



«АККРЕДИТЕУ ЖӘНЕ РЕЙТИНГТИҢ  
ТӘУЕЛСІЗ АГЕНТТІГІ» КЕМ

НУ «НЕЗАВИСИМОЕ АГЕНТСТВО  
АККРЕДИТАЦИИ И РЕЙТИНГА»

INDEPENDENT AGENCY FOR  
ACCREDITATION AND RATING

# REPORT

on the results of the work of the external expert commission on the  
assessment of compliance with the requirements of the standards of  
program accreditation  
of the educational program  
32.05.01 "Medical and preventive care"

FSFEO HE KemSMU of the Ministry of Health of Russia

**INDEPENDENT ACCREDITATION AND RATING AGENCY  
EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION**

***Addressed to  
Accreditation  
Council IAAR***



**REPORT**

**on the results of the work of the external expert commission on the assessment  
of compliance with the requirements of the standards of program accreditation  
of the educational program  
32.05.01 "Medical and preventive care"**

**FSFEO HE KemSMU of the Ministry of Health of Russia**

**From February 15 to 17 , 2022**

**Kemerovo**

**"17" February 2022**

**CONTENT**

(I) LIST OF DESIGNATIONS AND ABBREVIATIONS .....3  
(II) INTRODUCTION.....4  
(III) REPRESENTATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION .....5  
(IV) DESCRIPTION OF THE PREVIOUS ACCREDITATION PROCEDURE.....5  
(V) DESCRIPTION OF THE EEC VISIT .....5  
(VI) COMPLIANCE WITH SPECIALIZED ACCREDITATION STANDARDS .....6  
(VII) OVERVIEW OF STRENGTHS/BEST PRACTICES FOR EACH STANDARD .....25  
(VIII) OVERVIEW RECOMMENDATIONS FOR QUALITY IMPROVEMENT FOR EACH STANDARD.....26  
(IX) REVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE ORGANIZATION OF EDUCATION .....28  
(X) RECOMMENDATION TO THE ACCREDITATION COUNCIL .....28



**(I) LIST OF DESIGNATIONS AND ABBREVIATIONS**

**AMP** – Administrative and Management personnel  
**BD** – basic disciplines.  
**University** – higher education institution  
**EEC** – External expert commission of the Independent Accreditation and Rating Agency  
**SAC** – State Attestation Commission  
**EQF** – European Qualifications Framework  
**FSE** – final state examination  
**FC** – final control  
**IS** – information system  
**IT** – Information Technology  
**KemSMU, University** – Federal State-funded educational institution of higher education "Kemerovo State Medical University" of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation  
**MET** – monitoring and evaluation tools  
**CES** – catalog of elective subjects  
**IAAR** – Independent Accreditation and Rating Agency  
**RW** – research work  
**SRW** – student's research project  
**CPD** – continuous professional development  
**CME** – Continuing medical education  
**NQF** – National qualifications framework  
**NLA** – normative legal acts.  
**NQF** – national qualifications framework.  
**GC** – General competencies  
**EP** – educational program  
**PD** – profile disciplines  
**Teaching staff** – professorial teaching staff  
**LO** – Learning outcomes  
**WC** – working curriculum  
**QMS** – Quality management system  
**Mass media** – mass media  
**SIW** – student's independent work  
**SIWGT** – independent work of a student under the guidance of a teacher.  
**SC** – standard curriculum  
**TSS** – Training and support staff  
**EMC** – educational and methodical complex  
**EMCD** – educational and methodical complex of the discipline  
**EW** – educational work  
**C** – Curriculum  
**AC** – Academic Council  
**AVN** – automated information system  
**ECTS** – European Credit Transfer System

## **(II) INTRODUCTION**

In accordance with the order of the Independent Accreditation and Rating Agency No. 9-22- OD dated 10.01.2022, from February 15 to 17, 2022, an external expert commission (EEC) assessed compliance with the IAAR program accreditation standards of the educational program 32.05.01 "Medico-preventive Business" of Kemerovo State Medical University (approved and put into effect according to the NAAR Order No. 68-18/1-OD of May 25, 2018).

The report of the external expert commission contains an assessment of the compliance of KemSMU activities within the framework of program accreditation with the IAAR criteria, recommendations of the EEC on further improvement of the parameters of educational programs and the parameters of the program profile of educational programs.

### **Composition EEC:**

1. **IAAR Chairman** – Ion Bologan MD, N. Testemitanu State University of Medicine and Pharmacy, Republic of Moldova (online);
2. **IAAR Foreign Expert** – Tulupova Elena Sergeevna, Ph. D., Institute of Public Health and Medical Law, 1st Faculty of Medicine, Charles University (Czech Republic);
3. **IAAR Foreign Expert** – Meyrkhanovna Zulfiya Zhankalova, MD, gastroenterologist, Kazakh National Medical University named after V. I. Abramovich. Asfendiyarova (Republic of Kazakhstan);
4. **IAAR Foreign Expert** – Kashkinbayev Yerlan Tursynbayevich, Ph. D, NAO "Astana Medical University", Republic of Kazakhstan (online);
5. **IAAR National Expert** – Kolomiets Natalia Eduardovna, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Siberian State Medical University of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation (Russian Federation);
6. **IAAR Employer** – Shitz Employer Polina Vladimirovna, Meditsina Plus LLC, Russian Federation, Moscow Smolensk (online);
7. **IAAR Student**– Olovyannikov Yuri Sergeevich, a 5th-year student of the General Medicine educational program of the Institute of Clinical Medicine of the Altai State Medical University, Russian Federation (online);
8. **IAAR Observer** – Saydulayeva Malika Akhyadovna, IAAR Project Manager (Republic of Kazakhstan).

### **(III) REPRESENTATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION**

Federal State-funded Educational Institution of Higher Education "Kemerovo State Medical University" (hereinafter - the University) The Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation was organized in 1955 by order of the Minister of Health of the RSFSR No. 450 dated 11/14/1955 as a medical institute.

In 2016, it was renamed the Federal State Budgetary Educational Institution of Higher Education "Kemerovo State Medical University" of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation.

The University has a Special permit (license) for educational activities No. 2343, issued by the Federal Service for Supervision of Education and Science on August 18, 2016, valid indefinitely, according to which the main professional educational programs of higher education - specialty programs are implemented, and [state accreditation from 02/19/2021](#) (certificate of state accreditation No. 3500, issued on February 19, 2021 by the Federal Service for Supervision of Education and Science, valid on February 19, 2027) for an enlarged group of higher education specialties – specialty: 32.00.00 Health sciences and preventive medicine.

-At Kemerovo State Medical University, training is carried out at the following levels of education:

**- professional education:**

- higher education – Bachelor's degree (Nursing)
- higher education – specialty (General medicine, Preventive medicine, Pharmacy, Pediatrics, Dentistry)
- higher education - training of highly qualified personnel

**- additional professional education:**

- professional development
- professional retraining

The university consists of 5 faculties: medical (MF), pediatric (PF), dental (DF), preventive medicine (PMF), pharmaceutical (FarmF).

The total number of students enrolled in bachelor's degree programs, specialty programs (full-time and part-time education): 3770 people, including preventive medicine (6 years, 360 ECTS credits, 667 students); 7th level 7 HRK/2 QF-EHEA, higher education, full-time.

In the preparation of students for the EP to conduct the educational process in the specialty of medical and preventive care, a staff of teaching staff has been formed, which is approved by the staffing table. The number of teaching staff is planned based on the needs of the educational process, the standard of the teaching load on the teacher and depends on the contingent of students.

The total number of teaching staff is 78 people, of which 74 (95%) are the main employees. The settlement of the teaching staff over the past 5 years has remained stable at a level of at least 70%.

### **(IV) DESCRIPTION OF THE PREVIOUS ACCREDITATION PROCEDURE**

The educational program 32.05.01 "Medical and preventive care" is undergoing international program accreditation for the first time.

### **(V) DESCRIPTION OF THE EEC VISIT**

To obtain objective information on the evaluation of the University's activities, the members of the EEC used the following methods: visual inspection, observation, interviewing employees of various structural units, teachers, students, heads of clinical bases and their structural units, questioning of the teaching staff and students.

On 15-17.02.2022, EEK IAR organized a visit to the FSFEI of HE KemSMU of the Ministry of Health of Russia (hereinafter - the University).

On the first day of the visit, on 02/15/2022, meetings were held in a hybrid format with the rector, vice-rectors, heads of structural divisions, deans and deputy deans, heads of departments, teachers. Visual inspection of the Simulation Training and Accreditation Center (main building), the library located in the main building of the University.

Table 1 – Information about employees and students who took part in on-line meetings with the EEC NAAR:

<b>Category of participants</b>	<b>Number</b>
Rector	1
Vice-Rectors	2
Heads of structural divisions, deans	21
EP managers	6
Teaching staff	21
Students, undergraduates	24
Graduates	8
Employers	7
<b>Total</b>	<b>90</b>

On the second day of the visit, on 02/16/2022, in accordance with the program, meetings were held in a hybrid format with students of the accredited program, interviews with representatives of employers, graduates, a visual inspection of the Federal Budgetary Healthcare Institution "Center for Hygiene and Epidemiology in the Kemerovo Region", work with department documents and attendance of teaching staff classes according to the schedule, visits to practice bases.

The survey of teachers and students was conducted in parallel with the interview.

On the third day of 17.02.2022, the work of the EEC was carried out: development and discussion of recommendations, discussion, decision-making by voting, preparation of information by the chairman on the results of an external assessment. Discussions of organizational issues, interview results, and work with documents were conducted daily throughout the visit.

At the final meeting with the management of the institution, the chairman and members of the EEC shared their impressions and recommendations.

## **(VI) COMPLIANCE WITH SPECIALIZED ACCREDITATION STANDARDS**

### **6.1. The "Mission and Results" Standard**

#### ***The evidentiary part***

Kemerovo State Medical University (KemSMU) carries out its activities on the basis of [Charter of Kemerovo State Medical University](#) and in accordance with the regulatory and strategic documents adopted in the Russian Federation.

The mission of the educational program "Medical and preventive care" is to develop universal, general professional and professional competencies among students, which are formed on the basis of disciplinary competencies in the conditions of fundamental and practical orientation of training specialists based on international standards, domestic traditions of higher medical education and ensuring the competitiveness of graduates of KemSMU in the domestic and foreign labor markets; for the implementation of continuing education, maximally focused on the needs of the individual, society and the state; in the implementation of modernization of activities, improvement of the educational process and scientific research, the introduction of innovative technologies.

The development and updating of the Mission of the EP is carried out in accordance with

the Regulations on the EP.

During the development and revision of the mission of the EP "Medical and preventive care", the teaching staff, employers, graduates and students take part at all stages. All proposals and additions for analysis and generalization are submitted to the Dean's Office of the Faculty of Medicine and Prevention. Specialists from other medical universities are involved as reviewers of the EP in the specialty 32.05.01 "Medical and preventive care".

The development of the EP Mission project or its updating takes place with the participation of the teaching staff of departments, employers and students (FMK protocol of 12/16/2020). The discussion of the mission, generalization and analysis of the received proposals takes place at the Council of the Faculty of Medicine and Prevention (Protocol No. 2 of 12/23/2020) and CMS KemSMU (Protocol No. 4 of 02/17/2021); the approval of the mission and EP takes place at the Academic Council of KemSMU (Protocol No. 6 of 02/25/2021).

The mission of KemSMU and EP 32.05.01 "Medical and preventive care", the final results of the development of the program are published on the official website of the university.

### ***Analytical part***

According to the "Mission and Results" standard, the EEC NAAR, based on the study of the submitted documents, the results of interviews with vice-rectors, heads of departments, teaching staff, students and graduates, a virtual inspection with logistical, informational and methodological resources, notes the following.

