



«АККРЕДИТТЕУ ЖӘНЕ РЕЙТИНГТИҢ  
ТӘУЕЛСІЗ АГЕНТТІГІ» КЕМ

НУ «НЕЗАВИСИМОЕ АГЕНТСТВО  
АККРЕДИТАЦИИ И РЕЙТИНГА»

INDEPENDENT AGENCY FOR  
ACCREDITATION AND RATING

# REPORT

on the results of the external expert commission's assessment  
of compliance with the requirements of the standards for international initial  
accreditation of medical and pharmaceutical education programmes  
(based on WFME/ AMSE/ ESG)

31.05.03 Dentistry (Specialist programme) (initial accreditation)

NATIONAL RESEARCH LOBACHEVSKY STATE  
UNIVERSITY OF NIZHNY NOVGOROD

21 - 23 November 2023

**INDEPENDENT AGENCY FOR ACCREDITATION AND RATING**  
*External Expert Commission*

*To IAAR  
Accreditation Council*



**REPORT**

**on the results of the external expert commission's assessment  
of compliance with the requirements of the standards for international initial accreditation  
of medical and pharmaceutical education programmes  
(based on WFME/ AMSE/ ESG)**

*31.05.03 Dentistry (Specialist programme) (initial accreditation)*

**NATIONAL RESEARCH LOBACHEVSKY STATE UNIVERSITY OF NIZHNY  
NOVGOROD**

**21 - 23 November 2023**

**Nizhny Novgorod, 2023**

## Contents

(I) LIST OF NOTATIONS AND ABBREVIATIONS .....	3
(II) INTRODUCTION 4	
(III) PRESENTATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL INSTITUTION.....	4
(IV) DESCRIPTION OF THE EEC VISIT.....	5
(V) DESCRIPTION OF THE PREVIOUS ACCREDITATION PROCEDURE.....	7
(VI) COMPLIANCE WITH PROGRAMME ACCREDITATION STANDARDS.....	7
<b>6.1. Standard "Mission and Outcomes" .....</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>6.2. Standard "Educational Programme" .....</b>	<b>10</b>
<b>6.3. Standard "Student Assessment Policy".....</b>	<b>14</b>
<b>6.4. Standard "Students" .....</b>	<b>17</b>
<b>6.5. Standard "Academic Staff/Faculty" .....</b>	<b>20</b>
<b>6.6. Standard "Educational Resources" .....</b>	<b>23</b>
<b>6.7. Standard "Educational Programme Evaluation".....</b>	<b>27</b>
<b>6.8. Standard "Governance and Administration".....</b>	<b>29</b>
(VII) OVERVIEW OF STRENGTHS/BEST PRACTICES FOR EACH STANDARD.....	35
(VIII) OVERVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS FOR QUALITY IMPROVEMENT.....	36
(IX) OVERVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE EDUCATIONAL INSTITUTION.....	37
(X) RECOMMENDATION TO THE ACCREDITATION COUNCIL.....	37
Annex 1: Evaluation Table "PROGRAMME PROFILE PARAMETERS".....	38
Annex 2. PROGRAMME OF VISIT TO THE EDUCATIONAL INSTITUTION.....	48
Annex 3. RESULTS OF THE FACULTY SURVEY.....	59
Annex 4: RESULTS OF THE STUDENT SURVEY.....	64

## **(I) LIST OF NOTATIONS AND ABBREVIATIONS**

**EEC** - external expert commission

**SFC** - state final certification

**C.u.** - credit units

**ICM** - Institute of Clinical Medicine

**IAAR** - Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating

**UNN** - Federal State Autonomous Educational Institution of Higher Education "National Research Lobachevsky State University of Nizhny Novgorod"

**EI** - educational institution

**USE** - unified state examination

**EP** - educational programme

**FSES HE** - Federal State Educational Standard of Higher Education

**ELS** - electronic library system

**ECTS** - European Credit Transfer System

**ESG** - Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area

**QF-EHEA** - Qualifications Framework in the European Higher Education Area

**WFME** - World Federation for Medical Education

## **(II) INTRODUCTION**

In accordance with Order No. 158-23-OD dated 02.10.2023 of the Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating, the External Expert Commission from 21 to 23 November 2023 assessed the compliance of the educational programme 31.05.03 Dentistry (Specialist programme) (initial accreditation) of the National Research Lobachevsky State University of Nizhny Novgorod with the standards for international initial accreditation of medical and pharmaceutical education programmes (based on WFME/AMSE/ESG) (No.150-22-OD dated 21 December 2022, third edition).

The report of the External Expert Commission (EEC) contains the assessment of the educational programme presented according to the IAAR criteria, recommendations of the EEC on further improvement of the educational programme and parameters of the educational programme profile.

### **External Expert Commission members:**

1) **Chairperson of IAAR Commission** - Raushan Sultanovna Dosmagambetova, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Medical University of Karaganda (Republic of Kazakhstan) *Off-line participation*

2) **IAAR Expert** - Irina Nikolaevna Moroz, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Belarusian State Medical University (Republic of Belarus) *Off-line participation*

3) **IAAR Expert** - Elena Alexandrovna Kiseleva, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department of General Practice Dentistry, Medical Institute of the Federal State Budgetary Educational Institution of Higher Education "Kemerovo State University", Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation, (Russian Federation) *On-line participation*

4) **IAAR Expert** - Marina Alexandrovna Skiba, Candidate of Pedagogical Sciences, Associate Professor, Chairperson of the IAAR Expert Council, 1st category expert (Astana, Kazakhstan) *Off-line participation*

5) **IAAR Expert, employer** - Polina Vladimirovna Shits, Medicine Plus LLC, Russian Federation (Russian Federation) *On-line participation*

6) **IAAR Expert, student** - Maria Alexeevna Starshenkova, 4th year student of Information Systems and Technologies, Ulyanovsk State Technical University (Russian Federation) *On-line participation*

7) **IAAR Expert, student** - Oksana Mikhailovna Anisimova, 5th year student of the Institute of Clinical Medicine, Samara State Medical University (Russian Federation) *On-line participation*

8) **IAAR Coordinator** - Malika Akhyadovna Saydulaeva, Project Manager, Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating (Republic of Kazakhstan) *Off-line participation*

## **(III) PRESENTATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL INSTITUTION**

Federal State Autonomous Educational Institution of Higher Education "National Research Lobachevsky State University of Nizhny Novgorod", abbreviated names: National Research Lobachevsky State University of Nizhny Novgorod; Lobachevsky State University of Nizhny Novgorod; Lobachevsky University; UNN. The University was founded on 30 January (17 January old style) 1916. It became one of the three People's Universities in Russia and the first higher education institution in Nizhny Novgorod. In 1918, after merging with the Polytechnic Faculty evacuated from Warsaw and the Higher Agricultural Courses, the university received the status of a state university (the first Soviet university).

In 1956, the University was named after the great Russian mathematician Nikolai Lobachevsky.

UNN is one of Russia's leading universities and according to the QS World University Rankings is among the world's top 700 universities. Today, Lobachevsky University has 20 institutes and faculties, 6 research institutes. More than 200 doctors of science, including 19 full members and

corresponding members of the Russian Academy of Sciences, and about 1000 candidates of science are engaged in research and teaching at the University.

#### **(IV) DESCRIPTION OF THE EEC VISIT**

The visit of the External Expert Commission (hereinafter referred to as the EEC) to the Federal State Educational Institution of Higher Education "National Research Lobachevsky State University of Nizhny Novgorod" was organised and conducted from 21 November to 23 November 2023 in accordance with the Programme approved by the IAAR Director A.B. Zhumagulova and agreed with the Acting Rector of the University O.V. Trofimov.

A preliminary meeting was held online on 17 November 2023, with all EEC members attending.

During the visit, the EEC studied regulatory and educational documents of the University under accreditation, training and resource kits for disciplines, guidance materials, visited the structural units and departments declared in the programme, which provide the educational process implementation, and also checked the operation of information systems used by the University for conducting classes online.

All materials requested by the Commission were provided by the University representatives in a timely manner. In order to obtain objective information for the assessment of UNN activities, the EEC members carried out visual inspection of classrooms, laboratories, library, clinical bases and the University's own clinics, other premises used for teaching classes. The Commission also observed and interviewed employees of various structural units, teaching staff members, employers; a questionnaire survey of teaching staff and students was conducted.

UNN ensured the presence of all employees and persons specified in the Visit Programme. The three-day Programme of the EEC programme accreditation was implemented in full, in accordance with the schedule of activities for each day.

On the first day, 21 November 2023, a preliminary meeting of the Chairperson and members of the IAAR EEC was held, during which the objectives, the programme, and the responsibilities of the EEC members were outlined.

The EEC members discussed key issues, determined additional information to be requested from UNN structural units to validate and confirm the reliability of information/data during accreditation.

The meeting with the UNN Acting Rector, Professor Oleg Vladimirovich Trofimov, was held according to the amended programme, an oral presentation on UNN's current activities was made.

A scheduled meeting was held with UNN Vice-Rectors (President of UNN, Professor Roman Grigorievich Strongin; Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs, Professor Mikhail Ivanovich Rykhtik; Vice-Rector for International Affairs and Networking, Associate Professor Alexander Borisovich Bedny; Vice-Rector for Research and Innovation Mikhail Yuryevich Gryaznov; Vice-Rector for Legal Affairs Artyom Igorevich Zavozyaev; Vice-Rector for Strategic Development, Associate Professor Nikita Vladimirovich Avralev; Vice-Rector for Economics and Finance Viktor Alekseevich Bolshakov; Vice-Rector for Organisational and Personnel Affairs, Associate Professor Sergey Valeryevich Starkin; Vice-Rector for Youth Policy and Educational Work Elena Anatolievna Chumankina; Vice-Rector for Administration and Facilities Alexander Vladimirovich Sychev; Vice-Rector for Security Alexander Nikolayevich Kul'tyapov).

After that, a meeting was held with the heads of UNN structural divisions (Head of the Educational Programmes Department Svetlana Valeryevna Yedemskaya; Head of the Educational Process Management Department Yulia Valeryevna Kolchina; Head of the Career Centre Svetlana Valentinovna Romanenko; Head of the Department for International Student Affairs Ekaterina Evgenyevna Smirnova; Deputy Vice-Rector for International Affairs and Networking Konstantin Valeryevich Kemaev; Head of the Informatisation Department Svetlana Nikolayevna Makhlay; Director of the Library Olga Valeryevna Kotova; Head of the Youth Policy Department Veronika Sergeyevna Orlova; Head of the Personnel Department Elena Olegovna Polovinkina; Head of the Corporate Development Department Anastasia Vladimirovna Polozova; Head of the Public Relations and Mass Media Department Tatiana Evgenyevna Upirvitskaya).



An interview meeting was held with the heads of UNN institutes (Director of the Institute of Information Technology, Mathematics and Mechanics Nikolay Yurievich Zolotykh; Director of the Institute of Clinical Medicine Natalia Yurievna Grigorieva). In particular, they took an active part in the meeting with the EEC experts and highlighted the main areas of their activities in terms of organisation of the educational process, development, implementation and management of educational programmes, working with students and teaching staff, interaction with the Rector's Office and other UNN units.

Subsequently, a meeting was held with the heads of UNN departments that teach basic and specialized disciplines in the first cluster (Head of the Department of Multidisciplinary Clinical Training Evgeny Georgievich Sharabrin; Head of the Department of Surgical Diseases Igor Yurievich Ezhov; Head of the Department of Neurology and Medical Rehabilitation Tatiana Valentinovna Buylova; Head of the Department of Clinical Dentistry Natalia Viktorovna Tiunova; Head of EP 31.05.01 General Medicine (taught in English) Natalia Gennadyevna Belyaeva; Head of EP 31.05.01 General Medicine (taught in Russian) Marina Olegovna Petrova; Head of EP 31.05.03 Dentistry (taught in English) Julia Andreyevna Vokulova; Head of EP 31.05.03 Dentistry (taught in Russian) Maria Leonidovna Zhdanova; Chairperson of the Curriculum Commission at the Institute of Clinical Medicine, Associate Professor Elena Aleksandrovna Mikhailova).

During the interviews with these persons, information was obtained about the implementation of the educational process at the departments, the conditions that the university provides for their activities, and answers were given to questions about motivation and incentives for the teaching staff, about admission and career development, financial support of the teaching staff, and other aspects.

During the meeting with the teaching staff of the UNN departments, in particular with the representatives of basic biomedical sciences, behavioural and social sciences, medical ethics, medical jurisprudence, clinical and professional disciplines, the EEC experts asked questions about the implementation of educational, research and clinical processes at UNN, career development opportunities, incentives for teaching staff, provision of the educational process with necessary resources (materials and equipment, information, etc.), interaction with administrative and management bodies. Next, the faculty members took part in the questionnaire survey.

While visually inspecting the UNN facilities, the EEC experts visited UNN's own clinics and the simulation centre, which is also an accreditation centre.

During the day, there were discussions and exchange of experts' opinions, as well as policy development and determination of the range of issues for obtaining necessary information. On 21.11.2023, the EEC experts met with UNN students.

The meeting was held in the form of an interview, where the issues of student support at the university, the functioning of student representative bodies, the participation of students in the activities of the university, in the development of educational programmes and other issues were discussed.

Subsequently, the students took part in the questionnaire survey. Visual inspection was conducted and classes were attended at the UNN departments. The departments demonstrated the classes with 4th-5th year students, instructional materials for students, the lesson plan, assessment tools, and literature for self-study.

There was a conversation with the students, who expressed their positive opinion about the activities of structural units, clinics, departments, the university as a whole, and the educational process.

The EEC experts selectively visited UNN practical training sites.

A meeting with employers was also held. Information was obtained confirming that the university closely cooperates with clinical sites, implements clinical training at clinical sites, its graduates are employed in these organisations, such events as job fairs are used to select and invite young professionals to work, employers are partly involved in the formation of the educational programme by familiarising themselves with the programmes.

In total, 56 representatives of UNN took part in face-to-face meetings and a questionnaire survey regarding the EP "Dentistry" (Table 1).

Table 1 - Information about employees and students who took part in meetings with the IAAR EEC:

Category of participants	Number
Rector	1
President	1
Vice-Rectors	10
Heads of structural units	11
Directors of institutes	2
Heads of departments	9
Teaching staff members	7
Students	12
<b>Total</b>	<b>53</b>

56 representatives of the teaching staff and 254 students took part in the questionnaire survey (26.8% of them were students of the Dentistry educational programme).

