



«АККРЕДИТТЕУ ЖӘНЕ РЕЙТИНГТІҢ  
ТӘУЕЛСІЗ АГЕНТТІГІ» КЕМ

НУ «НЕЗАВИСИМОЕ АГЕНТСТВО  
АККРЕДИТАЦИИ И РЕЙТИНГА»

INDEPENDENT AGENCY FOR  
ACCREDITATION AND RATING

# REPORT

on the results of the work of the external expert  
commission for the evaluation  
for compliance with the requirements of the standards of specialized  
accreditation of the doctoral educational program based on WFME /  
AMSE standards (medical and pharmaceutical education)

8D10101 PUBLIC HEALTH

**KAZAKH NATIONAL UNIVERSITY  
NAMED AFTER AL-FARABI**  
in the period from 2 to 4 of December 2021

**INDEPENDENT AGENCY FOR ACCREDITATION AND RATING**  
*External expert commission*

*Addressed to  
Accreditation  
Council of the IAAR*



«АККРЕДИТТЕУ ЖӘНЕ РЕЙТИНГТИҢ  
ТӘУЕЛСІЗ АГЕНТТІГІ» КЕМ

НУ «НЕЗАВИСИМОЕ АГЕНТСТВО  
АККРЕДИТАЦИИ И РЕЙТИНГА»

INDEPENDENT AGENCY FOR  
ACCREDITATION AND RATING

**REPORT**

**on the results of the work of the external expert commission for the evaluation  
for compliance with the requirements of the standards of specialized accreditation of the  
doctoral educational program based on WFME / AMSE standards (medical and  
pharmaceutical education)**

***8D10101 PUBLIC HEALTH***

**KAZAKH NATIONAL UNIVERSITY NAMED AFTER AL-FARABI  
in the period from 2 to 4 of December 2021**

*December 4, 2021  
Almaty city*

**(I) LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS**

**AC** - Academic calendar  
**DB** - Database  
**BD** - Basic disciplines  
**GSPH** - Graduate School of Public Health  
**SAC** - State Attestation Commission  
**SCSE** - State compulsory standard of education  
**DET** - Distance Educational Technologies  
**ICT** - Information and Communication Technologies  
**IC** - Individual Curriculum  
**KazNU** - Kazakh National University  
**CCh** - Component of choice  
**CT** - Complex Testing  
**CTE** - Credit technology of education  
**CED** - Catalog of elective disciplines  
**MES RK** - Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan  
**MEP** - Modular Educational Program  
**RD** - Research work  
**RWS** - Research work of students  
**RC** - Required component  
**EP** - Educational programs  
**MD** - Major disciplines  
**PTS** - Professorial and teaching staff  
**RK** - Republic of Kazakhstan  
**WC** - Working Curriculum  
**QMS** - Quality Management System  
**IWDS** - Independent work of doctoral students  
**IWDST** - Independent work of doctoral students under the guidance of a teacher  
**MC** - Model Curriculum  
**FM&H** - Faculty of Medicine and Health

## (II) INTRODUCTION

In accordance with the order 156-21-OD dated November 1, 2021 of the Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating, from December 2 to December 4, 2021, an external expert commission assessed the compliance of the educational program «8D10101 Public Health» of Al-Farabi Kazakh National University with the standards of specialized accreditation IAAR (No. 68-18/1-OD dated May 25, 2018, second edition) in a hybrid format.

The report of the external expert commission (EEC) contains an assessment of the submitted educational program to the IAAR criteria, recommendations of the EEC for further improvement of the educational program and profile parameters of the educational program.

### **The composition of the EEC:**

**1. Chairman of the IAAR commission** – Yury Eduardovich Belykh, Candidate of Physical and Mathematical Sciences, Associate Professor, Vice Rector for Academic Affairs, Grodno State University named after Yanka Kupala (city Grodno, Republic of Belarus) (offline);

**2. IAAR expert** - Chizhovich Veslav Aleksandrovich, Professor, Doctor of Economics, Graduate School of Law and Administration of the University of Law in Rzeszow, specialist in international customs law, member of the International Academy of Customs Law (ICLA), co-author of professional standards of the World Customs Organization (Warsaw, Poland) (offline);

**3. IAAR expert** - Sousana Michailidou, PhD, Professor, Vice-Chancellor for Academic Affairs Webster Athens (Athens, Greece) (online);

**4. IAAR expert** – Aleksey Nikolaevich Kalyagin, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Vice-Rector for General Medicine and Postgraduate Education, Head of the Department of Propaedeutics of Internal Diseases of the Federal State Budgetary Educational Institution of Higher Education «Irkutsk State Medical University» of the Ministry of Health of Russia, expert of the Federal Accreditation Agency (Irkutsk, Russian Federation) (online);

**5. IAAR expert** – Prof. Dr. Güljanat Kurmangaliyeva Ercilasun, Professor, Ankara University Haji Bayram Veli (Ankara, Republic of Turkey) (offline);

**6. IAAR expert** - Aktamov Innokenty Galimalaevich, Candidate of Pedagogical Sciences, Doctor of Philosophy (PhD), Head of the Laboratory "Center for Translations from Oriental Languages" of the Institute of Mongolian, Buddhist and Tibetan Studies of the Siberian Branch of the Russian Academy of Sciences, Associate Professor of the Department of History and Regional Studies of Asian Countries, Buryat State University named after D. Banzarov, expert of the Federal Accreditation Agency (Ulan-Ude, Russian Federation) (offline);

**7. IAAR expert** - Bizhkenova Aigul Ermekovna, Doctor of Philology, Professor, Eurasian National University. L.N. Gumilyov (Nur-Sultan, Republic of Kazakhstan) (offline);

**8. IAAR expert** - Kurmangaliyev Kairat Bolatovich, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, NAO "West Kazakhstan Medical University. Marat Ospanov" (Aktobe, Republic of Kazakhstan) (offline);

**9. IAAR expert** – Anna Rozentsvaig, Candidate of Law, Associate Professor, Head of Internal Control Department, Samara National Research University named after Academician S.P. Koroleva, expert of the Russian Accreditation Agency (Samara, Russian Federation) (offline);

**10. IAAR expert** - Zhumagulova Bakitgul Sakenovna, Doctor of Philology, Professor, Kazakh National Pedagogical University named after Abay (Almaty, Republic of Kazakhstan) (offline);

**11. IAAR expert** - Zharkenova Svetlana Bakhytovna, Candidate of Law, Professor, Eurasian National University named after. L.N. Gumilyov (Nur-Sultan, Republic of Kazakhstan) (offline);

- 12. IAAR expert** - Ivanchenko Nellya Nikolaevna, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Kazakh National Medical University named after S.D. Asfendiyarov (Almaty) (offline);
- 13. IAAR expert** - Burbekova Saule Zhorabekovna, Candidate of Philology, Associate Professor, Astana IT University (Nur-Sultan, Republic of Kazakhstan) (offline);
- 14. IAAR expert-employer** – Abildaeva Tolkin Zheksengazievna, Head of the Human Capital Development Department of the Chamber of Entrepreneurs of Almaty (Almaty, Republic of Kazakhstan) (offline);
- 15. IAAR expert-employer** - Rakhimova Nurbike Altaykyzy, expert of the 1st category of the human capital development department of the Chamber of Entrepreneurs of Almaty (Almaty, Republic of Kazakhstan) (online);
- 16. IAAR student expert** - Bolatbekova Ayganym Aibolkyzy, doctoral student of the Public Health Program, Karaganda Medical University, member of the Alliance of Students of Kazakhstan (Karaganda, Republic of Kazakhstan) (online);
- 17. IAAR student expert** – Dzhangeldinova Saltanat Bolatovna, 1st year doctoral student of the educational program Foreign language: two foreign languages, Karaganda University named after academician E.A. Buketov (Karaganda, Republic of Kazakhstan) (online);
- 18. IAAR expert-student** - Niyazova Zulfira Rigantovna, 2nd year master student of the educational program Linguistics, Kazakh National Pedagogical University named after Abai (Almaty, Republic of Kazakhstan) (online);
- 19. IAAR expert student** – Astanayeva Diana Abdizhapparkyzy, 1st year master student of the educational program Foreign Philology (Turkish), International Kazakh-Turkish University named after Khoja Ahmed Yasawi (Turkestan, Republic of Kazakhstan) (online);
- 20. IAAR expert student** - Kamasheva Gulnara Mukhamedshaykyzy, 7th year student of General Medicine, Karaganda Medical University, member of the Alliance of Students of Kazakhstan (Karaganda, Republic of Kazakhstan) (online);
- 21. IAAR expert-student** - Bulatov Zhansen Baurzhanovich, 4th year student of the educational program Law and Law Enforcement, KAZHLU University named after M.S. Narikbaeva (Nur-Sultan, Republic of Kazakhstan) (online);
- 22. IAAR expert-student** – Shibovskaya Lydia Nikolaevna, master student of the educational program «222 – Medicine», International European University (Kyiv, Ukraine);
- 23. IAAR coordinator** – Kanapyanov Timur Yerbolatovich, PhD, Deputy General Director for International Cooperation of the IAAR (Nur-Sultan, Republic of Kazakhstan) (offline);
- 24. IAAR coordinator** - Aikyz Bauyrzhankyzy, PhD, specialist in international projects and public relations of the IAAR (Nur-Sultan, Republic of Kazakhstan) (offline).

### **(III) REPRESENTATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION**

Kazakh National University named after Al-Farabi (hereinafter KazNU) begins its activity on January 15, 1934 as part of the Pedagogical Institute. In 1993, the university was given the status of an autonomous state university and it was renamed the Al-Farabi Kazakh State National University. In October 1991, the university was named after the great thinker Abu Nasyr ibn al-Farabi, and in 2000 the Kazakh National University named after al-Farabi was given a special status of a national university.

The university actively cooperates with 525 universities and research centers in 47 countries of the world, is a member of the International, European and Eurasian University Associations, as well as a strategic partner of the UN Civilization Alliance and the Regional Hub for Sustainable Development within the framework of the UNESCO UNITWIN program.

The educational activities of the academy are carried out in accordance with the license for the implementation of educational activities No. KZ27LAA00019309 dated 03.02.2010.

In December 2015, a medical faculty was opened at Al-Farabi KazNU. At the faculty, on the basis of international standards and new scientific achievements, healthcare personnel are trained at all levels of educational programs - bachelor's, master's, doctoral studies. Additional professional education is also provided for business representatives and specialists from various fields and sectors involved in the development, promotion and implementation of health improvement and preservation programs. Currently, in accordance with ongoing scientific research, popular educational programs for the training of specialists, the faculty is called Medicine and Health.

Doctoral studies in the specialty 8D10101 "Public Health" are carried out for three years in the scientific and pedagogical direction, which makes it possible to implement individual educational trajectories, enhances interdisciplinary training with the possibility of transforming individual blocks in accordance with the structure of employers' requests for the formation of specific professional competencies. The implementation of doctoral educational programs is carried out by the university in close cooperation with leading foreign educational and scientific organizations, medical organizations, practical healthcare specialists, and potential employers of the healthcare system of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

Requirements for the level of preparation of doctoral students are determined on the basis of the Dublin descriptors and reflect the acquired competencies, expressed in the achieved learning outcomes.

The faculty makes it possible to study educational programs at all levels - bachelor's, master's, internship, residency, doctoral studies, postdoctoral studies, to provide training according to new international standards, based on the scientific achievements of modern healthcare. A wide range of paraclinical disciplines is an ideal platform for implementing scientific ideas and introducing the achievements of molecular biology, bio- and nanotechnology, bioinformatics, biophysics, etc. into clinical practice.

The training is also attended by prominent scientists and leading specialists from research institutes, scientific centers of Kazakhstan and visiting professors from near and far abroad (Russia, Ukraine, Belarus, Canada, Germany, Sweden, South Korea, etc.). The teaching staff of the faculty has a high degree, 25 teachers have diplomas from foreign universities (Great Britain, USA, Italy, South Korea), 78.5% of teachers teach in English. The faculty, thanks to active international cooperation with leading scientific centers and universities of the world, creates real opportunities for foreign internships. More than 10 visiting professors from leading foreign universities regularly work at the faculty every year.

Nowdays, students from Turkey, Afghanistan, Yemen, Jordan, Iran, Iraq, Kenya, Pakistan, Palestine, Syria, India, USA, China, Russia, Mongolia, Uzbekistan and Turkmenistan study at the faculty. The total number of students is more than 2,400, including more than 1,000

foreign students from 22 countries. As a leading university in Kazakhstan, the Faculty has its own clinical bases: Clinical Diagnostic Center, City Hospital No. 1 in Almaty.

Graduates of the faculty successfully work in large private and public medical organizations, the Departments of Public Health and Sanitary and Epidemiological Control of regions and cities, which are employers of current graduates and actively participate in the development of educational programs, continuous practical training, and provide bases for practices. The employment of graduates of the faculty is 100%.

The Faculty, on the basis of the Research Institute of Health and the Research Laboratory of Health and the Environment, implements more than 15 scientific projects at the international and national levels. Performed 4 Erasmus+ projects.

The Higher School of Public Health (hereinafter referred to as the Higher School of Public Health) FM&H carries out educational activities in the specialty "Health" HSPH was founded in 2015. In 2016, an educational license was obtained to launch a master's program in the specialty "Public Health". In 2017, an educational license was obtained and a doctoral program was launched in the specialty "Public Health".

The graduating department of doctoral students in the specialty «Public Health» is the Department of Epidemiology, Biostatistics and Evidence-Based Medicine. The faculty of the department involved in the preparation of doctoral students has a 100% degree and is represented by 22 teachers, including: 1 doctor of medical sciences, 8 candidates of medical sciences, 1 candidate of legal sciences, 9 doctors of PHD. The teaching staff of the department is actively published in journals indexed in the Web of Science, Scopus database. Over the past year, 32 articles have been published.

Training in doctoral studies in the EP «Public Health» has been conducted since 2016. 11 graduates completed their studies from 2016 to 2021, of which 1 defended his dissertation with the award of a scientific degree, which gives great prospects for self-realization, the opportunity to engage in scientific and pedagogical activities at universities, achieve goals in science, the possibility of entering into partnerships with foreign colleagues, exchange of experience with scientists from leading world universities, foreign internships for advanced training, lecturing and conducting scientific research in leading scientific centers, further improvement of the level of foreign language proficiency, career growth opportunities. Upon completion of the educational program in the specialty 8D10101 - Public Health (PhD), doctoral graduates are given the right to enter a post-doctoral program on a competitive or basis.

KazNU named after al-Farabi has institutional autonomy in relation to: the development of an educational program and the use of allocated resources necessary for the implementation of the educational program in accordance with SCES-2020. Freedom in the preparation of the educational program is achieved through the university component (elective disciplines).

The freedom to choose elective disciplines by doctoral students complements and deepens the competencies formed in accordance with the direction of preparation for this educational program in order to deepen the understanding of global health problems, the strategic objectives of the country's development, the use of innovative technologies during training, which ensures the quality of education.

Within the framework of academic freedom, departments have the right to independently determine the form of assessing the knowledge of doctoral students in the discipline (oral examination, testing, solving situational problems, etc.).

The educational program of doctoral studies in the specialty «Public Health» includes two types of practice: pedagogical and research.

For the period from 2016-2020, the number of people enrolled in doctoral studies amounted to 11 people who completed their studies - 11, including 1 who successfully defended his dissertation and is studying under the post-doctoral program. All 11 graduates are employed in accordance with their qualifications.

**(IV) DESCRIPTION OF THE PREVIOUS ACCREDITATION PROCEDURE**

The educational program «8D10101 Public Health» is being accredited by the IAAR for the first time.

**(V) DESCRIPTION OF THE EEC VISIT**

The work of the EEC was carried out on the basis of the approved Program of the hybrid visit of the expert commission for specialized accreditation of educational programs of the Al-Farabi Kazakh National University from 2 to 4 December, 2021.

In order to coordinate the work of the EEC on 1.12.2021, an online installation meeting was held, during which powers were distributed among the members of the commission, the schedule of the visit was clarified, agreement was reached on the choice of examination methods.

To obtain objective information about the quality of educational programs and the entire infrastructure of the university, to clarify the content of self-assessment reports, meetings were held with vice-rectors of the university in areas of activity, heads of structural divisions, heads of departments, teachers, students, graduates, employers. A total of 52 representatives took part in the meetings (table 1).

