persons involved in these processes are covered in the Academic Policy of Esil University (AP EsU 01-06, approved by Protocol No. 18 dated June 30, 2022).

The management of the EP is carried out through the functioning of collegial bodies in the form of the Quality Assurance Commission of the Faculty of Business and Management, acting on the basis of P EsU 14-23 “Regulations on the Quality Assurance Commission”, academic committees, graduating departments, meetings of members EP.

The members of the EP management have been trained in education management programs: for example, Bekzhanova T.K. on the courses "Management in Education", Turan University, February 12-20, 20224; Chereeva B.T. and Bekzhanova T.K. - "Modern Trends in Education", Esil University, August 8-23, 2023.

In order to determine the quality of the EP implementation, the university conducts an annual survey of students, faculty, employers and graduates, the results of which are discussed at meetings of collegial bodies. The survey results are published on the university website (<https://esil.edu.kz/otchet-sotsiologicheskogo-issledovaniya/>), students, faculty and employees have the opportunity to make an appointment with the rector or send an application via e-mail [rector@esil.edu.kz](mailto:rector@esil.edu.kz) or the rector's blog.

During the survey of the faculty, the involvement of the faculty in the process of making management and strategic decisions was assessed as follows: “very good” - 23.8%, “good” - 73.8%, “relatively bad” - 2.4% of respondents who indicated the answers “bad”, “very bad” and did not answer this question were not identified.

#### ***Analytical part***

The IAAR EEC, having held meetings, discussions and interviews with the rector, vice-rectors, heads of structural divisions, deans of faculties, heads of educational programs, teaching staff, students, employers and graduates, as well as having conducted a survey of teaching staff and students, having familiarized themselves with the material and technical base and practice bases, notes that the leadership of the educational program has ensured the participation of representatives of interested parties in the collegial governing bodies of the educational program.

The EEC members familiarized themselves with the documents that form the key aspects of the educational program's activities in the medium term, in particular, with the "Development Plan for the Educational Program "Accounting and Audit" for 2019-2022." (<https://esil.edu.kz/documents-accounting-and-audit-department/>), "The program and plan for the development of the educational program 7M04103-"State and Local Government" in the direction of training 7M041 "Business and Management" for 2022-2025" (<https://esil.edu.kz/department-of-management-documents/>), "The program and plan for the development of the educational program 7M04104-"State and Local Government" in the direction of training 7M041 "Business and Management" for 2022-2025" (<https://esil.edu.kz/department-of-management-documents/>), which made it possible to notice the identity of the Development Plans for EP 7M04103-"State and Local Government" and 7M04104-"State and Local Government", as well as the lack of differentiation of planning processes for the EP "Accounting and Audit" in terms of training levels, which does not allow us to positively assess their individuality and uniqueness. We also noted the different structure of the Development Plan for different EPs, as well as the lack of a unified approach to the development of development plans for the university's EP, taking into account the



compliance of the EP development plan with the Institution's Development Strategy, national priorities and labor market needs.

The IAAR experts were unable to verify the development of EP development plans based on the actual positioning of the university and the functioning of mechanisms for the formation and regular revision of the EP development plan. Also, it was not possible to see documents or consensus records on the involvement of stakeholders in the formation and development plans of the EP, approved by the Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs and Science. Familiarization with the organization of the risk management system showed that the university maintains the "Esil University Risk Register for 2023-2024", but we were unable to familiarize ourselves with the current procedure for identifying, measuring, preventing and mitigating risks. We also noted the lack of involvement in the risk management system of all members of the educational process for 7M04103-State and local government, 7M04104-State and local government, 6B04105-Accounting and audit, 7M04107-Accounting and audit, 7M04108-Accounting and audit.

During the work of the EEC, the IAAR experts did not receive a complete understanding of how the planning, reporting and activity procedures provide for innovation management based on the implementation of all the main management functions of the EP.

It is also noted that since the last post-accreditation monitoring procedure (June 2023), 50% or more of the recommendations of the expert group members have not been implemented.

**Strengths/best practices for OP 7M04103-State and local government, 7M04104-State and local government, 6B04105-Accounting and Audit, 7M04107-Accounting and Audit, 7M04108-Accounting and Audit":**  
not identified.

**Recommendations for the EP "7M04103-State and Local Government, 7M04104-State and Local Government, 6B04105-Accounting and Audit, 7M04107-Accounting and Audit, 7M04108-Accounting and Audit":**

- Before the start of the 2024-2025 academic year, the university management shall develop an internal regulatory document describing uniform requirements for the development of plans for the development of the university's educational programs, taking into account:

- compliance of the EP development plan with the Institution's Development Strategy, national priorities and labor market needs;

- involvement of employers, students and faculty in drawing up the EP development plan;

- determination of the individuality and uniqueness of the EP development plan within the framework of the real positioning of the university;

- a mechanism for monitoring the implementation of the EP development plan and regular revision of the EP development plan.

- In the 2024-2025 academic year, the EP management shall review the EP development plans and bring them into compliance with the newly established requirements.

- The EP management shall annually monitor the implementation of the EP development plans for the fulfillment of target indicators, assessment of the achievement of learning objectives, compliance with the needs of stakeholders, and on this basis make decisions aimed at the continuous improvement of the EP. The monitoring results shall be communicated to all stakeholders.

- The university management shall develop and document a risk management procedure at the level of structural divisions and within the EP by December 2025.

- The university management shall provide for innovation management in the planning, reporting and activity procedures during 2024 based on the implementation of all basic management functions, including planning, organization, stimulation, and analysis.

- The management of the university and the educational program must, by the end of the

2024-2025 academic year, conduct an analysis of the implementation of the recommendations of the EEC for the accredited programs (previous and current accreditation procedures), include measures and activities for their implementation in the Development Plans of the educational program and ensure their full implementation.

### ***Conclusions of the EEC by criteria:***

**According to the standard "Educational Program Management", the educational programs of the EP "7M04103-State and Local Government, 7M04104-State and Local Government, 6B04105-Accounting and Audit, 7M04107-Accounting and Audit, 7M04108-Accounting and Audit" have 11 satisfactory positions and 6 require improvement.**

### ***6.2. Standard "Information Management and Reporting"***

✓ The university must demonstrate the development of the goal and strategy for the development of the EP based on the analysis of external and internal The university must ensure the functioning of the system for collecting, analyzing and managing information based on modern information and communication technologies and software.

✓ The head of the EP demonstrates the systematic use of processed, adequate information to improve the internal quality assurance system.

✓ The head of the EP demonstrates the existence of a reporting system reflecting the activities of all structural divisions and departments within the EP, including an assessment of their effectiveness.

✓ The university must determine the frequency, forms and methods of assessing the management of the EP, the activities of collegial bodies and structural divisions, and senior management.

✓ The university must demonstrate a mechanism for ensuring the protection of information, including the determination of persons responsible for the reliability and timeliness of information analysis and the provision of data.

✓ The university demonstrates the involvement of students, employees and faculty in the processes of collecting and analyzing information, as well as making decisions based on them.

✓ The head of the EP must demonstrate the existence of mechanisms for communication with students, employees and other stakeholders, including conflict resolution.

✓ The university must ensure that the degree of satisfaction of the needs of students, faculty and staff within the educational program is measured and demonstrate evidence of the elimination of identified deficiencies.

✓ The university must evaluate the effectiveness and efficiency of activities in the context of the EP.

✓ The information collected and analyzed by the university within the educational program must take into account:

✓ Key performance indicators;

✓ The dynamics of the student body in terms of forms and types;

✓ The level of academic performance, student achievement and expulsion;

✓ Student satisfaction with the implementation of the EP and the quality of education at the university;

✓ Availability of educational resources and support systems for students;

✓ Employment and career growth of graduates.

✓ Students, TS and staff must confirm their consent to the processing of personal data with documents.

✓ The head of the EP should facilitate the provision of necessary information in the relevant fields of science.

### ***Evidential part***

In the information and educational environment of the Esil University Institution, information systems have been implemented, both of our own design and commercial products. This ensures a high degree of automation of information management processes. Information management is carried out in accordance with the regulation "internal quality assurance system".

Management and administration of educational programs of the accredited cluster is carried out in accordance with the laws "On Education", "On Science", regulatory documents of the Ministry of Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan, documents developed by the Esil University Institution, and in accordance with the Development Plans of the EP cluster, which is a document that predicts the further development of the university.

The University has a developed information and computer infrastructure. Completeness and relevance of information about the activities of the Esil University Institution is posted on the official website of the university <https://esil.edu.kz/about-us/>, which has an expanded structure of information pages, is the entry point to the internal portal. The internal portal contains announcements, organizational and legal documents, plans and reports of the university, which are updated in a timely manner.

The activities of the departments serving the cluster's educational programs are determined by the mission and Development Strategy of the Kazakh University of Economics, Finance and

International Trade until 2025. The procedure for managing the educational process at the university and educational programs, as well as the responsibility of the performers of these works, are established in accordance with the Development Strategy based on documented procedures of the quality management system. These documents are located in the Documentolog corporate system repository, documented procedures are updated annually, and persons responsible for the processes make the necessary changes and additions to both the procedures and individual forms.

All provisions governing the educational process are approved by the Academic Council of the university. <https://esil.edu.kz/academic/>. The original documents are stored in the Quality Assurance and Strategic Analysis Department, the electronic version of the document is located in the Documentolog University Electronic Document Management System <https://sed.esil.edu.kz> ; and on the university website, which is accessible to all heads of university departments and students. <https://esil.edu.kz/ru/students/dokumenty/>.

Employers and social partners take part in the examination of the MOP EP, based on the results of which changes are made (exclusion of unclaimed disciplines and trajectories from the WCs, introduction of practice-oriented courses, etc.). A survey of graduates and employers is conducted. The results are discussed at the departments and appropriate decisions are made.

In order to determine the conditions for creating a favorable environment for training competitive graduates, a survey on the quality of training is conducted annually. Monitoring of student satisfaction with the quality of training is carried out by means of a questionnaire.

One of the main areas of development of the university and the EP cluster is the need to improve the quality and ensure equal access to educational resources for all students, regardless of the form of education. For this purpose, the university has developed and implemented electronic educational resources in the educational process EsU. "Collection, processing and protection of personal data of students and faculty" of the Esil University Institution:

All employees and students of the university were familiarized with the document (consent sheet) and signed that they agree with the collection, storage and processing of personal data <https://cloud.mail.ru/public/TUZ4/WwL1L5hVP>.

Applicants upon admission to the university, along with other documents, must write a statement that they agree with the collection, storage and processing of personal data for educational and other purposes that do not contradict the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

Signed agreements are stored in the personal files of students.

The safety of the processed information is ensured by the uniform distribution of roles and functions in the information systems we use, the availability of reliable anti-virus programs, system administration of existing servers, a backup system on servers, restriction of access of individuals to the room with servers, modern technical equipment of the rooms with servers to ensure the safety of their work.

Access to information posted in closed databases is carried out for legal purposes by officials who have access to information processing, after passing mandatory authorization, within the framework necessary to perform specific job responsibilities.

High-quality collection, monitoring, analysis, exchange of current information, formation of statistical and reference reports on the contingent of students in the context of specialties and forms of training, the formation of orders on the movement of the contingent of students is carried out by the registration department.

In the Institution "Esil University" there are various mechanisms of communication with students, employees and other interested parties.

Thus, within the framework of interaction with employees between the administration and the workforce, a collective agreement is concluded to regulate socio-economic and labor relations. This agreement is created on the basis of the current legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The information and feedback system is implemented through the work of collegial bodies, scheduled meetings of the rector with the staff, students, the rector's reception on personal and

official matters; questions and answers on the rector's blog <https://esil.edu.kz/rectors-blog/>, deans; curatorial hours; official web portal; information, hanging stands; sociological surveys. The feedback channels existing at the university provide an opportunity for all stakeholders to contact the management with problems, initiatives and proposals for improving activities. Specific decisions are made on all requests and proposals.

There are official pages of the university rector in social networks, where students, parents, faculty, employers and interested parties can ask questions, address problems and leave their comments on improving the university's activities.

The development plans of the educational program are publicly discussed with representatives of all interested parties. Students who are members of the Faculty Council, the Rector's Office, the Academic Council of the Esil University Institution, working groups, etc. also actively participate in the discussion and decision-making.

The university has a Student Registration and Service Center. The purpose of the Esil University Student Registration and Service Center is to provide high-quality and fast service to students to ensure timely and high-quality provision of services and information support. <https://esil.edu.kz/students/>

In its activities, the Student Registration and Service Center is guided by: the policy and goals of Esil University in the field of quality; the current legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan; the Charter of the Esil University Institution <https://esil.edu.kz/wpcontent/uploads/2023/11/organized.pdf>, the Academic Policy of Esil University and other internal regulatory documents of the university. <https://esil.edu.kz/academic-policy/>.

The University successfully operates 11 (eleven) information systems based on the corporate network: automated information system for managing the educational process "Platonus"; AIS "Distance Learning Portal Moodle"; AIS "Electronic Admissions Committee"; AIS "Electronic Library"; Electronic document management system "Documentolog"; IP telephony and web conferencing based on the "3CX Phone System"; Internet gateway based on "Traffic Inspector"; Proctoring system OES.kz; Antiplagiarism system Antiplagiat.ru; Webinar platform for online broadcasts Microsoft Teams; Corporate mail.

The University is accelerating the development of its technological infrastructure: a dedicated fiber-optic communication line (FOCL) has been put into operation to dramatically increase and boost the Internet speed to 500 Mbps; IP telephony is used at the University via the FOCL; 60 PCs, 26 laptops, 1 video recorder, 8 units of copying and duplicating equipment and 7 projectors were purchased in 2022; an ElarPlanScan planetary scanner; there are 7 high-performance servers of the Supermicro 825TQ-R720 PB model, HP ProLiant DL 380e Gen8, HP ProLiant DL 180 G6, HP ProLiant DL 380e Gen8; 3 computer classes with Core I5 processors have been updated; a 10 kW server uninterruptible power supply; the sound and lighting equipment in the assembly hall and lecture hall has been updated. Thus, the equipment used in the implementation of the OP meets the needs and corresponds to modern multimedia requirements.

One of the most important indicators of the effectiveness of a modern University, an indicator of the effectiveness of transformations is the level of satisfaction of the faculty, staff and students with the management system. In order to determine the degree of satisfaction of the faculty, staff and students with the management system, meetings are periodically held with the rector, vice-rectors for areas of activity, heads of structural divisions. Surveys are systematically conducted on issues related to the development of the social and domestic sphere, educational activities, organization of leisure outside of school hours, salaries of employees and financial support for students.

The educational programs of the cluster regularly undergo appropriate audit, are reviewed by partner employers, discussed with students, and adjustments and amendments are made to the curricula based on their suggestions and opinions.

One of the criteria for the quality of education is monitoring the academic performance and quality of knowledge of students. Monitoring the knowledge of students is a continuous process that includes different types of control: current control, midterm control and midterm certification (session).

The main reasons for the unstable enrollment of applicants to the Master's program are primarily related to: the lack of state educational grants for economic specialties; the outflow of applicants to national research universities; regularly changing new rules and tightening requirements for admission to the Master's and Doctoral programs significantly reduce the number of participants in the entrance exams. Information and library resources used to organize the learning process are sufficient and meet the requirements of each educational program being implemented and include educational, educational and methodological, scientific, reference, industrial and practical literature, legislative and regulatory legal acts, as well as additional literature for personal self-development.

A survey of students showed that 47.8% of respondents (64 people) were completely satisfied with the availability and quality of Internet resources, 31.3% (42 people) were partially satisfied, 13.4% (18 people) were partially dissatisfied, 3.7% (5 people) were dissatisfied, and 3.7% of respondents (5 people) found it difficult to answer.

#### ***Analytical part***

When analyzing the criterion of the standard "Information Management and Reporting" for accredited educational programs, the EEC notes that the University has developed an information policy and established processes for collecting, analyzing and managing data on the activities of specific areas of training within the framework of accredited educational programs. It is also noted that there is a system for managing information and reporting on student enrollment, academic performance, transfers, staffing, academic mobility of teachers and students, which is regularly presented at meetings of faculties, the rector's office and the academic council of the university.

Regular surveys of students and employers are conducted, and based on the results of their surveys/interviews, appropriate measures are taken to eliminate deficiencies. Information and communication technologies are used with a fairly high degree of efficiency.

Along with this, there are certain issues related to this standard that were not fully confirmed by the EEC. For example, during a survey of graduates and students, it became known that many, although they are aware of the latest changes in the curriculum, do not have enough information about the activities of the self-government body and the opportunity to participate in it. Another important aspect of effective information management is the ability to involve students, teachers and staff in the processes of collecting, analyzing data and making decisions based on it, but this was not adequately demonstrated.

The survey did not confirm the existence of a documented mechanism for communication with students, employees and other stakeholders. Information on the compliance of the collected information with the parameters and key performance indicators within the accredited EPs is insufficiently presented, the mechanism for identifying and assessing the parameters and indicators that determine the effectiveness of the EP implementation is not clearly defined.

The analysis of information management and reporting within the framework of the implemented EPs of the university shows that the mechanisms of regular reporting reflecting all levels of the structure, including the assessment of the effectiveness and efficiency of research by the faculty of the department, need to be more clearly coordinated.

***Strengths/best practices for the EP "7M04103-State and Local Government, 7M04104-State and Local Government, 6B04105-Accounting and Audit, 7M04107-Accounting and Audit, 7M04108-Accounting and Audit":***  
*not identified.*

**Recommendations for the "EP "7M04103-State and Local Government, 7M04104-State and Local Government, 6B04105-Accounting and Audit, 7M04107-Accounting and Audit, 7M04108-Accounting and Audit":**

- The university management shall develop an internal document by 2024 regulating the conduct of surveys, including determining the levels and period for reviewing the survey results and taking corrective actions.

- The university management shall include key performance indicators and efficiency of the OP, the level and period of their assessment in P EsU 17-01 Regulation on Conducting an Audit of Educational Programs by the end of 2024.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria:**

According to the standard "Information Management and Reporting", the educational programs "EP "7M04103-State and Local Government, 7M04104-State and Local Government, 6B04105-Accounting and Audit, 7M04107-Accounting and Audit, 7M04108-Accounting and Audit" have 7 satisfactory positions and 1 requires improvement.

