



«АККРЕДИТТЕУ ЖӘНЕ РЕЙТИНГТИҢ
ТӘУЕЛСІЗ АГЕНТТІГІ» КЕМ

НУ «НЕЗАВИСИМОЕ АГЕНТСТВО
АККРЕДИТАЦИИ И РЕЙТИНГА»

INDEPENDENT AGENCY FOR
ACCREDITATION AND RATING

REPORT

on the results of the external expert commission's assessment
of compliance with the requirements of the standards for international initial
accreditation of medical and pharmaceutical education programmes
(based on WFME/ AMSE/ ESG)

31.05.01 General Medicine (Specialist programme) (initial accreditation)

NATIONAL RESEARCH LOBACHEVSKY STATE UNIVERSITY OF
NIZHNY NOVGOROD

21 - 23 November 2023

INDEPENDENT AGENCY FOR ACCREDITATION AND RATING
External Expert Commission

To IAAR
Accreditation Council



REPORT

**on the results of the external expert commission's assessment
of compliance with the requirements of the standards for international initial accreditation
of medical and pharmaceutical education programmes
(based on WFME/ AMSE/ ESG)**

31.05.01 General Medicine (Specialist programme) (initial accreditation)

**NATIONAL RESEARCH LOBACHEVSKY STATE UNIVERSITY OF NIZHNY
NOVGOROD**

21 - 23 November 2023

Nizhny Novgorod, 2023

Contents

(I) LIST OF NOTATIONS AND ABBREVIATIONS	3
(II) INTRODUCTION	4
(III) PRESENTATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL INSTITUTION	4
(IV) DESCRIPTION OF THE EEC VISIT	6
(V) DESCRIPTION OF THE PREVIOUS ACCREDITATION PROCEDURE	6
(VI) COMPLIANCE WITH PROGRAMME ACCREDITATION STANDARDS	9
6.1. Standard "Mission and Outcomes"	9
6.2. Standard "Educational Programme"	12
6.3. Standard "Student Assessment Policy"	18
6.4. Standard "Students"	20
6.5. Standard "Academic Staff/Faculty"	24
6.6. Standard "Educational Resources"	27
6.7. Standard "Educational Programme Evaluation"	31
6.8. Standard "Governance and Administration"	34
(VII) OVERVIEW OF STRENGTHS/BEST PRACTICES FOR EACH STANDARD.....	37
(VIII) OVERVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS FOR QUALITY IMPROVEMENT.....	38
(IX) OVERVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE EDUCATIONAL INSTITUTION	40
(X) RECOMMENDATION TO THE ACCREDITATION COUNCIL	41
Annex 1: Evaluation Table "PROGRAMME PROFILE PARAMETERS".....	42
Annex 2. PROGRAMME OF VISIT TO THE EDUCATIONAL INSTITUTION	52
Annex 3. RESULTS OF THE FACULTY SURVEY	63
Annex 4: RESULTS OF THE STUDENT SURVEY.....	69

(I) LIST OF NOTATIONS AND ABBREVIATIONS

EEC - external expert commission

SFC - state final certification

C.u. - credit units

ICM - Institute of Clinical Medicine

IAAR - Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating

UNN - Federal State Autonomous Educational Institution of Higher Education "National Research Lobachevsky State University of Nizhny Novgorod"

EI - educational institution

USE - unified state examination

EP - educational programme

FSES HE - Federal State Educational Standard of Higher Education

ELS - electronic library system

ECTS - European Credit Transfer System

ESG - Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area

QF-EHEA - Qualifications Framework in the European Higher Education Area

WFME - World Federation for Medical Education

(II) INTRODUCTION

In accordance with order No. 158-23-OD dated 02.10.2023 of the Independent Accreditation and Rating Agency, the External Expert Commission from 21 to 23 November 2023 assessed the compliance of the educational programme 31.05.01 General Medicine (Specialist programme) (initial accreditation) of the National Research Lobachevsky State University of Nizhny Novgorod with the standards for international initial accreditation of basic medical and pharmaceutical education programmes (based on WFME/ AMSE/ ESG) (No. 150-22-OD dated 21 December 2022, third edition).

The report of the External Expert Commission (EEC) contains the assessment of the educational programme presented according to the IAAR criteria, recommendations of the EEC on further improvement of the educational programme and parameters of the educational programme profile.

External Expert Commission members:

1) **Chairperson of IAAR Commission** - Raushan Sultanovna Dosmagambetova, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Medical University of Karaganda (Republic of Kazakhstan) *Off-line participation*

2) **IAAR Expert** - Irina Nikolaevna Moroz, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Belarusian State Medical University (Republic of Belarus) *Off-line participation*

3) **IAAR Expert** - Elena Alexandrovna Kiseleva, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department of General Practice Dentistry, Medical Institute of the Federal State Budgetary Educational Institution of Higher Education "Kemerovo State University", Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation, (Russian Federation) *On-line participation*

4) **IAAR Expert** - Marina Alexandrovna Skiba, Candidate of Pedagogical Sciences, Associate Professor, Chairperson of the IAAR Expert Council, 1st category expert (Astana, Kazakhstan) *Off-line participation*

5) **IAAR Expert, employer** - Polina Vladimirovna Shits, Medicine Plus LLC, Russian Federation (Russian Federation) *On-line participation*

6) **IAAR Expert, student** - Maria Alexeevna Starshenkova, 4th year student of Information Systems and Technologies, Ulyanovsk State Technical University (Russian Federation) *On-line participation*

7) **IAAR Expert, student** - Oksana Mikhailovna Anisimova, 5th year student of the Institute of Clinical Medicine, Samara State Medical University (Russian Federation) *On-line participation*

8) **IAAR Coordinator** - Malika Akhyadovna Saydulaeva, Project Manager, Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating (Republic of Kazakhstan) *Off-line participation*

(III) PRESENTATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL INSTITUTION

Federal State Autonomous Educational Institution of Higher Education "National Research Lobachevsky State University of Nizhny Novgorod", abbreviated names: National Research Lobachevsky State University of Nizhny Novgorod; Lobachevsky State University of Nizhny Novgorod; Lobachevsky University; UNN. The UNN was founded on 30 January (17 January old style) 1916. It became one of the three People's Universities of Russia and the first higher education institution in Nizhny Novgorod. In 1918, after merging with the Polytechnic Faculty evacuated from Warsaw and the Higher Agricultural Courses, the university received the status of a state university (the first Soviet university).

In 1956, the University was named after the great Russian mathematician Nikolai Lobachevsky.

UNN is one of Russia's leading universities and according to the QS World University Rankings is among the world's top 700 universities. Today Lobachevsky University has 20 institutes and faculties, 6 research institutes. More than 200 doctors of science, including 19 full members and

corresponding members of the Russian Academy of Sciences, and about 1000 candidates of science are engaged in research and teaching at the University.

The educational activities of UNN are carried out in accordance with the licence No. L035-00115-52/00096943 issued by the Federal Service for Supervision in Education and Science dated 26.12.2016 (open-ended).

The educational programme "General Medicine" (Specialist programme) is implemented at the Institute of Clinical Medicine (Director - Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor Natalia Yurievna Grigorieva), which includes: Department of Educational Work, clinical departments, University Clinic, Higher School of Rehabilitation and Human Health, Accreditation and Simulation Centre (<https://icm.unn.ru/o-fakultete/>).

The main departments, where the educational programme (EP) 31.05.01 General Medicine is delivered, include: the Department of Internal Medicine, the Department of Multidisciplinary Clinical Training, the Department of Surgical Diseases, the Department of Adaptive Physical Education, the Department of Neurology and Medical Rehabilitation. The departments are headed by 5 doctors of sciences.

The departments of the Institute of Clinical Medicine (ICM) involved in the delivery of the EP "General Medicine" have the resource potential providing for the implementation of this educational activity (interview, self-assessment report): staffing - 193 teaching staff, including 26 doctors and 92 candidates of sciences, 8 teaching staff with the academic title of "Professor" and 28 with the academic title of "Associate Professor". The proportion of faculty members with higher academic degrees involved in the EP "General Medicine" is almost 61%.

The staff of the ICM Department of Internal Medicine consists of 68 teaching staff members, including 12 doctors and 28 candidates of sciences, 1 faculty member with the academic title of "Professor" and 15 with the academic title of "Associate Professor". The proportion of the teaching staff involved in the implementation of the EP "General Medicine" who have higher academic degrees is almost 59%. 49 external part-time teaching staff, highly qualified employees of healthcare institutions take part in the educational process (interviews, documents).

There is an established infrastructure, including academic buildings equipped with modern technical facilities, the University Clinic (the dental department is a training base for students of the EP "Dentistry"), the Accreditation and Simulation Centre and 15 clinical bases of healthcare institutions of the Nizhny Novgorod region, which have concluded agreements with UNN on practical training of students (<http://www.unn.ru/site/sveden/objects>).

The educational programme "General Medicine" was opened in 2019. The duration of the EP "General Medicine" is 6 years (12 semesters), 360 ECTS credits. The form of study is full-time. In the academic year 2024/2025, the first graduation from this educational programme is expected.

To be admitted for the study in the EP "General Medicine", one must have secondary general, secondary vocational education or higher education. At present, 994 students are studying in the EP "General Medicine", including 259 Russian-speaking and 735 English-speaking students. Graduates of the programme "General Medicine" have the opportunity of employment in medical organisations in the position of a district therapist; they can continue their studies in clinical residency, postgraduate programmes or receive additional professional education.

So far, no analysis of the employment of students has been conducted, as their graduation from the programme "General Medicine" will take place in 2024/2025 academic year. It should be noted that Lobachevsky University has a Career Centre - a structural unit that promotes the employment of graduates and their adaptation to the labour market, and the resources of the Career Centre will also be used to analyse the career development of the EP "General Medicine" graduates.

UNN carries out its international activities in the following areas: education of foreign citizens, cooperation with educational and scientific medical institutions and organisations, in particular by arranging international academic exchanges of faculty members and students, organising and conducting international forums, conferences, scientific research and other forms of cooperation. More than 130 higher education institutions from 38 countries of the world are the partners of UNN. At present, academic mobility programmes with more than 60 foreign universities have been

developed on the basis of direct contractual relations. Academic mobility is implemented in the form of exchange of students and teaching staff, internships, participation in conferences and congresses. Currently, more than 900 students from 50 countries (Algeria, Egypt, Turkmenistan, Turkey, Uzbekistan, Ecuador, Iran, Iraq, Colombia, Syria, Ghana, India, etc.) are studying at ICM under the programmes "General Medicine" and "Dentistry". However, ICM practically does not use the opportunities of UNN agreements with its partners to implement various forms of academic mobility in the course of the EP "General Medicine" (interview).

As part of the EP "General Medicine", one research project "Predictors of early vascular ageing in patients with myocardial infarction without previous coronary history" is implemented at ICM (self-assessment report, interviews) (Table 1). In this situation, it is necessary to intensify the work of ICM on concluding or implementing international and national agreements on cooperation with universities and research organisations in the field of education and research in order to expand the possibility of faculty members and students to participate in joint educational and research projects, as well as to benefit from the academic mobility of faculty members and students.

Table 1: Main research areas

Name of research projects, programmes	Customer and source of funding	Name of principal investigator	Due date	Collaborating organisations	Number of publications in the country	Publications in foreign countries	Number of inventor's certificates / pre-patents
Predictors of early vascular ageing in patients with myocardial infarction without previous coronary history	Priority 2030	N.Yu. Grigorieva	28.12.2023	-	1	2	-

In the list of research activities, there are no projects, scientific programmes, or grants for R&D carried out at ICM jointly with foreign partners.

No commercialisation of R&D technology has been reported for the EP 31.05.01 General Medicine under accreditation.

(IV) DESCRIPTION OF THE PREVIOUS ACCREDITATION PROCEDURE

International accreditation of the EP 31.05.01 General Medicine (Specialist programme) (initial accreditation) according to IAAR standards is conducted for the first time.

(V) DESCRIPTION OF THE EEC VISIT

The EEC carried out its work according to the approved Programme of the expert commission visit for programme accreditation of the educational programme at UNN during the period from 21 to 23 November 2023.

To coordinate the work of the EEC, an introductory meeting was held on 17.11.2023, during which the responsibilities were distributed among the members of the commission, the schedule of the visit was updated, and agreement was reached on the choice of expert assessment methods.

To obtain objective information about the quality of educational programmes and the overall infrastructure of the university, to clarify the content of self-assessment reports, meetings were held with the Rector, Vice-Rectors of the university in charge of relevant activities, heads of structural units, directors of institutes, heads of departments, faculty members, and students. A total of 71 representatives took part in the meetings (Table 1).

Table 1 - Information about employees and students who took part in meetings with the IAAR EEC:

Category of participants	Number
Rector	1
Vice-Rectors	9
Heads of structural units	10
Directors of institutes	2
Heads of departments	9
Teaching staff members	15
Students	25
Graduates *	
Employers *	
Total	71

Note:* graduates and employers did not take part in the meetings with the IAAR EEC due to the fact that there has been no graduation of students in the EP "General Medicine" and the EP "Dentistry".

During their tour, the members of the EEC got acquainted with the state of ICM facilities, visited two academic buildings (the Centre for Innovation Development and academic building 1), where the Department of Educational Work and IMC departments, the University Clinic (dental department), the Accreditation and Simulation Centre, and the library are located.

Library support of the educational process meets the requirements of the Federal State Educational Standard of Higher Education (FSES HE). It is in the form of printed or electronic resources, which can be accessed both by visiting the library and through the personal account of faculty members and students. The printed collection amounts to 1500 thousand storage units, including 650 000 educational (650 000 scientific) units, including 4850 dissertations. Electronic resources include electronic libraries (<http://www.lib.unn.ru/ebs.html>), in particular "eLIBRARY.RU", "YURAYT", "Lan", "Student's Consultant", "Doctor's Consultant", "Znanium.com" and "University Library Online"; as well as periodicals (<http://www.lib.unn.ru/onlineaccess.html>). Access to electronic resources is provided by the UNN Internet network both on the University territory and beyond (to get access to resources outside the UNN network, one should apply to the Research Department of the Fundamental Library (nmo@lib.unn.ru)). The library has electronic resources to support the implementation of the EP at ICM, which include electronic publications in electronic library systems (ELS) of UNN and foreign electronic resources (Table 2, Table 3).

Table 2. - Provision of electronic editions in electronic library systems for the EP "General Medicine" and the EP "Dentistry"

Description	ELS "Student's Consultant"	ELS "Doctor's Consultant"	ELS "Znanium"	ELS "Lan"	ELS "YURAYT"
-------------	----------------------------------	---------------------------------	------------------	-----------	-----------------

31.05.01 "General Medicine" (Specialist programme)

Number of books	600	60	965	392	569
		31.05.03 "Dentistry" (Specialist programme)			
Number of books	320	100	262	275	510

Table 3. - Provision of e-books on foreign resources ("SpringerLink", "EBSCO", "Bentham")

Description	MEDICAL, Medicine	Internal Medicine General Medicine	Dentistry	COMPUTERS, Computer Science
SpringerLink	236 950	1261	231	22 836
EBSCO ***	506	12	10	383
Bentham Science Publishers	357	14	11	41

At the meeting of the IAAR EEC with the UNN target groups, the mechanisms for implementing the university policy were clarified and individual data presented in the EP self-assessment report were specified.

In the course of their work, the EEC members visited the following practical training bases: State Budgetary Healthcare Institution of the Nizhny Novgorod region "City Clinical Hospital No. 5" (Nizhny Novgorod, 34 Nesterov St.), ICM University Clinic (Nizhny Novgorod, 25 Gagarin Ave., Bldg. 1, Centre for Innovation Development).

During the visit to the City Clinical Hospital No. 5, it was established that this healthcare institution is a multidisciplinary hospital with a capacity of 550 beds and is headed by its Chief Medical Officer N.V. Rodin. The City Clinical Hospital No. 5 comprises: neurological department, cardiological department, rheumatological department, therapeutic department, surgical department, anaesthesiology and intensive care department, cardiovascular surgery department, thoracic surgery department, etc., where various types of medical care are provided. The hospital has modern equipment that allows students to learn practical skills during practical classes and on-the-job training.