Table 1 - Information about employees and students who took part in meetings with the EEC IAAR:

<b>Category of participants</b>	<b>Quantity</b>
Vice - Rector 's Building	2
Heads of structural divisions	18
Deans	4
Heads of departments	6
Teachers	4
Students, undergraduates, doctoral students	4
Graduates	9
Employers	4
<b>Total</b>	<b>52</b>

During the visual inspection, the members of the VEC got acquainted with the state of the material and technical base, visited the laboratories (clinics): the Kazakh Research Institute of Oncology and Radiology, the MSE at REM the Phthisiopulmonology Center of the AH of Almaty, the Scientific and Practical Center for Sanitary and Epidemiological Expertise and Monitoring of the MSE at REM the National Center for Public Health, the Center for Modern Medicine MEDITERRA.

At the meetings of the EEC, IAAR with the target groups of the university, the mechanisms for implementing the university's policy were clarified and the specification of individual data presented in the university self-assessment report was carried out.

During the visit, classes were attended in the disciplines of "Legislation in healthcare", "Epidemiology (advanced)"

- in the discipline «Legislation in healthcare», topic «Drug turnover», 1st year, specialty 8D10101 Public health, teacher - Candidate of Law Maulenova Bakhyt Nusipovna. The lesson was conducted online through the multifunctional ZOOM platform. The first hour of the lesson was devoted to a lecture, after a ten-minute break, two hours of practical training - case analysis.

- in the discipline «Epidemiology (advanced)», 1st year specialty 8D10101 Public health, lecturer - PhD, Associate Professor Natalia Yegorovna Glushkova. The lesson was conducted online through the multifunctional ZOOM platform. The lecture was held in English.



In accordance with the accreditation procedure, a survey was conducted of 220 teachers, 320 students, including junior and senior students.

In order to confirm the information presented in the Self-Assessment Report, external experts requested and analyzed the working documentation of the university. Along with this, the experts studied the Internet positioning of the university through the official website of the university <https://www.kaznu.kz/>.

As part of the planned program, recommendations for improving accredited educational programs of Al-Farabi Kazakh National University, developed by the EEC based on the results of the expertise, were presented at a meeting with the management on 4.12.2021.



**(VI) COMPLIANCE WITH SPECIALIZED ACCREDITATION STANDARDS****6.1. Standard «Mission and outcomes»***Mission Definition*

- ✓ *The medical education organization should define its mission and bring it to the attention of stakeholders and the health sector.*
- ✓ *The mission statement should contain the goals and educational strategy to prepare a competent scientist, researcher at the level of postgraduate medical education.*
- ✓ *The medical education organization must ensure that the stated mission includes the problems of public health, the needs of the medical care system and other aspects of social responsibility.*
- ✓ *A medical education organization must have a development plan for the educational program that corresponds to the stated mission, the goals of a medical education organization, including improving the quality of doctoral programs and approved by the advisory board of a medical education organization / scientific organization.*
- ✓ *A medical education organization should systematically collect, accumulate and analyze information about its activities and the implementation of the doctoral program; conduct an assessment of strengths and weaknesses (SWOT analysis), on the basis of which the leadership of a medical educational organization, together with an advisory board, should determine policy and develop strategic and tactical plans*
- ✓ *The mission and goals of the EP of the medical education organization should correspond to the available resources, the capabilities of the medical education organization / scientific organization, market requirements and ways to support them should be determined and access to information about the mission, goals of the EP of the medical education organization for the public should be provided (availability of information in the media , on the website of the university), the mission and goals of the EP of the medical educational organization / scientific organization are approved by the advisory board.*

*Participation in the formulation of the mission*

- ✓ *The medical education organization must ensure that what are the main interested the parties participate in the development of the mission of the EP.*
- ✓ *Institutional autonomy and academic freedom*
- ✓ *The medical education organization should have institutional autonomy to develop and implement policies for which the faculty and administration are responsible, especially with regard to:*
  - ✓ *development of an educational program;*
  - ✓ *use of allocated resources necessary for the implementation of the educational program*
  - ✓ *A medical education organization should guarantee academic freedom to its employees and doctoral students:*
  - ✓ *in relation to the current educational program, which will be allowed to rely on different points of view in the description and analysis of issues in medicine;*
  - ✓ *in the possibility of using the results of new research to improve the study of specific disciplines / issues without expanding the educational program.Конечные результаты обучения*
  - ✓ *The medical education organization must define the expected learning outcomes that doctoral students must exhibit after completing the doctoral program.*
  - ✓ *Postdoctoral studies with the award of a degree should provide doctoral students with the competencies that will enable them to become qualified researchers capable of conducting independent scientific research in accordance with the principles of good research practice.*
  - ✓ *Other competencies (knowledge, skills, attitudes) relevant to the doctoral program should include:*
  - ✓ *demonstration by doctoral students of a systematic understanding in the field of study and mastering the skills and methods of research in their field;*
  - ✓ *Demonstration by doctoral students of the ability to form, develop, implement and adapt original scientific research in the context of existing academic works at the level required for publication in international peer-reviewed publications;*
  - ✓ *demonstration by doctoral students of leadership skills, the ability to manage the work of others, project management, the ability to teach and transfer knowledge;*
  - ✓ *the ability to exchange views in their field of research with academic advisors, the broad academic community and society as a whole;*
  - ✓ *the ability to promote, within an academic and professional context, technological, social or cultural progress in a knowledge society.*
  - ✓ *Completion of a doctoral program should be of potential benefit to those who pursue a career outside the medical organization and apply their competencies developed during the development of the doctoral program, including critical analysis, evaluation and solution of complex problems, the ability to transfer new technologies and synthesis of new ideas.*
  - ✓ *The medical education institution/scientific organization should ensure that the process of renewal and restructuring leads to the modification of the final learning outcomes of graduates in accordance with the responsibilities that are assigned to graduates after the completion of the doctoral program.*

**Evidential part**

The University has developed an official website <https://www.kaznu.kz/>, which contains general information about the University and strategic directions of development, the procedure for ongoing monitoring of progress, intermediate certification, the academic calendar, the procedure for calculating the academic rating of a student, the procedure for appointing and paying state scholarships requirements for the final state certification, etc.

The University realizes its mission in the interests of the individual, society and the state. The problems of health and public health, the needs of the health care system and the provision of medical care are reflected in the mission of the KazNU and the goals of the clinical activities of the KazNU, namely in creating optimal conditions for the training of competitive specialists using progressive forms and methods of education, modern achievements of medical science and

practical health care.

Already at the stage of development of the University Mission, the administration and staff of the university, faculty, doctoral students, health and education authorities, medical scientific organizations, professional medical associations responsible for postgraduate education, the public,. The Ministry of Health, the Ministry of Education and Science, health organizations are directly involved and information about this is brought to the public. Also, information about the educational program of doctoral studies in the specialty «Public Health» is published on the website of the university and is available to all interested parties.

In the appendix to the self-report, the Faculty of Medicine and Healthcare presented to the EEC experts a strategic plan for the development of the doctoral educational program, which contains information, goals and objectives of the EP, activities for the development of the EP for 2020-2023. The development plan corresponds to the mission of the university and includes issues of improving the quality of doctoral programs, discussed and approved by the advisory board of NJSC KazNU. As part of the acquaintance with this document of a wider range of interested parties, it is advisable to place it on the Internet resources of the university.

At the end of the academic year, the Faculty of Medicine and Healthcare collects and analyzes information on the quality of the implementation of the doctoral program, evaluates strengths and weaknesses, generates an annual report, on the basis of which the administration jointly with a consultative and advisory organ determines the policy for further improvement of the EP.

For continuous monitoring, evaluation of the achievement of the goals and objectives of the EP, the Academic Quality Committee operates, which includes all stakeholders - experienced teachers, students, employers.

The mission and goals of NJSC KazNU correspond to the available resources, opportunities and market requirements, as well as ways to support them. The university has material, technical and information resources, the university management controls the provision of all processes of the university with the necessary resources (office equipment, premises, creating comfortable conditions for employees and students, providing clinical facilities, practice bases, allocating funds for scientific research and internships for doctoral students, etc.) and decides on priorities, feasibility and the amount of resources needed. Training and retraining of teachers and staff, including on quality management issues, is implemented in accordance with the plans for advanced training of teaching staff. The advanced training of teachers is carried out in accordance with the Regulations on additional professional education, the needs of teachers and the university, and trends in the development of education.

The administration, teaching staff of the faculty are responsible for compiling the educational program of doctoral studies and allocating the resources necessary for its implementation. This is provided through participation university teaching staff in developing and peer review SCSE, model curricula at the republican level.

Within the framework of academic freedom, a catalog of elective disciplines has been developed, which is updated for each new academic year, taking into account the proposals of interested parties. The departments of the faculty independently determine the form of assessing the knowledge of doctoral students in the discipline (oral examination, testing, computer testing, solving situational problems, etc.), which is reflected in the syllabuses.

In the educational program 8D101101 «Public Health», developed within the framework of the SCSE (Order No. 647 in the revision of 2020) taken into account main final results doctoral studies. The requirements for the level of preparation of a doctoral candidate are determined on the basis of the Dublin Descriptors of the third level of higher education (doctoral studies) and reflect the acquired competencies, expressed in the achieved learning outcomes. Areas of professional competence have been developed for doctoral studies, taking into account the requirements of employers and society of social demands. 5 out of 11 doctoral graduates are

teachers of the departments of the Faculty of Medicine and Public Health, using in their work the acquired skills in the issues of university training of specialists in the field of public health, analysis of the latest theoretical and practical developments, scientific concepts and achievements of world and Kazakhstan science in the field of public health. One of the graduates is an employee of a research institute, independently plans, organizes and conducts research in the field of public health, implements the results obtained into practice, conducts an examination and evaluates scientific projects and research in the field of public health. One graduate is studying in a postdoctoral program in public health at KazNU, plans his own professional development, taking into account modern trends in the field of public health, speaks at international scientific forums, conferences and seminars on public health issues.

Through the introduction of an automated complex, an improvement in the information service of all subjects of the educational process is achieved, in accordance with the requirements for educational institutions by the President and the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, recommendations of international organizations. In general, the School of Public Health of the Faculty of Medicine and Public Health has achieved many positive results over 6 years and sets itself priority tasks for the development of new educational programs, the introduction of double diplomas at all levels of education, the expansion of post-doctoral programs, etc.

#### ***Analytical part***

According to the criteria of the «Mission and outcomes» standard, KazNU has a mission, which is reflected in the development strategy for 2019-2021. The mission of the university is widely represented on all information resources of the university, in an accessible form on the stands of educational buildings. Employees, graduates and students, employers and representatives of practical healthcare are widely aware of the mission, which was found out during a meeting with these representatives. Stakeholders actively participated in the development of the mission. The mission of the university was discussed at the level of the faculty and then at the faculty meeting, taking into account the achievements of modern science and education, the requests of potential doctoral students wishing to study under the program, as well as the expectations of employers.

The goals and objectives of the accredited EP correspond to the mission and vision and charter of KazNU and reflect the main areas of activity presented in the University Development Strategy for 2017-2021.

Based on the annual reporting, an analysis of strengths and weaknesses is carried out and, on their basis, the development of tactical and strategic development plans, including doctoral programs.

Discussion of the results of the implementation of the EP is also discussed at the methodological council of the Higher School of Health, at the Academic Council of the faculty, as well as at the annual scientific and methodological conference of the university, during which, in the process of broad discussion in an interdisciplinary and interprofessional environment, together with representatives of other faculties, recommendations are made to improve the EP, strategies teaching and assessment. 71.8% of the teaching staff rated the degree of academic freedom as very good.

The strategic plan of the educational program of doctoral studies in the specialty 8D10101 "Public Health" provides for continuous monitoring of the quality of the educational process, in accordance with the results of which the current plan is adjusted to achieve the greatest efficiency.

The material and technical resources for the educational process in doctoral studies meet all the necessary requirements. The university has educational buildings, clinical bases, practice bases for the implementation of the theoretical and research components of the doctoral program.

A high level of assessment was given by the teaching staff of the faculty to the opportunities provided by the university for professional development (very good - 80.9%).

75% of teaching staff are satisfied with the provision of career opportunities by the university.

In order to identify satisfaction with the training as a whole, the rector's blog, helpline, and trustbox were opened.

The final results are aimed at achieving the competencies of students and are consistent with the mission and goals of the university.

**Strengths according to the standard:**

*No strengths were identified for this standard.*

**Recommendations for EP 8D10101 Public Health:**

- No

**Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:**

*Strong - 0; satisfactory - 20, including 1 with a recommendation for improvement; suggests improvements - 0; unsatisfactory - 0.*

**6.2. Standard «Research environment and educational resources»**

*Scientific research environment*

- ✓ *The success of individual doctoral programs must be ensured by the organization of a strong and efficient research environment.*
- ✓ *The quality of the research environment should be assessed by analyzing:*
  - ✓ *publication of research results (number of publications, impact factor, etc.) on the profile of doctoral studies in a medical education organization / scientific organization.*
  - ✓ *the level of attracting external funding for scientific research in a medical education institution/scientific organization.*
  - ✓ *the number of qualified and competent researchers in a group, faculty, educational institution*
  - ✓ *national and international cooperation with research groups of medical organizations, universities, research centers.*
  - ✓ *Research must be conducted in accordance with international ethical standards and approved by the relevant and competent ethics committees. In their research work, doctoral students must adhere to international ethical standards: the Declaration of Helsinki II (clinical research), the European Union Directive, 2010/63/EU (animal research) and the Oviedo Convention (bioethics).*
    - ✓ *In order to provide access to the means necessary to write a dissertation, doctoral programs should include studies in other laboratories, preferably in another country, thus ensuring internationalization.*
    - ✓ *The implementation of the doctoral program should take place in conditions of mutual respect, planning and shared responsibility of the supervisor and the doctoral candidate.*
    - ✓ *The medical education/research organization should explore the possibility of providing joint doctoral degree programs from both universities and joint leadership to support cooperation between higher education institutions.*
    - ✓ *The medical education/research organization should ensure that the process of updating educational resources is carried out in accordance with changing needs, such as the recruitment of doctoral students, the number and profile of academic staff, the doctoral program.*
- The medical education organization should:*
  - ✓ *provide sufficient autonomy in the distribution of resources, including adequate remuneration of teachers in order to achieve the final learning outcomes;*
  - ✓ *when allocating resources, take into account scientific advances in the field of medicine and public health problems and their needs.*
- Material and technical base*
  - ✓ *A medical education organization/scientific organization must have material and technical support that meets the licensed indicators, which include the following criteria:*
    - ✓ *classrooms, laboratories and their equipment should be modern and adequate to the goals and objectives of the doctoral program;*
    - ✓ *doctoral students should be provided with conditions for the implementation of independent educational and research work;*
    - ✓ *The medical education institution/scientific organization must have sufficient resources for the proper implementation of the doctoral program and distribute them in accordance with the needs. The resources of the organization should provide:*
      - ✓ *admission of doctoral students*
      - ✓ *organization of training in the doctoral program*
      - ✓ *dissertation work*
      - ✓ *scientific supervision of doctoral students*
      - ✓ *consulting doctoral students*
      - ✓ *review, review and evaluation of the dissertation*
      - ✓ *award of a degree*
      - ✓ *operating costs*
      - ✓ *expenses for participation in training courses, in international scientific conferences*
      - ✓ *payment for doctoral studies in institutions where this is practiced.*
      - ✓ *resources also include doctoral student stipend/salary, however fees may vary.*
      - ✓ *The resource policy should be aimed at maintaining and ensuring the constant professional growth of teachers of the doctoral program.*
  - ✓ *The medical education organization must:*

- ✓ provide a safe environment for staff, doctoral students, patients and their caregivers, including providing the necessary information and protection from harmful substances, microorganisms, observing safety rules in the laboratory and when using equipment
- ✓ The medical education organization should improve the learning environment for doctoral students by regularly updating, expanding and strengthening the material and technical base, which should correspond to the development in teaching practice.
- Information Technology
- ✓ A medical education organization/scientific organization must have information support corresponding to the goals and objectives of the doctoral program:
  - ✓ the library should contain the materials necessary for training - educational, technical, scientific and reference literature, various medical periodicals, etc.;
  - ✓ Doctorates should have timely and free access to library resources.
  - ✓ The library should have basic technical equipment to support daily activities: fax machines, copiers, computers, printers available for public use, and a telephone with voice mail or answering machine.
  - ✓ The library must have an information website. The website may contain the following elements: links, interlibrary loan forms, full-text electronic journal articles, and a feedback form.
  - ✓ The medical education organization/scientific organization should regularly monitor library resources, study and implement strategies to meet the current and future needs of doctoral students.
  - ✓ Doctoral students should use computer classes and terminals with access to information resources (local network, Internet);
  - ✓ The medical education organization/scientific organization should monitor the availability and adequate use of information resources by doctoral students;
  - ✓ In a medical educational organization / scientific organization, constant updating, improvement and expansion of the base of information resources should be carried out.
  - ✓ A medical education institution/scientific institution must open and constantly update a section on its website dedicated to doctoral programs containing the following information:
    - ✓ Structure and staff of the department of doctoral studies, duties of the head and staff of the department;
    - ✓ Admission policy, including clear rules about the doctoral candidate selection process;
    - ✓ List of doctoral programs;
    - ✓ Structure, duration and content of doctoral programs;
    - ✓ Criteria for the appointment of a supervisor; outlining the characteristics, responsibilities and qualifications of the supervisor;
    - ✓ Methods used to evaluate doctoral students;
    - ✓ Criteria for designing and writing a dissertation;
    - ✓ Description of the dissertation defense procedure;
    - ✓ Description of the Dissertation Council (regulations, composition, announcements) (if any);
    - ✓ Program for quality assurance and regular evaluation of the doctoral program;
    - ✓ Information about the doctoral students, taking into account the year of study.