According to the results of the questionnaire survey: the level of communication between management and teaching staff was assessed as very good and good by 88.1%; 94% of teaching staff are satisfied with the level of attention paid by the management of the institution to the content of the educational programme; 93.3% of teaching staff are satisfied with the availability of necessary scientific and educational literature in the library for teachers, 92% are satisfied with the openness and accessibility of management for teaching staff, 81% are satisfied with the involvement of teaching staff in the process of making managerial and strategic decisions, 89.2% are satisfied with the equal opportunities for all teaching staff, and 89.2% are satisfied with the attitude of the management of the institution to the teaching staff. The results of the student questionnaire survey indicate that students are fully satisfied with the level of accessibility of the dean's office in 93% of cases, the accessibility of academic advising in 61.8% of cases, the accessibility of counselling for personal problems in 77% of cases, the level of accessibility of library resources in 89.5% of cases, the overall quality of academic programmes in 88.3% of cases, and teaching methods in general in 91.3% of cases,

During the three days of the EEC work, and also after the end of all interviews and visits, the experts discussed the university indicators in terms of their compliance with the programme accreditation parameters and developed recommendations.

On 23.11.2023 upon completion of the work, the EEC experts met with the management and responsible persons of the university, shared their impressions and presented the recommendations developed as a result of the work performed.

## **(V) DESCRIPTION OF THE PREVIOUS ACCREDITATION PROCEDURE**

International accreditation of the Dentistry (Specialist programme) 31.05.03 (initial accreditation) according to IAAR standards is conducted at UNN for the first time.



## **(VI) COMPLIANCE WITH PROGRAMME ACCREDITATION STANDARDS**

### **6.1. Standard "Mission and Outcomes"**

- *Defining the mission*

*The educational institution should:*

- ✓ *define the mission of the EP and communicate it to stakeholders and the healthcare sector.*

- ✓ *reflect in the mission statement of the EP the objectives and educational strategy to train a competent professional at the higher education level in healthcare with an appropriate foundation for a future career in any area of healthcare, including all types of practice, administrative medicine and research in healthcare; capable of fulfilling the roles and functions of a professional in accordance with the established requirements of the healthcare sector; prepared for post-graduate education and committed to training and education in the healthcare sector.*

- ✓ *ensure that the mission incorporates research achievements in the biomedical, clinical, pharmaceutical, behavioural and social sciences, aspects of global health and reflects major international public health issues.*

- *Institutional autonomy and academic freedom*

*The educational institution should:*

- ✓ *have the institutional autonomy to develop and implement a quality assurance policy for which the administration and teachers are responsible, especially with regard to the design of the educational programme and the allocation of resources required to implement the educational programme.*

- ✓ *provide academic freedom for staff and learners to pursue the educational programme and to use the results of new research to enhance the study of specific disciplines/issues without extending the EP.*

- *Learning outcomes*

*The educational institution should:*

- ✓ *identify the expected learning outcomes that students should achieve at the end of their studies in relation to achievements at the basic level in terms of knowledge, skills and professional attitudes; an appropriate foundation for a future career in any area of the healthcare sector; future roles in the healthcare sector; further postgraduate training; commitment to lifelong learning; community health needs, healthcare system needs and other aspects of social responsibility.*

- ✓ *ensure appropriate behaviour of students towards fellow students, teachers, medical staff, patients and their relatives*

- ✓ *publish the expected learning outcomes of the EP*

- ✓ *identify and coordinate the link between the learning outcomes required on completion and those required in postgraduate training*

- ✓ *provide opportunities for students to participate in research in the relevant healthcare field*

- ✓ *pay attention to the expected learning outcomes related to global health*

- *Participation in the formulation of mission and learning outcomes*

*The educational institution should:*

- ✓ *ensure the participation of key stakeholders in the formulation of the mission statement and expected learning outcomes*

- ✓ *ensure that the stated mission and expected learning outcomes are based on the opinions/suggestions of other stakeholders*

### ***Evidence-based part***

All stakeholders participated in the development and approval of the UNN Mission Statement: teaching staff, students, representatives of the practical field, employers.

Institutional autonomy is confirmed by the state status of the educational institution, minutes of the Academic Council meetings, where the institution approves its own standards and educational programmes (Extract from Minutes No. 13 of the UNN Academic Council dated 30.11.2022).

The degree programme is developed by the faculty members of the departments, as well as by working groups including members of the Academic Council, cycle curriculum committees, central coordinating curriculum council with the involvement of practical healthcare workers and students. It is coordinated with the Curriculum Department and approved by the decision of the UNN Academic Council.

When developing the degree programme, the Faculty has enough autonomy to choose the number of biomedical, behavioural, clinical disciplines, inclusion of elective disciplines, types of practical training, i.e. ensuring their compliance with national and international requirements to the maximum extent possible.

Annually, as of September 1, the HR Department analyses the provision of both departments and programmes with professional staff. To organise the learning process in clinical disciplines, the capabilities of the accreditation centre are used, which provides the first degree of realism of simulation training for students to develop practical skills, the development of clinical skills based on the simulation of the situation, which allows students to obtain the correct basic safety skills for patients, while reducing risks in the provision of medical care in the future. There are phantoms for applying dental manipulations, technologies for controlling the correctness of tooth preparation, making injections, prosthesis insertion techniques.

As a result of completing the Specialist programme "Dentistry", the graduate should have universal, general professional and professional competencies set out in the Federal State Standard of Higher Education 31.05.03 Dentistry, implemented through knowledge, skills and abilities. A specialist who has completed the programme can carry out the following types of professional activities: Education and science (in the field of scientific research); Health care (in the field of medical care for dental diseases); Administrative, managerial and office activities (in the field of activities of healthcare organisations).

The assessment of the final results of completing the EP "Dentistry" in the form of the development of all the competencies set out in the educational programme is performed during the Final State Certification of graduates. According to the results of the Final State Certification, the commission, in addition to making decisions on awarding the appropriate qualification, prepares a report, which reflects its opinion on the level of students' training and the main shortcomings in their training. These data are reported and analysed by the Academic Council of the University, where an action plan is adopted to eliminate the shortcomings noted by the chairpersons of the State Examination Commission for the relevant specialty. This assessment serves as a direct feedback for UNN regarding the development of clinical competencies in its graduates.

As part of the quality management system and internal independent assessment of educational quality, questionnaires have been developed and surveys are conducted among students, teachers, employers and graduates (sociological research) in order to study the needs and expectations of consumers of educational services of UNN and of all stakeholders, to improve the quality of education at the University.

The survey process is automated for convenience and efficiency of data collection. The results are discussed at UNN Academic Council meetings, presented at educational and methodological conferences and used to improve the curriculum and the educational programme as a whole.

### ***Analytical part***

The EEC experts note that within the framework of the standard "Mission and Outcomes" in the specialist programme "Dentistry" at UNN, the expert commission's work and analysis of the submitted documentation revealed, in general, compliance with the requirements of the standard.

The analysis of compliance of UNN and the Faculty of Dentistry with the criteria of this Standard, in general, indicates that the university has a Development Strategy, consistent with the mission and vision. The management carries out a number of activities on target indicators of activity areas, monitoring and measures for improvement.

The EEC members note that the Mission of the EP "Dentistry" is communicated to the stakeholders through mass media, by e-mail to all UNN departments, teaching staff, students, by posting on the information stands of the departments.

However, the EEC experts note that the mission and vision were not interpreted during the interviews with the teaching staff and students.

The educational programme for the specialty "Dentistry" at UNN has been designed on the basis of the mission and taking into account the requirements of the federal educational standard and makes it possible to train a competent doctor capable of several types of professional activities, including medical, organisational and managerial, as well as research. This allows the graduates of the educational programme "Dentistry" to choose their career paths.

If the graduate is focused on medical type of professional activities, he/she has an opportunity after receiving a Certificate of primary accreditation of a specialist to be employed in medical institutions as a dentist or to continue training in residency, to carry out research in the process of training under postgraduate or doctoral programmes, preparation and defence of a research qualification thesis.

The available material resources of UNN are used responsibly in order to fulfil the mission and objectives of the EP "Dentistry" in a proper manner.

The EEC members note that UNN attaches great importance to developing in students appropriate behaviour towards colleagues, teachers, administration, patients and their relatives.

At the same time, the EEC members note that the EP "Dentistry" stakeholders (students) found it difficult to clearly describe the mission of the EP during the interviews with the EEC members and to give specific examples of their personal involvement in the development of the UNN and the EP mission and vision.

During their visit and interviews, the EEC members failed to get a full and detailed understanding of what activities were carried out at UNN in order to discuss the mission and final outcomes of the EP "Dentistry".

Satisfactory scores were given by the EEC members for those items that formally comply with the standard, but require increased attention in meeting the criteria of the standards at UNN.

***Strengths/best practices:***

No strengths have been identified for this standard.

***EEC Recommendations:***

1) Ensure that the mission, quality policy and vision of the institution are communicated to all stakeholders (deadline: 01.09.2024);

2) It is recommended that the EP management should involve stakeholders on a regular basis in the development of the mission of the EP "Dentistry" (deadline: 01.09.2024);

3) It is recommended that the management of the EP "Dentistry" should regularly (at least once a year) study, analyze and document the opinions/suggestions of stakeholders regarding the mission, vision and final learning outcomes (deadline: 01.09.2024).

***EEC conclusions based on the criteria:***

*strengths — 0*

*satisfactory — 11*

*need improvement — 2*

*unsatisfactory — 0*

**6.2. Standard "Educational Programme"**

- *Educational programme model and teaching methods*

*The educational institution should:*

- ✓ *define the specifications of the EP, including a statement of expected learning outcomes, a curriculum based on a modular or spiral structure, the qualification to be awarded*
- ✓ *use teaching and learning methods that stimulate, prepare and support students to take responsibility for the*

*learning process*

- ✓ *ensure that the EP is implemented in accordance with the principles of equality.*
- ✓ *develop students' capacities for lifelong learning*

- *Scientific method*

*The educational institution should:*

- ✓ *impart to students throughout the programme of study the principles of scientific methodology, including methods of analytical and critical thinking; methods of research in healthcare and evidence-based medicine*

- ✓ *provide for the possibility to include in the content of the programme the results of modern scientific research.*

- *Basic biomedical sciences*

*The educational institution should:*

- *identify and include in the EP the achievements of basic biomedical sciences to develop in students an understanding of scientific knowledge, concepts and methods that are the basis for the acquisition and application in practice of clinical scientific knowledge.*

- *provide mechanisms for revision and updating of the EP taking into account the achievements of biomedical sciences, which reflect scientific, technological, medical and pharmaceutical developments, current and expected needs of the society and healthcare system.*

- ✓ *Behavioural, social sciences and medical/pharmaceutical ethics*

*The educational institution should:*

- ✓ *identify and incorporate advances in behavioural sciences, social sciences, medical/pharmaceutical ethics and jurisprudence into the EP*

- ✓ *provide mechanisms for revising and updating the EP to reflect advances in behavioural and social sciences, medical/pharmaceutical ethics and jurisprudence, including current scientific, technological and medical and pharmaceutical developments, current and anticipated societal and healthcare system needs; changing demographic and cultural contexts*

- *Clinical/pharmaceutical sciences and skills*

*The educational institution should:*

- ✓ *identify and incorporate advances in clinical/pharmaceutical sciences into the EP to ensure that students on completion of the programme have acquired sufficient knowledge, clinical and professional skills to take appropriate responsibility in subsequent professional practice;*

- ✓ *ensure that students spend a sufficient proportion of the programme in planned contact with patients, service users in appropriate clinical/workplace settings and gain experience in health promotion and disease prevention.*

- ✓ *determine the amount of time dedicated to the core clinical/professional disciplines*

- ✓ *organise training with appropriate attention to the safety of the learning environment and patients, including observation of the student's actions in clinical/workplace settings.*

- ✓ *provide the opportunity to modify the EP, taking into account advances in scientific, technological, medical and pharmaceutical developments, current and anticipated societal and healthcare system needs.*

- ✓ *ensure that each student has early contact with real patients, service users, including his/her gradual involvement in the provision of services and incorporating his/her responsibility:*

- *in relation to the examination and/or treatment of the patient under supervision in an appropriate clinical setting;*

- *in sanitary and epidemiological surveillance procedures in relation to the examination and/or inspection of the facility under supervision, which is carried out in appropriate operational units (sanitary and epidemiological control centres, territorial departments of sanitary and epidemiological control, including transport, disinfection organisations and healthcare institutions);*

- *in relation to patient counselling on the rational use of medicines, which is carried out under appropriate workplace conditions*

- ✓ *structure the various components of training in clinical, environmental and occupational health monitoring and other workplace skills according to the specific stage of the training programme.*

- *Educational programme structure, content and duration*

*The educational institution should:*

- ✓ *describe the content, scope and sequence of disciplines/modules, including maintaining an appropriate balance between basic biomedical, behavioural, social and clinical/professional disciplines*

- ✓ *provide for horizontal integration of related sciences and disciplines;*

- ✓ *provide for vertical integration of clinical/professional sciences with the basic biomedical and behavioural and social sciences*

- ✓ *provide the option of elective content (electives) and determine the balance between the compulsory and elective parts of the programme.*

- ✓ *determine the interrelation with complementary medicine, including non-traditional, traditional or alternative practices, occupational medicine, including aspects of the impact of the environment and anthropogenic production loads, as well as social situation on the population's health.*



- *Programme management*

*The educational institution should:*

- ✓ *determine the procedures for the development, approval and revision of the EP*
- ✓ *designate a committee, under the direction of academic management, responsible for planning and implementing the EP to ensure that the expected learning outcomes are achieved.*
  - ✓ *ensure representation of academic staff, students, representatives from other stakeholders, including representatives from clinical and work bases, healthcare professionals involved in the process of training in the committee of the educational institution in charge of the EP.*
  - ✓ *provide for the possibility to plan and implement innovations in the EP through the committee in charge of the EP.*

- *Linkage with medical/pharmaceutical practice and the healthcare system*

*The educational institution should:*

- ✓ *ensure continuity between the EP and the subsequent stages of professional training or practice that the student will undertake upon graduation*
- ✓ *take into account the specific conditions in which graduates will be working and modify the EP accordingly.*

### ***Evidence-based part***

The total workload of the educational programme is 300 credit units (c.u.). The structure of the educational programme corresponds to the FSES HE in the area of study 31.05.03 Dentistry (Specialist level).

In 2022, the EP was revised by the representatives of the teaching staff of the graduating clinical departments, the Council of students, and employers, a thorough discussion of the main provisions of the EP was held, and it was approved by the UNN Academic Council.

After that, the educational programme “Dentistry“ was approved by the decision of the UNN Academic Council. The EP “Dentistry“ is annually updated in terms of the composition of disciplines (modules) established in the curriculum, and/or the content of work programmes of disciplines (modules), work programmes of practical training, teaching materials that ensure the implementation of appropriate educational technology, taking into account the development of dental science, medicine, healthcare, social sphere and economy, focusing on the expectations of consumers, major employers, and recommendations developed by the UNN quality management system. The development and supervision of the implementation of the EP “Dentistry“ is carried out by the Directorate of ICM, the Department of Educational Programmes and the Department of Educational Process Management of UNN.