The EEC confirms that the University has identified, brought to the attention of interested parties (teaching staff, students, heads of clinical bases and practice bases) and presented the mission of the University and the EP "Medical and Preventive Care" in open access. According to the criteria of the standard "Mission and final results" in terms of defining the mission, the University has a mission and brings it to interested parties by posting it on the official website of the University and information stands. However, during conversations with employers, graduates, it was revealed that not everyone knows the mission of the university, the question whether they participated in the development of the mission was answered no. And also in the orders of the collegial bodies for the approval of the mission and EP, there are no employers and students in the composition (Order 668A of January 22, 2022, the Council of the Faculty of Medicine and Prevention, Order No. 51A of the Central Methodological Council of 31.08.2020, the Faculty Methodological Commission of the Faculty of Medicine and Prevention, the Cyclical Methodological Commission for the 2020/21 academic year, the Central Methodological Council order No. 114 of 06.09.2021). As part of the Academic Council of the University in 2020, Order 651/1 of 30.06.2020 was attended by a 6th-year student, in 2021, the order was amended by Order No. 105 and 106 of 25.06.2021, where the student was not replaced.

The formation of the EP is carried out in accordance with the "Order of organization and implementation of educational activities for educational programs of higher education – bachelor's degree programs, specialty programs and master's degree programs" (approved by Order No. 301 of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation on 05.04.2017), the Federal State Educational Standard of Higher Education - specialty 32.05.01 "Medical and preventive care". The final results are aimed at achieving the competencies of students and correspond to the mission and purpose of the university.

The EEC notes that the University demonstrates the management of the educational program "Medical and preventive care" through documents developed on the basis of the strategic priorities of the University.

Reviews of employers, graduates, analysis of the site and the materials presented demonstrate the relevance and quality of educational services CME/CPD.

However, by Order of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation No. 1126 dated December 30, 2019 "On the assignment of educational organizations of higher education, educational organizations of additional and vocational education subordinate to the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation performing research, development and technological work for



civil purposes to the appropriate category based on the results of the evaluation of the effectiveness of their activities" KemSMU is assigned to the 3rd category "Scientific organizations those who have lost scientific activity as the main type of activity and prospects for development".

In the course of studying the documents and procedures for the management of the EP, the passive position of stakeholders in the development of the mission of the EP "Medical and preventive care" and the formulation of the final results of training was revealed. Stakeholders are represented by teaching staff, students and a narrow circle of employers who are part of the Academic Council of 2020 (order on the composition of the US KemSMU). The role of stakeholders was limited to participation in meetings to discuss the mission of the university and the EP. There are no materials on the formulation of the final results of EP training by employers and other stakeholders (round tables, discussion platforms, etc.) of the EEC.

#### ***Strengths/Best practices***

Strengths are not revealed.

#### ***EEC Recommendations***

1. Ensure the participation of various stakeholders: academic community, students, practical healthcare, professional associations, public organizations, etc. in the regular revision and implementation of the mission, formulation of the final results of the training EP 32.05.01 "Medical and preventive care", using a variety of tools of involvement (open-space events, discussion platforms, etc.), the deadline is until the beginning of the 2021-2022 academic year;

2. In order to expand the participation of third-party opinions in the discussion of the mission, it is necessary to expand the circle of external stakeholders, to include employers and graduates in the development of the mission of the EP. The deadline is until the beginning of the 2021-2022 academic year;

3. To inform extensively about the Mission of the educational institution (mass media, banners, stands, etc.) in order to bring it to the teaching staff, students and the healthcare sector;

4. Involve not only state structures of the healthcare system, but also professional associations, non-governmental organizations, and the public in the discussion and development of the formulation of the final results of the training of EP;

#### ***Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria of the "Mission and Results" standard:***

*strong positions – 0,*

*satisfactory – 21,*

*suggest improvements – 2,*

*unsatisfactory – 0.*

#### ***6.2. Standard "Educational program"***

##### ***The evidentiary part***

The EP is developed on the basis of local documents of KemSMU and has institutional autonomy on the formulation, development and implementation of educational programs, admission of students, assessment and admission of personnel, conducting research, distribution of extra-budgetary resources, etc. The MPEP in the specialty is developed in partnership with practical healthcare and students. The formation of the MPEP is carried out in accordance with the requirements of the Federal state educational standard (FSES HE), approved by the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation dated 15.06.2017. No. 552 "On approval of the Federal state educational standard of higher education – specialty in the specialty 32.05.01 Medical and preventive care", regardless of the Government of the Russian Federation, regional and local authorities, the Health Committee, professional medical associations and other

state and public management structures. The development and updating of the Mission of the MPEP is carried out in accordance with the Regulations on the MPEP.

MPEP in the specialty 32.05.01 Medical and preventive care in accordance with Federal Law No. 273-FZ of December 29, 2012 "On Education in the Russian Federation" is a set of basic characteristics of education (volume, content, planned results), organizational and pedagogical conditions and forms of certification, which is presented in the form of a curriculum, a calendar curriculum, work programs of disciplines (modules), other components, as well as evaluation and methodological materials.

The standard period for mastering the MPEP HE (full-time education), including vacations provided after passing the state final certification, is 6 years. The labor intensity of mastering by students of this MPEP HE for the entire period of study in accordance with the Federal State Educational Standard for this specialty is 360 credit units and includes all types of contact and independent work of students, practice, state final certification and the time allotted for quality control of mastering by students of MPEP HE.

The requirements for the results of the development of MPEP include universal competencies (CC 1-10), general professional competencies (OPK 1-12) and professional competencies (PC 1-17), which should be formed as a result of the development of MPEP by a graduate. Also, the structure of the MPEP includes a matrix and a passport of competencies, a curriculum, a calendar training schedule, work programs of disciplines (modules), practices, as well as evaluation and methodological materials.

The total volume of the educational program is 360 credit units (c.u.). The structure of the MPEP corresponds to the Federal State Educational Standard in the specialty of Medical and Preventive Medicine and consists of three blocks. Mandatory part: Block 1 is represented by disciplines (a total of 294 c.u.) and Block 2 - includes practices, including research work (48 c.u.) and a part formed by participants in educational relations (15 c.u.), Block 3 – state final certification (3 c.u.). When developing MPEP, students are provided with the opportunity to master elective disciplines and elective disciplines.

According to the results of the development of the educational program, graduates are awarded the qualification "Doctor in general hygiene, epidemiology".

In the OP programs implemented at KemSMU, students perform scientific-research projects in the study of individual basic and variable disciplines. Interactive forms of education are introduced and used – analysis of clinical cases, business and role-playing educational game, discussions, educational video, solving situational problems, portfolio formation, work on training simulators, etc. When studying disciplines aimed at the formation of competencies, including research activities, students' research work is widely used (compilation of an information review of literature on the proposed topic, preparation of an abstract, preparation of an essay, report, writing a term paper, preparation of educational schemes, tables), student's educational and research work. This information was presented in the self-assessment report, as well as confirmed during the visit of the EEC.

As a result of mastering the specialty program, a graduate should have universal, general professional and professional competencies (FSES HE 32.05.01 Medical and preventive care) implemented through knowledge, skills and possessions (Matrix and Passport of competencies in the disciplines of specialty 32.05.01 Medical and preventive care, included in the MPEP). A specialist who has completed the development of MPEP is preparing for the following types of professional activity: preventive; diagnostic; organizational and managerial; research.

The base of practices and contracts with the structures of the healthcare system are presented in

For example, the EEC got acquainted with the practice bases during a visit to the bases.

#### ***Analytical part***

According to the standard "Educational Program", it was revealed that the EP "Medical and preventive care" was developed on the basis of state standards, in accordance with the mission, goals and final results of training.

The modular spiral design of the EP includes basic biomedical sciences, behavioral and social sciences, clinical sciences in sufficient volume and provides interdisciplinary integration of fundamental training with specialized disciplines.

In accordance with the federal state educational standard of higher education – specialty in specialty 32.05.01 Medical and preventive care" the structure of the specialty program includes the following blocks: Block 1 "Disciplines (modules)"; Block 2 "Practice"; Block 3 "State final certification". According to paragraph 2.8 of the federal state educational standard of higher education, when developing a specialty program, students are provided with the opportunity to master elective disciplines (modules) and elective disciplines (modules).

The KemSMU self-assessment report revealed that students have the right to choose the subjects studied within the elective disciplines in physical education and sports.

KemSMU provides students with the opportunity to master disciplines (modules) by choice in the amount established by the Ministry of Education and the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation. However, the university does not provide an opportunity for elective content (elective) and to determine the balance between the mandatory and elective part of the EP. The university does not have a catalog of elective disciplines.

The KemSMU self-assessment report says that the main stakeholders are involved in the development of the MPEP mission: teachers, students, healthcare representatives, employers. In order to take into account the opinions of interested parties and discuss the formulation of the mission, a round table is organized at the university, the program of which provides for the formation of the mission and the final results of the EP, discussion of the list of disciplines for inclusion in the part of the EP formed by the participants of educational relations. However, during interviews with employers, it was revealed that employers did not participate in the development of the mission of the EP, which is presented in the MPEP in the "Medical and Preventive Case" of KemSMU, and there are no employers and students in the orders of KemSMU as part of collegial bodies (order 668A of January 22, 2022 Council of the Faculty of Medicine and Prevention, Order of the Central Methodological Council No. 51A of 31.08.2020, Faculty Methodological Commission of the Faculty of Medicine and Prevention, Cycle Methodological Commission for the 2020/21 academic year, Central Methodological Council Order No. 114 of 06.09.2021). As part of the Academic Council of the University of 2020, Order 651/1 of 30.06.2020 was attended by a 6th year student, in 2021, the order was amended by Order No. 105 and 106 of 25.06.2021, where the student was not replaced.

In the self-assessment report, the responsible structural unit for planning and implementing the EP "Medico-preventive business" are at the faculty level: the Dean's office of the Faculty of Medicine and Prevention, faculty methodological commissions, faculty Council, at the university level: the Academic Council of the University, CMS, UMO. Their activities are coordinated and directed by the Rector, Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs.

The Academic Council of KemSMU approves the educational program approved by the Central Methodological Council. The Central Methodological Council, together with the Dean's Office, coordinates and provides control over the development of all components of the educational program. The Dean of the faculty, the Teaching and methodological department is responsible for organizing the preparation, development of the basic educational program and its implementation. There is a constant monitoring of the implementation of the requirements of the Federal State Educational Standard (Protocol No. 6 of the 27.02.2021 meeting of the Academic Council).

However, during an interview with the dean, as well as representatives of the structural unit, it was not possible to identify the responsible structural unit for planning and implementing the EP.

***Strengths/Best practices***

Strengths are not revealed.

***EEC Recommendations***

To ensure the introduction of active innovative teaching and learning methods based on the modern theory of adult education Term – until September 1, 2022;

1. To develop and approve a catalog of elective disciplines in order to provide a choice of learning paths for students and expand the electability of disciplines in all courses. The deadline is until December 1, 2022;

2. To introduce students, graduates, representatives of practical healthcare, professional associations, public organizations into the collegial bodies responsible for the development, management, analysis and updating of the EP. The deadline is until September 1, 2022;

3. Identify and consolidate the department at the university responsible for planning and implementing the EP. The deadline is until June 1, 2022;

***Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria of the standard "Educational program":***

*strong positions – 0,*

*satisfactory – 38,*

*suggest improvements – 5,*

*unsatisfactory – 0.*

***6.3. The standard "Student Assessment"***

***The evidentiary part***

Assessment of students' knowledge, skills and abilities takes place at the following levels: current assessment in practical and final classes; intermediate certification – exams and tests upon completion of the study of disciplines, state final certification.

The principles and methods of assessing students' knowledge in exams and tests are established in the Regulations on the Quality Control System of Education. The principles and methods of evaluation of the state final attestation are established in the Regulations on the GIA. The procedure for conducting the SFE is regulated by the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation "On approval of the procedure for conducting the state final attestation for educational programs of higher education - bachelor's degree programs, specialty programs and master's degree programs" dated June 29, 2015 N 636 (as amended. from 03/27/2020).

Checking the level of mastery of practical skills and abilities formed in practical classes is carried out at the final (milestone) classes on thematic patients or on phantoms, devices in the Center of Simulation Training and accreditation, as well as when solving situational and case problems. When assessing practical skills in simulated conditions, evaluation sheets developed by University staff and borrowed from the database of the Federal Methodological Center for Accreditation of Specialists are used.

Transparency and accessibility of assessment procedures is ensured by open access to the university's regulatory and teaching documents, exams are conducted by independent examiners (persons not participating in the training or external examiners).

The University has a system of appealing the evaluation results. In case of disagreement with the final and intermediate assessment, the student has the right to submit an application to the appeal commission. The Commission, if there are doubts about the objectivity of the assessment, conducts a re-certification of students. The existing system of appealing students' grades is currently quite open. Appeals of students to the appeals commission are very rare.