**6.3. Standard "Development and approval of the educational program"**

- ✓ The university must demonstrate the existence of a documented procedure for the development of the educational program and its approval at the institutional level.
- ✓ The university must demonstrate the compliance of the developed educational program with the established objectives and planned learning outcomes.
- ✓ The head of the EP must determine the influence of disciplines and professional practices on the formation of learning outcomes.
- ✓ The university demonstrates the existence of a model of the educational program graduate, describing the learning outcomes and personal qualities.
- ✓ The qualification awarded upon completion of the educational program must be clearly defined, explained and correspond to a certain level of the NSC, QF-EHEA.
- ✓ The head of the EP must demonstrate the modular structure of the program based on ECTS, ensure that the structure of the educational program content corresponds to the set objectives with a focus on achieving the planned learning outcomes by each graduate.
- ✓ The head of the EP must ensure that the content of academic disciplines and learning outcomes correspond to each other and to the level of study (bachelor's degree, master's degree, doctoral degree).
- ✓ The head of the EP must demonstrate that external examinations of the educational program have been conducted.
- ✓ The head of the EP must provide evidence of the participation of students, faculty and other stakeholders in the development and quality assurance of the EP.
- ✓ The head of the EP must demonstrate the uniqueness of the educational program, its positioning in the educational market (regional/national/international).
- ✓ An important factor is the possibility of preparing students for professional certification.
- ✓ An important factor is the presence of joint and/or double-degree EP with foreign universities.

***Evidential part***

The re-accredited educational programs "7M04103-State and Local Government, 7M04104-State and Local Government, 6B04105-Accounting and Audit, 7M04107-Accounting and Audit, 7M04108-Accounting and Audit" have been developed in accordance with the regulatory documents of the Ministry of Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan, as well as in accordance with paragraph 3.1 "Formation of Educational Programs" of the Academic Policy of Esil University. This document contains a description of the modular-competence approach to the development of educational programs.

The initial version of the accredited educational programs is developed by the Academic Committee, the key approaches to organizing the activities of which are described in detail in P. EsU 18-02 "Regulations on the Academic Committees of Esil University" and is considered at a meeting of the graduating department, then submitted to the Academic Committee, where it undergoes the approval procedure; in case of a positive decision, the quality committee recommends the educational program for approval by the Academic Council of the university. The examination of the educational program is carried out by employers, corporate partners, students and the teaching staff involved in the development and implementation of the educational program. In general, the cluster educational programs have been developed in compliance with the procedures set out in P. EsU 17-05 "Regulations on the modular construction of educational programs". The quality assessment of the educational program is carried out on the basis of

paragraph 3.2 "Audit of educational programs" of the Academic Policy of Esil University and P. EsU 17-01 "Regulations on the audit of educational programs". Educational programs are approved by the rector based on a positive decision of the Academic Council of the university. Passports, development plans and graduate models of accredited educational programs are posted in various sections of the university website <https://esil.edu.kz/>.

The logic of constructing the sequence of academic disciplines is built on the principles of step-by-step formation of knowledge and competencies. Professional practice is organized on practice bases corresponding to the profile of the re-accredited educational programs. The management applies elements of dual training, which are reflected in the functioning of an active network of department branches (LLP "QazCake" for educational programs 7M04103-State and local government, 7M04104-State and local government, LLP "Center for audit and assessment" for educational programs 6B04105-Accounting and audit, 7M04107-Accounting and audit, 7M04108-Accounting and audit), involving employers-practitioners in the educational process. At the suggestion of employers, changes are made to the accredited educational programs reflecting practice-oriented training.

#### **Analytical part**

The analysis of the educational programs "7M04103-State and Local Government, 7M04104-State and Local Government, 6B04105-Accounting and Audit, 7M04107-Accounting and Audit, 7M04108-Accounting and Audit" for compliance with the requirements of the standard "Development and approval of educational programs showed their compliance with the specified goals, the presence of a graduate model, and the passage of the internal and external examination procedure. General university models of a bachelor's and master's degree graduate were approved by the Academic Council on April 18, 2022, protocol No. 16. The models include a list of the main components of a graduate of a certain level - i.e. they indicate what types of competencies the graduate model for the educational program should consist of. Experts note that general university models do not contain specific graduate competencies, and the presented graduate models for accredited programs do not correspond to general university models in their structure.

During the interview, employers confirmed their participation in the procedures for developing and evaluating the EP. However, the experts were unable to review publications on social networks and on the university website about the involvement of employers in the procedures for external evaluation of the EP.

The experts of the IAAR EEC note that the Academic Committee of the Faculty of Business and Management includes 16 people, including stakeholder participation for each EP is limited to one employer and one student. Employers are also poorly involved in the process of monitoring the quality of the EP.

During the interview, students and graduates gave fairly good feedback on the training of specialists according to these EPs, at the same time, the experts of the IAAR EEC note the insufficient positioning of EPs 7M04103-State and Local Government, 7M04104-State and Local Government, 6B04105-Accounting and Audit, 7M04107-Accounting and Audit, 7M04108-Accounting and Audit in the regional and national markets, the absence of a positioning strategy for the EP or elements of such a strategy in the system-forming documents of the EP (for example, in the EP passport).

The university management signed an agreement with the professional association CMI on professional certification of students and teaching staff. The VEC experts reviewed the documents on the training of students at the Academy of Public Administration on the course "School of Civil Servants". Documents confirming the possibility of preparing students of EP 7M04103-State and Local Administration, 7M04104-State and Local Administration, 6B04105-Accounting and Audit, 7M04107-Accounting and Audit, 7M04108-Accounting and Audit for professional certification in the profile of these EPs were not presented.

The university has laid the foundations for the implementation of a dual-degree or joint EP: the Regulation on the development and implementation of dual-degree education programs and joint educational programs at Esil University has been developed and dual-degree EP 6B04105-Accounting and Audit (with Gangnam University (South Korea), European University (Switzerland) has been added to the register of EPs, for which there is no student contingent. There are no dual-degree or joint EPs for other EPs.

***Strengths/best practices for the EPs “7M04103-Public and Local Government, 7M04104-Public and Local Government, 6B04105-Accounting and Audit, 7M04107-Accounting and Audit, 7M04108-Accounting and Audit”:***

**not identified.**

***Recommendations for the EP “7M04103-Public and Local Government, 7M04104-State and local government, 6B04105-Accounting and Audit, 7M04107-Accounting and Audit, 7M04108-Accounting and Audit»:***

- The university management shall annually conduct an external examination of the EP by various stakeholders, including employers, with the results discussed at meetings of the collegial governing bodies and the publication of the results on the official website of the university.

- The university management shall amend the Regulation on the modular construction of educational programs by the end of 2024 in terms of including the requirement for the EP graduate model to correspond to the general university model of the corresponding level of education, as well as ensuring the active participation of all categories of EP stakeholders in collegial bodies implementing the development, revision, updating and monitoring of the EP quality. The EP management shall bring the graduate models of accredited programs into line with general university models during 2025.

- The EP management shall develop a Roadmap for positioning the EP in the national market by the beginning of the 2024-2025 academic year.

- The university management shall analyze professional certification programs by June 20, 2024, determine the university's capabilities to prepare students for professional certification, and develop an action plan on this issue by September 1, 2024.

- The university management shall analyze the university's capabilities to implement dual-degree and/or joint programs with foreign universities by November 1, 2024, and the program management shall develop a Roadmap in this area by December 30, 2024, providing for measures to intensify career guidance work, support teachers involved in their implementation, and begin training in dual-degree and/or joint programs with foreign universities in the cluster by September 1, 2026.

***Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria:***

**According to the standard "Development and approval of the educational program", the educational programs "7M04103-State and local government, 7M04104-State and local government, 6B04105-Accounting and audit, 7M04107-Accounting and audit, 7M04108-Accounting and audit" have 10 satisfactory positions and 2 require improvement.**

#### ***6.4. Standard "Continuous monitoring and periodic evaluation of educational programs"***

- ✓ The university must ensure that the structure and content of the EP is reviewed taking into account changes in the labor market, employers' requirements and social demands of society.
- ✓ The university must demonstrate the availability of a documented procedure for monitoring and periodic evaluation to achieve the goal of the EP and continuously improve the EP.
- ✓ Monitoring and periodic evaluation of the EP must consider:
  - ✓ the content of the program in the context of the latest achievements of science and technology in a particular discipline;
  - ✓ changes in the needs of society and the professional environment;
  - ✓ workload, academic performance and graduation of students;



- ✓ the effectiveness of student assessment procedures;
- ✓ the needs and level of student satisfaction;
- ✓ compliance of the educational environment and the activities of support services with the goals of the EP.
- ✓ The head of the EP must publish information about changes to the EP, inform stakeholders of any planned or taken actions within the framework of the EP.
- ✓ Support services should identify the needs of different groups of students and their level of satisfaction with the organization of training, teaching, assessment, and mastering of the EP as a whole.

### **Evidential part**

Monitoring and periodic evaluation of the EP by the EP management are carried out on the basis of P EsU 17-01 "Regulations on the audit of the university's educational programs", approved by the decision of the Academic Council dated April 18, 2022, protocol No. 16. The EP management carries out a systematic review of the content and structure of the EP, taking into account the trends in the development of the labor market.

The head of the EP management carries out systematic monitoring, evaluation of effectiveness, revision of the policy in the field of quality assurance of the EP based on information management, depending on changing conditions and the environment (labor market, partners). In connection with the changing socio-economic integration, information and intellectual demands, a systematic assessment of the effectiveness of the goals and objectives of the EP is carried out throughout the entire period of student training. The effectiveness of the EP goal is systematically assessed at scheduled department meetings. An internal audit is periodically carried out, based on the results of which an EP Audit Report is prepared, which is heard at department meetings. The EP audit plan is discussed at the meetings of the Academic Committee (minutes No. 2 dated October 9, 2023).

Esil University has support services that ensure that the needs of different groups of students are identified and met, which was also confirmed during the interviews with students.

### **Analytical part**

As a result of familiarization with the documents on the accredited educational programs, the members of the IAAR EEC were convinced that the educational program management regularly evaluates the educational program, on the basis of which conclusions are made about the effectiveness of the educational program implementation.

In the organization of monitoring and evaluation of the educational program implementation of this cluster, the use of a systematic approach was noted, which implies the complexity and mutual agreement of the analysis and adjustment of the course content, their continuity and consistency. The activities of the Academic Committee, which at the end of the academic year reviews, updates and makes adjustments to the WCs, gives recommendations for adjusting the teaching and methodological complex, etc., are built from these positions. However, it was not possible to find publications on the university website about the actions taken or planned in relation to the educational program of the cluster.

The educational program management has done a good job of organizing the monitoring of students' satisfaction with the quality of the educational program, but it was not possible to familiarize ourselves with the functioning of the regular system for discussing the monitoring results at meetings of the governing bodies and with the publication of measures taken based on the results of the surveys on the university website. A survey of students during the visit of the JAAR EEC showed the following satisfaction of students with the quality of the educational program as a whole: 64.9% of respondents (87 people) were completely satisfied, 24.6% (33 people) were partially satisfied, 4.5% (6 people) were partially not satisfied.

***Strengths/best practices for the EP "7M04103-State and Local Government, 7M04104-State and Local Government, 6B04105-Accounting and Audit, 7M04107-Accounting and Audit, 7M04108-Accounting and Audit":***  
**not identified.**

**Recommendations for the EP "7M04103-State and Local Government, 7M04104-State and Local Government, 6B04105-Accounting and Audit, 7M04107-Accounting and Audit, 7M04108-Accounting and Audit":**

- The EP management shall publish and maintain up-to-date information on changes to each EP on the university website in the section dedicated to the EP from September 1, 2024.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria:**

According to the standard "Continuous monitoring and periodic assessment of the educational program", the educational programs "7M04103-State and local government, 7M04104-State and local government, 6B04105-Accounting and Audit, 7M04107-Accounting and Audit, 7M04108-Accounting and Audit" have 9 satisfactory positions, 1 requires improvement.

6.5. Standard "Student-centered learning, teaching and assessment of academic performance"

- ✓ The head of the EP must ensure respect and attention to various groups of students and their needs, providing them with flexible learning paths.
- ✓ The head of the EP must ensure teaching based on modern achievements of world science and practice in the field of training, the use of various modern teaching methods and assessment of learning outcomes, ensuring the achievement of the educational program goals, including competencies, skills in performing scientific work at the required level. The management of the educational program should determine the mechanisms for distributing the students' academic workload between theory and practice within the educational program, ensuring that each graduate masters the content and achieves the educational program's goals.
- ✓ An important factor is the availability of its own research in the field of teaching methods for the educational program's disciplines.
- ✓ The university should ensure that the learning outcomes assessment procedures correspond to the planned results and goals of the EP.
- ✓ The university should ensure consistency, transparency and objectivity of the educational program's learning outcomes assessment mechanism, and publication of the assessment criteria and methods in advance.
- ✓ Evaluators should be proficient in modern learning outcomes assessment methods and regularly improve their skills in this area.
- ✓ The head of the EP should demonstrate the availability of a feedback system for the use of various teaching methods and learning outcomes assessment.
- ✓ The head of the EP should demonstrate support for students' autonomy while providing guidance and assistance from the teacher.
- ✓ The head of the EP should demonstrate the availability of a procedure for responding to student complaints.

**Evidential part**

The academic policy of the university is aimed at meeting the needs of various categories of students. A special place in it is devoted to the issues of adaptation of foreign students. Thus, the "Program for the adaptation of foreign students to the conditions of study at Esil University for the 2022-2023 academic year" was developed, and a Welcome Center is functioning.

Accredited educational programs provide students with freedom in choosing the disciplines listed in the CED and WC, the student's participation in the formation of their individual curriculum, the involvement of advisers in the educational process, who assist them in choosing an educational trajectory. As a result of the implementation of the chosen educational trajectory, students receive the necessary competencies. The individual educational trajectory consists of university (mandatory), variable, correctional and organizational parts. The mandatory part includes the main modules for study, which correspond to the structure of the educational program.

The optional part includes a set of modules and their components that the student chooses to study depending on the areas of study that interest him. The mandatory and optional parts are aimed at determining the content of training. All issues related to the organization of the educational process for the EP, the system of monitoring the academic achievements of students are regulated by the Regulation on the credit technology of education / P EsU 17-09.

Current monitoring of students' academic performance is carried out according to the approved schedule of classes. The curriculum of the discipline determines various types of current monitoring of students' academic performance: oral survey, written control, tests, presentations, etc.

Midterm or intermediate control is carried out after passing a certain section. The final control (exam) is carried out taking into account the results of the current and midterm controls. Appealing the results of midterm and final control is carried out in accordance with the internal procedure P EsU 05-04 "Regulations on the Appeals Commission" dated March 24, 2022. As the interview with the teaching staff and students showed, in case of questions or disagreements, students, teachers and employees can contact the heads of the educational program, the head of the department, the dean of the faculty, or contact the rector directly through the online appeals system on the university website. In case of serious disagreements or conflict situations, they are resolved through the functioning of the Commission for the consideration of appeals of employees and students, the activities of which are regulated by P EsU 14-15 "Regulations on the commission for the consideration of appeals of students, employees and applicants to Esu; University», approved by the Academic Council of the University on February 28, 2023, Protocol No. 9.

During the survey, students of the accredited educational institutions assessed the teaching staff requirements for students as follows: 64.9% (87 people) are fully satisfied, 23.1% (31 people) are partially satisfied, 2.2% (3 people) are partially dissatisfied, 2.2% (3 people) are dissatisfied and 7.5% (10 people) found it difficult to answer, as well as the objectivity of the assessment of knowledge, skills and other academic achievements as follows: 67.2% (90 people) are fully satisfied, 25.4% (34 people) are partially satisfied, 4.5% (6 people) are partially dissatisfied, 2.2% (3 people) are dissatisfied and 0.7% (1 person) found it difficult to answer.

### **Analytical part**

The university has an advisory service that helps shape the educational trajectory of students, regulated by P EsU 14-23 "Regulations on the advisor", approved by the Academic Council on August 31, 2022, protocol No. 1.

Familiarization with the syllabi of academic disciplines showed that, along with traditional methods, cases, preparation of reports, presentations, solving multi-level tasks and situations are widely used (disciplines "Technology of making public management decisions", "State regulation of the real sector of the economy", "New public management", "Leadership in management", "Management in government agencies" EP 7M04103-State and local government), solving situational problems, preparing a project, presentations, tests, solving production situations (disciplines "Accounting in tourism and hotel business", "1C Accounting", "Practical audit", "Accounting in trade", "Analysis and diagnostics of financial and economic activities of the enterprise", "Tax audit and consulting" according to EP 6B04105-Accounting and audit, etc. At the same time, there are no proprietary teaching methods, the authorship of which is confirmed by official documents.

The syllabuses of the academic disciplines did not fully reflect the description of the assessment of learning outcomes; during the interview, the students were unable to answer the question of how they familiarize themselves with the assessment criteria. Familiarization with the syllabuses of the academic disciplines showed that the accredited educational programs do not use a criteria-based system for assessing learning outcomes; interviews with the faculty and familiarization with the university website showed that the university does not have uniform criteria for assessing learning outcomes and uniform approaches to organizing the procedure for assessing learning outcomes.

The EEC experts were unable to fully verify the existence of a truly functioning feedback system for the use of various teaching methods in the cluster educational programs.

During the survey, students of accredited educational institutions assessed the quality of educational programs in the educational institution as follows: 66.4% (89 people) were completely satisfied, 24.6% (33 people) were partially satisfied, 3% (4 people) were partially dissatisfied, 3% (4 people) were dissatisfied, and 3% (4 people) found it difficult to answer.

***Strengths/best practices for the EP "7M04103-State and Local Government, 7M04104-State and Local Government, 6B04105-Accounting and Audit, 7M04107-Accounting and Audit, 7M04108-Accounting and Audit":***  
not identified.

***Recommendations for the EP "7M04103-State and Local Government, 7M04104-State and Local Government, 6B04105-Accounting and Audit, 7M04107-Accounting and Audit, 7M04108-Accounting and Audit":***

- The university management should include criteria in the teaching staff motivation system that motivate teachers to develop their own research in the field of teaching methods for the disciplines taught by September 1, 2025.