The following educational technologies are used during practical classes: educational video films, solving situational problems, business and role-playing educational game, analysis of clinical cases, brainstorming method, small group method, case method, round tables, discussions, duty hours in the departments of the medical facilities, preparation of case histories, portfolios, work on training simulators, etc.

During the study of disciplines aimed at the development of competencies, including research activities, students' research work is widely used (compiling an informative literature review on the proposed topic, preparing an abstract, preparing an essay, report, writing a term paper, preparing training schemes, tables), student's educational research, work in the archives of medical institutions. Trainings, master-classes of experts and specialists of practical healthcare, attending medical conferences and consultations, participation in scientific and practical conferences, meetings with representatives of Russian and foreign companies, state and public organisations are also widely used.

One form of independent work is the creation of the student's portfolio. The student has access to the personal account, which is available from the moment of admission to UNN, where he/she can create a "student's electronic portfolio", which includes saving the student's papers, reviews and assessments of these papers by any participants of the educational process. Portfolio formation develops students' ability to analyse and evaluate the process of their own development.

UNN implements a system of points-based rating of students' academic progress. The main objectives of the points-based rating system are: to increase students' motivation for learning educational programmes; to activate (stimulate) students' daily and systematic work; to improve the

efficiency of students' regular independent work; to reduce the impact of chance and to provide a more accurate and objective assessment of the students' knowledge and practical training during interim assessment.

The opportunities for conducting research, in particular, educational experiments in the classroom, are not fully utilized. Measures for developing this area include: updating the curricula of the departments with the mandatory introduction of elements of educational research and educational experiment in accordance with the topics of the curriculum; strengthening control over the implementation of research and development results of UNN employees in educational and clinical work.

### *Analytical part*

The EEC experts note that the content of the working curricula of all disciplines of the EP "Dentistry" takes into account regional, national peculiarities and the current state of medical science and practice.

Teaching staff members of UNN clinical departments work at clinical facilities and healthcare institutions in Nizhny Novgorod, which ensures a close link between the subject "Dentistry" and practical healthcare and the participation of students in the work of a team of professionals in the provision of various types of dental care.

The EEC members note that practicing dentists take an active part in the training of students. The workload of the EP "Dentistry" is 300 credit units regardless of the form of applied educational technologies, including all types of classroom and independent work of the student, practical training and time allocated for quality control of learning the educational programme, and optional courses. The amount of full-time study programme for one academic year is 60 credit units.

In the process of interviewing students and teaching staff by the EEC members it was revealed that the number of elective disciplines is limited, which can be considered insufficient within the framework of international standards of medical education for meeting the individual needs of all students. This makes it necessary to intensify the work of the management of educational programmes, the dean's office and departments in this area and to involve all stakeholders (students, teaching staff, employers, representatives of practical healthcare, graduates of the EP "Dentistry") into the process of developing a catalogue of elective courses for the EP "Dentistry", taking into account the opinions of all stakeholders.

According to the results of interviewing representatives of focus groups by the EEC members it was revealed that teaching and learning methods based on modern adult learning theory are not actively used at UNN, the analysis of graduates' competency assessment results is not adequately conducted and documented for using the obtained results as a feedback tool for improving the EP, integrated learning based on organ systems and diseases has not been documented, the programme has a consistent linear design; the balance between compulsory and elective parts of the EP "Dentistry" is regulated only on the basis of the FSES HE; there are recommendations to provide the opportunity to form an individual educational path for students through the Catalogue of elective disciplines, which was not presented to the EEC; representatives of clinical facilities, graduates of the EP "Dentistry", practical healthcare professionals did not confirm during the interviews their active participation in the discussion of the content of the EP "Dentistry" in the collegial advisory bodies of the university.

Pursuant to the Federal state educational standard of higher education — Specialist programme 31.05.03 "Dentistry" approved by the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of Russia dated 12 August 2020, No. 984, 2 practical trainings with scientific orientation are offered: introductory practical training "Research work (obtaining primary skills of research work)" and field practice "Research work"; the data on their implementation at UNN have been presented (diaries or working programmes of practical training).

Satisfactory scores were given by the members of the EEC on those items that require increased attention in meeting the standards.



**Strengths/best practices:**

No strengths were identified for this standard.

**EEC Recommendations:**

1) It is recommended that managers of the EP "Dentistry" should gradually adapt the model (integrated modules by systems or organs, spiral design) of the educational programme. (Deadline: 01.09.2025);

2) It is recommended that the university management should organize professional development of teaching staff on the application of modern educational technologies and assessment methods in the educational process. (Deadline: 01.09.2024);

3) It is recommended that managers of the EP "Dentistry" should include in the educational process teaching and learning methods taking into account the best international practices (TBL, CBL, RBL, etc.) based on the principles of andragogy. (Deadline: 01.09.2024);

4) It is recommended that managers of the EP "Dentistry" should monitor the organisation and implementation of students' independent work and its effectiveness (Deadline: 01.09.2024);

5) It is recommended that managers of the EP "Dentistry" should implement horizontal integration of related sciences (integrated module, integrated programme). (Deadline: 01.09.2025);

6) The university management is recommended to develop and implement a system of academic counselling of students (advisor service) on the selection of elective disciplines and the development of individual educational paths. (Deadline: 01.12.2024).

7) It is recommended that managers of the EP "Dentistry" should expand the Catalogue of elective disciplines taking into account the opinion of all stakeholders. (Deadline: 01.12.2024).

8) It is recommended that managers of the EP "Dentistry" should include in the Catalogue of elective disciplines the issues of non-traditional and alternative medical practice. (Deadline: 01.12.2024).

**EEC conclusions based on the criteria:**

*strengths* — 0

*satisfactory* — 19

*need improvement* — 9

*unsatisfactory* — 0

**6.3. Standard "Student Assessment Policy"**

- *Assessment methods*

*The educational institution should:*

- ✓ *define and approve the principles, methods and practices used to assess students, including the number of examinations, criteria for determining pass marks, grades and the number of retakes allowed;*

- ✓ *ensure that assessment procedures cover knowledge, skills, attitudes and professional behaviour*

- ✓ *use a wide range of assessment methods and formats according to their "usefulness rating", which includes a combination of validity, reliability, impact on learning, acceptability and effectiveness of the assessment methods and format.*

- ✓ *provide for the possibility of ensuring that the assessment process and methods are subject to the review of external experts*

- ✓ *demonstrate readiness to ensure that assessment methods and results avoid conflicts of interest and use an appeal system for student assessment results*

- ✓ *provide for the possibility of ensuring an open assessment procedure and its results, informing students of the assessment criteria and procedures used*

- ✓ *provide for the possibility of documenting and assessing the reliability and validity of assessment methods, as well as the involvement of external examiners.*

- *Relationship between assessment and learning*

*The educational institution should:*

- ✓ *use assessment principles, methods and practices that are comparable to the expected learning outcomes and teaching and learning methods, ensure achievement of the intended learning outcomes, support student learning, and provide an appropriate balance of formative and summative assessment to guide learning and make judgements about academic performance*

- ✓ *provide for the possibility of adjusting the number and type of examinations to stimulate both knowledge acquisition and integrated learning*

- ✓ *provide timely, specific, constructive and fair feedback to students on assessment results*

### ***Evidence-based part***

The policy and procedure of learning outcomes assessment, forms of learning outcome assessment within the framework of the EP "Dentistry" are stipulated in accordance with the external and internal regulations of UNN.

Assessment of knowledge, skills and abilities of students is carried out at the following levels: entrance control, ongoing assessment at practical and summative classes; interim certification - examinations and tests at the end of studying disciplines, and state final certification. The principles and methods of assessing students' knowledge at examinations and tests are established by the Regulations on the ongoing academic performance monitoring and interim certification of UNN students. The Regulations establish that "the main purpose of interim certification is to evaluate the quality of students' achievement of the expected learning outcomes in a discipline (module) and practical training".

Expected learning outcomes for each discipline (module) and practical training include knowledge, skills, and abilities characterising the stages of competency development and ensuring achievement of the expected results at the completion of the educational programme.

Interim certification is carried out using assessment tools provided in the working programme of the discipline. Assessment tools for interim certification undergo internal (at the sessions of curriculum committees of UNN faculties/institutes) and external expert review, the results of which are formalised in the form of a report. Assessment tools are updated annually.

The level of mastery of practical skills developed during practical classes is checked at the final (modular) classes on practical skills with thematic patients or with phantoms in the Federal accreditation centre. When assessing practical skills in simulated conditions (OSCE), evaluation sheets taken from the database of the Federal Methodological Centre for Accreditation of Specialists are used. A seven-point evaluation system is used during interim certification.

The ongoing monitoring of UNN students' academic performance is carried out on a daily basis, during the educational process, in the form of oral questioning, testing, written work, practical work, analysis of clinical cases, assessment of the results of students' independent work. The ongoing monitoring of academic performance enables assessment in the course of studying disciplines and practical training, while interim testing provides for assessment of interim and final results of learning in respective disciplines and practical training. The aim of the state final certification at UNN is to establish the compliance of the results of mastering by students of educational programmes with the relevant requirements of the federal state standard (approved by the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of Russia dated 12 August 2020 No. 984).

Each discipline is supported by a working programme and control and measurement tools. These documents are fundamental for the ongoing monitoring of academic performance and intermediate certification. The final assessment of knowledge of the EP "Dentistry" graduates is carried out through the state examination, which includes the assessment of fundamental, paraclinical and clinical knowledge that is required for future specialists to carry out their professional activities.

Relevant regulations establish the processes of ongoing, interim and final certification, describe the policies, principles and methods of assessment, appeals procedures, and retake policies. These fundamental documents are available to the public, including supervisory and regulatory authorities, teaching staff, students and external stakeholders.

The internal control by types of activities is carried out by the departmental staff in accordance with the Work Plan of the departments, within the framework of visits to lectures and training sessions.

The monitoring of the EP implementation is carried out by the UNN Educational Programmes Department based on the results of end-of-term control, final certification, final state certification, analysis of the results of testing, examination of graduates, questionnaire surveys of students, teaching staff, and employers, which makes it possible to assess the achievement of the final learning outcomes of the EP. The monitoring of the EP implementation is carried out within the framework of internal university control and during the internal and external audit of the teaching staff activities.

The final learning outcomes are divided into three categories: knowledge, skills and abilities (all of them together constituting competencies). The programmes of each academic discipline reflect the list of general cultural, generic and professional competencies. One discipline can participate in the development of a number of competencies.

The Simulation Centre, the purpose of which is to provide a practice-oriented approach to medical education, training and development of skills to provide medical care using simulation educational technologies, allows students to assess their level of mastery of practical skills. The second stage of the comprehensive examination of the state final certification is the clinical case analysis (practical skills).

The system ensures a certain balance between formative and summative assessment, which allows an objective ranking of students when awarding prizes, scholarships, encouragement with letters of honour, commendations, etc. For high academic performance and extracurricular activity, students receive bonus points, which are required for them to be admitted to residency in their chosen speciality. An important role in the development of measures to encourage students for extracurricular activities belongs to student self-government bodies: the Student Council, the Student Trade Union, the Council of the Student Scientific Society.

According to the results of the questionnaire survey of UNN students during the work of the EEC, 61% and 27% of respondents are "fully" and "partially satisfied" with the fairness of examinations and interim certification; with the timeliness of assessment - 76% and 18% of students; with the explanation of the rules and strategy of the educational programme - 69% and 20%; with the strategy of the educational programme - 73% and 18%; with the tests and examinations conducted - 57% and 24% of respondents, respectively. The relationship between students and teachers is fully and partially satisfactory for 66% and 26% of respondents; objectivity and fairness of teachers for 53% and 43%; informing students about courses, educational programmes for 66% and 23% of students, respectively.

### ***Analytical part***

According to the results of the questionnaire survey at UNN conducted during the EEC visit, 49% and 33% of respondents, respectively, "fully agree" and "partially agree" that continuous assessment (seminars, tests, questionnaires, etc.) reflects the course content. The assessment criteria used by the instructors are fully and partially understood by 48% and 32% of the surveyed students respectively. 41% and 39% of respondents, respectively, fully and partially agree that the instructors objectively evaluate students' achievements.

The EEC recommends the use of assessment methods based on criteria and reasoning and special examinations, taking into account the specifics of medical education (direct and indirect observation of operational and communicative skills, mini-clinical examination (MiniCex), on-the-job assessment, etc.).

The system of students' knowledge assessment is subject to continuous review by the heads of departments and is an open environment for introducing new methods in this activity.

However, it is necessary to use a wider range of assessment methods and formats depending on their "usefulness assessment", which includes a combination of validity, reliability, impact on learning, acceptability and effectiveness of assessment methods and format, with the use of modern software.

The review of examples of tasks in the test form for senior students revealed the prevalence of tasks of a low cognitive level, and the presence of defects that have been made by the developers of test tasks.

The EEC experts note that UNN needs to document and evaluate the reliability and validity of assessment methods, which requires the implementation of appropriate software and an appropriate quality assurance process for existing assessment practices.

The EEC experts note that UNN needs to introduce new assessment methods in line with the needs and current trends in medical education. It is recommended to establish a clear relationship between assessment and learning and ensure an appropriate balance between formative and summative assessment. This will help to manage learning and assessment of student's academic performance more effectively and to establish rules for assessing progress and their relation to the assessment process.

The EEC experts note that UNN should ensure that timely, specific, constructive and fair feedback is provided to students based on the results of formative and summative assessments, it should document the assessment process using appropriate assessment forms, and make greater use of a variety of models and ways for receiving feedback.

In the course of interviews with the managers of the EP "Dentistry", with the teaching staff and students, the members of the EEC noted that there was a certain misunderstanding on the part of the participants of focus groups on these issues.

Satisfactory scores were given by the members of the EEC on those items that require increased attention in meeting the standards.

***Strengths/best practices:***

No strengths have been identified for this standard.

***EEC Recommendations:***

1) It is recommended that the managers of the EP "Dentistry" should optimise the system of student assessment using methods focused on the degree of learning outcomes achievement, taking into account international practices (Deadline: 01.09.2024);

2) It is recommended that the managers of the EP "Dentistry" should train the teaching staff on summative and formative assessment and ensure an appropriate balance between formative and summative assessment during the implementation of the EP "Dentistry" with the progress of students in each year of study being appropriately recorded (Deadline: 01.09.2024).

3) The managers of the EP "Dentistry" should develop a system (develop a local regulation) that will ensure that the assessment process and methods are open to external expert review (Deadline: 01.09.2024).

4) It is recommended that EP managers should regularly use and document a wide range of assessment methods and formats depending on their "usefulness assessment", which includes a combination of validity, reliability, impact on learning, acceptability and effectiveness of the assessment methods and format. (Deadline: 01.09.2025).