The appeal commission of the university is created by the order of the rector of the university. It is headed by the Vice-rector for Academic Affairs, it includes deans of all faculties.

The data presented by the EEC indicate the comparability of the final learning outcomes, assessment methods and the teaching and learning methods used.

***Analytical part***

According to the "Student Assessment" standard, it was revealed that the assessment of

students' academic achievements is carried out on the basis of internal regulatory documents. A point-rating system for assessing students' knowledge is used. Independent external examiners (including specialists from practical healthcare) are involved in the final state exams.

The KemSMU self-assessment report says that students' academic performance is assessed in two main ways: formative assessment (assessment for learning) and summative assessment (assessment of learning). However, when interviewing teachers, teachers confuse the concepts of summative and formative assessment, which requires teaching teaching staff on assessment methods.

The university provided evidence of the use of modern methods for assessing students' achievements, including both standard methods (testing, oral and written exams) and modern (OSCE), for clinical specialties. However, an objective structured clinical examination (OSCE) is not applied in the disciplines of the sanitary and hygienic profile.

Students have the opportunity to appeal grades.

An anonymous survey of 250 students of KemSMU showed that objectivity and teachers are satisfied with the fairness of excellent – 58.9%, good - 36.4%, satisfied – 8.8%, dissatisfied-2.6%, very bad – 2.2%, the fairness of exams and attestation satisfied excellent – 50,%, good-29.1%, satisfied - 6.6%, dissatisfied-3.5%, very bad – 1.8%, satisfaction with the tests and exams 2.5% are not satisfied and 1.7% answered very poorly, which requires updating the evaluation policy, the introduction of new standardized methods and the development of evaluation / checklists.

#### ***Strengths/Best practices***

Strengths are not revealed.

#### ***EEC Recommendations***

1. Systematize the methods of assessing the achievements of students, taking into account the number and quality of tests and questions for the oral exam. The deadline is until September 1, 2022;

2. To develop and implement an objective structured clinical examination (OSCE) in the disciplines of sanitary and hygienic profile; The deadline is until the beginning of the 2022-2023 academic year

. 3. To include in the training plan of teaching staff training by summative and informative assessment method with the provision of a list of students. The deadline is December 1, 2022;

4. The University needs to improve the process of ensuring the quality of assessment practice in terms of determining the reliability and validity of assessment methods. The deadline is until the beginning of the 2022-2023 academic year.

#### ***Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria of the standard "Student Assessment":***

*strong positions – 0,*

*satisfactory – 11,*

*suggest improvements – 4,*

*unsatisfactory – 0.*

#### **6.4. The "Students" Standard**

##### ***The evidentiary part***

KemSMU has defined and implements the admission policy, including a clearly established Provision – the Rules of admission to the Federal State budgetary educational institution of Higher Education "Kemerovo State Medical University" of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation for educational programs of higher education – bachelor's degree programs, specialty programs, which are adopted at a meeting of the Academic Council of the University and approved by the Rector of the University.

Annually KemSMU establishes a quota of targeted admission in accordance with the quota

of admission to targeted training established by the Government of the Russian Federation, state authorities of the subjects of the Russian Federation, which is up to 75% of the number of budget places.

For the selection of the most capable applicants to study at the University, a minimum threshold (score) is set for each entrance test, applicants who have not overcome it are eliminated from the competition. These minimum points are set by the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Russian Federation. The University has defined a policy and implemented in practice the admission of students with disabilities and the disabled in accordance with the current legislation, which is also reflected in the Rules of Admission to the University. At least 10% of places from the number of admission control figures are allocated annually for the admission of applicants with disabilities and disabled people.

The transfer of students from other medical institutions is regulated by the local regulatory document "Regulations on the conditions and procedure for transferring students under bachelor's degree programs, specialty to another educational organization, from other educational organizations, from one educational program to another, from one form of study to another."

The EEC was represented by units that provide monitoring of academic counseling and monitoring of student progress.

The EEC got acquainted with the conditions for the active participation of students in the development, planning of learning conditions, assessment and analysis of the quality of education they receive and discussion of the organization of the educational process, the practice of assessing knowledge, as well as the results obtained during the development of the OP. Students are involved in scientific conferences, symposiums, round tables, volunteer forums and competitions of social projects.

KemSMU has formed a support system aimed at the social, financial and personal needs of students, which includes a program of medical care, social support and financial assistance.

A system of financial support has been developed for students with financial difficulties: a reduction in the cost of tuition, a reduction in the cost of living in a hostel. Orphan students and students with disabilities have additional benefits and financial payments posted on the corresponding page of the website <https://kemsmu.ru/socpolicy/supports/>

Types of scholarships paid to students studying under the educational program: state academic scholarships to students; state social scholarships to students; state scholarships to graduate students, residents; scholarships of the President of the Russian Federation and scholarships of the Government of the Russian Federation; nominal scholarships; scholarships to students appointed by legal entities or individuals, including those who sent them to study.

The university has a student self-government, various clubs, sections for the development of creative abilities and health promotion.

Student self-government at the university is implemented through public student organizations run by students themselves. The policy of student representation at the university is implemented in three directions: student self-government; student representation in the collegial bodies of the university, which manages the educational process; representation of students in social projects implementing regional health objectives.

The university has dormitories, sports halls. There are food outlets in the academic buildings and at the bases of clinics.

KemSMU regularly allocates financial resources to organize and ensure the participation of students in conferences, seminars, symposiums, sports and recreation and cultural events.

The Institute of curatorship has been introduced at KemSMU in order to support and stimulate students to achieve learning outcomes.

### ***Analytical part***

According to the "Students" standard, it was revealed that the materials presented by the EEC, information on the university's website, the results of interviews and sociological surveys

of students confirm the data of the self-assessment report.

The control figures for admission to the EP in the specialties are regulated by state policy. Admission control figures are approved annually by orders of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation on the basis of the results of an open public competition for the distribution of admission control figures for higher education programs, one of the criteria of the competition is the availability of sufficient material and technical base at the University.

KemSMU has implemented student support programs aimed at social and personal needs, including anonymous psychological assistance from a psychologist, targeted solutions to financial problems, as well as health-related problems. Students are provided with counseling, including academic support, professional career planning, support in relation to personal, financial and health problems.

The position of the deputy dean has been introduced in the deaneries, who provides academic advice on the choice of electives (optional disciplines), and also assists students who have encountered difficulties in mastering curricula (drawing up individual schedules for the elimination of academic debts, monitoring progress, promotion to competitions and Olympiads in disciplines). However, according to the results of the survey, students answered the question whether you are satisfied with the availability of academic counseling, 1.5% are not satisfied and 7.3% are very bad, 4% are not satisfied with the availability of counseling on personal problems, 12.4% are very bad, which proves the insufficiency of counseling and the need to introduce tutors and advisors to students of all courses.

At all stages of the implementation of the MPEP, consultations are held with students regarding their academic performance in disciplines, dean's staff, tutors from among senior students and curators from among teaching staff.

The university has a student self-government, but there are no representatives of student self-government in the collegial bodies of the university (Order 668A of January 22, 2022, the Council of the Faculty of Medicine and Prevention, Order No. 51A of the Central Methodological Council of January 31, 2020, the Faculty Methodological Commission of the Faculty of Medicine and Prevention, the Cyclical Methodological Commission for the 2020/21 academic year, the Central Methodological Council order No. 114 of 06.09.2021).

Academic mobility (both students and teaching staff) is one of the indicators of the strategy of any university. The KemSMU self-assessment report presents the criteria for selecting students and teaching staff for academic mobility, but the "Regulations on Academic Mobility" have not been approved. In order to increase the indicators of academic mobility, the university should step up its activities to harmonize educational programs with the programs of leading domestic and foreign universities, and form joint educational programs.

### ***Strengths/Best practices***

Strengths are not revealed.

### ***EEC Recommendations***

1. In order to help build an individual learning trajectory, the system of academic counseling of students on issues related to preparation for postgraduate studies, professional career planning (professional orientation) should be expanded. The deadline is until September 1, 2022.

2. To introduce a school of advisors (for senior courses), in order to advise students on issues related to the choice of electives, preparation for postgraduate studies, professional career planning. The deadline is until September 1, 2022.

3. To keep up-to-date the system of social support for students.

4. To develop a program for the development of academic mobility of students and to provide for regional and international exchange in the university's development plans. Term – until January 1, 2023 academic

year. 5. To introduce students to the Collegial bodies responsible for the development of

the mission, EP. Term – until June 1, 2022.

***Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria of the standard "Students":***

*strong positions – 0,  
satisfactory – 15,  
suggest improvements – 1,  
unsatisfactory – 0.*

6.5. Standard "Academic staff/teachers"

***The evidentiary part***

At KemSMU, the selection and admission of academic staff in the specialty "Medical and preventive care" is carried out in accordance with [The Labor Code of the Russian Federation](#), other legislative acts and the Charter FSFE of HE KemSMU of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation.

The organizational and staff structure, the practice of selection, admission, placement of personnel, the formation of a quality reserve in the specialty of training "Medical and preventive care" are aimed at creating the necessary conditions for effective implementation of the EP.

The members of the EEC were provided with the information of the teaching staff in the context of the disciplines taught, the staffing table, indicating the qualitative and quantitative staffing of the EP "Medical and preventive care". Qualification requirements for the positions of teaching staff related to teaching staff are approved by the Unified Qualification Directory of positions of managers, specialists and employees, section "Qualification characteristics of positions of managers and specialists of higher professional and additional professional education, approved by Order of the Ministry of Health and Social Development of the Russian Federation dated 11.01.2011 No. 1n and job descriptions.

The total number of teaching staff is 78 people, of which 74 (95%) are the main employees.

The employment policy of the teaching staff is reflected in: [Regulations on the procedure for filling positions of teaching staff related to the teaching staff](#), [Regulations on the election of the dean of the faculty and the head of the Department of the University](#).

The content and norms of the time of activity of the teaching staff of the University regulates [Regulation on the procedure for planning and accounting for the work of the teaching staff](#). The standard (total) amount of working time of one teacher in an academic year is, on average, 1512 hours, based on a 36-hour working week (within the rate), taking into account 56 calendar days of vacation.

In order to stimulate employees to a high-quality result of work, as well as encouragement for the work performed at the university, in addition to the official salary, incentive payments have been established. The issues of staff promotion are regulated by the local regulations of the University, in particular, the Regulation on incentive payments under an effective contract to teaching staff of the University. The regulation determines the size of official salaries by professional qualification groups, the size of increasing coefficients to salaries; conditions and amounts of compensatory and incentive payments in accordance with the payment lists approved by the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation.

Employees are regularly sent for advanced training in accordance with the Plan and schedule of advanced training and retraining.

The teacher-student ratio is determined by the requirements of the Ministry of Education and Science of Russia and the roadmap of the university and is within the regulatory requirements. The number of students per teacher is approximately 1:8.

***Analytical part***

According to the "Academic Staff/Teachers" standard, it was revealed that the personnel policy on recruitment and selection of personnel ensures full equality and accessibility to vacancies available at the university and guarantees equal opportunities and an objective



assessment of the applicants' professional qualities. The balance of academic staff/teachers of basic biomedical sciences, behavioral and social sciences and clinical sciences is maintained for the adequate implementation of the EP.

KemSMU has developed and implemented support and evaluation mechanisms for teaching staff. For the purpose of motivation, surcharges are provided for publications in peer-reviewed publications with a non-zero impact factor.

The university has provided continuous professional development of teaching staff both in pedagogy and in specialized medical specialties.

The exchange of teaching staff is carried out in accordance with the Regulations on Academic Mobility of Students and Employees. In general, the university meets the needs of teaching staff in professional development, which is confirmed by reports and copies of documents on the professional development of teachers.

According to the results of the survey of teaching staff, about 2% answered the question of whether the university provides an opportunity for continuous development of the potential of teaching staff relatively poorly, 8% answered the question of how the work on improving the qualifications of teaching staff was done relatively poorly, and 1% each poorly and very poorly.