### ***Evidential part***

KazNU has a systematic approach to quality assurance and university resource management based on the requirements of the ISO 9000 series standards and the principles of the process approach. The decomposition of the life cycle processes of all areas of the university activity has been made and the necessary resources for their effective implementation have been structured.

Number and area of classrooms corresponds the number of students. Available the material base provides: lectures - various equipment for demonstrating illustrative (photo-, film-, video-) materials; performance of laboratory work in basic disciplines - educational (educational and scientific) equipment in accordance with the program of laboratory work; performance of laboratory work on profile (special) disciplines - educational – scientific and scientific equipment in accordance with the implemented scientific topics of laboratories; conducting seminars - computers for performing calculations and using information systems. Students have the opportunity to use the electronic publications of the university in computer classes, as well as through personal computers of departments in accordance with the volume of subjects studied.

The implementation of the EP is ensured by the availability of methodological aids and recommendations on the theoretical and practical sections of all disciplines and on all types of classes and practices.

Used in the educational process educational and methodological material complies with established regulatory documents (SCES, TC), includes the latest achievements of medical science, is based on the principles of evidence-based medicine. New educational technologies used based on the experience of leading foreign universities are aimed at the effective formation of the competencies of a university graduate. The doctoral program includes such disciplines as advanced biostatistics, research methodology, advanced epidemiology with evidence-based medicine, research bioethics, medical technology assessment, etc. Scientific consultants for doctoral students are foreign scientists from leading medical SRC, SRI: Martin McKee, professor at the European Institute of Health; Katarzyna Skarbek - Institute of Public Health, Poland; Pful

Blank is a professor at the University of California and others.

Used

educational and methodological documentation is developed by the relevant structural divisions of the KazNU on the basis of the State compulsory education standards, model curricula approved by the authorized State organ in the field of education, and model professional curricula approved by the authorized State organ in the field of health, it is mandatory to discuss at meetings of the departments, the Academic Council of KazNU and after receiving their positive opinion, it is approved by the rector.

Teachers and research assistant FM&H performs world-class scientific research in the field of medicine, public health, epidemiology, demography, health economics, and other sciences to understand the determinants of health in society. Within the framework of 5 scientific projects, KazNU cooperates with leading foreign universities: National Institute of Health, USA project «Building Capacity for the Study of Cognition and Risk Factors in Kazakhstan»; Population Health Research Institute, Canada, The Prospective Urban Rural Epidemiological (PURE) study project, Population Health Research Institute, Canada INVICTUS study project; University Medical Center Utrecht and Trinity College Dublin project «SURF (SURvey of Risk Factors)»; European Union project «598661-EPP-1-2018-1-RO-EPPKA2-CBHE-JP-Developing services for Individuals with Disabilities-DECIDE».

Also, the activities of the FM&H are epidemiological and hygienic research in the field of public health: the study of predictors and indicators of respiratory health, as well as associations with the professional activities of fire service workers; study of predictors and indicators of the level of exhaled carbon monoxide among workers of the fire service of the city of Almaty; conducting a population study of the prevalence of COPD and occupational risk factors for the disease in the population of the city of Almaty; monitoring of air pollution in the city of Almaty with suspended particles PM 2.5 and association with the heating season and solid fuel combustion; hygienic assessment and clinical and epidemiological study on association with indicators of the function of external respiration in workers of a metal structures plant in the city of Almaty; study of the levels of professional burnout among railway workers whose work is associated with a high level of stress in Kazakhstan, the Russian Federation and Belarus.

There is a high publication activity of the teaching staff of the faculty together with doctoral students of the EP. In 2021, 42 articles were published in international journals with a high impact factor, and 28 in the journals of the KQES of MES RK, which is a strength of the university. For example, doctoral student Tulekov, Z. with a group of co-authors has a scientific article “Health-related quality of life in a general population sample in Kazakhstan and its sociodemographic and occupational determinants” in the journal *Health and Quality of Life Outcomes*, 2021, 19(1), 199, impact factor 2, 344; a group of authors from among the teaching staff of KazNU Iurilli, MLC, Zhou, B., Bennett, JE, Kalmatayeva, Z., Ezzati, M., Filippi, S. published an article “Heterogeneous contributions of change in population distribution of body mass index to change in obesity and underweight” in the international edition “*eLife*”, 2021, 10, e60060” with an impact factor of 8.140.

KazNU implements the following international projects in the framework of public health: International multicenter project Population Urban Rural Epidemiological study (PURE), conducted in 27 countries of the world, initiated by the Canadian scientific organization PHRI, Hamilton Health Science Corporation, McMaster University, Canada; International multicenter clinical trial INVICTUS, conducted in 40 countries under the leadership of the Canadian scientific organization PHRI, Hamilton Health Science Corporation, McMaster University, Canada; International Research in association with the University of Pittsburgh; International project to create a register of patients with familial hypercholesterolemia, in collaboration with Imperial College, London, UK.

Research work in the doctoral program "Public Health" is planned in accordance with the needs of the university in the implementation of scientific and technical programs covering the most relevant and socially significant problems at the regional and national levels, as well as scientific grants planned by specialized departments.

For the implementation of educational programs on the basis of the Faculty of Medicine and Healthcare, the "Research Institute of Health" operates, the subject of which is scientific research of a fundamental and applied nature. The goal of the Institute of Health is world-class research in the field of medicine, public health, epidemiology, demography, health economics, and other sciences to understand the determinants of health in society.

Also, on the basis of the FM&H was opened research laboratory "Environment and Health".

Libraries is a modern five-storey building with a total area of 17,856.6 m<sup>2</sup>, equipped with new technologies and communication solutions. The university has formed a unified system of information and library services, thanks to which it is possible for students and teachers to receive a range of services: academic accessibility of library funds, information resources, Internet access, bibliographer consultation. The library contains: a background of an electronic library of its own generation with a full-text database (DB); subscription databases with perpetual access to electronic books of the world's largest publishers (EBooks) in the EBSCO, Springer, Elsevier databases, as well as to the Polpred full-text database, the IPRbooks electronic library system, the domestic database «Zan – Law», «Epigraph»; Classical reading room with an area of 1850 m<sup>2</sup> for 800 seats; Subscriptions operating on the principle of «one window»; Hall of the electronic library for 270 seats with a conditional division into zones (multimedia, Internet zone, zone for working with graphic programs, zone for working with electronic resources, zone for working with personal laptops); Hall of undergraduates, the dissertation fund, which is constantly replenished with new works and currently consists of 7867 copies of dissertations, 11407 abstracts; Hall of periodicals, with 299 domestic and foreign titles; The hall of rare and valuable publications, where rare books and manuscripts dating back to the 16th-21st centuries are stored, more than 19,000 documents.

The library has implemented an automation system based on RFID technology, as a result of which the issues of integration of the automated library and information system (ABIS) "IRBIS 64" and the use of university unified identification cards for employees and students of the university (ID-card) as library cards have been implemented. Self-service stations operating on the basis of RFID technologies have been installed in the reading room, giving readers the opportunity to independently register the selected literature and issue it for up to 3 days. Developed and launched the Al-Farabi Library mobile application for Android, which is available on [PlayMarket](#). The KazNU Library has its own information website.

KazNU has created a unique information Intranet system "Univer", united by a network of more than 3,500 modern computers.

The administration of NPJC KazNU, according to the development plan of the university, allocates the necessary funds from the budget of the university, which are spent on: capital and current repairs, increasing the provision of educational literature, improving the equipment of departments and courses implementing educational programs, equipping educational, scientific and information activities, purchasing furniture and educational equipment, maintaining engineering communications and networks of buildings and structures in working order and registering buildings and structures. In accordance with the allocated funds, furniture is updated at the university, hard and soft inventory, computer and office equipment, stationery, dummies, phantoms, medical equipment, consumables, etc. are purchased. Updating is carried out by fulfilling applications submitted by structural divisions.

The university has its own publishing and printing resources to provide the university with the production of printed materials, organizing the production and sale of printed materials,



services for copying, replicating and small print production, organizing the implementation and improvement of software used in modern electronic publishing systems, in order to improving the quality of printed products, which is supervised by the Department of Logistics and Maintenance of Buildings.

The university is exploring the possibility of providing joint doctoral degree programs from both universities and joint leadership to support cooperation between higher education institutions, for subsequent implementation.

Al-Farabi KazNU successfully operates a system of indicative planning, where targets are clearly defined - indicators in all areas of the university's activities. The rating system is a tool for evaluating the performance of teaching staff, departments and faculties. The system of indicative indicators is effectively used to conduct a detailed SWOT analysis of work at the level of departments and faculties, and to develop improvement plans based on it. Based on the results of departments and faculties on the main indicators of work: teaching and methodological, research and social and educational work, there is a system of stimulation and encouragement.

KazNU named after al-Farabi has sufficient material and technical base for the implementation of the educational program of doctoral studies in the specialty 8D10101 (6D110200) - "Public Health". The university covers a wide range of fundamental and applied research, which is based in 8 research institutes, 25 centers, 2 national-level laboratories and a regional technopark.

### ***Analytical part***

For students, all conditions have been created for the active use of education in the E-learning format, the Wi-Fi coverage area for free Internet access is 100% of the total area of the university and hostels. Videoconferences are becoming traditional for doctoral students of the university. Monitors are installed in the foyer of the buildings. The Univer information Intranet system operates, which contains educational resources for all training programs. The dean's office of the school through the information Intranet system "Univer" carries out the organization of education: electronic journals, bulletin board, newsletters, etc.

Educational - methodological and information support of the educational process at KazNU guarantees the possibility of high-quality development of the doctoral educational program. The implementation of the educational program is ensured by free access to international information networks, electronic databases, library collections, computer technologies, educational and methodological and scientific literature.

The University is taking measures to increase the level of motivation of teaching staff by distributing material resources based on the results of the work of each employee, as well as strengthening publication activity based on research results (number of publications, high impact factor, Scopus and Web Of Science bibliographic databases, etc.). the individual contribution of the teacher through incentive payments, taking into account criteria that allow evaluating the effectiveness and quality of work.

At KazNU are held measures to increase the level of motivation of the teaching staff through the payment of remuneration based on the results of the work of each employee, strengthening the publication activity based on the results of research on the individual contribution of the teacher. from 1 million tenge and more. In 2021, the wages of all teaching staff were raised twice. 75.9% of the teaching staff highly appreciated the support of the research activities of employees by the university management.

Bonuses for employees are carried out in order to stimulate employees, staffing the NJSC KazNU. Al-Farabi with competent and experienced personnel, ensuring sufficient material conditions for the conscientious performance of official duties, production efficiency and quality of work, the relationship between specific results of work and the amount of incentives, increasing the material interest of workers and the quality of work.

The University has the resources to conduct joint educational programs with universities near and far abroad, namely: extensive communication with foreign universities, implementing the EP of public health, teaching staff of the faculty, actively implementing joint scientific projects with international universities and public health organizations, doctoral students, 100% fluent in English, having material resources, connections with foreign universities.

The Faculty of Medicine and Health of KazNU under the doctoral program implemented 5 scientific projects for 2020-2021, the amount of funding for research programs amounted to 47, 906 million tenge. The university as a whole during this period implemented 435 research projects, with a total funding of 5856.5 million tenge. In order to attract external funding for scientific research under an accredited doctoral program, the faculty should increase the number of joint international scientific projects and the participation of doctoral students in these projects.

During the visit, the experts made visits to doctoral studies at the accredited EP. Classes were held online using the free ZOOM platform. The expert noted that classes were interrupted every 40 minutes and the participants in the process were forced to enter the conference each time, which could provoke a risk of reducing the quality of the educational process as a whole. Meanwhile, the MES RK recommends more than 30 free unlimited online platforms,

Currently, a safe environment for employees and students is one of the pressing issues. The university has created conditions that ensure the safety of employees and students: information and compliance with safety regulations at the workplace are carried out, there are fire alarms in all buildings of the university, briefings are conducted, there is an evacuation plan on each floor and there are shields with fire fighting equipment. Each department has safety magazines for students. Before the start of the school year, all students are introduced to safety during training.

***Strengths according to the standard:***

According to this standard, strengths were identified - 3

1. High publication activity of teaching staff in international journals with a high impact factor, as well as in journals included in the CQES of MES RK database.
2. Availability of a bonus system for employees in order to stimulate employees for scientific research and innovation activities.
3. The presence at the university of a unified system of information and library services, thanks to which it is possible for students and teachers to receive a range of services: academic accessibility of library funds, information resources, Internet access, bibliographer consultation, etc.

***Recommendations for EP 8 D 101 Public health:***

1. In order to increase the competitiveness of graduates to develop joint doctoral programs with universities of far and near abroad. /Center for International Programs. September 2023/
2. To increase the attraction of external funding sources by conducting applied research and development. /Department of Science and Innovation. January 2023/
3. To ensure the quality of distance education in doctoral studies, involve teaching staff with a certificate of advanced training courses to improve work using IT technologies in the distance learning format. /Management of methodological work and educational technologies. September 2022/

***Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:***

Strong - 3; satisfactory - 23, including 3 with the recommendation of improvement, suggests improvement - 1; unsatisfactory - 0.

### **6.3. Standard «Admission Policy and criteria»**

- ✓ *The medical education/scientific organization should define and implement an admissions policy, including a clearly defined policy for the selection process for doctoral students.*
- ✓ *The medical education organization/scientific organization should establish a relationship between the selection of doctoral students and the mission of the medical education organization, the educational program and the desired quality of graduates.*
- ✓ *To guarantee the quality of doctoral programs, the selection of doctoral students should be based on competition and ensure transparency in the selection process.*
- ✓ *Candidates for the doctoral program must have a level of education corresponding to the degree of Master of Science in the relevant doctoral profile or have completed residency training in medical specialties*
- ✓ *Prior to the enrollment of a doctoral candidate, the medical education institution/scientific organization must evaluate the quality of the scientific research project, the implementation of which is planned by the doctoral candidate.*
- ✓ *After enrolling in doctoral studies, the doctoral student must be approved by the topic of the dissertation and supervisors.*
- ✓ *The dissertation topic must be evaluated and approved by a panel of independent experts by external evaluation of the written description or based on the presentation of the research paper, including:*
  - ✓ *the expected results of the implementation of a scientific research project, which should end with the writing of a dissertation in accordance with the required quality standards (the "Dissertation" standard), within a period of time determined by the doctoral program;*
  - ✓ *degree of innovation and creativity of the scientific project*
  - ✓ *qualification of scientific supervisors (standard "Scientific leadership");*
- ✓ *Doctoral students should have rights and obligations comparable to the status of a medical education organization/scientific organization where research work is carried out.*
- ✓ *In cases where the doctoral student is forced to look for additional sources of income, additional time should be provided for the completion of the study program.*
- ✓ *The medical education/scientific organization should ensure that the renewal and restructuring process leads to:*
  - ✓ *adapting the doctoral admissions policy to reflect changing expectations and circumstances, staffing needs, changes in the postgraduate education system and the needs of the doctoral program.*

#### ***Evidence-based part***

In accordance with its mission, KazNU has established a policy of admission to doctoral studies, which complies with the requirements of the law based on the regulatory documents of the Republic of Kazakhstan:

- Model rules for admission to study in educational organizations that implement professional training programs for postgraduate education, approved by order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 31, 2018 No. 600 (as amended on June 8, 2020, order No. 237);
- Order p.o. Minister of Health and Social Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 31, 2015 No. 647 "On approval of state compulsory standards and standard professional training programs for medical and pharmaceutical specialties" (as amended on February 21, 2020 No. RK MES -12/2020);

The procedure for admission of students to doctoral studies is based on the principles of openness and transparency. All appeals are considered impartially, fairly and as conveniently as possible for all applying visitors.

Admission of persons entering doctoral studies is carried out by placing a state educational order for postgraduate education at the expense of the republican budget or the local budget, as well as paying for tuition at the expense of the student's own funds and other sources.