***EEC conclusions based on the criteria:***

*strengths* — 0

*satisfactory* — 6

*need improvement* — 4

*unsatisfactory* — 0



#### 6.4. Standard "Students".

- *Admission and selection policy*

*The educational institution should:*

- ✓ *have an admission policy and implement admission practices that are based on principles of objectivity and include a clear statement about the process of selecting students*
- ✓ *have a policy and implement practices for the admission of persons with disabilities.*
- ✓ *have a policy and implement a practice of transferring students from other educational organisations, including foreign ones.*
- ✓ *establish a connection between selection and the mission of the educational institution, the educational programme and the desired quality of graduates; periodically review the admission policy*
- ✓ *demonstrate readiness to use an appeal system for admission decisions*

- *Student intake*

*The educational institution should:*

- ✓ *determine the number of students admitted in accordance with the capacity of the educational institution at all stages of the educational programme*
- ✓ *demonstrate readiness to periodically adjust the size and nature of student intake, taking into account the views of stakeholders responsible for planning and developing human resources in the healthcare sector to meet the medical needs of community and society*
- ✓ *provide for the possibility of periodically reviewing the size and nature of student intake in consultation with other stakeholders and adjusting the numbers to meet the health needs of community and society*

- *Counselling and support for students*

*The educational institution should:*

- ✓ *demonstrate the potential for using a system of academic counselling for students*
- ✓ *demonstrate readiness to offer students a programme of support to address social, financial and personal needs, allocating appropriate resources and ensuring confidentiality of counselling and support*
- ✓ *demonstrate readiness to use the system of feedback with students on the assessment of conditions and organisation of the educational process*
- ✓ *demonstrate readiness to provide students with documents confirming the obtained qualification (diploma) and diploma supplement (transcript)*
- ✓ *provide the opportunity to take into account the needs of different groups of students and provide opportunities for shaping an individual educational pathway*
- ✓ *demonstrate readiness to provide academic counselling, which is based on monitoring the progress of the student and includes issues of professional guidance and career planning*

- *Student representation*

*The educational institution should:*

- ✓ *have a policy and implement practices for the representation of students and their appropriate participation in the definition of the mission, and in the development, management and evaluation of the educational programme and other matters relating to students*
- ✓ *provide for opportunities to encourage, facilitate and support student activities and student organisations.*

#### ***Evidence-based part***

Admission to higher education programmes (Specialist programmes) is carried out in accordance with UNN regulations, which are updated annually and in accordance with the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation dated 21 August 2020 No. 1076 "On Approval of the Procedure for Admission to Higher Education Programmes - Bachelor's degree programmes, Specialist programmes, Master's degree programmes", other regulatory and legal acts of the higher level.

Transparency, objectivity, maximum accessibility and detailed information for applicants are the main principles of the UNN admission policy at all stages of the admission process.

Admission is carried out in accordance with the UNN Admission Rules, which are approved and published on the UNN information sites in accordance with the Federal Law of 29 December 2012 No. 273-F3 "On Education in the Russian Federation" not later than 1 November of the year preceding the year of admission, and are the main document in the organisation and implementation of the admission policy.

The Admission Rules of UNN are based on federal laws and orders of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation as the founder of UNN, and other agencies.

The Government of the Russian Federation, federal executive authorities, the Ministry of Higher Education and Science of the Russian Federation as the founder of UNN determine the number of students to be admitted, primarily within the framework of admission target figures, distribute the detailed quota of target admission, determine the requirements for the number of places and admission conditions, including special quota, other particular, preferential and special conditions, and general competition.

The organisation of the work and composition of the Admissions Office is determined by the Regulations on the Admissions Office (approved annually by the order of UNN).

To ensure the conduct of entrance examinations for certain categories of citizens, including foreign citizens and stateless persons, UNN has established examination commissions, and the organisation of their work is stipulated by the Regulations on Examination Commissions.

Admission to the first year is carried out on the basis of competitive selection. The competition is carried out on the basis of the total competition score, which is made up of points, entrance tests and points for individual achievements of the entrant. Individual achievements are also taken into account in the case of equal competition points of entrants. This is approved annually in the Admission Rules and provides for taking into account the diverse interests and opportunities of entrants.

Draft admission orders are discussed at the meetings of the Admissions Office; the decision on admission to the first year is taken on a collegial basis. At all stages of admission and enrolment and during the academic year, UNN closely interacts with applicants and their representatives. Technical staff of the Admissions Office is appointed annually for this purpose.

UNN has established a student support and guidance system covering the main scope of problems a student may encounter at various stages of education.

At all stages of education, the Centre for Employment and Career Support provides career guidance and temporary employment support for the period of studies. All organisations and structural units providing counselling services operate within the framework of the law on the protection of personal data on the principles of confidentiality. The established system of support and assistance for students generally ensures the satisfaction of students' needs and requirements.

Student self-governance at UNN is implemented through public student organisations run by students themselves. The policy of student representation at UNN is implemented in three areas: student self-governance; student representation in the collegial bodies of the university that manage the educational process; representing students in social projects.

The Student Council coordinates the initiatives of students and UNN management.

According to the results of the questionnaire survey of UNN students conducted during the EEC visit, relations with the dean's office are rated as "very good" and "good" by 93% of respondents; the level of accessibility of the dean's office by 95% of respondents; the level of accessibility and responsiveness of university management by 93% of respondents. The availability of academic counselling at UNN is fully and partially satisfactory for 92% of respondents; the availability of study materials is satisfactory for 92% of respondents. 86% of respondents are fully or partially satisfied with the availability of counselling for personal problems and transparency of procedures for disciplinary action. 86% of students are fully or partially satisfied with the work of financial and administrative services of UNN. 87% of respondents are fully or partially satisfied with the availability of healthcare services for students and the quality of student healthcare services.

### *Analytical part*

The requirements outlined in the IAAR Standard "Students" are fully met by UNN, with the exception of the choice of elective courses.



UNN defines the relationship between student selection, mission, the EP and the desired quality of graduates. The main criterion for passing the competition is the sum of competition points, which is calculated as the sum of points for each entrance test, as well as those for individual achievements.

In the course of interviews with UNN students, the EEC members found that during meetings with heads of departments and institutes, students have the opportunity to express their opinions and wishes regarding their participation in decision-making, academic quality assurance, and other professional, financial, and social issues. All issues raised and discussed at these meetings are resolved in a timely and appropriate manner.

The results of student questionnaire survey showed high (over 90%) satisfaction rates in terms of the attitude and level of accessibility of the dean's office, accessibility and responsiveness of the university management, support with study materials in the learning process, availability of counselling for personal problems, financial and administrative services of the educational institution, level of accessibility of library resources, quality of services provided in libraries and reading rooms, existing educational resources of the university, usefulness of the website of the educational institution as a whole and its faculties in particular, the transparency of the procedure for incentive and disciplinary measures, the overall quality of the curricula, teaching methods in general, and the quality of teaching.

The interviews did not confirm the implementation at UNN of a definite system of academic counselling for students (permanent advisor service) on the selection of elective courses, forming an individual educational path, preparation for postgraduate studies and professional career planning.

Satisfactory scores were given by the EEC members for those items that require increased attention in meeting the standards.

***Strengths/best practices:***

No strengths have been identified for this standard.

***EEC Recommendations:***

The university management is recommended to systematically collect information, analyse the results of feedback from students on the formulation of the mission, content and implementation of the educational programme and use the results obtained to improve their quality. (Deadline: 01.09.2024, to be performed at least once a year).

***EEC conclusions based on the criteria:***

*strengths — 0*  
*satisfactory — 15*  
*need improvement — 1*  
*unsatisfactory — 0*

**6.5. Standard "Academic Staff/Faculty"**

- *Selection and recruitment policy*

*The educational institution should develop and implement a staff selection and recruitment policy to:*

✓ *determine their category, responsibility, and balance of academic staff/faculty in the basic biomedical sciences, behavioural and social sciences, and medical/pharmaceutical sciences to adequately implement the EP, including the appropriate ratio of faculty members teaching medical, non-medical, pharmaceutical courses, full-time and part-time faculty, and the balance between academic and non-academic staff.*

- ✓ *consider criteria for academic, educational and clinical excellence, including the balance between teaching, research and "service" functions*
  - ✓ *determine and ensure monitoring of the responsibilities of academic staff/faculty of basic biomedical sciences, behavioural and social sciences and clinical, hygiene, pharmaceutical sciences*
  - ✓ *provide for the possibility to take into account in selection and recruitment policy such criteria and characteristics as relevance to the mission and economic opportunities of the educational organisation, as well as the region's relevant characteristics*
    - *Staff performance and development policy*
- The educational institution should develop and implement a staff performance and development policy aimed at:*
- ✓ *maintaining a balance of opportunities between teaching, research and 'service' functions, ensuring that meritorious academic activities are recognized, with appropriate emphasis on teaching, research and professional qualifications*
  - ✓ *ensuring that individual members of staff have sufficient knowledge of the whole educational programme, as well as faculty training, development and appraisal*
  - ✓ *providing for the possibility to take into account the teacher-student ratio depending on the different components of the educational programme*
  - ✓ *staff career development.*

### ***Evidence-based part***

The main resource of UNN is its teaching staff, whose professional level ensures the high quality of the educational process and the university's competitiveness in the market of educational services.

The policy of selection and recruitment of academic staff at UNN is carried out in accordance with the Labour Code of the Russian Federation, the Regulations "On the procedure for filling positions of academic personnel belonging to the teaching staff", approved by the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of Russia dated 23.07.2015 No. 749, the Nomenclature of teaching staff positions in organisations engaged in educational activities, positions of heads of educational organisations, approved by the Resolution of the Government of the Russian Federation No. 225 of 21.02.2022 "On Approval of the Nomenclature of the positions of academic staff of organisations engaged in educational activities, positions of heads of educational organisations", and the order of the Ministry of Health and Social Development of the Russian Federation No.1n dated 11.01.2011 "On approval of the Unified qualification register of positions of managers, specialists and employees, section "Qualification characteristics of positions of managers and specialists of higher professional and additional professional education".

The HR policy on recruitment and selection ensures full equality and accessibility to vacancies available at UNN for all those who apply and guarantees equal opportunities and objective assessment of applicants' professional qualities.

The proportion of the teaching staff with higher academic degrees in the EP "Dentistry" for the last 5 years remains stable at the level of about 70%. All the teachers of clinical departments have specialist certificates (specialist accreditation certificates). The teaching staff members have a high level of qualification and competence, more than 50 % of teaching staff members have experience of research, teaching and clinical work of 15 years and more. Classes with students are conducted in Russian and English. Every year the number of teachers who are proficient in a foreign (English) language with the level necessary for teaching at the university increases.

Faculty members are guaranteed the right to elect colleagues and to be elected to the governing and advisory bodies of UNN and of the Institute of Clinical Medicine in accordance with the current criteria and procedures. In order to stimulate employees to achieve quality results of their work and to reward them for the work performed, UNN has established incentive payments in addition to the salary.

The issues of staff incentives are addressed by the local regulations of the university, in particular, by the orders on remuneration of UNN employees.

The regulations are designed to ensure uniformity in labour remuneration of UNN employees and establish the procedure and terms of labour remuneration, the procedure for spending funds on labour remuneration, the system of financial incentives and rewards for employees.

The system of financial incentives and rewards is aimed at increasing motivation for work of UNN employees, ensuring their financial motivation and increasing responsibility for the results of their activities, including the provision of educational services. The regulations determine the amount of official salaries by professional qualification groups, the amount of incremental coefficients to salaries; terms and amounts of compensatory and incentive payments.

According to the results of the questionnaire survey during the EEC visit, UNN faculty members gave a positive assessment ("very good" and "good" ratings) regarding the opportunity to use their own teaching strategies (90%) and teaching methods (98%); the opportunity to participate in academic mobility programmes (97%); professional development (95%); support from the faculty management (91%); and the opportunity to conduct research (91%). 94% of teachers have a positive assessment of the opportunities provided by UNN for the professional development of its teaching staff.

According to the results of the questionnaire survey of UNN students conducted during the EEC visit, 80% of students gave positive feedback ("very good" and "good") on the fact that the faculty teachers use effective teaching methods (93%); have a good command of the material they teach (96%); use effective teaching methods (80%); present the material in an understandable form (89%); present the material in an interesting form (76%); meet the requirements in terms of personal development and professional training of future specialists (82%); stimulate students' activity (77%); stimulate students' creative thinking (72%); demonstrate a positive attitude towards students (82%); and have a good command of professional language (97%).

### *Analytical part*

The EEC experts note that at UNN:

- there is a balance of academic staff/faculty of basic biomedical sciences, behavioural and social sciences and clinical sciences to adequately implement the EP "Dentistry";
- criteria have been developed for the recruitment and selection of faculty members, including the scientific, pedagogical and clinical merits of applicants;
- monitoring of the responsibility of academic staff/faculty engaged in teaching social sciences and humanities, basic biomedical sciences, behavioural, social and clinical sciences is ensured.
- institutional conditions for the funding of staff and efficient use of resources are taken into account.

The EEC experts state that the teachers involved in the implementation of the EP "Dentistry" at UNN:

- provide quality educational services to train qualified professionals for the healthcare system;
- conduct their own research and implement it both in the educational process and in clinical activities;
- conduct social and educational work as part of the development of social and personal qualities of the future dental doctors;
- evaluate the quality of students' training by means of ongoing, interim and final control using assessment tools developed at the departments;
- participate in the selection of base institutions of practical healthcare for students' training and professional practice;
- provide advisory and scientific and practical assistance to medical institutions;
- introduce simulation training methods into the learning process;
- develop and introduce new educational and instructional materials into the learning process;
- take part in the implementation of academic mobility programmes.

UNN has implemented a policy for teaching staff performance and development, which guarantees recognition of academic activities according to their merits, with a corresponding

emphasis on teaching, research and clinical qualifications, which is implemented in the form of institutional and governmental awards, promotion and/or remuneration in the form of a bonus. Clinical work and the results of research are used in teaching and learning.

On the whole, satisfaction of UNN faculty and students with their working and learning conditions is noted, however, the EEC members point out that the interviews and the questionnaire survey of the faculty have revealed the respondents' concern with regard to unbalanced teaching load by semesters ("sometimes" - 10% and "often" - 39%); overcrowding of study groups ("sometimes" - 11% and "often" - 47%); inconvenient schedule of classes ("sometimes" - 14% and "often" - 42%); which was also noted during the observation of the course of practical classes in the course of face-to-face visits to classes and individual clinical bases, where training is conducted within the EP "Dentistry".

The EEC experts also note that, according to the results of interviews with teaching staff and students, analysis of the content of working curricula for disciplines and face-to-face visiting of lectures and practical classes, the educational process at UNN is mainly based on learning and teaching methods focused on memorising (reproducing) and understanding of the study material; elements of analysis of clinical situations; supervision of patients under the guidance of clinical tutors (in senior courses). Assessment methods are used that do not reflect all the competencies envisaged in the EP "Dentistry", which is also noted in the EEC recommendations to Standard 2 "Educational Programme".