Maintaining a balance between educational, organizational, scientific, methodological, educational and ideological work of teaching staff is carried out through individual planning of working hours for the entire academic year, taking into account the needs of the university and the professional qualifications of teachers. However, according to the results of the survey of teaching staff, to the question assess the level of ability of teaching staff to combine teaching with scientific research and practical activities, teachers answered relatively poorly 11%, poorly 6%, which proves the need to revise the policy of activity and development of teaching staff with recognition of the results of all types of activities, including for part-timers observing the balance of time between teaching, clinical, scientific, methodological and educational functions.

#### ***Strengths/Best practices***

Strengths are not revealed.

#### ***EEC Recommendations***

1. Review the policy of activity and development of teaching staff with recognition of the results of all types of activities, including for part-timers, the balance of time between teaching, clinical, scientific, methodological and educational functions. The deadline is until September 1, 2022.

2. To continuously improve the system of financial incentives for teaching staff, taking into account the main indicators of educational, scientific and educational activities.

***Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria of the standard "Academic staff/teachers":***

*strong positions – 0,*

*satisfactory – 10,*

*suggest improvements – 2,*

*unsatisfactory – 0.*

#### ***6.6. Standard "Educational resources"***

##### ***The evidentiary part***

KemSMU has sufficient resources to ensure the implementation of the EP, allowing to ensure the implementation of the EP "Medico-preventive business". During the visual inspection of the graduating department of the EP "Medical and Preventive Affairs", a Simulation Training

and Accreditation Center (sanitary and hygienic building) was provided.

To implement the educational process at the university, there are 4 academic buildings, premises of clinical departments located in medical clinics, 3 dormitories for students for the implementation of the educational process at the university. The clinical departments of the university are located directly in the medical organizations of the city. The entire classroom fund is equipped with modern technical, demonstration facilities. Computer classes are connected to one single local network, have access to the Internet.

The university has created conditions for teaching disabled people and people with disabilities.

The center of the University's information space is the library, whose departments are located in three academic buildings, the library is located in two buildings in rooms with a total area of 1753.8 m<sup>2</sup>, the number of seats in reading rooms is 220.

The electronic information and educational environment of the University includes the following components: The official website of the University; Modular object-oriented dynamic learning environment Moodle; Corporate e-mail; Directory of publicly available data; Electronic library systems; Personal account of the user of the electronic information and educational environment. Legal Systems: Consultant and Code.

Students are provided with the resources of Russian EBS, professional databases, information and reference and search systems: DB "EBS" Student's consultant"; DB "Doctor's consultant. Electronic medical library"; Database of EBS "LAN", database "Electronic library system "Bukap", database "Electronic library system "Medical Library" MEDLIB.RU ", "YURAYT Educational Platform", EBS "SpetsLit", CODEX Information and Reference System, Consultant-Plus Legal Reference System.

Open access resources: NEB "eLibrary.RU"; "Federal Electronic Medical Library" (FEMB) (<http://www.femb.ru>), which is part of the unified state information system in the field of health care as a reference system; Electronic library subscription of the Central Library Service (<http://www.emll.ru>); Website of the World Health Organization (<http://www.who.int/ru>), foreign resources with limited access: PubMed (<http://www.pubmed.gov/>).

Healthcare institutions, which are clinical and practical bases of the University, have the necessary modern material and technical base for the development of professional and special skills.

Academic mobility (both students and teaching staff) is one of the indicators of the strategy of any university.

Students participating in scientific work are encouraged during student scientific forums (categories of works, diplomas, certificates) and the Republican competition student works (winners of the competition, first and second categories).

The university management constantly supports the aspirations and interests of employees in conducting research in medical education. According to the collective agreement, employees are awarded for achievements in research, for innovation proposals, preparation of monographs, textbooks and educational publications, for the defense and approval of dissertations, etc.

### ***Analytical part***

According to the standard "Educational Resources", it was revealed that KemSMU provides the implementation of the EP "Medical and preventive care" with appropriate material, technical and human resources, clinical bases, which is confirmed by the materials presented, the results of interviews and visual examination.

The University has ample opportunities for independent training of students: access to information and communication technologies, educational resources of the library, the use of the Internet.

The resources of clinical bases and bases of industrial practice are sufficient for the formation of clinical and professional skills of students.

The university invests its own funds in the development of material and technical resources

(purchase of equipment, educational literature).

During the work of the EEC, it was not revealed that the university does not actively promote regional and international exchange of employees. In the survey, 47.2% and 9.6% of teaching staff believe that additional invited teachers participate in the learning process sometimes and very rarely, respectively, and 5.6% answered never.

According to the results of the survey of teaching staff, the question of how the work on academic mobility of teaching staff was set was answered relatively poorly by 27%, poorly by 4% and 3% very poorly, which proves the need to develop a Provision on academic mobility and drawing up a program of academic mobility of teaching staff and students.

During the work of the EEC, it was revealed that KemSMU does not have access to educational resources with open access to full-text articles in scientometric databases Scopus, WoS, during a conversation with the head of the library, evidentiary documents (contracts) were not provided.

### ***Strengths/Best practices***

Strengths are not revealed.

### ***EEC Recommendations***

1. Develop and implement a policy of examination of educational programs. The deadline is until September 1, 2022;

2. To ensure the involvement of experts from the world's leading medical universities for the development of EP, the introduction of new innovative teaching methods and the assessment of students' knowledge;

3. Organize an examination of the EP, including teaching methods and assessment of practical skills of students, according to the results of which to make changes to the EP. The deadline is until the end of the 2021-2022 academic year;

4. To develop a program for the development of academic mobility of students and teaching staff, to provide for the provision of regional and international exchange of students and teaching staff in the development plans of the university; Term - until the beginning of 2022-2023 academic year

5. To define and implement a policy on academic mobility – transfer and offset of educational credits, mutual recognition of elements of EP, coordination of programs between universities, etc. Term - until the end of the 2021-2022 academic year.

6. Provide employees and students with access to educational resources with open access to full-text articles in scientometric databases Scopus, WoS. The deadline is until the end of the 2022-2023 academic year.

***Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria of the standard "Educational resources":***

*strong positions* – 0,

*satisfactory* – 25,

*suggest improvements* – 5,

*unsatisfactory* – 0.

### ***6.7. The standard "Evaluation of the educational program"***

#### ***The evidentiary part***

At KemSMU, the monitoring of the educational program and the results of its development is carried out on the basis of the Regulations on the main professional educational program, the Regulations on the work program of the discipline, the Regulations on the quality control system of training, the Regulations on the state final certification.

The Educational and Methodological Department (EMD) is responsible for regular

monitoring of the educational program. The Dean's Office, with the active participation of the departments, ensures timely implementation and evaluation of the tasks set. The results are discussed at the faculty council, the central methodological council, the quality council, and brought to the attention of departments and teachers.

Monitoring of the educational program is carried out in order to identify compliance with the requirements of the Federal State Educational Standard. The monitored components of the program are: 1) the structure of the program; 2) the ratio of the basic and variable parts; 3) the availability of elective disciplines; 4) types and types of practices; 5) educational and methodological support; 6) availability of electronic information and educational environment (EIES); 7) staffing; 8) material and technical support.

The Department of Quality of Education, the Center for the Promotion of Employment of Graduates regularly conduct sociological studies on satisfaction: 1) students with the quality of the educational process; 2) graduates with the quality of their education; 3) teachers' satisfaction with the quality and working conditions. The results of the survey and questionnaire are used when making changes to the educational program and the organization of the educational process.

The University collects and analyzes feedback from other stakeholders on EPMP. An external audit of the EPMP is regularly conducted, which is formalized by reviews from employers.

Regularly conducted research at the university to assess customer satisfaction allows us to take into account the needs and requirements of all existing and potential consumers.

#### *Аналитическая часть*

According to the standard "Evaluation of the educational program", it was revealed that the analysis of materials and the results of the meeting with the focus groups of AMS, teaching staff and students demonstrates the well-established processes of evaluation and monitoring of the EP. A survey of teaching staff and students is regularly conducted for satisfaction with the organization of the educational process.

Based on the results of evaluation procedures, the administration of the university and faculties identifies problems and shortcomings in achieving the expected intermediate and final learning outcomes, and corrects the components of the educational program.

According to the results of the survey of teaching staff, 5.6% of teachers answered relatively poorly, 1.6% poorly and 1.2% answered very poorly to the question assess the involvement of teaching staff in the process of making managerial and strategic decisions.

The University creates the conditions necessary for students to effectively master the chosen educational program in accordance with their interests and needs, providing this activity with appropriate resources (library, consulting, information). The University has organized a student support service and provides diverse opportunities for personal growth and development of young people. The availability of clinical bases contributes to high-quality modern medical education.

According to the results of the student survey, 4.1% of students answered the question whether you are satisfied with informing students about courses, educational programs, and academic degrees, and 5.1% answered very poorly, which proves that the monitoring results were not reported to interested parties.

There are no representatives of students and employers in the collegial bodies participating in the evaluation of the EP (Order 668A of January 22, 2022, the Council of the Faculty of Medicine and Prevention, Order No. 51A of the Central Methodological Council of 31.08.2020, the Faculty Methodological Commission of the Faculty of Medicine and Prevention, the Cyclical Methodological Commission for the 2020/21 academic year, the Central Methodological Council order No. 114 dated 06.09.2021).

In order to improve the feedback process, the university needs to work more actively with employers and teachers in providing feedback on decisions made on the basis of collective

discussion. According to the results of the survey, 12% answered relatively poorly, 1% poorly and 3% very poorly, According to the results of the survey of students, 3% answered not satisfied with the level of accessibility of the dean's office, 4.8% answered not satisfied with the question of how satisfied you are with the level of accessibility and responsiveness of the university management. satisfied and 2.6 is very bad, which proves the insufficiency of the presented feedback.

***Strengths/Best practices***

Strengths are not revealed.

***EEC Recommendations***

The management of the University and those responsible for the implementation of the EP to develop a program for monitoring key aspects of the EP by September 2022.

By the end of December 2022, those responsible for the EP should ensure a qualitative improvement in the content and implementation of the EP based on the implementation of the monitoring results obtained.

Responsible for the EP to involve teaching staff and students in the process of monitoring the EP, starting from the 2022 academic year.

The management of the University and those responsible for the implementation of the EP should conduct a comprehensive assessment of the educational program on a regular basis from the 2022-2023 academic year, aimed at:

- context of the educational process;
- description of the discipline, teaching methods, training and evaluation methods;

The management of the University and those responsible for the implementation of the EP need to develop and apply on a regular basis from 2022-2023 mechanisms for evaluating the educational program aimed at:

- student's progress;
- search for problems of insufficient achievement of the expected final learning outcomes and for the implementation of measures and corrective action plans to improve the educational program and curricula of disciplines.

Those responsible for the implementation of the EP should collect and study feedback from graduates on a regular basis from 2022 in order to obtain information, improve the EP and the quality of training of students.

***Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria of the standard "Evaluation of the educational program":***

- strong positions – 0,*
- satisfactory –15,*
- suggest improvements – 9,*
- unsatisfactory – 0.*

**6.8. Management and Administration Standard**

***The evidentiary part***

Management of the university's activities is carried out in accordance with the Charter and regulations on structural units and job descriptions.

The collegial governing body of the University is the Academic Council, which includes the rector, president, vice-rectors, deans of faculties, heads of departments, heads of departments, teachers, students. The Academic Council reviews and makes decisions on the main areas of educational, scientific and medical activities of KemSMU, as well as approves curricula and educational programs on the recommendation of the deans of faculties, awards honorary titles, approves local regulations governing the main activities. The structure and functions of the

Academic Council are presented in [Regulations on the Academic Council](#).

The faculty and its educational program are managed on the principles of the university-wide and program Mission and Quality Policy by faculty methodological commissions, cycle methodological commissions.

Kemsu has an internal quality assurance system in accordance with the requirements of the international Quality Management System (QMS) ISO 9001:2015.

The departments responsible for the development and full implementation of the EPMP are: Dean's Office, FNK, CMC.

The design of the EPMP is carried out by a team of developers from among the most qualified teaching staff of the departments. Responsibility for the development of the EPMP is assigned to the dean of the faculty. The dean forms a team of developers, approves the schedule of necessary work and deadlines. FMK, CMK define methodological approaches to the formation of EPMP, the competence matrix, the scale and criteria for assessing the formation of competencies.

