



«АККРЕДИТТЕУ ЖӘНЕ РЕЙТИНГТІҢ  
ТӘУЕЛСІЗ АГЕНТТІГІ» КЕМ

НУ «НЕЗАВИСИМОЕ АГЕНТСТВО  
АККРЕДИТАЦИИ И РЕЙТИНГА»

INDEPENDENT AGENCY FOR  
ACCREDITATION AND RATING

# Report

on the results of External Expert Panel's evaluation of Educational  
Program on Specialty Biomedicine 7M10105 in compliance with Initial  
Specialized Accreditation Standards

Non Commercial Joint Stock Company "West Kazakhstan Marat  
Ospanov Medical University"

26-28 April, 2022

**INDEPENDENT AGENCY FOR ACCREDITATION AND RATING**  
**External Expert Panel**

*Addressed  
to the IAAR Accreditation Council*



«АККРЕДИТТЕУ ЖӘНЕ РЕЙТИНГТИҢ  
ТӘУЕЛСІЗ АГЕНТТІГІ» КЕМ

НУ «НЕЗАВИСИМОЕ АГЕНТСТВО  
АККРЕДИТАЦИИ И РЕЙТИНГА»

INDEPENDENT AGENCY FOR  
ACCREDITATION AND RATING

**Report**

**on the results of External Expert Panel's evaluation of Educational Program on Specialty  
Biomedicine 7M10105 in compliance with Initial Specialized Accreditation Standards  
Non Commercial Joint Stock Company "West Kazakhstan Marat Ospanov Medical  
University"**

**26-28 April, 2022**

**Aktobe**

**April 28 , 2022**

## CONTENTS

(I) LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS AND SYMBOLS .....	3
(II) INTRODUCTION.....	4
(III) PRESENTATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION.....	5
(IV) DESCRIPTION OF EEP SITE VISIT .....	8
(V) DESCRIPTION OF PREVIOUS ACCREDITATION PROCEDURE.....	9
(VI) COMPLINACE FOR SPECIALIZED ACCREDITATION STANDARDS.....	9
Standard 6.1. Mission and Learning Outcomes.....	9
Standard 6.2 Scientific research environment and educational resources.....	12
Standard 6.3. Admission Policy and Criteria .....	15
Standard 6.4. Master’s Programme .....	17
Standard 6.5. Scientific Supervision .....	20
Standard 6.6 Governance and Administration.....	21
Standard 6.7. Стандарт On-going improvement .....	25
(VII) REVIEW OF STRENGTHS/ BEST PRACTICE ON EACH STANDARD.....	26
(VIII) REVIEW OF STRENGTHS/ BEST PRACTICE ON EACH STANDARD .....	26
(IX) REVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS ON QUALITY IMPROVEMENT .....	27
(X) REVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS ON EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION DEVELOPMENT.....	28
(XI) RECOMMENDATIONS FOR ACCREDITATION COUNCIL.....	28
Appendix 1. Evaluation Table «Parameters of Specialized Profile of EP in the.....	29



## **(I) LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS AND SYMBOLS**

ARDH- Aktobe Regional Department of Healthcare  
AIS - automated information system  
AC - Academic Council  
AK – Academic Committee  
BD - basic disciplines  
IDC-intra department control  
EEC – external expert commission  
HTMS - high-tech medical services  
HEI - higher educational institution  
GVFMC - Guaranteed volume of free medical care  
SCES- state compulsory education standards  
MP–municipal policlinic  
ДАW – Department for academic work  
SPED – state program for education development  
WKMU - West Kazakhstan Medical University  
S – stakeholders  
FSA - final state attestation  
IPPD- individual plan for professional development  
CDC - Consultative and Diagnostic Center  
MI- Measuring instruments  
MC - midterm control  
MPI- medical and preventive institution  
MH RK - Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan  
MES - Ministry of Education and Science  
MEP - modular educational program  
RW - research work  
NTP – scientific technical program  
CPD- continuous professional development  
NFQ- national framework of qualification  
SPC – scientific practical center  
IC - individual curriculum  
CHI - Compulsory health insurance  
EP – education program  
OR - office registrar  
RDH – Regional department of healthcare  
PMSA- primary medical sanitary aid  
TS - teaching staff  
PD – profile disciplines  
PRO - procedure  
RK - Republic of Kazakhstan  
WC- working curriculum  
Media – media  
QMS - quality management system  
SED - electronic document management system  
SC - Scientific Council  
CPS - center for practical skills  
CBL-Case-Based Learning  
PBL - Problem-Based Learning  
TBL - Team-Based Learning  
ELS- electronic library system

## (II) INTRODUCTION

According to order No 32-22-OD as of 10.02.2022 by IAAR between 26 - 28 April, 2022 External Expert Panel evaluated Educational Program on Specialty Biomedicine 7M10105 for compliance with specialized accreditation standards of Basic Medical and Pharmaceutical Education based on WFME/AMSE Standards dated on May 25,2018 No №68-18/1-OD implemented at West Kazakhstan Marat Ospanov Medical University

The report of the external expert panel (EEP ) contains a brief assessment of the compliance of the activities of the educational organization in the context of the international standards of IAAR , recommendations of EEP for improving quality assurance of educational programme 7M10105 Biomedicine

### **External Expert Panel Members:**

**The IAAR Expert, the Chairman of EEP**– Tagaduke Olga Konstantinovna, Doctor of Medical Science., State University of Medicine and Pharmacy named after Nicolay Testimitcanu (Moldova, Kishinyev); virtual participation

**The IAAR Expert** – Zacreviskiy Victor Veniaminovitch Закревский Виктор Вениаминович, д.м.н., ГБОУ ВПО «North-Western State Medical University named after I.I. Mechnikov (Russian Federation, . St. Petersburg) virtual participation;

**The IAAR Expert** – Kluyev Dmitrii Anatolevitch, Candidate of Medical Science., NC JSC «Karaganda Medical University (Kazakhstan, Karaganda);

**The IAAR Expert, employer** – Nugmanov Amandyk Bektursynovitch, LtD TOO" Mediker Пек" (Aktobe);

**The IAAR Expert, student** – Kairullova Madina Argynovna, Master's student , NC JSC «Astana Medical University » (Kazakhstan , Nur-Sultan) virtual participation;

**The IAAR Coordinator** –Jakenova Alisa Satbekovna, Candidate of Medical Science., Head of Medical Projects Agency (Kazakhstan, Nur-Sultan).

### (III) PRESENTATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION

West Kazakhstan Marat Ospanov Medical University is a large educational, medical, research, diagnostic and cultural center in the west region of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The University was founded in 1957 as State Medical Institute in Aktobe. In 1997 the Institute was transformed into Aktobe State Medical Academy and in 2000 it was given the name West Kazakhstan State Medical Academy named after Marat Ospanov and in 2009 changed its name into the Republican State Enterprise "West-Kazakhstan State University"», in 2012 it was the Republican state enterprise on the right of economic management "WKMOSMU" with the supervisory board of the Ministry of Healthcare and Social Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan, in 2019. The University was transformed into NJSC "West Kazakhstan Marat Ospanov Medical University".

Currently, the University implements 5 educational programs in Bachelor's degree, 5 specialties of both scientific pedagogic and profile study in Master's Degree at the government expense, 22 specialties in residency, and 2 specialties in PhD study, advanced training of doctors in 29 specialties, retraining of doctors in 1 specialty, advanced training of doctors - in 5 specialties

Training practical health care specialists is delivered through additional formal (advanced training courses) and informal educational programmes.

Challenges in modern society and in the sphere of education have defined the necessity of systemic approach to manage multifunctional educational and scientific clinical institution as our University. The University's management structure is annually reconsidered and in case of necessity reorganization measures are taken. Creating a net of structural divisions allows to provide educational and scientific process to be organized qualitatively thereby maintaining operative management of the institution in whole.

Besides it, the exclusive competence of the Board of Directors includes approving the organizational structure, its branches and representative offices and University staffing in line with the Paragraph 64 (subparagraph 17) of the University Charter approved by the Chairman of State Property and Privatization Committee, Ministry of Finance of the Republic of Kazakhstan, order No 161 dated February 7, 2019.

The University structure was approved by the Council of Directors on September 24, 2021, Minute No 8

JSC WKMU has an office in Atyrau where Residency Programs in clinical specialties and additional educational services ( advanced training courses, workshops )are offered to medical workers as well as for trainers.

Teaching faculty for 2021-2022 is 599 people in total, (82.8%). 467 of them are tenured professors and 132 people are at part time.

In addition, one of the key indicators of the University's cadres policy is the teaching staff status (rank/full/part time) appropriate to support the educational programmes. At present 196 professors have scientific degrees, 29 of them are Doctors of Medical Science( MD,) 151 instructors are Candidates of Medical Science and 20 people have PhD degrees.

Analyses on the quality and quantity of academic staff of the University demonstrate the readiness of teaching staff to organize and carry out educational process and there is full supply for training specialists at all faculties.

The University has license for delivering medical activities. Effective cooperation of the University's clinics with practical health sector in providing the population with highly specialized medical services is of great importance in further development.