Most of the faculty and students lack proper orientation in such teaching and learning methods as TBL (Team Based Learning), CBL (Case Based Learning); Research Based Learning, Project Based Learning, etc.

Large-scale implementation of modern teaching methods in the learning process of the EP "Dentistry" at UNN will make it possible to immerse students in the conditions of a safe quasi-professional environment; to model real clinical situations based on the rich clinical experience of the teaching staff; to consider and analyse diverse complex clinical cases from the perspective of an integrated interdisciplinary approach; to develop communication skills, clinical thinking, research and teamwork skills in students, starting from their junior years of study.

Introducing modern educational technologies in the learning process will require from UNN teaching staff to master such assessment methods as assessing the cognitive, operational, communicative, research component of students' competencies; the ability to independently search for and analyse information; skills to work in a professional and interdisciplinary team. This should be implemented in the course of development and implementation of modern assessment methods and tools and evaluation forms successfully used in the global medical community.

***Strengths/best practices:***

No strengths have been identified for this standard.

***EEC recommendations:***

- 1) To organize professional development for teaching staff on the application of modern educational technologies and assessment methods in the educational process (Deadline: 01.09.2024);
- 2) To expand the range of teaching methods taking into account the best international practices (TBL, CBL, RBL, etc.) (Deadline: 01.09.2024).

***EEC conclusions based on the criteria:***

*strengths — 0*

*satisfactory — 7*

*need improvement — 1*

*unsatisfactory — 0*



## 6.6. Standard "Educational Resources"

- *Physical facilities*

*The educational institution should:*

- ✓ *demonstrate readiness to provide sufficient physical facilities to ensure adequate implementation of the educational programme, and to create a safe learning environment for staff, students, patients and their relatives*
- ✓ *demonstrate readiness to improve the learning environment by regularly updating and expanding physical facilities to meet changes in educational practices*

- ✓ *Resources for practical training*

*The educational institution should:*

- *demonstrate readiness to provide the necessary resources to ensure that students receive appropriate clinical/practical experience, including:*
  - *quality and categories of patients/service users*
  - *number and categories of clinical/workplace bases, which include:*
  - *supervision of students' practice*
- ✓ *demonstrate readiness to assess, adapt and improve clinical/practical training environments to meet community needs*

- *Information technology*

*The educational institution should:*

- ✓ *develop and implement policies for the effective and ethical use and evaluation of appropriate information and communication technologies*
- ✓ *make provision for access to websites or other electronic media*
- ✓ *make provision for faculty and students to access relevant patient data and healthcare information systems using existing and appropriate new information and communication technologies for self-learning, access to information, patient databases and healthcare information systems*

- *Research and scientific achievements*

*The educational institution should:*

- ✓ *demonstrate readiness to use research activities and scientific achievements in the field of medicine, pharmacy as a basis for the educational programme*
- ✓ *formulate and implement policies that promote the relationship between research and education; provide information on the research base and research priorities of the educational institution*
- ✓ *ensure that the linkage between research and education is taken into account in teaching, encourages and prepares students for participation in research in the field of healthcare*

- *Educational expertise*

*The educational institution should:*

- ✓ *have a policy and implement access to educational expertise of processes, practices and problems of medical and pharmaceutical education with the involvement of specialists, educational psychologists, sociologists at university, inter-university and international levels; develop and implement a policy of expertise in the development, implementation and evaluation of the educational programme, development of teaching and assessment methods*
- ✓ *demonstrate readiness to provide evidence of the use of internal or external educational expertise in staff development, taking into account current experience in medical/pharmaceutical education and promoting the interests of staff in educational research*

- *Exchanges in the field of education*

*The educational institution should:*

- ✓ *have a policy and implement practices of national and international cooperation with other educational organisations, including staff and student mobility, as well as the transfer of educational credits*
- ✓ *demonstrate readiness to facilitate the participation of teachers and students in academic mobility programmes at home and abroad and allocate appropriate resources for this purpose*

### ***Evidence-based part***

To implement the EP "Dentistry", UNN has sufficient facilities, complying with current rules and regulations, providing all types of subject-focused and interdisciplinary training, practical and research activities of students, as envisaged by the curriculum,

To implement the educational process, UNN has academic buildings, premises of clinical departments and laboratories located in medical clinics, its own clinics, and dormitories for students. The analysis of the materials and technical equipment of the classrooms for completing the educational programme shows full compliance with the requirements of the FSES HE.

UNN has sufficient facilities for implementing the educational programme: availability of classrooms and lecture halls provided with modern technical equipment; a library and its collection; sports halls and sports grounds with appropriate equipment; sufficient provision of dormitories and catering facilities for students.

All the premises comply with fire safety requirements and sanitary and hygienic norms. Clinical departments of UNN are located in medical organisations of the city. The academic buildings have all the infrastructure for conducting classes and meeting the social and living needs of students. All classrooms are furnished with modern technical and demonstration equipment.

UNN has adequate facilities for all types of subject-focused and interdisciplinary training, laboratory, practical and research work of students, residents and postgraduates. The state of the classrooms and laboratories and the level of their equipment corresponds to the requirements of current educational standards. The students have at their disposal lecture halls, classrooms, interdepartmental laboratories. UNN has its own Dental Clinic.

UNN departments involved in teaching humanities, socio-economic, natural sciences and biomedical disciplines have everything necessary to organise and conduct the learning process, in particular, there are fully equipped classrooms, projectors and linguistic equipment, microscopes, tables for all sections of disciplines.

The education process at UNN is provided with a sufficient amount of the most diverse modern equipment (computers, office equipment, technical teaching aids, laboratory equipment, medical simulators and phantoms, medical instruments and consumables, medical, physical and chemical instruments, reagents and chemical utensils, anatomical and biological collections, microscopes and micro specimens), which is replenished according to the standard lists of necessary equipment.

The Federal Accreditation Centre was established at UNN on the basis of its Multidisciplinary Accreditation and Simulation Centre.

Library and information support of educational activities is provided by the UNN Library. The library provides instructional, scientific and informational support of the educational programmes implemented at the University. The University Library has concluded contracts for providing access to professional databases, information, reference and search systems that are required for the educational process. It has also launched the electronic library system (ELS) "Student's Consultant".

Each student during the entire period of his/her studies is provided with individual unlimited access to the ELS "Student's Consultant" and to the UNN electronic information and educational environment.

The electronic information and educational environment of the University provides access to the publications of electronic library systems and electronic educational resources specified in the work programmes.

Thus, the University library fulfils the requirements of the legislation in terms of instructional, library and information support of the educational programmes implemented by the University.

To provide clinical training to students, clinical departments based in medical organisations are used. Clinical bases with which UNN has agreements on practical training of students include several medical organisations, including multidisciplinary 24-hour hospitals; specialised medical institutions (obstetrical and gynaecological, infectious diseases, oncological, dermatological, ophthalmological, phthisiatric, psychiatric); outpatient and polyclinic institutions; social welfare institutions; medical prevention institutions; institutions providing psychological and pedagogical assistance.

Medical organisations, which are clinical bases of UNN, have the necessary modern facilities to train students in the provision of all types of dental care in accordance with the current Procedures for the provision of medical care in the relevant areas, which is confirmed by the appropriate licences.

At clinical bases, students under the supervision of teachers can jointly use medical equipment and tools for mastering professional competencies in such areas as Practice on obtaining professional



skills and experience of professional work (in preventive dentistry, surgical dentistry, therapeutic dentistry, orthopaedic dentistry, general dentistry, paediatric dentistry).

The educational process is supplemented with a stage of simulation training through the extensive use of patient-substitution and patient-centred technologies.

According to the results of the questionnaire survey of teachers conducted during the EEC visit, the sufficiency and availability of necessary scientific and educational literature in the library was positively assessed ("very good" and "good") by 91% of respondents; the level of conditions provided, taking into account the needs of different groups of students, by 94% of respondents.

According to the results of the questionnaire survey of UNN students conducted during the EEC visit, the sufficiency and availability of library resources was positively assessed ("very good" and "good") by 94% of respondents; quality of services provided in libraries and reading rooms, by 96%; satisfaction with existing educational resources, by 93%; available computer classes and research laboratories, by 89%; provision of students with dormitory accommodation, by 68% of respondents.

Based on the analysis of the questionnaire survey results, it was found that UNN provides sufficient opportunities for engaging in sports and other leisure activities (86%); facilities and equipment for students are safe, comfortable and modern (81%). Positive answers were received from 84% of respondents in terms of providing equal opportunities for all students.

### *Analytical part*

The EEC experts acknowledge that, within the framework of the standard "Educational Resources" for the EP "Dentistry", as evidenced by the findings of the expert commission and the analysis of the documentation submitted, UNN constantly improves the learning environment for students through regular updating, expansion and enhancement of its facilities, which is in line with the development of healthcare and the practice of education in medicine.

The EEC members note that UNN provides the necessary resources for the successful implementation of the EP "Dentistry" through the acquisition of clinical experience by students, which includes a sufficient number of training and clinical bases and categories of patients, as well as long-term contractual relations with medical organisations of Nizhny Novgorod city.

UNN implements a format of practical training in the form of placements at leading Russian and foreign universities.

The EEC members note that UNN teachers, according to the results of questionnaire survey during the EEC visit, indicate such problems in their educational activities (with answers "sometimes" and "often") as lack of classrooms (17% and 46% respectively); inadequate conditions for teaching in classrooms (8% and 26% respectively); weak Internet signal (10% and 47%); not receiving information about some events in a timely manner (7% and 35%); lack of technical teaching aids in some classrooms (13% and 27%).

The EEC experts note that UNN should develop and implement a policy regarding the use of expertise in the development of teaching methods and assessment of knowledge and skills in the EP "Dentistry", for instance, involving a group of independent experts (from among the advanced faculty members), since learning and teaching methods are somewhat behind the capabilities of the university's physical facilities.

The EEC experts also recommend the management of the Institute of Clinical Medicine to carry out a set of measures to conduct an expert review in the field of education assessment and in medical education research, including the study of theoretical, practical and social issues, as there was no convincing data on the ongoing research and expert work during interviews with UNN faculty members.

According to the results of interviews with faculty members who teach disciplines in the EP "Dentistry", the EEC experts identified the need for more assistance from the UNN administration to promote the aspirations and interests of the staff in conducting research in the field of medical education.

Satisfactory scores were given for those items that require more attention in meeting the standards.

***Strengths/best practices:***

No strengths have been identified for this standard.

***EEC recommendations:***

1) The university management is recommended to plan and implement research in medical education, to promote the aspirations and interests of the staff in conducting research, including the study of theoretical, practical and social issues of medical education, to implement the positive results of these studies in the educational process. (Deadline: 31.12.2024).

2) The university management is recommended to provide a safe environment (to conduct certification of workplaces) for the employees of the specialised departments of the Institute of Clinical Medicine. (Deadline: 01.09.2024).

***EEC conclusions based on the criteria:***

*strengths — 0*

*satisfactory — 9*

*need improvement — 5*

*unsatisfactory — 0*

**6.7. Standard "Educational Programme Evaluation"**

• *Mechanisms for programme monitoring and evaluation*

*The educational institution should:*

✓ *have established procedures for monitoring and periodic evaluation of the educational programme and the learning outcomes, student progress and performance of students*

✓ *develop and demonstrate readiness to apply an evaluation mechanism for the educational programme that examines the programme, its main components, student performance, identifies and addresses problems, ensures that relevant evaluation results have an impact on the EP*

✓ *demonstrate readiness to periodically evaluate the programme, giving a comprehensive review of the educational process, components of the educational programme, expected learning outcomes and social responsibility*

• *Teacher and student feedback*

*The educational institution should:*

✓ *provide for systematic feedback, analysing and responding to feedback from teachers and students.*

✓ *demonstrate readiness to use the results of feedback to improve the educational programme*

• *Performance of students*

*The educational institution should:*

✓ *demonstrate readiness to analyse the performance of students in accordance with the mission and expected learning outcomes, study programme and availability of resources.*

✓ *demonstrate readiness to analyse the performance of students, taking into account the conditions of their previous education, the level of preparation for admission to the university; use the results of the analysis to interact with the structural unit responsible for the selection of students, development of the educational programme, and counselling of students.*

• *Involvement of stakeholders*

*The educational institution should:*

✓ *demonstrate readiness to involve key stakeholders in the monitoring and evaluation of the educational programme*

✓ *demonstrate readiness to provide stakeholders with access to the results of programme evaluation, collect and review feedback from them and their comments on the educational programme.*

### ***Evidence-based part***

UNN has a multilevel system for evaluating educational programmes, which includes ongoing monitoring by the dean's office, periodic monitoring by the Curriculum Department, evaluation of the quality of the education process by the Standardization and Quality Office in the form of internal audits of educational units and processes. The monitoring of the educational programme and the results of its mastering is implemented on the basis of the Regulations on the professional higher education programme (Bachelor's, Specialist, Master's programme).

The UNN Curriculum Department is responsible for regular monitoring of the educational programme. The Dean's office with the active participation of the departments ensures timely fulfilment and evaluation of the tasks assigned. The results are discussed at the meetings of the central coordinating curriculum council, quality council, and are communicated to the departments and faculty members. Monitoring of the educational programme is carried out to identify its compliance with the requirements of the FSES HE.

The UNN Department of Educational Programmes provides students with a real opportunity to take part in shaping their programme of study, explains their rights and responsibilities for the implementation of the EP.

After studying each discipline, students have the opportunity to formulate and bring to the attention of the head of department their proposals on the structure, scope and content of the discipline studied, as well as on the methods and control tools by means of questionnaires. In order to analyse the educational programme, there is a basic feedback system, which controls the following indicators: the percentage of curricula and programmes of academic disciplines that meet the requirements of the FSES in terms of level and content; the percentage of disciplines provided with instructional materials; the level of graduates' competencies according to the FSES requirements; student satisfaction; graduate satisfaction; teacher satisfaction. Patients applying to the Dental Department of the UNN University Clinic sign an informed voluntary consent for medical intervention.

According to the results of the questionnaire survey of students during the EEC visit, 88% of respondents are fully and partially satisfied with the overall quality of study programmes; 90% of students are satisfied with teaching methods; 94% of students are satisfied with the quality of teaching; 89% of respondents are satisfied with the academic load and requirements for students. The results of the study on the satisfaction of different categories of consumers are communicated to all UNN stakeholders.