The university annually forms budget estimates of expenditures and estimates of income and expenses of extra-budgetary funds, analyzes the receipt and expenditure of financial resources. The principle of transparency is also implemented through the procurement procedure, which includes, among other things, the collection of applications from the structural units of the university about their need for resources to ensure the quality of the educational process and the working conditions of teachers.

The FEAP is approved for a calendar year and a planning period by the Academic Council of the University. Control over the expenditure of financial resources is carried out by the planning and financial management. In the FEAP, funding is distributed according to the articles and sub-articles of the budget classification (CBC).

The University has full autonomy to determine priorities in the allocation of extra-budgetary funds and the necessary autonomy in the allocation of budgetary funds within the allocated budget allocations.

The administrative division responsible for activities related to the educational process is the Educational Department (ED). The staff of the Educational Department forms databases on the contingent of students; analyzes the movement of the contingent of students and analyzes statistical data on students; analyzes the progress of students; forms and maintains personal files of students; works with orders on the contingent of students; advises departments on current issues; forms summary reports for submission to the external environment of the university.

In accordance with its Mission, the university is directly involved in solving issues related to the protection of the health of citizens in the country and the region. Constructive interaction is carried out in the provision of medical care by employees of 24 clinical departments located in public and private medical organizations in the following areas: treatment of patients with therapeutic and surgical profiles; operations; consultations and consultations; introduction of new methods of diagnosis and treatment.

### ***Analytical part***

According to the standard "Management and Administration", it was revealed that the management of the EP "Medical and preventive care" is provided by an organizational structure. Transparency of the management and decision-making system, assessment of the activities of the structures implementing the EP is carried out at meetings of collegial and advisory bodies.

KemSMU in its management structures should define structural units with the establishment of the responsibility of each structural unit and include all interested parties. According to the results of the study of documents, Orders on collegial bodies of KemSMU, it was revealed that there are no students and employers in the collegial bodies (Order 668A of January 22, 2022 Council of the Faculty of Medicine and Prevention, Order of the Central Methodological Council No. 51A of 31.08.2020, Faculty Methodological Commission of the Faculty of Medicine and Prevention, Cycle Methodological Commission for the 2020/21

academic year, Central Methodological Council Order No. 114 of 06.09.2021).

In the self-assessment report of KemSMU it is written that the University ensures transparency of the management system through the development and communication to the attention of all interested parties of the organizational structure and the provisions defining the communication links and functions of the units.

Transparency of decisions made by the university management, as well as collegial associations, is provided through the official website of the university. In addition, the decisions of the Academic Council, other councils, reports, reports and other information materials are also publicly available on the official website of the university. The electronic information and educational environment of the university provides transparency in the management of the educational process for students, teachers, heads of departments, dean, parents (legal representatives).. However, according to the results of the teachers' questionnaire, 14% of teachers answered relatively poorly, 4% answered poorly and 3% very poorly to the question assess the involvement of teaching staff in the process of making managerial and strategic decisions. To the question of how the management and administration of the university perceives criticism in their address, 12.8% of teachers answered relatively poorly and 1.6% poorly, 1.6% very poorly.

It should be noted the positive feedback from employers during interviews about the activities of the university administration and teaching staff of clinical departments, the results of joint work of the university and medical organizations in the region, which allows teaching staff and students to participate in providing medical care to the population of the region.

#### ***Strengths/Best practices***

Strengths are not revealed.

#### ***EEC Recommendations***

The management of the University and the EP by September 1, 2022 to determine the list of collegial management bodies, which should include:

- students;
- other interested parties (including employers, representatives of the Ministry of Education, Health, the public).

#### ***Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria of the standard "Management and Administration":***

*strong positions* – 0,  
*satisfactory* –15,  
*suggest improvements* – 2,  
*unsatisfactory* – 0.

#### ***6.9. The "Constant updating" standard***

##### ***The evidentiary part***

KemSMU is a dynamically developing and socially responsible educational organization, which has developed and implemented procedures for continuous monitoring and improvement of the fundamental processes of functioning. The University's development program is reviewed and adjusted as national goals in the field of health and education change, as well as the implementation of national projects "Demography", "Education", "Health Care" (<https://национальныепроекты.рф/>). At the meeting of the Academic Council on 30.09.2021, a new University Development Program for 2021-2026 was approved.

The process of updating and improving the implementation of the program is based on the use of electronic information technologies, practice-oriented technologies of the educational process, improving the pedagogical process, improving the quality of teaching. Responsibility

for the quality of training of specialists is assigned to the Vice-rector for Academic Affairs, Dean's Office of the Faculty of Medicine and Prevention, Department.

The EPMP "Medico-preventive business" is periodically updated to reflect the development in biomedical, behavioral, social, clinical sciences, as well as the demands of the healthcare system and society, taking into account the needs of employers. According to internal documents, the faculty constantly monitors and analyzes the satisfaction of employers and graduates, responding to comments and recommendations.

The effectiveness of educational activities, learning outcomes and their compliance with the Mission are monitored by the educational and methodological department, deans. Taking into account its own experience, audits, changes in the external environment, the University is constantly improving its activities. The provisions of the Mission and Policy are adapted taking into account the final results and the needs of the directions of development of national health care.

When implementing the EP, the university plans and applies processes of continuous monitoring, evaluation, analysis and improvement of educational services, taking into account the requirements of the state legislation of the Russian Federation, the requirements and expectations of stakeholders, contributing to the development of quality education based on a competency-based approach and learning outcomes. When planning the implementation of the EP, an analysis of activities based on the results of monitoring the implementation of the activities of the strategic development plan of the university, the annual plan of activities, the results of external and internal audits, reports of commissions is taken into account.

#### ***Analytical part***

According to the "Constant Updating" standard, it was revealed that the university provides procedures for regular revision of the EP "Medical and preventive care", which is confirmed by the materials presented, information on the university's website, and the results of focus group interviews. The EEC notes that when planning and allocating resources, academic structures take priority.

The university management actively supports and encourages scientific-research activities of students, young scientists of the university. The university has developed a program to support students and young scientists in their scientific research.

The University's development program is reviewed and adjusted as national goals in the field of health and education change, as well as the implementation of national projects "Demography", "Education", Health Care" (<https://национальныепроекты.рф/>). At the meeting of the Academic Council on 30.09.2021, a new University Development Program for 2021-2026 was approved.

The University applies the processes of continuous monitoring, evaluation, analysis and improvement of educational services, taking into account the requirements of legislation, requirements and expectations of stakeholders, contributing to the development of quality education based on a competency-based approach and learning outcomes. When implementing the program, the requirements of consumers are taken into account based on the QMS implemented at the university and its main elements.

The process of updating the EP in the specialty "Medical and preventive care" is based on the constant study of trends in medical science, in the field of medical education, participation in conferences, seminars, webinars in this area, higher school pedagogy, accreditation issues, preparation of new educational programs, improving the quality of education.

#### ***Strengths/Best practices***

Strengths are not revealed.

#### ***EEC Recommendations***



Those responsible for the implementation of the EP during 2022-2023 should:

- to adapt the model of the educational program and methodological approaches that take into account modern theories in education, the methodology of adult education and the principles of active learning;

- to conduct and improve the process of monitoring and evaluation of the educational program on a regular basis;

- to base the process of updating the EP on modern, as well as prospective studies, the results of their own study, evaluation and literature on pharmaceutical and medical education.

***Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria of the "Constant updating" standard:***

*strong positions – 0,*

*satisfactory – 12,*

*suggest improvements – 2,*

*unsatisfactory – 0.*



**(VII) OVERVIEW OF STRENGTHS/BEST PRACTICES FOR EACH STANDARD**

***Standard "Mission and Results"***

No strengths were identified.

***Standard "Educational program"***

No strengths were identified.

***Standard "Students Assessment"***

No strengths were identified.

***Standard "Students"***

No strengths were identified.

***Standard "Academic staff/teachers"***

No strengths were identified.

***Standard "Educational Resources"***

No strengths were identified.

***Standard "Educational Program Assessment"***

No strengths were identified.

***Standard "Management and Administration"***

No strengths were identified.

***Standard "Continuous Update"***

No strengths were identified.



## **(VIII) OVERVIEW RECOMMENDATIONS FOR QUALITY IMPROVEMENT FOR EACH STANDARD**

### ***Standard "Mission and Results"***

1. Ensure the participation of various stakeholders: the academic community, students, practical healthcare, professional associations, public organizations, etc. in the regular revision and implementation of the mission, the formulation of the final learning outcomes of EP 32.05.01 "Medical and preventive care", using a variety of engagement tools (open-space events, discussion platforms, etc.), the deadline is until the beginning of the 2021-2022 academic year;

2. In order to expand the participation of third-party opinions in the discussion of the mission, it is necessary to expand the circle of external stakeholders, to include employers and graduates in the development of the mission of the EP. The deadline is until the beginning of the 2021-2022 academic year;

3. To inform extensively about the Mission of the educational institution (mass media, banners, stands, etc.) in order to bring it to the management of teaching staff, students and the health sector;

4. Involve not only state structures of the healthcare system, but also professional associations, non-governmental organizations, and the public in the discussion and development of the formulation of the final results of the training of the EP;

### ***Standard "Educational program"***

1. Ensure the introduction of active innovative teaching and learning methods based on the modern theory of adult education Term – until September 1, 2022;

2. Develop and approve a catalog of elective disciplines in order to provide a choice of learning paths for students and expand the electability of disciplines in all courses. The deadline is until December 1, 2022;

3. To introduce students, graduates, representatives of practical healthcare, professional associations, public organizations into the collegial bodies responsible for the development, management, analysis and updating of the EP. The deadline is until September 1, 2022;

4. Identify and consolidate the department at the university responsible for planning and implementing the EP. The deadline is until June 1, 2022;

### ***Standart "Students Assessment"***

1. Systematize the methods of assessing the achievements of students, taking into account the number and quality of tests and questions for the oral exam. The deadline is until September 1, 2022;

2. To develop and implement an objective structured clinical examination (OSCE) in the disciplines of sanitary and hygienic profile; The deadline is until the beginning of the 2022-2023 academic year

3. To include training in summative and informative assessment methods with the provision of a list of students in the training plan of teaching staff. The deadline is December 1, 2022;

4. The University needs to improve the process of ensuring the quality of assessment practice in terms of determining the reliability and validity of assessment methods. The deadline is until the beginning of the 2022-2023 academic year.

### ***Standard "Students"***

1. To help build an individual learning trajectory, it is necessary to expand the system of academic counseling of students on issues related to preparation for postgraduate studies, professional career planning (professional orientation). The deadline is until September 1, 2022.

2. To introduce a school of advisors (for senior courses), in order to advise students on issues related to the choice of electives, preparation for postgraduate studies, professional career

planning. The deadline is until September 1, 2022.

3. To keep up-to-date the system of social support for students.

4. To develop a program for the development of academic mobility of students and to provide for regional and international exchange in the university's development plans. Term – until January 1, 2023 academic

year. 5. To introduce students to the Collegial bodies responsible for the development of the mission, OP. Term – until June 1, 2022.

***Standard "Academic staff/teachers"***

1. To review the policy of activity and development of teaching staff with recognition of the results of all types of activities, including for part-timers, compliance with the balance of time between teaching, clinical, scientific, methodological and educational functions. The deadline is until September 1, 2022.

2. To continuously improve the system of financial incentives for teaching staff, taking into account the main indicators of educational, scientific and educational activities.

***Standard "Educational resources"***

1. Develop and implement a policy of examination of educational programs. The deadline is until September 1, 2022;

2. To ensure the involvement of experts from the world's leading medical universities for the development of EP, the introduction of new innovative teaching methods and the assessment of students' knowledge;

3. Organize an examination of the EP, including teaching methods and assessment of practical skills of students, according to the results of which to make changes to the EP. The deadline is until the end of the 2021-2022 academic year;

4. To develop a program for the development of academic mobility of students and teaching staff, to provide for the provision of regional and international exchange of students and teaching staff in the development plans of the university; Term - until the beginning of 2022-2023 academic year

5. To define and implement a policy on academic mobility – transfer and offset of educational credits, mutual recognition of elements of EP, coordination of programs between universities, etc. Term - until the end of the 2021-2022 academic year.

6. Provide employees and students with access to educational resources with open access to full-text articles in scientometric databases Scopus, WoS. The deadline is until the end of the 2022-2023 academic year.