The Department of Internal Diseases has the resources to conduct educational activities (a lecture hall, classrooms), has access to patients in the wards of the City Clinical Hospital No. 5, where students of the EP "General Medicine" study the disciplines "Hospital Therapy", "Intermediate Level Therapy and Occupational Diseases". The interview with the Chief Medical Officer N.V. Rodin testifies to the joint activity of the hospital staff and faculty members of the departments in implementing the EP "General Medicine".

For the period of accreditation, some changes were made in the class attendance. The EEC members attended a practical class on the topic "Tachyarrhythmia and emergency care for it" ("Hospital Therapy" discipline). The class was conducted by A.K. Subbotin (lecturer of the Department of Internal Diseases) in group No. 451964_a2 (5th year) at the ICM Accreditation and Simulation Centre. The topic was taught by the lecturer's demonstration of emergency care using a simulator robot and providing comments. During the class the students practised this skill on the simulator robot under the lecturer's supervision.

A practical lesson on the topic "Bekhterev's disease" (academic discipline "Intermediate Level Therapy and Occupational Diseases") was also visited. It was conducted by E.M. Yashina, a lecturer of the Department of Internal Diseases, for a group of 4th year students at the City Clinical Hospital No. 5. The topic "Bekhterev's disease" was studied by demonstration of a clinical case (at the "patient's bedside"), accompanied by the lecturer's comments. Oral questioning with the use of a laptop computer was used during the classes. However, the oral questioning consisted of the lecturer's presentation of the material with group comments from the students. The student receives an individual assessment of his/her mastering of the topic at the end of the class based on test control. In the course of observing the educational process, no use of modern educational technologies was demonstrated. It should also be noted that when developing the EP, it is desirable to use terminology in accordance with the International Classification of Diseases, 10th revision, which is adopted in the

Russian Federation. The International Classification of Diseases, 10th revision, uses the term "Ankylosing spondylitis" (ICD-10 Classes: Spondylopathies (M45-M49), instead of the term "Bekhterev's disease". The use of international terminology in the development of the EP is consistent with the requirements of the IAAR accreditation standards.

Interviews with heads of departments and teaching staff show their lack of awareness of modern educational technologies for teaching (Problem-Based Learning, Team-Based Learning, Case-Based Learning, Research-Based Learning).

In accordance with the accreditation procedure, a questionnaire survey of 56 teaching staff members was conducted, among them the share of teaching staff of the Institute of Clinical Medicine involved in the EP "General Medicine" and the EP "Dentistry" was 35.7%. 256 students took part in the survey, among them the share of students enrolled in the programme "General Medicine" was 39.8%.

To verify the information presented in the Self-Assessment Report, the external experts requested and analysed the University's working documentation. Along with this, the experts studied the University's Internet positioning through the University's official website <http://www.unn.ru/>.

As part of the scheduled activities, the recommendations developed by the EEC based on the results of the expert review for improving the UNN's educational programmes being accredited were presented at the meeting with the management on 23.11.2023.

(VI) COMPLIANCE WITH PROGRAMME ACCREDITATION STANDARDS

6.1. Standard "Mission and Outcomes"

- *Defining the mission*

The educational institution should:

- ✓ *define the mission of the EP and communicate it to stakeholders and the healthcare sector.*
- ✓ *reflect in the mission statement of the EP the objectives and educational strategy to train a competent professional at the higher education level in healthcare with an appropriate foundation for a future career in any area of healthcare, including all types of practice, administrative medicine and research in healthcare; capable of fulfilling the roles and functions of a professional in accordance with the established requirements of the healthcare sector; prepared for post-graduate education and committed to training and education in the healthcare sector.*
- ✓ *ensure that the mission incorporates research achievements in the biomedical, clinical, pharmaceutical, behavioural and social sciences, aspects of global health and reflects major international public health issues.*

- *Institutional autonomy and academic freedom*

The educational institution should:

- ✓ *have the institutional autonomy to develop and implement a quality assurance policy for which the administration and teachers are responsible, especially with regard to the design of the educational programme and the allocation of resources required to implement the educational programme.*
- ✓ *provide academic freedom for staff and learners to pursue the educational programme and to use the results of new research to enhance the study of specific disciplines/issues without extending the EP.*

- *Learning outcomes*

The educational institution should:

- ✓ *identify the expected learning outcomes that students should achieve at the end of their studies in relation to achievements at the basic level in terms of knowledge, skills and professional attitudes; an appropriate foundation for a future career in any area of the healthcare sector; future roles in the healthcare sector; further postgraduate training; commitment to lifelong learning; community health needs, healthcare system needs and other aspects of social responsibility.*
- ✓ *ensure appropriate behaviour of students towards fellow students, teachers, medical staff, patients and their relatives*
- ✓ *publish the expected learning outcomes of the EP*
- ✓ *identify and coordinate the link between the learning outcomes required on completion and those required in postgraduate training*
- ✓ *provide opportunities for students to participate in research in the relevant healthcare field*
- ✓ *pay attention to the expected learning outcomes related to global health*

- *Participation in the formulation of mission and learning outcomes*

The educational institution should:

- ✓ *ensure the participation of key stakeholders in the formulation of the mission statement and expected learning outcomes*
- ✓ *ensure that the stated mission and expected learning outcomes are based on the opinions/suggestions of other stakeholders*

Evidence-based part

The educational programme 31.05.01 "General Medicine" is implemented at ICM in accordance with the Federal State Educational Standard of Higher Education in the corresponding field of study (specialty), the Charter of the Federal State Autonomous Educational Institution of Higher Education "National Research Lobachevsky State University of Nizhny Novgorod" (UNN), the "Regulations on the Procedure for the Development and Approval of Main Professional Educational Programmes of Higher Education at UNN" (new edition), approved by the order of the UNN Rector dated 09.03.2021 No.98-09 (decision of the UNN Academic Council, Minutes of 11.02.2021 No.2) and other local regulations of UNN.

The UNN Mission has been developed and posted on the University's website (<http://www.unn.ru/site/about/ofitsialnye-svedeniya-i-dokumenty/missiya-universiteta>, report). In order to implement the Mission, the priority areas of UNN development have been defined, which are set out in the "Development Strategy of the National Research Lobachevsky State University of Nizhny Novgorod (Lobachevsky University) until 2030" (Approved by the decision of the UNN Academic Council dated 16 June 2021, <http://www.unn.ru/site/about/ofitsialnye-svedeniya-i-dokumenty/strategiya-2030>) and the Quality Policy (self-assessment report).

The Mission of the EP 31.05.01 General Medicine has been developed and is presented in the structure of the "Main professional educational programme of higher education", which is approved by the decision of the UNN Academic Council (Minutes No. 6 of 26.06.2019; Minutes No. 13 of 30.11.2022), which is posted on the website. At the same time, the analysis of the content of the UNN Mission and the Mission of the EP "General Medicine" according to the data of the self-assessment report, interviews and examination of documents (<http://www.unn.ru/site/about/ofitsialnye-svedeniya-i-dokumenty/missiya-universiteta>, "Main professional educational programme of higher education" "General Medicine" (EP) is approved by the decision of the UNN Academic Council (Minutes No. 6 of 26.06.2019; Minutes No. 13 of 30.11.2022) shows that they need to be revised.

The procedure for the development and adoption of the EP Mission is presented in the structure of the "Main professional educational programme of higher education", which is approved by the decision of the UNN Academic Council (Minutes No. 6 of 26.06.2019; Minutes No. 13 of 30.11.2022). It is posted on the website and includes setting up a working group (UNN Vice-Rectors, administrators of ICM, heads of departments, associate professors of clinical departments, residents, students, employers); conducting a survey of the local community, healthcare representatives, students; discussion at the departmental meeting, at the Academic Council of ICM, at the meeting of the UNN Academic Council with the participation of stakeholders (faculty members, students, representatives of practical healthcare, employers). Changes in the mission and the content of the EP are introduced as necessary, taking into account modern achievements in science (self-assessment report, interviews).

Institutional autonomy of the UNN ICM makes it possible to independently develop the educational programme within the framework of compliance with the requirements of the Federal State Educational Standard (FSES HE) approved by the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of Russia dated 12.08.2020 No. 988 and/or educational standards of UNN, to conduct personnel recruitment and evaluation, resource allocation, including decent remuneration of faculty; to implement a system of incentives for teaching staff and students, which is in accordance with the requirements of the IAAR accreditation standards.

The EP is designed by a working group consisting of the Head of the EP appointed by the UNN order and faculty members of the ICM graduate departments, in accordance with the "Regulations on

the procedure for the development and approval of main professional educational programmes of higher education at UNN (new edition), approved by the order of the UNN Rector dated 09.03.2021 No. 98-09 (decision of the UNN Academic Council, Minutes of 11.02.2021 No. 2). It is examined at the meeting of the Curriculum Council and the Academic Council of ICM and approved at the meeting of the UNN Academic Council.

In developing the EP "General Medicine", ICM has sufficient autonomy to choose the number of biomedical, behavioural, clinical disciplines, to include elective disciplines, types of practical training, i.e. to ensure their compliance with national and international requirements to the maximum extent. At the same time, it should be noted that students' academic freedom regarding the shaping of their individual learning paths is limited due to their low awareness of the procedure for choosing elective disciplines (according to the interview data), and the possibility of their participation in the development of the EP is also limited due to the scarce representation of students in collegial governing bodies (UNN Academic Council), and due to the lack of their representation in the Academic Council of ICM, which does not meet the requirements of the IAAR accreditation standards (interviews, documents). The UNN Regulations "On the procedure for the development and approval of main professional educational programmes of higher education at UNN (new edition)" (Order of 09.03.2021 No. 98-OD) does not provide for the participation of students in the development and adoption of educational programmes. The right of students to participate in shaping the content of their professional education is realised through the UNN Student Council and students' participation in the work of the UNN Academic Council.

The interviews of the teaching staff and students failed to show how the academic freedom to use the results of new research for improving the study of specific disciplines in the course of the EP (without its extension) is ensured. The procedure for implementing the results of scientific research in the educational process has not been described.

The implementation of the programme ensures the development of universal, general professional and professional competencies. Universal and general professional competencies comply with the Federal State Standard of Higher Education in the speciality 31.05.01 General Medicine. Professional competencies correspond to the Professional Standard "Medical doctor (district therapist)". These competencies form the basis for career development of graduates, their continued education at the postgraduate level and lifelong professional development.

UNN guarantees that students fulfil all obligations towards doctors, faculty members, patients and their relatives in accordance with proper standards of behaviour, according to the laws of the Russian Federation, and UNN Internal Regulations (http://www.unn.ru/sveden/files/docs/local-norm-akts/2022/461-OD_01.09.2022.pdf).

Analytical part

The analysis of the content of the UNN Mission and the Mission of the EP "General Medicine" according to the data of the self-assessment report, interviews and study of documents (<http://www.unn.ru/site/about/ofitsialnye-svedeniya-i-dokumenty/missiya-universiteta>, "Main professional educational programme of higher education" "General Medicine" (EP), approved by the decision of the UNN Academic Council (Minutes No. 6 of 26.06.2019; Minutes No. 13 of 30.11.2022) shows that these documents need to be revised. The wording of the UNN Mission and the Mission of the EP "General Medicine" is cumbersome and difficult to understand, which does not meet the criteria of the IAAR accreditation standards and requires improvement. Interviews with faculty and students showed that they have no idea and do not understand what the Mission of UNN and the Mission of the EP "General Medicine" are, which is largely due to the lack of a systems approach in the development and discussion of the UNN Mission and the EP Mission, low awareness of these processes, and the difficulty of search on the website of the EP Mission.

ICM has sufficient autonomy in developing the EP "General Medicine". At the same time, it is noted that students' academic freedom regarding the possibility of their participation in the development of the EP is limited due to the scarce representation of students in collegial governing

bodies (there is only one student in the UNN Academic Council and there are no students in the ICM Academic Council), which does not meet the requirements of the IAAR accreditation standards. The local documents of UNN and ICM do not envisage or limit the participation of students in the work of collegial bodies, the interaction with them is carried out through the Student Council. The UNN Regulations "On the procedure for the development and approval of main professional educational programmes of higher education at UNN (new edition)" approved by the order of 09.03.2021 No. 98-OD do not provide for the participation of students in the development and adoption of educational programmes.

It is noted that students' academic freedom regarding the shaping of their individual learning paths is limited due to their low awareness of the procedure for choosing elective disciplines (according to the interview data), which does not meet the criteria of the IAAR Standard.

The work on ensuring the academic freedom of employees and students to use the results of new research for improving the study of specific disciplines when implementing the EP (without its extension) is not efficiently organised at ICM, which does not meet the criteria of the IAAR Standard.

Strengths/best practices:

No strengths have been identified for this standard.

EEC Recommendations:

1. It is recommended to the Head of ICM, and the Head of the EP to revise the Mission of the EP "General Medicine", making sure that it is available on the ICM website. Deadline: September 2024.

2. It is recommended to the Head of ICM:

2.1. to make additions and amendments to the local documents of ICM to expand the academic freedom of students regarding the possibility of their participation in the development of the EP "General Medicine";

2.2. to include students in the collegial bodies of ICM (ICM Academic Council). Deadline: September 2024.

3. It is recommended that the Head of ICM and the Head of the EP should ensure the implementation of activities aimed at developing students' individual learning paths, raising their awareness of the procedure for choosing elective disciplines. Deadline: September 2024, thereafter, on a permanent basis.

4. It is recommended that the Head of ICM and the Head of the EP make the teaching staff and students aware of the best practice of using the results of new research for improving the study of specific disciplines when implementing the EP (without extending it) in order to expand their academic freedom. Deadline: September 2024, thereafter, on a permanent basis.

EEC conclusions based on the criteria:

strengths — 0

satisfactory — 11

need improvement — 2

unsatisfactory — 0

6.2. Standard "Educational Programme"

• *Educational programme model and teaching methods*

The educational institution should:

✓ *define the specifications of the EP, including a statement of expected learning outcomes, a curriculum based on a modular or spiral structure, the qualification to be awarded*

✓ *use teaching and learning methods that stimulate, prepare and support students to take responsibility for the learning process*

✓ ensure that the EP is implemented in accordance with the principles of equality.

✓ develop students' capacities for lifelong learning

- Scientific method

The educational institution should:

✓ impart to students throughout the programme of study the principles of scientific methodology, including methods of analytical and critical thinking; methods of research in healthcare and evidence-based medicine

✓ provide for the possibility to include in the content of the programme the results of modern scientific research.

- Basic biomedical sciences

The educational institution should:

- identify and include in the EP the achievements of basic biomedical sciences to develop in students an understanding of scientific knowledge, concepts and methods that are the basis for the acquisition and application in practice of clinical scientific knowledge.

- provide mechanisms for revision and updating of the EP taking into account the achievements of biomedical sciences, which reflect scientific, technological, medical and pharmaceutical developments, current and expected needs of the society and healthcare system.

✓ Behavioural, social sciences and medical/pharmaceutical ethics

The educational institution should:

✓ identify and incorporate advances in behavioural sciences, social sciences, medical/pharmaceutical ethics and jurisprudence into the EP

✓ provide mechanisms for revising and updating the EP to reflect advances in behavioural and social sciences, medical/pharmaceutical ethics and jurisprudence, including current scientific, technological and medical and pharmaceutical developments, current and anticipated societal and healthcare system needs; changing demographic and cultural contexts

- Clinical/pharmaceutical sciences and skills

The educational institution should:

✓ identify and incorporate advances in clinical/pharmaceutical sciences into the EP to ensure that students on completion of the programme have acquired sufficient knowledge, clinical and professional skills to take appropriate responsibility in subsequent professional practice;

✓ ensure that students spend a sufficient proportion of the programme in planned contact with patients, service users in appropriate clinical/workplace settings and gain experience in health promotion and disease prevention.

✓ determine the amount of time dedicated to the core clinical/professional disciplines

✓ organise training with appropriate attention to the safety of the learning environment and patients, including observation of the student's actions in clinical/workplace settings.

✓ provide the opportunity to modify the EP, taking into account advances in scientific, technological, medical and pharmaceutical developments, current and anticipated societal and healthcare system needs.

