



«АККРЕДИТЕУ ЖӘНЕ РЕЙТИНГТИҢ
ТӘУЕЛСІЗ АГЕНТТІГІ» КЕМ

НУ «НЕЗАВИСИМОЕ АГЕНТСТВО
АККРЕДИТАЦИИ И РЕЙТИНГА»

INDEPENDENT AGENCY FOR
ACCREDITATION AND RATING

REPORT

on the results of the work of the external expert commission for
assessment of compliance with the requirements of Standards for
international program accreditation of educational programs
31.05.03 Dentistry (specialist`s degree)
FSBEI HE "Kirov State Medical University"
of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Russian Federation
December 5-7, 2023

INDEPENDENT AGENCY FOR ACCREDITATION AND RATING
External Expert Commission

IAAR Recognition (Accreditation) Council



«АККРЕДИТТЕУ ЖӘНЕ РЕЙТИНГТИҢ
ТӘУЕЛСІЗ АГЕНТТІГІ» КЕМ

НУ «НЕЗАВИСИМОЕ АГЕНТСТВО
АККРЕДИТАЦИИ И РЕЙТИНГА»

INDEPENDENT AGENCY FOR
ACCREDITATION AND RATING

REPORT

**on the results of the work of the external expert commission for assessment
of compliance with the requirements of Standards for international program accreditation
of educational programs**

31.05.03 Dentistry (specialist's degree)

FSBEI HE "Kirov State Medical University"

of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Russian Federation

December 5-7, 2023

Kirov

TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	3
INTRODUCTION	5
INTRODUCTION OF THE EDUCATIONAL INSTITUTION	6
DESCRIPTION OF THE VISIT OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMISSION	6
COMPLIANCE WITH STANDARDS OF PROGRAMM ACCREDITATION	9
6.1. Standard “Mission and Outcomes”	9
6.2 Standard “Educational program”	13
6.3. Standard “Assessment of students”	17
6.4. Standard “Students”	21
6.5. Standard “Academic staff / teachers”	26
6.6. Standard “Educational resources”	30
6.7. Standard “Assessment of the educational program”	33
6.8 Standard «Management and administration»	36
6.9 Standard “Continuing innovations”	42
OVERVIEW OF STRENGTHS/BEST PRACTICES FOR EACH STANDARD	46
Appendix 1. Evaluation table «SPECIALISED PARAMETERS»	49



LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

COVID-19	– the novel COVID-19 infection
IT	– information technology
SFE	– State Final Examination
GIS SCOS	– State information system "Modern digital educational environment"
SEB	– State Examination Board
USE	– unified state exam
c.p.	– credit points/credits
ICE	– the Institute of Continuing Education
Kirov State Medical University	– Federal State Budgetary Educational Institution of Higher Education "Kirov State Medical University of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Russian Federation"
IHIS	– integrated healthcare information system
HP	– healthcare providers
MAS-centre	– Multipurpose Accreditation and Simulation Centre
MOH Kirov region	– Ministry of Healthcare of Kirov region
MOH Russia	– Ministry of Healthcare of the Russian Federation
MSHE Russia	– Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Russian Federation
IAQE	– independent assessment of the quality of education
NPR	– academic staff
OBG, GO and ChS	– safety, civil defense and emergency situations
LHC	– limited health capacities
GPS	– general professional skills
MPEDP	– main/major professional education degree program
OSCE	– Objective Structured Clinical Examination
official website	– the official website of Kirov SMU in the telecommunications network "Internet"
PrS	– professional skills
ATS	– academic teaching staff

BP	– business plan
DEP	– Department of Economics and Planning
RSIC	– Russian Scientific Information Centre
QMS	– quality management system
SSS	– student scientific society
LA	– labour actions
JF	– job functions
US	– universal skills
ASO	– Academic Services Office
FSES HE	– Federal State Educational Standard of Higher Education
FIS GNA	– Federal Information System of State Scientist Certification
FIS GIA and Admission	– Federal Information System of the State Final Examination and Admission
LAM	– learning assessment materials
FRES	– Federal Register of Educational Certificates
FRHO	– Federal Registry of Healthcare Organizations (automated system of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Russian Federation)
FRHP	– Federal Registry of Healthcare Professionals (automated system of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Russian Federation)
ED	– Economic Department
EMB	– Educational and Methodological Board
DLS	– digital library system
EIEE	– electronic information and educational environment

INTRODUCTION

In accordance with Order No. 151-23-OD dated 29.09.2023 of the Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating, from December 5 to December 7, 2023, an external expert commission assessed the compliance of the educational program 31.05.03 Dentistry (specialty) Federal State Budgetary Educational Institution of the Kirov State Medical University of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation standards for International Accreditation of basic Medical and Pharmaceutical education programs (based on WFME/AMSE/ESG) No.150- 22-OD dated December 21, 2022, third edition).

The report of the external expert commission (EAC) contains an assessment of the submitted educational program according to the criteria of the NAAR, recommendations of the EAC for further improvement of the educational program and parameters of the profile of the educational program.

Members of the EEC:

IAAR expert – Chairman of the EEC - Omarkulov Bauyrzhan Kadenovich, PhD, Associate Professor, NAO "Medical University of Karaganda" (Karaganda, Republic of Kazakhstan,), Off-line participation;

IAAR expert – Moroz Irina Nikolaevna, MD, Professor, Belarusian State Medical University (Minsk, Republic of Belarus), Off-line participation;

IAAR expert – Vasily Viktorovich Alyamovsky, MD, Professor, Honored Physician of the Russian Federation, Moscow State Medical and Dental University named after Evdokimov, Head of the Education Committee of the Dental Association of Russia (Moscow, Russian Federation) Off-line participation;

IAAR expert – Seidakhmetova Aizat Ashimkhanovna, PhD, AO South Kazakhstan Medical Academy (Shymkent, Republic of Kazakhstan) On-line participation;

IAAR expert - Employer of EEC – Shits Polina Vladimirovna, Director of OOO "Medicine Plus" (Smolensk, Russian Federation), On-line participation;

IAAR Expert - EEC Student -- Diana Egorova, 6th year student, specialty "Medicine", Volga Region Research Medical University (Nizhny Novgorod, Russian Federation), On-line participation;

IAAR expert - EEC Student -- Bazarbayeva Victoria, 2-year undergraduate, specialty "Molecular Biology", Vyatka State University, (Kirov, Russian Federation), Off-line participation;

IAAR Coordinator – Alisa Satbekovna Dzhakenova, PhD, Head of Medical Projects of the Agency (Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan), Off-line participation.

INTRODUCTION OF THE EDUCATIONAL INSTITUTION

Federal State Budgetary Educational Institution of Higher Education "Kirov State Medical University" of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Russian Federation was founded on April 2, 1987 as a branch of the Perm State Medical University. Since May 3, 1994, it has been an independent organization, is a leading educational institution, the center of medical science in the Kirov region.

The University's development strategy is aimed at implementing state policy in the field of healthcare and medical education, providing the industry with highly qualified medical personnel, improving the quality and accessibility of medical care for all segments of the population.

Due to the constant work to improve the quality of education and the implementation of research results, the University occupies worthy places in Russian and regional rankings. Thus, in 2015, the University became the winner of the competition "The best universities of the Russian Federation"; in 2016, it was included in the list of the best universities according to the results of an independent assessment of the quality of educational activities of higher education organizations; in 2017, it was the winner of the competition "100 best universities of the Russian Federation" (diploma for high quality educational services); in 2021 – 9th place among universities of the Volga Federal District; in 2022 – entry into the first league of "Performance Monitoring – 2022"; in 2023 – 3rd place among universities of the Volga Federal District.

The structure of Kirov SMU includes: 5 faculties, 43 departments, Clinic of Kirov SMU, consultative and diagnostic center of the University clinic, Institute of Continuing Additional Education (7 structural units: Center for Continuing Medical Education, Center for Additional Education, Center for pre-university training, Multiprofile accreditation and simulation Center, Training center "Factory of Processes", Multifunctional medical, psychological and pedagogical center "Academy new opportunities", Regional Speech Therapy Center), information and computing center, Laboratory of Pharmacological Bioenergetics and Membranology, laboratory of directed regulation of intermicrobial interactions in exo- and endomicroecological systems, biomedical Biomodeling Center, scientific laboratory "Cariology", scientific society of young scientists and Students, Center for Clinical Research, Center for Quality Management System Assurance, Department for admission and career guidance, Department of highly qualified personnel Training, Center for Practical Training and Employment of Graduates, Representative Office of the University in the Republic of Mari El, psychological counseling service, physical culture and sports club, University History Museum.

In the 2023-2024 academic year, 42 students were enrolled to the 31.05.03 Dentistry program (specialist's degree, intramural form of study) at the expense of the federal budget. The average USE score of students enrolled in 2023 is 78.0.

Students. The number of students on 01.09.2023 for bachelor's and specialist's degree programs, specialty – 2911 people, including 227 people studying at the program 31.05.03 Dentistry (specialist's degree), 14 people at the programs of training highly qualified personnel: residents – 12, graduate students – 2.

Kirov State Medical University provides training in higher education programs for all regions of the Russian Federation, countries of the near and far abroad.

DESCRIPTION OF THE VISIT OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION

The visit of the external expert commission (hereinafter referred to as the Commission, the EEC) to the Kirov State Medical University was organized and conducted from December 05 to December 07, 2023 in accordance with the Program approved by the director of "IAAR" Zhumagulova A.B. and coordinated with the rector of Kirov State Medical University L.M. Zheleznov.

The preliminary meeting was held online on December 01, 2023, which was attended by all members of the EEC.

During the visit, the VEC studied regulatory, educational and methodological documents for the accredited university, educational and methodological materials of disciplines, methodological

documents, visited the structural units and departments stated in the Program that ensure the implementation of the educational process, and also checked the operation of information systems used by the Kirov State Medical University for online classes.

All materials requested by the Commission were provided by representatives of the University in a timely manner. In order to obtain objective information on the assessment of the activities of the Kirov State Medical University, the members of the EEC carried out: visual inspection of classrooms, laboratories, libraries, clinical facilities and the University Clinic and other premises providing practical lessons; observation, interviewing employees of various structural units, teachers, employers, surveys of the teaching staff (academic personnel) and students.

Kirov State Medical University ensured the presence of all employees and persons specified in the Visit Program. The three-day Program for conducting the EEC program accreditation has been completed in full, in accordance with the distribution of activities by day.

On the first day, December 05, 2023, a preliminary meeting of the Chairman and members of the EEC took place, during which the goals, program, and responsibilities of the EEC members were announced.

The EEC members discussed key issues, identified additional information that should be requested from the structural units of Kirov State Medical University for validation and confirmation of the reliability of information/data during accreditation.

The meeting with the rector of Kirov State Medical University L.M. Zheleznov took place according to the program, an oral presentation on the current activities of Kirov State Medical University was presented. A meeting was held with the vice-rectors of Kirov State Medical University (Kasatkin E.N. – Vice-rector for Academic Affairs; Razin M.P. - Vice-rector for Scientific, innovative work and relations with practical healthcare; Klimovich V.V. - Vice-rector for facilities and premises of the University; Yelsukova E.P. - Vice-rector for educational and social work; Mokrushin A.N. – Vice-Rector for Digital Development).

A meeting was held with the heads of structural units of Kirov State Medical University (Makhneva S.Y. – Chief accountant; Sitnikov S.V. – Director of the Institute of Continuing Additional Education; Mokrushin A.N. – director of the Information and Computing center; Vershinin A.V. - director of the Clinic; Ermolin D.S. – director of the Multiprofile Accreditation and Simulation Center; Petrova N.N. – Head of the library; Yelsukova N.P. – Acting Head of the Information and Youth Policy Department; Kandakova E.A. – Acting Head of the Financial and Economic Department; Dunaeva E.B. – Head of the Science and Innovation Department; Kalinina S.N. – Head of the Documentation Support Department; Mamaev E.S. – Head of the Information Technology Department in Education; Molchanova E.P. – Head of the Personnel Department; Vidyakina E.V. – Head of the Admission and Career Guidance Department; Kokovikhina I.A. – Head of the Department for Training of highly qualified personnel; Sharapova E.V. – Head of the Department of International Relations; Perminov A.A. – Head of the Department of Facility Services Support; Semeno N.S. – Head of the Educational and Methodological Department; Vychezhzhanin V.A. - Chairman of the Students' Union; Novoselova T.S. – Chairman of the Student Council; Shibanova K.S. – Head of the Procurement Office; Bandur E.A. – Head of the Center for Ensuring the Quality Management system).

An interview was held with the Deans of the Faculties (head of EP 31.05.01 "General Medicine" – E.M. Iutinsky – Dean of the Faculty of Medicine; head of EP 31.05.03 "Dentistry" – S.N. Gromova – Dean of the Faculty of Dentistry; head of EP 34.03.01 "Nursing" – L.N. Shmakova –Dean of the Faculty of Socio-Economics). Deans took an active part in the meeting with the EEC and highlighted the main directions of their activities in terms of organizing the educational process, developing, implementing and managing educational programs, working with students and teaching staff, interacting with the rector's office and other units of Kirov State Medical University.

Subsequently, a meeting was held with the heads of departments of basic and specialized disciplines.

During the interview with them, information was obtained about implementation of the

educational process at the departments, conditions that the University provides for their activities, answers were received to questions about the motivation and stimulation of teaching staff, admission and career growth, financial support for teaching staff and other aspects.

At a meeting with the teaching staff of the departments of Kirov SMU, in particular with representatives of basic biomedical sciences, behavioral and social sciences, medical ethics, medical jurisprudence, clinical and professional disciplines, the EEC experts asked questions about the implementation of educational, scientific and clinical processes at Kirov SMU, career opportunities, stimulating teaching staff, providing the educational process with the necessary resources (material and technical, information, etc.), interaction with administrative and management structures. Then the teaching staff took part in the survey.

During a visual inspection of the material and technical equipment of the Kirov State Medical University, the EEC experts visited the University's own clinic, the University's MAS center.

The members of the EEC visited the practice facilities of accredited programs and during a visual inspection, the members of the EEC got acquainted with the state of the material and technical bases of clinical departments: Clinic of the Kirov State Medical University (consulting and diagnostic department, including the facility of practical training in the specialty "Dentistry", Kirov, Volodarskogo str., 161); dental department of the polyclinic Private healthcare institution "Clinical Hospital "RZD-Medicine" of the city of Kirov", Oktyabrsky propekt, 151).

Consulting and Diagnostic Department of the Clinic provides primary health care, specialized medical care to adults and children on a planned basis, within the framework of the Program of state guarantees for providing citizens with free medical care. The structure is organized in such a way that full continuity in the patient's treatment is ensured: from the stage of diagnosis and treatment to rehabilitation, eliminating the need to seek additional help from other medical organizations.

The medical organization actively participates in testing methods of prevention, diagnosis, treatment and rehabilitation, carries out practical application of developed and previously unused methods in the provision of medical care to confirm evidence of their effectiveness.

Dental facilities of the Clinic are represented by modern dental equipment: dental installations, equipment for precision endodontics, prosthetics on dental implants, clinical studies of means of prevention of dental diseases are underway.

Students of the specialty "Dentistry" conduct independent admission of patients with dental diseases, have the opportunity to be present and assist during surgical interventions, management of patients with combined dental pathology. During the training, students also get acquainted with the basics of working in electronic health systems.

05.12.2023. during the day, experts held a discussion and exchange of views, a policy was developed and a range of issues was determined to obtain the necessary information.

On 06.12.2023, the experts of the EEC met with students of the Kirov State Medical University. The meeting was held in the form of an interview, the issues of student support at the University, the functioning of the student representation, the participation of students in the activities of the University, in the development of educational programs and other issues were revealed.

Later, the students took part in the survey. Visual inspection and attendance of classes were conducted at the departments of the Kirov State Medical University. The departments demonstrated classes with students of 2-5 years, methodological materials for students, lesson plan, control tools, literature for self-study. During the conversation, the students expressed their positive opinion about the educational process, about the activities of departments, clinics, departments, and the University as a whole. The EEC experts selectively visited the facilities of hospital-based practice for accredited EP of Kirov State Medical University.

A meeting with employers was held. There is evidence that the University closely cooperates with healthcare institutions, implements clinical training at clinical facilities, graduates work in these organizations, which is an important mechanism for attracting young personnel to work in

the healthcare system, employers participate in the formation of an educational program partly by familiarizing them.

A total of 237 representatives of the Kirov State Medical University took part in face-to-face meetings (Table 1).

Table 1 – Information about employees and students who took part in meetings with the EEC:

Category of participants	Number
Rector	1
Vice rectors	5
Heads of structural units	21
Deans of faculties	3
Heads of departments	25
Teachers	67
Students	90
Graduates	15
Employers	10
Bcero	237

113 representatives of teaching staff and 319 students took part in the survey, including: 259 (81.2%) students of the EP "General Medicine", 22 (6.9%) students of the EP "Dentistry", 38 (11.9%) students of the EP "Nursing".

Based on the results of the survey: 100% of teaching staff are satisfied with the level of attention that the management of the educational institution pays to the content of the educational program; 98.2% of teaching staff are satisfied with the availability of necessary scientific and educational literature in the library for teachers, 99.1% – openness and accessibility of management for teaching staff, 76.1% – involvement of teaching staff in the process of making managerial and strategic decisions, 96.5% – equal opportunities for all teaching staff. The results of the student survey showed that students are completely satisfied with the level of accessibility of the dean's office in 64.3% of cases, the availability of academic counseling – in 52.0% of cases, the availability of counseling on personal problems – in 48.3%, the level of accessibility of library resources – 64.6%, the overall quality of educational programs – in 50.8%, teaching methods in general – 49.2%

During the three days of the VEC's work, also after the end of all interviews and visits, the experts discussed the university's indicators for their compliance with the parameters of program accreditation, and developed recommendations.

On 07.12.2023, upon completion of the work, the experts of the VEC met with the management and responsible persons of the university, shared their impressions and familiarized them with the recommendations developed based on the results of the work carried out.

COMPLIANCE WITH STANDARDS OF PROGRAMM ACCREDITATION

6.1. Standard "Mission and Outcomes"

The evidentiary part

The University's Mission is closely linked to the regional component, in particular the presence of a well-developed medical and cosmetic industry in the region. To implement the global Mission, priority directions for the development of the University have been identified, as set out in the University Development Program for 2021-2030 (adopted by the Academic Council of the Kirov State Medical University, Protocol № 10 dated 25.12.2020; with amendments and additions, Protocol № 11 dated 23.12.2022). Kirov State Medical University declares the generation,

dissemination, application and preservation of advanced knowledge in the interests of the practical healthcare sector, in the development of medical science, and in the development of competition among university graduates.