***Standard "Evaluation of the educational program"***

The management of the University and those responsible for the implementation of the EP to develop a program for monitoring key aspects of the EP by September 2022.

By the end of December 2022, those responsible for the EP should ensure a qualitative improvement in the content and implementation of the EP based on the implementation of the monitoring results obtained.

Responsible for the EP to involve teaching staff and students in the process of monitoring the EP, starting from the 2022 academic year.

The management of the University and those responsible for the implementation of the EP should conduct a comprehensive assessment of the educational program on a regular basis from the 2022-2023 academic year, aimed at:

- context of the educational process;

- description of the discipline, teaching methods, training and evaluation methods;

The management of the University and those responsible for the implementation of the EP need to develop and apply on a regular basis from 2022-2023 mechanisms for evaluating the educational program aimed at:

- student's progress;
- search for problems of insufficient achievement of the expected final learning outcomes and for the implementation of measures and corrective action plans to improve the educational program and curricula of disciplines.

Those responsible for the implementation of the EP should collect and study feedback from graduates on a regular basis from 2022 in order to obtain information, improve the EP and the quality of training of students.

***Standard "Management and Administration"***

The management of the University and the EP by September 1, 2022 to determine the list of collegial management bodies, which should include:

- students;
- other interested parties (including employers, representatives of the Ministry of Education, Health, the public).

***Standart "Constant updating"***

Those responsible for the implementation of the EP during 2022-2023 should:

- to adapt the model of the educational program and methodological approaches that take into account modern theories in education, the methodology of adult education and the principles of active learning;
- to conduct and improve the process of monitoring and evaluation of the educational program on a regular basis;
- to base the process of updating the EP on modern, as well as prospective studies, the results of their own study, evaluation and literature on pharmaceutical and medical education.

**(IX) REVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE ORGANIZATION OF EDUCATION**

**(X) RECOMMENDATION TO THE ACCREDITATION COUNCIL**

The members of the EEC came to the unanimous opinion that the educational program 32.05.01 "Medical and preventive care" implemented by the Kemerovo State Medical University of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation can be accredited for a period of 3 years.

**Appendix 1. Evaluation table "PARAMETERS of a specialized PROFILE" 32.05.01**  
**"Medical and preventive care"**

№	№	№ crit.	EVALUATION CRITERIA	The Position of the educational organization			
				Strong	Satisfactory	Suggests improvement	Unsatisfactory
		<b>1.1.1</b> <b>1.1</b>	<b>"MISSION AND RESULTS"</b> <b>Mission definition</b>				
1	1	1.1.11	A medical education organization <b>should</b> define its <i>mission</i> and that of the EP and communicate it to stakeholders and <b>the health sector</b> .		+		
			The mission statement <b>should</b> include <b>goals and an educational strategy</b> to train a competent doctor at the level of <b>basic medical education</b> :				
2	2	1.1.2	with an appropriate foundation for a further career in any field of medicine, including all types of medical practice, <b>administrative medicine</b> and research in medicine		+		
3	3	1.1.3	capable of performing the role and functions of a doctor <b>in accordance with the established requirements of the health sector</b>		+		
4	4	1.1.4	prepared for <b>postgraduate</b> training		+		
5	5	1.1.5	with the commitment to A life-long approach that includes professional responsibility to support the level of knowledge and skills through performance evaluation, auditing, learning from one's own practices and recognized activities in <i>the NPR/NME</i> .		+		
6	6	1.1.6	A medical education organization <b>should</b> ensure that its mission includes medical research achievements in the biomedical, clinical, behavioral, and social sciences.		+		
7	7	1.1.7	A medical education organization should ensure that its mission includes aspects of global health and reflects major international health issues.		+		
		<b>1.2</b>	<b>Participation in mission formulation</b>				
<b>8</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>1.2.1</b>	The medical education organization <b>should</b> ensure that <i>key stakeholders</i> are involved in the development of the OP mission.			+	

9	9	1.2.2	The medical education organization <b>should</b> ensure that the stated mission of the EP is based on the opinions/suggestions of other <i>relevant stakeholders</i> .			+	
		<b>1.3</b>	<b>Institutional autonomy and academic freedom</b>				
			The medical education organization <b>should</b> have <i>institutional autonomy</i> to develop and implement policies for which the administration and faculty are responsible in relation to:				
10	10	1.3.1	development and drafting of the educational program;			+	
11	11	1.3.2	use of the allocated resources necessary for the implementation of the educational program.			+	
			A medical education organization <b>should</b> guarantee <i>academic freedom</i> to its staff and students:				
12	12	1.3.3	in relation to the current educational program, which will be allowed to rely on different points of view in the description and analysis of questions on medicine;			+	
12	12	1.3.4	the possibility of using the results of new research to improve the study of specific disciplines / issues without expanding the educational program.			+	
		<b>1.4</b>	<b>Final learning outcomes</b>				
		1.4.1	A medical educational organization <b>must</b> : determine the expected <i>final learning outcomes</i> that students should show upon completion, relative to:				
13	13		of their achievements at a basic level in terms of knowledge, skills and abilities;			+	
14	14		of an appropriate foundation for a future career in any field of medicine;			+	
15	15		of their future roles in the health sector;			+	
16	16		of their subsequent postgraduate training;			+	
17	17		of their lifelong learning commitments;			+	
18	18		public health health needs, health system needs, and other aspects of social responsibility.			+	
19	19	1.4.2	The medical education organization <b>must</b> ensure that the student fulfills obligations to doctors, teachers, patients and their relatives in accordance with appropriate standards of conduct.			+	
20	20	1.4.3	The medical education organization <b>should</b> determine and coordinate the relationship of the final learning outcomes required upon completion with those required in post-graduate training			+	
21	21	1.4.4	Medical education organizations			+	

			<b>should</b> determine the results of involving students in conducting research in medicine;				
22	22	1.4.5	Medical education organizations <b>should</b> pay attention to the final results related to global health;		+		
23	23	1.4.6	Medical educational organizations <b>should</b> use the results of the assessment of graduates' competencies as a feedback tool for improving the educational program.		+		
			<b>Total</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>22</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>0</b>
		<b>2</b>	<b>EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM</b>				
		<b>2.1</b>	<b>Educational program model and teaching methods</b>				
24	1	2.1.1	The medical education organization should define an educational program that includes an integrated model based on disciplines, organ systems, clinical problems and diseases, a model based on modular or spiral design.		+		
25	2	2.1.2	The medical education organization <b>should</b> identify <i>the teaching and learning methods used</i> that encourage, prepare, and support students to take responsibility for their learning process.		+		
26	3	2.1.3	The medical education organization must ensure that the educational program develops students' lifelong learning abilities.		+		
27	4	2.1.4	The medical education organization must ensure that the educational program is implemented in accordance with the principles of equality.		+		
28	5	2.1.5	Medical education organizations should use teaching and learning methods based on modern adult learning theory.			+	
		<b>2.2</b>	<b>The scientific method</b>				
		2.2.1	The medical education organization should teach students throughout the entire training program:				
29	6		principles of scientific methodology, including methods of analytical and critical thinking;		+		
30	7		scientific research methods in medicine;		+		
31	<b>8</b>		evidence-based medicine,		+		
32	9		which require <i>the appropriate competence of teachers and will be a mandatory part of the educational program.</i>		+		
33	10	2.2.2	A medical educational organization <b>should:</b> include <i>elements of scientific research in the educational program</i> for the formation of scientific thinking and the application of scientific research methods.		+		
34	11	2.2.3	Medical education organizations		+		



			should promote the involvement of students in conducting or participating in research projects.				
			<b>Basic biomedical sciences</b>				
			The medical organization of education should define and include in the educational program:				
35	12	2.3.1	achievements <i>in basic biomedical sciences</i> to develop students' understanding of scientific knowledge;		+		
36	13	2.3.2	concepts and methods that are fundamental to the acquisition and application of clinical scientific knowledge.		+		
			A medical educational organization should adjust and introduce new achievements in the biomedical sciences in the educational program for the following purposes:				
37	14	2.3.3	scientific, technological and clinical developments;		+		
38	15	2.3.4	current and expected needs of society and the healthcare system.		+		
		<b>2.4</b>	<b>Behavioral and social sciences and medical ethics</b>				
		2.4.1	The medical educational organization should define and include in the educational program the following achievements:				
39	16		<i>behavioral sciences;</i>		+		
40	17		<i>social sciences;</i>		+		
41	18		<i>medical ethics;</i>		+		
42	19		<i>medical jurisprudence, which will provide the knowledge, concepts, methods, skills and attitudes necessary to understand the socio-economic, demographic and cultural conditionalities of the causes, spread and consequences of medical health problems, as well as knowledge about the national health system. health care system and patient rights, which will contribute to the analysis of public health problems, effective communication, clinical decision-making and ethical practice.</i>		+		
		2.4.2	A medical education organization <b>should</b> adjust and introduce new achievements <i>in the behavioral and social sciences</i> as well as <i>medical ethics</i> in the educational program for:				
43	20		scientific, technological and clinical developments;		+		
44	21		current and expected needs of society and the healthcare system;		+		
45	22		changing demographic and cultural conditions.		+		
		<b>2.5</b>	<b>Clinical Sciences and Skills</b>				
			The medical education organization				

			should identify and implement achievements in the clinical sciences in the educational program and ensure that students:				
46	23	2.5.1	acquire sufficient knowledge and clinical and professional skills to take on appropriate responsibilities, including activities related to health promotion, disease prevention and patient care;		+		
47	24	2.5.2	conduct a reasonable part (one third) of the program in planned contacts with patients, including consideration of the goal, the appropriate number and their needs. sufficiency for training in relevant clinical databases;		+		
48	25	2.5.3	carry out health promotion and prevention activities.		+		
49	26	2.5.4	A medical education organization must set a certain amount of time for training in the main clinical disciplines, including internal medicine, surgery, psychiatry, general medical practice (family medicine), obstetrics and gynecology, and pediatrics.		+		
50	27	2.5.5	The medical education organization should organize clinical training with appropriate attention to patient safety, including monitoring the student's activities in the conditions of clinical bases.		+		
			Medical educational organizations should adjust and introduce new achievements in clinical sciences in the educational program for:				
51	28	2.5.6	scientific, technological and clinical developments;		+		
52	29	2.5.7	current and expected needs of society and the healthcare system.		+		
53	30	2.5.8	A medical education organization should ensure that: that each student has early contact with real patients, including their gradual participation in patient care, including responsibility for the examination and / or treatment of the patient under supervision, which is carried out in the appropriate clinical databases.		+		
54	31	2.5.9	A medical education organization should structure the various components of clinical skills training according to the specific stage of the training program.		+		
		<b>2.6</b>	<b>Structure of the educational program, content and duration</b>				
55	32	2.6.1	The medical education organization should describe the content, scope, and sequence of courses and other elements of the educational program to ensure that an appropriate balance is maintained between the basic		+		

			biomedical, behavioral, social, and clinical disciplines.				
			The medical organization of education should be included in the educational program:				
56	33	2.6.2	ensure horizontal integration of related sciences and disciplines;		+		
57	34	2.6.3	ensure vertical integration of clinical sciences with basic biomedical and behavioral and social sciences;		+		
58	35	2.6.4	provide the possibility of elective content (electives) and determine the balance between the mandatory and elective part of the educational program, which includes a combination of mandatory elements and electives or special components of choice;			+	
59	36	2.6.5	identify the relationship with complementary medicine that includes non-traditional, traditional or alternative practices.		+		
		<b>2.7</b>	<b>Program management</b>				
60	37	2.7.1	The medical education organization should identify a structural unit responsible for educational programs that, under the direction of academic leadership, has the responsibility and authority to plan and implement the educational program, including allocating allocated resources for planning and implementing teaching and learning methods, evaluating students, and evaluating the educational program and courses of study, in order to ensure that final results are achieved training.		+		
61	38	2.7.2	The medical education organization <b>should</b> guarantee representation from teachers and students in the structural unit responsible for educational programs.			+	
62	39	2.7.3	The medical educational organization <b>should</b> plan and implement innovations in the educational program through the structural division responsible for educational programs.			+	
63	40	2.7.4	The medical educational organization <b>should include</b> representatives from <i>other relevant stakeholders</i> , in the structure of the structural unit of the medical educational organization responsible for educational programs <i>that include other relevant stakeholders. participants in the educational process, representatives from clinical bases, graduates of medical educational organizations, health professionals involved in the training process, or other faculty members of the university.</i>			+	