- The EP management shall ensure the publication of criteria and methods for assessing learning outcomes in the syllabi of academic disciplines by the beginning of the 2024-2025 academic year.

- In 2024, the EP management shall plan training and advanced training for the EP faculty on modern methods of assessing learning outcomes.

- The EP management shall develop and implement a feedback system on the use of various teaching methods and assessing learning outcomes by January 1, 2025.

***Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria:***

**According to the standard "Student-centered learning, teaching and assessment of academic performance", the educational programs "7M04103-State and local government, 7M04104-State and local government, 6B04105-Accounting and audit, 7M04107-Accounting and audit, 7M04108-Accounting and audit" have 7 satisfactory positions and 3 require improvement.**

***6.6. Standard "Students"***

✓ The university must demonstrate the policy of forming the contingent of students and ensure transparency, publication of procedures regulating the life cycle of students (from admission to completion).

✓ The head of the EP must provide for the implementation of special adaptation and support programs for newly admitted and foreign students.

✓ The university must demonstrate the compliance of its actions with the Lisbon Recognition Convention, including the existence and application of a mechanism for the recognition of the results of academic mobility of students, as well as the results of additional, formal and informal training.

✓ The university must provide an opportunity for external and internal academic mobility of students, as well as assist them in obtaining external grants for training.

✓ The university must encourage students to self-education and development outside the main program (extracurricular activities).

✓ An important factor is the presence of a mechanism for supporting gifted students.

✓ The HEI must demonstrate cooperation with other educational organizations and national centers of the "European Network of National Information Centers on Academic Recognition and Mobility/National Academic Recognition Information Centers" ENIC/NARIC in order to ensure comparable recognition of qualifications.

✓ The HEI must provide students with internship places, demonstrate the procedure for facilitating the employment of graduates, maintaining contact with them.

✓ The HEI must demonstrate the procedure for issuing graduates with documents confirming the qualification received, including the achieved learning outcomes.

- ✓ The head of the EP must demonstrate that graduates of the program have skills that are in demand in the labor market and that these skills are really relevant.
- ✓ The head of the EP must demonstrate the existence of a mechanism for monitoring the employment and professional activity of graduates.
- ✓ An important factor is the existence of an active association/union of graduates.

### **Evidential part**

In order to attract applicants to the accredited EP of the cluster, career guidance work is carried out on a systematic basis. Working groups are created to visit organizations in the city and region. Explanatory work is organized among graduates on the conditions of admission, "Open Days" are held. Applicants can get additional information on the university website (<https://esil.edu.kz/entrant/>) and familiarize themselves with the rules for accepting documents, and also contact the admissions office of the Institution "Esil University".

Esil University is interested in enrolling applicants with high academic performance, who in the future will be able to achieve high results in the professional field. In this regard, the university has developed rules for admitting applicants based on the "Standard Rules for Admission to Educational Organizations Implementing Educational Programs of Higher and Postgraduate Education" (Order of the MES of the RK dated October 31, 2018, No. 600).

Foreign citizens are admitted to higher education institutions and scientific organizations in the manner established by the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan, as well as international treaties ratified by the Republic of Kazakhstan. Applications for Master's degree programs at Esil University are accepted by the university's admissions committee and (or) through the information system from June 1 to July 15 of the calendar year. Foreign citizens are provided with adaptation assistance, such as legalization of stay in the country, assistance in migration issues, a specialized adaptation program for foreign citizens with the conditions of study at Esil University has been created (<https://esil.edu.kz/for-foreign-applicants/>), there is also a Welcome Center (<https://esil.edu.kz/ru/cooperation/international-projects>), reflecting the cooperation between the institutions participating in the project, which unites their needs and problems by implementing a Strategic and Marketing Plan in the field of internationalization and creating an online platform on which Kazakh and Chinese higher education institutions present their proposals (training and research) with the prospect of attracting students, teachers and researchers.

The issues of forming the contingent and the results of admission are considered at meetings of the departments, the rector's office and the Academic Council. According to the state compulsory standard of education, the contingent is divided into students on an educational grant and students on a fee-paying basis.

The correspondence between the admission process and the subsequent progress of students is assessed based on the results of examination sessions. During the training, students undergo current, midterm and final control. Midterm control in accordance with the credit technology of education is carried out 2 times per semester - on the 8th and 15th weeks.

The issues of forming the contingent and the results of admission are considered at meetings of the departments, the rector's office and the Academic Council. According to the state compulsory standard of education, the contingent is divided into students on an educational grant and students on a fee-paying basis.

The compliance between the admission process and subsequent progress of students is assessed based on the results of examination sessions. During the training, students undergo current, midterm, and final assessments. Midterm assessments in accordance with the credit technology of education are carried out twice a semester - on the 8th and 15th weeks.

The results of midterm assessments are posted in the Platonus electronic journal using their login and password, where each student can view their scores in their personal account at any time.

To pass and pass the course as a whole, you need to score at least 50 points based on the results of two ratings and an exam. In case of debts, the procedure for eliminating academic debts is carried out on a paid basis during the summer semester, according to the approved academic calendar. The teacher also monitors the process of eliminating debts during the semester. Students who fail to pass the examination session within the established time frame due to illness or other valid reasons documented by the relevant organization are given the opportunity to extend the session and set a deadline for passing them.

Based on the results of the academic year (based on the results of the winter and spring sessions) and the results of the summer semester, the average grade point average (GPA) is calculated. For transfer from one course to another, the university has established a scale of transfer grades (GPA) for courses, which is annually approved by the Academic Council.

Transfer from one course to another is formalized by the order of the rector based on the submission of the dean of the faculty of the corresponding direction. Information on the rules of admission, transfer from one course to another, transfer from other universities, the procedure for transferring credits earned in other universities, expulsion rules, as well as in the event of questions related to educational activities, students receive during consultations with advisers, at meetings with the head of the department and the dean.

The University has a Regulation on the Provision of Educational Benefits (hereinafter referred to as the Regulation) <http://old.esil.edu.kz/upload/iblock/9ae/polozhenie-o-predostavlenii-obrazovatelnykh-lgot.pdf> , which determines the procedure for providing benefits to persons studying on a contractual basis at the Institution "Esil University" (hereinafter referred to as the University), as well as those entering the University (dated 04/18/2022). Educational benefits are provided from the University's funds. The total limit of educational benefits for one academic year is determined when approving the budget. For newly admitted students, an orientation week is held, during which introductory lectures are held, where issues of training using the credit technology of education, calculating GPA points, transfer from course to course, summer session, etc. are discussed.

Work on the adaptation of students begins with the information and organizational stage. Group advisers conduct excursions, survey students, based on the results of which the level of adaptation and satisfaction of students is determined. The university creates favorable conditions for conducting classes, independent work, sports, leisure, artistic and scientific creativity, which contributes to the successful adaptation of students. Master's students are familiarized with the living conditions in the dormitory.

The procedure for recognition and nostrification is carried out by the National Center for Higher Education Development of the MSHE.

The University closely cooperates with the National Center for Higher Education Development. In order to ensure comparable recognition of qualifications, the Registrar's Office sends a monthly report on the work carried out to organize external and internal academic mobility of students, takes part in the information and training seminars of the Center.

According to the Regulation on academic mobility of students and faculty of Esil University (<https://esil.edu.kz/academic-mobility/>), seminars, round tables with faculty and students are held annually to explain academic mobility programs and other information, information is provided through social networks and the university website (<https://esil.edu.kz/>).

Academic mobility at Esil University is carried out within the framework of concluded agreements and memorandums with national and foreign universities (<https://esil.edu.kz/partner-universities-for-academic-mobility-programs/>)

The Esil University Institution implements an academic mobility program. External academic mobility of students and administrative staff is coordinated by the International Cooperation Department.

The HEI provides all students of the cluster's EP with the opportunity to participate in academic mobility programs, creates possible conditions, and provides advisory support. The head of the EP helps in facilitating the selection of disciplines, drawing up curricula, and transferring disciplines. Students have the right to independently choose a partner university, determine the list of disciplines to study, and then submit an application to the graduating department.

Academic mobility of students is considered as a factor and tool for increasing the competitiveness of education, acts as a kind of guarantee of the quality of higher education, and contributes to the formation of competent personnel. The competitiveness of graduates is determined by the quality and quantity of competencies focused on the requirements of employers and forming their holistic professional competence (<https://esil.edu.kz/academic-mobility/>). Funding for academic mobility is provided by the students themselves, or by funds from the European Union, in the case of participation in academic mobility programs within the Erasmus+ program.

The cluster EP together with the Career Center department are actively working to promote employment of graduates: the international and domestic labor market is studied, vacancies are searched for, cooperation with representatives of various companies is organized within the framework of open doors. In this matter, the Alumni Association provides active support, which helps new graduates in finding a job, this cooperation is reflected in the Regulation on the Alumni Association <http://old.esil.edu.kz/upload/iblock/19b/P-ob-assotsiatsii-vypusnikov.pdf>

In order to assist in employment, the cluster's EP annually participates in job fairs for graduates, where students have the opportunity to talk to employers, receive advice from specialists in various industries about current youth employment programs, and use the provided electronic database of vacancies in the region and the republic.

Students have the opportunity to take part in various clubs, within the framework of which students are engaged in scientific research, participate in scientific conferences. Students have the opportunity to communicate outside of classes in the assembly hall, library, sports complex, canteen. The library is used to meet the needs of students in familiarization with various types of educational literature, conducting thematic classes, cultural and educational events and other information events. The assembly hall provides an opportunity to hold scientific and cultural-mass university-wide events. The sports complex is used for sports competitions, sports section classes. Students and employees of the institute enjoy the right to free use of the sports hall, gym and all sports equipment.

Also, the university has created all the conditions for the maximum development of the personality of a student who has a high level of ability in one or more areas, taking into account his individual abilities, where, according to the Regulation on the support of gifted students, all mechanisms for supporting gifted students of the university are prescribed <http://old.esil.edu.kz/upload/iblock/d45/Polozhenie-o-podderzhke-odarenykh-obuchayushchikhsya.pdf>

### ***Analytical part***

The EEC commission confirms that the procedure for forming the contingent of students is carried out strictly in accordance with the academic policy of the university, as well as regulatory and legal acts in the field of higher education. Only those students and postgraduates who have scored the required number of points based on the test results are included in the number of those enrolled in the university. The contingent of postgraduates is also formed by postgraduates transferred from foreign universities.

Students and postgraduates are aware of the content of the training program, disciplines, and the qualifications received upon completion of training. From conversations with students, it became clear that they highly value the opportunity to study at the university, since graduates of the program are in demand in the labor market, as confirmed by employers' reviews. Students also

highlighted the presence of practicing teachers and an abundance of practical classes, which contributes to achieving harmony between theory and practice. In addition, employers highly appreciated the strong theoretical basis of student training.

The student survey showed that over 93% of respondents were fully or partially satisfied with the level of accessibility of the dean's office and departments and the level of accessibility and responsiveness of the management (of the university, faculties and departments). Also, over 94% of the students surveyed were satisfied with the availability of academic counseling. It is worth noting that 97.8% of the students who completed the survey fully or partially agreed that the course program was clearly presented.

The university provides full support to students throughout the entire period of study, from the moment of enrollment to graduation. This activity is reflected in the rules published on the website, where students can get all the necessary information about the learning process at all stages. Students receive initial assistance and support in close cooperation with the supervisor. The university provides students and postgraduates with all the necessary educational materials, and also has a mechanism for supporting talented students. EEU notes that a strong position is the presence of a mechanism for supporting gifted students.

The university actively encourages students' desire for self-education and development outside the main program (in extracurricular activities). According to the survey results, 90% of students noted that the educational organization provides sufficient opportunities for sports and other leisure activities.

The University actively supports the academic mobility of students, providing opportunities to study both abroad and within the country. Students who have completed a course of study at other educational institutions are issued a transcript, and a procedure for recognizing and crediting courses in accordance with the ECTS system within the framework of academic mobility is provided. Despite all the advantages for students, the University recommends that the management of accredited educational programs strengthen efforts to improve external and internal academic mobility of students by developing a corresponding Action Plan.

The University is ready to accept foreign citizens. All procedures regulating the admission, accommodation and adaptation of foreign students are described. The University has developed documents that meet the requirements of the Lisbon Convention, providing for procedures for the recognition of learning outcomes and competencies obtained abroad and at other educational institutions. Cooperation with the Bologna Process and Academic Mobility Center can facilitate the recognition of the qualifications of foreign citizens during the annual admissions campaign.

Upon completion of training and successful passing of the final control, the University issues a diploma of its own sample with an appendix on the development of the full volume of educational credits. The Diploma Supplement is issued in three languages.

***Strengths/best practices for the EP "7M04103-State and Local Government, 7M04104-State and Local Government, 6B04105-Accounting and Audit, 7M04107-Accounting and Audit, 7M04108-Accounting and Audit":***

- An important factor is the availability of a support mechanism for gifted students.

***Recommendations for the EP "7M04103-State and Local Government, 7M04104-State and Local Government, 6B04105-Accounting and Audit, 7M04107-Accounting and Audit, 7M04108-Accounting and Audit":***

- The EP management should develop a Roadmap for the development of academic mobility of students by September 1, 2024.

***Conclusions of the EEC by criteria:***



According to the standard "Students", the educational programs "7M04103-State and Local Government, 7M04104-State and Local Government, 6B04105-Accounting and Audit, 7M04107-Accounting and Audit, 7M04108-Accounting and Audit" have 1 strong, 10 satisfactory positions and 1 requires improvement.

### 6.7. Standard "Teaching staff"

- ✓ The HEI must have an objective and transparent personnel policy in the context of the educational program, including hiring (including invited faculty), professional growth and development of personnel, ensuring the professional competence of the entire staff.
- ✓ The HEI must demonstrate that the quality of the faculty composition corresponds to the established qualification requirements, the university strategy, and the goals of the educational program.
- ✓ The head of the EP must demonstrate the change in the role of the teacher in connection with the transition to student-centered learning and teaching.
- ✓ The HEI must provide opportunities for career growth and professional development of the faculty, including young teachers.
- ✓ The HEI must attract specialists from relevant fields to teaching, who have professional competencies that meet the requirements of the educational program.
- ✓ The HEI must demonstrate the presence of a mechanism for motivating the professional and personal development of the faculty.
- ✓ The university must demonstrate the widespread use of information and communication technologies and software by the faculty in the educational process (for example, online learning, e-portfolio, MOOCs, etc.).
- ✓ The HEI must demonstrate the focus of its activities on the development of academic mobility, attracting the best foreign and domestic teachers.
- ✓ The HEI must demonstrate the involvement of each teacher in promoting the culture of quality and academic integrity at the university, determine the contribution of the faculty, including invited ones, to achieving the goals of the EP.
- ✓ An important factor is the involvement of the faculty in the development of the economy, education, science and culture of the region and the country.

### Evidential part

At Esil University, the selection and placement of scientific and pedagogical personnel is carried out in accordance with the requirements of the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan: the Constitution of the RK, the Labor Code of the RK, the Civil Code of the RK, the Laws of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education" and personnel policy (P EsU 19-14), the Rules of Internal Labor Regulations and Corporate Ethics of the Esil University Institution (PEsU 20-05), the Regulations for the Selection and Hiring of Personnel of the Esil University Institution (P EsU20-11), the Rules for Competitive Substitution of Positions of the Professorial and Teaching Staff of the Esil University Institution (PrEsU 20-01).

Personnel procedures at the university are transparent. Information on the competitive substitution of positions of teaching staff is posted on the university website. The job responsibilities of the EP employees are spelled out in job descriptions stored in the Human Resources Department.

The university observes all personnel procedures: selection criteria (openness) based on objective and transparent criteria (required qualifications, individual abilities, professional knowledge, work experience); the procedure for appointing and hiring TS on a competitive basis; promotion to relevant positions, the decision on which is based on the same objective criteria as hiring and is the result of transparency and fairness of personnel procedures. The quantitative and

qualitative composition of the TS to the requirements and structure of the curricula for educational programs.

The criteria for hiring TS are work experience, level of training (education, advanced training), competence, special skills, publications, business and moral qualities, etc.

The personnel policy is implemented through the possibility of continuous internal training and development of TS (advanced training), which is necessary for the university at the present time and in the future, through the involvement of young employees with other personal characteristics and qualifications in the team in order to ensure the influx of new ideas and the reproduction of personnel.

The appointment to a position is formalized by an act of the employer (an order of the rector of the university), issued based on the concluded employment contract. Promotion (to a higher position) is formalized by an order of the rector of the university with the conclusion of an additional agreement based on the submission of the supervised vice-rector, considering the achieved results, business and personal qualities and professional training. The transfer of the TS to a higher position is formalized by an order of the rector of the university with the conclusion of an additional agreement based on the decision of the Competition Committee or the submission of the head of the department through the Academic Council of the university in accordance with the submitted documents (decision of the department based on the results of attending classes, length of service, advanced training, number of publications, etc.).

The reasons for dismissal are moving, reaching retirement age, health condition.

Information about the TS is posted on the University website in the section "Faculties" - "Departments" - "Staff". This information contains personal data, information about the subjects taught, the academic interests of the teacher, and advanced training.

Among the TS providing the educational process every year there are teachers awarded with badges, titles, certificates of honor and letters of thanks from the relevant ministry and government agencies.

In the 2023-2024 academic year, 57 teachers are teaching in EP 6B04105 "Accounting and Audit", including 5 PhDs, 17 Candidates of Sciences, and 4 Doctors of Economics. The percentage of teachers with a degree is 46%. EP 7M04107/08 - "Accounting and Audit" is served by 10 teachers, including teaching staff teaching general education disciplines, including 10 teachers with academic degrees (100.0%). EP 7M04103 "Public and Local Government" (Master's program) involves 10 teachers in the educational process, including 9 full-time and 1 part-time teacher. Among them are 3 Doctors of Sciences, 4 Candidates of Sciences, and 3 PhDs, the percentage of teachers with a degree is 100%. Thus, accredited educational programs are provided with highly qualified teaching staff with basic education that corresponds to the program profile, which allows for interchangeability and electiveness in all disciplines. Many teachers are holders of the "Best Teacher of the Year" grant.