WKMU named after Marat Ospanov has its own 3 clinics which provides the population with highly specialized medical services in the field of cardiology, cardiosurgery, oncology and surgery.

In line with Provision on credit technology system of education approved by the MES of RK,+ the University has been implementing academic mobility program for teaching staff (P

WKMU 18-05 Regulations " on sending teaching staff and employees of WKMU abroad under the program of academic mobility"; PRO WKMU 608-2020 "Research work of teaching staff").

The University has concluded Memorandums of cooperation in the field of education, health care and science with medical universities of the Russian Federation and overseas countries.

The University is cooperating with home partners on the basis of 30 Memorandums of Understanding , and there are 23 Memorandums concluded between the University and partners from Russian and 46 Memorandums with overseas institutions. In total 99 MoU have been concluded in the field of education.

The University's activities are guided by the Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the University Charter as well as the Corporate Governance Code.

**Table 1 – Academic Staff implementing Master's Programmes**

	Average age	Faculty members with scientific degrees and titles (%) (%)	Work at			Hold degrees of				Rank	
			1,0 wage	0,5 wage	0,25 wage	Master's	Candidate of Science	Doctor of Science	PhD	Professor	Associate professor
Tenured/ full- time faculty members	50	14		16	11	4	14	3	6	5	14
Part-time faculty members	-										
Staffing in Total	50	27		16	11	4	14	3	6	5	14
Including women	50	22		14	8	4	12	1	5	2	12

**Table 2 – Information on Educational Programme in Specialty Biomedicine7M10105**

Degree /Duration	Master's / 2 years
Language of learning	Kazakh , Russian
Structural Unit (Head )	Koshmagambetova G.K.- head of the Department for Master's and Doctoral Degree Studies
The main profile training at - the Department of Natural Sciences Disciplines (Department head – Zharmakhanova G.M.)	
Credits ECTS	120
Study course (number of terms), format of learning	Full-time 2 year education consisting of 4 terms

Admission and Application Requirements	While applying for the course applicants should have the exam certificate with required passing scores ( not lower than 70 scores )issued by National Center for Testing
	The absence of contraindications to be admitted to medical educational organizations is additionally required (Form 086 / y, "List of medical contraindications for admission to universities"). Key points in selecting applicants to the university are the results of competition for grants by government.
Opportunities in continuing education in further (after completing the course )	Doctoral Degree studies, advanced training, retraining courses and etc
The goals of Educational Programme	Training highly qualified scientific pedagogical cadres who has a good command of professional competencies necessary to carry out pedagogic and research activities at educational organizations. Master's Programmes ensures firm grounds for research in future and enables to become a part of scientific community
Learning Outcomes	Learning outcome is training highly qualified specialists with critical thinking skills and skills of generating new ideas in the field of medicine , education and science and with aptitude to interact in new economic conditions. At the end of the study graduates must have competencies outlined in State Standard of Compulsory Education Requirements , RK



Tuition fees	<a href="http://zkgmu.kz/ru/abiturientu/4845-razmery-oplaty-za-obuchenie-po-obrazovatel-nym-programmam-vysshego-i-ili-poslevuzovskogo-obrazovaniya-nekommercheskogo-aktsionernogo-obshchestva-zapadno-kazakhstanskij-meditsinskij-universitet-imeni-marata-ospanova-na-2020-2021-uchebnyj-god">http://zkgmu.kz/ru/abiturientu/4845-razmery-oplaty-za-obuchenie-po-obrazovatel-nym-programmam-vysshego-i-ili-poslevuzovskogo-obrazovaniya-nekommercheskogo-aktsionernogo-obshchestva-zapadno-kazakhstanskij-meditsinskij-universitet-imeni-marata-ospanova-na-2020-2021-uchebnyj-god</a>
--------------	---

Training specialists in the Specialty Biomedicine 7M10105 is regulated in line with legislation of the RK, and is appropriate to the University mission and its Strategic Development Plan .

#### (IV) DESCRIPTION OF EEP SITE VISIT

The work of EEP was carried out between the 26-28 April, 2022 (Annex1 )on the basis of the agreed programme in the framework of specialized accreditation of educational programmes.

To coordinate the work of external evaluation group on the 25<sup>th</sup> April the preliminary meeting was held, during which the EEP members had their responsibilities allocated by the Chair, discussed key issues and matters and chose the methods of expertise.

To gain objective information on the quality of activities at the University , the EEP used such methods as observation, interviewing and conducting questionnaire survey among staff, teaching fellows, graduates , students and employers.

The meetings of EEP with target groups were held in accordance with the EEP visit programme. The University created conditions so that all people indicated in the visit programme could take participation in the meetings.

In accordance IAAR standard, the EEP had meetings with Rector, Vice-Rector, Department heads, deans, professors, students , and employers to get objective information about the quality of educational programmes and the University infrastructure and to clarify the content of a self-evaluation report. In total 32 people took participation in meetings on evaluation processes of educational programme in Biomedicine 7M10105. (Table 3 )

Таблица 3. Information on academic and administrative staff, graduates and students participating in EEP meetings

Participants/ quantity								
University management		Heads of Divisions	Deans	Faculty members	Heads of Educational programs and departments	Learners	Employers	Graduates
Rector	Vice-Rector							
1	4	10	1	9	4	--	4	-

In accordance with the site visit programme of EEP, virtual and on-site excursions were hold that provide experts with opportunity to get acquainted with work of the Center for Practical Skills, Morphology Laboratory of Histology Department, Anatomical Museum, Library and Research Center.

Online Questionnaire survey were conducted both among faculty members and learners in line with accreditation procedures. The results of the questionnaire survey conducted among 12 faculty members (Biomedicine ) demonstrated that 100% of respondents had been satisfied with the content of the educational programme, with academic freedom provided by the University. .

91,7% respondents satisfied with the terms created by the University for teaching staff both in advancing qualification and opportunities to use their own teaching methods in practice.

All respondents answered that University Library provides with all necessary literature. 83,4% respondents find difficult to combine teaching and research activities. Many respondents showed that they are satisfied in regards with both the support by the management and development of educational programs, research activities of teaching staff and motivation approaches as well. In whole all questions were answered positively and respondents believe that the University is developing with great potentials to grow. Questionnaire survey was not conducted among students since students were not enrolled for this Educational programme this year.

Recommendations developed by the EEP on improving the University activities based on the analyses were presented at the meeting with the University management and Department heads on 28 April, 2022.

## **(V) DESCRIPTION OF PREVIOUS ACCREDITATION PROCEDURE**

Educational Programme 7M10105 «Biomedicine» undergoes accreditation procedure by IAAR for the first time.

## **(VI) COMPLINACE FOR SPECIALIZED ACCREDITATION STANDARDS**

### **Standard 6.1. Mission and Learning Outcomes**

#### ***Evidences***

The University's activities are guided with The University Charter, normative documents, strategic development plan developed and adopted in line with normative legal documents of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The mission of WKMU is training highly qualified medical cadres who are in-demand both in the country and at international labour market. The mission has been developed and was approved at the Academic Council and was included in the University's Development Program for 2019-2023

The mission of EP in Biomedicine 7M10105 is to train highly qualified specialists in the field of pharmacy, and to implement innovation in medicine, science and education efficiently to meet the demand of both society and state. The mission of the University and educational programme is posted on the website [www.zkgmu.kz](http://www.zkgmu.kz). Faculty body are introduced with the mission at Department's meetings, master's students are informed by heads at the meeting, and the mission is also posted at the University website. Practical health care specialists are members of the University's collegial board: Academic Council, Council of Faculties, Academic Committee for Master's and Doctoral students where questions regarding the mission are usually discussed.

The mission of EP undergoes several phases of approval. At the 1st stage members of Academic Committee that are instructors who train scientific pedagogical cadres, representatives of health care sector, learners articulate the mission and goals based on the advances in modern science and medical education, learners' demands and employers' expectations. After that the mission is submitted to be discussed at the Department where master's students are trained (Minute No 8 dated Apr 26, 2021). Then formulated mission are discussed and approved at the meeting of Academic Council. The final version was approved as an official document on 6 April 2021 (Minute No6)).

To implement Educational Programme in Biomedicine 7M10105, the University has enough material-technical base appropriate to rules and norms and ensures all types of training as well as research as outlined to be fulfilled in the curriculum and through extracurricular activity. Thus, resources and facilities available at the University meet market requirements. Information resources (internet, educational platforms, AIS Platonus etc) are supported by the Department of

Digitalization. In the framework of Academic Mobility Programme overseas professors take participation in educational process of the University. ( on -campus or remote learning ).

The consistency of basic and post graduate medical education is achieved through the Model “Bachelor’s, Master’s and Doctoral Degrees” where each following level is impossible without completing the previous one. The quality of training master’s students is assessed based on the results of Final State exam which is carried out in accordance with learning outcomes.

The goal of Final Attestation is to evaluate professional level of training of graduates upon competing Master’s Degree Programmes. Students successfully completing 2- year master’s course are awarded Master’s Degree.