		<b>2.8</b>	<b>Communication with medical practice and the health care system</b>				
64	41	2.8.1	The medical organization of education should provide an operational link between the educational program and the subsequent stages of professional training (internship if available, specialization, NPR/NME) or practice, which the student will start at the end of training, including identifying health problems and determining the required learning outcomes, clearly defining and describing the elements of the educational program and their relationships at various stages training and practical training, with due regard to local, national, regional and global contexts, as well as feedback to/from the health sector and the involvement of teachers and students in the work of the specialist team in health care delivery.		+		
			A medical educational organization <b>should</b> ensure that the structural unit responsible for the educational program:				
65	42	2.8.2	takes into account the specifics of the conditions in which graduates will work and accordingly modify the educational program;		+		
66	43	2.8.3	considers the modification of the educational program based on feedback from the public and society as a whole.		+		
			<b>Total</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>38</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>0</b>
		<b>3.</b>	<b>STUDENT RATING</b>				
		<b>3.1</b>	<b>Evaluation methods</b>				
			The medical education organization <b>should:</b>				
67	1	3.1.1	define, approve and publish the principles, methods and practices used for student assessment, including the number of examinations and other tests, maintaining a balance between written and oral examinations, using criteria-based and reasoning-based assessment methods, and special examinations (OCE or Mini-Clinical Examination)		.+		
68	2	3.1.2	ensure that the assessment covers knowledge, skills, and attitudes to learning;		+		
69	3	3.1.3	use a wide range of assessment methods and formats depending on their "utility score", which includes a combination of validity, reliability, and quality of life. impact on training, acceptability and effectiveness of evaluation methods			+	

			and format;				
70	4	3.1.4	ensure that evaluation methods and results avoid conflicts of interest;		+		
71	5	3.1.5	ensure that the evaluation process and methods are open (accessible) for external experts to review;		+		
72	6	3.1.6	use a system for appealing evaluation results.		+		
			<b>A medical educational organization should:</b>				
73	7	3.1.7	<i>document and evaluate reliability and validity evaluation methods, which requires an appropriate quality assurance process for existing evaluation practices;</i>			+	
74	8	3.1.8	implement new evaluation methods as needed;			+	
75	9	3.1.9	use the system to appeal evaluation results.		+		
		<b>3.2</b>	<b>Relationship between assessment and learning</b>				
			The medical education organization <b>should</b> use principles, methods and practices of assessment that include students' academic achievements and assessment of knowledge, skills, and professional values of relationships that:				
76	10	3.2.1	clearly comparable to teaching methods, teaching methods and final learning outcomes;		+		
77	11	3.2.2	ensure that students achieve the final learning outcomes;		+		
78	12	3.2.3	promote student learning;		+		
79	13	3.2.4	provide an appropriate balance between formative and summative assessment to manage learning and evaluate student academic progress, which requires establishing rules for assessing progress and their relationship to the assessment process.			+	
			<b>A medical educational organization should:</b>				
80	14	3.2.5	<i>regulate the number and nature of inspections of various elements of the educational program in order to promote knowledge acquisition and integrated learning, and to avoid negative impact on the learning process and eliminate the need to study excessive information and overload the educational program;</i>		+		
81	15	3.2.6	ensure that timely, specific, constructive and fair feedback is provided to students based on the results ratings.		+		
			<b>Total</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>11</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>0</b>
		<b>4.</b>	<b>STUDENTS</b>				
		<b>4.1</b>	<b>Admission and selection policy</b>				
			The medical education organization				

			<b>should:</b>				
82	1	4.1.1	define and implement an admission policy, including a clearly defined provision on the student selection process;		+		
83	2	4.1.2	have a <i>policy</i> and implement <i>the practice of admitting students with disabilities in accordance with the current laws and regulations of the country</i> ;		+		
84	3	4.1.3	have a policy and implement the practice of transferring students from other educational programs and medical organizations.		+		
			A medical educational organization <b>should:</b>				
85	4	4.1.4	establish the relationship between student selection and the mission of the medical education organization, the educational program and the desired quality of graduates;		+		
86	5	4.1.5	periodically review the admission policy, based on relevant data from the public and specialists, in order to meet <i>the health needs of the population and society as a whole, including consideration of student recruitment based on their gender, ethnic origin and language, and the potential need for a special admission policy for students from low-income families and national minorities</i> ;		+		
87	6	4.1.6	use the system to appeal admission decisions.		+		
		<b>4.2</b>	<b>Student recruitment</b>				
88	7	4.2.1	The medical organization of education <b>should</b> determine the number of students accepted in accordance with the material and technical capabilities at all stages of training and preparation, and make a decision on the recruitment of students, which implies the need to regulate national requirements for health personnel resources. in the event that medical organizations of education do not control the number of students recruited, they should demonstrate their obligations by: explain all relationships, paying attention to the consequences of the decisions made (the imbalance between the recruitment of students and the material, technical and academic potential of the university).		+		
89	8	4.2.2	The medical education organization <b>should</b> periodically review the number and enrollment of students in consultation with <i>relevant stakeholders responsible for planning and developing human resources in</i>		+		

			<i>the health sector, as well as with experts and organizations on global aspects of human resources in health (such as insufficient and uneven distribution of human resources in health, migration of doctors, opening of new medical universities). and regulate in order to meet the health needs of the population and society as a whole.</i>				
		<b>4.3</b>	<b>Advising and supporting students</b>				
			A medical educational organization <b>should</b> :				
90	1	4.3.1	have a system of academic counseling for its students, which includes issues related to elective selection, preparation for postgraduate studies, professional career planning, appointment of academic mentors (mentors )for individual students or small groups of students;		+		
91	2	4.3.2	offer a student support program focused on social, financial and personal needs, which includes support related to social and personal problems and events, health and financial issues, access to health care, immunization programs and health insurance, as well as financial assistance services in the form of financial assistance, scholarships and loans;		+		
92	3	4.3.3	allocate resources to support students;		+		
93	4	4.3.4	ensure confidentiality regarding advice and support.		+		
			A medical education organization <b>should</b> provide counseling that:				
94	5	4.3.5	is based on monitoring student progress and focuses on social and personal needs students, including academic support, support for personal problems and situations, health problems, financial issues;		+		
95	6	4.3.66	includes counseling and professional career planning.		+		
		<b>4.4</b>	<b>Student representation</b>				
96	7	4.4.1	The medical education organization <b>should</b> define and implement <i>policies for student representation and appropriate participation</i> in mission definition, development, management, and evaluation of the educational program, and other matters relevant to students.			+	
97	8	4.4.2	The medical education organization <b>should</b> <i>promote and support student activities</i> and student organizations, including <i>providing technical and financial support to student organizations.</i>		+		

			<i>Total</i>	<b>0</b>	<b>15</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>0</b>
		<b>5.</b>	<b>ACADEMIC STAFF/TEACHERS</b>				
		<b>5.1</b>	<b>Selection and recruitment policy</b>				
			The medical education organization <b>should</b> define and implement a <i>staff selection and admission policy</i> that:				
98	1	5.1.1	defines their category, responsibilities, and <i>balance of academic staff/teachers</i> in basic biomedical sciences, behavioral and social sciences, and clinical sciences for the adequate implementation of the educational program, including the appropriate balance between medical and non-medical teachers, full-time or part-time teachers, and the balance between academic and non-academic staff;		+		
99	2	5.1.2	contains criteria for the scientific, pedagogical and clinical merits of applicants, including an appropriate balance between teaching, scientific, and clinical qualifications;		+		
100	3	5.1.3	defines and monitors the responsibilities of academic staff/faculty in basic biomedical sciences, behavioral and social sciences, and clinical sciences.		+		
			A medical education organization <b>should</b> take into account the following criteria in its recruitment policy:				
101	4	5.1.4	attitude to its mission, <i>the significance of local conditions, including gender, nationality, religion, language and other conditions relevant to the medical education organization and educational program;</i>		+		
102	5	5.1.5	<i>economic opportunities that take into account the institutional conditions for employee funding and efficient use of resources.</i>		+		
		<b>5.2</b>	<b>Development policy and employee performance</b>				
			The medical education organization should define and implement a policy for the activities and development of employees that:				
104	6	5.2.1	allows you to maintain a <i>balance between teaching, research and service functions</i> , which includes setting <i>the time for each type of activity, taking into account the needs of the medical educational organization and the professional qualifications of teachers;</i>			+	
105	7	5.2.2	guarantees <i>the recognition of academic performance</i> , with appropriate emphasis on teaching, research and clinical qualifications, and <i>is implemented in the form of</i>			+	



			<i>awards, promotions and / or remuneration;</i>				
106	8	5.2.3	ensures that clinical activities and research are used in teaching and learning;		+		
107	9	5.2.4	ensures <i>that each employee has sufficient knowledge of the educational program, which includes knowledge of teaching/learning methods and the general content of the educational program, as well as other disciplines and subject areas in order to encourage cooperation and integration;</i>		+		
108	10	5.2.5	<i>includes training, development, support and evaluation of teachers ' activities, which involves all teachers, not only newly hired, but also teachers drawn from hospitals and clinics.</i>		+		
			A medical educational organization <b>should:</b>				
109	11	5.2.6	take into account the ratio of "teacher-student " depending on the various components of the educational program;		+		
110	12	5.2.7	develop and implement employee promotion policies.		+		
			<b>Total</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>0</b>
		<b>6.</b>	<b>EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES</b>				
		<b>6.1</b>	<b>Material and technical base</b>				
			A medical educational organization <b>must:</b>				
111	1	6.1.1	have a sufficient <i>material and technical base</i> for teachers and students to ensure adequate implementation of the educational program;		+		
112	2	6.2.2	provide <i>a safe environment</i> for employees, students, patients and those who care for them, including providing the necessary information and <i>protection from harmful substances, microorganisms, compliance with safety regulations in the laboratory and when using the equipment.</i>		+		
113	3	6.1.3	Medical education organizations <b>should</b> improve the environment <b>in which</b> training of students through regular updating, expansion and strengthening of the material and technical base, which should correspond to the development in the practice of training.		+		
		<b>6.2</b>	<b>Resources for clinical training</b>				
			The medical education organization <b>should</b> provide the necessary resources for students to acquire adequate clinical experience, including sufficient:				
114	4	6.2.1	number and categories of patients;		+		

115	5	6.2.2	number and categories of <i>clinical bases</i> that include <i>clinics, outpatient services (including primary health care), primary health care facilities, health centers, and others institutions providing medical care to the population, as well as centers/laboratories of clinical skills that allow conducting clinical training, using the capabilities of clinical databases and providing rotation in the main clinical disciplines;</i>		+		
116	6	6.2.3	monitoring of students ' clinical practice.		+		
117	7	6.2.4	The health education organization <b>should</b> <i>examine and evaluate, adapt and improve clinical training resources to meet the needs of the population served, which will include compliance and quality for clinical training programs regarding clinical facilities, equipment, number and category of patients and clinical practice, supervision as a supervisor, and administration.</i>		+		
		<b>6.3</b>	<b>Information technology</b>				
118	8	6.3.1	The medical education organization <b>should</b> define and implement policies that focus on <i>the effective use and evaluation of relevant information and communication technologies</i> in the educational program.		+		
119	9	6.3.2	A medical educational organization <b>should</b> provide access to online or other electronic media		+		
			Medical education organizations <b>should</b> provide teachers and students with opportunities to use information and communication technologies:				
120	10	6.3.3	for self-study;		+		
121	11	6.3.4	access to information;		+		
122	12	6.3.5	patient management;		+		
123	13	6.3.6	work in the healthcare system.		+		
124	14	6.3.7	A medical education organization <b>should</b> optimize students ' access to relevant patient data and health information systems.		+		
		<b>6.4</b>	<b>Medical research and scientific achievements</b>				
			A medical educational organization <b>must:</b>				
125	15	6.4.1	have <i>a research activity in the field of medicine and scientific achievements</i> as a basis for the educational program;		+		
126	16	6.4.2	define and implement policies that promote the relationship between research and education;		+		
127	17	6.4.3	provide information on the research base and priority areas in the field of scientific research of the medical		+		

			educational organization;				
128	18	6.4.4	use medical scientific research as a basis for educational activities. programs		+		
			A medical education organization <b>should</b> ensure that the relationship between research and education is consistent.:				
129	19	6.4.5	is considered in teaching;		+		
130	20	6.4.66	encourages and prepares students to participate in scientific research in the field of medicine and their development.		+		
		<b>6.5</b>	<b>Expertise in the field of education</b>				
			A medical educational organization <b>must</b> :				
131	21	6.5.1	have access to <i>educational expertise</i> , where appropriate, and conduct expertise that examines the processes, practices, and problems of medical education and may involve physicians with research experience in medical education, psychologists, and sociologists in the field of education, or through the involvement of experts from other national and international institutions.			+	
			The medical education organization <b>should</b> define and implement a policy on the use of expertise in the field of education:				
132	22	6.5.2	in the development of the educational program;		+		
133	23	6.5.3	in the development of teaching methods and assessment of knowledge and skills.			+	
			A medical educational organization <b>should</b> :				
134	24	6.5.4	provide evidence of the use of internal or external expertise in medical education to develop staff capacity;		+		
135	25	6.5.5	pay due attention to the development of <i>expertise in educational assessment and research in medical education as a discipline that includes the study of theoretical, practical and social issues in medical education</i> ;			+	
136	26	6.5.6	promote the desire and interests of employees involved in conducting research in medical education.		+		
		<b>6.6</b>	<b>Exchange in the field of education</b>				
			The medical education organization should define and implement policies for:				
137	27	6.6.1	cooperation at the national and international levels <i>with other medical institutions</i> ;		+		
138	28	6.6.2	<i>transfer and offsetting of educational credits, which includes consideration of the scope of the educational</i>		+		