For the policy of selection and admission of doctoral students, for the implementation of the state order for the admission of students, compliance with legislative acts and regulations on the formation of a contingent of doctoral students is the responsibility of the Chairman of the Admissions Committee. The Admissions Committee ensures the acceptance of documents and the organization of conditions for the admission of applicants to doctoral studies and is responsible for transparency and compliance with the admission rules.

For applicants to doctoral studies, the admission committee carries out:

- consulting applicants on the issues of a selected group of educational programs of postgraduate education, familiarization with the procedure for the entrance exam;
- organization of acceptance and verification of documents received;
- organization of the entrance examination for groups of educational programs.

Admission of foreign citizens to doctoral studies is carried out on a paid basis. Obtaining by foreign citizens on a competitive basis in accordance with the state educational order of free postgraduate education is determined by international treaties of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

Admission of foreign citizens to study on a paid basis is carried out based on the results of an interview conducted by the admission committees of the University during the calendar year. Enrollment of foreign citizens is carried out in accordance with the academic calendar 5 (five) days before the start of the next academic period.

Education documents issued by foreign educational organizations are recognized or nostrified in accordance with the procedure established by law in accordance with the Rules for the recognition and nostrification of education documents approved by order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated January 10, 2008 No. 8 (registered in the Register of State Registration of Regulatory Legal acts under No. 5135).

Admission to doctoral studies with an indication of the training program is announced through the media (mass media) and on the University's website no later than fifteen calendar days before the start date for accepting documents.

Admission to doctoral studies is carried out in two stages: pre-selection, entrance examinations.

Preliminary selection of applicants for doctoral studies is carried out before the start of entrance examinations from February 1 to May 31 of the calendar year. The results of the preliminary selection for training in doctoral educational programs are admission to the entrance exams. Applications for doctoral studies are accepted from July 3 to August 3 of the calendar year. Entrance examinations for groups of educational programs for doctoral studies are held from 4 to 20 August of the calendar year. Enrollment - until August 28 of the calendar year.

#### ***Analytical part***

The policy and procedure for admission to doctoral studies is posted on the University website, available to applicants and all interested parties, which is identical to the mission of the university and consists in the formation of human resources that are competitive and in demand on the national and international labor markets, achieving a qualitatively new effect in the formation of citizens of the country and the world and in promoting the sustainable development of society through the transfer and enhancement of knowledge.

The Dean's Office of the Faculty of Medicine and Healthcare of the University informs applicants about the policy of admission to the University by posting the necessary documentation on the official website of the University; provides an opportunity to get acquainted with the content of the programs of entrance examinations, as well as other documents regulating the organization of admission to doctoral studies.

#### ***Strengths according to the standard:***

No strengths were identified for this standard.

Recommendations for OP 8D10101 Public Health:

- No

#### **Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:**

Strong - 0; satisfactory - 10, suggests improvements - 0; unsatisfactory - 0.

#### **6.4. Standard «Doctoral Program»**

- ✓ The medical education organization/scientific organization must determine the purpose and objectives of the doctoral program.
- ✓ The doctoral program should be based on original research, courses and other types of work that require analytical and critical thinking.
- ✓ The doctoral program should be structured with a clear time limit equivalent to 3 full-time years.
- ✓ The doctoral program should include compulsory courses in parallel with the dissertation work. A significant part of the training program should include the training of doctoral students in specific skills, which may consist of:
  - ✓ teaching doctoral students the skills of presenting research results (oral/poster/documents) for academic and non-academic audiences,
  - ✓ project management,
  - ✓ writing a grant application,
  - ✓ critical evaluation of scientific literature,
  - ✓ management of technical staff and doctoral students,
  - ✓ professional growth and organization of cooperation,
  - ✓ other.
- ✓ The doctoral program must be carried out under scientific supervision.
- ✓ The Medical organization of education/scientific organization should determine the teaching and learning methods used.
- ✓ The doctoral program must ensure that doctoral students are taught the rules of ethics and the responsible conduct of scientific research.
- ✓ In a medical organization of educational / scientific organization, there should be mechanisms:
  - ✓ allowing doctoral students, if necessary, to complete part of their doctoral program in another educational institution, including in other countries;
  - ✓ continuous evaluation of the progress of the research work of the doctoral student throughout the doctoral program.
  - ✓ The medical institution of education /scientific organization must ensure the confidentiality of the doctoral student consulting on the doctoral program, scientific guidance, personal matters.
  - ✓ The medical organization of education must ensure that the educational program is implemented in accordance with the principles of equality.
  - ✓ An appeal mechanism should be developed and implemented in a medical education institution/scientific organization, allowing doctoral students to review the decision regarding their programs and the evaluation of their dissertations.
  - ✓ The medical education institution/scientific organization should carry out a regular assessment of the quality of the doctoral program, including feedback from supervisors and doctoral students.
  - ✓ The medical education/scientific organization should ensure that the renewal and restructuring process leads to:
    - ✓ adaptation of the model of the educational program and methodological approaches in teaching, in order to ensure that they are appropriate and appropriate;
    - ✓ adjusting the elements of the doctoral program and their relationship in accordance with advances in the medical sciences, with changes in the demographic situation and the state of health / morbidity structure of the population and socio-economic, cultural conditions.
    - ✓ Improving the process of monitoring and evaluating the doctoral program in accordance with changes in learning outcomes and teaching and learning methods

#### ***Evidence-based part***

Educational program of doctoral studies in the specialty 8D10101 «Public Health» developed for training qualified public health professionals.

The educational program was developed in accordance with the State Compulsory Education Standard, approved by the Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated February 21, 2020 No. 647 «On Approval of State Compulsory Standards and Model Professional Curricula for Medical and Pharmaceutical Specialties».

The results of doctoral studies in the specialty 8D10101 «Public Health» include:

1. Assessment of the needs of public health and healthcare, its problems and development prospects to improve the quality of life and reduce the incidence of the population;
2. Application of knowledge methodology skills and knowledge of advanced epidemiological and statistical concepts in a specific setting to identify public health risks;
3. Analysis new theoretical and practical developments, scientific concepts and achievements of world and Kazakhstani science in the field of public health for their successful implementation in practical health care;
4. Critical evaluation of information from various sources, including a systematic review and meta-analysis to formalize the results of a literature search in the form of a scientific report.
5. Conducting scientific research based on the hypothesis of the relationship between the risks of the material environment and health in order to predict and reduce their negative impact on public health.
6. Development of new strategies in the field of public health, including programs for managing risks of a biological, social, climatic nature for planning anti-epidemic and preventive measures to reduce them among the population and in population groups at increased risk.

7. Evaluation of public health surveillance programs to develop and implement a system for monitoring population morbidity and groups at increased risk for health status and activities for the provision of medical services.

8. Conducting an examination and evaluation of scientific projects and research, control programs and preventive programs to increase the scientific and evidence base of decisions taken to improve the provision of public health services;

9. Planning own professional development, taking into account current trends and needs of public health and higher education;

10. Ensuring the principles of protection of authorship and intellectual property rights for scientific discoveries and developments;

11. Implementation of methodological support of the educational process using innovative forms and technologies in accordance with bioethical principles for conducting classes with students of medical universities and faculties and practical healthcare professionals in the disciplines of public health.

12. Possession of the theory and practice of public health, scientific writing and oral communication skills to present research results to professional and non-professional audiences, at national and international conferences; and hold seminars on public health issues.

In accordance with the TC SCSE, structure of the doctoral educational program contains educational and scientific components that are equivalent and determine the content of education, and reflect their correlation, measurement and accounting.

The educational program of doctoral studies contains:

- 1) theoretical training, including the study of a cycle of basic and major disciplines;
- 2) practical training of doctoral students: various types of professional practices, scientific internships;
- 3) scientific - research (experimental research) work, including the completion of a doctoral dissertation;
- 4) intermediate and final certification.

Information on the structure, duration (number of hours / credits, semester / academic year), content of the educational program, indicating the mandatory elements, elective components and their duration is contained in the MC for each academic year. The educational program ensures that all parts of the educational program include relevant disciplines, as well as approaches for integrating program components. KazNU has a system for planning, providing, implementing and monitoring all rotations included in the training program. Each doctoral student has an individual curriculum and an individual work plan, in accordance with which the educational program is implemented.

Saved disciplines university component, the ratio of basic and major disciplines, the total number of credits and hours mastered, etc.

Educational programs of postgraduate education are provided with the following auxiliary "tools": standard curricula of the doctoral specialty, academic calendar, individual work plan of a doctoral candidate, working curricula, curricula for disciplines.

Labor intensity accounting all types of work is carried out according to the volume of mastered material and is measured in credits, which are units of measurement of the labor costs of doctoral students and teachers necessary to achieve specific learning outcomes. At the same time, there is an accumulative credit system that takes into account loans mastered at previous levels of education. Upon admission, a doctoral student has all the prerequisites necessary for mastering the relevant professional doctoral curriculum. If not, studies on a paid basis during doctoral studies.

The educational program of doctoral studies is designed on the basis of a modular system for studying disciplines.

Education in doctoral studies is carried out only on a full-time basis.

A doctoral student who has mastered the full course of theoretical study of the doctoral educational program, but has not completed the research component, is given the opportunity to re-master the credits of the research component and defend a dissertation in the next academic year on a paid basis. A doctoral student who has mastered the full course of theoretical study of the educational program of a doctoral program, but who has not defended a doctoral dissertation within the prescribed period, is extended the period of study in doctoral studies on paid basis.

Early awarding of the scientific degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) is allowed in the case of early mastery of the educational and scientific component of the educational program, successful completion of a comprehensive exam in the specialty and defense of a dissertation for the degree of Doctor.

According to the accredited doctoral program, 11 doctoral students graduated, with access to the defense in the Dissertation Council -1. During the interview, 5 doctoral students expressed readiness at the beginning of 2022 come to the defense having an article in an international peer-reviewed journal at the end of 2021, 4 more stated that their scientific article was successfully peer-reviewed and is at the stage of publication.

### ***Analytical part***

Teaching staff, employees, students and representatives of practical healthcare, potential employers are involved in the process of managing the EP through their inclusion in the advisory bodies (Academic Council, Scientist Council). Within the framework of the policy KazNU, according to the SCSE, freedom is provided in compiling an educational program. Freedom in the preparation of the educational program is achieved through the university component (elective disciplines). So, the department in the development of working curricula of the discipline can change up to 20% of the content of the standard program, up to 40% of the thematic plan of the subject.

The EP at the University is being developed from taking into account directions original research by future doctoral students, the specifics of which are reflected in the list of elective disciplines proposed for study, as well as in the topics of planned dissertations. Dissertation works of doctoral students are planned in the field of topical, modern scientific problems that require analytical and critical thinking, a patent information search is carried out on the topic of the work.

Doctoral students of the EP "Public Health" are actively involved in the process of evaluating educational programs by expressing their opinions and wishes at the end of the course of study, mastering a particular discipline or by questioning to identify opinions and take into account the comments, suggestions of direct consumers. The university administration takes into account the comments and suggestions of doctoral students on the organization of the educational process (class schedule, etc.), the program for studying elective disciplines, the list of elective disciplines, the library fund and other issues directly related to the learning process.

The involvement of doctoral students in the development of the EP by participating in the discussion of the EP (they are invited to the meetings of the department) to assess the quality of programs, the degree of satisfaction of doctoral students with educational services, the organization of various events, etc. is carried out using questionnaire methods. Doctoral students are involved in the process of evaluating the EP by expressing their opinions and wishes at the end of the course of study or mastering a particular discipline, or by questioning to identify opinions and take into account comments. Comments and suggestions of doctoral students on the organization of the educational process (schedule of classes, etc.), the program for studying elective disciplines, on the list of elective disciplines, on the library fund and other issues directly related to the learning process, are discussed and taken into account when considering the educational program.

The data obtained as a result of the survey is used to improve the EP and the processes for

their implementation. In addition, in order to improve the quality, the university has developed a plan for the development of the doctoral study program in Public Health for 2020-2023, which provides for a number of specific activities indicating the deadline and responsible departments.

The University constantly monitors and periodically evaluates the educational program of doctoral studies in the specialty "Public Health", based on the results of which it corrects the EP 2 times a year. Changes and additions to the educational program of doctoral studies in the specialty "Public Health" are made in accordance with the State Program for the Development of Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2011-2020.

During the interview, doctoral graduates confirmed that the educational program of the doctoral program "Public Health" is updated annually in accordance with the competencies that are assigned to doctoral students.

The educational program of doctoral studies in the scientific and pedagogical direction makes it possible to implement individual educational trajectories, strengthen interdisciplinary training with the possibility of transforming individual blocks in accordance with the structure of employers' requests for the formation of specific professional competencies.

KazNU is basic interested side in the training of specialists in the profile direction. The recruitment of doctoral students depends on the need for doctoral specialists 8D10101 – «Public Health» for the upcoming academic year. The number of applicants is due to the allocation of the state order by the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Educational resources satisfy the development of the doctoral program, all disciplines of credits of the main and elective components are performed by teachers with academic degrees on the basis of the university. Educational resources are updated when normative and regulatory documents (SCSE, TC) are changed, when catalogs of elective disciplines are updated, as well as when innovative technologies are introduced into the educational process.

The University widely uses the principle of an independent objective assessment, involving representatives of practical healthcare and potential employers as chairmen, members and examiners of the state attestation commission for the final attestation of graduates. Their opinions and comments are taken into account when planning improvements.

The functioning mechanisms of the training quality assurance system created at the university include the monitoring of the educational program; ensuring the competence of the teaching staff; regular internal audit according to agreed criteria; accounting and analysis of the opinions of employers.

In university functioning Student Service Center «Keremet», created to serve all categories of students, teachers and employees of the University in order to optimize and automate the processes in the field of providing services on the principle of "one office", minimizing corruption risks, transferring paper services to electronic format. The University has trust boxes, a helpline, which are continuously functioning and are one of the important types of socially significant services.

***Strengths according to the standard:***

No strengths were identified for this standard.

***Recommendations for OP 8D10101 Public Health:***

- No

***Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:***

Strong - 0; satisfactory - 16, suggests improvement - 0; unsatisfactory - 0.

**6.5. Standard «Scientific guidance»**

✓ Each doctoral student must have scientific advisers, one of whom is foreign, to cover all aspects of the program



- ✓ *The number of doctoral students assigned to the scientific adviser should be adequate to his workload.*
- ✓ *Scientific consultants can be scientific consultants of other organizations, both in the country and abroad.*
- ✓ *Qualified scientific adviser must have a PhD or equivalent degree, be an active scientist with scientific research publications in refereed literature.*
- ✓ *When selecting and appointing a scientific adviser, his research experience and international relations should be analyzed.*
- ✓ *Medical organization of education/scientific organization should have clearly defined duties and responsibilities of each scientific advisor.*
- ✓ *Scientific advisers should have regular consultations with their doctoral students*
- ✓ *The medical education institution/scientific organization should plan and organize training courses for scientific advisers on the policy of implementing doctoral programs, the main responsibilities of scientific advisers.*
- ✓ *A medical education organization/scientific organization should provide a document that describes the process of scientific leadership. The document must be signed by the scientific adviser, the doctoral candidate and the head of the doctoral program.*

### ***Evidence-based part***

The number of teaching staff for the contingent of doctoral students of the specialty 8D10101 - Public Health at the departments is controlled by the department of personnel management and documentation of the Department for Administrative and Personnel Work and is 100% in accordance with the norms of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 27, 2007 No. 319-III «On Education». The educational program is carried out through a competition for filling vacant positions, the procedure for which is regulated by the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated April 23, 2015. No. 230 «On approval of the Rules for the competitive replacement of positions of professors and teachers and researchers of higher educational institutions» in accordance with the requirements of Order No. 169 of the Ministry of Education and Science dated April 30, 2020 «On Amendments to the Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan» dated July 13, 2009 No. 338 «On Approval of the Standard Qualification Characteristics of the Positions of Pedagogical Workers and Equivalent Persons».

The teaching staff is formed based on the needs for the effective implementation of the educational program, as well as on the basis of the total volume of the teaching load. When compiling the staffing table for the new academic year, for conducting classes with doctoral students, a mandatory requirement for teachers is the presence of basic education, the correspondence of the code of the specialty to the academic degree, academic title. Currently, the training of doctoral students in the educational program 8D10101 – «Public Health» is provided by highly qualified teaching staff that meets the qualification requirements approved by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The University is taking measures to increase the level of motivation of teaching staff by distributing material resources based on the results of the work of each employee, as well as strengthening the individual contribution of the teacher of the department/module through incentive payments, taking into account criteria that allow evaluating the effectiveness and quality of work.