The choice of teaching methods and technologies, teaching styles of "Esil University" is based on the principles of the Bologna process: fundamentality, innovation and individualization of education. The high-quality composition of the TS carries out systematic work to improve teaching methods, increase the level of scientific and methodological culture, introduce the results of scientific research into the content of the curricula of disciplines, actively search for technologies that ensure the achievement of high-quality results in training personnel, a high level of professional competence.

One of the main criteria for the effectiveness of Research Work at the University is the implementation of fundamental and applied research projects. An indicator of the particular relevance of the scientific activities of the University is its participation in the implementation of fundamental, research projects in the line of state policy. In order to meet the requirements of the modular educational program for the accredited EPs, famous scientists and practitioners are invited to conduct classes.

The range of specialists who were attracted by the University, or more precisely, by the graduating departments, to transfer knowledge and form a real understanding of the profession in future graduates is quite wide - managers and employees of various levels of divisions of enterprises of different functional and industry focus, financial analysts, representatives of the business environment. Results due to the involvement of practicing teachers: due to the involvement of practicing teachers, the educational results and cognitive interest of the EP students in their future profession increased; transfer of experience directly from the first person; the ability to illustrate theoretical provisions with practical examples; original presentation of material, the author's view; identification of the most talented students and employment of graduates in accordance with the profile of training; expansion of the horizon of theoretical knowledge for the practitioners themselves in the process of preparing for classes; the possibility of concluding a cooperation agreement with the enterprises from which the teacher-practitioner was recruited.

For the development of the economy, education, science and culture of the region and the country, the TS of the accredited EP have published a large number of scientific works (study guides, monographs, textbooks, scientific articles in the journals of the CQAFES RK, in international peer-reviewed scientific journals Scopus, Web of Science Core Collection, international conferences), there are author's certificates.

In connection with the ongoing educational and methodological seminars on the EP of the cluster, the efficiency of the educational process has significantly increased due to the adaptation of multimedia, the active use of slide materials in practical and theoretical classes, the use of electronic textbooks and the use of interactive resources. The topics of diploma and master's theses have been updated. Open classes were held as part of the exchange of pedagogical experience.

In accordance with the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education", the University has developed Qualification Characteristics of Teaching Staff Positions. The requirements set forth in the Qualification Characteristics are aimed at increasing the effectiveness of their work, work activity, business initiative and competence, the most complete use of their professional and creative potential, rational organization of work and ensuring its effectiveness.

For the effectiveness and efficiency of the work of the TS, the University has created all favorable conditions. Each teacher in the department is provided with a personal workstation, a computer, the necessary documentation, a library fund, etc.

In the context of dynamic processes occurring in higher education, the problem of motivating teachers is of particular importance.

Based on general principles, Esil University is developing its own motivation system for TS, taking into account the professional focus and Development Strategy of the University.

Esil University has defined strategic development directions and is introducing modern educational technologies. The main factor ensuring the successful operation of the university in achieving its goals is the teaching staff, which carries out educational, methodological, scientific and educational activities. The increasing role and responsibility of teachers necessitates identifying their potential and improving their motivation.

Currently, material (direct and indirect) and non-material (organizational and moral) incentives and motivators are used in the practice of stimulation and motivation.

At Esil University, organizational methods of non-material motivation are interesting, which include public recognition, which consists in the fact that particularly distinguished employees are presented for encouragement (gratitude / certificate of honor, valuable gifts) of the top management of the organization - the rector, the trade union committee of teaching staff, as well as presentations for encouragement (gratitude / certificate of honor) of the Minister of Science and Higher Education of the RK with further dissemination of information about the achievements of employees on the university website.

At Esil University, there is also a mechanism for stimulating the publication activity of the TS, the main goals of which are to intensify the activities of the TS to promote publications in

highly rated scientific journals and, accordingly, to improve the university's positions in various rankings. The amount of incentives is determined in the Regulation on bonuses and payment of additional allowances to employees of Esil University - <http://old.esil.edu.kz/upload/iblock/cd7/Polozhenie-o-stimulirovanii-publikatsionnoy-aktivnosti-PPS.pdf>

With the transition to student-centered learning, the role of the teacher has changed, a partnership model of relationships is being built, where the teacher acts as a partner and mentor in relation to the students.

Esil University implements student-centered learning according to various criteria: assessment of students' knowledge (systematic monitoring in order to improve the educational process, availability of criteria and methods of assessment, assessment by several examiners, consideration of mitigating circumstances, formal appeal procedure); supporting the sense of autonomy of students (self-assessment of students - greater availability of samples of scientific works of master's and doctoral students, Code of Honor of students, participation of students in the development of educational programs); social dimension (the policy of the university to support the diversity of needs and interests of students), since all master's and doctoral students have needs that go beyond the curriculum; learning outcomes (implementation of a competency-based approach, procedures for recognizing informal and non-formal learning, published procedures for admission of master's and doctoral students.

Esil University has a trade union committee, whose members are provided with financial assistance. In the summer, employees are provided with a 30% discount on the cost of a standard room for spa treatment within Kazakhstan, financial support for organizing group recreation.

Monitoring of satisfaction of the TS with working conditions is carried out by the administration regularly. For these purposes, a survey of the TS was conducted at the university. According to the survey results, it can be stated that the majority of the TS are satisfied with the working conditions and services available at the university.

The departments carry out systematic work to form the staff and reserve of the TS, ensuring the implementation of educational programs.

The qualifications of the TS correspond to all profiles of educational programs and taught disciplines, which is confirmed by the presence of diplomas in the relevant specialties, certificates, issued educational and teaching aids, publications of articles and monographs.

The main areas of formation of the personnel reserve and development of the personnel potential of the TS are: scientific internships, advanced training of the TS, academic mobility of the TS, training in PhD doctoral programs.

Academic mobility of the TS is carried out in accordance with agreements (contracts) on cooperation with partner universities and is carried out to participate in the academic, educational process of the partner university. The preferred method of implementing academic mobility of the TS is their secondment to partner universities and educational organizations or online mobility for: giving lectures, conducting classes and consultations; participation in scientific work within the framework of joint scientific projects and programs; participation in advanced training programs, including participation in summer and winter schools; internships.

Mobility of the TS is allowed on the basis of an invitation from universities without signing cooperation agreements.

The main criteria for the selection of TS for incoming and outgoing academic mobility are: 1) relevant basic and postgraduate education in the relevant educational program; 2) TS candidacies are submitted upon request in accordance with the conditions of the partner university; 3) resume / CV (Europass); 4) a certificate confirming the appropriate level of knowledge of a foreign language (only in cases of studying in a foreign language).

The criteria for the preliminary selection of TS for academic mobility at Esil University and for incoming academic mobility from partner universities are carried out in accordance with

the Regulation on the academic mobility of students and faculty members of the Esil University Institution (P EsU University 11-05) <https://esil.edu.kz/upload/iblock/706/P-ob-akadem.-mobil.pdf>

### ***Analytical part***

The EEC Commission was convinced that the university follows the human resources management policy in strict accordance with the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan and internal documents. The main goal of the personnel policy is the effective management and development of the human potential of the university, maintaining the optimal quantitative and qualitative composition of employees, as well as their professional and social development. Employees who successfully pass the competition for vacant positions are provided with all the necessary conditions for effective work. The university actively develops human resources, providing faculty with the appropriate education and academic degrees.

In addition, it was established that the TS must personally sign when familiarizing themselves with internal university regulations related to personnel issues, and decisions regarding procedural issues must be presented to the TS by the university's personnel service. The EEC Commission was convinced that leading teachers are qualified practitioners in their fields and are able to ensure high quality education.

During the interview, it became clear that the development of the personality of the faculty is one of the key areas of the university's work. Various incentive methods are used in the context of scientific, pedagogical, theoretical and practical activities. For example, the university pays bonuses for the publication of articles in highly rated journals depending on the category of the journal. The experts were convinced that the university actively supports the personal development of teachers of the main programs, which is reflected in additional incentives for activity in publications in peer-reviewed international scientific journals Web of Science (Web of Knowledge) and Scopus. This fact is confirmed by the results of the faculty survey, where 95.2% of the surveyed TS rated the support of the university and its management for the research initiatives of the TS as "very good" and "good".

Also, during the interview, the EP management demonstrated their readiness to involve practitioners in the relevant fields in teaching. To the question "How often are master classes and classes with the participation of practitioners held within your course?" 28.6% of respondents answered "very often", 42.9% - "often" and 28.6% answered "sometimes". The teaching staff has a sufficient level of pedagogical qualifications, teachers have practical experience to provide high-quality education. Active work is also underway to prepare employees and TS for the development of academic mobility within the EP. As part of the accumulation and integration of various methods, the priority for the initial period of the EP development is the involvement of leading domestic and foreign specialists in the field of accounting and management.

The staffing level of the teaching staff for the accredited educational programs corresponds to 100%, the level of academic degrees of the teaching staff for all educational programs corresponds to regulatory requirements. Thus, 57 teachers teach in educational program 6B04105 "Accounting and Audit", including 5 PhDs, 17 Candidates of Science, and 4 Doctors of Economics. The degree rate is 46%. 10 teachers serve in educational program 7M04107/08 - "Accounting and Audit", including teaching staff teaching general education disciplines, including 10 teachers with academic degrees (100.0%). 10 teachers are involved in the educational process in educational program 7M04103 "State and Local Government" (Master's program), of which 9 are full-time and 1 teacher is a part-time worker. Among them are 3 doctors of science, 4 candidates of economic sciences, and 3 PhD doctors, the degree rate is 100%. The VEC notes a strong position on the quality of the teaching staff, established qualification requirements, the university strategy, and the goals of the educational program.

During the interview, the commission notes that support for university employees in order to improve the institution's activities is carried out through material and moral incentives, as well as the allocation of the necessary resources. According to the results of the student survey, the overwhelming majority of students (97%) agree with the statement that teachers present the material in an accessible and engaging manner, and also meet the requirements for personal development and professional growth. The teaching staff of the grading departments makes significant efforts to maintain a high interest in learning and ensure the quality of the educational process. The university has implemented a KPI system with the gradation of "platinum", "gold", "silver". However, according to the results of the interview with the teaching staff, a lack of understanding of this system was established, the teaching staff was not involved in its development.

Teachers engaged in teaching in accredited educational programs use a variety of modern teaching methods, encourage students to engage in scientific research, and use information and communication technologies to varying degrees. However, they did not present their own methodological developments to the VEK or demonstrate online resources such as massive open online courses (MOOCs), online cases, etc.

The results of the staff survey showed that teachers at Esil University can apply their own methods in the teaching process? 69% of respondents (29 people) assessed this opportunity as "very good" and 31% (13 people) - as good. All lecturers noted that the University provides conditions for continuous professional development of employees. This clearly indicates prospects for qualitative and professional growth of the teaching staff.

***Strengths/best practice in EP "7M04103-State and Local Governance, 7M04104-State and Local Governance, 6B04105-Accounting and Audit, 7M04107-Accounting and Audit, 7M04108-Accounting and Audit":***

- The HEI demonstrates compliance of the qualitative composition of the teaching staff with the established qualification requirements, the HEI strategy, and the objectives of the EP.

***Recommendations for the EP "7M04103-State and Local Government, 7M04104-State and Local Government, 6B04105-Accounting and Audit, 7M04107-Accounting and Audit, 7M04108-Accounting and Audit":***

- The university management should hold seminars by October 1, 2024 to discuss and explain the parameters of KPI indicators, establish a clear gradation of the point system and the amount of cash payments based on the results of achieving the status of "platinum", "gold", "silver".

- The department management should actively introduce information and communication technologies into the teaching process (e.g. e-portfolio and online learning) and develop e-materials and Massive Open Online Courses (MOOCs) continuously.

***Conclusions of the EEC by criteria:***

**According to the standard "Teaching staff", the educational programs "7M04103-State and local government, 7M04104-State and local government, 6B04105-Accounting and audit, 7M04107-Accounting and audit, 7M04108-Accounting and audit" have 1 strong, 8 satisfactory positions and 1 requires improvement.**

#### 6.8. Standard "Educational resources and student support systems"

✓ *The university must ensure that the infrastructure and educational resources, including material and technical resources, meet the goals of the educational program.*

✓ *The management of the educational program must demonstrate the sufficiency of classrooms, laboratories and other facilities equipped with modern equipment to ensure the achievement of the educational program goals.*

✓ *The university must demonstrate that the information resources meet the needs of the university and the educational programs being implemented, including in the following areas:*

✓ *technological support for students and faculty in accordance with educational programs (e.g. online learning, modeling, databases, data analysis programs);*

✓ *library resources, including a collection of educational, methodological and scientific literature on general educational, basic and specialized disciplines on paper and electronic media, periodicals, access to scientific databases;*

✓ *examination of research results, graduate theses, dissertations for plagiarism;*

✓ *access to educational Internet resources;*

✓ *functioning of WI-FI on its territory.*

✓ *The university must demonstrate that it creates conditions for conducting scientific research, integrating science and education, publishing the results of scientific research work of the teaching staff, employees and students.*

✓ *The university must strive to ensure that the educational equipment and software used for mastering educational programs are similar to those used in the relevant sectors of the economy.*

✓ *The management of the educational program must demonstrate the availability of procedures for supporting various groups of students, including information and consulting.*

✓ *The management of the educational program must demonstrate the availability of conditions for the student to advance along an individual educational trajectory.*

✓ *The university must consider the needs of various groups of students (adults, working people, foreign students, as well as students with special educational needs).*

✓ *The university must ensure that the infrastructure meets security requirements.*

The need for material and technical resources and infrastructure of EP 7M04103/04 "State and Local Government" and EP 6B04105/7M04107, 7M04108 - "Accounting and Audit" is determined taking into account the forms of training, educational programs, and the student body. To ensure sufficiency, monitoring of resource needs is carried out annually by surveying students, summarizing applications, and the needs of departments and divisions.

Information and library resources used to organize the learning process are sufficient and meet the requirements of each educational program being implemented.

The library fund is an integral part of the information resources and includes educational, educational and methodological, scientific, reference, industrial and practical literature, legislative and regulatory legal acts, as well as additional literature for personal self-development.

The number of publications in Kazakh, Russian or other languages of instruction in the library collection is proportional to the contingent of students in the languages of instruction.

The quality of the collection meets modern requirements for training specialists in the university profile for operational library services and information and bibliographic services for graduate students, doctoral students and teachers.

The information portal providing a wide range of information sources is the University Website and the Scientific Library page on the website. <https://esil.edu.kz/ru/about/library/>. This page provides sections such as: repository, databases, information about Kazakhstan, official Kazakhstan, inclusive education, free electronic resources of more than 100 titles. The Scientific Library owns more than 100 titles of textbooks translated into Kazakh under the project "New Humanitarian Education: 100 New Textbooks in the Kazakh Language". A total of 5,300 copies

of books were delivered from the "National Translation Bureau" to our library. All these books can also be read online on our website at the link: Open University of Kazakhstan: <https://openu.kz/ru/books>.

The work on book supply is carried out jointly with the departments. The library fund is completed with modern editions, which are often accompanied by materials on audio, video cassettes and floppy discs. They are reflected in all catalogues of the library.

The library has 7 reading rooms for 250 seats, including 1 electronic reading room, a periodicals room, an electronic room, a scientific literature room, a fiction room and two book depositories. The library has at its disposal 40 computers, 1 large-size photocopier, 3 MFPs. All computers are connected to the INTERNET network, students have access to information resources, various databases, collections of digitised documents, websites and web portals.

The library is available to the faculty and students throughout the day: reading rooms are open from 8.00 to 19.00 hours without a lunch break, the lending room is open from 9.00 to 19.00 hours without a break. Thus, the demands and needs of the students of the university were taken into account. The library employs qualified, professionally - competent staff providing various library services. The staff is in constant search of new forms and methods of work with users.

The individual plans of teachers of the cluster EP departments obligatorily provide for the development and updating of information resources of the EP: presentations of training courses using interactive whiteboards, multimedia projectors, media libraries, electronic stands, audio-video equipment, video projectors, phono-video libraries, videoconferences. Analysis of the criterion of sufficiency of information resources and support systems for students are systematically reviewed at departmental meetings.

The indicators of material and technical equipment of the educational process are a characteristic of the institute's potential and a guarantee of its sustainability. The Institute carries out a set of measures to form a modern material base, information space and effectively developed communication infrastructure, as well as to introduce new forms and methods of providing educational services based on modern information technologies, the University has developed an official documented procedure of material and technical base.

The issues of material, technical and information support of the educational process during the reporting period were repeatedly considered at meetings of the department and collegial bodies of the university.

Interactive whiteboards, projectors, electronic encyclopedias and textbooks are actively used in the educational process. The lectures regularly include viewing of demo slides and videos. Field classes have also become traditional, involving practitioners in teaching and developing elective disciplines and reviewing them.

In order to improve the quality of training specialists in the Department of Education and educational and methodological work of the department, educational and methodological seminars are held, which address current and current issues of educational and methodological work of the department.

The logistical, library and information resources used to organize the learning process of the cluster are sufficient and meet the requirements of the educational program being implemented. The University has high technical equipment with modern computers. An information database has been created that functions within each structural unit and allows you to quickly and flexibly solve production issues.

The students of the cluster have advisors assigned to them, who coordinate the educational process. Individual work of teaching staff with students is provided in the syllabus for each discipline. Additionally, in order to develop the professional competencies of students and conduct research work of doctoral and undergraduates in the educational process, branches and laboratories of departments are used.



In general, the logistical, library and information resources used to organize the learning process at Esil University are sufficient, meet the requirements of each implemented cluster support and meet their purpose.

All classrooms used in the educational process of the cluster are connected to the global Internet and the local network of the university. Most of the classrooms are decorated with stands, students of the cluster use interactive whiteboards, projectors and computer rooms of the university, connected to a local network and connected to broadband Internet access - 100 MB/s.

The classrooms are equipped with projectors and computers. There is also a Wi-Fi Internet connection at the university. All electrical appliances and office equipment comply with safety requirements. The classrooms are fully equipped with furniture and office equipment – study desks and chairs, light-pro, marker boards, large lecture halls are equipped with microphones.

The provision of information resources in the context of the OP cluster and the basic equipment of the University with information resources correspond to the indicators of the Strategic Development Plan of the university. Students and teaching staff of the cluster have constant access to the WI-FI network both in academic buildings and in dormitories.