Annual analysis on training quality of graduates is carried out through questionnaire survey among heads of Chemist’s and medical institutions in western regions of Kazakhstan. According to the results of questionnaire conclusions on the University’s prestige, the employability and competitiveness of graduates, level of professional knowledge and skills, skills of cooperation, leadership aptitude, communicative skills , readiness to learn, qualification appropriateness are made.

WKMU has institutional autonomy in shaping and implementing the policy on quality , in developing educational programmes, in conducting research, in distributing extra budget resources , and in recruiting employees.

Educational programmes in Specialties are developed, implemented and controlled by involving all concerned parties.

Responsibility for developing educational programmes is upon Academic Committee for Specialties the activity of which is regulated by the Provision “on Academic Committee of West Kazakhstan Marat Ospanov Medical University” The members of the Committee are experienced teaching methodologists, professors and associate professors, advisors, representatives of a student community and practical health care sector.

In the context of academic freedom the University defines the Curriculum based on Modal Working Plan of Specialty, Catalog of Elective courses and the content of educational programme on its own way. The course content is reflected in the Syllabuses which are designed by faculty members by taking into consideration pre and post requisites , agreed by departments associated to the course , discussed by the Academic Committee for Specialty and approved at the meeting of Academic Council.

Students as direct consumers are engaged in the process of educational programme evaluation by expressing their opinions and wishes at the end of the course or upon completion of disciplines through questionnaire survey conducted to get feedback.

WKMU systematically assesses the state and perspectives of University development , analyzes strengths and weaknesses , develops measures of correction on the basis of which in further strategic plan of development is shaped.

Internal and external audits are conducted. Internal audit is carried out by the Quality management System office, by the Department for Teaching and by Dean’s Offices. External audits take place during Final State Attestation, licensing and certifying for compliance with MS ISO Requirements 9001:2015 and during accreditation. The results of audits and expertise are informed at the meetings of Board of Directors, Academic Council, Council of Faculty, the decisions of which define the policy, activity and correction actions to be undertaken by the University. Analysis made on the University’ activities are also hosted on the University website.

Thus, the mission and values of WKMU is appropriate to the Strategic Development Plan and contribute to internalization and harmonization with other educational organizations, to innovation technologies in in the world’s pharmaceutical education, in training specialists by focusing on economic and social needs of the country.

### ***Analytical part***

Analyzing the compliance of EP in the context of the international standards of IAAR it should be noted that Mission and Learning outcomes meet the standard requirements.

The mission of the University, its strategic goals and reports are posted on site <http://zkgmu.kz/ru/otdel-strategicheskogo-razvitiya-i-mezhdunarodnogo-sotrudnichestva>.

Educational Programme of Postgraduate Education with the focus on training research and pedagogical cadres within the master's Degree Programme Biomedicine is designed in line with:

1. Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education" dated July 27, 2007 No. 319-III. (with amendments and additions as of 07.07.2020 г № 361-VI.)
2. Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan on " People's health and health care system" dated June 07, 2020 No360-VI
3. Appendix 8 to the Order by Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated from October 31, 2018 No 604 « State General Compulsary Standard for Postgraduate Education dated from 05.05.2020 No 182
4. Order by the Ministry of Education and Science of the RK dated from 13.10.2018 No 569 on «Approving Track Classifier of Training cardes with higher and post education degrees (with amendments and additions for 05.06.2020)
5. Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 269 dated June 14, 2019. "On amendments to the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 31, 2018. No. 600 "On approval of the Model rules for admission to training in educational organizations that implement educational programs of higher and postgraduate education"
6. Order by the deputy Minister of Health Of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated from 31 July 2015 No 647 on "Approving state compulsory standards and Modal professional educational programs in medical and pharmaceutical specialties (with amendments and additions for 21.02. 2020 № RK NHS -12/2020)
7. Order No 600 on « Approving Model Rules of enrollment to the educational institution implementing posteducation programs» by the Minister for Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 31 October 2018 (with amendments and additions по состоянию на 24.05.2021 № 241)
8. Order No 595 by the Minister for Education and Science of the RK dated from October 31, 2018 registered in the Ministry of Justice of the RK on October 31, 2018, No 17657 on «Approving Model Rules of activity of educational organization of appropriate type.»
9. Order No 420 by the Minister of Education and Science, RK , dated October 16, 2013 on Approving Modal Rules of educational organization activities
10. Order No 152 by the Minister of Education and Science of the RK dated from April 20, 2011 on «Approving Rule of organization of learning process in line with credit system» (with amendments and additions for 12.10.2018 .)
11. Order No 774 on « Approving the Nomenclature of Medical and Pharmaceutical Specialties» (with amendments and additions on 28.08.2017 .) by the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated from 24 November 2009.
12. State Compulsary Standard of Education RK 5.05.001-2005 Coding System of Academic disciplines for higher and posteducation
13. Order No 125 by the Minister of Education and Science of the RK dated from 18 March 2008 «Model Rules for conducting current academic achievement control, midterm and final attestation of learners at higher educational institutions (with amendments and additions for 14.06.2018 .)
14. Strategic Plan of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2020-2024 (Order No 1435 by the first Vice-Minister of the RK dated from Dec 27, 2019)
15. Order No 135 on “Additional measures on providing education quality in tranfering learning process to blinded learning during pandemia Covid -19 by the Minister of Education and Science ” dated from April 8,2020
16. Internal normative documents of WKMU

Educational activity of the Faculty is based on implementation of State Programme «Health» for 2016-2019, Road map of Healthcare of RK for 2016-2019 on Modernization of medical education in which science, education and innovation are combined to implement the world's new educational technologies, to build professional competencies in graduates thereby ensuring their competitiveness in the market of medical services.

Accreditation of educational programmes in Biomedicine in the context of home and international standard requirements is planned by the University and it is confirmed with references on the website. [www.zkgmu.kz](http://www.zkgmu.kz).

The members of EEP noted that at the meeting with target groups, academic staff were aware of the University mission but told that they did not take part in articulating them.

Material resources available at the University are used efficiently to achieve the mission and goals set. The members of EEP noted that the University pays great attention to building respectful attitude at the university community.

During the meetings with employers it was noted that there is a high demand for graduates completing the course in Biomedicine.

### ***Strengths / Best practice***

*There are not any strengths on this standard*

### ***Recommendations by EEP***

The Managers responsible for the development of Educational Programmes should identify the direction of training in priority within the Specialty Biomedicine depending on demands in the market and identify specific learning outcomes including pedagogic and research competencies in each prioritized direction.

Deadline – early 2022-2023

***Conclusions made by EEP on criteria:*** strengths– 0, satisfactory – 13, should be improved – 1, unsatisfactory– 0.

## **Standard 6.2 Scientific research environment and educational resources**

### ***Evidences***

***Research activities of the University is regulated by Law “on Education” No 319-III of 27.07.2007. (29.06.2020.), «On Science» No 407-IV dated 18.02.2011. (with amendments and additions dated 18.03.2019.), national Health care Development Programme of the RK for 2020-2025 No982 dated 26.12.2019., approved by President of the RK, Code of the RK on «Population Health and Health care system» No 360-VI as of 07.07.2020.***

Research topics of master's students are a part of Department's research projects <https://zkmu.kz/temy-dissertacij-obuchayushhixsya-po-programmam-magistratury/>.

The University community takes an active participation in both university-funded and government financed research project. Involvement of all concerned parties in projects enhances research potential of the University and ensures effective training of cadres with high qualification. Engagement in scientific research projects enables academic staff and students combine research with education..

The University has a Clinical Laboratory, Pathoanatomical Department of the Medical Center, Scientific and Practical Center, and Morphological laboratory that enable to implement research projects. The main goal of Scientific and Practical Center is to conduct research in developing and improving models of normal and pathological states, various methods of investigation, diagnostics and treatment and also carry out research within the programmes financed by the MES and projects funded by the University budget, to provide consultations among teaching

fellows. Master's students do also research at Scientific and Practical Center in line with their master's thesis. Scientific and Practical Center homes laboratories : Molecular-genetic, sanitary – hygienic, molecular biologic and cellular laboratories. At the Molecular –genetic Lab studies on genetic markers associated with disease development , diagnostics and treatment , drug efficiency test , diagnostics of infectious diseases are conducted.

The results of research work are documented as scientific articles, patents, authorship (<https://zkmu.kz/virtualnaya-vystavka-trudov-avtorov-sotrudnikov/>). The amount of articles in international journals indexed in Web of Knowledge, Scopus, Springer is 40 for 2017; in 2018 this number increased up to 50, in 2019 if the number of articles was 53, in 2020 – 68, and in 2021 – 66. 7 . Based on the number of articles in international peer-reviewed publications (Web of Science, Scopus) for the Master's profile "Biomedicine" in 2017 - 26, in 2018 - 39, in 2019 - 48, in 2020 - 40, in 2021 - 58 articles . Teachers who participate in the implementation of programs in international peer-reviewed publications (Web of Science, Scopus), published in 2017 - 8, in 2018 - 7, in 2019 - 7, in 2020 - 6 and in 2021 - 22 articles .