The mission of the MPEDP "Dentistry" was approved by the Academic Council of the University, which includes teachers, students and employers.

The mission of MPEDP "Dentistry" is to conceptually substantiate and model the conditions for the training of highly professional modern specialists who are able to effectively, using fundamental theoretical knowledge and innovative technologies, carry out medical activities in the field of dentistry: preventive, pediatric, therapeutic, surgical and orthopedic, treatment of various categories of the population: children, adults and the elderly.

Proper standards of student behavior are regulated by the Code of Ethics for Students of Medicine and Pharmacy.

The MPEDP "Dentistry" is developed by teachers of departments, as well as a working group including the head of the educational program, members of the Academic Council of the Faculty of Dentistry, methodological commissions with the involvement of practical health workers and students, coordinated by the University and approved by the decision of the Academic Council of the University.

When developing the MPEDP, the Faculty has sufficient independence in choosing the number of biomedical, behavioral, and clinical disciplines, including elective disciplines (elective disciplines), and types of practices, i.e. maximizing their compliance with national and international requirements.

Students participate in scientific research within the framework of student scientific circles. The achieved results are presented in the portfolio of students posted on the university's website.

To organize the educational process in clinical disciplines, the capabilities of the MAS-center are used, which provides simulation training for students of the MPEDP "Dentistry" to practice practical skills of basic cardiopulmonary resuscitation, emergency and emergency medical care, the formation of clinical skills based on situation modeling, which allows students to obtain the right basic safety skills for patients, while reducing the risks of providing medical care in the future. On the basis of the Department of Dentistry, there are phantoms for the use of dental manipulations, technologies for controlling the correctness of tooth preparation, tooth extraction, injection, etc.

The competencies of University graduates who have successfully completed their training in MPEDP and passed the primary accreditation procedure allow them to find a job in accordance with the order of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Russian Federation "On approval of qualification requirements for medical and pharmaceutical workers with higher education in the field of training "Healthcare and medical sciences" and the professional standard.

As a result of mastering the specialty programs, graduates should have universal, general professional and professional competencies of the Federal State Educational Standard for Higher Education.

In 2023, at the ICE of Kirov State Medical University, at the expense of federal budget allocations for 2023, training was conducted on 23 additional professional training programs in the field of "Healthcare", 38 additional professional training programs and 5 additional professional retraining programs for specialists were implemented. The main forms of education are full-time on-the-job, part-time and part-time, including the use of distance learning technologies.

The assessment of the final results of the development of the MPEDP in the form of the formation of all competencies fixed in the educational program is carried out at the State final certification of graduates. According to the results of the SFE, the commission, in addition to making decisions on the assignment of appropriate qualifications, forms a report in which it reflects its opinion on the level of training of students, the main shortcomings in their training. These data are reported and analyzed at the Academic Council, where an action plan is adopted to eliminate the comments of the chairmen of the SEB in the relevant specialty. The data of the results of the SFE MPEDP "Dentistry" are annually reported and analyzed by the Academic Council of

the faculty (the last review is Protocol №7 dated 29.08.2023). This assessment is a direct feedback for Kirov State Medical University on the formation of clinical competencies among its graduates.

In order to study the needs and expectations of consumers of educational services of Kirov State Medical University and all interested parties, improve the quality of education within the framework of the quality management system, internal independent assessment of the quality of education, questionnaires have been developed and students, teachers, employers and graduates are being surveyed (sociological research). The results are discussed at meetings of the Academic Council of Kirov State Medical University and used to improve the curriculum and educational program as a whole.

The involvement of stakeholders in the process of improving the formulation of the Mission and goals takes place during the discussion of health and medical education issues at meetings.

When forming the MPEDP development plan, transparency of processes was noted, while information about the content of the MPEDP is communicated to interested parties.

MPEDP specialties are publicly discussed with representatives of all interested parties, taking into account the identified shortcomings, comments and suggestions, correct and introduce amendments.

The Kirov State Medical University maintains the procedure for approval, periodic review (revision) and monitoring of educational programs and documents regulating this process. All processes regulating the implementation of the OP are documented. Each employee knows their responsibilities, functions and rights.

The Analytical Part

EEC experts note that within the framework of the "Mission and Results" standard for accredited specialties of the Kirov State Medical University, during the work of the expert commission and the analysis of the submitted documentation, compliance with the requirements of the standard was revealed. Stakeholders participated in the development and approval of the Mission: teaching staff, students, representatives of the practical sphere, employers. At the same time, it should be noted that after the formation of the Mission of the MPEDP "Dentistry", its provisions were insufficiently brought to the attention of wide circles of the health sector.

The analysis of the compliance of the activities of Kirov State Medical University and faculties with the criteria of this standard indicates the presence of a Development Strategy in Kirov State Medical University that corresponds to the mission and vision of the university. The management carries out a number of activities on target indicators of areas of activity, monitoring and improvement measures. The members of the EEC note that the Mission of the MPEDP "Dentistry" is brought to the attention of interested parties by e-mail distribution to all departments of the Kirov State Medical University, teaching staff, students, by posting on information stands. However, the EEC experts note that during interviews with faculty, students, employers and graduates, the mission and vision were not fully interpreted.

The accredited MPEDP is designed on the basis of the Mission and taking into account the requirements of the Federal State Educational Standard, and allows preparing competent doctors capable of the following types of professional activities: medical, organizational and managerial, research. This allows graduates of the MPEDP to choose career paths.

When a graduate is oriented to a medical type of professional activity, he has the opportunity, after receiving a certificate, to find a job in medical institutions as a doctor or to continue his studies in residency, to carry out research activities in the process of studying under postgraduate programs.

The main stakeholders in the formulation of the mission and learning outcomes are teaching staff, students, representatives of health authorities (Ministry of Health of the Kirov region) and employers (chief physicians, heads of structural divisions of medical organizations). The formulation of the mission and expected results of the educational program is the main content of the activity of the teaching staff. Students are attracted through student public organizations (student council, trade union committee of students). Representatives of the health authorities (Ministry of Healthcare of the Kirov region) and employers (chief physicians, heads of structural

divisions of medical organizations) take part in discussions at regular meetings with the Minister of Healthcare, deputy Ministers).

The main stakeholders in the formulation of the mission and learning outcomes are teaching staff, students, representatives of health authorities (Ministry of Healthcare of the Kirov region) and employers (chief physicians, heads of structural divisions of medical organizations). The formulation of the mission and expected results of the educational program is the main content of the activity of the teaching staff. Students are attracted through student public organizations (student council, union committee of students). Representatives of the health authorities (Ministry of Healthcare of the Kirov region) and employers (chief physicians, heads of structural divisions of medical organizations) take part in discussions at regular meetings with the Minister of Healthcare, deputy Ministers).

At the same time, the members of the EEC note some shortcomings, students and employers found it difficult to clearly reproduce the mission of the MPEDP during interviews with members of the EEC and give specific examples of what exactly their personal participation in the development of the Mission and vision of the Kirov SMU and MPEDP was. During the visit and the interview, the members of the EEC did not receive a complete and detailed idea of exactly what events were held at the Kirov State Medical University in order to discuss the Mission and final results of the MPEDP "Dentistry".

The available material resources are used responsibly, in order to adequately implement the fulfillment of the designated Mission and goals of the MPEDP.

The members of the EEC note that great importance is attached to the formation of proper behavior among students in relation to colleagues, teachers, administration, patients and their relatives.

According to the "Mission and Outcomes" standard, we would like to note that the success of the implementation of the MPEDP is determined mainly on the basis of a systematic, purposeful and effective implementation of the MPEDP development plan, which, accordingly, should be the most transparent and accessible to all interested parties.

The MPEDP is constantly being developed and adjusted taking into account the needs of interested persons and students. When developing the MPEDP, they comply with national development priorities and the university's development strategy.

Satisfactory ratings were given by the EEC members on those items that formally meet the standard but require increased attention while meeting the criteria of the standards.

Strengths/best practices

According to this standard, no strengths have been identified.

Recommendations of the EEC

1. The University management needs to more consistently bring to the attention of interested parties: faculty, students, and the health sector information about the procedure for developing and making changes to the University's Mission. The deadline is until 01.09.2024.

2. The management of the University, the head of the MPEDP "Dentistry" is recommended to ensure the participation of key stakeholders in the formulation of the Mission and expected learning outcomes. The deadline is until 01.09.2024.

3. The management of the University, the head of the MPEDP "Dentistry" is recommended to ensure that the stated Mission and expected learning outcomes are based on the opinions/suggestions of other stakeholders, primarily students and employers. The deadline is until 01.09.2024.

The conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:

- ***Strengths – 0***
- ***Satisfactory – 10***
- ***requires improvements – 3***

• *Unsatisfactory – 0*

6.2 Standard “Educational program”

The evidentiary part

Educational process in the specialty 31.05.03 "Dentistry" is carried out on the basis of the Federal State Educational Standard approved by Order No. 984 of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation dated August 12, 2020 and the professional standard "Dentist", taking into account the needs of the regional labor market, the requirements of federal executive authorities and relevant industry requirements. EP "Dentistry" was approved by the Academic Council of the University on 28.05.2021, Record No. 5, and approved by the rector on 31.05.2021. The duration of the EP "Dentistry" is 5 years.

The content of the EP "Dentistry" describes general characteristics of the specialty 31.05.03 Dentistry: the purpose and objectives of the EP; the standard period for mastering the EP (5 years); the complexity and structure of the EP; the amount of contact work; qualifications assigned to graduates ("Dentist"); requirements for the applicant (availability of an appropriate level of education, confirmed by a document on secondary general education or a document on secondary vocational education, or a document on higher education and qualifications) and the language of educational activity (the state language of the Russian Federation or a foreign language in accordance with the charter of the Kirov State Medical University).

The total volume of the EP is 300 credit units (c.u.). The structure of the EP corresponds to the Federal State Educational Standard for the specialty 31.05.03 Dentistry and consists of three blocks. Block 1 is represented by the disciplines of the mandatory part (a total of 252 c.u.) and the disciplines of the part formed by private individuals of educational relations (18 units). Block 2 includes practices (27 c.u.). Block 3 is the state final certification (3 c.u.).

In 2020, in order to prepare the EP in the process of transition to training according to the Federal State Educational Standard for the specialty 31.05.03 Dentistry (order of the Ministry of Education and Science dated August 12, 2020 No. 984), the main provisions of the EP were discussed at meetings of specialized methodological commissions, EMB. Then the OP was approved by the EMB of the University (Record No. 6 dated 20.05.2021) and approved by the decision of the Academic Council of the Kirov State Medical University (Protocol No. 5 dated 28.05.2021). The development and control of the implementation of the OP is carried out by the staff of the Dean's Office of the Faculty of Dentistry and the University's ASO. The latest adjustments to the EP were made in connection with the implementation in the Russian Federation of the National Project "Healthcare", the state program of the Kirov region "Development of healthcare" for 2020-2024.

The development of the EP is carried out using traditional and modular learning systems. The traditional system, which implies simultaneous and sequential study of several subjects (up to 10 per year), is used to study biomedical disciplines in junior courses (1-2). The modular system, which allows you to consistently study disciplines in the form of cycles following each other during the semester, is used in the form of cyclic classes in senior courses (3-5). The "immersion method" in one subject contributes to a deeper and better mastery of competencies. The EP model is integrated, allowing to ensure the relationship between fundamental and clinical sciences, which is important for the formation of students' motivation and interest in the studied basic biomedical disciplines through the prism of applying the acquired knowledge to solving a specific clinical problem. Integrated training helps future doctors to collect facts into a single chain in order to get a complete picture of the clinical situation and develop a holistic approach to the treatment of each individual patient.

The concentric approach to building the EP (repeated mastering of one competence in different disciplines) contributes to a better and in-depth mastery of competencies.

The total volume of the EP "Dentistry" (curricula 2023) contains 300 credits (c.u.). The volume of contact work is 62.74% of the total amount of time allocated to the implementation of disciplines.

The educational technologies and methods of teaching are presented in the working programs of disciplines and practices. During practical training, the following educational technologies are used: educational video, solving situational problems, business and role-playing educational game, analysis

of clinical cases, brainstorming method, small group method, case method, round tables, discussions, duty in the departments of the medical base, preparation of medical history, portfolio, work on training simulators, etc. In the study of disciplines aimed at the formation of competencies, including research activities. Stimulation and formation of students' responsibility for the process and its results is carried out using such methods as: conducting educational admission of patients under the supervision of a teacher; participation in intra-university, all-Russian and international Olympiads in dentistry; practicing practical skills on phantoms; using point-rating assessment of student academic performance.

The Dean's office of the relevant faculty and the Academic Services Office of Kirov State Medical University carry out the development and control of the implementation of educational programs.

The content of elective disciplines is determined by specialized departments based on the existing topical problems of medicine and healthcare. The scope and content of practical training of students and the forms of its control are defined in the Federal State Educational Standard and curricula. Kirov State Medical University provides students with the opportunity to choose and master elective subjects in the 4th and 5th courses.

The development, approval and implementation of the EP is carried out in accordance with external and internal organizational, legal, regulatory, administrative and methodological documents, such as the Procedure for the development and approval of educational programs of higher education, the Regulation on the work program of the discipline (module) of the main professional educational program, the Regulation on the practice program, the Procedure for conducting ongoing monitoring of academic performance and intermediate certification of students, Regulations on the system of assessment of the quality of educational activities and training of students, The procedure for the participation of a student of the Kirov State Medical University of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation in the formation of the content of their professional education, etc. In accordance with the principles of quality management of education, changes are being made to the quality management system.

The EP management mechanism implemented at the Kirov State Medical University is effective and allows for prompt adjustments (Record No. 1 of meeting of the Educational and Methodological Board meeting dated 17.09.2020 "The main directions of educational and methodological work of Kirov SMU for the 2020-2021 academic year", where the transition to the implementation of educational programs of higher education under the Federal State Educational Standard 3++ was discussed).

The departments determine the modernity and relevance of the material on the subjects taught, make changes and additions to the curricula, which are approved by the Central Methodological Council, the Academic Council of the University and reflected in the curricula.

Training on accredited educational programs is carried out in accordance with the curricula approved by the Academic Council of Kirov State Medical University.

When studying disciplines aimed at the formation of competencies, including research activities, students' research work is widely used (compiling an information review of literature on the proposed topic, preparing an abstract, preparing an essay, a report, writing a term paper, preparing educational schemes, tables), student's educational and research work, work in the hospital archive. Also, trainings, master classes of experts and specialists in practical healthcare, visits to medical conferences and consultations, participation in scientific and practical conferences, meetings with representatives of Russian and foreign companies, government and public organizations are widely used.

One of the forms of independent work is the formation of a student's portfolio. According to the Regulation on EIOS, in the personal account, which the student receives access to from the moment of admission to Kirov State Medical University, formation of an "Electronic Student Portfolio" is available, including preservation of the student's works, reviews and evaluations of these works by any participants in the educational process. Formation of the portfolio develops students' ability to analyze and evaluate the process of their own development.

The EP "Dentistry" provides for multiple formation of one competence in various disciplines. Learning outcomes (competence formation) are evaluated continuously throughout the

learning process. In accordance with the "Procedure for conducting ongoing monitoring of academic performance and intermediate certification of students at Kirov State Medical University", assessment of quality of mastering the educational program is carried out using ongoing monitoring of academic performance, intermediate certification of students and state final certification of graduates.

Kirov State Medical University has introduced a system of point-rating assessment (PRA) of student academic performance. The main objectives of the PRA are: to increase the motivation of students to master educational programs; to activate (stimulate) the daily and systematic work of students; to increase the effectiveness of regular independent work of students; to reduce the role of randomness and to ensure a more accurate and objective assessment of the level of knowledge and practical training of students during intermediate certification.

Scientific research by students is carried out under the guidance of teaching staff as part of the work of the Student Scientific Society. As of 01.12.2023, 196 students studying in the specialty Dentistry are engaged in research work in the Society.

Students are actively involved in the research work of the University. The research results are being implemented in the educational process at the university departments. The structure of lectures and practical classes includes information on the results of research carried out within the framework of dissertations.

To support students who take an active part in research, various support measures are used, including: the appointment of an increased state academic scholarship, the transfer from a paid to a budget form of education, financing trips of students to participate in scientific events at the expense of the university.

The EP "Dentistry" includes disciplines of simulation training focused on the problems of ethics and doctor-patient contact and clinical disciplines aimed at preparing for the initial accreditation of specialists, which establishes the compliance of knowledge, skills and abilities of the accredited with the requirements of the standard, which allows a university graduate after completing the 5th year of admission to professional activity.

Kirov State Medical University has a unit responsible for organizing both direct postgraduate education (residency) and continuing medical education (additional professional programs) – the Institute of Continuing Additional Education. One of the tasks of the department is constant interaction with the regional administration and practical healthcare in order to assess the need for specialists in certain specialties.

The staff schedule of Kirov State Medical University includes the position of vice-rector for scientific, innovative work and connections with practical healthcare, director of the Institute of Continuing Additional Education, who organize and supervise work in these areas. This allows the teaching staff to provide a link between basic medical education and the subsequent stage of professional training of a specialist.

The analytical part

During the visit, the Members of the EEC conducted a detailed analysis of the accredited EP in the specialty "Dentistry" for compliance with the requirements of the modern education market, principles and methods of organizing educational, research and educational processes aimed at satisfying the interests of students and all participants in the educational process of the EP.

EP is implemented in accordance with the principles of equality (there is no discrimination based on gender, age, presence/absence of health limitations, religion, culture, nationality, citizenship, etc.), which is confirmed during interviews and when attending classes at departments.

An example of vertical integration is the fact that the possibility of effective and successful study of the above disciplines is determined by a number of basic, as well as behavioral, social, legal and specialized disciplines previously studied by students: "Life Safety", "Physics, Mathematics" (1st year), "General and bioorganic Chemistry" (1st year), "Biological chemistry – biochemistry of the oral cavity" (1st, 2nd courses), "Normal physiology – Maxillofacial Physiology" (1st, 2nd courses), "Bioethics" (3rd year), "Psychology and Pedagogy" (2nd year), "Psychology of communication and conflict in the professional activity of a dentist" (2nd year),

"Jurisprudence" (2nd year). At the first lectures and practical classes in the specialized discipline "Hygiene" (3rd year), students are required to use previously acquired knowledge, skills and abilities in the field of sanitary and hygienic studies of environmental objects and their impact on human health using physical, chemical, and functional methods. Thus, the above-mentioned "bundle" of various academic disciplines, applied and correctly constructed in the curriculum, ensures the most effective study of more complex specialized disciplines in senior courses. The University determines the content and scope of academic disciplines.