Safety requirements at the university are implemented on the basis of: current Legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan; resolutions, orders of higher authorities, methodological and other materials on occupational safety, safety, industrial sanitation and fire protection; orders and orders of the Rector of the university; labor regulations; norms, methodological materials and instructions on occupational safety in educational laboratories and classrooms; occupational health and safety requirements.

Teachers of the cluster use innovative technologies of active learning (situational learning technologies, case study, brainstorming, group discussion) aimed at developing students' competencies and include analysis of production situations, solving situational problems, business games, modeling of professional activity in the educational process, contextual learning, organization of professionally oriented educational and research works. The UMKD of educational programs necessarily contains those competencies that the student acquires as a result of studying this discipline.

Indicators of the material and technical equipment of the educational process are a characteristic of the university's potential and a guarantee of its sustainability. The University is implementing new forms and methods of providing educational services based on modern information technologies

Indicators of the material and technical equipment of the educational process are a characteristic of the university's potential and a guarantee of its sustainability. The University is implementing new forms and methods of providing educational services based on modern information technologies

To date, the university's computer equipment fleet consists of 579 personal computers. Of these, 343 PCs are used in the educational process, 152 PCs and 59 laptops are used by structural units. The University has 21 computer classes and 24 lecture halls equipped with multimedia projectors, projection screens and interactive whiteboards. The computers used in the educational process have software installed according to the studied disciplines (56 programs).

In total, 47 multimedia projectors, 15 interactive whiteboards, and 19 projection screens are used.

All computer classes are equipped with video surveillance systems operating in HD format.

In addition, it is possible to record video sessions, which in turn allows students to view lectures in the cluster. In addition to all the main modules, additional modules for recording audio lectures and connecting to the world knowledge base Wikipedia have also been introduced, which significantly help the university faculty to enhance the interactive capabilities of their e-courses.

The university also has an automated information system Platonus, which allows to comprehensively automate the processes of credit and distance learning systems. For each student

and employee, there is a so-called personal account (personal web page), which allows university staff to automate their main tasks, students to see the necessary information. The main IP of the university provides all the main business processes of the University using credit technology of education. It runs on Windows Server OS, uses MySQL database, Tomcat is used as a web server. AIS "Platonus" is developed in the Java programming language. It has advantages: improved user-friendly interface; the ability to use it for different academic degrees; flexible testing settings; the ability to receive statistical reports on academic performance by qualitative indicator; additional functions when creating curricula; the ability to assign appeals and retake reports. Additionally, modules for printing applications to diplomas, an integration module with 1C Accounting and the Active Directory naming service were purchased. A mobile application has been developed to organize access to systems using mobile devices and modern gadgets.

Thus, the equipment used in the implementation of the OP meets the needs and meets modern multimedia requirements.

The students of the cluster are connected at the University around the clock to the Wi-Fi wireless Internet access system, consisting of 9 Internet access points and the University's local network. The students of the department living in the dormitory also have the opportunity to use the Wi-Fi wireless Internet access system, consisting of 4 Internet access points, around the clock. Consultations, reviews of control and certification works are implemented in three ways: On-line, via chat and using the capabilities of the forum in the Platonus system and the Distance Learning Portal; In Off-line mode - through the use of the forum and e-mail, as well as in the Platonus system.

Students are consulted directly in the classrooms in accordance with the approved schedule of the OP placed on the stands. Accessibility, adequacy and relevance of the learning environment are systematically monitored, and these issues are reflected in the minutes of department meetings.

The university has a website that provides information support for students and teaching staff. Entrance to the site is possible upon registration and guest visit. The site information is updated as needed.

The needs of various groups of students in the context of the OP cluster are taken into account by the dean's office, the department. The university has identified groups of students: children from large families, incomplete families, low-income, disabled, orphans who can apply for educational benefits according to the Regulations on the Provision of educational Benefits of the Esil University institution (<http://old.esil.edu.kz/upload/iblock/9ae/polozhenie-o-predostavlenii-obrazovatelnykh-lgot.pdf>), employees and teaching staff of the university can also apply for these benefits. Departments where cluster OPS are involved, together with deans, study the needs of such students and promptly respond to problems that have arisen. Each group has its own chat, so the head of the group and the curator are always in touch and can provide information support. The curators form a passport of the group, which contains information: the address of residence, contact details of the students.

### ***The analytical part***

Universities provide adequate learning resources and student support services to achieve the goals of their educational programs. The entire infrastructure, special classrooms and their operation are aimed at the successful implementation of educational tasks.

During the work of the commission, the university demonstrated the sufficiency of material and technical resources and infrastructure intended for various groups of students in training programs. Equal opportunities and unhindered access were provided for students with special educational needs.

Only 85.1% of respondents are fully or partially satisfied with classrooms and classrooms for large groups. At the same time, 12.7% of students who took part in the survey are partially or completely dissatisfied and 2.2% find it difficult to answer this question. The WEC notes that the

management of the OP needs to provide for the equipping of specialized classrooms and laboratories with modern equipment for accredited OP.

All conditions for training have been created for students, this is full provision and accessibility of the necessary information and technical resources. An important element of the system for ensuring a high level of sufficiency of resources and student support systems is regular monitoring of student satisfaction with the quality of the educational process, which is carried out through a questionnaire. Students express their opinions in the process of oral interviews and conversations with teachers, heads of departments, and university management.

All structural units are involved in informing and advising students, which solve any issues of students. Thus, 67.2% (90 people) are fully satisfied with informing the requirements in order to successfully complete this educational program (specialty) and 27.6% of respondents (37 people) are partially satisfied, 1.5% (2 people) are partially dissatisfied, 2.2% (3 people) are not satisfied, 1.5% of respondents (2 people) or the respondents found it difficult to answer.

Taking into account the needs of students (working, adults, international students and students with special educational needs), the VEC notes that physical and technical resources and infrastructure meet the requirements, there is free access to educational Internet resources. The university has a Wi-Fi Internet connection. The results of the survey of students show that only 79.1% of respondents (106 people) are fully or partially satisfied with the availability and quality of Internet resources and 17.1% (23 people) are partially dissatisfied and dissatisfied. Also, the survey of teaching staff showed that 38.1% of teaching staff (16 people) sometimes face a lack of Internet access or weak Internet, and 61.9% of respondents (26 people) replied that they had never had problems with the Internet. According to the results of a survey of students and measurements of the Internet speed made directly by experts, it was found that the University has a very low Internet connection speed at the level of 1-3 Mbit/s.

In general, the available educational materials, technologies and information and library resources used in the organization of the educational process fully comply with the stated mission, goals and objectives, as well as meet the requirements of the educational program.

***Strengths/best practices for the OP*** «7M04103-State and local government», «7M04104-State and local Government», «6B04105-Accounting and auditing», «7M04107-Accounting and auditing», «7M04108-Accounting and Auditing»:  
**not identified.**

***Recommendations for the OP*** «7M04103-State and local government», «7M04104-State and local government», «6B04105-Accounting and audit», «7M04107-Accounting and audit», «7M04108-Accounting and audit»:

- The management of the OP, until February 1, 2025, plans for the development of the OP include equipping specialized classrooms and laboratories with modern equipment for accredited OP, which will ensure the achievement of the goals of the OP
- The management of the university in the 2024-2025 academic year will strengthen and adjust the work of Wi-Fi, providing high-speed and uninterrupted connection to the entire campus.

***The conclusions of the WEC according to the criteria:***

**According to the standard** «Educational resources and student support systems», the educational programs «7M04103-State and local Government», «7M04104-State and local Government», «6B04105-Accounting and audit», «7M04107-Accounting and audit», «7M04108-Accounting and Audit» have 13 satisfactory positions.

### 6.9. The standard «Informing the public»

- ✓ *The university guarantees that the published information is accurate, objective, relevant and reflects all areas of the university's activities within the framework of the educational program.*
- ✓ *Public awareness should include support and clarification of the national development programs of the country and the system of higher and postgraduate education.*
- ✓ *The university management should use a variety of ways to disseminate information (including mass media, web resources, information networks, etc.) to inform the general public and interested persons.*
- ✓ *Information about the educational program is objective, relevant and should include:*
  - ✓  *the purpose and planned results of the OP, the assigned qualification;*
  - ✓ *information about the assessment system of students' academic achievements;*
  - ✓ *information about academic mobility programs and other forms of cooperation with partner universities and employers;*
  - ✓ *information about the opportunities for the development of personal and professional competencies of students and employment;*
  - ✓  *data reflecting the positioning of the OP in the educational services market (at the regional, national, and international levels).*
  - ✓ *An important factor is the publication on open resources of reliable information about PPP, in terms of personalities.*
  - ✓ *The university must publish audited financial statements on its own web resource.*
  - ✓ *The university should post information and links to external resources based on the results of external assessment procedures.*
  - ✓ *An important factor is the posting of information about cooperation and interaction with partners, including scientific/consulting organizations, business partners, social partners and educational organizations.*

#### ***The evidentiary part***

The university management uses a variety of ways to disseminate information – this is the university's website, briefings conducted by the management, open days, job fairs at the University, round tables with heads of enterprises and organizations, exhibitions of achievements, demonstrations of implemented new technologies and equipment, career guidance months and weeks.

The purpose of the website is to develop a high-quality information environment of the university as a resource of educational, scientific networks and a national information resource. The information resource of the site is open and publicly accessible and is aimed at forming the image of the institute for prompt and objective public information about the university's activities.

Information on the implemented educational programs is systematically updated on the university's website - goals, results, qualifications <https://esil.edu.kz/educational-programs-department-of-management/> The University's website is available in three languages.

Information about the university's activities during the year is covered on the university's website, speeches by the management and teaching staff in the media, on social networks <https://www.facebook.com/esil.university>, [https://instagram.com/esil\\_university?igshid=YmMyMTA2M2Y](https://instagram.com/esil_university?igshid=YmMyMTA2M2Y).

The website contains profiles on teaching staff of departments (<https://esil.edu.kz/faculty-of-business-and-management/> which are updated as necessary, personal data, information about the disciplines being read, scientific interests of the teacher, and professional development are supplemented and edited. Information on the conditions of admission to all levels of education, on the qualifications received is available in the "Applicants" tab <https://esil.edu.kz/entrant/>.

Information about the scientific activities of teaching staff and students, requirements for reports, etc. are posted in the "Science" tab <https://esil.edu.kz/center-for-socio-economic-research/>

The implementation of international educational and scientific programs and projects is available in the "International Cooperation" tab <https://esil.edu.kz/cooperation/>

Information on the student's contingent, academic achievements in the context of the university's educational programs is available in the Platonus system, information on the contingent and graduation is integrated into the NOBD information portal – the National

Educational Database.

Information on financial activities is published annually on the university's website (a report for previous years <https://esil.edu.kz/finance-center/>), at the moment, the university has an audit commission for the past 2023.

Every year, the rector reports to the university staff on the results of the year and the tasks for the new academic year. (minutes of the meeting of the Academic Council No. September 2, 2022).

The preparation of information for posting on the university's Internet resources, except for information posted by educational departments and teachers on the educational portal, is carried out by interested structural units of Esil University.

The information is submitted under the signatures of the head of the department and the supervising vice-rector in at least three language versions: Kazakh, Russian and English. Those responsible for the publication post information approved by the Rector of the University on the Internet resources of Esil University, which has its own procedure for filling the Esil University online portal with information.

Satisfaction with information about the university's activities and the specifics and progress of educational programs is assessed through the rector's blog, and anyone can leave their innovative suggestions to improve the university's activities <http://old.esil.edu.kz/ru/registratsiya-innovatsionnykh-predlozheniy-po-uluchsheniyam-deyatelnosti-vuza>.

The preparation of information for posting on the university's Internet resources, except for information posted by educational departments and teachers on the educational portal, is carried out by interested structural units of Esil University.

Social networks are actively used, and WhatsApp groups and Facebook networks are being created to provide information about the OP to the target audience, and it is used to enhance the effectiveness of informing stakeholders about the OP, increasing the audience of listeners.

On the Esil University website (<https://esil.edu.kz>) there is adequate and objective information about educational programs in the context of personalities, which indicates the goals, results, assigned qualifications for all educational programs (<https://esil.edu.kz/department-of-accounting-and-audit/> according to the OP "Accounting and auditing", <https://esil.edu.kz/personnel-department-of-management/> according to the OP "GMU").

The University closely cooperates with enterprises and organizations of the city, on international cooperation, as well as on research work, on admission to industrial practice and work, memorandums and agreements on mutual cooperation have been concluded with all of them <https://esil.edu.kz/partners-for-international-cooperation/>.

International cooperation with partner universities is carried out in two main directions: educational and research. One of the important parameters of the Bologna process is to ensure academic mobility of the teaching staff (hereinafter referred to as teaching staff) and students. Currently, academic mobility at Esil University is carried out within the framework of concluded agreements and memoranda with 22 national and 79 foreign universities).

### ***The analytical part***

In the course of the work of the VEC, interviews were conducted with the university management, teachers and students, as a result of which the objectivity and reliability of the published data on the educational program were revealed. The staff can get full information about the program on the official website of the university. It was noted that the provision of information on topical issues is carried out both through the website and through the internal networks of the university. A survey among students showed that the content and information content of the web page as a whole:

- 64.2% of students (86 people) are completely satisfied;
- 29.9% (40 people) are partially satisfied;

- 3.7% (5 people) are partially dissatisfied;
- 0.7% (1 person) of students who took part in the survey are not satisfied;
- 1.5% (2 people) find it difficult to answer.

The tabs of the university's website do not always contain up-to-date information about the OP. They mainly contain general information, including information about the goals and planned results of the OP, the qualifications awarded, information about the student performance assessment system, information about various forms of cooperation with partner universities and employers, about the personal and professional development of students and their employment opportunities, about the position of the OP in the educational services market.

The WEC notes that each department has a tab in the general website of the university. Since these pages are poorly structured by sections (in particular "documents"), the information sought is not well structured or relevant, which makes it difficult for interested parties to find it. Information is often presented in fragments or posted on different pages of the site.

The University actively promotes the national development programs of the country and the system of higher and postgraduate education. However, information about the university's participation in the implementation of these programs is not always available. The University also participates in external evaluation, including national and international ratings, however, information on the accreditation of the University with links to external resources based on the results of external evaluation procedures is not reflected on the website.

According to the requirements of this standard, the information published by the university must be accurate, objective, relevant and reflect the entire range of activities of the university within the framework of the educational program. The WEC notes that, although the published information is accurate and objective, it is not always relevant and reflects the entire range of activities of the university within the framework of the implementation of the OP.

***Strengths/best practices of the OP «7M04103-State and local government», «7M04104-State and local government», «6B04105-Accounting and audit», «7M04107-Accounting and audit», «7M04108-Accounting and audit»: not identified.***

***Recommendations for the OP «7M04103-State and local government», «7M04104-State and local government», «6B04105-Accounting and audit», «7M04107-Accounting and audit», «7M04108-Accounting and audit»:***

- By July 1, 2024, the management of the OP should analyze and systematize the "Documents" section on the pages of departments on the official website of the university and ensure the presentation of information in the context of educational programs.

- By September 1, 2024 and in the future, post on the university's website national programs for the development and system of higher professional education, information about the university's participation in the implementation of these programs.

- To post on the university's website by September 1, 2024 information about the accreditation of the OP and links to external resources based on the results of external assessment procedures (websites of accreditation agencies).

***The conclusions of the WEC according to the criteria:***

**According to the standard "Teaching staff" educational programs "7M04103-State and local government, 7M04104-State and local government, 6B04105-Accounting and audit, 7M04107-Accounting and audit, 7M04108-Accounting and audit" have 11 satisfactory positions and 1 requires improvement.**

## **(VII) OVERVIEW OF STRENGTHS/BEST PRACTICES FOR EACH STANDARD (design example)**

**According to the standard «Educational program Management»:**  
*the strengths of this standard have not been identified.*

**According to the «Information Management and Reporting» standard:**  
*the strengths of this standard have not been identified.*

**According to the standard «Development and approval of an educational program»:**  
*the strengths of this standard have not been identified.*

**According to the standard «Continuous monitoring and periodic evaluation of educational programs»:**  
*the strengths of this standard have not been identified.*

**According to the standard «Student-centered learning, teaching and assessment of academic performance»:**  
*the strengths of this section have not been identified.*

**According to the «Students» standard:**  
An important factor is the availability of a support mechanism for gifted students.

**According to the standard «Teaching staff»:**  
The university will demonstrate the compliance of the qualitative composition of teaching staff with the established qualification requirements, the university's strategy, and the goals of the OP.

**According to the standard «Educational resources and student support systems»:**  
*the strengths of this section have not been identified.*

**According to the standard «Informing the public»:**  
*the strengths of this section have not been identified.*

## **(VIII) REVIEW OF QUALITY IMPROVEMENT RECOMMENDATIONS FOR EACH STANDARD**

**According to the standard «Educational program Management»:**  
***Recommendations for the OP «7M04103-State and local government», «7M04104-State and local government», «6B04105-Accounting and audit», «7M04107-Accounting and audit», «7M04108-Accounting and audit»:***

- Before the beginning of the 2024-2025 academic year, the university management will develop an internal regulatory document describing the uniform requirements for the development of plans for the development of educational programs of the university, taking into account:

- compliance of the development plan with the Development Strategy of the institution, national priorities and the needs of the labor market;

- involvement of employers, students and teaching staff in the preparation of a development plan for the;

- determining the individuality and uniqueness of the development plan of the University within the framework of the real positioning of the university;

- a mechanism for monitoring the implementation of the OP development plan and regular revision of the OP development plan.

- In the 2024-2025 academic year, the management of the OP will review the development plans of the OP, bring them into line with the newly established requirements.

- The management of the OP annually monitors the implementation of development plans for the implementation of target indicators, assesses the achievement of learning goals, meets the needs of stakeholders, and on this basis makes decisions aimed at continuous improvement of the OP. The results of monitoring should be communicated to all interested parties.

- By December 2025, the university management will develop and document the risk management procedure at the level of structural divisions and within the framework of the OP.

- During 2024, the university management should provide for innovation management in planning, reporting and activity procedures based on the implementation of all basic management functions, including planning, organization, stimulation, analysis.