Competent faculty members with academic degrees and titles that meet the requirements for supervisors of undergraduates are involved in the process of master's students research guidance. The total number of teaching staff - supervisors for postgraduate education programs (master's and doctoral studies) is 213 people, including 28 doctors of science, 163 candidates of science, 22 PhD doctors.

The scientometric indicator - the citation of scientists from our university is growing every year, where the indicator according to the Web of Science / Scopus databases in 2017 is 103, in 2018 - 166, in 2019 - 203, in 2020 - 220, in 2021 - 305.

WKMU is enough equipped with necessary facilities to be licensed for educational programme in accordance qualification requirements. First of all, all campus buildings of the University ensure the fulfilment of academic and research objectives of Master's Programme. Classrooms ,lecture halls, conference rooms at leading theoretical and clinical departments are equipped with multimedia installations, air conditioners, screens, interactive whiteboards.

The classrooms have laptops, connected to free Internet access, where you can connect to the Platonus automated information system. The "Platonus" system creates access to electronic journals on educational achievements of students, to announcement board of the university, and contacting with the dean's office

The opportunities of the Scientific and Practical Center with its laboratories and vivarium, equipment, clinical, pathomorphological laboratories of the Medical Center, the availability of special equipment in the areas of scientific research are described in the "Scientific Environment" standard. The scientific and technical base of the university includes equipment designed to carry out molecular biological, molecular genetic, sanitary and hygienic, morphological, biochemical studies. Information on the material and technical equipment of the laboratories is available on the university website (<https://zkmu.kz/materialno-texnicheskaya-baza/>).

The library fund is updated annually, in accordance with current regulations. For the period 2018-21 the library fund received 36436 copies. Scientific periodicals are available through a subscription to the Scientific Electronic Library.

The number of master's students depends on the number of places given by government for free education. WKMU is interested in preparing specialized scientific and pedagogical profiles. Educational resources satisfy the development of the master's program, all disciplines of the main and elective components are delivered by faculty members with academic degrees at the Department chosen for Programme. Educational resources are updated when normative and regulatory documents (GOSO) are changed, when catalogs of elective disciplines are updated, as well as when innovative technologies are introduced into the educational process

### ***Analytical part***

Analyzing the submitted information as well as visiting Departments and Labs the EEP states that the material and technical base used in the organization of learning process is sufficient, and

meets the requirements. Scientific laboratories and other premises comply with established safety standards and rules. The implementation of educational programs at the university is ensured by the free access of each student to information resources and the library fund.

Department of Digitalization is responsible for implementing policy on information and communication technologies and digitalization of educational process.

The EEP states that learners are provided with necessary information and communication technologies, but information on the control whether technologies are used targeted or purposefully or not is not available.

The fact that Practical classes in Biomedicine take place at the Scientific and Practical Center is confirmed with documentations.

The University implements the Program of Academic Mobility of Teaching staff and Students. Exchange programs allow you to consolidate knowledge, skills and experience not only within the scope of specialization, but also contribute to fostering additional competencies. Currently, WKSMU has official Memorandums of Understanding with many overseas and post Soviet countries.

Extensive experience of cooperation with various universities, including foreign ones, provides great opportunities for integrating scientific potential in the framework of creating joint educational programs in the direction of Biomedicine. Such experience will improve both the level of research training of undergraduates and will determine the further development of the program at the international level.

WKMU conducts an examination in the field of education, which considers the problems, processes and practice of education by involving experiences practitioners, psychologists and sociologists. Internal expertise on compliance of the teaching methodology at the university with the implementation of the educational program is carried out systematically both at the intra-departmental level and by the internal audit system.

EEP confirms that student support services function through the university website, through personal appeals to the dean, vice-rector, rector, curator, mentor, advisor, etc.

EEP experts failed to obtain information about the possibility of making corrections to the program for the implementation of the master's project, if necessary, which the university management should pay close attention to. The implementation of various critical risks jeopardizes both the implementation of a scientific project and the completion of master's studies .

Analyses made on information hosted on the University website revealed that information lacks or is provided insufficiently on :

- the structure and staffing of the department
  - detail description of Master's Degree Programmes by indicating learning outcomes
  - admission and selection criteria for master's Degree
  - rules for documenting master's thesis
  - description of thesis defiance procedures
  - description of State Committee's work for Master's Degree thesis defense
- Deadline – early 2022-2023.

The members of EEP considers that the University facilities contribute to vary the forms and methods of involving master's students in research activities and in publishing research results.

***Strengths / best practice***

**No strengths for this standard**

***Recommendations by EEP***

1. The management of educational organization should develop and implement the system for managing risks (the change of supervisor or the topic of scientific research, lack of

- consumables, stopping access to patients etc) which arise while doing master's research.  
Deadline - early 2023.
2. Management of Educational Programme should determine the list of potential partner-organizations to develop jointly educational programmes in the Specialty Biomedicine .  
Deadline – early 2024
  3. The management of educational organization should implement the system of monitoring and controlling whether the learners adequately use information resources.  
Deadline - early 2023-2024
  4. Management of Department for Master's and Doctoral Degree Studies should increase information posting activities to provide concerned parties and potential candidates for Degrees with information sufficiently on :
    - the structure and staffing of the department
    - detail description of Master's Degree Programme by indicating learning outcomes
      - admission and selection criteria for master's Degree
    - rules for documenting master's thesis
    - description of thesis defense procedures
    - description of State Committee's work for Master's Degree thesis defense
 Deadline – early 2022-2023.

**Conclusions made by EEP according to criteria :** strong– 0, satisfactory – 25, should be improved– 4, unsatisfactory – 0.

### **Standard 6.3. Admission Policy and Criteria**

#### **Evidential part**

Building student contingent is based on the number of order by state for training scientific and pedagogic cadres and tuition fee provided by different University resources and produced by learners themselves as well.

In WKMU, in accordance with the mission, a multi-level model of training specialists is being implemented, which allows graduates with higher professional education to continue their studies in the magistracy. The main idea of training in educational programs in all specialties of the master's program is the training of scientific and pedagogical cadres.

In order to meet the needs of the population and society as a whole, the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, which is responsible for planning and developing human resources in the healthcare sector, annually sets in advance the number of master's students might be admitted to medical universities on free education basis. In turn, the university submits an application on the number of students the University could receive appropriate to its material, technical and educational potentials for approval to the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan

The number of master's students accepted is planned by taking into account the total area of educational and laboratory premises, the availability of teaching staff, the provision of educational, educational, methodological and scientific literature, the throughput of a large population base, the availability of social and living conditions.

In accordance with its mission, the university establishes Policy on Master's Students Admission, which complies with the requirements of the law regarding equality of educational opportunities and ethical aspects.

The WKMU Policy on Admission for Master's Degree Programmes is developed in line with the Law of the RK on Education dated 27 July 2007 No 319 , Law on Science dated February 18, 2011 No 407-IV , and in accordance with the Modal Rules on Admission to educational organization implementing postgraduate education programmes approved by MES, KR dated Oct30, 2018 No 600



Admission procedure of the University is stated in Provision on Admission for Master's Degree Programme approved by the Council of Directors of WKMU and in the University's Academic Policy.

The University officially announces of admission for Master's Degree Programme by indicating specialties, a group of educational programmes with the list of subjects to be taken exams in by posting information on website or announcement boards of the University) and in Platonus (<https://platonus.zkmu.kz>), in social nets as Instagram and facebook which will be made available to potential master's students and concerned parties. ([https://zkmu.kz/wp-content/uploads/2021/10/info\\_dlya\\_post\\_v\\_magistr-ru.pdf](https://zkmu.kz/wp-content/uploads/2021/10/info_dlya_post_v_magistr-ru.pdf)).

Application to Master's Degree programme is received by Admission Committee created at the University or via electronic system from June 15 till July 19 annually.

The Chairman of Admission Committee is Rector. Admission Committee provides applicants with consultations regarding educational programmes and exam requirements.

Applicants preferring scientific and pedagogical direction 7M10105 "Biomedicine" can indicate one group of educational programs and up to 3 (three) OVPO in the in the application

Admission of undergraduates to WKMU is carried out by placing a state educational order for training personnel in scientific, pedagogical and specialized areas, as well as paying for training at the expense of students' own funds and other sources, taking into account the resource potential of WKMU. Admission of citizens to the magistracy of WKMU is carried out on a competitive basis based on the results of Comprehensive testing - the availability of an electronic certificate, which is confirmed on the website of the National Testing Center of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan [www.testcenter.kz](http://www.testcenter.kz).

Due to the fact that the university is not directly involved in the organization of comprehensive testing, competitive selection, applicants choose a university and come with a certificate for a grant. The main mission of the Department of Master's and Doctoral Studies of the University is to carry out career guidance, inform interested parties about the master's programs implemented at the university, familiarize with the list of groups of educational programs of postgraduate education indicating the profile disciplines of comprehensive testing, familiarize with the list of required documents, about career prospects, about necessary preparation for the successful delivery of exam

The Admission Committee and the Department for Master's and Doctoral Studies provide applicants with information on the selected group of educational programs of postgraduate education, on the procedure of comprehensive testing, with instructions for registering on the NTC website for submitting an application.