Bonuses for employees are carried out in order to stimulate employees, staffing with competent and experienced personnel, ensuring sufficient material conditions for the conscientious performance of official duties, production efficiency and work quality, the relationship between specific labor results and the amount of incentives, increasing the material interest of employees and the quality of work.

Teachers are given the opportunity to use information and communication technologies for self-study, access to information, work in the healthcare system, as well as an international information base for teaching evidence-based medicine and preparing students for continuing medical education and professional development.

The university used special attention to the training and professional development of employees. So, for example, the teaching staff of the faculty Vinnikov D.S. and Maulenova B.N. in 2018 received a Certificate of completion of a refresher course at the Institute for Advanced Studies and Additional Education of KazNU. Al-Farabi 108 hours on the topic «Methodology in medical education and science»; Mamyrbekova S.A. in 2021 received a certificate of training»

Higher Education 4.0 «Digital Transformation»; also 5 teaching staff of the faculty have certificates of advanced training in the Center for retraining and advanced training Best . In accordance with the Comprehensive Plan of the main activities for the implementation of the Strategic Plan of KazNU, in order to improve the teaching qualifications and develop the competencies of the teaching staff, a teacher training system has been created. The main goal is to increase human resources capable of ensuring the quality of medical education in line with the best international practice. The teaching staff by the EP Public Health has a 100% degree, of which 5 are MD, 6 PhD, 5 PhDs in Health.

The University takes measures to motivate and stimulate employees: ensuring working conditions in accordance with the labor legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the labor contract and the collective agreement, providing employees with equipment, tools, technical documentation and other means necessary for the performance of labor duties; timely remuneration and payment of incentive bonuses for quality work; Every year, teachers take advanced training courses on the basis of the Faculty of Advanced Training and Additional Education at the expense of the university; systematic direction of employees for advanced training outside the university; training of scientific and pedagogical staff from among young scientists and employees; training and specialization of teaching staff abroad, including under the Bolashak program: for 2019-2021. 4 teaching staff of the university completed an internship at leading foreign universities: East Carolina University , USA , Osaka University , Osaka , Japan , Istanbul University , Seoul National University .

Monitoring the effectiveness and quality of teaching, evaluation of scientific and practical work, the performance of official duties of the teaching staff is carried out by the head of the department, the dean of the ShPH, the personnel department, by monitoring the implementation of the individual work plan of teachers and the work plan of the department. The management of the ShPH and heads of departments control the quality of keeping individual documentation of teachers. The individual plans of the teaching staff reflect such sections as educational work, educational and methodological work, educational work with students.

Relations between employees and the employer of KazNU are regulated by labor and collective agreements, teacher-student, student-student relationships are regulated by the Rules of Internal Documentation.

The procedure for consideration of labor disputes is carried out in accordance with the Labor Code.

Training of scientific and pedagogical personnel for PhD doctoral studies at the ShPH is carried out by improving the qualifications of teaching staff at the intra-university, republican and international levels.

Recruitment for advanced training courses for teaching staff is carried out at the request of the heads of structural divisions, according to the advanced training plan. Based on the applications received, an order is formed for conducting a PC course, at the end of which, students who successfully complete the course are issued a document confirming the training (certificates / certificate).

To improve the level of both professional and pedagogical competence, personal potential and readiness to solve non-standard tasks, the university holds events with the invitation of foreign scientists as part of the Visiting Professor program.

Developed mechanisms and criteria for systematic evaluation of the effectiveness of teaching quality: these are IQC at the departments, open classes, mutual visits to classes, student surveys, etc. The results of open classes are discussed at meetings of departments, the Academic Council.

The effectiveness of the quality of teaching is assessed by the coverage of thematic issues, the participation of students in a practical lesson, the interest, activity, motivation of students in

the educational process, the quality of academic performance, the assimilation of practical skills and the development of clinical thinking.

Mutual visiting journals reflect that the educational process at the University is carried out on the basis of innovative learning technologies, informatization and computerization of the entire learning process, the application of new concepts in the field of education and science, the improvement of traditional teaching methods, the creation and constant replenishment of the fund of electronic learning tools. The results of practical understanding of innovative forms of education are discussed at meetings of departments, methodological seminars, scientific and practical conferences.

In KazNU, scientific consultants are appointed to supervise the doctoral dissertation and control over the implementation of the dissertation work for a doctoral student within two months after enrollment. The guidance of doctoral students for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) is carried out by consultants in the amount of at least 2 people, one of whom is a scientist from a foreign university that meets the requirements of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Candidates for scientific consultants are discussed and approved at a meeting of the relevant department, scientific committee (SC), the University Council and the Senate of the teaching staff, approval is carried out in accordance with the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 391 dated June 17, 2015, qualification requirements, as amended by the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 231, dated 5.06. 2020 and are issued by order of the rector.

The scientific adviser must have an academic degree «PhD», or «Doctor of Science», or «Doctor of Philosophy (PhD)», or «Doctor of Specialization», or an academic degree of «Doctor of Philosophy (PhD)», or «Doctor of Specialization», or the degree «Doctor of Philosophy (PhD)», or «Doctor by profile», be the author of:

- in the areas of training 8D05 «Natural sciences, mathematics and statistics», 8D06 «Information and communication technologies», 8D07 «Engineering, manufacturing and construction industries», 8D08 «Agriculture and bioresource», 8D09 «Veterinary medicine», 8D10 «Health care and social security (medicine)» 2 articles in international peer-reviewed scientific journals included in the 1st, 2nd, 3rd quartile according to JCR (JSR) in the Web of Science Core Collection (Web of Science Core Collection) or having a percentile score in Cite Score (Website Speed) not less than 35, or Hirsch index 2 or more; - in other areas of training, who is the author of 5 scientific articles in specialized publications included in the List of scientific publications and 1 scientific article in an international peer-reviewed scientific journal that has an impact factor according to JCR (JCR) or indexed in one of the Science Citation Index databases Expanded, Social Science CitationIndex or Arts and Humanities Citation Index in WebofScienceCoreCollection (Web of Science Core Collection) or having a Cite Score percentile (Site Score) of at least 35.

### ***Analytical part***

Based on the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 391 dated June 17, 2015 year, qualification requirements, (as amended by the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 231, dated 06/05/2020 d.) in KazNU, scientific advisers are appointed to supervise the doctoral dissertation and control over the implementation of the dissertation work for a doctoral candidate within two months after enrollment, one of whom is a foreign scientist. x months after admission.

The priority of supervising the dissertation work of a doctoral student is given to scientific consultants who carry out scientific projects of both domestic and foreign origin, have publications in international peer-reviewed journals and an h-index of at least 2, as well as successfully supervise the scientific research of doctoral students of previous years.

A tripartite agreement is concluded between KazNU, domestic and foreign consultants, providing for the responsibility of each of the parties in the timely and high-quality preparation of a doctoral student: responsibility for the theoretical part of the EP, research work, all types of practices, scientific internships and proper publication of the results of the doctoral student's own research in journals, included in the CQES database and international peer-reviewed publications.

In KazNU, no more than 2 doctoral students can be assigned to a scientific consultant. If the scientific consultant has an H-index of 3 or more, he has the right to supervise 3 doctoral students.

KazNU regularly conducts training courses for scientific consultants / managers on the policy of implementing doctoral programs as part of the implementation of the development of scientific potential in accordance with the Concept for the development of research activities.

The university annually holds seminars on "Research Management" with the invitation of foreign experts, where the University staff is trained. The subject of the seminars are the processes of organization and development of scientific research in the system of health care and medical education.

In order to improve the quality of knowledge in the field of their professional competence, scientific supervisors in the library are provided with access to information resources and databases, the costs of which are compensated by the University. Scientific supervisors are systematically informed through the University's corporate website and corporate e-mail about grant competitions at home and abroad, as well as about ongoing conferences in the field, about journals indexed by Thomson Reuters, which accept quality articles free of charge, where they can publish the results of their research in both educational and scientific activities.

***Strengths according to the standard:***

No strengths were identified for this standard.

***Recommendations for OP 8D10101 Public Health:***

- No

***Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:***

Strong - 0; satisfactory - 9, suggests improvement - 0; unsatisfactory - 0.

**6.6. Standard «Dissertstion»**

- ✓ *The doctoral program should end with the preparation and defense of a doctoral dissertation, which is an indicator of the formation of competencies in a doctoral candidate in accordance with the educational program*
- ✓ *The medical education organization/scientific organization should determine the term for preparing the thesis, limited to a 3-year period.*
- ✓ *The dissertation must be written by the doctoral candidate independently, contain a set of new scientific results and provisions put forward by the author for public defense, and testify to the author's personal contribution to science, and also meet one of the requirements:*
- ✓ *contain new scientifically substantiated results that solve an important scientific problem;*
- ✓ *contain new scientifically substantiated results, the use of which ensures the solution of an important applied problem;*
- ✓ *contain new scientifically substantiated theoretical and (or) experimental results, the totality of which is important for the development of specific scientific areas.*
- ✓ *The structure of the dissertation should include a literature review related to the research topic, a detailed analysis of the purpose and objectives of the research work, a methodological framework, methodological solutions, results, discussion, conclusion, conclusions and further research prospects.*
- ✓ *The dissertation of applied importance must contain information on the practical use of the scientific results obtained by the author, confirmed by copyright certificates, patents and other official documents*
- ✓ *The dissertation can be written in the state or Russian languages.*
- ✓ *To ensure international recognition, the dissertation can be written and defended in English.*
- ✓ *Annotation to the dissertation should be published in the state, Russian and English languages.*
- ✓ *The summary of the doctoral dissertation should be published in two languages (English, Russian or Kazakh), depending on the main language of study of the doctoral candidate.*
- ✓ *The results of the dissertation work should be available to interested parties (doctoral students, scientific consultants, employees of the organization where the dissertation was carried out, researchers performing scientific work in a similar direction, and other categories of interested parties), i.e. published unless copyright, or other reasons, prevent it.*
- ✓ *The dissertation can be published on the home page of the medical educational organization / scientific organization in which the scientific*

*work was carried out, both in an abbreviated (summary, theses) and in full, if copyright or other reasons do not prevent this. The dissertation submitted for defense must be published on the website of the university where the dissertation council operates in the specialty of dissertation work.*

- ✓ *The dissertation work must be accompanied by at least 7 (seven) publications on the topic of the dissertation, including at least 3 (three) in scientific publications recommended by the Committee, 1 (one) in an international scientific publication, 3 (three) in the materials of international conferences, including 1 (one) in the materials of foreign conferences. An international publication must be in the information database of Thomson Reuters (ISI Web of Knowledge, Thomson Reuters) or Scopus, and have a non-zero impact factor.*
- ✓ *In the case of joint publications, the co-author should document that the doctoral student has made a significant and independent contribution to the writing of these works. Ownership of the doctoral student's research results must be clearly defined and described. This will avoid re-publishing results in more than one dissertation.*
- ✓ *The medical education institution/scientific organization must ensure that the dissertation of the doctoral student is discussed at an extended meeting of the department where the dissertation was carried out.*

### ***Evidence-based part***

Normative duration development the educational program of doctoral studies in the scientific and pedagogical direction is 3 years. The educational program of doctoral studies is developed according to the principle of modular training. The topic of a doctoral dissertation is determined taking into account its relevance during the first semester. The direction of dissertation research, as a rule, is associated with national priorities, either state programs, or programs of fundamental or applied research. The topic of a doctoral dissertation with justification and structure, a plan for completing a doctoral dissertation indicating the deadlines for completing work on a dissertation, a plan for scientific publications, internships are reflected in the individual work plan of a doctoral student.

Scientific advisers of doctoral students are approved by the decision of Scientist Council of the University at the request of the Academic Council during the first two months of study in agreement with the graduating departments.

The scientific guidance of students in the educational program of doctoral studies (doctoral students) is carried out by a special advisory commission in the amount of at least 2 people (domestic and foreign scientific consultants), appointed from among specialists whose qualifications meet the requirements.

Scientific consultants are persons actively engaged in scientific research in a given branch of science (according to their specialty).

For doctoral students who have mastered the full course of theoretical training of the educational program of doctoral studies at KazNU, who completed the scientific component, but did not defend their doctoral dissertation, they are given the opportunity to defend their thesis in subsequent years on a paid basis in the amount of 4 academic credits (SCSE 647).

Allowed adjustment topics of the dissertation of a doctoral student on the basis of a reasoned opinion of the supervisor.

### ***Analytical part***

The topics of approved dissertations of doctoral students, domestic and foreign supervisors of scientific works were discussed at the University Council of KazNU and approved by the order of the rector.

The content and design of the dissertation work with the relevant sections of doctoral dissertations, completed and being performed at KazNU, satisfy requirements working instructions «Requirements for the content and design of a PhD doctoral dissertation».

Of the 11 graduates of the doctoral program «Public Health» of KazNU, one graduate fully completed doctoral studies with the defense of dissertation.

Doctoral students at the meeting noted that after 3 years and completion of doctoral studies, the lack of publications of the dissertation research in the journals included in the Scopus and Web of Science database does not make it possible to defend a doctoral dissertation. Some doctoral students have already submitted articles to an international peer-reviewed journal and are awaiting publication, however, most doctoral students have not started preparing for writing a publication.

**Strengths according to the standard:**

No strengths were identified for this standard.

**Recommendations for OP 8D10101 Public Health:**

1. To implement the requirements of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan to enter the defense of doctoral dissertations, monitor the intermediate stages of the implementation of the individual doctoral plan within the framework of the implementation and writing of chapters of the doctoral dissertation and publications 2 times per academic year. / Dean of the Faculty of Medicine and Health. June 2022./

**Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:**

Strong - 0; satisfactory - 15, suggests improvements - 2; unsatisfactory - 0.

**6.7. Standard «Evaluation of dissertations»**

- ✓ *Medical organization of education/scientific organization should define, approve and publish the principles, methods and practices used to evaluate doctoral students, including criteria for evaluating scientific work.*
- ✓ *The final assessment and approval of the dissertation work should be carried out by the Dissertation Council.*
- ✓ *The defense of the dissertation should be carried out at the university where the Dissertation Council operates in the relevant area of doctoral training.*
- ✓ *Before submitting documents for consideration to the dissertation council, the dissertation must be reviewed.*
- ✓ *Reviewers*
- ✓ *based*
- ✓ *study*
- ✓ *dissertations and published works should submit written reviews to the extended meeting of the department, which evaluate the relevance of the chosen topic, the degree of validity of scientific provisions, conclusions, recommendations formulated in the dissertation and its practical significance, their novelty, and also a conclusion is made on the possibility of passing the next stages of defense for the award of the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) or Doctor of Philosophy in the relevant specialty.*
- ✓ *The defense of a doctoral dissertation should include both the preparation of a written version and the subsequent oral defense.*
- ✓ *Dissertation defense should be open to the public.*
- ✓ *The time between the submission of the dissertation to the Dissertation Council and the defense should be as short as possible in order to ensure further employment for the doctoral graduate.*
- ✓ *The dissertation defense should be considered successful if the Dissertation Council made a positive decision, i.e. 2/3 (two thirds) or more of the members of the Dissertation Council who participated in the meeting voted for him. If less than 2/3 (two thirds) of the members of the Dissertation Council who participated in the meeting voted for a positive decision, a negative decision is made.*
- ✓ *In case of a negative assessment of the written version of the dissertation, the doctoral student should be given the opportunity to finalize the dissertation. If a negative assessment is given in the oral defense, the doctoral student should be allowed an additional defense. In exceptional cases, the Dissertation Council may reject the dissertation without the possibility of revision.*
- ✓ *The doctoral degree should be awarded by the authorized body in case of a positive decision of the dissertation council and its application, which evaluates the dissertation and oral defense; expert evaluation of the dissertation work by experts of the authorized body (in the absence of a special status of a medical education institution). The doctoral degree should be awarded by the university in case of a positive decision of the dissertation council, which evaluates the dissertation and oral defense in case of a special status of the medical education institution.*
- ✓ *In order to achieve independent and competent international expertise, medical educational institutions / scientific organizations should actively use information technologies that allow some members of the Dissertation Council to participate in the process of evaluating and defending a dissertation in a remote format.*

**Evidence-based part**

At the present time, the principles, methods and practice of assessing doctoral students are regulated by the Academic Policy of the Al-Farabi Kazakh National University 2021-2022. (decision of the Academic Committee dated 19.04.2019, protocol No. 8 ), developed, approved and published on the KazNU website.