- By the end of the 2024-2025 academic year, the management of the university and the OP should analyze the implementation of the recommendations of the WEC on accredited programs (previous and current accreditation procedures), include measures and measures for their implementation in the Development Plans of the OP and ensure full implementation.

**According to the «Information Management and Reporting» standard:**

***Рекомендации для ОП «7M04103-Государственное и местное управление, 7M04104-Государственное и местное управление, 6B04105-Учет и аудит, 7M04107-Учет и аудит, 7M04108-Учет и аудит»:***

- During 2024, the University management will develop an internal document regulating the conduct of surveys, including determining the levels and period of review of survey results, and taking corrective actions.

- The management of the university by the end of 2024 in the EsU 17-01 Regulation on the audit of educational programs, to include key indicators of the effectiveness and efficiency of the educational program, the level and period of their assessment.

**According to the standard «Development and approval of an educational program»:**

***Recommendations for the OP «7M04103-State and local government», «7M04104-State and local government», «6B04105-Accounting and audit», «7M04107-Accounting and audit», «7M04108-Accounting and audit»:***

- The university management annually conducts an external examination of the OP by various stakeholders, including employers, with discussion of the results at meetings of collegial management bodies and publication of the results on the official website of the university.

- By the end of 2024, the university management should amend the Regulation on the modular construction of educational programs in terms of including the requirement that the graduate model of the OP comply with the general university model of the appropriate level of education, as well as ensuring the active participation of all categories of stakeholders of the OP in collegial bodies implementing the development, revision, updating and monitoring of the quality of the OP. During 2025, the management of the OP will bring the models of graduates of accredited programs in line with university-wide models.

- By the beginning of the 2024-2025 academic year, the management of the OP should develop a Roadmap for the positioning of the OP in the national market.

- The university's management should analyze professional certification programs by June 20, 2024, determine the university's capabilities to prepare students for professional certification and develop an action plan on this issue by September 1, 2024.

- The management of the university by November 1, 2024 to analyze the university's capabilities for the implementation of double-degree and/ or joint SOP with foreign universities,



the management of the OP by December 30, 2024 to develop a Roadmap in this area, providing for measures to enhance career guidance, support teachers involved in their implementation and from September 1, 2026 start studying at double-degree and/or joint with foreign universities of the OP cluster.

**According to the standard «Continuous monitoring and periodic evaluation of educational programs»:**

***Recommendations for the OP «7M04103-State and local government», «7M04104-State and local government», «6B04105-Accounting and audit», «7M04107-Accounting and audit», «7M04108-Accounting and audit»:***

- Starting from September 1, 2024, the management of the OP will publish and keep up-to-date information about changes to each OP on the university's website in the section dedicated to the OP.

**According to the standard «Student-centered learning, teaching and assessment of academic performance»:**

***Recommendations for the OP «7M04103-State and local government», «7M04104-State and local government», «6B04105-Accounting and audit», «7M04107-Accounting and audit», «7M04108-Accounting and audit»:***

- The university management should include criteria in the teaching staff motivation system that motivate teachers to develop their own research in the field of teaching methods of the taught disciplines before September 1, 2025.

- The management of the Educational Institution should ensure the publication of criteria and methods for evaluating learning outcomes in syllabuses of academic disciplines by the beginning of the 2024-2025 academic year.

- In 2024, the management of the OP will plan training and advanced training of the teaching staff of the OP on modern methods of evaluating learning outcomes.

- By January 1, 2025, the management of the OP will develop and implement a feedback system on the use of various teaching methods and evaluation of learning outcomes

**According to the «Students» standard:**

***Recommendations for the OP «7M04103-State and local government», «7M04104-State and local government», «6B04105-Accounting and audit», «7M04107-Accounting and audit», «7M04108-Accounting and audit»:***

- The management of the Educational institution should develop a Roadmap for the development of academic mobility of students by September 1, 2024.

**According to the standard «Teaching staff»:**

***Recommendations for the OP «7M04103-State and local government», «7M04104-State and local government», «6B04105-Accounting and audit», «7M04107-Accounting and audit», «7M04108-Accounting and audit»:***

- By October 1, 2024, the university management will hold seminars to discuss and clarify the parameters of KPI indicators, establish a clear gradation of the point system and the amount of cash payments based on the results of achieving the status of "platinum", "gold", "silver".

- The management of the department should actively introduce information and communication technologies into the educational process (for example, e-portfolios and online training), as well as develop electronic materials and mass open online courses (MOOS) constantly.

**According to the standard «Educational resources and student support systems»:**

**Recommendations for the OP «7M04103-State and local government», «7M04104-State and local government», «6B04105-Accounting and audit», «7M04107-Accounting and audit», «7M04108-Accounting and audit»:**

- The management of the OP, until February 1, 2025, plans for the development of the OP include equipping specialized classrooms and laboratories with modern equipment for accredited OP, which will ensure the achievement of the goals of the OP

- The management of the university in the 2024-2025 academic year will strengthen and adjust the work of Wi-Fi, providing high-speed and uninterrupted connection to the entire campus.

**According to the standard "Informing the public":**

**Recommendations for the OP «7M04103-State and local government», «7M04104-State and local government», «6B04105-Accounting and audit», «7M04107-Accounting and audit», «7M04108-Accounting and audit»:**

- By July 1, 2024, the management of the OP should analyze and systematize the "Documents" section on the pages of departments on the official website of the university and ensure the presentation of information in the context of educational programs.

- By September 1, 2024 and in the future, post on the university's website national programs for the development and system of higher professional education, information about the university's participation in the implementation of these programs.

- To post on the university's website by September 1, 2024 information about the accreditation of the OP and links to external resources based on the results of external assessment procedures (websites of accreditation agencies).

## **(IX) OVERVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE ORGANIZATION OF EDUCATION**

There are no recommendations for the development of the university.

## **(X) RECOMMENDATION TO THE ACCREDITATION COUNCIL**

The members of the WEC came to the unanimous opinion that OP 7M04103-State and local government, 7M04104-State and local government, 6B04105-Accounting and audit, 7M04107-Accounting and audit, 7M04108-Accounting and audit are recommended for accreditation for a period of 5 years.

**Appendix 1. Evaluation Table "Parameters of the Specialized Profile" of the SE  
"7M04103-State and Local Administration, 7M04104-State and Local Administration,  
6B04105-Accounting and Audit, 7M04107-Accounting and Audit, 7M04108-Accounting  
and Audit"**

№ п\п	№ п\п	Evaluation criteria	The position of the educational organization			
			Strong	Satisfactory	Suggests improvement	Unsatisfactory
The standard "Educational Program Management"						
1	1.	The university should demonstrate the development of a goal and strategy for the development of the OP based on an analysis of external and internal factors with the broad involvement of a variety of stakeholders		+		
2	2.	The quality assurance policy should reflect the relationship between scientific research, teaching and learning		+		
3	3.	The university demonstrates the development of a culture of quality assurance		+		
4	4.	Commitment to quality assurance should apply to any activity performed by contractors and partners (outsourcing), including in the implementation of joint/double degree education and academic mobility		+		
5	5.	The management of the OP ensures transparency in the development of the OP development plan based on an analysis of its functioning, the real positioning of the university and the orientation of its activities to meet the needs of the state, employers, stakeholders and students			+	
6	6.	The management of the OP demonstrates the functioning of mechanisms for the formation and regular revision of the development plan of the OP and monitoring its implementation, evaluating the achievement of learning goals, meeting the needs of students, employers and society, and making decisions aimed at continuous improvement of the OP			+	
7	7.	The management of the OP should involve representatives of groups of interested persons, including employers, students and teaching staff in the formation of a development plan for the OP			+	
8	8.	The management of the educational institution should demonstrate the individuality and uniqueness of the educational institution's development plan, its consistency with national development priorities and the development strategy of the educational organization			+	
9	9.	The university must demonstrate a clear definition of those responsible for business processes within the framework of the OP, the distribution of staff responsibilities, and the differentiation of functions of collegial bodies		+/+		
10	10.	The management of the OP ensures coordination of the activities of all persons involved in the development and management of the OP, and its continuous implementation, as well as involves all stakeholders in this process		+		
11	11.	The management of the OP should ensure the transparency of the management system, the functioning of the internal quality assurance system, including its design, management and monitoring, and appropriate decision-making		+		
12	12.	The management of the OP should carry out risk management			+	
13	13.	The management of the educational institution should ensure the participation of representatives of interested persons (employers,		+		

		teaching staff, students) in the collegial management bodies of the educational program, as well as their representativeness in making decisions on the management of the educational program				
14	14.	The university must demonstrate innovation management within the framework of the OP, including the analysis and implementation of innovative proposals		+		
15	15.	The management of the educational institution should demonstrate its openness and accessibility to students of teaching staff, employers and other interested persons		+		
16	16.	The management of the OP confirms the completion of training in educational management programs		+		
17	17.	The management of the OP should strive to ensure that the progress made since the last external quality assurance procedure is taken into account when preparing for the next procedure			+	
Total according to the standard				11	6	
The Information Management and Reporting Standard						
18	1.	The university must ensure the functioning of the information collection, analysis and management system based on modern information and communication technologies and software		+		
19	2.	The management of the OP demonstrates the systematic use of processed, adequate information to improve the internal quality assurance system		+		
20	3.	The management of the OP demonstrates the existence of a reporting system reflecting the activities of all structural divisions and departments within the framework of the OP, including an assessment of their effectiveness		+		
21	4.	The university should determine the frequency, forms and methods of evaluating the management of the OP, the activities of collegial bodies and structural units, and senior management		+		
22	5.	The university must demonstrate a mechanism to ensure the protection of information, including the identification of responsible persons for the reliability and timeliness of information analysis and data provision		+		
23	6.	The university demonstrates the involvement of students, employees and teaching staff in the processes of collecting and analyzing information, as well as making decisions based on them		+		
24	7.	The management of the OP should demonstrate the availability of communication mechanisms with students, employees and other stakeholders, including conflict resolution		+		
25	8.	The university must ensure that the degree of satisfaction with the needs of teaching staff, staff and students within the framework of the OP is measured and demonstrate evidence of the elimination of the detected shortcomings		+		
26	9.	The university should evaluate the effectiveness and efficiency of its activities, including in the context of the OP		+		
		The information collected and analyzed by the university within the framework of the OP should take into account:				
27	10.	key performance indicators		+		
28	11.	dynamics of the contingent of students in the context of forms and types		+		
29	12.	academic performance, student achievements and expulsion		+		
30	13.	satisfaction of students with the implementation of the OP and the quality of education at the university		+		
31	14.	accessibility of educational resources and support systems for students		+		
32	15.	employment and career development of graduates		+		
33	16.	Students, staff and teaching staff must document their consent to the processing of personal data		+		
34	17.	The management of the OP should help to provide all necessary information in the relevant fields of science		+		
Total according to the standard				17	0	

The standard "Development and approval of an educational program"						
35	1.	The university must demonstrate the existence of a documented procedure for the development of an OP and its approval at the institutional level		+		
36	2.	The university must demonstrate the compliance of the developed OP with the established goals and planned learning outcomes		+		
37	3.	The management of the educational institution should determine the impact of disciplines and professional practices on the formation of learning outcomes		+		
38	4.	The university can demonstrate the existence of a graduate model of an OP describing learning outcomes and personal qualities			+	
39	5.	The qualification awarded upon completion of the OP must be clearly defined, explained and correspond to a certain level of the NSC, QF-EHEA		+		
40	6.	The management of the OP should demonstrate the modular structure of the program based on the European Credit Transfer and Accumulation System (ECTS), ensure that the OP and its modules (in terms of content and structure) meet the set goals with a focus on achieving the planned learning outcomes		+		
41	7.	The management of the educational institution should ensure that the content of academic disciplines and learning outcomes correspond to each other and the level of education (bachelor's, master's, doctoral studies)		+		
42	8.	The management of the OP must demonstrate the conduct of external expertise of the OP		+		
43	9.	The management of the OP must provide evidence of the participation of students, teaching staff and other stakeholders in the development of the OP, ensuring their quality		+		
44	10.	The management of the OP should demonstrate the positioning of the OP in the educational market (regional/ national/ international), its uniqueness		+		
45	11.	An important factor is the possibility of preparing students for professional certification			+	
46	12.	An important factor is the availability of a double-degree OP and/or joint OP with foreign universities		+		
Total according to the standard				10	2	
The standard "Continuous monitoring and periodic evaluation of basic educational programs"						
47	1.	The university should ensure the revision of the content and structure of the OP, taking into account changes in the labor market, the requirements of employers and the social demand of society		+		
48	2.	The university must demonstrate the existence of a documented procedure for monitoring and periodic evaluation of the OP in order to achieve the goal of the OP. The results of these procedures are aimed at continuous improvement of the OP		+		
		Monitoring and periodic evaluation of the OP should consider				
49	3.	the content of the programs in the context of the latest achievements of science and technology in a particular discipline		+		
50	4.	changes in the needs of society and the professional environment		+		
51	5.	workload, academic performance and graduation of students		+		
52	6.	effectiveness of student assessment procedures		+		
53	7.	the needs and satisfaction of students		+		
54	8.	compliance of the educational environment and the activities of support services with the goals of the OP		+		
55	9.	All interested parties should be informed of any planned or undertaken actions regarding the OP. All changes made to the OP must be published			+	

56	10.	Support services should identify the needs of different groups of students and their degree of satisfaction with the organization of training, teaching, assessment, and mastering of the OP in general		+		
Total according to the standard				9	1	
The standard "Student-centered learning, teaching and assessment of academic performance"						
57	1.	The management of the educational institution should ensure respect and attention to different groups of students and their needs, providing them with flexible learning paths		+		
58	2.	The management of the OP should ensure teaching based on modern achievements of world science and practice in the field of training, the use of various modern teaching methods and evaluation of learning outcomes that ensure the achievement of the goals of the OP, including competencies, skills to perform scientific work at the required level		+		
59	3.	The management of the OP should determine the mechanisms for distributing the educational load of students between theory and practice within the framework of the OP, ensuring the development of the content and achievement of the goals of the OP by each graduate		+		
60	4.	An important factor is the availability of own research in the field of teaching methods of the disciplines of the OP			+	
61	5.	The university must ensure that the procedures for evaluating learning outcomes are consistent with the planned results and goals of the OP		+		
62	6.	The university must ensure the consistency, transparency and objectivity of the mechanism for evaluating the results of OP training. Criteria and methods for evaluating learning outcomes should be published in advance			+	
63	7.	Evaluators should be familiar with modern methods of evaluating learning outcomes and regularly improve their skills in this area		+		
64	8.	The management of the OP should demonstrate the existence of a feedback system for the use of various teaching methods and evaluation of learning outcomes			+	
65	9.	The management of the OP should demonstrate support for the autonomy of students with simultaneous guidance and assistance from the teacher		+		
66	10.	The management of the educational institution must demonstrate the existence of a procedure for responding to student complaints		+		
Total according to the standard				7	3	
The "Students" standard						
67	1.	The university must demonstrate the policy of forming a contingent of students and ensure transparency of its procedures. The procedures governing the life cycle of students (from admission to completion) must be defined, approved, and published		+		
68	2.	The management of the educational institution should provide for special adaptation and support programs for newly enrolled and foreign students		+		
69	3.	The university must demonstrate compliance of its actions with the Lisbon Recognition Convention, including the existence and application of a mechanism for recognizing the results of academic mobility of students, as well as the results of additional, formal and non-formal education		+		
70	4.	The university should provide an opportunity for external and internal academic mobility of students, as well as assist them in obtaining external grants for training			+	
71	5.	The university should actively encourage students to self-education and development outside the main program (extracurricular activities)		+		
72	6.	An important factor is the availability of a support mechanism for gifted students	+			

73	7.	The university should demonstrate cooperation with other educational organizations and national centers of the "European Network of National Information Centers for Academic Recognition and Mobility/ National Academic Information Centers of Recognition" ENIC/NARIC in order to ensure comparable recognition of qualifications		+		
74	8.	The university must provide students with internship places, demonstrate the procedure for facilitating the employment of graduates, and maintain contact with them		+		
75	9.	The university must demonstrate the procedure for issuing graduates with documents confirming their qualifications, including the achieved learning outcomes		+		
76	10.	The management of the OP must demonstrate that graduates of the program have skills that are in demand in the labor market and that these skills are really in demand in the labor market		+		
77	11.	The management of the OP should demonstrate the existence of a mechanism for monitoring the employment and professional activities of graduates		+		
78	12.	An important factor is the presence of an active alumni association/association		+		
Total according to the standard			1	10	1	
The standard "Teaching staff"						
79	1.	The university should have an objective and transparent HR policy in the context of the OP, including hiring (including invited teaching staff), professional growth and staff development, ensuring the professional competence of the entire staff		+		
80	2.	The university must demonstrate that the qualitative composition of teaching staff meets the established qualification requirements, the university's strategy, and the goals of the OP	+			
81	3.	The management of the OP should demonstrate the change in the role of the teacher in connection with the transition to student-centered learning and teaching		+		
82	4.	The university should provide opportunities for career growth and professional development of teaching staff, including young teachers		+		
83	5.	The university should involve in teaching specialists from relevant industries with professional competencies that meet the requirements of the OP		+		
84	6.	The university must demonstrate the existence of a mechanism for motivating the professional and personal development of teaching staff		+		
85	7.	The university should demonstrate the widespread use of teaching staff of information and communication technologies and software in the educational process (for example, on-line training, e-portfolio, MOHS, etc.)			+	
86	8.	The university should demonstrate the focus of its activities on the development of academic mobility, attracting the best foreign and domestic teachers		+		
87	9.	The university must demonstrate the involvement of each teacher in promoting a culture of quality and academic integrity at the university, determine the contribution of teaching staff, including invited ones, to achieving the goals of the OP		+		
88	10.	An important factor is the involvement of teaching staff in the development of the economy, education, science and culture of the region and the country +		+		
Total according to the standard			1	8	1	
The standard "Educational resources and student support systems"						
89	1.	The university must ensure that educational resources, including logistical and infrastructure, meet the objectives of the educational program		+		