### ***Analytical part***

The EEC experts note that in the course of the work of the expert commission and analysis of the documents submitted, it was found that the EP "Dentistry" in terms of the standard "Evaluation of Educational Programmes" is mostly in compliance with the requirements of the standard. The EEC members, having analysed the submitted documents and having interviewed the participants of focus groups, came to the conclusion that UNN has a multilevel system of evaluation of the educational programme in the specialty "Dentistry", which includes internal evaluation of the education quality and consists of:

- ongoing monitoring of the organisation and implementation of the educational process by the dean's office (in the form of monthly departmental reports on current academic performance and student attendance);
- assessment of the quality of the educational process by the Curriculum Office and the Educational Quality Assurance Office in the form of an internal audit of educational units and processes;
- participation of independent experts in the procedures of interim and final certification;
- assessment of the quality of teaching by the faculty members through questionnaires from students;

- internal departmental assessment of teaching quality in the form of mutual visits of teaching staff to classes, etc.

UNN administration periodically conducts assessment of the EP, including the content of disciplines, organisation of the educational process, material and technical resources, learning environment, cultural and national peculiarities.

At the same time, the EEC experts note that UNN needs to update the monitoring of processes and results, which should include the collection and analysis of data on key aspects of the educational programme "Dentistry".

The academic performance of UNN students is systematically analysed in relation to the mission and final learning outcomes of educational programmes, taking into account such indicators as the grade point average for specific disciplines and courses of study; absolute academic performance and qualitative indicator of academic performance; absolute number and proportion of dropouts. The conditions of study in the disciplines that have been completed are also analysed.

UNN administration conducts periodic surveys to assess the degree of student and faculty satisfaction with educational programmes and resource provision.

At the same time, the EEC members state that the processes of receiving feedback from the UNN students regarding the EP "Dentistry" being implemented are insufficient for developing corrective or preventive measures to improve the EP "Dentistry".

The EEC members note that the feedback concerning the issues of assessment and improvement of the EP is mainly presented in the form of questionnaire surveys, while it is necessary to expand the range of forms and methods, taking into account the specifics of the EP (oral and written comments from the EP stakeholders; reflective reviews; focus group interviews, chronological reports, etc.).

Satisfactory scores were given by the EEC members for those items that require more attention in meeting the standards.

***Strengths/best practices:***

No strengths have been identified for this standard.

***EEC recommendations:***

1) It is recommended that the managers of the EP "Dentistry" involve professional associations at the regional level to evaluate the educational programme in order to improve the quality of training. (Deadline: 01.09.2024).

2) It is recommended that the university management should ensure documentation of the process of evaluation of students' academic achievements by implementing an electronic journal to ensure accessibility and openness to all participants of the educational process. (Deadline: 01.12.2024).

***EEC conclusions based on the criteria:***

*strengths* — 0

*satisfactory* — 6

*need improvement* — 3

*unsatisfactory* — 0

**6.8. Standard "Governance and Administration"**

• *Governance*

*The educational institution should:*

✓ *define structural units and their functions, including relationships within the University*



✓ *define committees in the management structure, their responsibilities and composition, reflecting the representation of key and other stakeholders, ensuring transparency of the management bodies' work and the decisions they make*

- *Academic leadership*

*The educational institution should:*

✓ *describe the academic leadership's responsibilities in defining and managing the educational programme*

✓ *demonstrate readiness to periodically assess academic leadership in relation to the achievement of its mission and expected learning outcomes*

- *Educational budget and resource allocation*

*The educational institution should:*

✓ *have a clear allocation of responsibility and authority for resourcing the educational programme, including a dedicated budget for training*

✓ *demonstrate readiness to allocate the resources required for the implementation of the educational programme and to allocate educational resources according to the needs of the programme*

✓ *provide for the possibility of independent allocation of resources, including remuneration for teachers who adequately achieve the expected learning outcomes; when allocating resources, take into account scientific advances in healthcare as well as public health issues and needs.*

- *Administrative staff and management*

*The educational institution should:*

✓ *demonstrate readiness to have administrative and professional staff, to implement the educational programme and related activities, ensure proper management and allocation of resources*

✓ *demonstrate readiness to ensure that all units of the educational organisation participate in the processes and procedures of the internal quality assurance system.*

- *Interaction with the healthcare sector*

*The educational institution should:*

✓ *demonstrate readiness to engage constructively with the healthcare system and health-related sectors of society and government, including those abroad*

✓ *demonstrate readiness to formalise collaboration, including the involvement of staff and students, with partners in the healthcare sector.*

- *Public information*

*The educational institution should:*

✓ *provide for regular publication on the official website of the educational institution and in the mass media of complete and reliable information about the educational programme and its achievements*

### ***Evidence-based part***

The management of activities and interaction between structural and collegial units of UNN is carried out in accordance with the UNN Charter.

The collegial management body of UNN is the Academic Council, which includes the Rector, Vice-Rectors, deans of faculties, representatives of regional healthcare authorities, heads of departments, heads of structural units, faculty members, students.

The Academic Council considers and makes decisions on the main areas of educational, scientific and medical activities of UNN, and also approves curricula and educational programmes on the proposal of the deans of faculties, submits candidates for academic titles, awards honorary titles, approves local regulations to govern the main activities.

According to its organisational structure, UNN has vertical and horizontal interaction of structural units.

The Rector is responsible for the general management and administration of UNN activities.

Directly subordinate to the Rector are the Vice-Rectors and Departments that support the processes within UNN.

The ICM Directorate is a structural unit under the authority of the Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs. In the course of performing its main tasks and functions, the Dean's Office interacts with other units: the Department of Educational Programmes and the Department of Educational Process Organisation, the Personnel Department, and the University's academic departments. Interaction between the Directorate and departments and students is carried out within the framework of meetings

of councils and committees, as well as in the electronic information educational environment of the university by means of corporate e-mail and electronic personal accounts.

UNN carries out financial and economic activities in accordance with the Charter approved by the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Russian Federation, the Budget Code, federal laws, decrees of the Government of the Russian Federation, other regulations in force in the territory of the Russian Federation.

The Financial and Economic Affairs Department ensures economic feasibility and validity of the UNN programme policy aimed at supporting the UNN Mission, the educational programme, and external relations.

The funding is provided in accordance with the agreements concluded with the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Russian Federation. The funding of the educational programme is provided from the following sources: 1) subsidies for financial support of the state (municipal) assignment from the federal budget; 2) targeted subsidies in accordance with the Budget Code of the Russian Federation; 3) proceeds from the provision of paid educational services, and other paid services.

UNN can independently allocate financial resources to achieve the final learning outcomes in accordance with the regulatory documents.

The amount of funding of the University to implement the main educational programme of higher education is determined in accordance with the standards established by the Government of the Russian Federation. Taking into account the peculiarities of educational programmes, the following types of expenditures per one student of a specialist programme are envisaged: expenditures for remuneration of employees, including established compensatory and incentive payments; expenditures directly related to the provision of the educational process (purchase of teaching and visual aids, technical teaching aids, consumables, stationery, payment for communication services in terms of costs associated with connection to the Internet and payment for the use of this network and other utility needs), other expenditures related to the provision of the educational process (professional development of employees, travel expenses, etc.).

UNN makes incentive payments to faculty members: for high achievements in scientific and pedagogical activities; for state, departmental and university awards and distinctions; based on the results of rating control of their performance quality.

UNN allocates funds to support students (financial aid). Analysis is conducted of the amount of financial resources spent on faculty remuneration. Based on the results of the teaching staff performance, the indicators for determining an effective bonus system are reviewed. It is planned to expand the indicators of faculty labour evaluation when the intended results in education are achieved, subject to the availability of financial resources.

External independent assessment of education quality is carried out on a permanent basis in accordance with the Federal Law of 29.12.2012 No. 273-FZ "On Education in the Russian Federation", "Methodological recommendations for the organization and conduct of internal independent assessment of the quality of education in educational institutions of higher education - Bachelor's, Specialist and Master's degree programmes" (letter of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation dated 15 February 2018 No. 05-435), and the UNN order.

Regular self-assessment is carried out within the framework of the annual self-evaluation of UNN, as well as through internal audit, which regulates internal activities and is designed to analyse and evaluate the organisation's performance. The main objectives of internal audits at UNN are: to assess the conformity of the QMS or its individual processes to the requirements of internal regulatory documents, international and national standards; to provide the organisation's management with reliable data on the quality of educational, research and other processes; to analyse the effectiveness of corrective and preventive actions to eliminate any identified inadequacies.

UNN is a dynamically developing and socially responsible educational organisation, which has developed and implemented procedures for continuous monitoring and improvement of its fundamental functioning processes.

The monitoring of the implementation of the educational programme at UNN includes:



- 1) self-assessment procedure;
- 2) internal audit procedure;
- 3) stakeholder surveys to identify requirements to learning outcomes;
- 4) analysis of entrance control results (testing, USE);
- 5) feedback from stakeholders;
- 6) results of all types of practical training.

The documenting of inadequacies and shortcomings in the work of the departments and the faculty as a whole is carried out in the course of internal and external audits. Based on the results of audits, the departments develop plans of corrective and preventive measures in order to eliminate the causes of identified inadequacies and prevent their recurrence. According to the results of the academic year, all departments, councils, and committees prepare reports on the results of the implementation of plans, and processes at the Faculty of Dentistry. These results are analysed by the Education Quality and Monitoring Office, Dean's Office of the Faculty, and the management of UNN to make decisions for future periods, and are also reflected in the strategic development plans.

To successfully implement the educational programme, it is necessary to provide the departments, structural units of UNN involved in educational activities with sufficient material, technical, and information resources (availability of classrooms, office equipment, classroom equipment, etc.), as well as human resources.

Every year, before the beginning of the academic year, an order on the preparation of the University for the new academic year is issued. A list of commission members is determined for the programme "Dentistry", who make a conclusion based on the departments' readiness certificates about the need for additional resources for quality educational process, which is further reflected in the applications for such resources.

The EEC members state that the UNN administration:

- ensures the fulfilment of the state assignment for practical healthcare bodies and employers, and the training of medical doctors in the field of "Dentistry";
- coordinates the process of educational programmes development;
- ensures the fulfilment of standard and working curricula of the educational programme;
- exercises control over the proper processing of documents by the Admissions Office when students are enrolled in the first year or transferred from one university to another;
- takes part in the preparation and organisation of current and ceremonial events, International Olympiads, events held by the student scientific society, volunteer student association, Youth Union, etc.;
- participates in the development of class schedules and controls the readiness of departments for the beginning of the academic year;
- organises the educational process and ensures quality control of students' training;
- appoints group supervisors for junior years and clinical tutors for senior years of study;
- provides data on the student population at the Faculty of Dentistry and their academic performance for the Rector, Institute administration, planning and financial department, accounting department and other subdivisions of the Institute;
- organises and supervises the students' academic and work practice and the conduct of tests and examinations;
- provides academic leave of absence, performs dismissal and reinstatement of students, makes decisions regarding the repeating of the course of study by a student;
- collects information on the academic performance of the students at the Faculty with its subsequent analysis and discussion at the meetings of the Faculty Council, of the Academic Council and the Rector's Office;
- implements a set of measures for dealing with missed classes, conducting the appeal procedure;
- provides support for students in need and gifted students;
- appoints scholarships, including personal scholarships, on the recommendation of the Academic Council, to the students of the Faculty in accordance with the current Regulations;

- organises and exercises control over all activities of the departments within the programme;
- prepares test materials for the final state certification of graduates of the programme "Dentistry";
- arranges discussions on healthy lifestyle, patriotic education of students, visits of students to theatres, museums and exhibitions;
- assists in organising sports and cultural events for students;
- organises the settlement of students in the dormitory and monitors the living conditions.

To discuss the main issues related to the organisation of educational and instructional work, the Dean's Office of the Faculty of Dentistry has a Faculty Council, which includes: the Dean, the Deputy Deans, student representatives, heads of departments.

In the process of interviewing the UNN administrative and managerial staff and heads of departments, it was noted that the responsibility of the academic leadership in relation to the development and management of the educational programme has been defined, the head of the EP has been appointed (head of the EP 31.05.03 Dentistry (taught in English) is Julia Andreevna Vokulova; head of the EP 31.05.03 Dentistry (taught in Russian) is Maria Leonidovna Zhdanova).

The implementation of the educational programme is ensured by the management and academic staff of UNN, as well as by persons engaged under the terms of civil law contracts (on a compensated or gratuitous basis). The EEC members noted that responsibility for the implementation of the study programme and achievement of the final objectives and results at UNN lies with the Rector, Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs and the ICM Directorate.

At the end of the calendar year, a plan of material and technical support of the educational programme is drawn up on the basis of requests of structural units and departments, to plan financial resources for the educational process for the future period. The Planning and Finance Department develops a plan for financing all processes related to the implementation of the programme. All departments keep records of material and technical resources. A significant amount of resources has been allocated for the development of the Electronic Information and Education System in order to implement the programme in a distance format. The research conducted by faculty members and students of the programme also requires certain material expenditures, which is reflected in the UNN procurement plan.

The process of updating educational resources is carried out in accordance with changing needs, with the development of research areas in medicine, innovative technologies of surgical intervention, treatment of many diseases, as well as the social and economic requirements of the labour market in the field of medical services. All this requires updating the programme, the introduction of new mandatory disciplines and elective disciplines, optional courses based on advanced and own research, world trends in the study of this field of medicine. Dynamic adjustment of educational resources is based on new trends in basic, clinical, behavioural, social sciences, taking into account the level of morbidity, mortality, health status in society, state assignment, and profile of specialists. Such adjustment that involves the inclusion of new knowledge contributes to the improvement of socio-economic indicators of the living standards in the country and in the world.

The educational process is organised with the use of modern technologies. Many classrooms are equipped with interactive whiteboards and video conferencing equipment. Extensive online library resources and international databases are at the disposal of students.

To implement the EP "Dentistry", an in-house Dental Department of the UNN University Clinic has been opened and licensed, agreements on practical training with medical organisations of Nizhny Novgorod are in place, which undoubtedly ensures the best and most effective practical training in medical disciplines.

One of the important tasks of UNN in the near future is to establish compliance of its activities with international standards by integrating higher medical education, research work and qualified clinical activity into the educational process; harmonising the traditions of the national medical school with international standards in the field of medical education.

### *Analytical part*

According to its Charter, UNN has the status of a federal state autonomous institution and receives funding to fulfil the state order. To pursue research and professional activities, graduates of the Specialist programme can continue their studies in residency and postgraduate programmes.

UNN independently carries out financial and economic activities, its financial autonomy correlates with the principles of responsibility to society for the quality of all activities in professional training, scientific research and service provision, with the effective management of funds and state property.

The distribution of resources is implemented depending on the peculiarities and needs of the EP, specifics of the academic discipline, conditions for practical and laboratory classes, the need to involve standardised patients, etc. The established policy does not contradict the legislative acts of the Russian Federation, which ensures institutional autonomy of UNN.

During the discussion with the focus groups, the interviewees responded that UNN periodically evaluates the academic leadership regarding the achievement of its mission and final learning outcomes.