✓ ensure that each student has early contact with real patients, service users, including his/her gradual involvement in the provision of services and incorporating his/her responsibility:

- in relation to the examination and/or treatment of the patient under supervision in an appropriate clinical setting;

- in sanitary and epidemiological surveillance procedures in relation to the examination and/or inspection of the facility under supervision, which is carried out in appropriate operational units (sanitary and epidemiological control centres, territorial departments of sanitary and epidemiological control, including transport, disinfection organisations and healthcare institutions);

- in relation to patient counselling on the rational use of medicines, which is carried out under appropriate workplace conditions

✓ structure the various components of training in clinical, environmental and occupational health monitoring and other workplace skills according to the specific stage of the training programme.

- Educational programme structure, content and duration

The educational institution should:

✓ describe the content, scope and sequence of disciplines/modules, including maintaining an appropriate balance between basic biomedical, behavioural, social and clinical/professional disciplines

✓ provide for horizontal integration of related sciences and disciplines;

✓ provide for vertical integration of clinical/professional sciences with the basic biomedical and behavioural and social sciences

✓ provide the option of elective content (electives) and determine the balance between the compulsory and elective parts of the programme.

✓ determine the interrelation with complementary medicine, including non-traditional, traditional or alternative practices, occupational medicine, including aspects of the impact of the environment and anthropogenic production loads, as well as social situation on the population's health.

- Programme management

The educational institution should:

- ✓ *determine the procedures for the development, approval and revision of the EP*
- ✓ *designate a committee, under the direction of academic management, responsible for planning and implementing the EP to ensure that the expected learning outcomes are achieved.*
- ✓ *ensure representation of academic staff, students, representatives from other stakeholders, including representatives from clinical and work bases, healthcare professionals involved in the process of training in the committee of the educational institution in charge of the EP.*
- ✓ *provide for the possibility to plan and implement innovations in the EP through the committee in charge of the EP.*

- *Linkage with medical/pharmaceutical practice and the healthcare system*

The educational institution should:

- ✓ *ensure continuity between the EP and the subsequent stages of professional training or practice that the student will undertake upon graduation*
- ✓ *take into account the specific conditions in which graduates will be working and modify the EP accordingly.*

Evidence-based part

The educational programme "General Medicine" has been developed on the basis of the Federal State Educational Standard of Higher Education approved by Order No. 988 of the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Russian Federation dated 12.08.2020. The EP "General Medicine" is posted on the official website of UNN in the section "Information about the programmes being implemented" (<http://www.unn.ru/sveden/education/edu-op.php>).

The structure of the EP "General Medicine" includes a matrix of competencies, curriculum, calendar study schedule, working programmes of disciplines (modules), practical training, as well as assessment tools and teaching materials.

The overall workload of the educational programme is 360 credit units (c.u.). The structure of the EP corresponds to the Federal State Standard of Higher Education in the speciality "General Medicine" (Specialist level) and comprises three blocks. Block 1 consists of disciplines of the compulsory part (288 c.u. in total) and disciplines of the part of the programme formed by the participants of educational relations (36 c.u.). Block 2 comprises practical training, including research work (33 c.u.). Block 3 is the state final certification (3 c.u.). The duration of the programme is 6 years (60 c.u./year).

The development of the programme and control over its implementation is carried out by the Head of ICM and the Head of the EP "General Medicine". The EP "General Medicine" is annually updated in terms of the list of disciplines (modules) established in the curriculum, and/or the content of the working programmes of disciplines (modules), working programmes of practical training, instructional materials supporting the implementation of appropriate educational technology, taking into account the development of science, medicine, healthcare, the social sphere and the economy, focusing on the expectations of consumers. Recently, the educational programme "General Medicine" has been supplemented with the disciplines "Evidence-based medicine", "Therapeutic exercise", "Medical law", etc. (Minutes of the Presidium of the UNN Academic Council of 14.12.2021 No. 4; Minutes of the UNN Academic Council of 31.05.2023 No. 6).

The EP "General Medicine" is delivered with the use of traditional and modular learning systems, which represent a sequence of studying the disciplines. In the report, the modular system is presented in the form of cycle classes (disciplines) in senior years (4-6). Starting from the 4th year, students can shape an individual EP with a choice of elective disciplines. It should be noted that the EP is not an integrated model of learning based on disciplines, organ systems, clinical problems and diseases, built on a modular or spiral design (interview).

At UNN ICM, both traditional methods (lectures, practical and seminar classes) and modern methods (case method, portfolio, work on simulators) are used, including the methods based on the principles of andragogical learning. The educational programme includes various types of practical training to ensure practice-oriented learning.

The interview shows the teaching staff's unawareness about modern educational technologies (Problem-Based Learning (PBL); Team-Based Learning (TBL); Case-Based Learning (CBL);

Research-Based Learning (RBL). However, in clinical departments, Case-Based Learning (CBL) with case-based tasks is used.

The EP "General Medicine" envisages independent work of students, which along with modern teaching methods helps to encourage students to take responsibility for their learning process. One of the forms of independent work is the creation of an electronic portfolio in the personal account, which allows students to develop the skill of self-assessment and analysis of their progress and prepares the future doctor for lifelong learning. However, the interview with faculty members and students reveals a low level of their awareness of teaching and learning methods that stimulate, support and prepare students to take responsibility for their learning process, which does not meet the requirements of the IAAR Standard.

The educational programme is implemented in accordance with the principle of equality, which is ensured by equal treatment of all students and staff of UNN ICM and non-discrimination on the grounds of religion, ethnicity, gender, sexual orientation, physical ability and social status.

The work aimed at forming and developing students' scientific thinking, principles of scientific methodology, involvement of students in scientific research at all stages of studying the programme is carried out at ICM.

There are student research circles in ophthalmology, pharmacology, psychiatry, internal medicine, dentistry, however, the priority of their activity is not conducting scientific research, but reviewing clinical and summing up the results of practical training. Inadequate involvement of students in scientific research is due to the lack of research projects at ICM. Within the framework of the EP "General Medicine", one research project "Predictors of early vascular ageing in patients with myocardial infarction without previous coronary history" (self-assessment report data, interviews) is implemented at ICM (Table 4).

Table 4. - Information on students' participation in research studies

Name of scientific projects/research	Participation of students (number)	Articles published (number)	Participation in conferences/pre presentations (number)
Predictors of early vascular ageing in patients with myocardial infarction without previous coronary history	3	4	2

The main basic disciplines are studied in semesters 1-8. Working programmes of biomedical disciplines are developed taking into account the integration with clinical disciplines both vertically and horizontally, starting from the first year of study.

The EP includes disciplines reflecting the achievements in the field of behavioural, social sciences, medical ethics, medical law, which are necessary for understanding the socio-economic, demographic and cultural determinants of the causes, prevalence and consequences of health problems, knowledge of the national healthcare system and patient's rights: "History of Russia", "History of Medicine" and "Bioethics" (1st year), "Life Safety" (3rd year), "Medical Law" (5th year), "Public Health and Healthcare" (6th year). Social sciences are delivered from 1st to 6th year in parallel with the main biomedical disciplines.

Linkage with medical practice and healthcare system. During the study of clinical disciplines, great attention is paid to the development of competencies in accordance with the Professional Standards, clinical skills are developed taking into account the current national clinical recommendations and standards of treatment.

Clinical training of students in the EP "General Medicine" provides for early contact of the students with the patients: introductory practical training (1st year); practical training (assistant to nursing staff) (1st year), practical training for obtaining professional skills and experience of

professional work in nursing staff positions (2nd year). At the UNN ICM, the competency-oriented principle of EP design is realised, which aims at developing generic and professional competencies. The volume and content of the EP disciplines ensures that the declared competencies can be developed.

The UNN ICM has an accreditation and simulation centre, which facilitates the development of practical and clinical skills of students while ensuring the safety of patients; there are contracts with 15 clinical bases, which provide the necessary contact of students with patients of different profiles in the academic process and during practical training (6 types), in order to achieve the goal of the educational programme "General Medicine".

Programme Management. ICM has defined the structure and officials responsible for organising the development and implementation of the EP "General Medicine":

- at the level of ICM - Head of ICM, Head of the EP, ICM Academic Council,
- at the level of UNN - UNN Academic Council, Department of Educational Programmes.

The educational programme is developed, approved and implemented in accordance with external and internal organisational, regulatory, administrative and procedural documents ("Regulations on the procedure for the development and approval of main professional educational programmes of higher education at UNN (new edition), approved by the order of the UNN Rector dated 09.03.2021 No. 98-09 (decision of the UNN Academic Council, minutes of 11.02.2021 No.2; "Guidelines for the development of curricula of the main educational programmes of higher education (Bachelor's, Specialist, Master's, residency programmes, forming the register of educational programmes, and preparation of educational documentation for the 2024-2025 academic year (UNN order dated 16.11.2023 No. 06.49-05-1309/23).

The EP is developed by a working group consisting of the Head of the EP appointed by the UNN order, and faculty members of the ICM graduating departments. It is considered at the meeting of the ICM Academic Council and Curriculum Council and is approved at the meeting of the UNN Academic Council. Optimisation of the EP is carried out on the basis of questionnaire surveys of students, faculty members, and practical training supervisors at healthcare institutions. The students' opinion on the EP quality is accounted for through interaction with the UNN Student Council.

ICM conducts training both at pre-graduate and residency level, as well as advanced training of doctors, which makes it possible not only to prepare graduates for practical work in accordance with the level of their qualification, but also to integrate educational programmes of pre-graduate and post-graduate level.

Analytical part

The educational programme "General Medicine" has been developed on the basis of the Federal State Educational Standard of Higher Education approved by Order No. 988 of the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Russian Federation dated 12.08.2020.

Upon reviewing the report and the documents, as well as after the interviews, it was found that ICM needs to organise training for faculty members to raise their awareness of the educational programme, which includes an integrated learning model based on disciplines, organ systems, clinical problems and diseases, built using a modular or spiral design; teaching and learning methods to develop students' responsibility for their learning process; to ensure that training in teaching methods based on modern adult learning theory is organised and implemented in educational activities.

ICM has provided conditions for observing the principles of equality in relation to students regardless of their gender, ethnicity, religion, sexual orientation, socio-economic status and physical abilities.

The structure, content and duration of the EP ensures a balance between basic biomedical, behavioural, social and clinical disciplines. However, the EP does not provide sufficient horizontal (related sciences and disciplines) and vertical (clinical sciences with basic biomedical, behavioural and social sciences) integration (interview).

The structure of the programme provides for the choice of elective and optional disciplines.

However, the interview with students showed their low awareness of the availability of elective disciplines and the procedure to choose them.

ICM has defined the structure and officials responsible for organising the development and implementation of the EP "General Medicine", including the Head of the ICM, the Head of the EP, the ICM Academic Council, the UNN Academic Council, the Department of Educational Programmes. The documents regulating the development of the EP have been worked out. Optimisation of the EP is carried out on the basis of questionnaire surveys of students, faculty members, and practical training supervisors at healthcare institutions. The opinion of graduates, members of the State Examination Commission and employers has not been taken into account for the reason that the first graduation of the EP "General Medicine" is to take place in the academic year 2024/2025. However, there is a lack of student representation in the ICM Academic Council and insignificant representation of students in the UNN Academic Council (1 person) that makes a decision on the approval of the EP (<http://www.unn.ru/site/about/rukovodstvo-i-struktura-universiteta/uchenyj-sovet>).

The research environment and educational resources of UNN provide the opportunities to implement the EP "General Medicine" (Institute of Biology and Biomedicine, Institute of Information Technology, Mathematics and Mechanics). However, ICM does not fully utilise the resources for developing students' scientific thinking, principles of scientific methodology, involvement of students in research at all stages of studying within the EP. In the framework of the EP "General Medicine", one research project is implemented at ICM, there is a low awareness of the teaching staff and students about the scientific methodology of research, low activity of students in research (interview and report data, Table 4), which does not meet the requirements of the IAAR standard.

This situation also does not allow to fully implement research-based learning (RBL), which is based on the active participation of students in research projects and is aimed to develop research, problem solving, search and creative competencies. The enhancement of the research base of ICM will make it possible to expand the research component in the educational programmes by means of individual research projects carried out by students in the classroom and as part of their independent work, and their active involvement in the research conducted at ICM.

The interview with the teaching staff and students has demonstrated their insufficient awareness of the mechanisms for revision and updating of the EP "General Medicine" with due regard to the achievements of biomedical and social sciences, medical/pharmaceutical ethics and jurisprudence, reflecting developments in science, technology, medicine and pharmacy, and the needs of modern society.

ICM is in the process of forming a link between the EP and subsequent stages of professional training by providing opportunities for training in residency and additional professional programmes. It is planned to monitor the employment of graduates who will complete their studies in 2025, and the level of satisfaction with the quality of their training by employers. The Career Centre is functioning at UNN, which expands its activities on employment of graduates every year, including career guidance events, master classes, job fairs, etc.

Strengths/best practices:

No strengths have been identified for this standard.

EEC Recommendations:

1. It is recommended that the UNN management, Head of the ICM, Head of the UNN Department of Educational Programmes, Head of the EP should organise:

- training of the teaching staff aimed at increasing their awareness of the educational programme, including an integrated learning model based on disciplines, organ systems, clinical problems and diseases, using a modular or spiral design; teaching and learning methods to develop students' responsibility for their learning process. Deadline: September 2024, thereafter on a

permanent basis.

- training in teaching methods based on modern adult learning theory and their implementation in educational activities. Deadline: September 2024, thereafter on a permanent basis.

2. It is recommended that Head of the ICM, Head of the EP, Head of the UNN Department of Educational Programmes should make the teaching staff aware of the best practices of EP development, which ensures the horizontal and vertical integration of academic disciplines. Deadline: September-December 2024.

3. It is recommended that Head of the ICM, Head of the EP, Head of the UNN Department of Educational Programmes ensure that the students are informed about the elective disciplines and the procedure for their selection. Deadline: June 2024, thereafter on a permanent basis.

4. It is recommended that the UNN management, Head of the ICM expand the representation of students in the collegial bodies responsible for the development and approval of the EP. Deadline: September 2024, thereafter on a permanent basis.

5. It is recommended that the UNN management considers the possibility of allocating resources to improve the ICM research base, which will ensure the implementation of research-based learning (RBL). Deadline: December 2024.

6. It is recommended that Head of the ICM should elaborate an action plan for developing ICM research activities, including an increase in the number of research projects (grants) implemented at ICM within the framework of the EP "General Medicine". Deadline: June 2024.

7. It is recommended that Head of the ICM together with Head of the UNN Department of Educational Programmes should:

7.1. familiarise the teaching staff and students with the mechanisms of revision and updating of the EP taking into account the achievements of biomedical and social sciences, medical/pharmaceutical ethics and jurisprudence, reflecting the developments in science, technology, medicine and pharmacology, the needs of modern society;

7.2. make provisions for incorporating the results of modern scientific research into the EP "General Medicine". Deadline: June 2024, thereafter on a permanent basis.

8. It is recommended that Head of the ICM should develop an action plan to increase the number of students participating in research and development. Deadline: June 2024.

EEC conclusions based on the criteria:

strengths — 0

satisfactory — 19

need improvement — 9

unsatisfactory — 0

6.3. Standard "Student Assessment Policy"

● *Assessment methods*

The educational institution should:

✓ *define and approve the principles, methods and practices used to assess students, including the number of examinations, criteria for determining pass marks, grades and the number of retakes allowed;*

✓ *ensure that assessment procedures cover knowledge, skills, attitudes and professional behaviour*

✓ *use a wide range of assessment methods and formats according to their "usefulness rating", which includes a combination of validity, reliability, impact on learning, acceptability and effectiveness of the assessment methods and format.*

✓ *provide for the possibility of ensuring that the assessment process and methods are subject to the review of external experts*

✓ *demonstrate readiness to ensure that assessment methods and results avoid conflicts of interest and use an appeal system for student assessment results*

✓ *provide for the possibility of ensuring an open assessment procedure and its results, informing students of the assessment criteria and procedures used*

✓ provide for the possibility of documenting and assessing the reliability and validity of assessment methods, as well as the involvement of external examiners.

- Relationship between assessment and learning

The educational institution should:

✓ use assessment principles, methods and practices that are comparable to the expected learning outcomes and teaching and learning methods, ensure achievement of the intended learning outcomes, support student learning, and provide an appropriate balance of formative and summative assessment to guide learning and make judgements about academic performance

✓ provide for the possibility of adjusting the number and type of examinations to stimulate both knowledge acquisition and integrated learning

✓ provide timely, specific, constructive and fair feedback to students on assessment results

Evidence-based part

The policy of student assessment at ICM is defined in the "Regulations on the ongoing academic performance monitoring and interim certification of students", which specifies the modalities of quality control over the educational programmes at UNN, including the forms, assessment system and grading criteria, the frequency and procedure of ongoing monitoring of performance and interim certification, the procedure for setting the time frame for passing the relevant tests by students who have not passed interim certification for a valid reason or who have academic arrears. The Regulations are approved by the decision of the Academic Council, put into effect by the Rector's order, posted on the UNN official website and thus brought to the attention of all interested parties.