90	2.	The management of the OP must demonstrate the presence of classrooms, laboratories and other facilities equipped with modern equipment and ensuring the achievement of the goals of the OP		+		
		The university must demonstrate the compliance of information resources with the needs of the university and the implemented programs, including in the following areas:				
91	3.	technological support for students and teaching staff in accordance with educational programs (for example, online training, modeling, databases, data analysis programs)		+		
92	4.	library resources, including the collection of educational, methodological and scientific literature on general education, basic and profile disciplines on paper and electronic media, periodicals, access to scientific databases		+		
93	5.	library resources, including the collection of educational, methodological and scientific literature on general education, basic and profile disciplines on paper and electronic media, periodicals, access to scientific databases		+		
94	6.	access to educational Internet resources		+		
95	7.	the operation of WI-FI in its territory		+		
96	8.	The university must demonstrate that it creates conditions for conducting scientific research, integrating science and education, publishing the results of research work of teaching staff, staff and students		+		
97	9.	The university should strive to ensure that the educational equipment and software used for the development of educational programs are similar to those used in the relevant sectors of the economy		+		
98	10.	The university should strive to ensure that the educational equipment and software used for the development of educational programs are similar to those used in the relevant sectors of the economy		+		
99	11.	The management of the educational institution should show the availability of conditions for the advancement of the student along an individual educational trajectory		+		
100	12.	The university should take into account the needs of different groups of students (adults, working, foreign students, as well as students with special educational needs)		+		
101	13.	The university must ensure that the infrastructure meets the security requirements		+		
Total according to the standard			0	13	0	
The standard "Informing the public"						
102	1.	The information published by the university must be accurate, objective, relevant and reflect all areas of the university's activities within the framework of the educational program			+	
103	2.	Public awareness should include support and clarification of the national development programs of the country and the system of higher and postgraduate education		+		
104	3.	The university's management should use a variety of ways to disseminate information (including mass media, web resources, information networks, etc.) to inform the general public and interested parties		+		
		The information published by the university about the educational program should be objective and relevant and include:				
105	4.	the purpose and planned results of the OP, the assigned qualification		+		
106	5.	information about the assessment system of students' academic achievements		+		
107	6.	information about academic mobility programs and other forms of cooperation with partner universities and employers		+		
108	7.	information about the opportunities for the development of personal and professional competencies of students and employment		+		



109	8.	data reflecting the positioning of the OP in the educational services market (at the regional, national, and international levels)		+		
110	9.	An important factor is the publication of reliable information on PPP on open resources, in terms of personalities		+		
111	10.	The university must publish audited financial statements on its own web resource		+		
112	11.	The university should post information and links to external resources based on the results of external assessment procedures		+		
113	12.	An important factor is the placement of information about cooperation and interaction with partners, including scientific/consulting organizations, business partners, social partners and educational organizations		+		
Total according to the standard in total			2	11	1	0
			2	96	15	0



## Appendix 2. Visit program



**AGREED**  
Rector  
Institutions "Esil University"  
\_\_\_\_\_ Taubaev

A.A.  
"\_\_\_" \_\_\_\_\_ 2024



АККРЕДИТТЕУ ЖӘНЕ РЕЙТИНГТИҢ  
ТӘУЕЛСІЗ АГЕНТТІГІ

НЕЗАВИСИМОЕ АГЕНТСТВО  
АККРЕДИТАЦИИ И РЕЙТИНГА

INDEPENDENT AGENCY FOR  
ACCREDITATION AND RATING

**I APPROVED**  
General Director of the NU  
"Independent Agency for  
Accreditation and Rating"

\_\_\_\_\_  
Zhumagulova A.B.  
"\_\_\_" \_\_\_\_\_ 2024

**program**  
**VISIT OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION**  
**INDEPENDENT ACCREDITATION AND RATING AGENCY (IAAR)**  
**TO THE INSTITUTION "ESIL UNIVERSITY"**  
**(international program accreditation)**

**Date of the visit: April 1-3, 2024**

<b>Cluster 1 (accreditation)</b>	6B04105/ 7M04107/ 7M04108 - Accounting and auditing; 7M04103/ 7M04104 - State and Local Government;
<b>Cluster 2 (primary accreditation)</b>	7M04113 Business Administration (MBA) 7M06102 Information Systems 8D04107 Finance 8D04106 State and Local government 7M11402 Social work 1-1.5 g
<b>Cluster 3 (accreditation)</b>	6B11101 Tourism; 6B11401/7M11401 - Social work; 6B04201/ 6B04110 - Customs business;
<b>Cluster 4 (accreditation)</b>	Cluster 4 (accreditation)

<b>Date and time</b>	<b>VEC's work with target groups</b>	<b>Position and Surname, First name, Patronymic of the target group participants</b>	<b>The form of communication</b>
<b>March 30, 2024</b>			
<b>12.00-13.00 (the time will be specifi</b>	Preliminary meeting of the VEC (discussion of key issues and the program of	<i>External IAAR experts</i>	Connect to the Zoom Conference <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969</a> Conference ID: 464 173 2969

ed)	the visit)		
<i>According to the schedule during the day</i>	Arrival of the members of the External Expert Commission		
<b>18.00</b>	Supper	<i>External IAAR experts</i>	
<b>Day 1: April 1, 2024</b>			
<b>09.00-09.30</b>	Allocation of responsibility of experts, solution of organizational issues	<i>External IAAR experts</i>	Office / room No. (VEK office) conference room Connect to the Zoom Conference <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969</a> Conference ID: 464 173 2969
<b>09.30-10.00</b>	Meeting with the Rector	<i>Taubaev Ayapbergen Aldanaevich - Rector</i>	Conference room Join the Zoom Conference <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969</a> Conference ID: 464 173 2969
<b>10.00-10.15</b>	Technical break		
<b>10.15-11.00</b>	Meeting with Board Members-Vice-Rectors	<i>Turekulova Dametken Medikhanovna - Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs and Science Shuitenov Gabit Zhumabaevich - Vice-Rector for Strategy and Digitalization</i>	Conference room Connect to the Zoom Conference <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969</a> Conference ID: 464 173 2969
<b>11.00-11.10</b>	Technical break		
<b>11.10-11.50</b>	Meeting with heads of structural divisions of the NGO	<i>Dmitry Nikolaevich Smybyshev - Director of the Central Research Institute Jarlgasova Baglan Yerkinovna - Head of UPiMUP Akhanov Berik Utelbaevich - Head of the Department of Career Guidance Zadanova Elmira Bekbolatovna - Head of the International Cooperation Department Kushebina Gulnara Malikovna - Head of the Registrar's office Mustafina Sayran Yelubaevna - Director of the Scientific Library Iskhakova Gozal Rakhmatullayevna - Head of the Personnel Department  Akparov Zhangeldy Ashimovich - Director of the CIT Imanbayeva Raykhan Gazizovna – Chief of Staff, Zhumanova Bekarshyn Kimashevna - Director of the PC Center</i>	Conference room Connect to the Zoom Conference <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969</a> Conference ID: 464 173 2969

		<p><i>Zhumabai Batyrkhan Elikovich - Head of the OOKIS</i></p> <p><i>Yerbol Khamitovich Sakeev - Director of the Career Center</i></p> <p><i>Sadirbayev Orazkan Aitmagambetovich - Head of the AHU</i></p> <p><i>Almagambetov Berik Amanzholovich - Engineer for OT, TB and Emergency situations</i></p> <p><i>Nurgalieva Zhanna Ergalievna - Executive Secretary of the Admissions Committee</i></p> <p><i>Gabiden Tulakbaevich Shardarov – Chief Accountant</i></p>	
<b>11.50-12.00</b>	Exchange of views of the members of the external expert commission		<p>Conference room</p> <p>Connect to the Zoom Conference</p> <p><a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969</a></p> <p>Conference ID: 464 173 2969</p>
<b>12.00-12.40</b>	Meeting with the deans of accredited educational institutions	<p>Alina Gulzhan Baltabaevna - Dean of the Faculty of Business and Management</p> <p>Mukhamedzhanova Aigul Aitmagambetovna - Dean of the Faculty of Applied Sciences</p>	Conference room
<b>12.40-13.00</b>	The work of the VEC	<i>External IAAR experts</i>	
<b>13.00-14.00</b>	<b>Lunch</b>		
<b>14.00-14.15</b>	The work of the VEC		
<b>14.15-15.00</b>	Meeting with heads of departments and heads of the OP	<p>Saltanat Nesipbekovna Valieva - Head of the Department of Management, PhD, Acting Associate Professor</p> <p>Chereeva Bakhytgul Tolegenovna - Head of the OP "State and Local Government" doctoral, Master's degree, PhD, Acting Associate Professor</p> <p>Zhusupova Zhanat Zhaksalykovna Head of the OP "Business Administration" MBA</p> <p>Lukpanova Zhanar Oralkhanovna – Head of the Finance Department</p> <p>Berstembayeva Rysty Kudaibergenovna – Head of the Finance Department</p> <p>Bykov Artyom Alexandrovich – Head of the ISIT Department</p> <p>Zhumashev Marat Sungatovich head of the OP "Information Systems"</p> <p>Yesenova Moldir Balkairovna head of the OP "VTiPO"</p> <p>Kaliev Askar Kadyrovich – head of the department "Law"</p>	<p>Conference room</p> <p>Connect to the Zoom Conference</p> <p><a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969</a></p> <p>Conference ID: 464 173 2969</p>

		Kapysheva Saltanat Kairzhanovna – head of the OP "Customs" Sadykov Zhasulan Amangeldyevich - head of the department "Social work and Tourism", head of the OP "Tourism" Adebietova Aiman Yesenkulovna - head OP "Social work"	
<b>15.00-15.10</b>	Technical break		Audience No. Connect to the Zoom Conference <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969</a> Conference ID: 464 173 2969
<b>15.10-16.00</b>	Meeting with the staff of the OP	<b>Full name of the teacher, position, OP</b> <b>1 hall (Annex No. 1) (Room No. 203, session hall zoom 1)</b> <b>2 hall (Annex No. 2) (Room No. 204, session hall zoom 2)</b> <b>Room 3 (Annex No.3) (Room No.205, session hall zoom 3)</b>	Audience No. Connect to the Zoom Conference <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969</a> Conference ID: 464 173 2969
<b>16.00-17.00</b>	Survey of teaching staff (in parallel)	<b>Appendix 2 (Full name of the teacher, position, e-mail)</b>	The link is sent to the e-mail of the teacher personally
<b>16.00-16.10</b>	Exchange of views of the members of the external expert commission		Audience No. Connect to the Zoom Conference <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969</a> Conference ID: 464 173 2969
<b>16.10-17.00</b>	Meeting with students of the OP	<b>Appendix 3</b> <b>Student's full name, course, OP</b> <b>1 hall (Annex No. 1) (Room No. 203, session hall zoom 1)</b> <b>Hall 2 (Appendix No. 2) (Room No. 204, session hall zoom 2)</b> <b>Room 3 (Annex No.3) (Room No.205, session hall zoom 3)</b>	Audience No. Connect to the Zoom Conference <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969</a> Conference ID: 464 173 2969
<b>17.00-18.00</b>	Student survey (in parallel)	<b>Appendix 4</b> <b>Student's full name, course, OP, e-mail</b>	The link is sent to the student's e-mail personally
<b>17.00-17.50</b>	Visual inspection of the OP and the material, technical, educational and laboratory facilities only facilities for accredited OP		<i>Along the route</i>

<b>17.50-18.00</b>	The work of the VEC discussion of the results of the first day	<i>External IAAR experts External IAAR experts</i>	Conference room Connect to the Zoom Conference <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969</a> Conference ID: 464 173 2969
<b>18.00-19.00</b>	Supper	<i>External IAAR experts</i>	
<b>Day 2: April 2, 2024</b>			
<b>09.00-09.30</b>	Work of the VEC	IAAR External Experts	Conference hall Join a Zoom meeting <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969</a> Conference ID: 464 173 2969
<b>09.30-11.30</b>	Selective visits to EP practice bases	External IAAR experts according to the route list	
<b>11.30-13.00</b>	Working with department documents (documents must be uploaded to the cloud by cluster in advance; if necessary, department heads will be invited to the Zoom online room) and attending teaching staff classes as scheduled	Appendix 6	
<b>13.00-14.00</b>	Dinner		
<b>14.00-14.20</b>	Exchange of views among members of the external	<i>IAAR External Experts</i>	
<b>14.20-15.10</b>	Meeting with stakeholders (representatives of practice bases and employers) (hybrid)	Appendix 8	Conference hall Join a Zoom meeting <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969</a> Conference ID: 464 173 2969
<b>15.10-15.30</b>	Technical break		
<b>15.30-16.10</b>	Meeting with EP graduates		Conference hall Join a Zoom meeting <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969</a> Conference ID: 464 173 2969
<b>16.10-</b>	(hybrid)	Appendix 9	

<b>16.30</b>			
<b>16.30-19.00</b>	Technical break		
<b>19.00-20.00</b>	Work of the EEC, discussion of the results of the second day and profile parameters (recording is being carried out)	IAAR External Experts	
<b>Day 3: April 3, 2024</b>			
<b>09.00-11.30</b>	Work of the EEC, development and discussion of recommendations	IAAR External Experts	Conference hall Join a Zoom meeting <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969</a> Conference ID: 464 173 2969
<b>11.30-11.40</b>	Technical break		
<b>11.40-12.30</b>	Work of the EEC development and discussion of recommendations (recorded)	IAAR External Experts	Conference hall Join a Zoom meeting <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969</a> Conference ID: 464 173 2969
<b>12.30-13.00</b>	Work of the VEC	IAAR External Experts	
<b>13.00-14.00</b>	Dinner		
<b>14.00-16.00</b>	Work of the EEC discussion, decision-making by voting (recorded)		Conference hall Join a Zoom meeting <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969</a> Conference ID: 464 173 2969
<b>16.00-16.30</b>	Work of the EEC, Discussion of the results of quality assessment	IAAR External Experts	
<b>16.30-17.00</b>	Final meeting of the EEC with the university management		Conference hall Join a Zoom meeting <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/4641732969</a> Conference ID: 464 173 2969
<b>18.00-19.00</b>	Dinner	IAAR External Experts	

**Abbreviations***IAAR – Independent Accreditation and Rating Agency**EEC – IAAR External Expert Commission**OO – educational organization**EP – educational program*

Teaching staff - teaching staff

**Appendix 3. RESULTS OF THE PPP SURVEY****Total number of questionnaires: 42****2. Position, %**

Professor	3 (7,1%)
Associate Professor/Associate Professor	18 (42,9%)
Senior Lecturer	17 (40,5%)
Teacher	4 (9,5%)
Head Department	0 (0%)
Other	0 (0%)

**3. Academic degree, academic title**

Honored Worker	0 (0%)
Ph.D	3 (7,1%)
PhD	12 (28,6%)
master	14 (33,3%)
PhD	7 (16,7%)
Professor	1 (2,4%)
Associate Professor/Associate Professor	8 (19%)
No	3 (7,1%)
Other	0 (0%)

**4. Work experience at this university**

Less than 1 year	5 (11,9%)
1 year – 5 years	11 (26,2%)
Over 5 years	26 (69,9%)
Other	0 (0%)

<b>№</b>	<b>Questions</b>	<b>Very good</b>	<b>Fine</b>	<b>Relatively bad</b>	<b>Badly</b>	<b>Very bad</b>	<b>Didn't answer</b>
<b>1</b>	To what extent does the content of the educational program meet your scientific and professional interests and needs?	31 (73,8%)	11 (26,2%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
<b>2</b>	How do you assess the opportunities provided by the University for the professional development of teaching staff?	22 (52,4%)	19 (45,2%)	1 (2,4%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
<b>3</b>	How do you assess the opportunities provided by the University for career growth of teaching staff?	24 (57,1%)	17 (40,5%)	1 (2,4%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
<b>4</b>	How do you assess the degree of academic freedom of the teaching staff?	23(54,8%)	19 (45,2%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)



	To what extent can teachers use their own						
5	•• Learning strategies	21 (50%)	20 (47,6%)	1(2,4 %)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
6	•• Teaching methods	29(69%)	13 (31%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
7	•• Educational innovations	26(61,9%)	16(38,1 %)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
8	How do you evaluate the work on organizing medical care and preventing diseases at the university?	18(42,9%)	23(54,8 %)	1(2,4 %)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
9	What attention does the management of the educational institution pay to the content of the educational program?	26 (61,9%)	15 (35,7%)	1 (2,4%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
10	How do you assess the sufficiency and accessibility of the necessary scientific and educational literature in the library?	30 (71,4%)	12 (28,6%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
11	Assess the level of created conditions that take into account the needs of different groups of students?	16(38,1%)	25(59,5 %)	1(2,4 %)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
	Assess the openness and accessibility of management						
12	•• For students	26(61,9%)	16(38,1 %)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
13	•• teachers	24(57,1%)	18(42,9 %)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
14	Assess the involvement of teaching staff in the process of making management and strategic decisions	10(23,8%)	31(73,8 %)	1(2,4 %)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
15	How are innovative activities of teaching staff encouraged?	14(33,3%)	27(64,3 %)	1 (2,4%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
16	Assess the level of feedback from teaching staff to management	18(42,9%)	23(54,8 %)	1(2,4 %)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
17	What is the level of stimulation and involvement of young specialists in the educational process?	12(28,6%)	29(69%)	1 (2,4%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
18	Evaluate the created opportunities for professional and personal growth for each teacher and staff member	19(45,2%)	23(54,8 %)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
19	Assess the adequacy of university management's recognition of the potential and abilities of teachers	19(45,2%)	23(54,8 %)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
	How the work is done						
20	•• By academic mobility	17(40,5%)	24(57,1 %)	1(2,4 %)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
21	•• To improve the qualifications of teaching staff	15(35,7%)	25(59,5 %)	2(4,8 %)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
	Rate the support of the university and its leadership						
22	•• Research initiatives of teaching staff	24(57,1%)	16(38,1 %)	2(4,8 %)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
23	•• Development of new educational programs/academic disciplines/teaching methods	21(50%)	20(47,6 %)	1(2,4 %)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
	Assess the level of ability of teaching staff to combine teaching						

24	• • with scientific research	22(52,4%)	19(45,2%)	1(2,4%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
25	• • with practical activities	17(40,5%)	24(57,1%)	1(2,4%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
26	Assess how well the students' knowledge acquired at the university corresponds to the realities of the requirements of the modern labor market	17(40,5%)	24(57,1%)	1(2,4%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
27	How do the management and administration of the university perceive criticism addressed to them?	13(31%)	27(64,3%)	2(4,8%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
28	Assess how well your academic workload meets your expectations and capabilities?	21(50%)	19(45,2%)	2(4,8%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
29	Assess the focus of educational programs/curricula on developing students' skills and abilities to analyze the situation and make forecasts?	22(52,4%)	19(45,2%)	1(2,4%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
30	Assess how well the educational program meets the expectations of the labor market and employers in terms of content and quality of implementation	19(45,2%)	22(52,4%)	1(2,4%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)

### Why do you work at this university?

**Wide opportunities for self-development**

**Friendly staff, loyal management, good students**

**Promising University**

**I like the team, I've been working here since 2007**

**The conditions suit me**

**Invited**

**The team is good**

**Good team. Close to home**

**Excellent management, work schedule, team, professional development opportunities provided**

**The university gives you the opportunity to constantly work to improve your knowledge**

**I like working at this university, I realize myself as a professional**

**Comfortable conditions and opportunity for professional growth**

Good conditions have been created to start an educational initiative  
Работаю первый год

Because I completed my doctorate at this university

Good team

My expectations were met

Strong personnel

One of the best universities in economics

because here you have the opportunity to express yourself as a creative person

I like the leadership of the university, the staff of the department and the curiosity of the students. Very favorable environment for teaching staff and students)

Convenient work schedule

I like it, the staff of the Management Department is friendly, I work with pleasure!