When conducting interviews with the administrative and managerial staff of the University, teaching staff, students, it was revealed that teaching and learning methods based on the modern theory of adult education are not actively used in the educational process: TBL, CBL, RBL. Despite the fact that modern teaching methods are used in the study of the disciplines of the EP "Dentistry", such as: trainings, master classes of experts and specialists in practical healthcare, visits to medical conferences and consultations, participation in scientific and practical conferences, meetings with representatives of Russian and foreign companies, government and public organizations, it is necessary to strengthen the use of teaching and learning methods that stimulate, prepare and support students to take responsibility for the learning process, in particular – project method that is useful in solving research and practice-oriented tasks.

The content of the working programs of the disciplines is updated annually in accordance with the latest achievements and changes in the discipline being studied. Work programs are discussed and approved at the meetings of the department. The participants in the discussion are the head of the department and the entire teaching staff, who make proposals for changing and supplementing work programs.

To improve the effectiveness of the development, evaluation and revision of the EP, it is necessary to create a structure/committee responsible for the EP and introduction of innovations.

A set of basic characteristics of education (volume, content, planned results) and organizational and pedagogical conditions, which is presented in the form of a curriculum, a calendar curriculum, work programs of academic subjects, courses, disciplines (modules), evaluation and methodological materials, a work program of education, a calendar plan of educational work, forms of certification. All the above documents are publicly available on the official website of the University.

Teachers of the clinical departments of Kirov State Medical University work at clinical bases and in medical institutions, which ensures a close relationship between the EP and the field of practical healthcare and the participation of students in the work of a team of specialists in providing various types of medical care. The members of the EEC noted that practitioners are actively involved in the education of students. The quality of training of specialists and their professional competencies is confirmed by the characteristics and feedback from the heads of medical institutions and employers.

Students have the opportunity to choose from various elective subjects. The choice of disciplines is carried out by students on their own voluntarily, taking into account individual educational needs. Registration for elective and elective subjects is carried out by making an application and submitting it to the dean's office. Based on the applications received, the dean's office forms lists of groups for the selected disciplines. Students have the right to make changes to the list of elective subjects for the next academic year.

When visiting the bases of hospital-based practice in the specialty "Dentistry", it was noted that students receive briefings on occupational safety and health. The completion of the briefings was confirmed by the students during the interview.

Strengths/best practices not detected.

According to this standard, no strengths have been identified.

Recommendations of the EEC

1. The head of the EP "Dentistry" is required to strengthen the use of teaching and learning methods that stimulate, prepare and support students to take responsibility for the learning process. The deadline is 01.09.2025.

2. The University administration is required to create a structure/committee responsible for the development and implementation of innovations in order to improve the effectiveness of the development, evaluation and revision of the OP. The deadline is 01.09.2025.

3. The administration of the University, the head of the EP "Dentistry" are recommended to ensure the representation of teaching staff, students, representatives from other interested parties, including representatives from clinical, industrial bases, University graduates, healthcare professionals involved in the learning process in the University committee responsible for the EP. The deadline is 01.09.2024.

The conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:

- ***Strengths – 0***
- ***Satisfactory – 25***
- ***Requires improvements – 3***
- ***Unsatisfactory – 0***

6.3. Standard "Assessment of students"***The evidentiary part***

According to the educational program "Dentistry", the procedure for evaluating learning outcomes and their forms are regulated in accordance with external and internal regulatory legal acts.

Students can familiarize themselves with local regulations on the website of Kirov State Medical University. In addition, in order to inform students about the methods of teaching and assessment, the methodological guidelines for students for practical classes present assessment materials, types of contact and individual work, forms of knowledge control.

The assessment of students' knowledge, skills and abilities takes place at the following levels: current assessment in practical and final classes; midterm assessment – exams and tests upon completion of the study of disciplines and practical training, state final examination.

The principles and methods of assessing students' knowledge in exams and tests are established by the Procedure for Conducting Ongoing Monitoring of Academic Performance and Midterm Assessment of Students at Kirov State Medical University of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Russian Federation. The procedure defines the requirements for monitoring current academic performance and midterm assessment, as well as the procedure for eliminating academic debt for higher education programs at the University. The quality of mastering the educational programs of higher education at the University is assessed by carrying out ongoing monitoring of academic performance and midterm assessment of students. Current monitoring of academic performance and midterm assessment are forms of checking the progress of the curriculum, the learning process, the results of students' assimilation of educational material and the formation of competencies, as well as correlating the results obtained with the requirements established by the Federal State Educational Standard for the specialty "Dentistry".

The current monitoring of students' academic performance provides an assessment of the progress of mastering disciplines (modules) and practical training and is carried out to determine the level of training of students and their assimilation of educational material on individual topics (sections) of disciplines (modules), practical skills and abilities provided by the practice programs. The forms of current control at the University include: a conversation on the topic of the lesson, testing, solving situational problems, a colloquium, evaluating the performance of laboratory work, evaluating the writing of educational case histories, checking the level of mastery of practical skills, on thematic patients or on phantoms in the MAC-centre.

Assessment sheets developed by University staff and taken from the database of the Federal Methodological Center for Accreditation of Specialists are used to assess practical skills in simulated conditions (OSCE).

The midterm assessment is carried out using the evaluation tools presented in the work program of the discipline. Evaluation tools for midterm assessment are subject to internal examination and are approved by the Academic Council of the faculty and the central Methodological Council. The results of the current monitoring of academic performance in disciplines (modules) are evaluated according to a four-point system – “excellent”, “good”, “satisfactory”, “unsatisfactory”, or according to a point-rating system implemented at the department and approved by the Educational and Methodological Board.

Midterm assessment of students ensures the assessment of intermediate and final learning outcomes in disciplines (modules), practical training and is carried out in accordance with the curricula of educational programs in the form of exams, assessment tests and credits in academic disciplines (modules), based on the results of practice. Exams and tests are the final stage of studying the entire discipline or part of it and are aimed at testing students' knowledge on theoretical issues, testing the ability to analyse and synthesise the knowledge gained and apply it to solve practical problems, checking the acquired skills of individual work, the degree of development of creative thinking. In accordance with the Federal State Educational Standard, exams and tests are aimed at checking and evaluating knowledge, skills, and (or) work experience that characterise the stages of competence formation in the process of mastering an educational program. The credit based on the results of the practical training serves as a form of verification of professional skills development and experience of professional activity provided for by the practical training programs.

Midterm assessment in the form of an exam or a test in a discipline (module) includes three mandatory stages: 1) checking the level of mastering practical skills; 2) computer or paper testing; 3) an interview.

The form and (or) stages of the practice test are determined by the work programs of the practices.

The results of checking the level of mastering practical skills and testing on a computer or paper have a qualitative assessment of “credited” and “not counted”. Grades “credited” based on the results of checking the level of mastering practical skills and testing are the basis for admission of students to an interview. The minimum number of points for obtaining an assessment “credited” for the test stage of the midterm assessment and the criteria for evaluating the development of practical skills are established by the department and are reflected in appendix B to the work program for the discipline (module).

Checking the level of mastery of practical skills and skills formed in practical classes is carried out at the final practical skills classes, on thematic patients or on phantoms in the MAC-centre, simulation training bases of the Department of Dentistry. Simulation dental training bases allow implementing a practice-oriented approach to medical education, training and development of medical care skills using simulation educational technologies. Assessment sheets taken from the database of the Federal Methodological Center for Accreditation of Specialists are used to assess practical skills in simulated conditions (OSCE).

The interview is conducted on problems and cases in the examination cards. The result of the interview during the midterm assessment in the form of an exam or a credit with an assessment is determined by the grades “excellent”, “good”, “satisfactory”, “unsatisfactory”, during the midterm assessment in the form of a credit – the grades “credited”, “not credited”. Indicators and criteria for evaluating the results of the interview are established by the department and are reflected in appendix B to the work program for the discipline (module), practical training.

The results of the tests are entered by the teachers in the student's academic record and in the student's record book with a grade of “credited” or “not credited”.

Exams are taken during examination sessions according to a schedule composed in accordance with the curricula and academic schedules approved by the order of the Rector for the midterm assessment at the University.

A student who has successfully passed the midterm assessment in all disciplines of the curriculum is admitted to the State Final Examination. The criteria for assessing the formation of competencies in the state exam are set out in the program of state Final Examination.

The University uses a procedure for evaluating the validity of all methods used for both current and midterm and final control – interview questions, professionally oriented cases, tests. Thus, the procedure for determining the validity of the content and the validity of the conformity of assessment methods is carried out in several stages: at department meeting, then during discussion at the methodological commission on the profile of the discipline. The validity of the test tasks is also checked in stages: the complexity of each test task is monitored, its ability to distinguish test subjects with different levels of knowledge first by group, then by course and by year, considering the representativeness of the sample and the normality of the distribution. All information on the assessment of the validity of tests is accumulated in the Information and Computing Center of the University and is available for analysis by the dean's office and departments after each examination session.

The results of the current and midterm certification are reflected in the attendance records for the discipline. The results of the semi-annual midterm certifications are made in the form of electronic summary tables, analysed and discussed at the Academic Council of the faculty and the University. To assess achievements, each student forms a personal portfolio during the entire period of study at the University.

A point-rating system was developed and is being used, which students are familiar with. At the same time, as part of interviews with teachers and students, it was noted that Kirov State Medical University does not have an automated rating calculation system and electronic journals through which students could learn about their academic achievements.

To ensure transparency of the assessment results, exams (intermediate and State Final Examination) are conducted with the involvement of external examiners – representatives from medical organisations of the Kirov region by agreement. The participation of external experts ensures the transparency of the assessment and independence. External examiners (experts) are selected from among employers with at least 5 years of managerial experience in medical organizations.

The procedure for conducting the State Final Examination is regulated by the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation “On approval of the procedure for conducting the state final certification of educational programs of higher education - bachelor's degree programs, specialist's programs and master's degree programs” dated June 29, 2015 No. 636.

The University developed and put into effect by Order No. 445-ОД dated 30.08.2019 “Regulation on the quality assessment system of educational activities and training of students at Kirov State Medical University of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Russian Federation”, regulating issues of internal and external control of students' knowledge, as well as their practical clinical skills.

The existing system makes it possible to effectively regulate the educational process at the University, including the system of assessment of students' knowledge.

In case of disagreement with the final and midterm assessment, students have the right to submit an application to the appeal commission. The Commission, if there are doubts about the objectivity of the assessment, re-certifies the students.

The existing system of appealing students' grades is currently quite open, it is prescribed in the Procedure for conducting ongoing monitoring of academic performance and midterm certification of students. The appeals of students to the appeals commission are very rare.

The Appeal Commission, headed by the Chairman of the Appeals Commission, is created in each case by the order of the Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs. It includes the most experienced teachers of the interested department and related departments.

Kirov State Medical University regularly conducts surveys of students to assess their satisfaction with the organization of the educational process, learning outcomes, the quality of lectures, the quality of practical classes, the quality of the knowledge assessment system, the

provision of educational literature, the organization of practical training, the organization of extracurricular activities.

The results of such surveys are reported to the members of the Academic Council and the Rector's Office of the University, and are brought to the attention of the entire teaching staff. Surveys show that students are satisfied with both the organization of the educational process as a whole and its individual parts. The average scores are 4.42-4.55 out of 5.

There are categories on the University's website: "Frequently Asked Questions", "Citizens' Appeals", through which students can get comprehensive information on issues of interest to them or ask a question.

According to the results of the survey of students during the work of the Higher School of Economics, the objectivity of the assessment of knowledge, skills and other educational achievements – 45.8% and 38.6% of respondents; the objectivity and fairness of the teacher – 47.3% and 35.7%; the strategy of the educational program – 49.5% and 33.2%; conducted tests and exams 42% and 37.3% of respondents, respectively. 52.8% and 32.6% of respondents were fully and partially satisfied with the relationship between students and teachers; 54.2% and 32% of students were informed about courses and educational programs, respectively.

The analytical part

According to the standard, it should be noted that the assessment of educational achievements of students in accredited specialties is carried out in compliance with regulatory legal acts in the field of education of the Russian Federation. In the process of analysing the submitted documents, the results of interviewing teachers and students, it was revealed that there is evidence that the student assessment procedure is clearly defined and communicated to teachers and students.

When analysing student achievements, a point-rating system is used, which helps students take responsibility for their educational process. At the same time, students can get acquainted with the grades only in the paper journals of teachers, which limits their ability to evaluate their rating in real time.

The forms of student control are transparent and accessible to those who are interested in the educational program.

According to the results of the survey of students conducted during the visit of the External Expert Commission, 48.9% and 36.7% of respondents, respectively, fully agree and partially agree that the educational achievement assessment system (seminars, tests, questionnaires, etc.) reflects the content of the course. The evaluation criteria used by the teacher are fully and partially understood by 47% and 39.2% of the surveyed students, respectively. 45.8% and 38.6% of respondents fully and partially agree with the fact that teachers objectively assess students' achievements, respectively.

According to the External Expert Commission, little attention is paid to determining the validity and reliability of assessment methods in educational programs. Assessment methods based on criteria and reasoning and special examinations considering the specifics of medical education (direct and indirect observation of operational and communication skills, mini-clinical examination (MiniCex), workplace assessment, etc.) should be used.

The student knowledge assessment system is continuously studied by the heads of departments and is an open environment for using new methods in this activity. However, it is necessary to use a wider range of assessment methods and formats, depending on their "utility assessment", which includes a combination of validity, reliability, impact on learning, acceptability and effectiveness of assessment methods and formats, using modern software. Familiarisation with the examples of tasks in the test form for senior students revealed the predominance of tasks of a low cognitive level, the presence of defects made by the developers of tasks in the test form.

External Expert Commission notes that Kirov State Medical University should document and evaluate the reliability and validity of assessment methods, which requires the introduction of

appropriate software and an appropriate quality assurance process according to existing assessment practices.

External Expert Commission notes that Kirov State Medical University should guarantee the provision of timely, specific, constructive and fair feedback to students based on the results of formative and summative assessments, document the assessment process using appropriate assessment forms, and make wider use of a variety of models and ways to receive feedback.

Strengths/best practices

According to this standard, no strengths have been identified.

Recommendations of the External Expert Commission:

1. The head of the educational program is recommended to regularly use and document a wide range of methods for evaluating students' academic achievements and formats, depending on their “usefulness assessment”, which includes a combination of validity, reliability, impact on learning, acceptability and effectiveness of assessment methods and format. The deadline is 01.09.2025.

2. The university management is recommended to ensure the openness of the assessment procedure and its results: documenting the process of evaluating students' academic achievements through the introduction of an electronic journal, accessibility and openness of student's academic achievements to all participants in the educational process. The deadline is until 01.09.2024.

3. The head of the educational program is recommended to provide for the possibility of adjusting the number and nature of exams in order to encourage students to acquire knowledge and implement integrated learning methods – 31.01.2025

The conclusions of the External Expert Commission according to the criteria:

- strong positions – 0
- satisfactory -7
- requires improvement -3
- unsatisfactory – 0

6.4. Standard “Students”

Evidentiary part

In the University, there is an admission policy, including clearly established Regulations – the Rules of admission to the Federal State budgetary educational institution of higher education “Kirov State Medical University” of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Russian Federation for educational programs of higher education – bachelor's, specialist`s programs. Admission is carried out in accordance with the Rules of admission to the University, which are adopted at a meeting of the Academic Council of the University and approved by the order of the Rector of the University.

This regulation was developed in accordance with Federal Law No. 273-ФЗ dated December 29, 2012 “On Education in the Russian Federation”, Order No. 1076 of the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Russian Federation dated August 21, 2020 “On Approval of the procedure for admission to educational programs of higher education – bachelor's, specialist`s and master`s degree programs”, as well as other laws and regulations of authorised executive authorities in the field of education.

The Government of the Russian Federation, federal executive authorities, the Ministry of Higher Education and Science of the Russian Federation, the Ministry of Healthcare of the Russian Federation, as the founder of Kirov State Medical University of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Russian Federation, determine the volume of admission, primarily within the admission control figures, distribute a detailed quota of targeted admission, determine the requirements for the number of places and admission requirements, including a special quota, other special, preferential and special conditions, and a general competition. The list of applicants who are not subject to

entrance examinations is separately detailed.

The University establishes a list of entrance exams for admission to educational programs of higher education in accordance with the Order of the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Russian Federation dated 06.08.2021 No. 722 “On approval of the list of entrance exams for admission to educational programs of higher education – bachelor’s and specialist’s programs”, the minimum number of points in Kirov State Medical University for obtaining education in educational programs of higher education – bachelor’s, specialist’s and master’s degree programs for the 2023-2024 academic year are approved by the Ministry of Healthcare of the Russian Federation.

An admission commission is established for admission to the University in accordance with the Regulations on the Admission Commission. To select the most capable candidates at the University, the Ministry of Healthcare of the Russian Federation sets a minimum number of points confirming successful completion of the entrance exams. Applicants who do not score the minimum number of points are eliminated from the competition.

The admission plan to the University at the expense of the federal budget (admission control figures) is established by order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation on the basis of the results of an open public competition for the distribution of admission control figures for educational programs of higher education in accordance with the values of the indicators of the educational organisation.

The University has defined a policy and put into practice the admission of persons with disabilities and persons with limited health capacities in accordance with current legislation, which is also reflected in the Rules of Admission to the University and the Regulations on the Admission of persons with disabilities and limited health capacities to Kirov State Medical University of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Russian Federation. At least 10% of the places from the number of control figures are allocated annually for admission to training for the disabled and people with limited health capacities.

The University cooperates with the regional health authority (Ministry of Healthcare of the Kirov region). When planning budget places (for participation in an open public competition for the distribution of admission control figures for higher education programs), the University coordinates their number with the Ministry of Healthcare of the Kirov region. When planning the allocation of the employer-sponsored places, first of all, the needs of the region are considered, the Ministry of Healthcare of the Kirov region sends an application for the need for employer-sponsored places to the Ministry of Healthcare of the Russian Federation.