According to the questionnaire survey conducted during the EEC visit, 75% of respondents were fully satisfied with the attitude of the UNN management to the faculty members; 82% of respondents with the relationship with their immediate superiors; 92% with the relationship with colleagues in the department; 69% with the degree of participation in management decision-making; 84% with the relationship with students.

80% of teaching staff are fully satisfied with the recognition of their successes and achievements by the administration; 75% of respondents, with the support of suggestions and comments; 73% with the activities of the university administration; 70% with the conditions of remuneration. 71% of teaching staff are fully satisfied with working conditions, the range and quality of services provided at the university; 73% of respondents, with labour protection and safety; 75% with the change management in the university activities. 50% of faculty members are fully satisfied with the social package (recreation, sanatorium treatment, etc.); 61% of respondents are satisfied with the organisation and quality of catering at the university; 68% with the organisation and quality of medical care.

The EEC members, having analysed the submitted documents and interviewed the participants of the focus groups, concluded that UNN as a dynamic and socially responsible institution of higher medical education should initiate procedures for regular review and revision of the content, learning outcomes/competencies, assessment and learning environment of the educational programme. The functions of structural/functional units and process charts should be thoroughly reviewed and documented and deficiencies in the EP "Dentistry" should be addressed, given that UNN is constantly allocating resources for continuous improvement.

The managers of the EP 31.05.03 "Dentistry" at UNN should annually adjust the elements of the educational programme and their interrelation in accordance with the achievements in the field of biomedical, behavioural, social and clinical sciences, changes in the demographic situation and health status/morbidity structure of the population and socio-economic and cultural conditions. The adjustment process will ensure the inclusion of new relevant knowledge, concepts and methods, and the exclusion of outdated ones.

The EEC members recommend that UNN should develop clear principles of assessment and methods of conducting examinations as well as their number in accordance with the changing learning outcomes and teaching and learning methods, because in the course of the interviews with the students, mainly only oral and written questioning, testing and solving situational tasks were mentioned.

Satisfactory scores were given by EEC members for those items that require more attention in meeting the standards.

***Strengths/best practices:***

1. Constructive interaction with the healthcare system, where for the best implementation of the EP "Dentistry" an in-house Dental Department of the UNN University Clinic has been opened and licensed.

***EEC recommendations:***

No recommendations.

***EEC conclusions based on the criteria:***

*strengths — 1*

*satisfactory — 11*

*need improvement — 0*

*unsatisfactory — 0*

**(VII) OVERVIEW OF STRENGTHS/BEST PRACTICES FOR EACH STANDARD**

***Standard "Mission and Outcomes"***

No strengths have been identified for this standard.

***Standard "Educational Programme"***

No strengths have been identified for this standard.

***Standard "Student Assessment Policy"***

No strengths have been identified for this standard.

***Standard "Students"***

No strengths have been identified for this standard.

***Standard "Academic Staff/Faculty"***

No strengths have been identified for this standard.

***Standard "Educational Resources"***

No strengths have been identified for this standard.

***Standard "Educational Programme Evaluation"***

No strengths have been identified for this standard.

***Standard "Governance and Administration"***

Constructive interaction with the health sector and health-related sectors of society.



## **(VIII) OVERVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS FOR QUALITY IMPROVEMENT**

### ***Standard "Mission and Outcomes"***

- 1) Ensure that the mission, quality policy and vision of the institution are communicated to all stakeholders (Deadline: 01.09.2024);
- 2) It is recommended that the EP management should involve stakeholders on a regular basis in the development of the mission of the EP "Dentistry" (Deadline: 01.09.2024);
- 3) It is recommended that the management of the EP "Dentistry" should regularly (at least once a year) study, analyze and document the opinions/suggestions of stakeholders regarding the mission, vision and final learning outcomes (Deadline: 01.09.2024).

### ***Standard "Educational Programme"***

- 1) It is recommended that managers of the EP "Dentistry" should gradually adapt the model (integrated modules by systems or organs, spiral design) of the educational programme. (Deadline: 01.09.2025);
- 2) It is recommended that the university management should organize professional development of teaching staff on the application of modern educational technologies and assessment methods in the educational process. (Deadline: 01.09.2024);
- 3) It is recommended that managers of the EP "Dentistry" should include in the educational process teaching and learning methods taking into account the best international practices (TBL, CBL, RBL, etc.) based on the principles of andragogy. (Deadline: 01.09.2024);
- 4) It is recommended that managers of the EP "Dentistry" should monitor the organisation and implementation of students' independent work and its effectiveness (Deadline: 01.09.2024);
- 5) It is recommended that managers of the EP "Dentistry" should implement horizontal integration of related sciences (integrated module, integrated programme). (Deadline: 01.09.2025);
- 6) The university management is recommended to develop and implement a system of academic counselling of students (advisor service) on the selection of elective disciplines and the development of individual educational paths. (Deadline: 01.12.2024).
- 7) It is recommended that managers of the EP "Dentistry" should expand the Catalogue of elective disciplines taking into account the opinion of all stakeholders. (Deadline: 01.12.2024).
- 8) It is recommended that managers of the EP "Dentistry" should include in the Catalogue of elective disciplines the issues of non-traditional and alternative medical practice. (Deadline: 01.12.2024).

### ***Standard "Student Assessment Policy"***

- 1) It is recommended that the managers of the EP "Dentistry" should optimise the system of students' assessment using methods focused on the degree of learning outcomes achievement, taking into account international practices (Deadline: 01.09.2024);
- 2) It is recommended that the managers of the EP "Dentistry" should train the teaching staff on summative and formative assessment and ensure an appropriate balance between formative and summative assessment during the implementation of the EP "Dentistry" with the progress of students in each year of study being appropriately recorded (Deadline: 01.09.2024).
- 3) The managers of the EP "Dentistry" should develop a system (develop a local regulation) that will ensure that the assessment process and methods are open to external expert review (Deadline: 01.09.2024).
- 4) It is recommended that EP managers should regularly use and document a wide range of assessment methods and formats depending on their "usefulness assessment", which includes a combination of

validity, reliability, impact on learning, acceptability and effectiveness of the assessment methods and format. (Deadline: 01.09.2025).

***Standard "Students"***

The university management is recommended to systematically collect information, analyse the results of feedback from students on the formulation of the mission, content and implementation of the educational programme and use the results obtained to improve their quality. (Deadline: 01.09.2024, at least once a year).

***Standard "Academic Staff/Faculty"***

- 1) To organize professional development for teaching staff on the application of modern educational technologies and assessment methods in the educational process (Deadline: 01.09.2024);
- 2) To expand the range of teaching methods taking into account the best international practices (TBL, CBL, RBL, etc.) (Deadline: till 01.09.2024).

***Standard "Educational Resources"***

1) The university management is recommended to plan and implement research in medical education, to promote the aspirations and interests of the staff in conducting research, including the study of theoretical, practical and social issues of medical education, to implement the positive results of these studies in the educational process. (Deadline: 31.12.2024).

2) The university management is recommended to provide a safe environment (to conduct certification of workplaces) for the employees of the specialised departments of the Institute of Clinical Medicine. (Deadline: 01.09.2024).

***Standard "Educational Programme Evaluation"***

1) It is recommended that the managers of the EP "Dentistry" involve professional associations at the regional level to evaluate the educational programme in order to improve the quality of training. (Deadline: 01.09.2024).

2) It is recommended that the university management should ensure documentation of the process of evaluation of students' academic achievements by implementing an electronic journal to ensure accessibility and openness to all participants of the educational process. (Deadline: 01.12.2024).

***Standard "Governance and Administration"***

No recommendations.

**(IX) OVERVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS FOR EDUCATIONAL INSTITUTION DEVELOPMENT**

*No recommendations.*

**(X) RECOMMENDATION TO THE ACCREDITATION COUNCIL**

*The EEC members have reached a unanimous opinion that the EP 31.05.03 "Dentistry" (Specialist programme) (initial accreditation) is recommended for accreditation for a period of 3 years.*

## Annex 1: Evaluation table "PROGRAMME PROFILE PARAMETERS"

No.	No.	No. of crit.	EVALUATION CRITERIA	Position of the educational institution			
				Strong	Satisfactory	Needs improvement	Unsatisfactory
<b>Standard 1 "MISSION AND OUTCOMES"</b>							
<b>1.1 Definition of the mission</b>							
<b>The educational institution should:</b>							
1	1	1.1.1.	define the mission of the EP and communicate it to stakeholders and the healthcare sector.			+	
2	2	1.1.2.	reflect in the mission the aims and the educational strategy to train a competent professional at tertiary level in healthcare with an appropriate basis for a future career in any healthcare field, encompassing all types of practice, administrative medicine and research in healthcare; capable of fulfilling the roles and functions of a specialist in accordance with the established requirements of the healthcare sector; prepared for the postgraduate education and committed to lifelong learning		+		
3	3	1.1.3.	ensure that the mission of the EP incorporates research advances in the biomedical, clinical, pharmaceutical, behavioural and social sciences, aspects of global health and reflects major international health issues.		+		
<b>1.2. Institutional autonomy and academic freedom</b>							
<b>The educational institution should:</b>							
4	4	1.2.1.	have the institutional autonomy to develop and implement a quality assurance policy for which the administration and faculty are responsible, especially with regard to the design of the educational programme and the allocation of resources required for the implementation of the educational programme		+		
5	5	1.2.2.	ensure academic freedom for staff and students to pursue the educational programme and to use the results of new research to improve the study of specific disciplines/issues without extending the EP			+	
<b>1.3 Learning outcomes</b>							
<b>The educational institution should:</b>							
6	6	1.3.1.	define the expected learning outcomes that students are expected to achieve on completion of their studies in relation to attainment at a basic level of knowledge, skills and professional attitudes; an appropriate foundation for a future career in any area of the healthcare industry; future roles in the healthcare sector; further postgraduate training; a commitment to lifelong learning; the health needs of society, the needs of the healthcare system and other aspects of social responsibility		+		
7	7	1.3.2.	ensure that students behave appropriately towards fellow students, teachers, medical staff, patients and their relatives		+		
8	8	1.3.3.	publish the expected learning outcomes of the EP		+		

9	9	1.3.4.	identify and coordinate the linkage of the learning outcomes, required upon completion with those required in postgraduate studies		+			
10	10	1.3.5.	provide opportunities for students to participate in research in a relevant area of healthcare		+			
11	11	1.3.6.	address the expected learning outcomes related to global health		+			
<b>1.4 Participation in the formulation of the mission and learning outcomes</b>								
<b>The educational institution should:</b>								
12	12	1.4.1.	ensure the participation of <i>key stakeholders</i> in formulating the mission and expected learning outcomes		+			
13	13	1.4.2.	ensure that the stated mission and expected learning outcomes are based on the opinions/suggestions of <i>other stakeholders</i>		+			
				<i>Total</i>	0	11	2	0
<b>Standard 2. EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME</b>								
<b>2.1 Education programme model and teaching methods</b>								
<b>The educational institution should:</b>								
14	1	2.1.1.	define the specifications of the EP, including a statement of expected learning outcomes, a curriculum based on a modular or spiral structure, the qualification to be awarded		+			
15	2	2.1.2.	use <i>teaching and learning methods</i> that stimulate, prepare and support students to take responsibility for the learning process		+			
16	3	2.1.3.	ensure that the EP is implemented in accordance with the principles of equality		+			
17	4	2.1.4.	develop students' capacities for lifelong learning		+			
<b>2.2. Scientific method</b>								
<b>The educational institution should:</b>								
18	5	2.2.1.	impart to students throughout the programme of study the principles of scientific methodology, including methods of analytical and critical thinking; methods of research in healthcare and evidence-based medicine		+			
19	6	2.2.2.	provide for the possibility to include in the content of the programme the results of modern scientific research.		+			
<b>2.3 Basic biomedical sciences</b>								
<b>The educational institution should:</b>								
20	7	2.3.1.	identify and include in the EP the achievements of basic biomedical sciences to develop in students an understanding of scientific knowledge, concepts and methods that are the basis for the acquisition and application in practice of clinical scientific knowledge.		+			
21	8	2.3.2.	provide mechanisms for revision and updating of the EP taking into account the achievements of biomedical sciences, which reflect scientific, technological, medical and pharmaceutical developments, current and expected needs of the society and healthcare system.		+			
<b>2.4. Behavioural, social sciences and medical/pharmaceutical ethics and jurisprudence</b>								
<b>The educational institution should:</b>								



22	9	2.4.1.	identify and incorporate advances in behavioural sciences, social sciences, medical/pharmaceutical ethics and jurisprudence into the EP		+		
23	10	2.4.2.	provide mechanisms for revising and updating the EP to reflect advances in behavioural and social sciences, medical/pharmaceutical ethics and jurisprudence, including current scientific, technological and medical and pharmaceutical developments, current and anticipated societal and healthcare system needs; changing demographic and cultural contexts			+	
<b>2.5. Clinical/pharmaceutical sciences and skills</b>							
<b>The educational institution should:</b>							
24	11	2.5.1.	identify and incorporate advances in clinical/pharmaceutical sciences into the EP to ensure that learners on completion of the programme have acquired sufficient knowledge, clinical and professional skills to take appropriate responsibility in subsequent professional practice		+		
25	12	2.5.2.	ensure that learners spend a sufficient proportion of the programme in planned contact with patients, service users in appropriate clinical/workplace settings and gain experience in health promotion and disease prevention		+		
26	13	2.5.3.	determine the amount of time dedicated to the core clinical/professional disciplines		+		
27	14	2.5.4.	organise training with appropriate attention to the safety of the learning environment and patients, including observation of the learner's actions in clinical/workplace settings		+		
28	15	2.5.5.	provide the opportunity to modify the EP, taking into account advances in scientific, technological, medical and pharmaceutical developments, current and anticipated societal and healthcare system needs.		+		
29	16	2.5.6.	ensure that each learner has early contact with real patients, service users, including his/her gradual involvement in the provision of services and incorporating his/her responsibility: - in relation to the examination and/or treatment of the patient under supervision in an appropriate clinical setting; - in sanitary and epidemiological surveillance procedures in relation to the examination and/or inspection of the facility under supervision, which is carried out in appropriate operational units (sanitary and epidemiological control centres, territorial departments of sanitary and epidemiological control, including transport, disinfection organisations and healthcare institutions); - in relation to patient counselling on the rational use of medicines, which is carried out under appropriate workplace conditions		+		
30	17	2.5.7.	structure the various components of training in clinical, environmental and occupational health monitoring and other workplace skills according to the specific stage of the training programme.		+		
<b>2.6. Educational programme structure, content and duration</b>							
<b>The educational institution should:</b>							
31	18	2.6.1.	describe the content, scope and sequence of disciplines/modules, including maintaining an appropriate balance between basic biomedical, behavioural, social and clinical/professional disciplines		+		
32	19	2.6.2.	provide for horizontal integration of related sciences and disciplines			+	