During the year, work is carried out on the professional orientation of graduates and young teachers of the university. Various forms and methods of career guidance work are used.

The department for Master's and Doctoral studies, that has power to determine the state order, place an announcement, organize, outline the procedure and conduct the acceptance of documents, enrollment is responsible for the policy on selection and admission. The internal rules on admission to Master's and Doctoral studies are reviewed annually due to changes and additions to the Model Rules on admission to postgraduate education or due to the introduction of a new state educational standard, etc.

In the process of selection priority is given to research potentials and foreign language proficiency demonstrated by applicants.

The university supports faculty members with aptitudes to research and plans to provide itself with scientific and pedagogical cadres by attracting them to apply for postgraduate education.

The Policy on Admission undergoes adaptation, first of all, due to the need in cadres at clinical and theoretical departments. In 2019 changes have been made to the SCES of postgraduate education adopted in 2015, and approved in 2020, and according to it modular trajectories of the master's program have been developed.

It is expected that there will be high demand in specialists with a good command of professional knowledge with the skills of solving social problems in the field of medical genetics,

bioinformatics, pharmagenesis.

Since funds for scientific and pedagogical personnel are allocated at the expense of the state order, the training of specialists among faculty members of the university is provided. Master's programs are carried out both on the state order and on a contractual (paid) basis.

### ***Analytical part***

Having analyzed the work delivered within the EP, the EEP noted that the University has clear policy on admission for master's programmes. Education can be at state order that study cost is covered by government or on commercial basis which means that students will have to pay tuition fees for the courses offered by the University. Transparency of procedures on selecting students is achieved with open information on decisions on the official website of the University.

The university pursues the policy of balanced selection of students, taking into account ethnic origin and other social requirements. The number of students would be admitted to the university is planned by taking into account the total area of educational and laboratory premises, the availability of teaching staff, the provision of educational, methodological and scientific literature, the capacity of the university's clinical facilities, the availability of social and living conditions for studying and living students.

In the country, what is the peculiar about the procedure on admission is that the process of admission to universities is controlled by the government and universities do not participate in it. Therefore, the exam results displayed by applicants are not processed by or at the university. and accordingly, it was not possible to trace the nature of the decisions made in the documents and interviews.

One of the consequences of such entry system is that students enrolled for the Programme might show different level of skills and research experience, etc. The university does not conduct evaluation of skills or knowledge upon entry so it results in inefficient implementation of EP to some extent. To create individual learning trajectory it would be rational if the University have opportunity to evaluate research potential of applicants.

### ***Strengths / best practice***

*No strengths have been revealed*

### ***Recommendations by EEP***

1. The management of the EP and the head of the Department for Master's and Doctoral degree studies should develop mechanisms and work plan for recruiting potential candidates to apply for Master's Degree Programmes in prioritized directions

2. The management of Educational programmes should develop mechanisms for assessing master's students research potential and mechanisms of taking these results in future in creating individual learning trajectory. Deadline – early 2023-2024.

**Conclusions of the EEP according to the criteria:** strong positions – 0, satisfactory – 5, should be improved – 2, unsatisfactory – 0

## **Standard 6.4. Master's Programme**

### ***Evidential part***

WKMU is ready to implement EP M143 in Biomedicine within Master's Degree Programme, which is based on multidisciplinary and competitive approach

The content covers:

- 1) theoretical training with the focus on basic and profile related subjects;
- 2) practical training including a variety of research or practical internship;
- 3) research work with master's thesis completion;

## 4) final attestation.

The Master's Program is based on a modular system of studying disciplines with a set of hours / credits agreed by the Academic Committee for "Master's, Doctoral Studies", and the Department of Academic Work and approved at the Academic Council.

The department implementing the programme is responsible for developing EP in accordance with State Standard of Compulsory Education. The list of core disciplines are outlined in the State Standard of Compulsory Education and the elective courses are determined at the Department by taking into account the expectations of employers and needs in job market.

A master's students who has mastered the core components of the modular master's program in the scientific and pedagogical direction 7M10105 "Biomedicine" must have fundamental scientific or professional training, be proficient in modern information technologies, including methods for obtaining, processing and storing scientific information, be able to formulate and solve modern scientific and practical problems, organize and conduct experimental research and research activities in the chosen direction, successfully carry out research and management activities.

Upon completion, a graduate acquires the following competencies: critical thinking, pedagogical skills, effective communications, research skills in biomedicine, leadership and management.

The goal of Master's Programme in Biomedicine M143 is training highly qualified specialists with deep professional competencies in scientific-pedagogic and research activities in at educational organizations. Master's Programme ensures those who are planning to be engaged in scientific work with firm grounding for research.

Key competencies acquired in the framework of courses "Critical Thinking", "Communication" are the skills of systematic search, critical thinking, profound knowledge necessary to professional activities, skills of lifelong learning, multidisciplinary skills. In the course Research in Biomedicine and Leadership and Management course students understand the philosophy of science, master research methodology and by the end of the course master's students will be able to operate research results and to use best evidences at practice.

While working on original study master's student creates new ways of solving problems by synthesizing and reorganizing scientifically grounded arguments. This competency is fostered in the process of mastering basic disciplines (the History and Philosophy of Science, Psychology of Management, Biomedical Statistics, Research Methodology, Ethics of Research, Academic Writing) and 5 profile disciplines (Project management in Biomedicine, Cellular and Molecular Pathobiology, Biophysics with Biomedicine basis and etc.)

The Master's degree program "Biomedicine" includes cycles of basic and profile disciplines, disciplines of the university component and the component of choice. The list of disciplines of the university component and the component of choice is determined by the University independently. At the same time, the needs of the labor market, the expectations of employers, the needs and interests of undergraduates are taken into account. The cycles of basic (hereinafter - BD) and profiling (hereinafter - PD) disciplines include disciplines of the university component (hereinafter - UC).

The university component of the BD cycle of all educational programs of the master's program in the scientific and pedagogical direction includes the disciplines "History and philosophy of science", "Foreign language (professional)", "Pedagogy of higher education", "Psychology of management". Integrated programs have been developed for the disciplines of the UC cycle of the BD, which are interdisciplinary in nature.

In the master's program in the scientific and pedagogical direction, the volume of the database cycle is 29% of the total volume of the educational program of the master's program or 35 academic credits / 1050 hours. Of these, 57% or 20 academic credits / 600 hours are allocated to the VC.

In the master's program in the scientific and pedagogical direction, the volume of the PD cycle is 41%, or 49 academic credits / 1470 hours. of the total volume of the master's educational program. The programs of disciplines and modules are interdisciplinary and multidisciplinary in nature, providing training at the intersection of a number of areas of knowledge.

An obligatory component of the master's program of the scientific and pedagogical direction 7M10105 "Biomedicine" is: 1) practical training of undergraduates, including various types of practices, scientific or professional internships; 2) research work, including the implementation of a master's thesis.

The educational program of the scientific and pedagogical master's program includes two types of practices that are carried out in parallel with theoretical training or in a separate period:

- 1) pedagogical in the BD cycle 4 credits / 120 hours. - at the university;
- 2) research in the PD cycle 6 credits / 180 hours. - at the place of dissertation.

The research work of a master student, including an internship and a master's thesis (MRW) is 24 credits / 720 hours.

The final certification is 12 academic credits or no more than 10% of the total educational program of the master's program in the scientific and pedagogical direction and is carried out in the form of writing and defending a master's thesis. The purpose of the final certification is to assess the learning outcomes and key competencies achieved upon completion of the master's educational program.

Upon completion of each discipline a standardized questionnaire survey conducted among students to get feedback on whether they were satisfied with educational programme content. The obtained information as a result of questionnaire survey are discussed at the Department and amendments and additions are made into Syllabuses, office hours are rescheduled, teaching methods are reconsidered, books are ordered, and new equipment is applied for. Faculty members have discussion on how to improve teaching methods, materials and evaluation actions. Recommendations are submitted to the Academic Committees for Specialties and if necessary to the Academic Council where data on evaluation of EP are discussed to remove shortcoming.

### ***Analytical part***

During expertise work of the EEP, detailed analyses were made on the compliance of EP to, principles of education organization, teaching methods, research methodology focused on satisfaction of all stakeholders of education quality. The content and format of EP, decisions made by the management of EP are agreed with strategic and normative documents of the RK. The University has its own budget and can use money from its commercial activities to cover expenses spent to advanced courses of academic staff.

The management of WKMU and EP do not only involve concerned parties in developing educational programmes but also recruit them to work together as was known while talking with target groups. In this sense, the University is carrying a huge work together with employers to enhance graduate employment.

Faculty members interviewed by the EEP could explain how elective courses are created, how students chose the electives and how individual learning trajectory is designed.

Nevertheless, the EEP noted that reports and questionnaire survey results did not give a picture on how specific method of teaching are applied to foster necessary competencies in students. It was also impossible to get detailed information on the procedures of pedagogical practice by master's students. In addition to it, the EEP states that the existing system does not allow master's students earn extra credits in summer time.