According to the Regulations, the assessment of a doctoral student is carried out by current control academic performance, intermediate and final attestation of doctoral students. Yearly attestation of doctoral students - a procedure carried out to control the implementation of the individual doctoral student curriculum (DSC) (theoretical training, practical training, research work), is carried out by the Commission approved by the vice-rector. The yearly attestation is carried out on the basis of the results of the interim attestation, the practice reports provided by the doctoral student, internship reports and written reports on the doctoral student's scientific work, in accordance with the IC for the year on the chosen research topic. In addition to the

report, the doctoral student submits: the doctoral candidate's research program, annexes with abstracts of reports at conferences, round tables and seminars; published qualifying articles in popular science journals that describe the main results of the doctoral candidate's scientific activity. At the end of the research work, the doctoral student submits a report on the implementation signed by the supervisor and the review of the latter. The results of the attestation are assessed as "certified / not attested", are drawn up in the minutes of the meeting; the percentage of completion of scientific research is determined and, if necessary, the progress of the research is adjusted.

The FSA assessment method is a comprehensive exam (oral and written), the graduating department forms tickets on the subjects of the disciplines included in the comprehensive exam.

Preliminary examination of the dissertation. After the doctoral student has mastered the doctoral educational program and presented the dissertation, the department where the dissertation was carried out conducts a preliminary discussion of the dissertation at an extended meeting. To review the work (pre-defense / approbation) PhD doctoral students are organized and conducted with the additional involvement of scientists corresponding to the profile of the dissertation, the Academic Council of the Faculty of Public Health. The structure includes scientists of the University who have the degree of Doctor / Candidate of Sciences and Doctor of Philosophy (PhD), or Doctor in profile, with experience in research and scientific and pedagogical work of at least 5 years, with at least 2 (two) articles and/or reviews in peer-reviewed scientific publications indexed in the Science Index Expanded Web of Science database and/or having a Cite Score percentile in Scopus and/or an h-index of at least 1.

Preliminary examination of the dissertation is carried out at a meeting of the department. For this purpose, the doctoral student submits a dissertation for registration to the department of training and certification of scientific personnel of the university.

The conclusion on the dissertation on the recommendation or non-recommendation for defense is drawn up in the form of an extract from the minutes of the meeting of the department, signed by the chairman of the meeting, certified by the head of the department for training and attestation of scientific personnel and approved by the vice-rector for scientific and innovative activities of the university. The conclusion contains: the relevance of the research topic, the scientific results and their validity, the practical and theoretical significance of the scientific results, the completeness of the publication of the dissertation materials in the press in accordance with the requirements of clause 61 of this Regulation, comments and suggestions, the conclusion about the recommendation or not the recommendation for defense.

Doctoral students who have passed a comprehensive exam go to the next stage - the defense of a doctoral dissertation. The final assessment of the scientific activity of a doctoral student is the defense of a doctoral dissertation in accordance with the Rules for awarding academic degrees, approved by order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated March 31, 2011 No. 127.

According to the Model Regulations on Dissertation Councils, checking for plagiarism is mandatory for any scientific work of a doctoral student. According to the requirements of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, doctoral students are tested under the "Plagiarism" program at the National Center for State Scientific and Technical Expertise. Based on the results of the examination, the doctoral student is issued a certificate of the appropriate sample, which is subsequently submitted to the Dissertation Council at the place of defense.

The implementation of the doctoral program takes place in the conditions of respect for mutual respect, planning and common responsibility of the supervisor and the doctoral candidate.

The University cooperates with leading research centers in Kazakhstan, near and far abroad. To achieve the goals set, active work is underway to develop partnerships with foreign embassies in the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The university has established contacts and concluded memorandums of cooperation with universities . For 2016-2021 academic year 47 cooperation agreements and memorandums of understanding were concluded with foreign educational, scientific and clinical organizations: Japan, South Korea, Turkey, Kyrgyzstan, Russia, etc.

The implementation of the EP of the doctoral program in the specialty "Public Health" is implemented using the following educational activities and teaching methods:

- practical exercises: survey, work in small groups, testing, discussions, presentations, feedback, work with medical literature, search for information on the Internet, discussion of the results of individual and group tasks;

- independent work of a doctoral student under the guidance of a teacher (IWDT), which is an extracurricular type of work of a doctoral candidate and is carried out by him in contact with a teacher. IWDT is carried out according to a separate schedule, which is not included in the general schedule of training sessions;

- practice: participation in the work of the basic institutions of a doctoral candidate ( a base corresponding to a narrow specialty, the topic of a dissertation) with subsequent analysis and a report on past practice. The research practice of doctoral students is carried out in accordance with the approved academic calendar and individual work plan. Between KazNU and the organization, which is the base of practice, an Agreement is concluded. The University has such contracts with many medical organizations of the Republic of Kazakhstan: the Research Institute of Oncology and Radiology, the Scientific Center for Hygiene and Epidemiology, the Research Institute of Cardiology and Internal Medicine, the leading medical universities of Kazakhstan, etc.

Practical classes are aimed at expanding and detailing scientific knowledge, at developing and consolidating professional skills. Preparation for practical classes involves preliminary independent work of doctoral students in accordance with the methodological developments for each planned topic. Practical exercises also serve as a form of checking the achievement of goals through the current monitoring of the results of independent work of doctoral students, their ability to work with primary sources, mastering the skills of independent presentation with oral presentations, substantiating and defending their own point of view, through teaching doctoral students the rules of discussion and the ability to listen to a partner, identification of individual learning difficulties in individual doctoral students. Also, the faculty of the Higher School of Public Health conduct scientific seminars for doctoral students of all medical universities of the Republic of Kazakhstan on the topic: “Conducting scientific research in the field of health and healthcare”, the purpose of which is to organize a platform for the exchange of experience in scientific, practical, research and innovation activities on topical issues in the field of health and healthcare. According to doctoral students, such seminars help doctoral students in setting the goals and objectives of the study, the theoretical and practical parts; encourage discussion of objects, subjects, volumes, materials and methods of research, the results of scientific research; development of skills for conducting scientific discussion, oral and written presentation of the results of scientific research; approbation of the results of dissertation research; teach adjustment and quality control of research work.

University teachers at all levels of education are doing a lot of work to introduce into the educational process new forms and methods of teaching, means of enhancing cognitive activity: - case-based learning (CBL), incl. analysis of specific situations (ACS or case study); team-based learning (TBL), incl. work in small groups; role-playing, business games; creative tasks (video films, crossword puzzles, quizzes, etc.); the use of problematic and situational tasks in practical classes; - e-learning. The syllabuses clearly spell out the teaching methods for each discipline. The syllabuses are available through the online services of the University.



The use of innovative technologies in the educational process of the university is based on a powerful material and technical base, which is constantly being improved in accordance with the requirements of the time.

Training sessions in doctoral studies are conducted using innovative technologies and interactive teaching methods (discussion, brainstorming, work in small groups, case method, videoconference, debates, round tables).

In the structure of the educational program of doctoral studies, a significant place is given to independent work. The departments approve the independent work of a doctoral candidate, which is divided into two types - independent work of a doctoral student with a teacher (IWDST) and IWD. IWDST is an extracurricular work of a doctoral candidate in contact with a teacher, which must be indicated in the schedule of studies. Hours of the IWDST include consultations on homework, extracurricular work performed by the doctoral student independently on a specific list of topics reserved for independent study, provided with educational and methodological literature and recommendations; controlled in the form of tests, examinations, colloquia, essays, reports and other forms of knowledge control. As part of independent work, a doctoral student works with scientific literature, performs his own research, and analyzes his research. The department, to which the doctoral student is assigned, has a schedule of the IWDST, where the doctoral candidate can receive the necessary advice within the framework of the discipline being studied and his research. For example, at the Department of Epidemiology, Biostatistics and Evidence-Based Medicine, doctoral students receive high-quality advice on processing the results of their own research in computer programs SPSS, etc., as well as on evidence bases of literary sources (Cochrane Library, etc.).

The KazNU doctoral program guarantees training in the rules of ethics and responsible conduct of scientific research. Medical ethics includes moral issues in medical practice, such as the values, rights, and obligations associated with researcher behavior and decision-making. KazNU uses approaches in the formation of doctoral students' values not only as a researcher, but also as a student of a medical university. KazNU has developed a student code of honor, a researcher code of honor, and a regulation on the local ethical commission. All documents are located on the KazNU website.

### ***Analytical part***

Evaluation of dissertations of doctoral students is carried out by the Dissertation Councils of universities of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

After the doctoral student has mastered the doctoral educational program and presented the dissertation, the department at which the dissertation was carried out conducts a preliminary discussion of the dissertation at an extended meeting.

Before submitting a dissertation for preliminary discussion at the department, a doctoral candidate must:

- get dissertations in the Scientific Library of KazNU UDC;
- check the dissertation at the National Center for State Scientific and Technical Expertise (hereinafter referred to as NCSSTE) for technical design (norm control).

To discuss the dissertation at the department, the doctoral student submits the following documents:

- dissertation in open form;
- reviews of domestic and foreign scientific consultants ;
- list of scientific papers and their copies;
- transcript ;
- an extract from the protocol of the Scientist Council of KazNU and an order to approve the topic of the dissertation work and assign scientific consultants;
- primary documents on the dissertation;

– conclusion of the Ethics Commission on the absence of violations in the process of planning, evaluating, selecting, conducting and disseminating the results of scientific research, including the protection of the rights, safety and well-being of research objects (objects of wildlife and habitats).

The procedure for discussion at the meeting of the department includes: presentation by the doctoral student of the main provisions of the dissertation; questions of the participants of the meeting of the department - answers of the doctoral student; speeches of scientific advisers or, in case of absence, the announcement of their reviews; speeches of reviewers; doctoral candidate's responses to reviewers' comments, as well as their wishes and recommendations; dissertation discussion; adoption of the conclusion by open vote.

The conclusion on the dissertation on the recommendation or not of the recommendation of the department for defense is drawn up in the form of an extract from the minutes of the meeting of the department, signed by the chairman and secretary of the meeting, and approved by the vice-rector for science.

After receiving a positive conclusion from the extended meeting of the department, the doctoral student submits an application to the Rector of the University for the choice of the dissertation council in which he will defend himself. Doctoral student of KazNU in the EP Public Health passed the defense procedure in the Dissertation Council at the Kazakh Medical University "Higher School of Public Health".

The dissertation council of the KMU HShPH consists of a chairman, deputy chairman, academic secretary and members of the council. The DC includes at least 6 (six) people who have an academic degree (candidate of science, doctor of science, doctor of philosophy (PhD), doctor in profile). Including one scientist from a foreign university (invited depending on the topic of the doctoral student).

The dissertation work is posted on the official website of the KMU «HShPH».

***Strengths according to the standard:***

- *No strengths were identified for this standard.*

***Recommendations for OP 8D10101 Public Health:***

- *No*

**Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:**

Strong - 0; satisfactory - 12, suggests improvements - 0; unsatisfactory - 0.

**6.8. Standard «Governance and Administration»**

*Program management*

- ✓ *The management of the medical education organization / scientific organization must be effective and ensure the improvement of the educational program.*
- ✓ *Medical education organization/scientific organization should determine the structural unit responsible for educational programs and achievement of the final learning outcomes.*
- ✓ *The structural unit responsible for educational programs should have the authority to plan and implement the educational program, including the allocation of allocated resources for the planning and implementation of teaching and learning methods, evaluation of doctoral students, evaluation of the educational program and courses of study.*
- ✓ *Representatives of doctoral students should interact with the management of the doctoral department on the design, management and evaluation of doctoral programs.*
- ✓ *The involvement of doctoral students in the work of organizations of students working on the development of programs for the preparation of doctoral students should be encouraged and facilitated.*
- ✓ *The structural unit responsible for educational programs should ensure the transparency of the management system and decisions that are published in bulletins, posted on the website of the university, included in the protocols for review and execution.*
- ✓ *The medical education organization should, through the structural unit responsible for educational programs, plan and implement innovations in the educational program.*
- ✓ *The medical education organization should include representatives from other relevant stakeholders in the structural unit of the medical education organization responsible for educational programs, including other participants in the educational process, representatives from clinical sites, graduates of medical education organizations, healthcare professionals involved in the learning process or other teachers of the university faculties.*

- ✓ *The medical education organization should ensure that the structural unit responsible for the educational program:*
- ✓ *takes into account the peculiarities of the conditions in which graduates will have to work and, accordingly, modify the educational program.*
- ✓ *considers the modification of the educational program based on feedback from the public and society as a whole.*
- ✓ *The medical education/scientific organization should ensure that the renewal and restructuring process leads to:*
- ✓ *improving the organizational structure and management principles of the doctoral program to ensure effective operation in the face of changing circumstances and needs, and, in the future, to meet the interests of various stakeholder groups.*
- ✓ **Academic Leadership**
- ✓ *The medical education institution must clearly define the responsibility of the academic leadership in relation to the development and management of the educational program*
- ✓ *The medical education organization should periodically evaluate the academic leadership regarding the achievement of its mission and the final results of education.*
- ✓ *Training budget and resource allocation*
- ✓ *The medical education organization must:*
- ✓ *have a clear terms of reference and authority to provide the educational program with resources, including the target budget for education.*
- ✓ *allocate the resources necessary for the implementation of the educational program and distribute educational resources in accordance with their needs.*
- ✓ *The system of financing a medical education organization should be based on the principles of efficiency, effectiveness, priority, transparency, responsibility, differentiation and independence of all levels of budgets.*
- ✓ *Financial and administrative policy should be aimed at improving the quality of the educational program.*
- Administrative staff and management**
- A medical education organization must have an appropriate administrative and academic staff, including their number and composition in accordance with qualifications, in order to:*
- ✓ *ensure the implementation of the educational program and related activities;*
- ✓ *ensure proper management and allocation of resources.*
- ✓ *The medical education institution/scientific organization should develop and implement an internal management quality assurance program, including consideration of needs for improvement, and conduct regular management review and analysis.*
- ✓ *The medical education institution/scientific organization must ensure the implementation of the doctoral program in accordance with the quality management system certified by independent organizations.*
- ✓ **Engagement with the health sector**
- ✓ *The medical education institution/scientific organization should have constructive interaction with the health sector, with related health sectors of society and government, including the exchange of information, cooperation and initiatives of the organization, which contributes to the provision of qualified specialists in accordance with the needs of society.*
- ✓ *The medical education organization/scientific organization should provide operational link between the educational program and the subsequent stages of professional training.*
- ✓ *A medical education institution/scientific organization should be given official status of cooperation with partners in the health sector, which includes the conclusion of formal agreements defining the content and forms of cooperation and/or the conclusion of a joint contract and the establishment of a coordinating committee, and holding joint events.*

### **Evidence-based part**

In university organized continuous monitoring of the implementation of the strategic plan of the educational program of doctoral studies in the specialty 8D10101 "Public Health", in accordance, with results which is happening current adjustment of individual moments of the plan for maximum efficiency. In evaluation fulfillment plans and making addition and change active participation accept employers, students and teaching staff of ShPH.

The main structural subdivisions involved in the direct implementation of the doctoral program are specialized departments and the dean's office.

The main goal of the dean's office is to conduct continuous organizational, coordination and administrative work aimed at achieving the goals and objectives set for the dean's office.

The dean's office is directly responsible for the organization and implementation of the educational process, the functioning of the EP. The dean's office coordinates the work in PhD doctoral studies, controls the academic and labor discipline in accordance with the normative and legal documents of the university. According to the organizational structure of NJSC "KazNU", the dean's office is supervised by the Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs). The issues of improving the EP are considered and discussed at the Scientific Council of the Faculty.

The main educational and scientific structural units of the university that carry out educational and methodological and research work in one or more related / related disciplines, educational work among students, as well as the training of scientific and pedagogical personnel are the departments. The Higher School of Health includes the following departments: epidemiology, biostatistics and evidence-based medicine, health policy and organization, and the department of physical education and sports.

The general management of the implementation of the EP is carried out by the director of the Higher School of Public Health. The Director, at meetings with postgraduate students,

maintains regular feedback on design issues when forming an IC, planning scientific internships, academic mobility, etc., managing and evaluating doctoral programs (meetings with teaching staff, meetings, questioning).

The assessment of the organization of training in the departments is carried out by monitoring the external and internal conditions and the state of the educational process at the university in order to identify trends, as well as deviations in the quality of training students from the strategic goal by the Methodological Council of the Faculty and Scientific Council faculty which are means of ensuring the transparency of decisions made in the educational program and management system. Each academic year, the Methodological Council carries out an examination of curricula and useful programs for EP, syllabuses, considers issues of educational and methodological support of the educational process at the university; discussing and making proposals for improving draft regulatory legal documents related to the issues of methodological support of the university. Work in progress organization developing textbooks, teaching aids, including on electronic media, discussing proposals to improve the list of specialties (professions) based on forecasting priority areas of production technologies and science, on the basis of which the Register of EP is updated. For 2020-2021, a DBA program (Doctor of Business Administration) was included in the Register. For this program, the team of authors of the Faculty of Medicine and Healthcare received an Author's certificate. Also, the methodological council considered the catalog of disciplines, annual plans of the faculty, forms of control of doctoral students' knowledge. All issues after consideration by the Methodological Council are subject to be submitted for approval by the Scientists Council of the University.