In 2023, admission to getting education in the educational program “General Medicine”, within the employer-sponsored quota, amounted to 35.7% of the total number of enrolled in the first year, and 83.3% of the total number of enrolled on a budgetary basis.

The University's cooperation with the Ministry of Healthcare of the Kirov region, the Ministry of Education of the Kirov region on the issue of planning budget places leads to the fact that the percentage of admission within the employer-sponsored quota tends to increase, which provides a guarantee of employment for citizens who have completed their studies in those regions and considering those specialists which make the demand of the population and meet the need for public health and society in general.

Admission to places with tuition fees (extra-budgetary) is carried out at places that are approved at a meeting of the Academic Council of the University. In the process of accepting documents and enrolling applicants for extra-budgetary places, the University can increase the number of extra-budgetary places. When making this decision, the University enrolls all applicants who scored at least the minimum number of points.

The University has a policy and implements the practice of transferring students from other medical educational institutions and other educational programs. The transfer is carried out in accordance with the “Procedure for transferring, expelling and readmitting students at Kirov State Medical University of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Russian Federation.”

The University selects the most qualified applicants for the educational process in accordance with their results of entrance exams, and also evaluates individual achievements and

awards points for: documents on education with honors, volunteering, participation and (or) results of participation in school olympiads and other intellectual and (or) creative competitions, physical education events. Information about the individual achievements to be considered is indicated in the Admission Rules, as well as in the List of individual achievements of applicants to be considered at admission, and the order of accounting for these achievements.

The University developed a system for filing and considering appeals against the admission commission for the admission of applicants, which is reflected in the Regulations on the Appeal Commission. During the entire period, there were no appeals against the results of the entrance exams from applicants.

The legislation prohibits regulating the admission of applicants considering their gender, ethnic origin, etc. Admission to the University is generally available to all categories of citizens, the only selection criterion is points for entrance exams.

The passing score for admission to Kirov State Medical University is consistently high and its value was 78.0 in 2023-2024. The competition for admission to study in the specialty "Dentistry" remains high from year to year, and it amounted to 14 people per place in 2023-2024.

The tuition fee is determined by the local regulations of the university, posted on the official website of Kirov State Medical University in the section "Paid educational services". The tuition fee is posted on the official website of the University.

The University accepts applicants' documents necessary for admission when submitting an application for consent to the processing of their personal data, which contains, among other things, consent to the processing of personal data allowed by the applicant for distribution (disclosure to an indefinite circle of persons), given in accordance with Article 10.1 of Federal Law No. 152-ФЗ dated 27.07.2006 "On personal data" (Collection of Legislation of the Russian Federation, 2006, No. 31, Article 3451; 2021, No. 1, Article 58).

According to the decision of the Admission Commission of the University, the applicant is awarded points for individual achievements in accordance with section V of the Admission Rules, the applicant submits documents confirming the receipt of the results of individual achievements.

Transparency, objectivity, maximum accessibility and detailed information for applicants are the main principles of the University's admission policy at all stages of admission campaign. All information on the contingent formation is posted on the university's website.

The order of work and the composition of the admission commission are approved annually by the order of the University. Applicants can familiarise themselves with the entrance test Programs on the information platforms of Kirov State Medical University.

The University has established a Department for the organisation of admission and career guidance, which interacts with state authorities and local governments of the Kirov region and other regions of the Russian Federation, the State Employment Service of the Kirov region, state, municipal and commercial enterprises, educational institutions on career guidance issues and the specifics of education at the University.

Every year, the University conducts various career guidance events in order to attract and select professionally oriented applicants: excursions for students of online classes of natural science, High School Student Days, Career Guidance Weeks, Graduate Days, Open Days, Science Festivals, Career Days and other events. In the University, there is the centre of Preparatory education, which, along with University admission training courses, conducts career guidance work. University staff going to the districts of the Kirov region are working to attract the most trained and professionally oriented youth to study at the University.

The project "Junior Medical Academy" was created in the Centre of Preparatory Education, the purpose of which is to develop research interest, meet the educational needs of school students by forming a scientific worldview.

Enrolled applicants, if necessary, have the opportunity to transfer both between specialties within the university and between universities in accordance with the Procedure for transferring, expelling and readmitting students to the University.

The Appeal Commission accepts and considers appeals submitted by applicants who passed the entrance exams, which the University organises independently. In case of disagreement with

the mark, each applicant or their legal representative has the right to submit a written application to the head of the admission commission to review the results of the entrance exams in accordance with local regulations.

All students are informed about the opportunity to contact the rector. There is a system for receiving feedback on issues that concern students, their problems and needs. Channels for receiving feedback are the following: telephone, e-mail, electronic services (form for submitting an electronic appeal, receiving advice on services provided, section “Frequently Asked questions”, “Citizens' appeal”, “Suggestions and complaints” on the University's website). Monitoring, which is carried out on a regular basis, is an important way to receive feedback. The monitoring covers various target audiences: students of the Centre of Preparatory Education, students of different courses, residents, students of the Central Scientific Methodological Society. Based on the monitoring data, the structural units of the University determine the needs of students, identify problems and build further work to solve them. Regular meetings of students with curators, deans of faculties and the vice-rector for academic affairs are held, where academic performance issues are discussed. Regular coursework, group and individual conversations to clarify the causes of possible academic leeway. In the University, there is the Council of the curators that coordinates the work of group curators and provides assistance in methodological support, a psychological counseling service that provides students with assistance in solving personal and professional problems.

A large role in working with students is assigned to curators (the Regulation on the curator of the student group). A mentor teacher is assigned to each student group in the 1st and 2nd courses. Under their leadership, students get acquainted with the organisation of the educational process at the University, leisure, accommodation, food facilities. A tutor group was created to help the curators from among the senior students. At the beginning of the academic year, the project “Welcome, freshman!” is being implemented for 1st year students, which involves a number of adaptation activities, familiarisation with the corporate culture of the University.

For effective and safe study, the Anti-Corruption Commission was established. Local regulations have been approved in the field of anti-corruption.

Proper standards of students' behaviour are regulated by the internal regulations of Kirov State Medical University.

The development of the desired qualities and behaviour of students was developed by the teaching staff, dean's staff with the participation of representatives of the Council of Students of Kirov State Medical University and the Union of Students of Kirov State Medical University, considering the Federal Law “On Education in the Russian Federation” dated 28.12.2012 No. 273-Ф3, the Procedure for applying disciplinary measures to students and removing them from students (approved by order of the Ministry of Education and Science Sciences of the Russian Federation No. 13 on 15.03.2013), the Charter of Kirov State Medical University.

The following mechanisms are used to identify students who need psychological, social and material support: surveys and questionnaires; observation and analysis of behaviour by the curator of groups and staff of the dean's office; analysis of academic achievements etc.

The activities of the psychological counseling service are aimed at adapting first-year students and overcoming possible psychological difficulties in subsequent courses of study. Both curators and tutors, as well as staff of the psychological service, conduct individual counseling and group classes, work on teaching psychological literacy, psychoprophylaxis, and psychotherapy. A special place in the work of the psychological service is occupied by events with certain categories of students who require special attention: orphans, persons with limited health capacities, students raising children, etc. The university developed a comprehensive program for the organisation of psychological assistance to students with disabilities and limited health capacities, and a work flow chart is being developed annually to increase the accessibility of facilities and services for the disabled and people with limited health capacities.

Student self-government at Kirov State Medical University is implemented through public student organisations run by students themselves. The policy of student representation is implemented in three directions: student self-government; student representation in collegial

bodies of the university, which manage the educational process; representation of students in social projects that implement regional health objectives. The student scientific society becomes the starting point, the point of scientific growth and development of young scientists.

In order to take into account the opinions of students on University management issues and when adopting local regulations affecting their rights and legitimate interests, a Student Council was established on the initiative of students, whose tasks are to develop proposals to improve the quality of the educational process, considering the personal, professional and scientific interests of students, and the implementation of socially significant initiatives.

The Union of students of Kirov State Medical University represents the interests of students, provides financial support, consulting and legal support. Throughout their studies, university students are involved in various forms of socio-cultural activities, participate in socio-political life, and socially significant actions.

All organisations and structures providing advisory services operate within the framework of the law on the protection of personal data on the principles of confidentiality. The established system of support and assistance for students as a whole ensures that the requests and needs of students are met.

According to the results of a survey conducted during the visit of the External Expert Commission, the level of accessibility of the dean's office is estimated at “satisfied” and “partially satisfied” by 64.3% and 27% of respondents, respectively; the level of accessibility and responsiveness of the university management is 63% and 25.1% of respondents; 52% and 35.1% of respondents are fully and partially satisfied with the availability of academic counseling; educational resources – 56.1% and 32.3% of respondents.

48.3% and 35.1% of respondents are fully and partially satisfied with the availability of counseling on personal problems. 51.4% and 37% of students are fully and partially satisfied with the work of the financial and administrative services of Kirov State Medical University. 55.2% and 31.3% of respondents are fully and partially satisfied with the quality of medical services at the University.

The analytical part

At Kirov State Medical University, the requirements for the standard are met in sufficient volume. It can be noted that the selection and admission to the University is carried out in accordance with the Federal Law on Education in the Russian Federation, the Admission Procedure, and the Admission Rules. Information about admission conditions is publicly available and applicants are provided with equal, open and accessible conditions for admission. The most worthy applicants are selected for enrollment, determined by the sum of the points of the entrance tests and individual achievements.

Students are given the opportunity to participate in advisory bodies, in the evaluation and improvement of the training program. It should be noted that the students were unable to clearly articulate their potential in shaping the policy of representation and participation in Mission definition, development, management and evaluation of the educational program and other issues related to the students.

During the interviewing of students and graduates of the educational program, the members of the External Expert Commission found that during meetings with the heads of departments, the dean's office, students have the opportunity to express their opinions and wishes regarding their participation in the decision-making process, ensuring academic quality and other professional, financial and social issues. All issues raised and discussed at these meetings are resolved in a timely and appropriate manner.

The results of the student survey showed high (in total in the range of 85-95%) satisfaction indicators in terms of the attitude and level of accessibility of the dean's office, accessibility and responsiveness of the university management, support of educational materials in the learning process, accessibility of counseling on personal problems, financial and administrative services of the University, the level of accessibility of library resources, the quality of services provided in libraries and reading rooms, the existing educational resources of the university, the usefulness of

the website of educational organisations in general and faculties in particular, the clarity of the procedure for taking incentive and disciplinary measures, the overall quality of curricula, teaching methods in general, and the quality of teaching. Attention is paid to the fact that there is less satisfaction, in comparison with other criteria, with the availability of rest rooms for students.

It should be noted that student self-government at Kirov State Medical University is implemented through public student organizations run by students themselves, but the representation of students of the Faculty of Dentistry has not been implemented.

In accordance with the strategy of medical and pharmaceutical education of Kirov State Medical University, the admission of students, including from foreign countries, is annually increasing according to budgetary and extra-budgetary forms of education. This requires a comprehensive approach to solving the issues of the educational process and personality formation, in conditions of social instability and the growth of crisis interventions.

Strengths/best practices

According to this standard, no strengths have been identified.

Recommendations of the External Expert Commission:

1. The management of the university is recommended to organise work to expand the representation of students studying in all subjects in the collegial bodies of the University. The deadline is until 31.01.2025.

The conclusions of the External Expert Commission according to the criteria:

- strong positions – 0
- satisfactory – 15
- requires improvement – 1
- unsatisfactory – 0

6.5. Standard “Academic staff / teachers”

Evidentiary part

Kirov State Medical University has positions of pedagogical and scientific workers, engineering and technical, administrative and economic, industrial, educational and auxiliary, medical and other employees of the University.

The policy of selection and admission of academic staff at Kirov State Medical University is carried out in accordance with the Labor Code of the Russian Federation, the regulation “On the procedure for substituting positions of teaching staff “, approved by Order No. 749 of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation dated 23.07.2015, the Nomenclature of positions of teaching staff of organisations engaged in educational activities, positions of heads of educational organisations, approved by the Decree of the Government of the Russian Federation dated 21.02.2022. No.225, by Order of the Ministry of Healthcare and Social Development of the Russian Federation dated 11.01.2011 No. 1n “On approval of the Unified Skills Guide for positions of managers, specialists and non-manual workers, section “Qualification characteristics of positions of managers and specialists of higher professional and additional professional education” and the Charter of Kirov State Medical University.

In Kirov State Medical University there is an open procedure for recruitment and selection of personnel, the objectivity of competitions in the selection of applicants for scientific and pedagogical positions. Teaching staff must have a higher education corresponding to the academic discipline which they teach, training in Pedagogy (every 3 years), specialty (every 5 years), IT technology (every 3 years), inclusive education (every 3 years), first aid (every 3 years). Applicants for the position of head of the department, professor and associate professor must have a doctorate or PhD degree.

The announcements of the competitions are publicly available on the University's website, which allows both University employees and external applicants to participate in the competition.

To implement the educational program “Dentistry” on the basis of curricula, the teaching staff is formed, which is approved by the staffing schedule. The number of teaching staff is planned based on the needs of the educational process, the standard of the teaching load on the teacher, the contingent of students in all educational programs. The balance of the academic staff of general biomedical sciences, behavioural and social sciences and medical sciences, as well as the balance between academic and non-academic staff is formed based on the curriculum of the specialty.

The total number of teaching staff of Kirov State Medical University is 302 people, out of whom 250 (82.8%) are the main employees. The number of full-time teachers is 206. 44 full-time teachers work on a part-time basis. Every year, highly qualified managers and employees of practical healthcare and pharmacy, whose activities are related to the direction of the implemented educational program, are admitted on the terms of external secondary employment. Currently, the number is 52 (17.2%) teachers.

The staff includes 39 heads of departments, 21 professors, 149 associate professors, 52 senior teachers and 37 teaching assistants. The gender composition of the University teaching staff is represented by 201 (66.5%) women, 101 (33.5%) men.

The part of teachers of general disciplines is 61.8%, specialised (clinical) disciplines – 38.2%.

The balance of teaching staff is observed and determined in accordance with the curriculum and the structure of disciplines and practices. This makes it possible to ensure the successful implementation of the educational program.

The qualitative composition of the teaching staff is determined by the personnel potential with a doctorate or PhD degree. The academic degree holders rate of the teaching staff has remained stable at a level of at least 70% over the past 5 years. All teachers of clinical departments have certificates of specialists or information about the passage of accreditation.

Teaching staff has a high level of qualification and competence, more than 60% of teaching staff have 15 years of experience in scientific, pedagogical and clinical work and more.

52 teachers underwent professional retraining under the “Higher School Teacher” program, 36 of them are employees of clinical departments.

The responsibility of teachers is monitored when analysing the fulfillment of job descriptions, an individual plan reflecting the volume and timing of educational, disciplinary, methodological, scientific and other types of work, as well as annual certification of educational, therapeutic and scientific work.

When interviewing teaching staff, including heads of departments, it was identified that the individual plan of the teacher is discussed at the meeting of the department and is approved by the head of the department. Every year, at the end of the academic year, an analysis of the performance of indicators within the framework of an individual plan is carried out at a meeting of the department.

The policy of job admission of the teaching staff and researchers of the University is reflected in local regulations: Regulations on the procedure for substituting positions of teaching staff; Regulations on the procedure for electing the dean of the faculty and the head of the department; Regulations on the procedure for a competition for the positions of researchers.

The election of academic staff who meet the qualification requirements for the positions is carried out by the collegial governing boards of the University: the Academic Council of the University, Academic Councils of faculties.

The distribution of teaching staff by discipline categories directly corresponds to the number of study hours approved for each discipline. Disciplines are defined for each department and distributed among teachers in accordance with the curriculum and job description. The rights and duties of the teaching staff are defined in the job description. Teachers teach disciplines in accordance with the work program of the discipline and the planned results of educational activities. Monitoring the results of students' studies at the midterm assessment, State final Examination, passing primary specialised accreditation allows evaluating the performance of duties by teachers.

The educational program and its constituent elements (curriculum, work programs,

assessment methods) are clearly defined and brought to the attention of each teacher. There is a close relationship between the teachers of the departments and the dean.

The contribution of teachers of biomedical, social, behavioural, and clinical disciplines to learning outcomes, the amount of hours allocated to their study, as well as the quality of the educational process for teachers, depending on the distribution of their responsibilities, is constantly analysed.

In order to stimulate employees to a high-quality result of work, as well as incentives for work performed at the University, in addition to the official salary, incentive payments have been established. Issues of staff incentives are determined by local regulations of the University, in particular, the Regulations on Remuneration of Employees of FSBEI HE Kirov SMU MOH Russia, the Regulations on Indicators and Criteria for the Effectiveness of Teaching and Research staff of FSBEI HE Kirov SMU MOH Russia and the procedure for their application. The regulations determine the size of official salaries by professional qualification groups, the size of salary increment coefficients; the conditions and amounts of compensatory and incentive payments.

Based on the results of a special assessment of the working conditions of the teaching staff, compensation payments are established

The University maintains a balance of academic and professional qualifications of teachers, which ensures the quality of the educational process. The content and time standards of the University teaching staff regulates the Regulation on time standards for calculating educational, methodological, research and other work performed by the teaching staff. The time standards for performing each type of extracurricular work are distributed depending on the type and unit of work.

The standard (total) amount of working time of one teacher in an academic year is at least 1,500 hours, based on a 36-hour working week (within the rate), considering 56 calendar days of vacation.

The activities of the scientific and pedagogical work of the University are divided into classroom (educational) and extracurricular (research, educational and methodological; educational and educational; therapeutic; expert, as well as other, including those related to improving one's professional level, provided for by labour (official) duties and (or) the individual plan of the teacher).

The academic load of each teacher is determined depending on the position they hold, the level of qualification and may not exceed the upper limits established by the positions of scientific and pedagogical workers. The teaching load for teaching staff positions is set to a maximum of 900 hours per academic year.

Teachers are engaged in research activities in accordance with their scientific specialty and the profile of the department. Leading scientists of the University publish the results of their research in periodicals indexed in the international information and analytical systems of scientific citation WoS and Scopus, as well as in journals included in the Russian Science Citation Index. The teaching staff also has the opportunity to publish the results of their research in the university scientific journal Vyatka Medical Bulletin, which is included in the list of journals recommended by the Higher Attestation Commission of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation for the publication of research results.

The University keeps records of the publication activity of teaching staff. Teachers who have high publication activity, conduct scientific research, involve students and postgraduates in scientific work, and are appointed as heads of scientific laboratories.