### ***Strengths / best practice***

Strengths have not been revealed for this standard

***Conclusions of the EEP according to the criteria: strong positions – 0, satisfactory – 19, should be improved– 3, unsatisfactory– 0***

***Recommendations by EEP***

1. The management of EP should identify specific teaching methods for each discipline that assist to the achievement of key competencies by master's students. The management of Department for Master's and Doctoral Degree Studies should ensure that all faculty members and master's students are aware of methods applied. The management of educational organization should ensure the material –technical base for implementing methods of teaching that contributes to the successfulness of EP. Deadline – early 2024.

2. The management of EP should develop mechanisms for conducting pedagogic practice by indicating methods of teaching pedagogic skills, type and volume of activities ,methods and criteria of evaluating learning achievements of students during pedagogical practice. Deadline – by the end of 2022-2023 academic year.

3. The management of the educational organization should develop and implement Provision on additional training during the vacation period in order students earn extra credits. The deadline is early 2023.

**Standard 6.5. Scientific Supervision*****Evidential part***

Within two months after enrollment each master's student is assigned a faculty advisor who will assist and control them in writing master's thesis. Supervisors should have scientific degrees and be active researcher in the field of master's thesis topic. Priority is given to such supervisors who has experience in research projects and has actively published in journals indexed in international databases and journals recommended by the Committee for Control in the Sphere of Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan (CCSES MES RK) at least for the last 5 years. Previous master's and doctoral theses successfully supervised by them are also taken into consideration

The procedure of approving master's thesis topics and their supervisors is carried out as outlined in Provision on Postgraduate education (master's degree) approved by the decision of the Board of WKMU dated Sept15,2021 Minute No 28.

Master's theses, faculty advisors, and co-advisors are discussed at the meetings of Department and Committee on Research Problems before submitting to the approval by rector . (Provision on Postgraduate education, 10.2, 10.3.).

Research activities of scientific supervisors are guided by the Law on Education of the RK dated February 18, 2011, No 407-IV (with amendments and additions for 28.10.2019) , by the Order of MES , RK on State Standard of Postgraduate Education dated October 31, 2018, No 604, and by the Order of Minister of Healthcare System , RK , dated 31 July,2015 No 647 "On approving state standard of compulsory education and model professional academic programmes in Medical and Pharmaceutical Specialties (with amendments and additions for 21 Feb, 2020 , No 12/2020),),

The individual work plan of a master's student is designed by his /her supervisor and is one of the main documents regulating the work of both master's students and his/her supervisor for the period of study and is developed in accordance with the University Standard requirements on "The procedure for organizing the educational process in postgraduate education programs (Masters and doctoral studies) PRO ZKMU 731-2020 <https://www.zkgmu.kz/docs/proscded->

The scientific supervisor of the master's student carries out direct supervision of the scientific work of a master's students. Scientific supervisors schedule office hours to their students several times a month. During consultaion, supervisor assesses the degree and quality of scientific research, the compliance with the individual plan of a student, gives recommendations and discuss theoretical and practical issues of research. Thus, the supervisor creates the conditions for the successful implementation of the tasks set, conducts systematic monitoring at the stages of

the study, discusses the results, makes adjustments in the course of work and provides assistance at certain stages of the dissertation.

The individual work plan of a master's student contains information about the workload, about practices, the plan of the master's thesis, scientific publications, internships and is designed for the entire period of study, and approved by the head of the Department of Master's and Doctoral Studies, one copy is stored in the student's attestation file and serves as the basis for control for curriculum fulfilment.

Regular classes (students' independent work under the supervision of a lecturer) are scheduled on the basis of individual learning plan, for the entire academic The schedule of classes and the schedule of the supervised student teaching are approved by the vice-rector for educational work of the university.

Evaluation procedures are outlined in the Provision on Postgraduate education, developed by the Department for Master's and Doctoral Degree studies and in the Policy on Academic Integrity (Minute No18 dated 30.07.2020.)

### ***Analytical part***

Having analyzed the EP for this standard, the EEP noted that the University has its own policy on appointing scientific advisors for master's programme. The number of faculty members appropriate to supervision requirements is enough to implement the EP. Total number of teaching fellows is 213, ( doctors od Science are 28, Candidates -163, PhD 22 ) . There are possibilities for multidisciplinary research projects in the context of master's thesis by involving overseas specialists from partner universities. A. M. Grzhibovskii , professor from State Medical University in Arkhangelsk (Russia ) provide master's students with consultations on publications as a foreign scientific advisor.

Nevertheless, the EEP members could not get clear answers on procedures of training potential scientific supervisors for the master's Programme, and the management should pay attention to this problem.

### ***Strengths / best practice***

*Strengths have not been revealed for this standard*

***Conclusions of the EEP according to the criteria: strong positions – 0, satisfactory – 6, should be improved– 1, unsatisfactory– 0***

### ***Recommendations by EEP***

1. The management of educational organization should develop and implement the system of training potential scientific supervisors, and renew information on research requirements and procedures . Deadline – the end 2023.

## **Standard 6.6 Governance and Administration**

### **Evidential part**

WKMU has its own management system that contributes to the achievement of the mission and goals, maintains institutional efficiency and integrity, creates and promotes creative learning, research, medical work environment. The transparency of the management system is carried out through information support for the process of preparation, adoption and implementation of the decision. Since 2020, electronic document management program “Documentolog” (<https://zkmu.documentolog.kz/>) has been introduced.

The main structural subdivisions - deans, departments, centers, departments, departments, laboratories, etc. perform certain functional duties (in accordance with the Regulations) and

between which there are horizontal and vertical links. The Board of Directors is the highest corporate governance body

Educational activities of the university is managed by Academic Council, a collegial governing body members of which are the head of the DAR, chairmen of the AC of specialties, deans of faculties, and heads of departments.

Working groups or expert commissions comprised of members of the Council, employees of the University, employers, representatives of public organizations are created to solve operational issues, to prepare meetings, to conduct expertise (report on self-assessment p. 77).

By order of the Chairman of the Board-Rector of the University No. 13 / 2-18-655 N / K dated November 25, 2020, as subdivision of Department of Academic Work, Quality Assurance Commission which makes decisions on the content and conditions for the implementation of educational programs, on the assessment policy and others academic issues was established .

Deans's Offices exercises all types of activities including academic, methodical, research and innovation by taking into consideration requirements to training qualified competitive specialists. Council of faculties is the governing body for faculties.

Informing concerned persons and related structures of the Academic Council's decisions take place at department meetings. The Minutes of meetings are posted monthly on the website (<https://zkgmu.kz/ru/universitet/uchenyj-sovet>) and communicated to each employee by sending mailing. The Academic Council monthly publishes decision information list.

Students receive information via AIS "Platonus", whatsapp chats and social networks Telegram channel Ospanov zhastary, Telegram bot @zkmuhelp\_bot, [https://www.instagram.com/ospanov\\_zhastary/](https://www.instagram.com/ospanov_zhastary/) and a working chat in the Student Parliament

Written appeals concerning the issues of the academic activities of the university are registered in the office. In addition, on the university website on the rector's blog (<https://zkgmu.kz/ru/blog-rektora/soobshcheniya>) there is an opportunity to contact and receive an answer and explanatory information (self-assessment report p.124).

Financing Master's Degree Programme is carried out at the expense of the reduced contingent at the cost approved in accordance with the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan: education at the expense of approved by the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated April 16, 2018 No. 199 as amended on July 23, 2020 No. 470 for the academic year; expenses for paying teachers, paying for utilities, purchasing supplies, purchasing educational and methodological literature at the expense of financing the cost of educating master's students.

University activities is financed from different sources: Университет обладает необходимой автономией для определения приоритетных направлений расходования средств.

University activities is financed from different sources: through the budget allocated by the government for education, through funds of ministries, organizations and enterprises of all forms of ownership, and also owing to the tuition fees produced by learners studying on paid basis , and extra budget sources of financing not prohibited by the law of the country. The University is free to identify and prioritize the field where allocation will be made to. Financing educational programmes is analyzed annually to comprehensively explore and evaluate financial condition of the university. For the implementation of the educational program, financial resources are allocated for all types of activities and items of expenditure: wage fund, material and technical support of the educational process (acquisition of manuals, instruments, equipment, consumables), campus maintenance.

The annual execution of the plan of financial and economic activities based on the results of the financial year is submitted to the Board of Directors to be considered.

To achieve the final learning outcomes; to award and support teaching staff and students the university has the right to independently direct financial resources in accordance with regulatory documents.

The cost of educational services at the University is determined in accordance with the requirements of the law, approved at the local level (in accordance with the Regulations on the provision of paid educational services), information is communicated to consumers by posting on the official website.