The following assessment levels are applied at UNN: ongoing assessment (in practical and summative classes); interim certification (exams and tests at the end of studying disciplines), state final certification. The assessment system uses a seven-point scale. The expected learning outcomes and methods for assessing students' achievements are presented in the working programmes of disciplines and are available to students. Assessment of theoretical knowledge is carried out in the traditional way. Assessment of practical skills is conducted traditionally ("at the patient's bedside") and on phantoms ("simulator robots") in the Accreditation and Simulation Centre.

Individual achievements of students are recorded in their portfolios on the basis of the results of interim certification, which are entered by the examiner into the electronic register (<https://journal.unn.ru>), using the resource Electronic Register, and which are further reflected in the student's personal account (<https://portal.unn.ru> "Learning Process"-"Student's Record Book").

UNN has developed the Regulations on Independent Assessment of Education Quality, regulating the issues of internal and external control of students' knowledge, as well as the availability of their practical clinical skills. The information obtained during the internal independent assessment of the education quality is collected and processed by the units engaged in educational activities (ICM and the UNN Office for Quality, Expertise and Educational Process Monitoring).

Analytical part

The assessment policy at ICM is defined in the "Regulations on the ongoing monitoring of academic performance and interim certification of students", which determines the conditions for the quality control over the educational programmes at UNN.

The analysis of documents and interviews with faculty members and students have revealed that ICM does not make full use of a wide range of assessment methods and formats depending on their "usefulness assessment", including a combination of validity, reliability, impact on learning, acceptability and effectiveness of assessment methods and assessment format, nor does it ensure that assessment procedures encompass knowledge, skills, attitudes and professional behaviour.

Faculty members and students are not properly aware of modern assessment methods. Modern assessment methods, in particular objective structured clinical examination, are not used in the assessment of practical skills in the Accreditation and Simulation Centre, which is not consistent with the requirements of the IAAR standard. No information was presented of the introduction of new assessment methods depending on the need, the use of assessment methods and formats depending

on their "assessment of usefulness".

A rather low awareness of faculty members was noted with regard to the procedure for determining the validity of content and of assessment methods relevance; with regard to assessment principles, methods and practices that are comparable to the intended learning outcomes and teaching and learning methods, provide an appropriate balance of formative and summative assessment to guide learning and make decisions about academic performance.

Students' individual achievements are recorded in the student's personal account (<https://portal.unn.ru> "Learning Process"- "Student's Record Book"), which is included in the portfolio and reflected in the academic rating throughout the entire period of study on the UNN portal in the Internet.

A system for appealing of assessment results, regulated by the UNN Rector's order, has been established.

Strengths/best practices:

No strengths have been identified for this standard.

EEC Recommendations:

1. It is recommended that Head of the ICM, Head of the EP, Head of the UNN Educational Programmes Department, Head of the UNN Office for Quality, Expertise and Educational Process Monitoring organise training of the teaching staff in modern assessment methods (including the use of a regular methodological seminar). Deadline: June 2024, thereafter on a permanent basis.

2. It is recommended that Head of the ICM, Head of the EP, Head of the UNN Educational Programmes Department, Head of the UNN Office for Quality, Expertise and Educational Process Monitoring introduce assessment methods and formats depending on their "usefulness assessment", which ensure reliability, validity, impact on learning, possibility to assess their effectiveness. Deadline: during the 2024/2025 academic year, thereafter on a permanent basis.

3. It is recommended that Head of the ICM, Head of the EP, Head of the UNN Educational Programmes Department, Head of the UNN Office for Quality, Expertise and Educational Process Monitoring adjust the content, form and methods of assessment for interim and final certification with the use of OSCE in order to stimulate knowledge acquisition and ensure integrated learning. Deadline: during the 2024/2025 academic year, thereafter on a permanent basis.

EEC conclusions based on the criteria:

strengths — 0

satisfactory — 6

need improvement — 4

unsatisfactory — 0

6.4. Standard "Students".

● *Admission and selection policy*

The educational institution should:

✓ *have an admission policy and implement admission practices that are based on principles of objectivity and include a clear statement about the process of selecting students*

✓ *have a policy and implement practices for the admission of persons with disabilities.*

✓ *have a policy and implement a practice of transferring students from other educational organisations, including foreign ones.*

✓ *establish a connection between selection and the mission of the educational institution, the educational programme and the desired quality of graduates; periodically review the admission policy*

✓ *demonstrate readiness to use an appeal system for admission decisions*

● *Student intake*

The educational institution should:

- ✓ *determine the number of students admitted in accordance with the capacity of the educational institution at all stages of the educational programme*
- ✓ *demonstrate readiness to periodically adjust the size and nature of student intake, taking into account the views of stakeholders responsible for planning and developing human resources in the healthcare sector to meet the medical needs of community and society*
- ✓ *provide for the possibility of periodically reviewing the size and nature of student intake in consultation with other stakeholders and adjusting the numbers to meet the health needs of community and society*
- **Counselling and support for students**
The educational institution should:
 - ✓ *demonstrate the potential for using a system of academic counselling for students*
 - ✓ *demonstrate readiness to offer students a programme of support to address social, financial and personal needs, allocating appropriate resources and ensuring confidentiality of counselling and support*
 - ✓ *demonstrate readiness to use the system of feedback with students on the assessment of conditions and organisation of the educational process*
 - ✓ *demonstrate readiness to provide students with documents confirming the obtained qualification (diploma) and diploma supplement (transcript)*
 - ✓ *provide the opportunity to take into account the needs of different groups of students and provide opportunities for shaping an individual educational pathway*
 - ✓ *demonstrate readiness to provide academic counselling, which is based on monitoring the progress of the student and includes issues of professional guidance and career planning*
- **Student representation**
The educational institution should:
 - ✓ *have a policy and implement practices for the representation of students and their appropriate participation in the definition of the mission, and in the development, management and evaluation of the educational programme and other matters relating to students*
 - ✓ *provide for opportunities to encourage, facilitate and support student activities and student organisations.*

Evidence-based part

Admission to study at UNN under the programme "General Medicine" is performed by the Admissions Office in accordance with the legislation of the Russian Federation and with the annual admission rules developed by the University, which are based on the principles of objectivity and include the regulations on the process of student selection (http://www.unn.ru/sveden/files/docs/priem/2023/Pravila_priema.pdf).

The rules of admission to the EP "General Medicine", information on all documents, contacts, information on admission tests, including programmes and samples of tasks, passing scores, number of places, tuition fees are posted on the page of the Admissions Office on the UNN website. Documents for admission can be submitted in person and remotely (through the website priem.unn.ru, or through the website of Gosuslugi); an applicant's personal account is also opened, which is used to provide consultations and information on admission.

All staff providing counselling services work within the framework of the Personal Data Protection Law acting on the principles of confidentiality in compliance with ethical standards.

To enable interactive communication with applicants, an electronic admissions office (<http://www.unn.ru/site/education/informatsiya-priemnoj-komissii>) is available. To assess the procedures related to admission to UNN, an anonymous and voluntary survey of applicants is carried out.

Entrance tests are conducted in person or in a remote format. Entrance test programmes are available on the UNN official website on the Admissions Office page (<http://www.unn.ru/site/education/informatsiya-priemnoj-komissii>) in the section "Information and Documents for Admission" under the tab "Entrance Tests. Programmes. Samples of tasks".

The Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Russian Federation in coordination with the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation determines the intake number of students. The Ministry of Health also allocates a quota of target admission and approves the list of persons who are admitted without entrance examinations. Student recruitment is organised taking into account UNN's facilities and human resources.

Competitive selection for the study in the EP "General Medicine" is carried out collegially on the basis of the aggregate competition score, which is composed of the scores of entrance examinations that are regulated at the state level, and scores for the entrant's individual achievements (UNN Regulations on accounting of individual achievements based on the regulations on admission <http://www.unn.ru/site/education/informatsiya-priemnoj-komissii>).

UNN implements a policy for admission of persons with disabilities and special needs and has created a barrier-free environment.

Appeals are considered by the Appeals Commission, which is established by the order of the UNN Rector for the period of entrance examinations. The Appeals Commission consists of the Chairperson, Deputy Chairperson and the most experienced members of the examination commissions. The review of examination materials is conducted in the presence of the members of the relevant examination commission under the guidance of the commission chairperson or his/her deputy. The entrant has the right to be present during the review of the appeal. A minor entrant (a person under 18 years of age) has the right to be accompanied by one of his/her parents or legal representatives, except for minors recognised by law as fully capable before reaching the age of majority. After consideration of the appeal, the appeals commission decides whether or not to change the assessment of the entrance test results.

UNN provides transfer of students from other educational institutions. In order to consider the transfer, a student must submit an application for transfer, as well as a certificate confirming the period of study under the relevant educational programme and other documents confirming individual achievements. In case of transfer, an application should be submitted to the multifunctional centre of the Department of Educational Process Organization. Students participating in bilateral and multilateral exchange programmes may be given credit for courses studied at another HEI, including foreign HEIs. In case there is a difference between curricula at UNN and another educational institution, an individual study plan is formed to study in the programme.

UNN has established a system of support and guidance for students, which covers the main issues they may encounter during their studies. Information about financial, academic and psychological support programmes is communicated to students through the student union committee and the UNN website. The following centres are functioning: the Centre for Social and Psychological Support, which aims to maintain students' psychological health and prevent social maladaptations; the UNN Career Centre (provides solutions to employment and career development issues); the UNN Student Squads Headquarters (supports student youth initiatives and their inclusion in volunteer activities); the Student Multifunctional Centre (provides technological and administrative support of the students' learning process, including obtaining certificates, in particular, about studying at UNN, references, transcripts from student record books, copies of UNN licences, study agreements, etc.). Students are provided with academic counselling based on the monitoring of students' academic performance and including issues of professional guidance and career planning; a system of mentoring is also in place.

To provide incentives and financial support to students, the University pays scholarships: state academic scholarships, state social scholarships, including enhanced state academic scholarships for achievements in academic, research, social, cultural, creative and sports activities (http://www.unn.ru/sveden/files/docs/soc-podderzhka/2022/03_02_22_45OP.pdf). The procedure for distributing the scholarship funds by types of scholarships is determined by the University taking into account the opinion of the students' local trade union organisation, as well as the UNN Student Council (http://www.unn.ru/sveden/files/docs/soc-podderzhka/2022/11_05_22_214OD.pdf).

There are some facilities that provide health protection of students: health centre, recreational camp "Zarya", ski base, stadium, sports halls, swimming pool "Dolphin" is available for rent. UNN has created an accessible environment for the disabled and for individuals with special needs, which includes special technical equipment with teaching aids for collective and individual use.

At UNN, the policy of student representation is implemented through student self-governance (Student Council of UNN/institute/faculty/branch; Student Dormitory Council and students' trade union organisation) and student representation in collegial advisory bodies in accordance with the

Charter of UNN (clauses 4.43, 4.45, 4.72, 8.4-8.7); Regulations on the Student Council of UNN (UNN Order No. 191-OD dated 14.05.2015); Regulations on the Student Dormitory of UNN (UNN Order No. 358-OD dated 29.07.2022), approved by the decision of the Presidium of the UNN Academic Council, Minutes of 12.07.2022 No. 7); Regulations on the Student Council of the faculty, institute, branch (subunit) of UNN (UNN order dated 09.08.2023 No. 06.49-05-0821).

However, student representation in collegial governing bodies is scarce or completely absent (there is only one student in the UNN Academic Council, there are no students in the Academic Council of ICM), which does not meet the requirements of the IAAR accreditation standards. Local documents of UNN and ICM do not provide for or limit the participation of students in the work of collegial bodies. The UNN Regulations "On the procedure for the development and approval of main professional educational programmes of higher education at UNN (new edition)", approved by the order of 09.03.2021 № 98-OD, does not provide for the participation of students in the development and adoption of educational programmes.

UNN has a Student Council (a collegial management body of the University), whose activities are aimed at participation in the development and evaluation of educational programmes, motivating students to study, organising students' leisure time, developing cooperation with other youth organisations (<mailto:ss.unn.official@gmail.com> https://www.instagram.com/studsovet_nngu https://vk.com/unn_sc). The activities of the students' trade union are aimed at protecting the rights of students and their social support.

Students of the EP "General Medicine" are included in the ICM Student Council and UNN Student Council, trade union committee, various commissions, including those responsible for financial aid. The chairperson of the ICM Student Council is a member of the Disciplinary Commission. Representatives of the ICM trade union committee are members of the scholarship commission.

Youth policy at ICM is implemented in the following areas: volunteering, social activities, sports, creative work, science. Structural units implementing the youth policy are listed in the report.

Analytical part

UNN implements its Policy on Admission and Selection of Students in accordance with the Admission Rules, Regulations on the Admissions Office, Regulations on the Examination Committee, Regulations on the Appeals Committee, which are updated annually on the basis of government regulations.

Student recruitment is conducted with due regard to the facilities and human resources of UNN in accordance with the target figures for admission, which are determined by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation that allocates a quota for target admission and approves the list of persons who are admitted without entrance examinations. Academic counselling, as well as social and financial support are provided to students.

At UNN, the policy of student representation is implemented through student self-governance (Student Council of UNN/institute/faculty/branch; Student Dormitory Council and students' trade union organisation) and student representation in collegial advisory bodies in accordance with the University regulations. However, student representation in collegial governing bodies is minimal (there is only one student in the UNN Academic Council, there are no students in the Academic Council of ICM), which is indicative of low involvement of students in decision-making processes and does not correspond to the principle of a student-centred approach. The local documents of UNN and ICM do not provide for or limit the participation of students in the work of collegial bodies. The UNN Regulations "On the procedure for the development and approval of main professional educational programmes of higher education at UNN (new edition)", approved by the order of 09.03.2021 № 98-OD, do not provide for the participation of students in the development and adoption of educational programmes.

Strengths/best practices:

No strengths have been identified for this standard.

EEC Recommendations:

It is recommended that UNN management and Head of the ICM should expand the representation of students in the collegial body and in structural units responsible for defining the mission, for the development, management and assessment of the EP. Deadline: September 2024, thereafter on a permanent basis.

EEC conclusions based on the criteria:

strengths — 0

satisfactory — 15

need improvement — 1

unsatisfactory — 0

6.5. Standard "Academic Staff/Faculty"

• *Selection and recruitment policy*

The educational institution should develop and implement a staff selection and recruitment policy to:

✓ *determine their category, responsibility, and balance of academic staff/faculty in the basic biomedical sciences, behavioural and social sciences, and medical/pharmaceutical sciences to adequately implement the EP, including the appropriate ratio of faculty members teaching medical, non-medical, pharmaceutical courses, full-time and part-time faculty, and the balance between academic and non-academic staff.*

✓ *consider criteria for academic, educational and clinical excellence, including the balance between teaching, research and "service" functions*

✓ *determine and ensure monitoring of the responsibilities of academic staff/faculty of basic biomedical sciences, behavioural and social sciences and clinical, hygiene, pharmaceutical sciences*

✓ *provide for the possibility to take into account in selection and recruitment policy such criteria and characteristics as relevance to the mission and economic opportunities of the educational organisation, as well as the region's relevant characteristics*

• *Staff performance and development policy*

The educational institution should develop and implement a staff performance and development policy aimed at:

✓ *maintaining a balance of opportunities between teaching, research and 'service' functions, ensuring that meritorious academic activities are recognized, with appropriate emphasis on teaching, research and professional qualifications*

✓ *ensuring that individual members of staff have sufficient knowledge of the whole educational programme, as well as faculty training, development and appraisal*

✓ *providing for the possibility to take into account the teacher-student ratio depending on the different components of the educational programme*

✓ *staff career development.*

Analytical part

The policy of selection and recruitment of academic staff at UNN is carried out in accordance with the Labour Code of the Russian Federation, the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of Russia dated 23.07.2015 No. 749 "On approval of the Regulations on the procedure for filling positions of academic personnel belonging to the teaching staff", Regulations on the procedure for competitive election to fill the positions of teaching staff at the Federal State Autonomous Educational Institution of Higher Education "National Research Lobachevsky State University of Nizhny Novgorod"

(<http://www.unn.ru/sveden/files/docs/local-norm-akts/2019/36-OD.pdf>.)