According to the results of a survey of students conducted during the visit of the external Expert Commission, 47.6% and 37.4% of respondents provided positive answers ("I completely agree" and "I agree") that teachers use effective teaching methods; 60.2% and 31.7% know the educational material; teachers present the material in an understandable form (45.8% and 40.1%); present the material in an interesting way (46.4% and 34.8%); meets the requirements in terms of personal development and professional formation of future specialists (45.3% and 39.9%); stimulate student activity (44.8% and 36.1%); stimulate the creative thinking of students (44.5%

Unofficial Translation
and 34.5%); demonstrate a positive attitude towards students (46.8% and 33.5%); speak a professional language (58.3% and 34.2%).

During interviews with teachers, it was noted that they take advanced training courses in a timely manner in accordance with the requirements of regulatory documents.

In order to develop the communication skills of teaching staff with foreign students, the English language training is conducted annually by the staff of the Department of Foreign Languages with the Latin language course.

According to the results of the survey during the visit of the External Expert Commission, 97.3% of the teachers participating in it rated the opportunity for professional development “very good” and “good”.

The teacher-student ratio is determined by the requirements of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation and the University's work flow chart and is within the regulatory requirements. The number of students per teaching staff is approximately 1:8.

The staff resources policy is aimed at increasing the level of human resources in accordance with the goals and mission of the University. The University provides all employees with equal opportunities to realise their opportunities and career growth. With effective performance of official duties, active scientific, educational and methodological activities, successful clinical work, teachers are recommended for higher positions, the replacement of which is carried out according to the results of competitive procedures and elections.

97.3% of the teaching staff participating in the survey are satisfied with the opportunities provided by the university for the career growth of teachers.

The analytical part

The University defined and brought to the attention of all employees the policy of selection and admission of academic staff. The personnel policy ensures equality and accessibility to vacancies available at the university and guarantees equal opportunities and an objective assessment of applicants' professional qualities.

The formed academic staff makes it possible to fully implement the educational program, which is ensured by the high degree of teaching staff (more than 60%) and the experience of scientific, pedagogical and clinical work for 15 years and more (60% of teaching staff).

The University regularly monitors the responsibility of teachers in accordance with local regulations.

An analysis of the information obtained during interviews and questionnaires also showed that the university provides training and advanced training for teachers.

The documents indicate that the teacher-student ratio is considered when planning the numbers of teaching staff. The University strives to maintain this ratio close to 1 to 8.

Kirov State Medical University has implemented a policy of activity and development of teaching staff, which guarantees recognition of the activities of employees, which is carried out, among other things, in the form of promotion and pay increases.

Strengths/best practices

According to this standard, no strengths have been identified.

Recommendations of the External Expert Commission

There are no recommendations for this standard.

The conclusions of the External Expert Commission according to the criteria:

- strong positions – 0
- satisfactory – 8
- requires improvement – 0
- unsatisfactory – 0

6.6. Standard “Educational resources”

The evidentiary part

To implement the educational program “Dentistry”, in Kirov State Medical University there are 3 academic buildings with a dining room and a utility block, 4 dormitories for students, a gym with a total area of 52,801.1 m², as well as premises of clinical departments and laboratories located in medical organisations. The presented material and technical base is sufficient, complies with the current rules and regulations that ensure the conduct of all types of disciplinary and interdisciplinary training, practical and research activities of students provided for in the curriculum.

The analysis of the material and technical equipment of the classroom fund for the development of the educational program showed full compliance with the requirements of the Federal State Educational Standard. All facilities comply with fire safety and sanitary standards.

The results of the survey of students indicate that 86.2% of respondents are satisfied with classrooms, classrooms for large groups, 87.8% – with existing scientific laboratories, 80.2% – with the provision of dormitories, 83.7% – with safety, comfort and modern equipment.

During interviews with management staff and teachers, experts noted the timeliness of updating equipment based on purchase requests.

Kirov State Medical University has a multi-profile accreditation and simulation center. Accreditation in the specialty “Dentistry” is carried out on the premises of the Department of Dentistry.

In accordance with the Federal State Educational Standard, accredited educational institutions include a number of educational and industrial practices. The largest medical organisations in Kirov are used as bases for the practice of students of Kirov State Medical University (13 contracts have been concluded).

When visiting the practical bases, the availability of the necessary equipment, premises and the number of mentors for students to do the practical training and consolidate their basic practical skills was confirmed.

To implement a unified policy in the field of informatisation of structural units in the University, there is the Computer Information Center.

Library and information support for educational activities is provided by the library of Kirov State Medical University located in premises with a total area of 579.6 m². Reading rooms are located in building No. 1 of the University, the area of reading rooms is 132.5 m². Reference and bibliographic system is represented by an electronic catalogue and a traditional systematic catalogue.

A unified corporate secure network has been deployed at Kirov State Medical University, uniting the university campus and all structural units. All corporate systems have a single point of entry and authorisation, there is a single security policy, a role model of interaction between employees and students is implemented.

The information system of Kirov State Medical University is integrated into the work of the Federal Uniform State Health Information System of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Russian Federation, as well as into the work of the Regional Ministry of Healthcare of the Kirov region.

Kirov State Medical University provides each student with individual unlimited access to electronic library systems (electronic libraries) from any place where there is access to the information and telecommunications network “Internet”, both on the territory of the University and outside it. The University also provides students from people with limited physical capabilities with electronic educational resources in forms adapted to their health limitations. Each student is provided with individual unlimited access to the Student's Consultant ELS during the entire period of study. Library of the medical university, ELS “University Library online”, "ELS “Icebook”, ELS “Doctor's Consultant” (for residents and graduate students); ELS “Lan” and Electronic Information and Learning Environment (EILE) of Kirov State Medical University. We have subscribed to publications on anatomy and normal physiology in English. 100% access for students and research and teaching staff is provided.

Since 2016, the Library of Kirov State Medical University has been part of the participants in the corporate project for the creation and exchange of information resources “Integrated Information and Library System (IILS) of the scientific and educational medical cluster of the Volga Federal District “Middle Volga”. As part of this project, users of the university library have access to the materials of libraries belonging to the cluster, namely: Kazan State Medical University, Izhevsk State Medical University, Privolzhskiy Research Medical University (PRMU, Nizhniy Novgorod), Perm State Medical University, Ulyanovsk State University.

Since 2020, Kirov State Medical University has been a participant in the educational project “Online Electronic Library” (Lan Publishing House, St. Petersburg). This project provides a single space for the exchange of content from participating universities. To date, 3307 publications of 30 medical universities are available. The participation of the University in the developing of “Online Electronic Library” project provides access to electronic libraries of most Russian universities and provides an access to the works of teachers of Kirov State Medical University.

In 2022, as part of a centralised (national) subscription from the RSCI of Kirov State Medical University, access to scientific foreign information resources was provided: EBSCO. MEDLINE Complete database, Cochrane Library, Springer eBook Collections, Springer Nature, Orbit Premium edition database, Lippincott Williams and Wilkins Archive Journals collection, eBook Clinical Lectures.

The University signs an annual contract to work in the database “Reference and Search Engine (SPS) Consultant Plus”. Access is provided from the computers of the university's academic buildings.

The Unified Educational Environment of the university has shown high efficiency during the COVID-19 pandemic. According to the results of a students` survey conducted during the visit of the External Expert Commission, 89.9% of respondents noted the availability of computer classes and Internet resources provided by the university, 89% of respondents noted the good equipment of the library and a fairly good collection of books; good accessibility and quality of Internet resources - 88.1%.

When interviewing employers, it was noted that the educational programs were developed with consideration of regional healthcare system needs.

The research base of Kirov State Medical University is used for scientific research: Laboratory of Pharmacological Bioenergetics and Membranology; Laboratory of directed regulation of Intermicrobial interactions in exo- and endomicroecological systems; Biomedical Center for Biomodeling; Scientific Laboratory “Kariesology”; Center for Clinical Research; material and technical base of departments and medical organisations that are clinical bases of the University.

Various methods of encouragement are used to involve students in conducting scientific research in medicine: the institutioning of an increased state academic scholarship, the transition to a budget form of education, the institution of scholarships from the President of the Russian Federation, additional exam scores for admission to residency.

The results of scientific research of the University staff and students are included in the educational program.

During the implementation of accredited educational programs, the University monitors the state and effectiveness of the processes of pedagogical activity, including a rating assessment of the activities of teachers; sociological studies of teachers`, students` and employers` satisfaction with the quality of the educational process at the university; external and internal audits.

Kirov State Medical University cooperates with professors of other medical universities, with foreign colleagues in teaching clinical disciplines, issues of the latest scientific research in the field of medical education, theoretical and practical research in the field of medicine. Academician of the Russian Academy of Sciences, Professor V. K. Leontiev, was involved in the implementation of the educational “Dentistry” in the format of part-time work in the planning of research and training of highly qualified personnel. Cooperation with full members of the Russian Academy of Sciences and leading medical universities in Russia allows formulating and implementing policies that strengthen the relationship between scientific research and education.

Advanced training of teaching staff is carried out with the participation of visiting professors from leading universities in Russia and foreign countries as part of academic mobility.

During the interview with the heads of departments and the teaching staff, it was noted that the university mainly motivates employees to conduct research in the field of medical science.

As part of the implementation of the educational program, academic mobility programs are regularly implemented for both students and teaching staff (with the Republic of Kazakhstan, Republic of Belarus, Republic of Uzbekistan), including short-term exchanges (training in cycles/modules, internships), participation in international scientific and practical events, lectures, seminars, webinars, master classes, round tables, etc. From 2014 to 2023, students of Kirov State Medical University completed practical training in clinics in Serbia, Brazil, Portugal, Croatia, Bulgaria, Macedonia, Croatia, Greece, Poland, Romania, Latvia, Italy, Thailand, Hungary, Mexico, Turkey, Moldova, Morocco. Students from Italy, Mexico, Brazil, China, Slovenia, and Kazakhstan completed internships at Kirov healthcare institutions.

Mutual international exchanges for students specialising in 31.05.03 Dentistry were carried out with universities of the Republic of Belarus: Vitebsk State Medical University, Belarusian State Medical University, Grodno State Medical University. The Memorandum of cooperation with Vitebsk State Medical University defines the areas of cooperation, the timing of the exchange of students, advertising and information materials. From 2015 to 2021, 62 students of the Republic of Belarus and 68 students of Kirov State Medical University participated in academic mobility programs.

Since 2019, more than 90 teachers and staff of Kirov State Medical University have participated in educational and scientific events organised by foreign partners.

According to the results of the survey of the teaching staff, 95.6% of respondents are satisfied with the organisation of academic activity at the university.

The analytical part

As part of the visit to the university's clinical bases, structures and departments, the availability of the necessary material and technical base necessary for the implementation of the educational program was confirmed. Satisfaction with the material and technical base and its availability was also established when interviewing teaching staff and students.

The material and technical base is regularly updated and expanded on the basis of a feedback system between departments and the university management on the completeness of the material and technical support of academic disciplines.

The University creates conditions for the development of clinical and practical skills by providing the educational process with simulation equipment and concluding contracts with practical healthcare as practice bases.

Visual inspection, the results of interviews and questionnaires indicate sufficient access to electronic information resources, health information systems in compliance with ethical standards and safety of teaching staff and students. The information educational environment of the university used has shown high efficiency.

The submitted documents and the information obtained during the interview allow us to conclude that there is a relationship between scientific achievements in the field of medicine, including university staff and students, and implemented educational program.

Members of External Expert Commission note that Kirov State Medical University conducts an examination of the educational program at various levels. The University has formulated and implemented a policy that helps strengthen the correlation between the results of scientific research and education, in particular, through the conclusion of contracts with the real sector of the economy – the developer and manufacturer of oral hygiene products, which made it possible to form a priority area – the prevention of dental diseases.

In order to fulfill the goals of international policy, academic mobility programs for the teaching staff and students are being implemented, and international scientific events are being held.

Strengths/best practices

The University has formulated and implemented a policy to strengthen the relationship between the results of scientific research and education, which consists of introducing the results of research on oral hygiene products into the educational process under contracts with the real sector of the economy.

Recommendations of the External Expert Commission

There are no recommendations for this standard

The conclusions of the External Expert Commission according to the criteria:

- strong positions – 1
- satisfactory – 13
- requires improvement – 0
- unsatisfactory – 0

6.7. Standard “Assessment of the educational program”***Evidentiary part***

The monitoring of the educational program and the results of its development is carried out on the basis of the Procedure for the development and approval of educational programs of higher education, the Regulations on the work program of the discipline (module) of the main professional educational program, the Procedure for the state final certification of higher education programs – bachelor's and specialist's degree programs, the Procedure for conducting ongoing monitoring of academic performance and midterm assessment of students, the Regulations on the quality assessment system for educational activities and training of students, the Procedure for the participation of a student of FSBEI HE Kirov SMU MOH Russia in the formation of the content of their professional education. Academic Services Office is responsible for regular monitoring of the educational program. The dean's office, with the active participation of departments, ensures timely implementation and assessment of assigned tasks. The results are discussed at the Academic Council of the University, Educational and Methodological Board, the Academic Council of the Faculty of Dentistry, and brought to the attention of departments and teachers. The University, in its monitoring program and in the evaluation of educational programs, involves the main persons: teaching staff, students and employers.

The monitoring of the educational program is carried out in order to identify compliance with the requirements of the Federal State Educational Standard. The monitored components of the program are the following: 1) the structure of the program; 2) the ratio of the mandatory part and the part formed by the participants of educational relations; 3) the availability of elective disciplines; 4) types and kinds of practical trainings; 5) educational and methodological support; 6) accessibility of electronic information and learning environment; 7) staffing; 8) logistical support. These components are evaluated through an internal independent evaluation with systematic monitoring, as well as national accreditation of the educational program.

The dean's office provides students with a real opportunity to participate in the formation of their educational program, explains their rights and obligations to fulfill the general professional educational program, informs students and their parents (legal representatives) about the right to participate in the formation of the content of their professional education at the time of admission and conducts explanatory work during the educational period.

After mastering each discipline, students have the opportunity to formulate and bring to the attention of the head of the department, deans, vice-rector and rector proposals on the structure, volume and content of the discipline, as well as on methods of control by means of a questionnaire. In addition, student representatives are members of the Academic Council of the University, the Academic Council of the Faculty.

To analyse the educational program, there is a basic feedback system, within the framework of the information map of the process “Implementation of higher education programs”, “Monitoring of customer satisfaction”, which regulate the implementation of the following indicators: the availability of updated educational program that meet the requirements of the Federal State Educational Standard in terms of level and content; compliance of the conditions for the implementation of educational program with the requirements of the Federal State Educational Standard; the level of competence of graduates according to the requirements of the Federal State Educational Standard; student satisfaction; employer satisfaction; teacher satisfaction.

In Kirov State Medical University, there are units of the central office of the quality management system, which employs a sociologist, one of whose main tasks is to organise and conduct customer satisfaction monitoring. The University developed questionnaires based on Yandex forms, links to which are publicly available on the official website of the University and in the personal accounts of students on the educational website. In the official group on the “VKontakte” social network, there is a link to the “red button”, the main task of which is to promptly bring information about suggestions or problems to the University management from students and external customers of University services in order to make an operational decision to eliminate identified problems (inconsistencies) or introduce rational suggestions into the educational process.

Research and teaching staff are interviewed as part of the annual monitoring on satisfaction with working conditions at Kirov State Medical University, where the climate in the corporate team, the comfort of “teacher-student” relationships and more are studied. Surveys of students and graduates are conducted according to the annual plan of the central office of the quality management system. At the same time, on the instructions of the University management, unscheduled monitoring is carried out to identify problems, collect consumer opinions and suggestions on improving the provision of educational services at Kirov State Medical University. Students have the opportunity to evaluate the educational program in each course of study as part of the monitoring “Teacher in students` eyes` and a questionnaire on satisfaction with the conditions of study at Kirov State Medical University. Assessing the quality of graduate training in the framework of the sociological survey “Employers' satisfaction with the training of graduates of Kirov State Medical University”, employers make suggestions to improve the quality of training of graduates of Kirov State Medical University, which are later used to work in University departments, including the psychological counseling service. When monitoring the employment of graduates of the first year of graduation, the issue of emerging difficulties of a young specialist at the initial stage of their career is studied, the most problematic points are brought to the management for corrective measures.

The head of the central office quality management system brings information on the results of monitoring to meetings of the Academic Council, the Rector's Office, by sending summary data to the departments of the University, the information is analysed and appropriate decisions are made to improve the quality of services and increase the loyalty of interested persons.

The results of these monitoring are compiled into reports and used in the work of the University in order to continuously improve processes and improve the quality of educational services. The results of the monitoring “Teacher in students` eyes`” are used in evaluating the criteria for the effectiveness of the heads of departments.

The analysis of the results of current academic performance, the results of midterm and final attestation, the analysis of attendance and academic performance takes place at meetings of departments, the Academic Council of the Faculty, the Academic Council of the University, reports are provided to the founder (Ministry of Healthcare of the Russian Federation) and the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation. Students' academic performance is regularly discussed at monitors` and students` course meetings. Students who have problems with mastering the educational program form an individual training plan, teachers of departments conduct ongoing consultations on disciplines. Excellent and well-performing students are encouraged by letters of gratitude to their parents, information about them is posted on the stand “Our Best Students”, in the corporate newspaper “Doctor” and on the University's website.

The employment of graduates in the medical field by profession is assessed according to a telephone survey, a questionnaire of graduates; employers' satisfaction with the quality of graduate training in theoretical, practical, and personal aspects. Based on the indicators of employers' satisfaction with the quality of graduate training, the curriculum, discipline programs and practices are being adjusted.

The curriculum of the specialty reflects the sequence of formation of competencies in the learning process; disciplines and practical trainings involved in the formation of competencies, as well as the possibility for students to personally choose elective disciplines. The analysis of the results of the current, intermediate and final attestation allows, if necessary, developing corrective and preventive measures regarding the content of disciplines, the ratio of lectures and practical classes, to introduce new disciplines into the elective part of the educational process, to expand the methodological and information support of the educational process.

The main concept of educational activities implemented by Kirov State Medical University is the creation of an intellectual environment through the planning and training of graduates capable of providing highly qualified multi-level medical care and the development of the healthcare system. The main forms of cooperation between the University and employers are the following: cooperation agreements, practical training and internship contracts, participation in events (presentations, seminars, round tables, master classes, etc.), joint medical activities, participation in the implementation of educational programs, in the certification of graduates during the State Final Examination and in the scientific life of the University.