			<i>program that can be transferred from other educational organizations and which can be facilitated by the conclusion of agreements on mutual recognition of educational program elements, and active coordination of programs between medical educational organizations and the use of a transparent credit unit system and flexible course requirements.</i>				
			The medical education organization <b>should</b> :				
139	29	6.6.3	promote regional and international exchange of staff (academic, administrative and teaching staff) and students by providing appropriate resources;			+	
140	30	6.6.4	ensure that the exchange is organized in accordance with the objectives, taking into account the needs of employees, students, and in compliance with ethical principles.			+	
			<b>Total</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>25</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>0</b>
		<b>7.</b>	<b>EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM</b>				
		<b>7.1</b>	<b>Mechanisms for monitoring and evaluating the program</b>				
			The medical education organization <b>should</b>				
141	1	7.1.1	have a process and outcome monitoring program that includes the collection and analysis of data on key aspects of the educational program to ensure that the educational process is carried out appropriately and to identify any areas that require intervention, and data collection is part of administrative procedures related to student admission, assessment, and evaluation. students and completion of training.			+	
142	2	7.1.2	ensure that the relevant assessment results have an impact on the curriculum			+	
			The medical educational organization <b>should</b> establish and apply mechanisms for evaluating the educational program, which:				
143	3	7.1.3	focus on the educational program and its <i>main components, including the model of the educational program, the structure, content and duration of the educational program, and the use of mandatory and elective parts;</i>			+	
144	4	7.1.4	focus on student progress;			+	
145	5	7.1.5	identify and address <i>problems that include insufficient achievement of the expected final learning outcomes, and will assume that the information received on the final results of training, including the identified</i>			+	

			shortcomings and problems, will be used as feedback for carrying out activities and corrective action plans, for improving the educational program and academic programs of disciplines;				
			The medical educational organization <b>should</b> periodically conduct a comprehensive <i>evaluation of the educational program</i> , aimed at:				
146	6	7.1.6	<i>the context of the educational process, which includes the organization and resources, learning environment and culture of the medical educational organization;</i>			+	
147	7	7.1.7	<i>for special components of the educational program, which include: description of the discipline and methods of teaching and learning, clinical rotations, and assessment methods;</i>			+	
148	8	7.1.8	on <i>overall final results</i> to be measured by national exam results, international exams, career choices, and post-graduate learning outcomes;		+		
149	9	7.1.9	Health education organizations <b>should</b> rely on social responsibility/accountability.		+		
		<b>7.2</b>	<b>Teacher and student feedback</b>				
150	10	7.2.1	The medical education organization <b>should</b> systematically collect, analyze and provide teachers and students <i>with feedback that includes information about the process and products of the educational program, and also include information about unfair practices or inappropriate behavior of teachers or students with legal consequences.</i>		+		
151	11	7.2.2	The medical education organization <b>should</b> use the feedback results to improve the educational program.		+		
		<b>7.3</b>	<b>Academic achievements of students</b>				
			A medical educational organization <b>should</b> conduct an <b>analysis</b> <i>учебных достижений</i> of students' academic achievements in relation to:				
152	12	7.3.1	<i>its mission and final learning outcomes</i> of the educational program, which includes information on the average duration of study, academic performance scores, the frequency of passing and failing exams, cases of successful completion and expulsion, student reports on the conditions of study in the courses taken, on the time spent studying areas of interest, including elective components, as well as interviews with students on repeat courses, and interviews with students who leave the program of study;		+		

153	13	7.3.2	of the educational program;		+		
154	14	7.3.3.	availability of resources.		+		
			A medical educational organization <b>should</b> analyze <i>учебные достижения</i> students' academic achievements in relation to the following factors:				
155	15	7.3.4	their <i>previous experience and conditions, including social, economic, cultural conditions;</i>		+		
156	16	7.3.5	level of training at the time of admission to a medical educational organization.		+		
			A medical education organization <b>should</b> use an analysis of students' academic achievements to provide feedback to the structural divisions responsible for:				
157	17	7.3.6	student selection;		+		
158	18	7.3.7	planning the educational program;		+		
159	19	7.3.8	advising students.		+		
		<b>7.4</b>	<b>Stakeholder engagement</b>				
			The medical educational organization <b>should</b> include in its monitoring program and activities aimed at evaluating the educational program:				
160	20	7.4.1	faculty and students;			+	
161	21	7.4.2	your administration and management.		+		
			A medical educational organization <b>should:</b> <i>for other stakeholders, including other representatives of academic and administrative staff, members of the public, authorized bodies for education and health, professional organizations, as well as those responsible for postgraduate education:</i>				
162	22	7.4.3	provide access to the results of the course and educational program assessment;		+		
163	23	7.4.4	collect and study feedback from them on the clinical practice of graduates;			+	
164	24	7.4.5	collect and study feedback from them on the educational program.		+		
			<b>Total</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>15</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>0</b>
		<b>8.</b>	<b>MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION</b>				
		<b>8.1</b>	<b>Management</b>				
165	1	8.1.1	The medical educational organization <b>should</b> define its management structures and functions, including their <i>relationship with the university, if the medical educational organization is a part or branch of the university.</i>		+		
			A medical educational organization <b>should</b> define <i>structural divisions in its management structures with the definition of responsibility for each structural division</i> and include them in their composition:				

166	2	8.1.2	representatives of academic staff;		+		
167	3	8.1.3	students;			+	
168	4	8.1.4	<i>other stakeholders, including representatives of the Ministry of Education and Health, the health sector and the public.</i>			+	
169	5	8.1.5	Medical educational organizations <b>should</b> ensure <i>transparency</i> of the management system and decisions made, which <i>are published in bulletins, posted on the university's website, and included in protocols for review and implementation.</i>		+		
		<b>8.2</b>	<b>Academic guidelines</b>				
170	6	8.2.1	The medical education organization <b>should</b> clearly define the responsibilities <i>of academic leadership</i> in relation to the development and management of the educational program.		+		
171	7	8.2.2	A medical education organization <b>should</b> periodically evaluate academic leadership regarding the achievement of its mission and ultimate learning outcomes.		+		
		<b>8.3</b>	<b>Training budget and resource allocation</b>				
			A medical education organization <b>must:</b>				
172	8	8.3.1	have clear responsibilities and powers to provide the educational program with resources, including the target budget for training;		+		
173	9	8.3.2	allocate the resources necessary for the implementation of the educational program and allocate educational resources in accordance with their needs.		+		
174	10	8.3.3	The system of financing a medical educational organization should include: It should be based on the principles of efficiency, efficiency, priority, transparency, responsibility, differentiation and independence of all budget levels.		+		
			A single educational organization <b>should:</b>				
175	11	8.3.4	provide sufficient autonomy in the allocation of resources, including decent remuneration of teachers in order to achieve the final results of training;		+		
176	12	8.3.5	when allocating resources, take into account scientific achievements in the field of medicine and public health problems and their needs.		+		
		<b>8.4</b>	<b>Administrative staff and management</b>				
			A medical educational organization <b>must</b> have <i>an appropriate administrative staff, including their number and composition in</i>				

			<i>accordance with their qualifications, in order to:</i>				
177	13	8.4.1	ensure the implementation of the educational program and related activities;		+		
178	14	8.4.2	ensure proper management and allocation of resources.		+		
179	15	8.4.3	The health education organization <b>should</b> develop and implement an internal quality assurance management program that includes consideration of needs for improvement, and conduct a regular review and review of management.		+		
		<b>8.5</b>	<b>Interaction with the health sector</b>				
180	16	8.5.1	The medical education organization <b>should</b> have a constructive interaction with the health sector, with related health sectors of society and government, including information exchange, cooperation and initiatives of the organization, which contributes to the provision of qualified doctors in accordance with the needs of society.		+		
181	17	8.5.2	The medical education organization <b>should</b> be given a formal status of cooperation with partners in the health sector, which includes the conclusion of formal agreements defining the content and forms of cooperation and/or the conclusion of a joint contract and the establishment of a coordination committee, and conducting joint activities.		+		
			<b>Total</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>15</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>0</b>
		<b>9.</b>	<b>CONSTANT UPDATE</b>				
			The medical organization of education <b>should</b> be considered as a dynamic and socially responsible institution:				
182	1	9.1.1	initiate procedures for regular review and revision of content, results / competencies, assessment and learning environment, structure and function, document and address deficiencies;		+		
183	2	9.1.2	allocate resources for continuous improvement.		+		
			A medical educational organization <b>should:</b>				
184	3	9.1.3	base the update process on prospective results. research and analysis and based on their own research, evaluation and literature on medical education;			+	
185	4	9.1.4	ensure that the process of updating and restructuring leads to a review of their policies and practices in accordance with previous experience, current activities and future prospects; direct the update process		+		



			to the following questions:				
186	5	9.1.5	Adaptation of the mission statement and final results to the scientific, socio-economic and cultural development of society.		+		
187	6	9.1.6	Modifying the final learning outcomes of graduates in accordance with the documented needs of the postgraduate training environment, including clinical skills, training in public health issues and participation in the process of providing medical care to patients in accordance with the responsibilities that are assigned to graduates after graduation from the MOO.		+		
188	7	9.1.7	Adapts the educational program model and methodological approaches to ensure that they are appropriate and appropriate and takes into account current theories in education, adult learning methodology, and active learning principles.			+	
189	8	9.1.8	Adjust the elements of the educational program and their relationship in accordance with advances in biomedical, behavioral, social and clinical sciences, with changes in the demographic situation and health / morbidity structure of the population and socio-economic and cultural conditions, and the adjustment process will ensure the inclusion of new relevant knowledge, concepts and methods, and the exclusion of outdated ones.		+		
190	9	9.1.9	Development of assessment principles and methods of conducting and quantity of examinations in accordance with changes in final learning outcomes and teaching and learning methods.		+		
191	10	9.1.10	Adapt student recruitment policies and selection methods to meet changing expectations and circumstances, human resource needs, changes in the pre-university education system, and the needs of the educational program.		+		
192	11	9.1.11	Adapt the policy of recruitment and formation of academic staff in accordance with changing needs.		+		
193	12	9.1.12	Updating educational resources to meet changing needs, such as student recruitment, the number and profile of academic staff, and the educational program.		+		
194	13	9.1.13	Improve the process of monitoring and evaluating the educational program.			+	

195	14	9.1.14	Improving the organizational structure and management principles to ensure effective performance in the face of changing circumstances and needs, and, in the long term, to meet the interests of various groups of stakeholders.		+		
			<b>Total</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>12</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>0</b>
			<b>TOTAL IN TOTAL</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>163</b>	<b>32</b>	<b>0</b>