UNN has the autonomy in the human resources management. When selecting applicants for the position of a faculty member, priority is given to the compliance of the qualification level of employees with the qualification requirements for the positions and the employee's professional

competence (Order of the Ministry of Health and Social Development of the Russian Federation dated 11.01.2011 No. 1n "On approval of the unified qualification directory of positions, managers, specialists and employees", section "Qualification characteristics of positions of managers and specialists of higher professional and additional professional education", UNN Charter, "Qualification requirements for employees holding faculty positions at Lobachevsky Nizhny Novgorod State University") and absence of restrictions on employment in the education system stipulated by legislative or other regulatory legal documents. Faculty members of clinical departments must have specialist certificates or accreditation certificates. There are no restrictions regarding gender, nationality, religion, or language when applying for employment at the UNN ICM.

Announcements on competitions are posted on the UNN website (www.unn.ru) at least 2 months prior to the competition. The election of academic staff who meet the qualification requirements for the positions is held by the UNN collegial governing bodies - the Academic Council of the institute/faculty/branch (for the positions of lecturer, senior lecturer, assistant, associate professor) or the Academic Council of the University (for the positions of professor, institute director).

The staffing for the implementation of the EP "General Medicine" is provided in accordance with the requirements of the Federal State Standard of Higher Education. At UNN, the number of academic staff is planned independently in accordance with the standards of academic workload per faculty member and depends on the student enrolment. The total number of teaching staff involved in implementing the EP "General Medicine" is 193 persons, including 26 Doctors of Sciences and 92 Candidates of Sciences, 8 faculty members with the academic title of Professor and 28 with the academic title of Associate Professor. The proportion of the teaching staff with higher academic degrees (total for individual persons) in the EP 31.05.01 "General Medicine" is almost 61%. The classes for students are taught in Russian and English. General information about the teaching staff is presented on the UNN website in the section "Management. Teaching staff" (<http://www.unn.ru/sveden/employees.php>).

The Policy of staff activity and development is in effect at UNN, whereby a balance is maintained between teaching, research, medical and service functions, including the allocation of time for each type of activity, taking into account the needs of the educational organisation and the teaching staff's professional qualifications. Teaching load at UNN is determined by the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation (dated 22.12.2014, No. 1601) "On the duration of working time (norms of hours of pedagogical work per salary rate) of teaching staff and on the procedure for determining the teaching load of teaching staff stipulated in the labour contract", the UNN Charter, the UNN order dated 06.06.2023, No. 06.49-04-0258/23 "On enactment of the Requirements for determining the teaching load of UNN teaching staff for the academic year 2023/2024" (minutes of the UNN Academic Council of 26.05.2023, No. 48). In addition to their teaching work (the amount depends on the position), ICM faculty members carry out research and clinical work (at clinical departments), as stipulated in their job descriptions and individual plans.

The human resources policy of the UNN ICM guarantees the recognition of all types of faculty members' activities according to their merits, the rating assessment of the teaching staff activity has been implemented ("Regulations on the scoring and rating assessment of the activities of the faculty members belonging to the UNN teaching staff", UNN order No. 590-OD dated 15.10.2020, UNN Academic Council minutes of 02.10.2020, No. 11), additional incentive payments are provided (including those for publication activity, patents, state awards, presentations), as well as awarding with certificates, diplomas, letters of appreciation (http://www.uk.unn.ru/_OfornlenieNagrada/ofornlenie_nagrada.php).

ICM has introduced a mentoring system and is working to establish a talent pool (including the awarding of personal scholarships to young and talented researchers).

UNN has created the necessary conditions for additional professional education of its employees, for combining their work with training. The UNN Faculty of Professional Development and Retraining provides ongoing training, retraining and professional development of UNN personnel based on scientific knowledge and application of modern educational technologies. UNN guarantees

free additional professional education of its teaching staff in accordance with the procedure established by the legislation.

Professional development of faculty members is carried out in accordance with the plans and schedules approved for the academic year. The results of the faculty members' professional development are reflected in the "UNN Employee" system in each employee's personal account. However, the interview with the faculty members has shown that they were mainly trained in their speciality profile, but did not receive training in modern teaching methods for implementing the EP "General Medicine".

Analytical part

UNN has the autonomy in the human resources management. The Policy of selection and recruitment of academic staff at UNN has been defined, it is carried out in accordance with the Labour Code of the Russian Federation, the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of Russia dated 23.07.2015, No. 749 "On approval of the Regulations on the procedure for filling positions of academic personnel belonging to the teaching staff", Regulations on the procedure for competitive election to fill the positions of teaching staff at the Federal State Autonomous Educational Institution of Higher Education "National Research Lobachevsky State University of Nizhny Novgorod" (<http://www.unn.ru/sveden/files/docs/local-norm-akts/2019/36-OD.pdf>.)

The human resources policy of the UNN ICM in implementing the EP "General Medicine" ensures the balance between faculty members teaching medical and non-medical courses, full-time and part-time faculty members, which is regulated by labour contracts and job descriptions.

The Policy of staff activity and development is in effect at UNN, whereby a balance is maintained between teaching, research, medical and service functions, including the allocation of time for each type of activity, taking into account the needs of ICM and the professional qualifications of faculty members.

The human resources policy of the UNN ICM guarantees the recognition of all types of faculty members' activities according to their merits, the rating assessment of the teaching staff activity has been implemented, taking into account all types of activities, incentive payments are established (including those for publication activity, patents, awards); candidates for academic titles, promotions (on a competitive basis) and state awards are recommended. The UNN ICM has created the necessary conditions for additional professional education of its employees. However, there is virtually no professional development of faculty members on educational programmes that include the knowledge of teaching/learning methods and the general content of educational programmes to stimulate cooperation and integration, which does not meet the requirements of the IAAR Standard.

Strengths/best practices:

No strengths have been identified for this standard.

EEC Recommendations:

1. It is recommended that the UNN ICM management should:

- Consider the possibility of sending the lecturers of the EP "General Medicine" to the leading educational centres of the Russian Federation and foreign countries to be trained in modern teaching methods. Deadline: December 2024, thereafter on a permanent basis.

- Organise the training on modern teaching methods for the teaching staff of the EP "General Medicine" at the UNN ICM with the involvement of leading experts in this field. Deadline: December 2024, thereafter on a permanent basis.

2. It is recommended that the Head of the EP should include in the professional development plan of the teaching staff involved in the EP "General Medicine" the training on modern teaching methods. Deadline: September 2024, thereafter on a permanent basis.

EEC conclusions based on the criteria:*strengths — 0**satisfactory — 7**need improvement — 1**unsatisfactory — 0***6.6. Standard "Educational Resources"**• *Physical facilities**The educational institution should:*

- ✓ *demonstrate readiness to provide sufficient physical facilities to ensure adequate implementation of the educational programme, and to create a safe learning environment for staff, students, patients and their relatives*

- ✓ *demonstrate readiness to improve the learning environment by regularly updating and expanding physical facilities to meet changes in educational practices*

✓ *Resources for practical training**The educational institution should:*

- *demonstrate readiness to provide the necessary resources to ensure that students receive appropriate clinical/practical experience, including:*

- *quality and categories of patients/service users*

- *number and categories of clinical/workplace bases, which include:*

- *supervision of students' practice*

- ✓ *demonstrate readiness to assess, adapt and improve clinical/practical training environments to meet community needs*

• *Information technology**The educational institution should:*

- ✓ *develop and implement policies for the effective and ethical use and evaluation of appropriate information and communication technologies*

- ✓ *make provision for access to websites or other electronic media*

- ✓ *make provision for faculty and students to access relevant patient data and healthcare information systems using existing and appropriate new information and communication technologies for self-learning, access to information, patient databases and healthcare information systems*

• *Research and scientific achievements**The educational institution should:*

- ✓ *demonstrate readiness to use research activities and scientific achievements in the field of medicine, pharmacy as a basis for the educational programme*

- ✓ *formulate and implement policies that promote the relationship between research and education; provide information on the research base and research priorities of the educational institution*

- ✓ *ensure that the linkage between research and education is taken into account in teaching, encourages and prepares students for participation in research in the field of healthcare*

• *Educational expertise**The educational institution should:*

- ✓ *have a policy and implement access to educational expertise of processes, practices and problems of medical and pharmaceutical education with the involvement of specialists, educational psychologists, sociologists at university, inter-university and international levels; develop and implement a policy of expertise in the development, implementation and evaluation of the educational programme, development of teaching and assessment methods*

- ✓ *demonstrate readiness to provide evidence of the use of internal or external educational expertise in staff development, taking into account current experience in medical/pharmaceutical education and promoting the interests of staff in educational research*

• *Exchanges in the field of education**The educational institution should:*

- ✓ *have a policy and implement practices of national and international cooperation with other educational organisations, including staff and student mobility, as well as the transfer of educational credits*

- ✓ *demonstrate readiness to facilitate the participation of teachers and students in academic mobility programmes at home and abroad and allocate appropriate resources for this purpose*

Evidence-based part

The UNN ICM has the necessary physical facilities and resources to fulfil the mission and implement the EP "General Medicine": university-wide structures, academic buildings, classrooms, library, University Clinic, Accreditation and Simulation Centre, UNN laboratories, dormitories, sports complex (ski base, stadium, sports halls), catering complex, health centre, student recreational camp "Zarya", etc. (<http://www.unn.ru/site/sveden/objects>).

All buildings and premises meet the needs of students with disabilities. The equipment of the classrooms meets the federal standard, fire safety requirements and sanitary and hygienic norms.

Educational, scientific and informational support of the programme is provided by the University library, which has various types of resources, including electronic ones.

The UNN ICM has the resources for the clinical training of students in the EP "General Medicine". The training is provided at the departments located in the academic building of ICM, at the bases of 15 medical organisations of the city in the relevant medical wards, where students together with faculty members have full access to patients (self-assessment report, interviews, visit to the clinical base).

Both emergency and routine patients in the main clinical areas: internal medicine, surgery, anaesthesiology-resuscitation, obstetrics-gynaecology, neurology, paediatrics, etc. are available in the clinics to practice professional skills. The UNN ICM has the necessary facilities to train students in providing various types of care, including primary, specialised and highly specialised care.

An accreditation and simulation centre is functioning, but modern methods for assessing the acquisition of practical skills, in particular, the objective structured clinical examination, are not used (interview).

The use of information and communication technologies at the UNN ICM is implemented in accordance with the UNN Development Programme for 2021-2030, UNN Development Strategy until 2030, UNN Policy in the field of education quality. The information system for educational process management of ICM is functioning, which is integrated with the UNN management and financial databases. The educational process management is based on the software package "Galaktika. University Management", which supports the learning process, including the development of basic and working curricula, maintaining the student population database, keeping records of academic performance, generation of all necessary documents in electronic form (<http://www.galaktika.ru/vuz/upravlenie-kontingentom-studentov.html>).

The UNN ICM provides access to international, national and local information resources. The UNN Fundamental Library provides access to electronic resources in all branches of knowledge, having the widest list of subscriptions to foreign scientific resources in the region (self-assessment report, interviews, visit to the base).

Faculty members and students have access to resources including standards of medical care, to electronic library systems ELS "Student's Consultant" <http://www.studentlibrary.ru/>, ELS "Doctor's Consultant", to Russian and foreign electronic resources.

Access to resources (databases and analytical services for assessing scientific activity) is also provided: Web of Science Core Collection; InCites, including Journal Citation Reports and Essential Science Indicator (analytical services for the assessment of scientific activity on the basis of Web of Science); Scopus, SciVal (analytical service for the assessment of scientific activity on the basis of Scopus); MEDLINE.

UNN has the resources to carry out scientific research in the field of medicine. However, ICM in the implementation of the EP "General Medicine" does not fully utilise the potential of UNN to strengthen the relationship between research and education, to implement the results of research in the EP and to prepare students for participation in research.

The strategy of integration (interrelation of educational and research activities) for both the teaching staff and students has not been fully developed at the UNN ICM. One research project "Predictors of early vascular aging in patients with myocardial infarction without previous coronary history" is implemented at ICM within the EP "General Medicine"; the number of students involved in research is low, the work of student research groups is more focused on practical activities than on the development of research skills (interview, report). Students of the EP "General Medicine" (3

persons) take part in the research project "Predictors of early vascular ageing in patients with myocardial infarction without previous coronary history" (Table 4). There are some student publications in scientific journals (Cardiology, Therapeutic Archive, Russian Journal of Cardiology).

UNN publishes some scientific periodicals, including the journal *Opera Medica et Physiologica*, which features articles on original research in physiology, pathophysiology and experimental medicine <http://www.unn.ru/site/about/mediaresursy/izdaniya-universiteta>.

The interview with faculty members and students has not shown how the results of new research are used to improve the study of specific disciplines in the implementation of the EP (without its expansion), and how research results are implemented in the educational process.

The Office for Quality, Expertise and Monitoring of the Educational Process (a unit of the Department of Educational Programmes) is responsible for designing and coordinating activities to ensure the appropriate level of education quality at UNN. Quality assurance activities at UNN faculties and institutes are assigned to curriculum commissions. The "Regulations on conducting internal assessment of education quality in higher education programmes" http://www.unn.ru/sveden/files/docs/local-norm-akts/2022/222-OD_13.05.2022.pdf have been developed. Employers, legal entities and individual persons, including the teaching staff of the educational organisation, are involved in regular internal assessment of the quality of educational programmes and the training of students.

The external expert assessment of the EP is performed by medical practitioners with experience in the field of medical education at the stage of reviewing the educational programmes being developed, during the state final certification, as well as in the course of the accreditation monitoring. However, the interviews with teaching staff and students have demonstrated low awareness regarding the conduct of the expert review in the field of medical education in relation to the development of the EP, methods of teaching and assessment of knowledge and skills, as well as research in the field of medical education, which does not meet the requirements of the IAAR standard.

UNN carries out its international activities in the following areas: education of foreign citizens, cooperation with educational and scientific medical institutions and organisations, including arranging international academic exchanges of faculty members and students, organising and conducting international forums, conferences, scientific research and other forms of cooperation. More than 130 higher education institutions from 38 countries of the world are the partners of UNN. At present, academic mobility programmes with more than 60 foreign universities have been developed on the basis of direct contractual relations. Academic mobility is implemented in the form of exchange of students and teaching staff, internships, participation in conferences and congresses. However, interviews with faculty members and students show that not all forms of academic mobility are realised at ICM.

UNN has a Centre for Examination of Foreign Documents on Education and Qualifications. The Centre provides expert and consulting services and conducts information activities in the field of recognition of foreign education or qualifications, foreign academic degrees and titles in order to ensure access of their holders to education or professional activities at UNN, provides assistance in the recognition in foreign countries of education and academic degrees or titles obtained at UNN.

Analytical part

The UNN ICM has the necessary physical facilities and resources to fulfil the mission and implement the EP "General Medicine": university-wide structures, academic buildings, classrooms, library, University Clinic, Accreditation and Simulation Centre, UNN laboratories, dormitories, sports complex (ski base, stadium, sports halls), catering complex, health centre, student recreational camp "Zarya", etc. (<http://www.unn.ru/site/sveden/objects>).

The UNN ICM has the resources for the clinical training of students in the EP "General Medicine". The training is provided at the departments located in the academic building of ICM, at the bases of 15 medical organisations of the city in the relevant medical wards, where students together with faculty members have full access to patients (self-assessment report, interviews, visit

to the clinical base).

There is an accreditation and simulation centre, however, modern methods for assessing the acquisition of practical skills, in particular, the objective structured clinical examination, are not used.

The UNN ICM provides access to international, national and local information resources. The UNN Fundamental Library provides access to electronic resources in all branches of knowledge, having the widest list of subscriptions to foreign scientific resources in the region (self-assessment report, interviews, visit to the base).

Faculty members and students have access to resources including standards of medical care, to electronic library systems ELS "Student's Consultant" <http://www.studentlibrary.ru/>, ELS "Doctor's Consultant", to Russian and foreign electronic resources.