When implementing the educational program in the declared specialties, an independent assessment is applied; experts from third-party organisations working in this field are included in the state examination commissions, their opinion is considered when planning measures to improve the educational program. In addition, the opinions of other interested persons obtained from official sources, analytical reports, etc. are considered.

The analytical part

Experts of External Expert Commission note that in the specialty of Dentistry, during the work of the expert commission and the analysis of the submitted documentation, compliance with the requirements of the standard was revealed. After analysing the submitted documents and interviewing the participants of the focus groups, the members of the External Expert Commission came to the conclusion that in Kirov State Medical University, there is a multi-level system for evaluating the educational program in the declared specialties, which includes an internal assessment of the quality of education and consists of:

- current control of the organisation and implementation of the educational process by the dean's office;
- assessment of the quality of the educational process of the central office quality management system in the form of an internal audit of educational units and processes;
- participation in the procedures of midterm and final assessment of external experts;
- assessment of the quality of teaching teaching staff from students by means of a questionnaire;
- internal cathedral assessment of the quality of teaching in the form of mutual visits by staff to classes, etc.

The University developed questionnaires based on Yandex forms, links to which are publicly available on the official website of the University and in the personal accounts of students on the educational website.

The members of the External Expert Commission note that the feedback regarding the issues of evaluation and improvement of the educational program is mainly presented in the form of a questionnaire.

The top-management of Kirov State Medical University periodically conducts an assessment of the educational program, including the content of disciplines, the organisation of the educational process, material and technical resources, the learning environment, cultural and national characteristics.

The academic achievements of students at Kirov State Medical University are systematically analysed in relation to the Mission and final learning outcomes, including the determination of indicators such as the average academic performance in disciplines and courses of study; absolute academic performance and qualitative performance indicator; the absolute number and proportion of students expelled. The conditions of study in the completed disciplines are analysed. The administration of Kirov State Medical University conducts periodic surveys in the field of assessing the degree of satisfaction of students and teaching staff with educational programs and resource availability.

In addition to evaluating students' academic achievements (academic performance) participation in research work, Students' Scientific Society, conferences, Olympiads considered. These indicators are taken into account when setting the final grade for the discipline as a stimulating incentive.

Monitoring allows making quick changes to the educational program. Thus, according to the results of the initial accreditation, adjustments were made to the curriculum, the academic discipline "Psychology of communication and conflict in the professional activity of a dentist" was added, emergency care trainings, and changes were made to the list of practical skills. On the recommendation of employers, the discipline "Physiotherapy in dentistry" was developed and introduced into the educational process. "Russian Language and Speech Culture" elective was added in accordance with the request of foreign students, aimed at improving the Russian language proficiency and professional communication.

Access to the monitoring results for external parties is carried out through the official website of the University, where the results of surveys of consumers of educational services are publicly available.

Strengths/best practices

According to this standard, no strengths were identified.

Recommendations of the External Expert Commission

There are no recommendations for this standard.

The conclusions of the External Expert Commission according to the criteria:

- Strong-0
- Satisfactory – 9
- Requires improvement – 0
- Unsatisfactory – 0

6.8 Standard «Management and administration»

The evidentiary part

The management of the University's activities and the interaction of structural and collegial departments of the University is carried out in accordance with the University's Charter and organizational structure.

The collective governing body of the University is the Academic Board of the University, which includes the Rector, Vice-Rectors, as well as appointed by decision of the Academic Board of the University - deans of faculties, director of the ICE. Other members of the Academic Board of the University are elected at the Conference of employees and students of the University by secret ballot. The Academic Board of the University considers and makes decisions on the main directions of educational, scientific, medical, financial and economic activities, as well as issues of international cooperation of the University. It makes a decision to convene the Conference of employees and students of the University, determines the terms and procedure for the election of the Rector of the University, approves curricula and MPEDPs on the proposal of the deans of faculties, awards honorary titles, approves local normative acts governing the main issues of the

University. The structure and functions of the Academic Board of the University are set out in the regulations of the Academic Board of the University.

The collegial advisory body ensuring the implementation of the Rector's powers for the current management of the University's activities is the Rector's office, acting under the chairmanship of the Rector on the basis of the Regulations on the Rector's Office.

According to the organisational structure, the University has vertical and horizontal interaction of structural units. Vice-rectors and departments that ensure the processes of the graduate life cycle are directly subordinate to the Rector. Vice-rectors supervise structural units in their areas of activity.

The structure of the University includes the ICE, clinic, faculties, scientific laboratories, library, hostels, a museum, a printing house, an archive, offices, centres, services and departments.

The functions and tasks of the structural units, the list of units and officials with whom the structural units of the University interact within the framework of their functions are defined by the regulations on the structural units. The tasks and functions of personnel are defined by job descriptions.

As part of the University, councils, commissions, committees function on the rights of public and collegial associations, the management tasks and functions of which are defined by the relevant provisions.

The Dean's Office of the Faculty of Dentistry is a structural unit of the Faculty of Dentistry. The main structural units of the faculty, in addition to the dean's office, are the departments assigned to the faculty by order. The general management of the faculty's activities is carried out by an elected body – the Academic Council of the Faculty of Dentistry. The activities of the faculty are managed by the Dean, who reports directly to the Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs. The position of dean is elective.

In the course of fulfilling the main tasks and functions, the faculty interacts: with the departments of the University involved in the implementation of the OP in the specialty 31.05.03 Dentistry on educational, methodological and research work; with the UMA on the organization of educational and methodological work, with the library on providing students with literature; with the University admissions committee on the organization of a new set students; with the Human Resources Department for the staffing of the departments of the faculty; with the Central Committee of the QMS on the issues of registration of regulatory documents and the results of monitoring student and staff satisfaction.

Университет обеспечивает прозрачность системы управления через разработку и доведение до сведения всех заинтересованных сторон организационной структуры и положений, определяющих коммуникативные связи и функции подразделений.

Transparency of decisions made by the University's management, as well as collegial and public associations, is ensured through the EIOS by mailing through the University's electronic document management system. In addition, the decisions of the Academic Council, other councils, reports, reports and other information materials are publicly available on the official website of the University.

The Dean of the faculty heads the working group on the development of the OP, which includes: the head of the OP, methodological commissions and the academic council of the faculty. The academic council of the faculty consists of heads of clinical and theoretical departments, professors, associate professors, students, representatives of employers (chief doctors, chief freelance dentist, chief freelance pediatric dentist), the head of educational and industrial practice, the director of the MAS center, representatives of UMU are regularly invited to meetings. The Academic Council of the Faculty of Dentistry includes heads of clinical and theoretical departments, associate professors, and students.

In order to assess academic leadership in relation to achieving the mission and intended educational results, the university has developed, implemented and effectively operates the QMS. The functioning of the QMS is carried out in several priority areas: monitoring the satisfaction of

participants in the educational process and stakeholders; documentation support for educational and other processes; monitoring the status and effectiveness of the QMS.

Kirov State Medical University, when carrying out financial and economic activities, is guided by the Charter approved by the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation, the Budget Code, federal laws, orders of the Government of the Russian Federation, other normative acts in force on the territory of the Russian Federation regulating the educational activities of budgetary institutions and the Plan of financial and Economic Activities for the current year and the planning period.

The financial strategy of the University aimed at its economic sustainability and the achievement of its mission and goals, the creation and maintenance of an environment for learning, research, medical work and creative activity, as well as the objectives of educational programs for short and long-term prospects is being developed by the FEU.

The financing of the institution for the implementation of the OP is carried out in accordance with agreements concluded with the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation: a subsidy for financial support of the fulfillment of a state (municipal) task from the federal budget; targeted subsidies in accordance with the Budget Code of the Russian Federation and proceeds from the provision of paid educational services and other activities (proceeds from the provision of premises for rent, accommodation fees and others).

Funds at the University are spent only for their intended purpose in accordance with the approved PFHD. The targeted use of all University funds is a key principle in the organization of financing in accordance with the approved PFHD, which is an important document for ensuring educational programs. The PFHD is approved for a calendar year and a planning period by the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation in the context of funding sources. The control over the expenditure of budgetary and extra-budgetary funds is carried out by the FEU. Guided by the principle of transparency (openness), the head of the FEU annually reports to the Academic Council on the implementation of the approved plan.

The costs of OP correspond to the articles and sub-items of the budget classification and include: payments to the staff of the institution, contributions to funds; purchase of goods, works and services for public needs (maintenance, current and capital repairs, utilities, other services, purchase of benefits, equipment, consumables), social security and other payments to the population; taxes and others.

To achieve the mission and the final results, the necessary allocation of resources is ensured, an expenditure system is formed based on limiting consumables (stationery, household goods, fuel), rationing travel expenses, and an individual approach to determining the needs of all departments of the University.

Budgetary funds are targeted in nature, and their spending is based on the principles of efficiency, effectiveness, priority, transparency, and responsibility.

The University has the opportunity, in accordance with approved regulatory documents, to independently determine priority areas for spending financial resources to achieve high learning outcomes.

The financial policy of the University is aimed at the development of the university, material and social protection of the teaching staff and other categories of employees studying. In order to stimulate employees to high-quality work results, as well as rewards for work performed, the University has developed and put into operation a system for determining the effectiveness of activities for all categories of employees. Based on the results of the work of teachers, indicators are constantly being improved to determine an effective remuneration system aimed at depending the amount of payments based on the results of work on the effectiveness of a particular employee in educational, methodological, research, organizational, managerial and educational activities.

The administrative unit responsible for activities related to the educational process is the UMU. The main person in the administrative unit is the head of the UMU, whose competence includes all administrative work on the management of the OP, who works in close cooperation with the Academic Council of the University, Academic Councils of faculties and deans. The educational department, which is part of the UMU, forms the educational load for the teaching

staff, is responsible for scheduling classes and lectures, the schedule of intermediate and state final certification, managing lecture halls and classrooms, forms databases on the contingent of students; analyzes the movement of the contingent of students and analyzes statistical data on students; analyzes student academic performance; works with student contingent orders; advises departments on current issues; generates summary reports for submission to the external environment of the university.

To train the administrative and professional staff of the University, providing management and administration of the educational program and related activities, professional development programs "Regulatory and legal support for educational activities", "Organization of support for students with disabilities at the university", etc. have been developed and are being implemented.

To continuously improve the quality of education based on a process approach, the University has developed and approved by a representative of the top management in the field of quality, the Rector of the University "Register of Processes of the Kirov State Medical University of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation", which includes the following processes: Implementation of higher education programs; Educational activities at departments; Organization and control of the educational process in the dean's office, the department of personnel training higher qualification; Organization and control of the educational process in the MIND; Monitoring of graduate employment (main processes); Personnel management (supporting process).

Effective resource management is carried out at the University to implement the Mission and Policy in the field of quality, to solve strategic and administrative tasks. The Personnel management process is managed by the Human Resources department. Employees of the HR department, under the guidance of the head of the department, ensure the selection and recruitment of personnel, collect and analyze personal data, form, enter and store personal files of employees, form a personnel reserve of young promising employees, etc. in accordance with the Regulations on the personnel department, the Regulations on the procedure for filling positions of teaching staff related to the teaching staff; the Regulations on the procedure for electing the dean of the faculty and the head of the department; the Regulations on the procedure for holding a competition for the positions of researchers.

Management of distribution and provision of educational and other processes with financial resources is carried out by the Financial and Economic Department and the Accounting Department. Their functions are to create organisational, economic, accounting and other conditions necessary for the implementation of all types of activities in accordance with the mission of the University.

Material and technical resources are managed by the planning and economic department, accounting department, legal service and contract service, whose professional staff are responsible for legal and material and technical support of MPEDPs and related activities in the activities of the University. In accordance with its Mission, the University directly participates in solving issues related to the health protection of citizens in the region. Constructive cooperation is carried out in the provision of medical care by the staff of 22 clinical departments, located in public and private medical organizations, in the following areas: treatment of patients with therapeutic and surgical profiles; carrying out operations; consultations and consiliums; introduction of new methods of diagnosis and treatment. The University's clinical base is represented by the clinical and diagnostic department of the clinic, which provides highly qualified stomatological advisory, diagnostic and treatment assistance to the population of Kirov region, other regions of the Russian Federation and citizens of foreign countries, and the in-patient department of the University clinic, which has a therapeutic, neurological, surgical department, anesthesiology and resuscitation department, medical rehabilitation department. The clinic has auxiliary departments: clinical diagnostic laboratory, an X-ray room, a computer tomography room, a functional diagnostics room, a physiotherapy room, an ultrasonic di-agnostics room, an endoscopy room. The clinic has 95 beds, of which 91 are 24-hour inpatient beds and 4 are day hospital beds.

The Rector is a member of the Board of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Kirov region. Employees of Kirov State Medical University have been appointed as chief freelance specialists of the region to manage the quality of medical care in various medical specialties. Teaching staff

of the University includes the chief freelance dentist specialist of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Kirov region and the Chairman of the board of the professional public association – Kirov Regional Public Organisation "Kirov Dental Association". The entire process of interaction with medical organisations is managed by the Project Office for the development of regional healthcare in accordance with the implementation of the University-region project. It consists of specialists from the ICE of Kirov State Medical University, the Department of Practical Training and Graduate Employment, the of Legal and Personnel Department of the Ministry of Healthcare of Kirov Region, Kirov Medical College, Kirov Regional Public Organisation "Association of Medical Workers of Kirov Region", training and methodological centre for the development of economical technologies and healthcare "Factory of Processes".

The main medical and demographic indicators in the region are monitored on a monthly basis. Action plans to improve the provision of medical care are regularly discussed at collegiums and meetings with leading specialists in the region. Based on the analysis of demographic indicators in the region, scientific programmes are developed to reduce mortality from socially significant diseases.

Kirov State Medical University, in cooperation with the health authorities of the constituent entities of the Russian Federation, develops continuing medical education, expands the number of residency specialties, and continues to train students and residents in professional communication skills, including while working in medical volunteer groups to prevent diseases and improve public health, reduce socially significant diseases and increase life expectancy of Russian citizens within the framework of the national projects "Healthcare" and "Demographics".

In accordance with the work plan and concluded agreements, the University Medical Council and the Project Office for the Development of Regional Healthcare analyses the results of providing medical care to the population and the implementation of the plan for introducing clinical recommendations into practical healthcare. Within the framework of the quadripartite cooperation agreement between Kirov State Medical University and the Ministry of Healthcare of Kirov region, regional departments of Roszdravnadzor and Territorial Compulsory Healthcare Insurance funds, an active information exchange of medical and demographic indicators is carried out.

Every year, together with the Ministry of Healthcare in the region, an analysis of medical staffing in urban hospitals and rural medical organisations is carried out. In connection with the existing needs of practical healthcare, it is necessary to develop training programmes for residents in specialties that are in short supply in the region and the Russian Federation, with the possibility of training at several levels according to the nomenclature of specialties and professional standards.

The University informs the public about the successes of the EP implementation through a systematically implemented information policy. To ensure the effectiveness of the University's information activity, all available channels and technologies are used: mass media, Internet, corporate edition of the newspaper "Doctor". Information about activities, events, news on the implementation of the programme is posted on the official website of the University in the Internet, in the official group VKontakte, Odnoklassniki, Telegram channel.

The work of the website is regulated by the Instruction on the order of placing and updating information on the official website of Kirov State Medical University (approved by the order of 27.04.2023 No. 218-OD). Every day the news feed of the university website provides up-to-date information about the ongoing activities.

The information policy is based on the principles of transparency, openness, public accessibility and is aimed at forming a positive image of the university.

Full information about the content of the MPEDP, conditions of its implementation is placed in a special section of the University website "Information about the educational organisation». The information in this section is updated within the terms established by the regulatory acts of the MSHE Russia.

Information on employment of graduates for the last 3 years is regularly published on the University website in the section "Information about the educational organisation"; on the page of

the department of practical training and employment of graduates; on the page of the department in the social network VKontakte.

Kirov State Medical University has the opportunity, in accordance with regulatory documents, to independently direct financial resources to achieve the final results of training. The amount of financing for the implementation of the educational program is determined in accordance with the standards established by the Government of the Russian Federation, taking into account the specifics of educational programs.

Kirov State Medical University makes incentive payments to teachers: for high achievements in scientific and methodological activities; for the presence of state, departmental and university awards and distinctions; based on the results of rating quality control of their activities.

Kirov State Medical University allocates funds to support students (financial assistance). The volume of financial resources spent on the remuneration of teachers is analyzed. Based on the results of the teachers' work, indicators are reviewed to determine an effective bonus system. It is planned to expand the indicators for evaluating the work of teachers in achieving the intended results in education if financial resources are available.

The analytical part

The management of the activities and interaction of the structural and collegial divisions of Kirov State Medical University is carried out in accordance with the University's Charter and organizational structure.

According to the Charter, Kirov State Medical University has the status of a federal state budgetary institution and receives funding to fulfill a state order. To conduct research and professional activities, graduates of the EP "Dentistry" can continue their studies in highly qualified personnel training programs: in residency, postgraduate studies.

Constructive interaction of the University with the healthcare sector is the basis for the successful functioning of the healthcare system in the region. Currently, the implementation of the provisions of the Decree of the President of the Russian Federation dated 07.05.2018 No. 204 "On National Goals and strategic objectives of the Development of the Russian Federation for the period up to 2024", which provides for the development and implementation of 12 National projects, which include the national projects "Healthcare" and "Demography".

Constructive interaction with the healthcare system and sectors of society in the implementation of the EP "Dentistry" is implemented by including the chief freelance dentist of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Kirov Region and the chairman of the Board of the professional public association - Kirov Dental Association among the full-time staff of the University.

The University is actively implementing the federal program "A new model of a medical organization providing primary health care "Lean polyclinic" in children's and adult polyclinics in the region. In connection with the introduction of lean technologies into medical organizations in the region, Kirov State Medical University has established a center for lean technologies (one of the first to receive state accreditation in the Russian Federation), which participates in this process, develops recommendations, evaluates the activities. Interaction between the University and the practice facilities is carried out in accordance with the Agreements on practical training of students concluded between the educational organization and the medical organization, which identify those responsible both on the part of the University and the side of the medical organization.

In order to continuously improve the level of competencies of students throughout their lives as a key factor in the formation of professional responsibility, the Institute of Continuing Additional Education operates at Kirov State Medical University.

Improvement of practical training system of medical and pharmaceutical specialists is achieved by high professionalism of the teaching staff, presence of a well-developed material and technical resources, modern educational technologies, high level of informatization, and practical orientation of the educational process.