The location is convenient

Development as a professional

I like the university

A small university with its own atmosphere, responsive staff, opportunity to grow in the scientific field, excellent students.

close to home address

I have been working for a long time

The profession is appropriate

I teach directly in my specialty

I like it

Very convenient work schedule and location of the university.

I work part-time

Calm, stable, good atmosphere, team

I consider it important to train specialists in the accounting profession; I am familiar with the organizational structure of this enterprise. I believe that in other educational institutions there is a similar situation with the organization of the educational process. I work in this company because... the principle of conservatism has its place

Good team

I feel comfortable here

In our university, support for young specialists is good, and we have colleagues with experienced scientific degrees to guide young specialists and share their experience!

### 32. How often are master classes and classes with the participation of practitioners held as part of your course?

very Often	often	Sometimes	very rarely	rarely
12 (28,6%)	18 (42,9%)	12 (28,6%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)

### 33. How often do external teachers (domestic and foreign) participate in the learning process?

Often	Often	Sometimes	very rarely	never
5 (11,9%)	30 (71,4%)	7 (16,7%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)

### 34. How often do you encounter the following problems in your work: (please give the answer in each line)

Questions	Often	Sometimes	Never	No answer
Lack of classrooms	0 (0%)	9 (21,4%)	33 (78,6%)	0 (0%)
Imbalance of teaching load by semester	1 (2,4%)	15 (35,7%)	26 (61,9%)	0 (0%)
Inaccessibility of necessary literature in the library	0 (0%)	12(28,6%)	30 (71,4%)	0 (0%)
Overcrowding of study groups (too many students in a group)	0 (0%)	11 (26,2%)	31 (73,8%)	0 (0%)
Inconvenient schedule	0 (0%)	15 (35,7%)	27 (64,3%)	0 (0%)
Inadequate classroom conditions	0 (0%)	8 (19%)	34(81%)	0 (0%)
Lack of Internet access/weak Internet	0 (0%)	16 (38,1%)	26 (61,9%)	0 (0%)
Lack of interest among students in learning	0 (0%)	23(54,8%)	19(45,2%)	0 (0%)

Late receipt of information about events	0 (0%)	9(21,4%)	33(78,6%)	0 (0%)
Lack of technical teaching aids in classrooms	0 (0%)	14(33,3%)	28(66,7%)	0 (0%)
Other problems	No problem No problems I want more salary strengthening the technical base of the university Insufficient number of educational programs in English. The bonus for an academic degree is partial, for example, for a candidate of sciences the bonus is only 44,925 tons. Small salary Road vehicles More laboratory audiences and the involvement of practical teachers. low salary increase			

**35. There are many different sides and aspects in the life of a university that in one way or another affect every teacher and employee. Rate how satisfied you are:**

Questions	Completely satisfied (1)	Partially satisfied (2)	Not satisfied (3)	I find it difficult to answer (4)
The attitude of the university management towards you	33 (78,6%)	8(19%)	0 (0%)	1 (2,4%)
Relationships with immediate management	35 (83,3%)	6 (14,3%)	1 (2,4%)	0 (0%)
Relations with colleagues at the department	42(100%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
Degree of participation in management decision making	32(76,2%)	10 (23,8%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
Relations with students	40 (95,2%)	2 (4,8%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
Recognition of your successes and achievements by the administration	34(81%)	8(19%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
Support for your suggestions and comments	30(71,4%)	12(28,6%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
Activities of the university administration	31(73,8%)	11 (26,2%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
Terms of payment	13(31%)	21(50%)	6 (14,3%)	2 (4,8%)
Working conditions, list and quality of services provided at the university	31 (73,8%)	11 (26,2%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)

Labor protection and safety	35 (83,3%)	7(16,7%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
Managing changes in the activities of the university	28 (66,7%)	14 (33,3%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
Providing a social package: rest, sanatorium treatment, etc.	22 (52,4%)	15 (35,7%)	4 (9,5%)	1 (2,4%)
Organization and quality of food at the university	30 (71,4%)	10 (23,8%)	1 (2,4%)	1 (2,4%)
Organization and quality of medical care	30 (71,4%)	10 (23,8%)	1 (2,4%)	1 (2,4%)

#### **Appendix 4. RESULTS OF THE STUDENT SURVEY**

##### **Total number of questionnaires: 134**

##### **Your specialty:**

- 7M04107 Accounting and audit – 3 (2.2%)**
- 6B04105 Accounting and audit – 26 (19.4%)**
- 7M04104 State and local government – 1 (0.7%)**
- 6B11101 Tourism – 28 (20.9%)**
- 6B11401 Social work – 14 (10.4%)**
- 7M11401 Social work 2 years - 1 (0.7%)**
- 6B04201 Customs – 2 (1.5%)**
- 6B04110 Customs – 4 (3%)**
- 6B06102 Computer technology and software – 7 (5.2%)**
- 6B06101 Information systems – 30 (22.4%)**
- 7M06101 Information systems 2 years – 12 (9%)**
- 7M04113 Business administration (MBA) – 2 (1.5%)**
- 7M06102 Information systems – 3 (2.2%)**
- 6B05301 Chemistry – 1 (0.7%)**

##### **Floor:**

Male	<b>62 (46,3%)</b>
Female	<b>72 (53,7%)</b>

##### **Rate how satisfied you are:**

Questions	Полностью удовлетворен	Частично удовлетворен	Частично не удовлетворен	Не удовлетворен	Затрудняюсь ответить
-----------	---------------------------	--------------------------	-----------------------------	--------------------	-------------------------

1. Relations with the dean's office (school, faculty, department)	94 (70,1% )	32 (23,9 )	4 (3% )	3 (2,2 )	1 (0,7% )
2. Level of accessibility of the dean's office (school, faculty, department)	94 (70,1% )	31 (23,1 )	4 (3% )	2 (1,5 )	3 (2,2% )
3. The level of accessibility and responsiveness of management (university, school, faculty, department)	87 (64,9% )	38 (28,4 )	3 (2,2 )	3 (2,2 )	3 (2,2% )
4. Availability of academic advising	90 (67,2% )	36 (26,9 )	4 (3% )	2 (1,5 )	2 (1,5% )
5. Support with educational materials during the learning process	83 (61,9% )	41 (30,6 )	7 (5,2 )	3 (2,2 )	0 (0%)
6. Availability of counseling on personal problems	80 (59,7% )	35 (26,1 )	8 (6% )	3 (2,2 )	8 (6%)
7. Relationship between student and teacher	94 (70,1% )	31 (23,1 )	4 (3% )	3 (2,2 )	2 (1,5% )
8. Activities of financial and administrative services of the educational institution	79 (59%)	43 (32,1 )	6 (4,5 )	3 (2,2 )	3 (2,2% )
9. Availability of health services	90 (67,2% )	29 (21,6 )	2 (1,5 )	3 (2,2 )	10 (7,5% )
10. The quality of medical care at the university	83 (61,9% )	30 (22,4 )	2 (1,5 )	6 (4,5 )	13 (9,7% )
11. Level of accessibility of library resources	95 (70,9% )	29 (21,6 )	1 (0,7 )	0 (0% )	9 (6,7% )
12. The quality of services provided in libraries and reading rooms	93 (69,4% )	26 (19,4 )	2 (1,5 )	2 (1,5 )	11 (8,2% )
13. Existing educational resources of the university	80 (59,7% )	45 (33,6 )	5 (3,7 )	1 (0,7 )	3 (2,2% )
14. Availability of computer classes	74 (55,2% )	32 (23,9 )	16 (11,9%)	8 (6% )	4 (3%)
15. Availability and quality of Internet resources	64 (47,8% )	42 (31,3 )	18 (13,4%)	5 (3,7 )	5 (3,7% )
16. Content and information content of the website of educational organizations in general and faculties (schools) in particular	86 (64,2% )	40 (29,9 )	5 (3,7 )	1 (0,7 )	2 (1,5% )
17. Study rooms, auditoriums for large groups	78 (58,2% )	36 (26,9 )	11 (8,2 )	6 (4,5 )	3 (2,2% )

18. Lounges for students (if available)	55 (41%)	28 (20,9 %)	18 (13, 4%)	14 (10, 4%)	19 (14,2 %)
19. Clarity of procedures for taking disciplinary action	82 (61,2% )	35 (26,1 %)	5 (3,7 %)	3 (2,2 %)	9 (6,7% )
20. The quality of the educational program as a whole	87 (64,9% )	33 (24,6 %)	6 (4,5 %)	6 (4,5 %)	2 (1,5% )
21. The quality of educational programs in the EP	89 (66,4% )	33 (24,6 %)	4 (3% )	4 (3% )	4 (3% )
22. Teaching methods in general	86 (64,2% )	36 (26,9 %)	6 (4,5 %)	4 (3% )	2 (1,5% )
23. Quick response to feedback from teachers on issues of the educational process	91 (67,9% )	34 (25,4 %)	5 (3,7 %)	3 (2,2 %)	1 (0,7% )
24. The quality of teaching in general	90 (67,2% )	31 (23,1 %)	9 (6,7 %)	3 (2,2 %)	1 (0,7% )
25. Academic load/requirements for the student	79 (59%)	42 (31,3 %)	7 (5,2 %)	4 (3% )	2 (1,5% )
26. Requirements of teaching staff for students	87 (64,9% )	31 (23,1 %)	3 (2,2 %)	3 (2,2 %)	10 (7,5% )
27. Information support and explanation before entering the university of the rules of admission and the strategy of the educational program (specialty)	86 (64,2% )	36 (26,9 %)	4 (3% )	3 (2,2 %)	5 (3,7% )
28. Informing the requirements in order to successfully complete this educational program (specialty)	90 (67,2% )	37 (27,6 %)	2 (1,5 %)	3 (2,2 %)	2 (1,5% )
29. The quality of examination materials (tests and examination questions, etc.)	88 (65,7% )	36 (26,9 %)	7 (5,2 %)	2 (1,5 %)	1 (0,7% )
30. Objective assessment of knowledge, skills and other educational achievements	90 (67,2% )	34 (25,4 %)	6 (4,5 %)	3 (2,2 %)	1 (0,7% )
31. Available computer classes	71 (53%)	42 (31,3 %)	15 (11, 2%)	4 (3% )	2 (1,5% )
32. Available scientific laboratories	69 (51,5% )	30 (22,4 %)	10 (7,5 %)	7 (5,2 %)	18 (13,4 %)
33. Objectivity and fairness of teachers	91 (67,9% )	31 (23,1 %)	8 (6% )	4 (3% )	0 (0% )
34. Informing students about courses, educational programs and academic degrees received	95 (70,9% )	30 (22,4 %)	6 (4,5 %)	3 (2,2 %)	0 (0% )

35. Providing students with a hostel	79 (59%)	21 (15,7 %)	2 (1,5 %)	1 (0,7 %)	31 (23,1 %)
--------------------------------------	-------------	-------------------	-----------------	-----------------	-------------------

**Please rate how much you agree:**

Statement	Full agreement	Agree	Partially agree	I don't agree	Complete disagreement	Didn't answer
36. The course syllabus was clearly presented	79 (59%)	38 (28,4%)	14 (10,4%)	2 (1,5%)	1 (0,7%)	
37. Course content is well structured	76 (56,7%)	36 (26,9%)	16 (11,9%)	4 (3%)	2 (1,5%)	
38. Key terms are sufficiently explained	80 (59,7%)	38 (28,4%)	14 (10,4%)	2 (1,5%)	0 (0%)	
39. The material proposed by the teacher is relevant and reflects the latest achievements of science and practice	73 (54,5%)	37 (27,6%)	20 (14,9%)	2 (1,5%)	2 (1,5%)	
40. The teacher uses effective teaching methods	77 (57,5%)	31 (23,1%)	22 (16,4%)	2 (1,5%)	2 (1,5%)	
41. The teacher has mastery of the material being taught.	90 (67,2%)	26 (19,4%)	15 (11,2%)	2 (1,5%)	1 (0,7%)	
42. The teacher's presentation is clear	78 (58,2%)	37 (27,6%)	17 (12,7%)	1 (0,7%)	1 (0,7%)	
43. The teacher presents the material in an interesting way.	71 (53%)	35 (26,1%)	21 (15,7%)	4 (3%)	3 (2,2%)	
44. Objectivity in assessing knowledge, skills and other educational achievements	78 (58,2%)	38 (28,4%)	15 (11,2%)	2 (1,5%)	1 (0,7%)	
45. Timely assessment of students' educational achievements	80 (59,7%)	38 (28,4%)	13 (9,7%)	2 (1,5%)	1 (0,7%)	
46. The teacher meets your requirements and expectations for professional and personal development	80 (59,7%)	35 (26,1%)	13 (9,7%)	4 (3%)	2 (1,5%)	
47. The teacher stimulates student activity	79 (59%)	34 (25,4%)	14 (10,4%)	4 (3%)	3 (2,2%)	
48. The teacher stimulates students' creative thinking	75 (56%)	35 (26,1%)	19 (14,2%)	3 (2,2%)	2 (1,5%)	



49. The appearance and manners of the teacher are adequate	91 (67,9 %)	31 (23, 1%)	10 (7,5 %)	2 (1,5 %)	0 (0 %)	
50. The teacher shows a positive attitude towards students	85 (63,4 %)	38 (28, 4%)	9 (6,7 %)	2 (1,5 %)	0 (0 %)	
51. The system for assessing educational achievements (seminars, tests, questionnaires, etc.) reflects the content of the course	81 (60,4 %)	40 (29, 9%)	11 (8,2 %)	2 (1,5 %)	0 (0 %)	
52. The assessment criteria used by the teacher are clear and accessible	82 (61,2 %)	37 (27, 6%)	13 (9,7 %)	2 (1,5 %)	0 (0 %)	
53. The teacher objectively evaluates student achievements	82 (61,2 %)	36 (26, 9%)	12 (9%)	4 (3 %)	0 (0 %)	
54. The teacher speaks a professional language	81 (60,4 %)	37 (27, 6%)	12 (9%)	4 (3 %)	0 (0 %)	
55. The organization of education provides sufficient opportunity for sports and other leisure activities	71 (53% )	34 (25, 4%)	15(1 1,2 %)	8 (6 %)	6 (4,5 %)	
56. Facilities and equipment for students are safe, comfortable and modern	68 (50,7 %)	38 (24, 4%)	24 (17, 9%)	1 (0,7 %)	3 (2,2 %)	
57. The library is well equipped and has a sufficient fund of scientific, educational and methodological literature	76 (56,7 %)	38 (28, 4%)	15 (11, 2%) 0	2 (1,5 %)	3 (2,2 %)	
58. Equal opportunities for mastering EP and personal development are provided to all students	83 (61,9 %)	34 (25, 4%)	13 (9,7 %)	1 (0,7 %)	3 (2,2 %)	

Other concerns regarding teaching quality:

- No problem
- There are no problems with the quality of education, Tourism specialty is excellent
- Many thanks to the teaching staff of the University, I wish you prosperity and success!!!
- no problems, but the educational program would need to be improved and the work of the administration would also be improved. Some managers can't answer simple questions
- During the training - no problems were identified regarding training
- I think that teaching is of low quality, unfortunately. Some teachers do not take students' education seriously. Teachers with extensive experience at the university conduct the teaching process wonderfully. As for teachers who have just come to the university and master's students, unfortunately, the situation is the opposite. After so many years of studying at the university, I am very disappointed in the quality of education. I hope that this questionnaire will reveal reliable results and begin the process of changing the quality of education.
- There are no complaints about the quality of teaching, I'm happy with everything, there's plenty of everything at the university
- There are no problems with the quality of teaching, the educational material is presented with a very creative approach
- A more convenient place for students to relax. Improving the quality of the Internet.

- Improvement of the Internet, as well as improvement of the work of Platonus, during exams it often freezes. What is often a stressful event?

- Teachers do not have a good relationship with students

there is no toilet paper in a simple toilet, let's start with that lesson and then we can consider the education side, there is no structure, everything is moved only when there is a paper, a report, and an inspection from the management

- It's a pity that I couldn't tell you sincerely about what's happening with teaching at the university. Letters were sent to your organization describing the problems of the university. If you haven't received it, write to my email below.

We couldn't tell you everything, because then we would have problems, including expulsion.

We were prepared for your arrival and told to speak only positively about the university.

The bottom line is that we, at the IS, don't have classes at all: we come to the office and just sit on the phones with the teacher, they don't teach us anything at all. In the third year, we don't know how to do anything at all, the teachers gave up on us, and we just completely cheated on the session. Out of 23 people, 5-6 of us come to pairs; the rest give grades just behind the scenes. I have no faith that the university itself will respond normally to our complaints.

The accreditation you leave to this university will ruin another generation of specialists

Email for feedback from me: [jopan.a@yandex.ru](mailto:jopan.a@yandex.ru)

- I would like to update outdated computers in the remaining classrooms

- There is a bad Wi-Fi signal at the university. This is all the disadvantages of the university for me.