Access to resources (databases and analytical services for assessing scientific activity) is also provided: Web of Science Core Collection; InCites, including Journal Citation Reports and Essential Science Indicator (analytical services for the assessment of scientific activity on the basis of Web of Science); Scopus, SciVal (analytical service for the assessment of scientific activity on the basis of Scopus); MEDLINE.

In implementing the EP "General Medicine", ICM does not fully utilise the potential of UNN to strengthen the relationship between research and education, to implement the results of research in the EP and to prepare students for participation in research (interview, report).

The strategy of integration (interrelation of educational and research activities) for both the teaching staff and students has not been fully developed at the UNN ICM. One research project "Predictors of early vascular aging in patients with myocardial infarction without previous coronary history" is implemented at ICM within the EP "General Medicine"; the number of students involved in research is small, the work of student research groups is more focused on practical activities than on the development of research skills (interview, report).

The policy of providing the relationship between the use of research results for improving the study of specific disciplines in the EP (without its extension) and for implementing research results in the educational process has not been clearly defined at ICM, which is confirmed by the interviews with faculty members and students.

ICM does not have a clearly defined policy on the participation of teaching staff and students in academic mobility programmes in Russia and abroad, there is a low awareness of teaching staff and students about the forms of academic mobility that are used by ICM in the delivery of the EP "General Medicine", which does not meet the requirements of the IAAR standard (interview).

ICM does not have a clearly defined policy on the use of expert review in medical education, with regard to the development of the EP, methods of teaching and assessment of knowledge and skills, and research in medical education, nor is there a fully established policy to support the interests of faculty members in conducting research in medical education.

Strengths/best practices:

No strengths have been identified for this standard.

EEC Recommendations:

1. It is recommended that the UNN management and the ICM management should develop and implement a policy on enhancing the relationship between research and education, implementing research results in the EP and for preparing students to participate in research, based on the use of UNN potential. Deadline: during the academic year 2024/2025, thereafter on a permanent basis.

2. It is recommended that the UNN management and the ICM management should implement the policy of integration (interrelation) of educational and scientific activities in the delivery of the EP "General Medicine", providing these activities with appropriate financial, organisational and instructional support. Deadline: during the academic year 2024/2025, thereafter on a permanent basis.

3. It is recommended that the UNN management and the ICM management should develop and

implement a policy on the use of expert review in the field of medical education, concerning the development of the EP, methods of teaching and assessment of knowledge and skills, conducting research in the field of medical education, supporting the interests of teaching staff in conducting research in medical education. Deadline: December 2024, thereafter on a permanent basis.

4. It is recommended that the UNN management and the ICM management should implement the policy of expanding the forms of academic mobility of teaching staff and students, providing them with appropriate financial, organisational and instructional support. Deadline: during the academic year 2024/2025, thereafter on a permanent basis.

EEC conclusions based on the criteria:

strengths — 0

satisfactory — 9

need improvement — 5

unsatisfactory — 0

6.7. Standard "Educational Programme Evaluation"

• *Mechanisms for programme monitoring and evaluation*

The educational institution should:

✓ *have established procedures for monitoring and periodic evaluation of the educational programme and the learning outcomes, student progress and performance of students*

✓ *develop and demonstrate readiness to apply an evaluation mechanism for the educational programme that examines the programme, its main components, student performance, identifies and addresses problems, ensures that relevant evaluation results have an impact on the EP*

✓ *demonstrate readiness to periodically evaluate the programme, giving a comprehensive review of the educational process, components of the educational programme, expected learning outcomes and social responsibility*

• *Teacher and student feedback*

The educational institution should:

✓ *provide for systematic feedback, analysing and responding to feedback from teachers and students.*

✓ *demonstrate readiness to use the results of feedback to improve the educational programme*

• *Performance of students*

The educational institution should:

✓ *demonstrate readiness to analyse the performance of students in accordance with the mission and expected learning outcomes, study programme and availability of resources.*

✓ *demonstrate readiness to analyse the performance of students, taking into account the conditions of their previous education, the level of preparation for admission to the university; use the results of the analysis to interact with the structural unit responsible for the selection of students, development of the educational programme, and counselling of students.*

• *Involvement of stakeholders*

The educational institution should:

✓ *demonstrate readiness to involve key stakeholders in the monitoring and evaluation of the educational programme*

✓ *demonstrate readiness to provide stakeholders with access to the results of programme evaluation, collect and review feedback from them and their comments on the educational programme.*

Evidence-based part

ICM implements mechanisms for developing, approving, monitoring and assessing the educational programme and the results of students' academic performance, in accordance with local regulations: "Regulations on the procedure for the development and approval of main professional educational programmes of higher education at UNN (new edition)", approved by the order of the UNN Rector dated 09.03.2021 No. 98-09 (Minutes of the UNN Academic Council of 11.02.2021 No. 2); "Regulations on the rating system for assessing students' performance at UNN", approved by the

order of the UNN Rector dated 15.11.2018 No. 470-OD (Minutes of the UNN Academic Council of 14.11.2018 No. 8), etc.

The assessment of the EP quality is carried out in accordance with the Action Plan for monitoring and assessment of the EP, which is annually developed by the Office for Quality, Expertise and Monitoring of the Educational Process and approved by the UNN Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs.

Educational programmes are annually reviewed at the meetings of the relevant departments and other structures implementing the educational programme, curriculum commissions and the Academic Council. The schedule of revision of working curricula and programmes of academic disciplines is approved in the work plans of the departments and curriculum commissions. They are updated in accordance with the "Regulations on the procedure for the development and approval of main professional educational programmes of higher education at UNN (new edition)", approved by the order of the UNN Rector dated 09.03.2021 No. 98-09 (Minutes of the UNN Academic Council of 11.02.2021 No. 2); "Guidelines for the development of curricula of main educational programmes of higher education (Bachelor's, Specialist, Master's, Residency programmes), compiling the register of educational programmes, and preparation of curricular documentation for the academic year 2024-2025", approved by the order of the UNN Rector dated 16.11.2023 No.06.49-05-1309/23.

UNN conducts continuous monitoring and periodic assessment of educational programmes by means of questionnaire surveys of students (<https://opros.unn.ru/46384>) and employers.

The interviewing of ICM faculty members and students about the organisation and implementation of the internal monitoring of the educational programme, including assessment of its compliance with the requirements of the Federal State Standard of Higher Education, the volume and content of the disciplines studied, including the variable part of the programme, the amount of contact work, the results of current academic performance and interim certification, the level of competencies of graduates at the final state certification, has demonstrated their poor awareness of this process.

The interviewing of ICM faculty and students has also shown their lack of awareness about the use of the mechanism of educational programme assessment (components of the EP, students' performance, expected learning outcomes and social responsibility) for identifying and solving problems related to the quality of the EP, which is not consistent with the requirements of the IAAR Standard.

The quality of the EP implementation is subject to external monitoring. Information on the results of inspections, performance assessment and prescribed actions is published on the UNN website.

Feedback between the educational process participants is provided by means of questionnaire surveys of students, teaching staff members, parents or legal representatives, graduates, employers. The questionnaire is posted on the UNN portal (<https://opros.unn.ru/46384>) and includes questions concerning satisfaction with various areas of the University's activities. The Commission for settling disputes between the participants of the educational process and the Disciplinary Commission are functioning, where the issues of improper behaviour of educational process participants are considered.

The students' academic performance is analysed annually in accordance with the "Regulations on the rating system for assessing students' performance at UNN" (Order of the UNN Rector dated 15.11.2018 No. 470-OD, Minutes of the UNN Academic Council of 14.11.2018 No. 8).

The corporate portal of UNN provides students with the opportunity to record the educational process and the results of interim certification (subsection "Student's Record Book" in the section "Educational Process"), provides access to the curriculum for specific disciplines, allows downloading reports on practical training, providing the opportunity to view grades and reviews, allows each student to maintain a Portfolio, which increases the student's responsibility, autonomy and participation in the process of assessing the quality of results. The portfolio reflects not only the student's academic performance, but also research and sports activities, participation in events and information about additional education.

Learning outcomes are analysed and evaluated when awarding scholarships, including personal scholarships, or when transferring students from contract places to state budget-supported places (<http://www.unn.ru/site/sveden/vacant>). The Smart Contract programme is in place, which allows a student to get a discount when paying tuition fees for the next year, provided that he/she passes the exams with "excellent" and "good" marks <http://www.unn.ru/site/education/informatsiya-priemnoj-komissii/programma-umnyj-vnebyudzheth-dlya-studentov-obuchayushchikhsya-navnebyudzhethoj-forme-obucheniya>.

The educational programme 31.05.01 General Medicine is implemented taking into account the opinions of all stakeholders, including employers and healthcare representatives. Interaction is realised through the conclusion of contracts for practical training, participation in state certification commissions, implementing the educational process at the departments, participation in the collegial bodies of UNN, monitoring the quality of students' training.

Within the framework of the internal system of quality assessment of educational activities under the educational programme, students and teaching staff have the opportunity to assess the conditions, content, organisation and quality of the educational process as a whole and of its individual disciplines and practical training by means of anonymous questionnaire surveys on the UNN website. The Student Union is involved in the drafting of plans, programmes, local regulations and other documents for the development of UNN's educational activities. It also represents the interests of students at the meetings of the Academic Council.

Analytical part

Quality assessment of the EP is carried out in accordance with the Plan of measures for monitoring and assessment of the EP, which is annually developed by the Office for Quality, Expertise and Monitoring of the Educational Process and approved by the UNN Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs. Local regulations have been developed, pursuant to which the monitoring and assessment of the educational programme, its structure, duration of studies, results of students' academic performance are carried out. However, the policy for implementing monitoring and assessment mechanisms of the educational programme, its structure, duration of study, results of students' academic performance is not clearly defined at ICM, as evidenced by the interviews with teaching staff and students.

Students' academic performance is analysed annually in accordance with the "Regulations on the rating system for assessing students' performance at UNN" (Order of the UNN Rector dated 15.11.2018 No. 470-OD, minutes of the UNN Academic Council of 14.11.2018 No. 8). Learning outcomes are analysed and evaluated when awarding scholarships, including personal scholarships, or when transferring students from contract places to state budget-supported places (<http://www.unn.ru/site/sveden/vacant>). The Smart Contract programme is in place, which allows a student to get a discount when paying tuition fees for the next year of study, provided that he/she passes the exams with "excellent" and "good" marks <http://www.unn.ru/site/education/informatsiya-priemnoj-komissii/programma-umnyj-vnebyudzheth-dlya-studentov-obuchayushchikhsya-navnebyudzhethoj-forme-obucheniya>.

The assessment of all areas of ICM activities, including the assessment of the quality and conditions for the implementation of the EP, is carried out on the basis of questionnaire surveys of all participants of the educational process (students, teaching staff, parents or legal representatives, graduates, employers) (<https://opros.unn.ru/46384>).

Strengths/best practices:

No strengths have been identified for this standard.

EEC Recommendations:

1. The ICM management should inform the teaching staff and students about the procedures of

monitoring and assessment of the educational programme, its structure, duration of studies, results of students' academic performance. Deadline: during the academic year 2024/2025, thereafter, on a permanent basis.

2. The ICM management should develop and introduce a policy on the implementation of mechanisms for monitoring and assessing the educational programme, its structure, duration of studies, results of students' academic performance. Deadline: during the academic year 2024/2025, thereafter, on a permanent basis.

3. The ICM management should develop and implement a system to ensure periodic assessment of the programme, including assessment of the educational process, components of the educational programme, expected learning outcomes and social responsibility. Deadline: during the academic year 2024/2025, thereafter, on a permanent basis.

EEC conclusions based on the criteria:

strengths — 0

satisfactory — 6

need improvement — 3

unsatisfactory — 0

6.8. Standard "Governance and Administration"

• *Governance*

The educational institution should:

✓ *define structural units and their functions, including relationships within the University*

✓ *define committees in the management structure, their responsibilities and composition, reflecting the representation of key and other stakeholders, ensuring transparency of the management bodies' work and the decisions they make*

• *Academic leadership*

The educational institution should:

✓ *describe the academic leadership's responsibilities in defining and managing the educational programme*

✓ *demonstrate readiness to periodically assess academic leadership in relation to the achievement of its mission and expected learning outcomes*

• *Educational budget and resource allocation*

The educational institution should:

✓ *have a clear allocation of responsibility and authority for resourcing the educational programme, including a dedicated budget for training*

✓ *demonstrate readiness to allocate the resources required for the implementation of the educational programme and to allocate educational resources according to the needs of the programme*

✓ *provide for the possibility of independent allocation of resources, including remuneration for teachers who adequately achieve the expected learning outcomes; when allocating resources, take into account scientific advances in healthcare as well as public health issues and needs.*

• *Administrative staff and management*

The educational institution should:

✓ *demonstrate readiness to have administrative and professional staff, to implement the educational programme and related activities, ensure proper management and allocation of resources*

✓ *demonstrate readiness to ensure that all units of the educational organisation participate in the processes and procedures of the internal quality assurance system.*

• *Interaction with the healthcare sector*

The educational institution should:

✓ *demonstrate readiness to engage constructively with the healthcare system and health-related sectors of society and government, including those abroad*

✓ *demonstrate readiness to formalise collaboration, including the involvement of staff and students, with partners in the healthcare sector.*

• *Public information*

The educational institution should:

✓ provide for regular publication on the official website of the educational institution and in the mass media of complete and reliable information about the educational programme and its achievements

Evidence-based part

The organisational structure of UNN and its collegial management bodies are defined http://www.unn.ru/site/images/docs/2023/structure_2023.jpg. The Rector is responsible for the general governance and management of UNN activities. The highest collegial management body is the Academic Council, its structure and functions are defined by the Regulations on the Academic Council of UNN. UNN has a Supervisory Board and Academic Councils of its subdivisions - branches, institutes, faculties. The Supervisory Board is responsible for overseeing the University's activities and making decisions on important issues of its development.

The main structural units of UNN, which ensure the implementation of educational, research and other activities, taking into account the level, type and focus of educational programmes, form of education and residence mode of students, are research institutes (Physics and Technology Institute, Institute of Chemistry, Institute of Neurosciences and others), institutes (Institute of Clinical Medicine, Institute of Biology and Biomedicine), faculties (Faculty of Chemistry, Faculty of Physics and others), clinics, branches, departments, offices, services, university-wide units, fundamental library.

The structure of UNN includes various departments that ensure the implementation of the EP "General Medicine": Administration and Facilities Department, Legal Department, Editorial and Publishing Department, Accounting Department, Internal Control Department, Informatisation Department, Information Security Department, Human Resources Department, Department of Educational Programmes, Department of Educational Process Organisation, Youth Policy Department, Public and Mass Media Relations Department, Project Management Department, Professional Guidance and Admissions Department, Finance and Logistics Department, Corporate Development Department, Department for International Student Affairs, Competency Development and Career Design Department <http://www.unn.ru/site/about/rukovodstvo-i-struktura-universiteta/upravleniya-otdely-sluzhby>.

Vice-Rectors are in charge of structural and collegial bodies in their areas of activity. The functions and duties of structural and collegial bodies, and their interaction are defined by the Regulations on Structural Units. The tasks and functions of UNN employees are defined by job descriptions.

Transparency of the UNN management system is ensured by the accessibility of all documents on the website, all decisions made are documented in the minutes of meetings and sessions.

UNN carries out its financial and economic activities in accordance with its Charter approved by the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Russian Federation, the Budget Code of the Russian Federation, federal laws, orders of the Government of the Russian Federation, other regulatory documents in force in the territory of the Russian Federation governing educational activities and activities of budget-funded institutions.

UNN has the autonomy to manage its financial resources in implementing its educational programmes. The plan of financial and economic activities of UNN for a calendar year is approved by the UNN Academic Council.

UNN allocates funds for incentive payments to faculty members according to the results of rating-based control of their achievements in various activities, provides financial support to students and to events held as part of sports, recreational and cultural activities. In line with the requirements of the respective Ministries, financial documentation is presented on the UNN website (<http://www.unn.ru/site/sveden/budget>). The control over the expenditure of financial resources is carried out by the Department of Finance and Logistics.