Kirov State Medical University independently carries out financial and economic activities, its financial autonomy correlates with the principles of responsibility to society for the quality of

all professional training, research and service provision activities, with the effective disposal of funds and state property. The allocation of resources is implemented depending on the characteristics and needs of the EP, the specifics of the academic discipline, the conditions for conducting practical and laboratory classes, the need to attract standardized patients, etc. The current policy does not contradict the legislative acts of the Russian Federation, which ensures the institutional autonomy of Kirov State Medical University.

In the process of interviewing the teaching staff of Kirov State Medical University and the heads of departments, it was noted that the responsibility of the academic leadership in relation to the development and management of the educational program was determined.

During the conversation with the target groups, an answer was received from the interviewers that Kirov State Medical University periodically evaluates academic leadership regarding achievement of its mission and final learning outcomes.

According to the survey conducted during the EEC visit, 97.3% of respondents were satisfied with the degree of participation in managerial decision-making; 81.4% were fully satisfied with the recognition of success and achievements by the administration; 73.2% were satisfied with the support of suggestions and comments; 84.1% were satisfied with the activities of the University administration; 87.5% were fully satisfied with the terms of remuneration, 36.3% of respondents were partially satisfied.

74.3% of teaching staff are fully satisfied with the working conditions, list and quality of services provided at the University; 85.8% are satisfied with labor protection and safety; 69% of respondents are satisfied with the management of changes in the University's activities. 38.1% of teaching staff are fully satisfied with the provision of a social package (rest, sanatorium treatment, etc.); 62.2% are satisfied with the organization and quality of food at the University; 69% of respondents are satisfied with the organization and quality of medical care.

Strengths/best practices

Constructive interaction with the healthcare system and sectors of society and government related to health, in particular with the chief freelance dentist of the Ministry of Health of the Kirov region and Chairman of the Board of the professional public association – Kirov Regional Public Organisation "Kirov Dental Association".

Recommendations of the External Expert Commission:

No recommendations

The conclusions of the External Expert Commission according to the criteria:

- Strong-1
- Satisfactory – 12
- Requires improvement – 0
- Unsatisfactory – 0

6.9 Standard “Continuing innovations”

The evidentiary part

Kirov State Medical University is a dynamically developing and socially responsible educational organisation, which developed and implemented procedures for continuous monitoring and improvement of fundamental functioning processes.

The development program of the University for 2021-2030 was revised and adjusted as national goals in the field of healthcare and education changed, as well as the implementation of national projects “Demography”, “Education”, “Healthcare”. Since 2009, the University has implemented QMS as a guarantee of satisfaction with the quality of education. To develop, implement, maintain and improve the QMS in Kirov State Medical University, the Central Management Office of the QMS was created. In 2021 The University has passed a certification audit according to the requirements of the International Standard ISO 9001:2015. According to the

principles of the QMS, a register of QMS processes has been developed, each of which is regulated by an appropriate process information card. Fundamental activities in the process of the graduates` cycle include implementing higher education programs; educational activities at departments; organization and control of the educational process in the dean's office, the department of training highly qualified personnel; organisation and control of the educational process in the University; monitoring of graduate employment (main processes); personnel management (supporting process).

According to the documented Management Procedure, all process owners are required to monitor and measure the relevant process and submit an annual report on the functioning of the process, identifying deficiencies and areas for improvement. Documentation of inconsistencies and shortcomings in the work of departments and the faculty as a whole is carried out during internal and external audits of the QMS. Based on the results of the audits, in order to eliminate the causes of the identified inconsistencies and prevent their recurrence, departments and departments develop plans for corrective and preventive measures. According to the results of the calendar year, all departments, councils, commissions prepare reports on the results of the implementation of plans and processes at the Faculty of Dentistry. These results are analysed by ASO, the dean's office of the Faculty, and the top management of the University to make decisions for future periods, and are also reflected in the strategic development plans of the faculty and the University. Reports analysing the effectiveness of the processes are presented annually to the Academic Council of the University in the annual report of the rector.

The process of updating and improving the implementation of the program is based on the use of electronic information technologies, practice-oriented technologies of the educational process, improving the pedagogical process, improving the quality of teaching. Responsibility for the quality of training of specialists is assigned to the Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs, the Dean's Office of the Faculty of Dentistry, the Central Management Office of the QMS, ASO, the Academic Council of the Faculty of Dentistry, clinical departments.

Monitoring of the implementation of the educational program and its compliance with the requirements of professional standards is carried out on the basis of the results of the current, intermediate certification, state final examination; questionnaires of students, graduates, the results of their discussion at departments, commissions, councils. Students participate in the evaluation of the program. The process of updating the fields of activity is based on the continuous study of trends in development and innovation in the field of medical education, participation in conferences, the results of academic mobility of students and the teaching staff. The constant updating and improvement of all processes taking place in the program is based on a constant and detailed study of trends in development and innovation in medical education around the world.

The process of constant updating and improvement is carried out through the introduction of new learning technologies in connection with changing external conditions, as well as the use of modern technologies: interactive lectures, discussions, case-based learning, problem-oriented learning.

Monitoring of the implementation of educational programs and achievements is carried out on the basis of the results of academic performance, questionnaires, reports of departments and structural units.

Monitoring of the implementation of the educational program "Dentistry" and its compliance with the requirements of professional standards is carried out on the basis of the following results obtained: academic performance on current and midterm certification, final state examination; questionnaires of students and graduates; discussions at departments; reports of commissions, councils. Students participate in the evaluation of the program.

Monitoring the implementation of the main educational program includes: 1) self-examination procedure; 2) the internal audit procedure of the QMS; 3) surveys of the interested persons in order to identify requirements for learning outcomes; 4) analysis of the results of entrance control (testing, Unified State Examination); 5) feedback from employers; 6) the results of all types of practical training.

Documentation of inconsistencies and shortcomings in the work of departments and the faculty as a whole is carried out during internal and external audits of the QMS. Based on the results of the audits, in order to eliminate the causes of the identified inconsistencies and prevent their recurrence, the departments develop plans for corrective and preventive measures. According to the results of the academic year, all departments, councils, commissions prepare reports on the results of the implementation of plans and processes at the Faculty of Dentistry. These results are analysed by the Department of Education Quality and Monitoring, the dean's office of the Faculty, the top-management of Kirov State Medical University to make decisions for future periods, and are also reflected in the strategic development plans of the faculties and Kirov State Medical University as a whole.

For the University, the experience of teaching foreign students, familiarity with the organisation of the educational process in different countries make great significance, as well as the assessment of educational activities by expert groups with the participation of representatives.

The training of competitive specialists is based on the continuing introduction of modern innovative technologies, interdisciplinary approaches and principles of evidence-based medicine and pharmacy in teaching fundamental and clinical disciplines.

For the successful implementation of the educational program, it is necessary to provide sufficient departments, structural units of Kirov State Medical University involved in educational activities with material, technical, information resources (availability of classrooms, office equipment, equipment of classrooms, etc.), human resources.

The process of updating educational resources is carried out in accordance with changing needs, the development of research areas in medicine, innovative technologies for surgical intervention, treatment of many diseases, as well as socio-economic requirements of the labour market in the field of medical services, which involves updating the program, the introduction of new compulsory and elective disciplines, electives based on promising and their own research, global trends in the study of this area. The dynamic adjustment of educational resources is based on new trends in basic, clinical, behavioural, and social sciences, considering the level of mortality, health status in society, government assignments, the profile of specialists, and the correction of the inclusion of new knowledge contributes to improving socio-economic indicators of living standards in the country and in the world.

The educational process is organised with the use of modern technologies. Many classrooms are equipped with the devices necessary for video conferencing. Students have an access to extensive online library resources and international databases.

One of the important objectives of Kirov State Medical University in the near future is to establish compliance with international standards by integrating higher medical education, research and qualified clinical activities into the educational process; harmonising the traditions of the national medical school with international standards in the field of medical education.

The analytical part

After analysing the submitted documents and meeting with the participants of the focus groups, the members of the External Expert Commission came to the conclusion that Kirov State Medical University, as a dynamically developing and socially responsible organisation of higher medical education, initiates procedures for regular review and revision of the contents of the educational program "Dentistry", learning outcomes/competencies, assessment and learning environment. At the same time, it is necessary to carefully review the functions of structural and functional units and process maps, to document and eliminate deficiencies in the accredited educational program "Dentistry", considering the fact that resources for continuous innovations are constantly allocated to Kirov State Medical University.

Interaction with employers on the formation of professional competencies is an important area of activity for the adjustment of programs.

The educational programs of Kirov State Medical University are undergoing a process of updating in order to timely reflect the development of clinical, biomedical, social sciences, as well as the needs of the healthcare system and society, considering employers' recommendations and

requests. The university's documents reflect the results of monitoring and analysing the satisfaction of employers and graduates. The University responds quickly to recommendations from the interested persons.

Revision of changes in programs and technologies for teaching certain disciplines is carried out in an open manner, with the participation of the teaching staff, students, departments, faculty, councils of specialties, university top management.

The university adopted the practice of regular meetings of administrative and managerial staff, heads of faculties, teaching staff with students, with the purpose to discuss issues of the content of educational programs, the organisation of the educational process, university regulations on educational activities, issues of increasing the availability of library resources, the material and technical base of the university, infrastructure.

Interested persons are provided with the opportunity to contact the University administration via the electronic platform of the University on various issues, which provides effective feedbacks. On the basis of appeal letters, questionnaires, plans of corrective and preventive measures are being developed that contribute to the elimination of all identified inconsistencies and the prevention of problematic situations, which is especially important in a complex epidemiological situation around the world.

Educational programs of Kirov State Medical University meet the requirements of the development of medical and pharmaceutical education and make it possible to comply with the main mission of the university.

Due to the difficult epidemiological situation, advanced training programs on the prevention, diagnosis and treatment of COVID-19 coronavirus infection have been developed and implemented in senior courses of specialty programs for all residency programs and in the system of continuing medical education.”

Quality system audits are conducted annually in all areas of activity and in all structural units of Kirov State Medical University, evaluation of the results in program development, intermediate certification, assessment methods, achievements, and development of clinical competencies is given.

The main purpose of this activity is the monitoring of educational activities done by students/employers/graduates and teachers aimed at constant updating.

The content of the disciplines is reviewed and compiled considering the final goals aimed at the labour market, the latest achievements of science and practice, the use of their own scientific research, and the active involvement of students in the educational process.

When monitoring the internal situation, the mission, goals, structure, content of educational programs, teaching technologies in modern conditions, and the quality of the teaching staff are taken into account. The results of an internal independent assessment of the quality of educational programs and suggestions for improvement are discussed with all participants in the educational process. Self-examination of the University is conducted annually, evaluation of the quality of programs is carried out based on the results of the state final examination, reports of state examination commissions, primary and specialised accreditations, reports of departments, the faculty, councils, identification of strengths and weaknesses in the implementation of the program.

Strengths/best practices:

There are no strengths

Recommendations of the External Expert Commission:

There are no recommendations for this standard

The conclusions of the External Expert Commission according to the criteria:

- strong – 0
- satisfactory – 12
- requires improvement – 0
- unsatisfactory – 0

OVERVIEW OF STRENGTHS/BEST PRACTICES FOR EACH STANDARD

The standard “Mission and outcomes”

According to this standard, no strengths were identified.

The standard “Educational program”

According to this standard, no strengths were identified.

The standard “Assessment of students”

According to this standard, no strengths were identified.

The standard “Students”

According to this standard, no strengths were identified.

The standard “Academic staff / teachers”

According to this standard, no strengths were identified.

The standard “Educational resources”

The University authorities formulated and implemented a policy to strengthen the relationship between the results of scientific research and education, which consists in introducing the results of research on oral hygiene products into the educational process under contracts with the real sector of the economy.

The standard “Evaluation of the educational program”

According to this standard, no strengths were identified.

The standard “Management and Administration”

Constructive interaction with the healthcare system and sectors of society and government related to health, in particular with the chief freelance dentist of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Kirov region and the head of the Board of the professional public association – the Kirov Dental Association.

The standard “Continuous Innovations”

According to this standard, no strengths were identified.

OVERVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS FOR QUALITY IMPROVEMENT

Standard 1. “MISSION AND OUTCOMES”

1. The University management needs to more consistently bring to the attention of interested parties: faculty, students, and the health sector information about the procedure for developing and making changes to the University's Mission. The deadline is until 01.09.2024.

2. The management of the university, the head of the educational program “Dentistry” is recommended to ensure the participation of key people in the formulation of the Mission and expected learning outcomes. The deadline is until 01.09.2024.

3. The management of the university, the head of the educational program “Dentistry” is recommended to ensure that the stated Mission and expected learning outcomes are based on the opinions/suggestions of others, primarily students and employers. The deadline is until 01.09.2024.

Standard 2 “EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM”

Recommendations of the External Expert Commission

1. The head of the educational program “Dentistry” needs to strengthen the use of teaching and learning methods that stimulate, prepare and support students to take responsibility for the learning process. The deadline is 01.09.2025.

2. The university management needs to create a structure/committee responsible for the development and implementation of innovations in order to improve the effectiveness of the development, evaluation and revision of the educational program. The deadline is until 01.09.2025.

3. The management of the university, the head of the educational program “Dentistry” is recommended to ensure the representation of teaching staff, students, representatives from other interested parties, including representatives from clinical, industrial bases, University graduates, healthcare professionals involved in the learning process in the University committee responsible for the educational program. The deadline is until 01.09.2024.

Standard 3. “ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS”

1. The head of the educational program is recommended to regularly use and document a wide range of methods for evaluating students' academic achievements and formats, depending on their “usefulness assessment”, which includes a combination of validity, reliability, impact on learning, acceptability and effectiveness of assessment methods and format. The deadline is 01.09.2025.

2. The university management is recommended to ensure the openness of the assessment procedure and its results: documenting the process of evaluating students' academic achievements through the introduction of an electronic journal, accessibility and openness of student's academic achievements to all participants in the educational process. The deadline is until 01.04.2024.

3. The head of the educational program is recommended to provide for the possibility of adjusting the number and nature of exams in order to encourage students to acquire knowledge and implement integrated learning methods – 31.01.2025

Standard 4. “STUDENTS”

1. The management of the University is recommended to organise work to expand the representation of students studying in all subjects in the collegial bodies of the University. The deadline is until 31.01.2025.

Standard 5. “ACADEMIC STAFF/ TEACHERS”

There are no recommendations from the EEC.

Standard 6. “EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES”

There are no recommendations from the EEC.

Standard 7. “EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM”

There are no recommendations from the EEC.

Standard 8. “MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION”

There are no recommendations from the EEC.

Standard 9. “CONTINUOUS INNOVATIONS”

There are no recommendations from the EEC.

OVERVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE EDUCATIONAL INSTITUTION

There are no recommendations from the EEC.

RECOMMENDATION FOR THE ACCREDITATION COUNCIL

The external expert commission made a unanimous decision to recommend to the IAAR Accreditation Council to accredit the educational program of Kirov State Medical University of on 31.05.03 Dentistry (specialist's degree) for a period of 5 (five) years.



Appendix 1. Evaluation table «SPECIALISED PARAMETERS»

№	№	№ CRIT.	ASSESSMENT CRITERIA	Position of the EI			
				Strong	Satisfactory	Requires	Unsatisfactory
Standard 1. MISSION AND OUTCOMES							
1.1 Defining mission							
Educational institution must:							
1	1	1.1.1.	define mission of the EP and bring it to the notice of stakeholders and healthcare sector.			+	
2	2	1.1.2.	ensure that the mission of the EP reflects the goals and educational strategy, which contribute to training competent specialists at the level of higher education in the field of healthcare with an relevant foundation for further career in any field of healthcare, including all types of practice, administrative medicine and scientific research in healthcare; capable of fulfilling the role and functions of a specialist in accordance with the established requirements of the healthcare sector; prepared for postgraduate education and committed to lifelong learning		+		
3	3	1.1.3.	guarantee that the mission includes research in biomedical, clinical, pharmaceutical, behavioral and social sciences, aspects of global health and reflects major international issues of healthcare		+		
1.2 Institutional autonomy and academic freedom							
Educational institution must:							
4	4	1.2.1.	have institutional autonomy for developing and implementing a quality assurance policy, for which the administration and faculty are responsible, especially with regard to development of the curriculum and management of resources required for curriculum implementation.		+		
5	5	1.2.2.	provide academic freedom of staff and students for implementation of the educational program, ensure application of resources of new research for improving learning in certain courses\issues without EP extension		+		
1.3 Learning outcomes							
Educational institution must:							
6	6	1.3.1.	define expected learning outcomes which should be achieved by the students upon graduation, provide an opportunity to acquire basic knowledge and professional skills; relevant foundation for the future career in any field of healthcare; future positions in healthcare sector; further postgraduate education; commitment for lifelong learning; public needs and public health; requirements of the healthcare systems and other aspects of social responsibility		+		
7	7	1.3.2.	ensure proper behavior of students towards fellow students, teaching staff, hospital personnel, patients and their relatives		+		
8	8	1.3.3.	publish expected learning outcomes of the EP		+		
9	9	1.3.4.	define and coordinate the connection between learning outcomes expected at the moment of graduation with those required in postgraduate education		+		