Scientist council is collegial organ of the faculty in academic, scientific and clinical activities. His decisions in these areas are binding on the staff and students of the faculty.

The Higher School of Public Health is an educational, scientific and administrative structural unit that implements the doctoral program in the specialty "Public Health", develops the socio-cultural competencies of doctoral students, as well as manages all types of activities of the departments that implement the training of doctoral students in the educational program "Public Health". The organizational structures of the management of the EP contribute to the achievement of the mission and goals of the Faculty of Medicine and Health, maintain institutional efficiency and integrity, create and maintain an educational environment for learning, pedagogical and research training of doctoral students, contribute to the development of communication skills and conduct scientific research.

The University has developed mechanisms and criteria for a systematic assessment of the effectiveness of teachers, their level of competence, the professional potential of the staff and readiness to solve the strategic tasks of our organization, formed plan future development employees.

The main goals of the rating are: the accumulation of statistical information about the formation and dynamics of the development of departments and teachers; comparative determination of the actual state of educational and scientific activities in each department for targeted resource management; connection of the issues under consideration with the creation of an intra-university quality management system for training specialists.

Monitoring the effectiveness and quality of teaching, evaluation of scientific and practical work, performance of duties of the teaching staff is carried out by the head of the department, the director of the Higher School of Health, the dean of the FM&H, the personnel department, by monitoring the implementation of the individual work plan of teachers and the work plan of the department.

Every year, the University conducts a survey of students through the "Univer". According to the results of the survey of doctoral students, there is a positive trend in the assessment of professional qualities, norms of behavior and ethics of teaching staff.

Mechanisms and criteria for a systematic assessment of the effectiveness of the quality of teaching have been developed: these are IDC at the departments, open classes, mutual visits to classes, student surveys, etc. The results of open classes are discussed at meetings of departments, AC.

The departments keep logs of mutual visits. An analysis of open and working sessions based on the results of mutual visits shows that the compliance of the ongoing practical training with the thematic plan and requirements has been carried out

Each teaching staff is registered on the site and has a personal account, which is a tool that allows teaching staff to enter, edit and store information about educational and scientific activities.

#### ***Analytical part***

To provide openness discussions problems and ideas for teaching doctoral students on the official website of the university there is a rector's blog for all students. Once in year held meeting rector with a contingent of university and postgraduate education.

The results of academic activity, the effectiveness of modern forms of management of the educational process, the prospects for further improvement of management and improving the quality of education are considered and discussed in the final reports of the rector, vice-rectors and heads of structural units at the annual traditional scientific-practical and educational-methodical conferences. To analyze the results and develop measures for improvement, internal commissions are formed (committee for holiday incentives, for competitive nominations, awards, expert commissions for competitions of STP teaching staff and young scientists, etc.). The results of the work of the commissions are heard at a meeting of the Scientific Council and are the basis for measuring and improving the efficiency of the university.

The teaching staff of the EP "Public Health" has the appropriate qualifications, timely undergoes retraining and advanced training and has a 100 percent degree. The EP "Public Health" is highly attractive for graduates of the master's program, as evidenced by the increase in the number of applicants for this doctoral program. The quality management system for the training of KazNU specialists today is aimed at implementing strategic and medium-term goals by forming and defining tasks for achieving and improving the quality of educational activities within the framework of strategic management, implemented through comprehensive plans, priority areas for the development of the university and its structural divisions. In this regard, in 2003, the process of implementing the QMS in KazNU was started.

At KazNU created and successfully functioning system internal control through the activities of internal auditors, inspecting activities structural subdivisions for compliance of the QMS with the requirements of international quality standards. The Regulations on the Internal Audit Service have been developed, which can be found on the official website of KazNU. The Internal Audit Service constantly reviews the effectiveness of the internal policies, documents and processes of the University.

Based on an objective analysis of the IAS for the 2021-2022 academic year, the Academic Policy of the University was revised. The IAS conducts an assessment of the rationality and efficiency of the use of the University's resources, the effectiveness of the use of the budget. Reporting documentation is submitted by the IAS for consideration to the Board of Directors of KazNU.

The annual work plan and reports can be found on the KazNU website. In accordance with the requirements of accreditation standards, a SWOT analysis of the effectiveness of achieving the goals and objectives of the EP is carried out.

#### ***Strengths according to the standard:***

*According to this standard, strengths were identified.*

#### ***Recommendations for EP 8D10101 Public Health:***

- *no*

**Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:**

Strong - 0; satisfactory - 24, suggests improvements - 0; unsatisfactory - 0.



**(VII) OVERVIEW OF STRENGTHS/BEST PRACTICES FOR EACH STANDARD**

***Standard 1 «Mission and outcomes***

According to this standard, no strengths have been identified.

***Standard 2 «Research environment and educational resources»***

According to this standard, 3 strengths have been identified

1. High publication activity of teaching staff in international journals with a high impact factor, as well as in journals included in the CQES database of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

2. The existence of a system of employee bonuses in order to stimulate employees to research and innovation activities.

3. Availability of a unified information and library service system at the university, thanks to which it is possible for students and teachers to receive a range of services: academic accessibility of library collections, information resources, access to the Internet, consultation of a bibliographer, etc.

***Standard 3 «Admission policy and criteria»***

According to this standard, no strengths have been identified.

***Standard 4 «Doctoral Program»***

According to this standard, no strengths have been identified.

***Standard 5 «Scientific Guidance»***

No strengths have been identified for this standard.

***Standard 6 «Dissertation»***

According to this standard, no strengths have been identified.

***Standard 7 «Evaluation of dissertations»***

According to this standard, no strengths have been identified.

***Standard 8 «Governance and Administration»***

According to this standard, no strengths have been identified.

**(VIII) OVERVIEW OF THE QUALITY IMPROVEMENT RECOMMENDATIONS FOR EACH STANDARD**

*For EP 8D10101 Public Health:*

**According to the standard «MISSION AND OUTCOMES»:**

There are no recommendations.

**According to the standard «RESEARCH ENVIRONMENT AND EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES»**

1. In order to increase the competitiveness of graduates to develop joint doctoral programs with universities of far and near abroad. /Center for International Programs. September 2023/

2. To increase the attraction of external funding sources by conducting applied research and development. /Department of Science and Innovation. January 2023/

3. To ensure the quality of distance education in doctoral studies, involve teaching staff with a certificate of advanced training courses to improve work using IT technologies in the distance learning format. /Management of methodological work and educational technologies. September 2022/

**According to the standard «ADMISSION POLICY AND CRITERIA»**

There are no recommendations.

**According to the standard «DOCTORAL PROGRAMME»**

There are no recommendations.

**According to the standard «SCIENTIFIC GUIDANCE»**

There are no recommendations.

**According to the standard «DISSERTATION»**

2. To implement the requirements of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan for the defense of doctoral dissertations, monitor the intermediate stages of the implementation of the individual doctoral plan within the framework of the implementation and writing of the chapters of the doctoral dissertation and publications 2 times a school year. / Dean's Office of the Faculty of Medicine and Healthcare. June 2022./

**According to the standard «EVALUATION OF DISSERTATIONS»**

There are no recommendations.

**According to the standard «GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION»**

There are no recommendations.



**Appendix 1. Evaluation table «Conclusion of the external expert commission» (8D10101 Public health)**

№		EVALUATION CRITERIA	Positions of the organization of education			
			Strong	Satisfactory	Suggests improvements	Unsatisfactory
		<b>STANDARDS «MISSION AND OUTCOMES»</b>				
		<b>Mission Statement</b>				
1	1	The medical education institution <b>must</b> state its mission and make it known to its stakeholders and the health sector it serves.		+		
2	2	The mission statement <b>must</b> contain the aims and educational strategy to prepare a competent scientist, researcher at the level of postgraduate medical education.		+		
3	3	The medical education institution <b>must</b> ensure that the stated mission encompasses the health problems of society, the needs of the medical and pharmaceutical care system and other aspects of social accountability.		+		
4	4	The medical education institution <b>must</b> have the strategic development plan of the educational programme that is consistent with the stated mission of the medical education institution, including issues of improving the quality of doctoral programmes and approved by the advisory council of the medical education institution / research organisation.		+		
5	5	The medical education institution <b>must</b> systematically gather and analyse the information on the quality of implementation of doctoral programmes, assess the strengths and weaknesses (SWOT-analysis) on the basis of which the administration together with the advisory council should determine the policy and develop strategic and tactical plans.		+		
6	6	The mission and objectives of educational		+		

		programmeme of medical education institution <b>must</b> comply with available resources, the capabilities of the medical education institution / research organisation and market requirements and ways of their support must be determined. The medical education institution must provide access to information about the mission, objectives of the educational programmeme of the medical education organisation for the public (the availability of the information in mass media, on the web-site of HEI). The mission and objectives of the medical education institution / research organisation must be approved by the advisory council				
<b>Participation in Formulation of Mission</b>						
7	7	The medical education institution <b>must</b> ensure that its principal stakeholders participate in developing (formulating) the mission of the educational programmeme.		+		
<b>Institutional Autonomy and Academic Freedom</b>						
The medical education institution <b>must</b> have institutional autonomy to develop and implement policies for which its faculty/academic staff and administration are responsible, especially regarding:						
8	8	design of the curriculum;		+		
9	9	use of the allocated resources necessary for implementation of the curriculum		+		
The medical education institution <b>should</b> ensure academic freedom for its staff and doctoral students:						
10	10	in addressing the actual curriculum where it would be allowed to draw upon different perspectives in description and analysis of issues in medicine ;		+		
11	11	in exploring the use of new research results to improve the study of specific disciplines / issues without expanding the curriculum.		+		
<b>Educational Outcomes</b>						
12	12	The medical education institution <b>must</b> define the intended educational outcomes that doctoral students should exhibit upon graduation of of the doctoral programmeme.		+		
13	13	Education in the doctoral programmeme <b>must</b> provide doctoral candidate with the competencies that will enable them to become a qualified researcher capable of conducting independent scientific research in accordance with the		+		

		principles of best research practices.				
Other competencies (knowledge, skills, and attitudes) corresponding to the doctoral programme <b>must</b> include:						
14	1 4	demonstration by the doctoral students of systematic understanding of the field of study and mastery of the skills and methods of research in their field;		+		
15	1 5	demonstration by the doctoral candidates of the ability to form, develop, implement and adapt an original research in the context of existing academic works at the level that is required for publication in the international peer-reviewed journals;		+		
16	1 6	demonstration by the doctoral candidates of leadership skills, the ability to direct the work of others, project management, ability to teach and transmit knowledge		+		
17	1 7	the ability to share insights in their research field with the academic advisors, wide academic community and society as a whole;		+		
18	1 8	the ability to assist within academic and professional environment to the technological, social or cultural progress in a society based on knowledge.		+		
19	1 9	Completion of the doctoral programme must have potential benefits for those who continue their career outside the healthcare institution, and apply their skills gained during the mastering the doctoral programme, including - a critical analysis, evaluation and solution of complex problems, the ability to transfer new technologies and generate new ideas.		+		
20	2 0	11.4.9 The medical education institution / research organisation should ensure that the regular process of renewal and restructuring leads to a modification of education outcomes of graduates in accordance with the responsibilities incumbent upon the graduates after the doctoral programme completion.		+		
<b>Total</b>			<b>0</b>	<b>20</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>STANDARDS «RESEARCH ENVIRONMENT AND EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES»</b>						
<b>Research Environment</b>						
21	1	The success of the individual doctoral programmes <b>must</b> be ensured by the arrangement of a strong and effective research environment.		+		
		The quality of the research environment <b>must</b> be				

		evaluated by analysing:				
22	2	the publication of research results (number of publications, impact factor, etc.) in major of doctoral programmeme in medical education institution / research organisation.	+			
23	3	the involvement level of external funding for carrying out research in medical education institution / research organisation.			+	
24	4	the number of qualified and competent teachers, researchers in the group, at the faculty, educational institution.		+		
25	5	national and international co-operation with research teams of medical organisations, universities, research centers.		+		
26	6	Research <b>must</b> be carried out in accordance with international ethical standards and approved by the appropriate and competent ethics councils. In the research doctoral candidate s must comply with international ethical standards: Declaration of Helsinki II (clinical trials), the European Union directive 2010/63/EU (animal studies) and the Oviedo Convention (Bioethics).		+		
27	7	In order to grant access to the facilities necessary for writing a dissertation, doctoral programmemes <b>must</b> include training in other laboratories, preferably in another country, thus providing internationalisation.		+		
28	8	Implementation of doctoral programmeme <b>must</b> be conducted in compliance with the conditions of mutual respect, shared responsibility of the academic advisor and a doctoral candidate .		+		
29	9	The medical education institution / research organisation <b>should</b> study the possibilities of providing joint doctoral programmemes with the award of degrees from both universities and joint study guide to support cooperation between higher education institutions.		+		
30	10	The medical education institution / research organisation <b>should</b> ensure that the process of renewal of the educational resources are in line with the changing needs, such as a admission of doctoral candidate s, the number and profile of academic staff, doctoral programmeme.		+		
The medical education institution <b>should</b> :						
31	11	provide sufficient autonomy in resource allocation, including a decent remuneration of teachers in order to achieve the education outcomes;	+			

32	1 2	in the allocation of resources, take into account		+		
		the scientific achievements in the field of medicine and public health problems and their needs .				
<b>Physical Facilities</b>						
The medical education institution / researchorganisation <b>must</b> have the logistics meeting licensing parameters, which include criteria:						
33	1 3	classrooms, laboratories and equipment <b>must</b> be modern and comply with the goals and objectives of doctoral programmeme;		+		
34	1 4	doctoral students must be provided with conditions for independent learning and research;		+		
35	1 5	The medical education institution / research organisation <b>must</b> have adequate resources for the proper implementation of doctoral programmeme and distribute them to the needs. The institution's resources must ensure: - admission of doctoral candidate s, - providing training in doctoral programmeme, - implementation of the dissertation (thesis), - scientific advising, - councelling of the doctoral candidate s, - consideration, review and evaluation of the dissertation (thesis), - award of academic egree, - operating costs, - the cost of participation in training courses, international scientific conferences, - tuition in doctoral programmemes in establishments where it is practiced. - resources also include a doctoral candidate scholarship / salary, but the amount of payment may vary.		+		
36	1 6	Resource policy <b>must</b> be aimed at support and ensuring the continuous professional development of teachers of doctoral programmeme.		+		
<b>The medical education institution must:</b>						
37	1 7	provide a safe environment for staff, doctoral candidate s, patients and those who care for them, including those providing the necessary information and protection against harmful substances, microorganisms, compliance with safety regulations in the laboratory and using the equipment.		+		

38	1 8	The medical education institution <b>should</b> improve the education environment of doctoral candidates through regular renewal, expanding and strengthening the facilities and resources, which must match the development in the practice of		+		
		teaching.				
<b>Information Technology</b>						
The medical education institution / research organisation <b>must</b> have the information support meeting the goals and objectives of doctoral programme:						
39	1 9	the library <b>must</b> contain the necessary learning materials - educational, technical, scientific and reference literature, various periodic medical publications, etc.;	+			
40	2 0	Doctoral candidates <b>must</b> have timely and easy access to library resources.		+		
41	2 1	The library <b>must</b> have a basic technical equipment to support the daily activities: fax machines, copiers, computers, printers, available for public use, and phones with voice mail or answering machine.		+		
42	2 2	The library <b>must</b> have information website. The web site may include the following elements: links, forms interlibrary loan, electronic full-text journal articles, and feedback form.		+		
43	2 3	The medical education institution / research organisation <b>must</b> regularly monitor library resources to learn and implement strategies to meet current and future needs of doctoral candidates.		+		
44	2 4	Doctoral candidates <b>must</b> have computer classes and terminals with access to information resources (LAN, Internet) for use.		+		
45	2 5	In the medical education institution / research organisation there <b>must</b> be control over availability and appropriate use of information resources by the doctoral candidates.		+		
46	2 6	The medical education institution / research organisation <b>must</b> constantly update, improve and expand the base of information resources.		+		