In 2006 the Quality Management System (QMS) was created at the university. In 2021, the QMS was recertified for compliance with the international standard ISO 9001:2015. Assessment of the state of the ZKMU QMS is carried out in accordance with the documented procedures PRO ZKMU 502-19 "Analysis by the management"; PRO ZKMU 801-19 "Internal audits"; PRO ZKMU 727-19 "Questioning"; PRO ZKMU 708-2020 "Quality control of the educational process"; PRO ZKMU 803-19 "Corrective actions", etc.

For the training of administrative and academic staff, advanced training courses, master classes, round tables, etc. have been developed. The calculation of departments staffing is carried out by the Department for Teaching on the basis of the volume of the annual teaching load of each department. The number of employees of the administrative staff and teaching staff is set at a ratio of 1:7. The ongoing cadre policy allows maintaining the balance of ratios between administrative and academic staff at the level of 1:6. This figure remains stable for the period 2018-2020 and ensures the effectiveness of management decisions to achieve the goals set by the university.

The development of interaction between the university and the employer is a key moment in the process of graduate employment. The University has entered the Agreement with each employer.

ZKMU exchanges information and cooperates with other institutions, sending employees to other universities or medical organizations and accepting students and employees from other institutions with good results in exchange of experience.

Thus, the university management system, academic management, budget for education and allocation of resources, administrative staff and management meet state and international quality standards to implement the educational program.

The assessment of the academic management is carried out based on the results of the final attestations of students, state attestations, the results of independent attestation of graduates, and the assessment of key indicators of the educational activities of the University Development Program.

Assessment of key indicators of the development strategy is carried out at the end of the calendar year. The achievement of development indicators is analyzed, and agreed by the authorized bodies of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, and then are approved at the meetings of the Academic Council and the Board of Directors. University employees and other concerned parties can find information about the implementation of the development strategy on the university website.

### ***Analytical part***

ЗКМУ в соответствии с Уставом является учреждением высшего образования, реализующим образовательные программы высшего образования, профессиональные образовательные программы послевузовского медицинского и фармацевтического образования. В 2016 г. ЗКГМУ прошел процедуру международной аккредитации образовательных программ, в ходе которой был сформулирован ряд рекомендаций, направленных на улучшение ОП.

The Commission notes that the university has defined management structures, structural divisions which include academic staff, students, representatives of practical healthcare, and their functions, which is confirmed by the submitted documents, the results of interviews with various focus groups, from the management of the NAO to employers.

Decisions made at different levels are transparent, brought to the attention of stakeholders by posting p on the website and through corporate e-mails Meeting Minutes are published on the university website, and distributed at academic councils, at meetings with students and employers, in AIS "Platonus", through Whatsapp chats and social networks Telegram channel Ospanov



zhastary, Telegram bot @zkmuhelp\_bot, [https://www.instagram.com/ospanov\\_zhastary/](https://www.instagram.com/ospanov_zhastary/) and working -chat in the Student Parliament.

Information of the current QMS system of the university, which is carried out in accordance with the documented procedures ZKMU 727-19 "Questionnaire survey " PRO ZKMU 708-19 "Quality control of the educational process", PRO ZKMU 803-19 "Corrective actions", etc is reflected in the documents submitted to the EEP and on the website of the University. According to the approved schedule, all structural divisions of the university conduct an internal audit for compliance with the QMS.

Information of the current QMS system of the university, which is carried out in accordance with the documented procedures ZKMU 727-19 "Questionnaire survey " PRO ZKMU 708-19 "Quality control of the educational process", PRO ZKMU 803-19 "Corrective actions", etc is reflected in the documents submitted to the EEP and on the website of the University. According to the approved schedule, all structural divisions of the university conduct an internal audit for compliance with the QMS.

The University independently carries out financial and economic activities, by developing a plan for financial and economic activities. The financial autonomy of the university correlates with the principles of responsibility in the society for the quality of all activities in professional training, scientific research, the provision of services, with the effective management of funds and property.

This policy does not contradict the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan and ensures the institutional autonomy of the university. Monitoring compliance with the principles of efficiency, effectiveness, priority, transparency and responsibility of the financing system is carried out during the audit, the results of which for the reporting period are posted on the website <http://zkgmu.kz/ru/sluzhba-vnutremnego-audit>.

The departments implementing the EP in Biomedicine are fully staffed according to the staffing table. Currently, the departments are provided with highly qualified cadres, including doctors of science, candidates of science, masters of science, associate professors and professors.

The qualitative and quantitative composition of the teaching staff ensures the full-fledged organization and conduct of the educational process, and the training of specialists in the EP. In order to motivate employees to improve the quality and effectiveness of activities, incentive measures (grants, additional payments) have been developed at the university, which was confirmed by the teaching staff at a meeting with members of the EEC.

Written appeals concerning the issues of the academic activities of the university are registered in the office. In addition, on the university website on the rector's blog there is an opportunity to contact and receive an answer and explanatory information(<https://zkgmu.kz/ru/blog-rektora/soobshcheniya>).

In order to ensure high-quality practical training within the educational programmes in Biomedicine, the university has concluded agreements with healthcare organizations as teaching hospitals on the basis of Provision on Clinical bases of medical educational organizations dated 11 September 2012 , Order No 628. Thus , the University is currently cooperating with following organizations:

: SGE Aktobe Medical Center , SGE «Hospital for Emergency Services », SGR « Polyclinic No 2», SGE «Polyclinic No 3», SGE «Polyclinic No 4», SGE «Polyclinic No5», SGE «Regional Perinatal Center», SGE «Regional Blood Center», that is confirmed on the basis of electronic documents as well as at the meetings with Deans, Faculty Fellows and Employers.

***Strengths / Best practice***

*Strengths have not been revealed for this standard*

***Recommendations by EEP***

There are not any *recommendations by EEP*

**Conclusions of the EEP according to the criteria:** strong positions – 0, satisfactory – 22, should be improved – 0, unsatisfactory – 0

### **Standard 6.7. Стандарт On-going improvement**

#### ***Evidential part***

WKMU is a dynamically developing educational organization that approach to the training pharmaceutical and medical cadres with great responsibility. The Universities enters into the group of top 20 universities (8<sup>th</sup> place) and according to independent ranking of universities in stands the first among medical universities of Kazakhstan.

Renewing process at the University is achieved by implementing the mission focuses on innovations in medicine, science and practice and improvement of education quality.

Analyses allow to evaluate the opportunities for improving and needs in changes in the quality management system, to reveal existing problems and to develop strategies to remove them. The University Policy on Quality and Goals have been developed and approved to ensure consistent improvement of educational and medical services offered and at enhancing the efficiency of quality management system in the context of international standard requirements.

Internal audits are regularly planned, at the result of which correcting and preventing actions are undertaken. For the last three years new departments such as the Office of Internal Audit Services the Center for Family Medicine and Primary Aid Research, International Medical Faculty, Department of Postgraduate Education, Department of Digitalization, Department of Evidence-based Medicine and Research Management, Center for Nursing Excellence have been opened at the University. During the site visit the EEP were acquainted with the work of them.

To enhance acquisition of practical skills by learners and improving the quality of medical services laboratories are regularly equipped in accordance with department needs.

Experience of applying innovative technologies (PBL, CBL, RBL etc.); in teaching, and knowledge and skills acquired by faculty members at seminars and workshops, or as a result of cooperation with educational organizations and research institutions (43 leading medical schools) are taken into consideration while renewing and improving educational programmes,

Academic freedom in designing educational programmes and elective courses available allow the University make appropriate additions or amendments into the EP that enables to develop elective courses depending on the changes in environment, in demographic situations, in population health state. The needs of stakeholders is the key term to be kept while developing EP.

#### ***Analytical part***

As a result of deep analyzing submitted documents and interviews and questionnaire survey conducted, the EEP concludes that the University is a dynamically developing organization that initiates evaluating, monitoring and reconsidering the content of EP, learning outcomes, education environment.

The process of updating focuses on the adaptation of mission, learning outcomes, teaching approaches that contribute to economic development of the society.

The University make corrections into EP by taking into consideration achievements in biomedical, behavioral, social and clinical, the changes in demographic situation. Nevertheless, one should pay attention, to include new research knowledge, conceptions, methods into Educational Programme Syllabus.

Academic Staff recruiting policy, and identifying the staff, improving educational resources of are adapted to the changes of all concerned parties.

Таким образом, по данному стандарту в целом, можно констатировать, что администрация и сотрудники университета работают над непрерывным улучшением.

### **Strengths/ best practice**

No strengths for this standard

**Recommendations by EEP**

No recommendations

**Conclusions of the EEP according to the criteria:** strong positions – 0, satisfactory – 6, should be improved – 0, unsatisfactory – 0.

**(VII) REVIEW OF STRENGTHS/ BEST PRACTICE ON EACH STANDARD**

**Standard 7.1. Mission and Learning Outcomes**

There are not strengths on this standard

**Standard 7.2 Research Environment and Educational Recourses**

There are not strengths on this standard .