10	10	1.3.5.	provide an opportunity for students to participate in research activities in the chosen area of healthcare		+			
11	11	1.3.6.	pay attention to expected learning outcomes connected to global health		+			
1.4 Participating in developing the mission and learning outcomes								
Educational institution must:								
12	12	1.4.1.	ensure participation of all major stakeholders in development of the mission and expected learning outcomes			+		
13	13	1.4.2.	ensure that the declared mission and expected learning outcomes are based on opinion/proposals of other stakeholders			+		
				<i>Total</i>	0	10	3	0
Standard 2. EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME								
2.1 Model of educational programme and learning methods								
Educational institution must:								
14	1	2.1.1.	define specifications of the EP, which includes declaring expected learning outcomes, curriculum based on module or spiral structure, qualification received upon completion of the programme		+			
15	2	2.1.2.	use teaching and learning methods which stimulate, prepare and support students for taking responsibility in the study process			+		
16	3	2.1.3.	guarantee that the EP is implemented according to the principle of equality		+			
17	4	2.1.4.	develop students' lifelong learning abilities		+			
2.2 Scientific method								
Educational institution must:								
18	5	2.2.1.	teach students to adopt the principles of scientific methodology, including methods of analytical and critical thinking; methods of research in healthcare and evidence-based medicine throughout the educational program		+			
19	6	2.2.2.	include results of modern scientific research into the EP		+			
2.3 Basic biomedical sciences								
Educational institution must:								
20	7	2.3.1.	define and include into the EP achievements of basic biomedical sciences for the formation of students' understanding of scientific knowledge, concepts and methods that are the basis for the acquisition and practical application of clinical scientific knowledge		+			
21	8	2.3.2.	make amendments to the EP considering achievements of biomedical sciences, reflecting scientific, technological, medical and pharmaceutical developments, current and future needs of society and healthcare system		+			
2.4 Behavioral and social sciences, medical/pharmaceutical ethics and jurisprudence								
Educational institution must:								
22	9	2.4.1.	define and include into the EP achievements of behavioral and social sciences, medical/pharmaceutical ethics and jurisprudence		+			
23	10	2.4.2.	make amendments to the EP considering achievements of behavioral and social sciences, medical/pharmaceutical ethics and jurisprudence, including modern scientific, technological, medical and pharmaceutical developments, current and future needs of society and healthcare system; changeable demographic and cultural context		+			
2.5 Clinical/pharmaceutical sciences and skills								
Educational institution must:								
24	11	2.5.1.	define and include into the EP achievements of clinical/pharmaceutical sciences and skills in order to guarantee that upon graduation students acquire relevant knowledge, clinical and professional skills for taking responsibility in further professional activities:		+			

25	12	2.5.2.	ensure that students spend a sufficient part of the programme in planned contacts with patients and service consumer in appropriate clinical/industrial settings and gain experience in health promotion and disease prevention		+		
26	13	2.5.3.	determine the amount of time devoted to studying the main clinical/specialized courses		+		
27	14	2.5.4.	organize educational process with appropriate attention to safety of the learning environment and patients, including monitoring the actions performed by the student in the clinical/production phases		+		
28	15	2.5.5.	make amendments to the EP considering modern scientific, technological, medical and pharmaceutical developments, current and future needs of society and healthcare system;		+		
29	16	2.5.6.	ensure that each student has early contact with real patients, service consumers, including their gradual participation in the provision of services and including responsibility: - in terms of examining and/or treating a patient under supervision, in appropriate clinical conditions; - in the procedures of sanitary and epidemiological supervision in terms of examination and/or inspection of the object under supervision, carried out in the relevant production facilities (centres of sanitary and epidemiological expertise, territorial departments of sanitary and epidemiological control, including transport, disinfection organizations and medical facilities); - in terms of advising the patient on the rational use of medicines, which is carried out in appropriate work environment		+		
30	17	2.5.7.	structure various components of training in clinical, hygienic skills for monitoring environmental and industrial factors and other production skills in accordance with a specific stage of the educational program.		+		
2.6 Structure of the educational program, content and duration							
Educational institution must:							
31	18	2.6.1.	describe the content, scope and sequence of courses/modules, including compliance with the appropriate ratio between basic biomedical, behavioral, social and clinical/specialized courses		+		
32	19	2.6.2.	ensure horizontal integration of interdisciplinary sciences and courses;		+		
33	20	2.6.3.	ensure vertical integration of clinical/specialized sciences with basic biomedical, behavioral and social sciences		+		
34	21	2.6.4.	provide elective content (electives) and determine the balance between mandatory and elective part of the EP		+		
35	22	2.6.5.	define interconnection between complimentary medicine, which includes non-traditional, traditional or alternative medical practice, occupational medicine, which includes aspects of environmental effect and effect of anthropogenic production load, social environment on human health		+		
2.7 Programme management							
Educational institution must:							
36	23	2.7.1.	establish procedures for development, approval and revision of the EP		+		
37	24	2.7.2.	establish a committee managed by the academic administration, responsible for planning and implementation of the EP for ensuring achievement of expected learning outcomes		+		
38	25	2.7.3.	to ensure representation of teaching staff, students, representatives from other stakeholders, including representatives from clinical, industrial facilities, graduates of the university, healthcare professionals involved in the learning process, in the university committee responsible for the OP.			+	

39	26	2.7.4.	plan and implement improvements in the EP through the responsible committee			+		
2.8 Association with medical/pharmaceutical practice and healthcare system								
Educational institution must:								
40	27	2.8.1.	ensure continuity between the EP and further stages of professional training or practical activity, which the student will begin upon graduation			+		
41	28	2.8.2.	improve the EP in compliance with the job conditions of the future graduates			+		
				<i>Total</i>	0	25	3	0
Standard 3. ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS								
3.1 Assessment methods								
Educational institution must:								
42	1	3.1.1.	identify and establish principles, methods and procedure of students' assessment, including the number of exams, criteria for setting passing scores, grades and the number of allowed retakes			+		
43	2	3.1.2.	ensure that assessment procedures cover knowledge, skills, attitudes and professional behavior			+		
44	3	3.1.3.	use a wide range of assessment methods and formats depending on their "utility assessment", including a combination of validity, reliability, impact on learning, acceptability and effectiveness of assessment methods and format				+	
45	4	3.1.4.	ensure that the assessment process and methods are open (accessible) for examination by external experts			+		
46	5	3.1.5.	ensure that assessment methods and results avoid conflicts of interest and use a system to appeal student assessment results			+		
47	6	3.1.6.	ensure openness of the assessment procedure and its results, inform students about the criteria and assessment procedures being used				+	
48	7	3.1.7.	provide the possibility for documenting and evaluating validity and reliability of assessment methods, as well as involvement of external examiners			+		
3.2 Correlation between assessment and learning								
Educational institution must:								
49	8	3.2.1.	use assessment principles, methods and procedures that are comparable to the expected learning outcomes, teaching and learning methods, guarantee achievement of expected learning outcomes, facilitate the study process, ensure an appropriate balance of formatted and final assessment for the area learning and making decision on academic performance			+		
50	9	3.2.2.	provide the possibility of adjusting the number and composition of exams in order to stimulate both knowledge acquisition and integrated learning				+	
51	10	3.2.3.	provide timely, specific, constructive and fair students feedback based on the assessment results			+		
				<i>Total</i>	0	7	3	0
Standard 4. STUDENTS								
4.1 Admission and selection policy								
Educational institution must:								
52	1	4.1.1.	define and implement an admission policy which is based on the principles of objectivity and includes a clear statement about the student selection process			+		
53	2	4.1.2.	have and implement policy and procedure of admitting individuals with disabilities			+		
54	3	4.1.3.	have and implement policy and procedure of transferring students from other educational institutions, including foreign ones			+		
55	4	4.1.4.	establish a link between the selection and the mission of the educational institution, the educational programme and the desired quality of graduates; periodically review the			+		

			admission policy				
56	5	4.1.5.	use the system of appealing decisions on the students' admission		+		
4.2 Admission of students							
Educational institution must:							
57	6	4.2.1.	determine the number of admitted students in accordance with the resources of the educational institution at all stages of the educational program		+		
58	7	4.2.2.	periodically regulate the number and range of admitted students, taking into consideration the views of stakeholders responsible for planning and developing human resources in the healthcare sector in order to meet healthcare needs of the population and society as a whole		+		
59	8	4.2.3.	provide the possibility for periodic review and regulation of the number and nature of admitted students, taking into consideration the opinion of other stakeholders in order to meet healthcare needs of the population and society as a whole		+		
4.3 Student counseling and support							
Educational institution must:							
60	9	4.3.1.	have a system of students' academic counseling		+		
61	10	4.3.2.	offer students a support programme aimed at social, financial and personal needs, assigning related resources and ensuring confidentiality of counseling and support		+		
62	11	4.3.3.	have a student feedback system to assess conditions and implementation of the educational process		+		
63	12	4.3.4.	provide students with documents confirming their qualifications (diploma) and diploma supplement (transcript)		+		
64	13	4.3.5.	take into account the needs of different students' groups and provide an opportunity to form an individual educational trajectory		+		
65	14	4.3.6.	provide academic counseling which is based on monitoring student academic performance and includes issues of professional orientation and career planning		+		
4.4 Student representative bodies							
Educational institution must:							
66	15	4.4.1.	develop and implement a policy of student representation and their appropriate participation in defining the mission, developing, managing and evaluating the educational program, and other issues related to students			+	
67	16	4.4.2.	provide an opportunity to encourage and assist student organizations in supporting student activities		+		
<i>Total</i>				0	15	1	0
Standard 5. ACADEMIC STAFF/TEACHING STAFF							
5.1 Recruitment and selection policy							
Educational institution must develop and implement staff selection and recruitment policy that:							
68	1	5.1.1.	defines their category, responsibility and balance of academic staff/teaching staff of basic biomedical sciences, behavioral and social sciences, and medical/pharmaceutical sciences for the adequate implementation of the EP, including a proper ratio between teachers of medical, non-medical, pharmaceutical profiles, teachers working full-time or part-time, as well as the balance between academic and non-academic staff		+		
69	2	5.1.2.	considers criteria of scientific, educational and clinical achievements, including relationship between teaching and research activities and "utility" functions		+		
70	3	5.1.3.	defines and monitors responsibility of the academic staff/teaching staff of basic biomedical sciences, behavioral and social sciences, clinical, hygienic, pharmaceutical sciences		+		

71	4	5.1.4.	defines and monitors responsibility of the academic staff/teaching staff of basic biomedical sciences, behavioral and social sciences, clinical, hygienic, pharmaceutical sciences		+			
5.2 Policy of staff functions and development								
Educational institution must develop and implement staff selection and recruitment policy that:								
72	5	5.2.1.	maintains a balance of opportunity between teaching, research and "utility" functions, ensures recognition of worthy academic activities with appropriate emphasis on teaching, research, and professional qualifications		+			
73	6	5.2.2.	ensures acquisition of sufficient knowledge by individual employees of the entire educational program, as well as training and advanced training of teachers, their development and assessment		+			
74	7	5.2.3.	provide the possibility to consider the "teacher-student" ratio depending on the various components of the educational program		+			
75	8	5.2.4.	staff career growth		+			
				<i>Total</i>	0	8	0	0
Standard 6. EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES								
6.1 Material and technical resources								
Educational institution must:								
76	1	6.1.1.	have sufficient amount of material and technical resources to ensure proper implementation of the educational program, as well as to create a safe learning environment for the staff, students, patients, and their relatives		+			
77	2	6.1.2.	improve the learning environment by regularly updating and expanding the material and technical resources to meet changes in educational sphere		+			
6.2 Resources for practical training								
Educational institution must:								
78	3	6.2.1.	provide the necessary resources to provide students with proper clinical practical experience, including: - quality and categories of patients and service consumers; - number of clinical/production facilities in various categories; - supervision of students		+			
79	4	6.2.2.	evaluate, adapt and improve conditions for clinical/practical training to meet the needs of the population		+			
6.3 Information technologies								
Educational institution must:								
80	5	6.3.1.	develop and implement policies aimed at effective and ethical use and evaluation of relevant information and communication technologies		+			
81	6	6.3.2.	provide access to websites and other mass communication media		+			
82	7	6.3.3.	provide teaching staff and students with access to sufficient patient data and healthcare information systems, using existing and relevant new information and communication technologies for self-tuition, access to informational databases of patients and dealing with healthcare information systems		+			
6.4 Research in medicine/pharmacy and scientific achievements								
Educational institution must:								
83	8	6.4.1.	use research activities and scientific achievements in the field of medicine and pharmacy as a foundation for the educational program		+			
84	9	6.4.2.	formulate and implement policies that strengthen the relationship between scientific research and education; provide information on research facilities and priority areas of scientific research in the educational institution		+			
85	10	6.4.3.	to provide coordination between scientific research and		+			

			education, which is taken into account in teaching process, encourages and prepares students to participate in scientific research in the field of healthcare					
6.5 Educational expertise								
Educational institution must:								
86	11	6.5.1.	have access to educational expertise of the educational process and issues of medical and pharmaceutical education with involvement of specialists, educational psychologists, sociologists at the university, interuniversity and international levels; develop and implement an expertise policy in the development, implementation, evaluation of the educational program, development of teaching and assessment methods		+			
87	12	6.5.2.	demonstrate evidence of using internal or external educational expertise in staff development, considering current experience in medical/pharmaceutical education and promoting the interests of staff in conducting research in education		+			
6.6 Educational exchange								
Educational institution must:								
88	13	6.6.1.	develop and implement a policy on domestic and international cooperation with other educational organizations, including staff and student mobility, as well as transfer of educational credits		+			
89	14	6.6.2.	facilitate participation of teaching staff and students in academic mobility programs within the country and abroad and manage resources required for these purposes		+			
				<i>Total</i>	1	13	0	0
Standard 7. ASSESSMENT OF EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME								
7.1 Programme monitoring and assessment mechanisms								
Educational institution must:								
90	1	7.1.1.	have regulated procedures for monitoring and periodic assessment of the educational program, learning outcomes, students' progress and academic performance		+			
91	2	7.1.2.	to develop and apply an educational programme assessment mechanism that examines the program, its main components, student performance, identifies and solves problems, ensuring that the relevant assessment results affect the educational program		+			
92	3	7.1.3.	periodically assess the educational program, examining all aspects of the educational process, components of the educational program, expected learning outcomes and social responsibility		+			
7.2 Teaching staff and student feedback								
Educational institution must:								
93	4	7.2.1.	systematically conduct, analyze and respond to feedback from teachers and students		+			
94	5	7.2.2.	use the feedback results to improve the educational program		+			
7.3 Students' academic achievements								
Educational institution must:								
95	6	7.3.1.	analyze academic performance of students and graduates in accordance with the mission and expected learning outcomes, educational programs and resource availability		+			
96	7	7.3.2.	analyze academic performance of students and graduates, with consideration to conditions of their previous education, level of preparation for university admission, use the results of the analysis to interact with the department responsible for selecting students, developing an educational program, advising students		+			
7.4 Involvement of stakeholders								
Educational institution must:								
97	8	7.4.1.	involve major stakeholders into monitoring and assessment of the educational program		+			

98	9	7.4.2.	provide stakeholders with access to the results of the programme assessment, collect and analyze feedback their feedback on medical practice of graduates and feedback on the educational program		+		
<i>Total</i>				0	9	0	0
Standard 8. MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION							
8.1. Management							
Educational institution must:							
99	1	8.1.1.	establish departments and their functions, including interrelations within the university		+		
100	2	8.1.2.	establish committees within the management structure, their responsibilities, and personnel which reflects representation of major and other stakeholders, ensuring transparency of work and decisions of the governance bodies		+		
8.2 Academic leadership							
Educational institution must:							
101	3	8.2.1.	describe responsibilities of the academic leadership in defining and managing the educational program		+		
102	4	8.2.2.	conduct periodic assessment of academic leadership regarding achievement of its mission and expected learning outcomes		+		
8.3 Budget for educational services and resources management							
Educational institution must:							
103	5	8.3.1.	have a clear allocation of responsibility and authority to provide resources for the educational program, including the target budget for education		+		
104	6	8.3.2.	provide resources required for implementation of the educational programme and allocate educational resources according to the needs		+		
105	7	8.3.3.	to provide a possibility for independent allocation of resources, including remuneration of teaching staff who duly achieve the expected learning outcomes, consider scientific achievements in healthcare and public health problems when allocating resources		+		
8.4 Administrative staff and management							
Educational institution must:							
106	8	8.4.1.	have administrative and professional staff to implement the educational programme and related activities, ensure proper management and allocation of resources		+		
107	9	8.4.2.	ensure participation of all departments of the educational institution in the processes and procedures of the internal quality assurance system		+		
8.5 Association with the healthcare sector							
Educational institution must:							
108	10	8.5.1.	cooperate with the healthcare system, health-related sectors of society and government, including foreign ones	+			
109	11	8.5.2.	give an official status to cooperation, including involvement of employees, students, and partners into the healthcare sector		+		
8.6 Public awareness							
Educational institution must:							
110	12	8.6.1.	publish complete and reliable information about the educational programme and its achievements on the official website of the educational institution and in the media		+		
111	13	8.6.2.	publish objective information on the employment and demand for graduates on the official website		+		
<i>Total</i>				1	12	0	0
Standard 9. CONTINUING INNOVATION							
Educational institution must:							
112	1	9.1.1.	as a dynamic and socially responsible organization, should initiate procedures for regular review and updating the process, structure, content, results/competencies, assessment and learning environment of the program, eliminate		+		

			documented deficiencies, allocate resources for continuous updating					
113	2	9.1.2.	base the innovation process on prospective research in the field of healthcare and on the results of its own study, assessment, and literature on medical/pharmaceutical education		+			
The educational organization must ensure that the process of innovation and restructuring leads to a review of policies and practices in accordance with previous experience, current activities, and prospects, and provide for the opportunity to address the following issues during the innovation process:								
114	3	9.1.3.	adapting the mission for the scientific, socio-economic, and cultural development of society		+			
115	4	9.1.4.	changes in the expected learning outcomes of graduates in accordance with the documented needs of the environment which they will be in, modification of learning outcomes in accordance with the documented needs of the postgraduate training environment, including clinical skills, training in public health and participation in the provision of medical care to patients in accordance with the responsibilities that are assigned to graduates after completing their education		+			
116	5	9.1.5.	adaptation of the EP model and teaching methods to ensure their adequacy and relevance		+			
117	6	9.1.6.	adjustments of EP elements and their interconnection in accordance with advances in biomedical, behavioural, social and clinical, hygienic, pharmaceutical sciences, with changes in the demographic situation and health status/morbidity structure of the population and socio-economic and cultural conditions, and the adjustment process will ensure inclusion of new relevant knowledge, concepts, methods, and exclusion of outdated ones		+			
118	7	9.1.7.	development of assessment principles, methods, and the number of exams in accordance with changes in the expected learning outcomes and teaching methods		+			
119	8	9.1.8.	adaptation of the student admission policy and methods of their selection, taking into account changing expectations and their circumstances, demand for personnel, changes in the pre-university education system and the requirements of the program		+			
120	9	9.1.9.	adapting recruitment policy and establishment of academic staff in accordance with changing needs		+			
121	10	9.1.10.	updating educational resources in accordance with changing needs, i.e. number of students enrolled, number and specialty of academic staff and the educational program		+			
122	11	9.1.11.	improving the process of monitoring and assessing of programmes		+			
123	12	9.1.12.	development of an organizational structure, as well as leadership and management, to cope with changing circumstances and needs and, over time, adapt to the interests of various stakeholder groups		+			
				<i>Total</i>	0	12	0	0
				Overall total	2	111	10	0