To implement the educational programme 31.05.01 General Medicine, UNN has an appropriate administrative staff: Rector, Vice-Rector for Strategic Development, Vice-Rector for Legal Affairs and Property Relations, Vice-Rector for International Affairs and Networking, Vice-Rector for Research and Innovation, Vice-Rector for Organisational and Personnel Affairs, Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs, Vice-Rector for Economics and Finance, Vice-Rector for Administration and

Facilities, Vice-Rector for Youth Policy and Educational Work. Department of Educational Programmes, including the Office for Quality, Expertise and Monitoring of the Educational Process, the Office for Methodological Support of Educational Programmes, the Centre for the Development of Open Online Education; the Department of Educational Process Management, including the Office for Support of the Educational Process, the Office for Teaching Load and Schedule Planning, the Student Multifunctional Centre and the Resource Centre; the Department of Project Management, including the Office for Support of Research and Development, the Office for Analysis and Planning of Scientific Research; Informatisation Department, including Technical Support Unit, Electronic Systems Development and Maintenance Unit, Electronic University Unit; Career Guidance and Admissions Department, Internal Control Department, Corporate Development Department, Department for International Student Affairs, Competency Development and Career Design Department, etc., according to the organisational structure of UNN (hereinafter referred to as UNN departments).

The Institute of Clinical Medicine (Director - Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor Natalia Yuryevna Grigorieva), which includes: Dean's Office, clinical departments, Higher School of Rehabilitation and Human Health, Accreditation and Simulation Centre (<https://icm.unn.ru/o-fakultete/>), administers the implementation of the educational programme "General Medicine".

The Director of the Institute of Clinical Medicine provides the implementation of the EP under the guidance of the Vice-Rectors in charge of certain areas of activity, in cooperation with respective UNN departments, depending on the goals and objectives that have been set.

The educational programme "General Medicine" is developed and managed by the head of the EP under the guidance of the ICM Director. The draft programme is developed by a working group consisting of the head of the programme appointed by the UNN order and faculty members of the ICM graduating departments. It is then reviewed at the meeting of the ICM Academic Council, Curriculum Council and approved at the meeting of the UNN Academic Council.

ICM has developed a close and effective cooperation with the healthcare sector. In accordance with its Mission, ICM is directly involved in the healthcare of residents of the Nizhny Novgorod region. This is possible because there are clinical bases located in 15 healthcare institutions, where ICM faculty members provide care to the local population and residents of other regions of the Russian Federation. ICM lecturers are members of the Russian Cardiology Society, the Society of Heart Failure Specialists, and the Eurasian Association of Therapists.

Analytical part

The organisational structure of UNN and its collegial management bodies, their functions are defined by the UNN Charter, Regulations on the UNN Academic Council, Regulations on structural units and job descriptions.

UNN has an administrative staff, whose size and qualification level contribute to the provision of activities for implementing the EP "General Medicine", proper management and allocation of resources.

The structures are defined, as well as their responsibility to develop and manage the implementation of the EP, resource allocation, including adequate remuneration of the teaching staff, which is carried out taking into account scientific achievements in the field of medicine, final learning outcomes, contribution to the development of medical science, solving problems in the field of public health and healthcare.

One should note the autonomy of UNN in forming the organisational structure and collegial management bodies, their composition, distribution of resources required for implementing the EP, including adequate remuneration of teaching staff for achieving the final learning outcomes, for their contribution to the development of medical science, solving problems in the field of public health and healthcare (report, interview).

Interaction with the healthcare sector is based on the agreements, which define the forms and areas of cooperation. Constructive interaction with the healthcare sector, joint responsibility of the

UNN ICM and practical healthcare for the quality of specialist training is one of the strong points of the Institute of Clinical Medicine (report, interview).

Strengths/best practices:

Constructive interaction with the healthcare and health-related sectors of society.

EEC Recommendations:

It is recommended that UNN management and ICM management should envisage in their budget planning the allocation of funds for academic mobility, organisation of training of faculty members in modern teaching methods, and for conducting research in the field of medical education. Deadline: December 2024.

EEC conclusions based on the criteria:

- *strengths* — 1
- *satisfactory* — 11
- *need improvement* — 0
- *unsatisfactory* — 0

(VII) OVERVIEW OF STRENGTHS/BEST PRACTICES FOR EACH STANDARD

Standard "Mission and Outcomes"

No strengths have been identified for this standard.

Standard "Educational Programme"

No strengths have been identified for this standard.

Standard "Assessment of Students"

No strengths have been identified for this standard.

Standard "Students"

No strengths have been identified for this standard.

Standard "Academic Staff/Faculty"

No strengths have been identified for this standard.

Standard "Educational Resources"

No strengths have been identified for this standard.

Standard "Educational Programme Evaluation"

No strengths have been identified for this standard.

Standard "Governance and Administration"

Constructive interaction with the health sector and health-related sectors of society.

(VIII) OVERVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS FOR QUALITY IMPROVEMENT

Standard "Mission and Outcomes"

1. It is recommended to the Head of ICM, and the Head of the EP to revise the Mission of the EP "General Medicine", making sure that it is available on the ICM website. Deadline: September 2024.

2. It is recommended to the Head of ICM:

2.1. to make additions and amendments to the local documents of ICM to expand the academic freedom of students regarding the possibility of their participation in the development of the EP "General Medicine";

2.2. to include students in the collegial bodies of ICM (Academic Council of ICM). Deadline: September 2024.

3. It is recommended that the Head of ICM and the Head of the EP should ensure the implementation of activities aimed at developing students' individual learning paths, raising their awareness of the procedure for selecting elective disciplines (elective disciplines). Deadline: September 2024, thereafter, on a permanent basis.

4. It is recommended that the Head of ICM and the Head of the EP make the teaching staff and students aware of the best practice of using the results of new research for improving the study of specific disciplines when implementing the EP (without extending it) in order to expand their academic freedom. Deadline: September 2024, thereafter, on a permanent basis.

Standard "Educational Programme"

1. It is recommended that the UNN management, the Head of ICM, the Head of the UNN Department of Educational Programmes, the Head of the EP should organise:

- training of the teaching staff aimed at increasing their awareness of the educational programme, including an integrated learning model based on disciplines, organ systems, clinical problems and diseases, using a modular or spiral design; teaching and learning methods to develop students' responsibility for their learning process. Deadline: September 2024, thereafter on a permanent basis.

- training in teaching methods based on modern adult learning theory and their implementation in educational activities. Deadline: September 2024, thereafter on a permanent basis.

2. It is recommended that the Head of ICM, the Head of the EP, the Head of the UNN Department of Educational Programmes should make the teaching staff aware of the best practices of EP development, which ensures the horizontal and vertical integration of academic disciplines. Deadline: September-December 2024.

3. It is recommended that the Head of ICM, the Head of the EP, the Head of the UNN Department of Educational Programmes ensure that the students are informed about the elective disciplines and the procedure for their selection. Deadline: June 2024, thereafter on a permanent basis.

4. It is recommended that the UNN management, the Head of ICM expand the representation of students in the collegial bodies responsible for the development and approval of the EP. Deadline: September 2024, thereafter on a permanent basis.

5. It is recommended that the UNN management considers the possibility of allocating resources to improve the ICM research base, which will ensure the implementation of research-based learning (RBL). Deadline: December 2024.

6. It is recommended that the Head of ICM should elaborate an action plan for developing ICM research activities, including an increase in the number of research projects (grants) implemented at ICM within the framework of the EP "General Medicine". Deadline: June 2024.

7. It is recommended that the Head of ICM together with the Head of the UNN Department of Educational Programmes should:

7.1. familiarise the teaching staff and students with the mechanisms of revision and updating of the EP taking into account the achievements of biomedical and social sciences, medical/pharmaceutical ethics and jurisprudence, reflecting the developments in science, technology, medicine and pharmacology, the needs of modern society;

7.2. make provisions for incorporating the results of modern scientific research into the EP "General Medicine". Deadline: June 2024, thereafter on a permanent basis.

8. It is recommended that the Head of ICM should develop an action plan to increase the number of students participating in research and development. Deadline: June 2024.

Standard "Assessment of Students"

1. It is recommended that the Head of ICM, the Head of the EP, the Head of the UNN Educational Programmes Department, the Head of the UNN Office for Quality, Expertise and Educational Process Monitoring organise training of the teaching staff in modern assessment methods (including the use of a regular methodological seminar). Deadline: June 2024, thereafter on a permanent basis.

2. It is recommended that the Head of ICM, the Head of the EP, the Head of the UNN Educational Programmes Department, the Head of the UNN Office for Quality, Expertise and Educational Process Monitoring introduce assessment methods and formats depending on their "usefulness assessment", which ensure reliability, validity, impact on learning, possibility to assess their effectiveness. Deadline: during the 2024/2025 academic year, thereafter on a permanent basis.

3. It is recommended that the Head of ICM, the Head of the EP, the Head of the UNN Educational Programmes Department, the Head of the UNN Office for Quality, Expertise and Educational Process Monitoring adjust the content, form and methods of assessment for interim and final certification with the use of OSCE in order to stimulate knowledge acquisition and ensure integrated learning. Deadline: during the 2024/2025 academic year, thereafter on a permanent basis.

Standard "Students"

It is recommended that the UNN management and the ICM management should expand the representation of students in the collegial body, structural units responsible for the definition of the mission, for the development, management and evaluation of the EP "General Medicine". Deadline: September 2024, thereafter on a permanent basis.

Standard "Academic Staff/Faculty"

1. It is recommended that the ICM management should:

- Consider the possibility of sending the lecturers of the EP "General Medicine" to the leading educational centres of the Russian Federation and foreign countries to be trained in modern teaching methods. Deadline: December 2024, thereafter on a permanent basis.

- Organise the training on modern teaching methods for the teaching staff of the EP "General Medicine" at the UNN ICM with the involvement of leading experts in this field. Deadline: December 2024, thereafter on a permanent basis.

2. It is recommended that the Head of the EP should include in the professional development plan of the teaching staff involved in the EP "General Medicine" the training on modern teaching methods. Deadline: September 2024, thereafter on a permanent basis.

Standard "Educational Resources"

1. It is recommended that the UNN management and the ICM management should develop and implement a policy on enhancing the relationship between research and education, implementing research results in the EP and for preparing students to participate in research, based on the use of UNN potential. Deadline: during the academic year 2024/2025, thereafter on a permanent basis.

2. It is recommended that the UNN management and the ICM management should implement the policy of integration (interrelation) of educational and scientific activities in the delivery of the EP "General Medicine", providing these activities with appropriate financial, organisational and

instructional support. Deadline: during the academic year 2024/2025, thereafter on a permanent basis.

3. It is recommended that the UNN management and the ICM management should develop and implement a policy on the use of expert review in the field of medical education, concerning the development of the EP, methods of teaching and assessment of knowledge and skills, conducting research in the field of medical education, supporting the interests of teaching staff in conducting research in medical education. Deadline: December 2024, thereafter on a permanent basis.

4. It is recommended that the UNN management and the ICM management should implement the policy of expanding the forms of academic mobility of teaching staff and students, providing them with appropriate financial, organisational and instructional support. Deadline: during the academic year 2024/2025, thereafter on a permanent basis.

Standard "Educational Programme Evaluation"

1. The ICM management should inform the teaching staff and students about the procedures of monitoring and assessment of the educational programme, its structure, duration of studies, results of students' academic performance. Deadline: during the academic year 2024/2025, thereafter, on a permanent basis.

2. The ICM management should develop and implement a policy on the implementation of mechanisms for monitoring and assessing the educational programme, its structure, duration of studies, results of students' academic performance. Deadline: during the academic year 2024/2025, thereafter, on a permanent basis.

3. The ICM management should develop and implement a system to ensure periodic assessment of the programme, including assessment of the educational process, components of the educational programme, expected learning outcomes and social responsibility. Deadline: during the academic year 2024/2025, thereafter, on a permanent basis.

Standard "Governance and Administration"

It is recommended that the UNN management and the ICM management should envisage in their budget planning the allocation of funds for academic mobility, organisation of training of faculty members in modern teaching methods, and for conducting research in the field of medical education. Deadline: December 2024.

(IX) OVERVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS FOR EDUCATIONAL INSTITUTION DEVELOPMENT

No recommendations

(X) RECOMMENDATION TO THE ACCREDITATION COUNCIL

The EEC members have reached a unanimous opinion that the EP 31.05.01 "General Medicine" (Specialist programme) (initial accreditation) is recommended for accreditation for a period of 3 years.



Annex 1: Evaluation table "PROGRAMME PROFILE PARAMETERS"

No.	No.	No. of crit.	EVALUATION CRITERIA	Position of the educational institution			
				Strong	Satisfactory	Needs improvement	Unsatisfactory
Standard 1 "MISSION AND OUTCOMES"							
1.1 Definition of the mission							
The educational institution should:							
1	1	1.1.1.	define the mission of the EP and communicate it to stakeholders and the healthcare sector.			+	
2	2	1.1.2.	reflect in the mission the aims and the educational strategy to train a competent professional at tertiary level in healthcare with an appropriate basis for a future career in any healthcare field, encompassing all types of practice, administrative medicine and research in healthcare; capable of fulfilling the roles and functions of a specialist in accordance with the established requirements of the healthcare sector; prepared for the postgraduate education and committed to lifelong learning		+		
3	3	1.1.3.	ensure that the mission of the EP incorporates research advances in the biomedical, clinical, pharmaceutical, behavioural and social sciences, aspects of global health and reflects major international health issues.		+		
1.2. Institutional autonomy and academic freedom							
The educational institution should:							
4	4	1.2.1.	have the institutional autonomy to develop and implement a quality assurance policy for which the administration and faculty are responsible, especially with regard to the design of the educational programme and the allocation of resources required for the implementation of the educational programme		+		
5	5	1.2.2.	ensure academic freedom for staff and students to pursue the educational programme and to use the results of new research to improve the study of specific disciplines/issues without extending the EP			+	
1.3 Learning outcomes							
The educational institution should:							
6	6	1.3.1.	define the expected learning outcomes that students are expected to achieve on completion of their studies in relation to attainment at a basic level of knowledge, skills and professional attitudes; an appropriate foundation for a future career in any area of the healthcare industry; future roles in the healthcare sector; further postgraduate training; a commitment to lifelong learning; the health needs of society, the needs of the healthcare system and other aspects of social responsibility		+		
7	7	1.3.2.	ensure that students behave appropriately towards fellow students, teachers, medical staff, patients and their relatives		+		
8	8	1.3.3.	publish the expected learning outcomes of the EP		+		

9	9	1.3.4.	identify and coordinate the linkage of the learning outcomes, required upon completion with those required in postgraduate studies		+			
10	10	1.3.5.	provide opportunities for students to participate in research in a relevant area of healthcare		+			
11	11	1.3.6.	address the expected learning outcomes related to global health		+			
1.4 Participation in the formulation of the mission and learning outcomes								
The educational institution should:								
12	12	1.4.1.	ensure the participation of <i>key stakeholders</i> in formulating the mission and expected learning outcomes		+			
13	13	1.4.2.	ensure that the stated mission and expected learning outcomes are based on the opinions/suggestions of <i>other stakeholders</i>		+			
				<i>Total</i>	0	11	2	0
Standard 2. EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME								
2.1 Education programme model and teaching methods								
The educational institution should:								
14	1	2.1.1.	define the specifications of the EP, including a statement of expected learning outcomes, a curriculum based on a modular or spiral structure, the qualification to be awarded			+		
15	2	2.1.2.	use <i>teaching and learning methods</i> that stimulate, prepare and support students to take responsibility for the learning process			+		
16	3	2.1.3.	ensure that the EP is implemented in accordance with the principles of equality			+		
17	4	2.1.4.	develop students' capacities for lifelong learning			+		
2.2. Scientific method								
The educational institution should:								
18	5	2.2.1.	impart to students throughout the programme of study the principles of scientific methodology, including methods of analytical and critical thinking; methods of research in healthcare and evidence-based medicine			+		
19	6	2.2.2.	provide for the possibility to include in the content of the programme the results of modern scientific research.			+		
2.3 Basic biomedical sciences								
The educational institution should:								
20	7	2.3.1.	identify and include in the EP the achievements of basic biomedical sciences to develop in students an understanding of scientific knowledge, concepts and methods that are the basis for the acquisition and application in practice of clinical scientific knowledge.			+		
21	8	2.3.2.	provide mechanisms for revision and updating of the EP taking into account the achievements of biomedical sciences, which reflect scientific, technological, medical and pharmaceutical developments, current and expected needs of the society and healthcare system.				+	
2.4. Behavioural, social sciences and medical/pharmaceutical ethics and jurisprudence								
The educational institution should:								