47	2 7	<p>The medical education institution/ research organisation <b>must</b> open and constantly update its website's section on the doctoral degree programmes containing the following information:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- structure and staff of the doctoral department, responsibilities of a head and staff of the department;</li> <li>- admission policy, including clear rules on the selection process of doctoral candidates;</li> <li>- a list of doctoral programmes;</li> <li>- structure, duration and content of the doctoral programmes;</li> </ul>		+		
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- criteria for the appointment of an academic advisor, outlining the characteristics, responsibilities and qualifications of an academic advisor;</li> <li>- methods used to assess the doctoral candidates;</li> <li>- criteria for execution and writing of a dissertation;</li> <li>- description of the procedures for the dissertation defense;</li> <li>- description of a work of the Dissertation Council (regulations, composition, announcements) (if applicable);</li> <li>- programme of quality assurance and regular evaluation of doctoral programme;</li> <li>- information about doctoral candidates taking into account the year of study.</li> </ul>				
<b>Total</b>			<b>3</b>	<b>23</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>STANDARDS «ADMISSION POLICY AND CRITERIA»</b>						
48	1	The medical education institution / research organisation <b>must</b> define and implement a policy of admission, including a clearly defined position on the process of selection of doctoral candidates.		+		
49	2	The medical education institution/ research organisation <b>must</b> establish a relationship between the selection of doctoral candidates and the mission of medical education institution, educational programme and the desired quality of graduates.		+		
50	3	To ensure the quality of doctoral programmes, doctoral candidates' selection <b>must</b> be based on competition and transparency in the selection process.		+		

51	4	Candidates for the doctoral programme must have a level of education corresponding to the degree of Master of Science in the appropriate major of doctoral programme, or completed training in a residency in medical specialties.		+		
52	5	Before enrolling doctoral candidates, the medical education institution / research organisation <b>must</b> assess the quality of the research project to be carried out by a doctoral candidate .		+		
53	6	After enrolling in doctoral programme the doctoral dissertation subject and advisors for doctoral candidate <b>must</b> be approved.		+		
54	7	Subject of the dissertation must be evaluated and approved by a panel of independent experts through external written evaluation, or on the basis of the presentation of research work, including: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- the expected results of the implementation of the research project, which must be completed by writing a dissertation in accordance with the required quality standards (standard "Dissertation"), within a period of time determined by the doctoral programme;</li> <li>- the degree of innovativeness and creativity of a research project;</li> <li>- qualification of the academic advisors (standard "Scientific Guidance").</li> </ul>		+		
55	8	Doctoral candidates must have the rights and obligations comparable to the status of medical education institution / research organisation where the scientific research work is carried out.		+		
56	9	In cases where the doctoral candidate is forced to seek additional sources of income there must be provided an additional time required to complete the training programme.		+		
The medical education institution / research organisation <b>should</b> ensure that the process of renewal and restructuring leads to:						
57	10	- an adaptation of admission policy of doctoral candidates subject to changing expectations and circumstances, human resource needs, changes in the system of postgraduate education and the needs of the doctoral programme.		+		
<b>Total</b>			<b>0</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>STANDARDS «DOCTORAL PROGRAMME»</b>						



58	1	The medical education institution / research organisation <b>must</b> define the purpose and objectives of the doctoral programme.		+		
69	2	Doctoral programme <b>must</b> be based on the performance of the original research, courses, and other types of works that require analytical and critical thinking.		+		
60	3	Doctoral programme <b>must</b> be structured with a clear time limit, equivalent to 3 years of full-time.		+		
61	4	Doctoral programme <b>must</b> include the compulsory courses alongside with the preparation of the dissertation research. A significant part of the training programme		+		
		must include training of doctoral candidates in specific skills, which may consist of: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- training doctoral candidates the skills to present the research results (oral/poster/documents) for academic and non-academic audience,</li> <li>- project management,</li> <li>- writing grant applications,</li> <li>- critical evaluation of scientific literature,</li> <li>- guidance of the technical personnel and doctoral candidates,</li> <li>- professional development and collaboration,</li> <li>- other.</li> </ul>				
62	5	Doctoral programme <b>must</b> be performed under the academic guidance.		+		
63	6	The medical education institution / research organisation <b>must</b> define the teaching and learning methods used.		+		
64	7	Doctoral programme <b>must</b> ensure the training of doctoral students of ethics rules and responsible conduct of research.		+		
In the medical education institution / research organisation <b>must</b> be mechanisms:						
65	8	allowing the doctoral candidates, if necessary, to fulfill part of their doctoral programme at another institution, including in other countries;		+		
66	9	ongoing progress evaluation of implementation of doctoral candidate research throughout the doctoral programme.		+		

67	1 0	The medical education institution / research organisation <b>must</b> ensure the confidentiality for the doctoral candidate s who receive advice on doctoral programmeme, academic advising, personal questions.		+		
68	1 1	The medical education institution <b>must</b> ensure that the educational programmeme is implemented in accordance with the principles of equality.		+		
69	1 2	The medical education institution / research organisation <b>must</b> design an appeal mechanism, which allows doctoral candidate to revise the decision regarding their programmemes and evaluation of their dissertations.		+		
70	1 3	The medical education institution / research organisation <b>must</b> make regular assessments of the quality of the doctoral programmeme, including feedback from the academic advisors and doctoral candidate s.		+		
		The medical education institution <b>should</b> ensure that the process of renewal and restructuring leads to:				
71	1 4	adaptation of educational programmeme model and methodological approaches in training to ensure their appropriateness and relevance;		+		
72	1 5	adjustment of doctoral programmeme elements and their relationships in accordance with the advances in medical science, with changing demographics conditions and health/disease pattern of the population and socio-economic and cultural conditions.		+		
73	1 6	improvement in the process of monitoring and evaluating the doctoral programmeme in accordance with changes in the education outcomes and teaching and learning methods.		+		
		<b>Total</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>16</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>STANDARDS «SCIENTIFIC GUIDANCE»</b>						
74	1	Each doctoral candidate must have an academic advisors, one of whom is foreign, to cover all aspects of the programmeme.		+		
75	2	The number of doctoral candidate s assigned to the academic advisor must be adequate to his workload.		+		
76	3	Academic advisors may be advisors of the doctoral candidate s of other institutions, both in the country and abroad.		+		

77	4	A qualified academic advisor <b>must</b> have a doctorate or equivalent degree, be an active scholar with research publications in peer-reviewed literature.		+		
78	5	In selecting and appointing of the advisor, his research experience and international connections should be analysed.		+		
79	6	The medical education institution / research organisation <b>must</b> have clearly defined duties and responsibilities of the academic advisor.		+		
80	7	Academic advisors <b>must</b> consult regularly their doctoral candidates.		+		
81	8	The medical education institution / research organisation <b>should</b> plan and organise training courses for academic advisors on the policy of implementing the doctoral programmes, main responsibilities of academic advisors.		+		
82	9	The medical education institution / research organisation <b>should</b> provide a document that describes the process of scientific leadership. The document must be signed by an academic		+		
		advisor, doctoral student and doctoral programme manager.				
		<b>Total</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>STANDARDS «DISSERTATION»</b>						
83	1	Doctoral programme <b>must</b> be completed by preparing and defending a dissertation, which is an indicator of the formation of doctoral student's competence in accordance with the educational programme.			+	
84	2	The medical education institution / research organisation <b>must</b> define the term for dissertation preparation, limited to 3-year period, unless otherwise stated in the normative legal act.				
85	3	The dissertation <b>must</b> be written by a doctoral candidate independently, contain a set of new scientific results and regulations put forward by the author for the public defense, and testifies to the author's personal contribution to science, and also meet one of the requirements:				
86	4	contain new evidence-based results that address important scientific problem;		+		
87	5	contain new evidence-based results, the use of which provides solution of applied problem;		+		

88	6	contain new evidence-based theoretical and (or) the experimental results, the totality of which is essential for the development of specific research area.		+		
89	7	Structure of the dissertation <b>must</b> include a review of the literature pertaining to the subject of research, detailed analysis of objectives and tasks of research, research methodology, results, discussion, discussion, conclusions and future prospects of the study.		+		
90	8	The dissertation, which has practical value, <b>must</b> contain information on the practical use of scientific results obtained by the author, confirmed by copyright certificates, patents and other official documents.		+		
91	9	The dissertation <b>may</b> be written in Kazakh or Russian.		+		
92	10	In order to ensure international recognition, the dissertation <b>may</b> be written and defended in English.		+		
93	11	Abstract of the dissertation <b>must</b> be published in Kazakh, Russian and English.		+		
94	12	Summary of the doctoral dissertation must be published in two languages (English, Russian or Kazakh), depending on the primary language of instruction of a doctoral candidate .		+		
95	1 3	The results of the dissertation <b>must</b> be made available to interested parties (doctoral candidates, academic advisors, employees of the institution where carried out the dissertation, to the researchers carrying out research work in the same field, and others categories of stakeholders), i.e. be published if copyright or other reasons do not prevent this.		+		
96	1 4	Dissertation <b>may be</b> published on the home web page of medical education institution / research organisation where the scientific work has been carried out, both release (summaries, abstracts), and in full if the copyright, or other reasons, do not prevent this. The dissertation submitted for defense <b>must</b> be published on the website of the university where the dissertation council functions in the specialty of dissertation work.		+		

97	1 5	The dissertation <b>must</b> be accompanied by no less than 7 (seven) publications on the topic of the dissertation, including at least three (3) in scientific publications recommended by the Council, one (1) in the international journals, three (3) in the documents of international conferences, including one (1) in the documents of foreign conferences. International edition must be in the database of the company Thomson Reuters (ISI Web of Knowledge, Thomson Reuters) or Scopus, and have a non-zero impact factor, unless otherwise stated in the normative legal act.			+	
98	1 6	In the case of joint publications, co-author <b>should</b> document that the doctoral candidate has made a significant and independent contribution to the writing of these papers. Ownership of the results of doctoral candidate research must be clearly defined and described. This will avoid re-publication of the results in more than one dissertation.			+	
99	1 7	The medical education institution / research organisation <b>must</b> provide a discussion of the dissertation of a doctoral candidate at the department(s) meeting, where the dissertation is carried out.			+	
		<b>Total</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>15</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>STANDARDS «EVALUATION OF DISSERTATIONS»</b>						
100	1	The medical education institution / research organisation <b>must</b> determine, approve and publish the principles, methods and practices used to assess the doctoral candidate s, including criteria for evaluating scientific work.			+	
101	2	The final evaluation and approval of the dissertation <b>must</b> be made by the Dissertation Council.			+	
102	3	The dissertation defense <b>must</b> be carried out at the HEI, where the Dissertation Council in corresponding field of training doctoral candidate s operates.			+	
103	4	Before submitting documents for consideration to the Dissertation Council, the dissertation <b>must</b> be reviewed.			+	

104	5	The reviewers based on the study of the dissertation and published works <b>must</b> submit written reviews to the extended meeting of the department that evaluate the relevance of the chosen topic, the degree of validity of scientific statements, conclusions, recommendations made in the dissertation and its practical significance, their novelty, and an opinion is given on the possibility of passing the subsequent stages of defense for the award of the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) or doctor in the profile in the relevant specialty.		+		
105	6	Doctoral dissertation defense <b>must</b> include both the preparation of a written version and subsequent verbal defense.		+		
106	7	The dissertation defense <b>must</b> be open to the public.		+		
107	8	The time between the submission of the dissertation to Dissertation Council and the defense <b>must</b> be as short as possible to ensure the future employment of graduates of doctoral programmeme.		+		
108	9	The dissertation <b>should</b> be considered successfully defended if the Dissertation Council makes a positive decision, i.e. 2/3 (two third) members or more of the Dissertation Council present at the meeting voted for. If at least 2/3 (two thirds) of the members of the Dissertation Council participated in the meeting voted for a positive decision, unfavorable decision is taken.		+		
109	10	In case of unfavorable assessment the written version of the dissertation, a doctoral candidate <b>should</b> be given an opportunity to finalise the dissertation. In case of unfavorable assessment in the oral defense, a doctoral candidate <b>must</b> be presented for re-defense. In exceptional cases, the Dissertation Council may reject the thesis without the possibility of revision.		+		

110	11	The degree of doctor <b>should</b> be awarded by the authorised organ in case of a positive decision of the Dissertation Council and its petition, which assesses the dissertation and oral defense; expert evaluation of the dissertation work by experts of the authorised organ (in the absence of a special status of a medical educational organisation). The degree of doctor <b>should</b> be awarded by the HEI in case of a positive decision of the Dissertation Council, which evaluates the dissertation and oral defense in case of a special status of the medical educational organisation.		+		
111	12	In order to achieve independent and competent international expertise, the medical education institution / research organisation <b>should</b> actively use information technologies that allow certain members of the Dissertation Council to participate in the assessment process and remote defending of a dissertation.		+		
		<b>Total</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>12</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>STANDARDS «GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION»</b>						
<b>Programmeme Management</b>						
112	1	Management of the medical education institution / research organisation <b>must</b> be effective and ensure the improvement of the educational programmeme.		+		
113	2	The medical education institution / research organisation <b>must</b> define the structural unit responsible for the implementation of educational programmemes and the achievement of the final learning outcomes.		+		
114	3	The structural unit responsible for educational programmemes <b>must</b> have the authority for planning and implementing the curriculum including the allocation of the granted resources for planning and implementing methods of teaching and learning, assessment of doctoral candidate s, evaluation of educational programmemes and courses.		+		
115	4	Representatives of doctoral candidate s <b>must</b> interact with the management of doctoral studies in the matters of design, governance and evaluation of doctoral programmemes.		+		
116	5	The involvement of doctoral candidate s in student organisations working on the development of doctoral training programmemes <b>should</b> be encouraged and facilitated.		+		

117	6	The structural unit responsible for educational programmes <b>should</b> ensure transparency of the work of governance and its decisions which are published in newsletters, posted on the HEI's website or included in the minutes for review and execution.		+		
118	7	The medical education institution <b>should</b> plan and implement innovations in educational programmes through a structural unit responsible for educational programmes.		+		
119	8	The medical education institution <b>should</b> in its advisory organ responsible for educational programmes include representatives of other stakeholders, including other participants in the educational process, representation of teaching hospitals and other clinical facilities, representatives of graduates of the medical education institutions, other health professions, who are involved in the educational process, or other faculty members of the university.		+		
The medical education institution <b>should</b> ensure that the structural unit responsible for curriculum:						
120	9	takes into account the environment in which graduates will be expected to work, and modify the programme accordingly.		+		
121	10	considers the modification of the educational programme based on feedback from the community and society as a whole.		+		
The medical education institution / research organisation <b>should</b> ensure that the process of renewal and restructuring leads to:						
122	11	an improvement of the organisational structure and principles of doctoral programme governance to ensure the efficient operation and (in the future) to meet the interests of different stakeholder groups in terms of changing circumstances and needs.		+		
<b>Academic Leadership</b>						
123	12	The medical education institution <b>must</b> clearly define the responsibilities of its academic leadership for development and management of the educational programme.		+		
124	13	The medical education institution <b>should</b> periodically evaluate its academic leadership in relation to achievement of its mission and intended educational outcomes.		+		
<b>Educational Budget and Resource Allocation</b>						
The medical education institution <b>must</b> :						



125	1 4	have a clear line of responsibility and authority for resourcing the curriculum, including a dedicated educational budget.		+		
126	1 5	allocate the resources necessary for the implementation of the curriculum and distribute the educational resources in relation to educational needs.		+		
127	1 6	The financial system of the medical education institution <b>must</b> be based on the principals of efficiency, effectiveness, priority, transparency, accountability, separation and autonomy of all levels of budgeting		+		
128	1 7	Financial and administrative policy <b>must</b> be aimed at improving the quality of the educational programmeme.		+		
<b>Administrative Staff and Management</b>						
The medical education institution <b>must</b> have an administrative and academic staff, including their number and composition in accordance with the qualifications, that is appropriate to:						
129	1 8	ensure the implementation of its educational programmeme and related activities;		+		
130	1 9	ensure good management and resource deployment.		+		
131	2 0	The medical education institution / research organisation <b>should</b> develop and implement an internal programmeme for management quality assurance, including consideration of the need for improvements and regularly review and analyse the management.		+		
132	2 1	The medical education institution / research organisation <b>must</b> ensure the implementation of doctoral programmeme in accordance with the quality management system certified by independent organisations		+		
<b>Interaction with Health Sector</b>						
133	2 2	The medical education institution <b>must</b> have constructive interaction with the health and health related sectors of society and government including exchange of information, collaboration, and organisational initiatives that facilitate provision of specialists with the qualifications needed by society.		+		
134	2 3	The medical education institution <b>must</b> ensure operational connection between the educational programmeme and the subsequent stages of professional training.		+		

135	24	The medical education institution <b>should</b> formalise the collaboration with partners in the health sector that means entering into formal agreements, stating content and forms of collaboration, and/or establishing joint contact and coordination councils as well as joint projects.		+		
<b>Total</b>			<b>0</b>	<b>24</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>In all</b>			<b>3</b>	<b>129</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>0</b>