33	20	2.6.3.	provide for vertical integration of clinical/professional sciences with the basic biomedical and behavioural and social sciences			+		
34	21	2.6.4.	provide the option of elective content (electives) and determine the balance between the compulsory and elective parts of the programme			+		
35	22	2.6.5.	determine the interrelation with complementary medicine, including non-traditional, traditional or alternative practices, occupational medicine, including aspects of the impact of the environment and anthropogenic production loads, as well as social situation on the population's health.			+		
<b>2.7. Programme management</b>								
<b>The educational institution should:</b>								
36	23	2.7.1.	determine the procedures for the development, approval and revision of the EP			+		
37	24	2.7.2.	designate a committee, under the direction of academic management, responsible for planning and implementing the EP to ensure that the expected learning outcomes are achieved			+		
38	25	2.7.3.	ensure representation of academic staff, students, representatives from other stakeholders, including representatives from clinical and work bases, healthcare professionals involved in the process of training in the committee of the educational institution in charge of the EP				+	
39	26	2.7.4.	provide for the possibility to plan and implement innovations in the EP through the committee in charge of the EP.			+		
<b>2.8. Linkage with medical/pharmaceutical practice and the healthcare system</b>								
<b>The educational institution should:</b>								
40	27	2.8.1.	ensure continuity between the EP and the subsequent stages of professional training or practice that the learner will undertake upon graduation			+		
41	28	2.8.2.	take into account the specific conditions in which graduates will be working and modify the EP accordingly			+		
				<i>Total</i>	0	19	9	0
<b>Standard 3. STUDENT ASSESSMENT POLICY</b>								
<b>3.1. Assessment methods</b>								
<b>The educational institution should:</b>								
42	1	3.1.1.	define and approve the principles, methods and practices used to assess students, including the number of examinations, criteria for determining pass marks, grades and the number of retakes allowed			+		
43	2	3.1.2.	ensure that assessment procedures cover knowledge, skills, attitudes and professional behaviour				+	
44	3	3.1.3.	use a wide range of assessment methods and formats according to their "usefulness rating", which includes a combination of validity, reliability, impact on learning, acceptability and effectiveness of the assessment methods and format				+	
45	4	3.1.4.	provide for the possibility of ensuring that the assessment process and methods are subject to the review of external experts			+		
46	5	3.1.5.	demonstrate readiness to ensure that assessment methods and results avoid conflicts of interest and use an appeal system for student assessment results			+		
47	6	3.1.6.	provide for the possibility of ensuring an open assessment procedure and its results, informing students of the assessment criteria and procedures used			+		

48	7	3.1.7.	provide for the possibility of documenting and assessing the reliability and validity of assessment methods, as well as the involvement of external examiners.			+	
----	---	--------	--	--	--	---	--

### 3.2. Relationship between assessment and learning

#### The educational institution should:

49	8	3.2.1.	use assessment principles, methods and practices that are comparable to the expected learning outcomes and teaching and learning methods, ensure achievement of the intended learning outcomes, support student learning, and provide an appropriate balance of formative and summative assessment to guide learning and make judgements about academic performance			+	
50	9	3.2.2.	provide for the possibility of adjusting the number and type of examinations to stimulate both knowledge acquisition and integrated learning			+	
51	10	3.2.3.	provide timely, specific, constructive and fair feedback to students on assessment results			+	
<i>Total</i>				0	6	4	0

### Standard 4. STUDENTS

#### 4.1. Admission and selection policy

#### The educational institution should:

52	1	4.1.1.	have an admission policy and implement admission practices that are based on principles of objectivity and include a clear statement about the process of selecting students			+	
53	2	4.1.2.	have a policy and implement practices for the admission of persons with disabilities			+	
54	3	4.1.3.	have a policy and implement practices of transferring students from other educational organisations, including foreign ones			+	
55	4	4.1.4.	establish a connection between selection and the mission of the educational institution, the educational programme and the desired quality of graduates; periodically review the admission policy			+	
56	5	4.1.5.	demonstrate readiness to use an appeal system for admission decisions			+	

#### 4.2. Student intake

#### The educational institution should:

57	6	4.2.1.	determine the number of students admitted in accordance with the capacity of the educational institution at all stages of the educational programme			+	
58	7	4.2.2.	demonstrate readiness to periodically adjust the size and nature of student intake, taking into account the views of stakeholders responsible for planning and developing human resources in the healthcare sector to meet the medical needs of community and society			+	
59	8	4.2.3.	provide for the possibility of periodically reviewing the size and nature of student intake in consultation with other stakeholders and adjusting the numbers to meet the health needs of community and society			+	

#### 4.3. Counselling and support for students

#### The educational institution should:

60	9	4.3.1.	demonstrate the potential for using a system of academic counselling for students			+	
61	10	4.3.2.	demonstrate readiness to offer students a programme of support to address social, financial and personal needs, allocating appropriate resources and ensuring confidentiality of counselling and support			+	

62	11	4.3.3.	demonstrate readiness to use the system of feedback with students on the assessment of conditions and organisation of the educational process		+			
63	12	4.3.4.	demonstrate readiness to provide students with documents confirming the obtained qualification (diploma) and diploma supplement (transcript)		+			
64	13	4.3.5.	provide the opportunity to take into account the needs of different groups of students and provide opportunities for shaping an individual educational pathway		+			
65	14	4.3.6.	demonstrate readiness to provide academic counselling, which is based on monitoring the progress of the student and includes issues of professional guidance and career planning		+			
<b>4.4. Student representation</b>								
<b>The educational institution should:</b>								
66	15	4.4.1.	have a policy and implement practices for the representation of students and their appropriate participation in the definition of the mission, and in the development, management and evaluation of the educational programme and other matters relating to students			+		
67	16	4.4.2.	provide for opportunities to encourage, facilitate and support student activities and student organisations.		+			
				<i>Total</i>	0	15	1	0
<b>Standard 5. ACADEMIC STAFF/FACULTY</b>								
<b>5.1. Selection and recruitment policy</b>								
<b>The educational institution should develop and implement a staff selection and recruitment policy to:</b>								
68	1	5.1.1.	determine their category, responsibility, and balance of academic staff/faculty in the basic biomedical sciences, behavioural and social sciences, and medical/pharmaceutical sciences to adequately implement the EP, including the appropriate ratio of faculty members teaching medical, non-medical, pharmaceutical courses, full-time and part-time faculty, and the balance between academic and non-academic staff		+			
69	2	5.1.2.	consider criteria for academic, educational and clinical excellence, including the balance between teaching, research and "service" functions		+			
70	3	5.1.3.	determine and ensure monitoring of the responsibilities of academic staff/faculty of basic biomedical sciences, behavioural and social sciences and clinical, hygiene, pharmaceutical sciences		+			
71	4	5.1.4.	provide for the possibility to take into account in selection and recruitment policy such criteria and characteristics as relevance to the mission and economic opportunities of the educational organisation, as well as the region's relevant characteristics		+			
<b>5.2. Staff performance and development policy</b>								
<b>The educational institution should develop and implement a staff performance and development policy aimed at:</b>								
72	5	5.2.1.	maintaining a balance of opportunities between teaching, research and 'service' functions, ensuring that meritorious academic activities are recognized, with appropriate emphasis on teaching, research and professional qualifications		+			
73	6	5.2.2.	ensuring that individual members of staff have sufficient knowledge of the whole educational programme, as well as faculty training, development and appraisal			+		
74	7	5.2.3.	providing for the possibility to take into account the teacher-student ratio depending on the different components of the educational programme		+			



75	8	5.2.4.	staff career development			+		
				<i>Total</i>	0	7	1	0
<b>Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES</b>								
<b>6.1. Physical facilities</b>								
<b>The educational institution should:</b>								
76	1	6.1.1.	demonstrate its commitment to provide sufficient physical facilities to ensure adequate implementation of the educational programme, and to create a safe learning environment for staff, students, patients and their relatives			+		
77	2	6.1.2.	demonstrate its commitment to improve the learning environment by regularly updating and expanding physical facilities to meet changes in educational practice			+		
<b>6.2. Resources for practical training</b>								
<b>The educational institution should:</b>								
78	3	6.2.1.	demonstrate its commitment to provide the necessary resources to ensure that students receive appropriate clinical/practical experience, including: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>quality and categories of patients/service users</li> <li>number and categories of clinical/workplace bases, which include:</li> <li>supervision of students' practice</li> </ul>			+		
79	4	6.2.2.	demonstrate its commitment to assessing, adapting and improving clinical/practical training environments to meet community needs			+		
<b>6.3. Information technology</b>								
<b>The educational institution should:</b>								
80	5	6.3.1.	develop and implement policies for the effective and ethical use and evaluation of appropriate information and communication technologies			+		
81	6	6.3.2.	make provision for access to websites or other electronic media			+		
82	7	6.3.3.	make provision for faculty and students to access relevant patient data and healthcare information systems using existing and appropriate new information and communication technologies for self-learning, access to information, patient databases and healthcare information systems.			+		
<b>6.4. Research and scientific achievements</b>								
<b>The educational institution should:</b>								
83	8	6.4.1.	demonstrate its commitment to use research activities and scientific achievements in the field of medicine, pharmacy as a basis for the educational programme			+		
84	9	6.4.2.	formulate and implement policies that promote the relationship between research and education; provide information on the research base and research priorities of the educational institution				+	
85	10	6.4.3.	ensure that the linkage between research and education is taken into account in teaching, encourage and prepare students for participation in research in the field of healthcare				+	
<b>6.5. Educational expertise</b>								
<b>The educational institution should:</b>								

86	11	6.5.1.	have a policy and implement access to educational expertise of processes, practices and problems of medical and pharmaceutical education with the involvement of specialists, educational psychologists, sociologists at university, inter-university and international levels; develop and implement a policy of expertise in the development, implementation and evaluation of the educational programme, development of teaching and assessment methods			+		
87	12	6.5.2.	demonstrate its commitment to provide evidence of the use of internal or external educational expertise in staff development, taking into account current experience in medical/pharmaceutical education and promoting the interests of staff in educational research			+		
<b>6.6. Exchanges in the field of education</b>								
<b>The educational institution should:</b>								
88	13	6.6.1.	have a policy and implement practices of national and international cooperation with other educational organisations, including staff and student mobility, as well as the transfer of educational credits			+		
89	14	6.6.2.	demonstrate its commitment to facilitate the participation of teachers and students in academic mobility programmes at home and abroad and allocate appropriate resources for this purpose			+		
				<i>Total</i>	0	9	5	0
<b>Standard 7. EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME EVALUATION</b>								
<b>7.1. Mechanisms for programme monitoring and evaluation</b>								
<b>The educational institution should:</b>								
90	1	7.1.1.	have established procedures for monitoring and periodic evaluation of the educational programme and the learning outcomes, student progress and performance of students			+		
91	2	7.1.2.	develop and demonstrate readiness to apply an evaluation mechanism for the educational programme that examines the programme, its main components, student performance, identifies and addresses problems, ensures that relevant evaluation results have an impact on the EP			+		
92	3	7.1.3.	demonstrate readiness to periodically evaluate the programme, giving a comprehensive review of the educational process, components of the educational programme, expected learning outcomes and social responsibility			+		
<b>7.2. Teacher and student feedback</b>								
<b>The educational institution should:</b>								
93	4	7.2.1.	provide for systematic feedback, analysing and responding to feedback from teachers and students			+		
94	5	7.2.2.	demonstrate readiness to use the results of feedback to improve the educational programme			+		
<b>7.3. Performance of students</b>								
<b>The educational institution should:</b>								
95	6	7.3.1.	demonstrate readiness to analyse the performance of students in accordance with the mission and expected learning outcomes, study programme and availability of resources			+		
96	7	7.3.2.	demonstrate readiness to analyse the performance of students, taking into account the conditions of their previous education, the level of preparation for admission to the university; use the results of the analysis to interact with the structural unit responsible for the selection of students, development of the educational			+		

			programme, and counselling of students.					
<b>7.4. Involvement of stakeholders</b>								
<b>The educational institution should:</b>								
97	8	7.4.1.	demonstrate readiness to involve key stakeholders in the monitoring and evaluation of the educational programme		+			
98	9	7.4.2.	demonstrate readiness to provide stakeholders with access to the results of programme evaluation, collect and review feedback from them and their comments on the educational programme.		+			
				<i>Total</i>	0	6	3	0
<b>Standard 8. GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION</b>								
<b>8.1. Governance</b>								
<b>The educational institution should:</b>								
99	1	8.1.1.	define structural units and their functions, including relationships within the University		+			
100	2	8.1.2.	define committees in the management structure, their responsibilities and composition, reflecting the representation of key and other stakeholders, ensuring transparency of the management bodies' work and the decisions they make		+			
<b>8.2. Academic leadership</b>								
<b>The educational institution should:</b>								
101	3	8.2.1.	describe the academic leadership's responsibilities in defining and managing the educational programme		+			
102	4	8.2.2.	demonstrate readiness to periodically assess academic leadership in relation to the achievement of its mission and expected learning outcomes		+			
<b>8.3. Educational budget and resource allocation</b>								
<b>The educational institution should:</b>								
103	5	8.3.1.	have a clear allocation of responsibility and authority for resourcing the educational programme, including a dedicated budget for training		+			
104	6	8.3.2.	demonstrate readiness to allocate the resources required for implementing the educational programme and to allocate educational resources according to the needs of the programme		+			
105	7	8.3.3.	provide for the possibility of independent allocation of resources, including remuneration for teachers who adequately achieve the expected learning outcomes; when allocating resources, take into account scientific advances in healthcare as well as public health issues and needs.		+			
<b>8.4. Administrative staff and management</b>								
<b>The educational institution should:</b>								
106	8	8.4.1.	demonstrate readiness to have administrative and professional staff for implementing the educational programme and related activities, ensure proper management and allocation of resources		+			
107	9	8.4.2.	demonstrate readiness to ensure that all units of the educational organisation participate in the processes and procedures of the internal quality assurance system		+			
<b>8.5. Interaction with the healthcare sector</b>								
<b>The educational institution should:</b>								

<b>108</b>	10	8.5.1.	demonstrate readiness to engage constructively with the healthcare system and health-related sectors of society and government, including those abroad	+				
<b>109</b>	11	8.5.2.	demonstrate readiness to formalise collaboration, including the involvement of staff and students, with partners in the healthcare sector.		+			
<b>8.6. Public information</b>								
<b>The educational institution should:</b>								
<b>110</b>	12	8.6.1.	provide for regular publication on the official website of the educational institution and in the mass media of full and reliable information about the educational programme and its achievements		+			
				<i>Total</i>	1	11	0	0
				<b>CUMULATIVE TOTAL</b>	1	84	25	0