22	9	2.4.1.	identify and incorporate advances in behavioural sciences, social sciences, medical/pharmaceutical ethics and jurisprudence into the EP		+		
23	10	2.4.2.	provide mechanisms for revising and updating the EP to reflect advances in behavioural and social sciences, medical/pharmaceutical ethics and jurisprudence, including current scientific, technological and medical and pharmaceutical developments, current and anticipated societal and healthcare system needs; changing demographic and cultural contexts			+	
2.5. Clinical/pharmaceutical sciences and skills							
The educational institution should:							
24	11	2.5.1.	identify and incorporate advances in clinical/pharmaceutical sciences into the EP to ensure that learners on completion of the programme have acquired sufficient knowledge, clinical and professional skills to take appropriate responsibility in subsequent professional practice		+		
25	12	2.5.2.	ensure that learners spend a sufficient proportion of the programme in planned contact with patients, service users in appropriate clinical/workplace settings and gain experience in health promotion and disease prevention		+		
26	13	2.5.3.	determine the amount of time dedicated to the core clinical/professional disciplines		+		
27	14	2.5.4.	organise training with appropriate attention to the safety of the learning environment and patients, including observation of the learner's actions in clinical/workplace settings		+		
28	15	2.5.5.	provide the opportunity to modify the EP, taking into account advances in scientific, technological, medical and pharmaceutical developments, current and anticipated societal and healthcare system needs.		+		
29	16	2.5.6.	ensure that each learner has early contact with real patients, service users, including his/her gradual involvement in the provision of services and incorporating his/her responsibility: - in relation to the examination and/or treatment of the patient under supervision in an appropriate clinical setting; - in sanitary and epidemiological surveillance procedures in relation to the examination and/or inspection of the facility under supervision, which is carried out in appropriate operational units (sanitary and epidemiological control centres, territorial departments of sanitary and epidemiological control, including transport, disinfection organisations and healthcare institutions); - in relation to patient counselling on the rational use of medicines, which is carried out under appropriate workplace conditions		+		
30	17	2.5.7.	structure the various components of training in clinical, environmental and occupational health monitoring and other workplace skills according to the specific stage of the training programme.		+		
2.6. Educational programme structure, content and duration							
The educational institution should:							
31	18	2.6.1.	describe the content, scope and sequence of disciplines/modules, including maintaining an appropriate balance between basic biomedical, behavioural, social and clinical/professional disciplines		+		
32	19	2.6.2.	provide for horizontal integration of related sciences and disciplines			+	

33	20	2.6.3.	provide for vertical integration of clinical/professional sciences with the basic biomedical and behavioural and social sciences			+		
34	21	2.6.4.	provide the option of elective content (electives) and determine the balance between the compulsory and elective parts of the programme			+		
35	22	2.6.5.	determine the interrelation with complementary medicine, including non-traditional, traditional or alternative practices, occupational medicine, including aspects of the impact of the environment and anthropogenic production loads, as well as social situation on the population's health.			+		
2.7. Programme management								
The educational institution should:								
36	23	2.7.1.	determine the procedures for the development, approval and revision of the EP			+		
37	24	2.7.2.	designate a committee, under the direction of academic management, responsible for planning and implementing the EP to ensure that the expected learning outcomes are achieved			+		
38	25	2.7.3.	ensure representation of academic staff, students, representatives from other stakeholders, including representatives from clinical and work bases, healthcare professionals involved in the process of training in the committee of the educational institution in charge of the EP				+	
39	26	2.7.4.	provide for the possibility to plan and implement innovations in the EP through the committee in charge of the EP.			+		
2.8. Linkage with medical/pharmaceutical practice and the healthcare system								
The educational institution should:								
40	27	2.8.1.	ensure continuity between the EP and the subsequent stages of professional training or practice that the learner will undertake upon graduation			+		
41	28	2.8.2.	take into account the specific conditions in which graduates will be working and modify the EP accordingly			+		
				<i>Total</i>	0	19	9	0
Standard 3. STUDENT ASSESSMENT POLICY								
3.1. Assessment methods								
The educational institution should:								
42	1	3.1.1.	define and approve the principles, methods and practices used to assess students, including the number of examinations, criteria for determining pass marks, grades and the number of retakes allowed			+		
43	2	3.1.2.	ensure that assessment procedures cover knowledge, skills, attitudes and professional behaviour				+	
44	3	3.1.3.	use a wide range of assessment methods and formats according to their "usefulness rating", which includes a combination of validity, reliability, impact on learning, acceptability and effectiveness of the assessment methods and format				+	
45	4	3.1.4.	provide for the possibility of ensuring that the assessment process and methods are subject to the review of external experts			+		
46	5	3.1.5.	demonstrate readiness to ensure that assessment methods and results avoid conflicts of interest and use an appeal system for student assessment results			+		
47	6	3.1.6.	provide for the possibility of ensuring an open assessment procedure and its results, informing students of the assessment criteria and procedures used			+		

48	7	3.1.7.	provide for the possibility of documenting and assessing the reliability and validity of assessment methods, as well as the involvement of external examiners.			+	
----	---	--------	--	--	--	---	--

3.2. Relationship between assessment and learning

The educational institution should:

49	8	3.2.1.	use assessment principles, methods and practices that are comparable to the expected learning outcomes and teaching and learning methods, ensure achievement of the intended learning outcomes, support student learning, and provide an appropriate balance of formative and summative assessment to guide learning and make judgements about academic performance			+	
50	9	3.2.2.	provide for the possibility of adjusting the number and type of examinations to stimulate both knowledge acquisition and integrated learning			+	
51	10	3.2.3.	provide timely, specific, constructive and fair feedback to students on assessment results			+	
<i>Total</i>				0	6	4	0

Standard 4. STUDENTS

4.1. Admission and selection policy

The educational institution should:

52	1	4.1.1.	have an admission policy and implement admission practices that are based on principles of objectivity and include a clear statement about the process of selecting students			+	
53	2	4.1.2.	have a policy and implement practices for the admission of persons with disabilities			+	
54	3	4.1.3.	have a policy and implement practices of transferring students from other educational organisations, including foreign ones			+	
55	4	4.1.4.	establish a connection between selection and the mission of the educational institution, the educational programme and the desired quality of graduates; periodically review the admission policy			+	
56	5	4.1.5.	demonstrate readiness to use an appeal system for admission decisions			+	

4.2. Student intake

The educational institution should:

57	6	4.2.1.	determine the number of students admitted in accordance with the capacity of the educational institution at all stages of the educational programme			+	
58	7	4.2.2.	demonstrate readiness to periodically adjust the size and nature of student intake, taking into account the views of stakeholders responsible for planning and developing human resources in the healthcare sector to meet the medical needs of community and society			+	
59	8	4.2.3.	provide for the possibility of periodically reviewing the size and nature of student intake in consultation with other stakeholders and adjusting the numbers to meet the health needs of community and society			+	

4.3. Counselling and support for students

The educational institution should:

60	9	4.3.1.	demonstrate the potential for using a system of academic counselling for students			+	
61	10	4.3.2.	demonstrate readiness to offer students a programme of support to address social, financial and personal needs, allocating appropriate resources and ensuring confidentiality of counselling and support			+	

62	11	4.3.3.	demonstrate readiness to use the system of feedback with students on the assessment of conditions and organisation of the educational process		+			
63	12	4.3.4.	demonstrate readiness to provide students with documents confirming the obtained qualification (diploma) and diploma supplement (transcript)		+			
64	13	4.3.5.	provide the opportunity to take into account the needs of different groups of students and provide opportunities for shaping an individual educational pathway		+			
65	14	4.3.6.	demonstrate readiness to provide academic counselling, which is based on monitoring the progress of the student and includes issues of professional guidance and career planning		+			
4.4. Student representation								
The educational institution should:								
66	15	4.4.1.	have a policy and implement practices for the representation of students and their appropriate participation in the definition of the mission, and in the development, management and evaluation of the educational programme and other matters relating to students			+		
67	16	4.4.2.	provide for opportunities to encourage, facilitate and support student activities and student organisations.		+			
				<i>Total</i>	0	15	1	0
Standard 5. ACADEMIC STAFF/FACULTY								
5.1. Selection and recruitment policy								
The educational institution should develop and implement a staff selection and recruitment policy to:								
68	1	5.1.1.	determine their category, responsibility, and balance of academic staff/faculty in the basic biomedical sciences, behavioural and social sciences, and medical/pharmaceutical sciences to adequately implement the EP, including the appropriate ratio of faculty members teaching medical, non-medical, pharmaceutical courses, full-time and part-time faculty, and the balance between academic and non-academic staff		+			
69	2	5.1.2.	consider criteria for academic, educational and clinical excellence, including the balance between teaching, research and "service" functions		+			
70	3	5.1.3.	determine and ensure monitoring of the responsibilities of academic staff/faculty of basic biomedical sciences, behavioural and social sciences and clinical, hygiene, pharmaceutical sciences		+			
71	4	5.1.4.	provide for the possibility to take into account in selection and recruitment policy such criteria and characteristics as relevance to the mission and economic opportunities of the educational organisation, as well as the region's relevant characteristics		+			
5.2. Staff performance and development policy								
The educational institution should develop and implement a staff performance and development policy aimed at:								
72	5	5.2.1.	maintaining a balance of opportunities between teaching, research and 'service' functions, ensuring that meritorious academic activities are recognized, with appropriate emphasis on teaching, research and professional qualifications		+			
73	6	5.2.2.	ensuring that individual members of staff have sufficient knowledge of the whole educational programme, as well as faculty training, development and appraisal			+		
74	7	5.2.3.	providing for the possibility to take into account the teacher-student ratio depending on the different components of the educational programme		+			

75	8	5.2.4.	staff career development			+		
				<i>Total</i>	0	7	1	0
Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES								
6.1. Physical facilities								
The educational institution should:								
76	1	6.1.1.	demonstrate its commitment to provide sufficient physical facilities to ensure adequate implementation of the educational programme, and to create a safe learning environment for staff, students, patients and their relatives			+		
77	2	6.1.2.	demonstrate its commitment to improve the learning environment by regularly updating and expanding physical facilities to meet changes in educational practice			+		
6.2. Resources for practical training								
The educational institution should:								
78	3	6.2.1.	demonstrate its commitment to provide the necessary resources to ensure that students receive appropriate clinical/practical experience, including: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> quality and categories of patients/service users number and categories of clinical/workplace bases, which include: supervision of students' practice 			+		
79	4	6.2.2.	demonstrate its commitment to assessing, adapting and improving clinical/practical training environments to meet community needs			+		
6.3. Information technology								
The educational institution should:								
80	5	6.3.1.	develop and implement policies for the effective and ethical use and evaluation of appropriate information and communication technologies			+		
81	6	6.3.2.	make provision for access to websites or other electronic media			+		
82	7	6.3.3.	make provision for faculty and students to access relevant patient data and healthcare information systems using existing and appropriate new information and communication technologies for self-learning, access to information, patient databases and healthcare information systems.			+		
6.4. Research and scientific achievements								
The educational institution should:								
83	8	6.4.1.	demonstrate its commitment to use research activities and scientific achievements in the field of medicine, pharmacy as a basis for the educational programme			+		
84	9	6.4.2.	formulate and implement policies that promote the relationship between research and education; provide information on the research base and research priorities of the educational institution				+	
85	10	6.4.3.	ensure that the linkage between research and education is taken into account in teaching, encourage and prepare students for participation in research in the field of healthcare				+	
6.5. Educational expertise								
The educational institution should:								

86	11	6.5.1.	have a policy and implement access to educational expertise of processes, practices and problems of medical and pharmaceutical education with the involvement of specialists, educational psychologists, sociologists at university, inter-university and international levels; develop and implement a policy of expertise in the development, implementation and evaluation of the educational programme, development of teaching and assessment methods			+		
87	12	6.5.2.	demonstrate its commitment to provide evidence of the use of internal or external educational expertise in staff development, taking into account current experience in medical/pharmaceutical education and promoting the interests of staff in educational research			+		
6.6. Exchanges in the field of education								
The educational institution should:								
88	13	6.6.1.	have a policy and implement practices of national and international cooperation with other educational organisations, including staff and student mobility, as well as the transfer of educational credits			+		
89	14	6.6.2.	demonstrate its commitment to facilitate the participation of teachers and students in academic mobility programmes at home and abroad and allocate appropriate resources for this purpose			+		
				<i>Total</i>	0	9	5	0
Standard 7. EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME EVALUATION								
7.1. Mechanisms for programme monitoring and evaluation								
The educational institution should:								
90	1	7.1.1.	have established procedures for monitoring and periodic evaluation of the educational programme and the learning outcomes, student progress and performance of students			+		
91	2	7.1.2.	develop and demonstrate readiness to apply an evaluation mechanism for the educational programme that examines the programme, its main components, student performance, identifies and addresses problems, ensures that relevant evaluation results have an impact on the EP			+		
92	3	7.1.3.	demonstrate readiness to periodically evaluate the programme, giving a comprehensive review of the educational process, components of the educational programme, expected learning outcomes and social responsibility			+		
7.2. Teacher and student feedback								
The educational institution should:								
93	4	7.2.1.	provide for systematic feedback, analysing and responding to feedback from teachers and students			+		
94	5	7.2.2.	demonstrate readiness to use the results of feedback to improve the educational programme			+		
7.3. Performance of students								
The educational institution should:								
95	6	7.3.1.	demonstrate readiness to analyse the performance of students in accordance with the mission and expected learning outcomes, study programme and availability of resources			+		
96	7	7.3.2.	demonstrate readiness to analyse the performance of students, taking into account the conditions of their previous education, the level of preparation for admission to the university; use the results of the analysis to interact with the structural unit responsible for the selection of students, development of the educational			+		

			programme, and counselling of students.					
7.4. Involvement of stakeholders								
The educational institution should:								
97	8	7.4.1.	demonstrate readiness to involve key stakeholders in the monitoring and evaluation of the educational programme		+			
98	9	7.4.2.	demonstrate readiness to provide stakeholders with access to the results of programme evaluation, collect and review feedback from them and their comments on the educational programme.		+			
				<i>Total</i>	0	6	3	0
Standard 8. GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION								
8.1. Governance								
The educational institution should:								
99	1	8.1.1.	define structural units and their functions, including relationships within the University		+			
100	2	8.1.2.	define committees in the management structure, their responsibilities and composition, reflecting the representation of key and other stakeholders, ensuring transparency of the management bodies' work and the decisions they make		+			
8.2. Academic leadership								
The educational institution should:								
101	3	8.2.1.	describe the academic leadership's responsibilities in defining and managing the educational programme		+			
102	4	8.2.2.	demonstrate readiness to periodically assess academic leadership in relation to the achievement of its mission and expected learning outcomes		+			
8.3. Educational budget and resource allocation								
The educational institution should:								
103	5	8.3.1.	have a clear allocation of responsibility and authority for resourcing the educational programme, including a dedicated budget for training		+			
104	6	8.3.2.	demonstrate readiness to allocate the resources required for implementing the educational programme and to allocate educational resources according to the needs of the programme		+			
105	7	8.3.3.	provide for the possibility of independent allocation of resources, including remuneration for teachers who adequately achieve the expected learning outcomes; when allocating resources, take into account scientific advances in healthcare as well as public health issues and needs.		+			
8.4. Administrative staff and management								
The educational institution should:								
106	8	8.4.1.	demonstrate readiness to have administrative and professional staff for implementing the educational programme and related activities, ensure proper management and allocation of resources		+			
107	9	8.4.2.	demonstrate readiness to ensure that all units of the educational organisation participate in the processes and procedures of the internal quality assurance system		+			
8.5. Interaction with the healthcare sector								
The educational institution should:								

108	10	8.5.1.	demonstrate readiness to engage constructively with the healthcare system and health-related sectors of society and government, including those abroad	+				
109	11	8.5.2.	demonstrate readiness to formalise collaboration, including the involvement of staff and students, with partners in the healthcare sector.		+			
8.6. Public information								
The educational institution should:								
110	12	8.6.1.	provide for regular publication on the official website of the educational institution and in the mass media of full and reliable information about the educational programme and its achievements		+			
				<i>Total</i>	1	11	0	0
				CUMULATIVE TOTAL	1	84	25	0