**Standard 7.3. Admission Policy and Criteria**

There are not strengths on this standard

**Standard 7.4. Master's Programme**

There are not strengths on this standard

**Standard 7.5. Scientific Supervision**

There are not strengths on this standard

**Standard 7.6. Governance and Administration**

There are not strengths on this standard

**Standard 7.7. On-going improvement**

There are not strengths on this standard

**(VIII) REVIEW OF STRENGTHS/ BEST PRACTICE ON EACH STANDARD**

Standard 6.1. Mission and Learning Outcomes

There are not strengths on this standard

Standard 6.2. Стандарт Research Environment and Educational Recourses

There are not strengths on this standard .

Standard 6.3. Admission Policy and Criteria

There are not strengths on this standard

Standard 6.4. Master's Programme

There are not strengths on this standard

Standard 6.5. Scientific Supervision

There are not strengths on this standard

Standard 6.6. Management and Administration

There are not strengths on this standard

Standard 6.7. On-going improvement

There are not strengths on this standard

## **(IX) REVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS ON QUALITY IMPROVEMENT**

### **Standard 8.1 Mission and Learning Outcomes**

The Management of Educational Programme should identify the direction of training in priority within the Specialty Biomedicine depending on demands in the market and identify specific learning outcomes including pedagogic and research competencies in each prioritized direction. Deadline – early 2002-2023

### **Standard 8.2 Research Environment and Educational Resources**

- The management of educational organization should develop and implement the system for managing risks (the change of supervisor or the topic of scientific research, lack of consumables, stopping access to patients etc) which arise while doing master's research. Deadline - early 2023.
- Management of Educational Programme should determine the list of potential partner-organizations to develop jointly educational programmes in the Specialty Biomedicine . Deadline – early 2024
- The management of educational organization should implement the system of monitoring and controlling whether the learners adequately use information resources. Deadline - early 2023-2024
- Management of Department for Master's and Doctoral Degree Studies should increase information posting activities to provide concerned parties and potential candidates for Degrees with information sufficiently on :
  - the structure and stuffing of the department
  - detail description of Master's Degree Programme by indicating learning outcomes
  - admission and selection criteria for master's Degree
  - rules for documenting master's thesis
  - description of thesis defense procedures
  - description of State Committee's work for Master's Degree thesis defense. Deadline – early 2022-2023.

### **Standard 8.3 Admission Policy and Criteria**

1. The management of the EP and the head of the Department for Master's and Doctoral degree studies should develop mechanisms and work plan for recruiting potential candidates to apply for Master's Degree Programmes in prioritized directions

2. The management of Educational programmes should develop mechanisms for assessing master's students research potential and mechanisms of taking these results in future in creating individual learning trajectory. Deadline – early 2023-2024.

### **Standard 8.4. Master's Degree Programme**

1. The management of EP should identify specific teaching methods for each discipline that assist to the achievement of key competencies by master's students. The management of Department for Master's and Doctoral Degree Studies should ensure that all faculty members

and master's students are aware of methods applied. The management of educational organization should ensure the material –technical base for implementing methods of teaching that contributes to the successfulness of EP. Deadline – early 2024.

2. The management of EP should develop mechanisms for conducting pedagogic practice by indicating methods of teaching pedagogic skills, type and volume of activities ,methods and criteria of evaluating learning achievements of students during pedagogical practice. Deadline – by the end of 2022-2023 academic year.

3. The management of the educational organization should develop and implement Provision on additional training during the vacation period in order students earn extra credits. The deadline is early 2023.

#### **Standard 8.5 Scientific Supervision**

The management of educational organization should develop and implement the system of training potential scientific supervisors, and renew information on research requirements and procedures . Deadline – the end 2023.

#### **Standard 8.6 Governance and Administration**

No recommendation

#### **Standar 8.7 On-going improvement**

No recommendation

### **(X) REVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS ON EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION DEVELOPMENT**

During the work of EEP both a remote and face-to-face meetings with administration of the University (Rector, Vice-Rector, Executive Director ) and heads of Educational Programmes and Department heads , academic staff, students, and employers were organized. The results of documents and internet resources of the educational organization studied during the visit demonstrates the improvement at the University in whole and in Biomedicine particularly.

The recommendations emphasized enhancing the work on articulation of priorities in training specialists in the field of Biomedicine and inclusion of innovation, new teaching methodologies into the educational program which allows to promote academic and research practice at higher level in the context of world's medical education space.

### **(XI) RECOMMENDATIONS FOR ACCREDITATION COUNCIL**

The Members of EEP unanimously came to conclusion that Educational Programme in Specialty 7M1010 Biomedicine, which is ready to be implemented at the NC JSC West Kazakhstan Marat Ospanov Medical University can be accredited for the period of 5 years

**Appendix 1. Evaluation Table «Parameters of Specialized Profile of EP in the  
Master's Programme Specialty 7M10105 – Biomedicine**

№ II/II	№	EVALUATION CRITERIA	Position of educational organization			
			Strong	satisfactory	Should be improved	unsatisfactory
<b>Standard 1 «MISSION AND LEARNING OUTCOMES»</b>						
<b>Defining the mission of educational programme</b>						
1.	1	The medical education organization should define its mission of the educational programme and bring it to the attention of stakeholders and the healthcare sector.		+		
2.	2	The medical education organization must ensure that the main stakeholders are involved in the development (formulation) of the mission of the educational programme..		+		
3.	3	The medical education organization must ensure that the stated mission includes the problems of public health, the needs of the medical care system and other aspects of social responsibility.		+		
4.	4	The medical education organization must ensure that the mission of the educational programme is consistent with the mission of the organization and allows the preparation of a competent researcher at the level of postgraduate medical education.		+		
5.	5	Mission and goals of the medical education organization and mission / educational programme: - should correspond to available resources, opportunities and requirements of the market; ways to support it should be determined; should be provided (availability of information on the website of the university).		+		
6.	6	The mission of the educational programme, similar to the mission of a medical educational organization, must be approved by the advisory board		+		
7.	7	A medical education organization <b>must</b> have a strategic plan for the development of an educational programme that corresponds to the stated mission of a medical education organization, including issues of improving the quality of master's programmes and approved by the advisory board of a medical education organization.			+	
<b>Institutional autonomy and academic freedom</b>						
8.	8	An organization that implements master's educational programmes must have an institutional autonomy to develop and implement policies for which faculty and administration are responsible, especially with regard to: development of an educational programme; - use of allocated resources necessary for the implementation of the educational programme.		+		

<i>Medical education organization should guarantee academic freedom to its employees and undergraduates:</i>						
9.	9	- in relation to the current educational programme, in which it will be allowed to rely on different points of view in the description and analysis of issues in medicine and pharmacy;		+		
10.	10	- in the possibility of using the results of new research to improve the study of specific disciplines/issues without expanding the educational programme		+		
<b>Learning Outcomes</b>						
11.	11	The medical education organization must determine the expected learning outcomes that undergraduates must display after completing the master's programme		+		
12.	12	The medical education institution must ensure that master's studies with the award of an academic master's degree will provide undergraduates with competencies that will allow them to become a qualified teacher and/or researcher in accordance with the principles of best pedagogical/research practice.		+		
13.	13	Completion of a master's programme should be of potential benefit to those pursuing a career outside of the medical organization and applying their competencies developed during the master's programme, including - critical analysis, evaluation and solution of complex problems, the ability to transfer new technologies and synthesis of new ideas.		+		
14.	14	The medical education organization should ensure that a regular (at least once a year) process of updating and restructuring leads to the modification of the final learning outcomes of graduates in accordance with the responsibilities that are assigned to graduates after graduation from the master's programme		+		
		<b>Total:</b>		<b>13</b>	<b>1</b>	
<b>Standard 2 RESEARCH ENVIRONMENT AND EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES</b>						
<b>Research environment</b>						
15.	1	The success of individual master's programmes must be ensured by the organization of a strong and effective research environment.		+		
<i>The quality of the research environment should be assessed by analyzing:</i>						
16.	2	publications of research results (number of publications, impact factor, etc.) on the profile of a master's programme in a medical education institution		+		
17.	3	the level of attracting external funding for scientific research in a medical educational organization		+		
18.	4	The number of qualified and competent teachers, researchers in the group, at the faculty, educational institution		+		
19.	5	national and international cooperation with research groups of medical organizations, universities, research centers		+		
20.	6	of a procedure/system of compliance with the ethics of scientific research in a medical education organization research ;		+		
21.	7	the possibility of providing access to the means necessary to write a dissertation		+		
22.	8	Master's programmes implemented in this medical institution of higher and postgraduate education may include training in other laboratories, preferably in another country, thereby ensuring internationalization		+		
23.	9	The medical education institution should explore the possibility of providing joint master's degree programmes from both universities and joint leadership to support cooperation between higher education institutions..			+	
24.	10	The medical education organization should ensure that the process of updating educational resources is carried out in accordance with changing needs, such as the recruitment of undergraduates, the number and profile of academic staff, the programme magistracy.		+		
25.	11	The medical education organization should be given sufficient autonomy in the distribution of resources, including procedures		+		

		aimed at adequate remuneration of teachers in achieving the final learning outcomes.				
<b>Material and technical base</b>						
<i>A medical education organization must have material and technical support that meets the licensed indicators, which include the following criteria:</i>						
26.	12	classrooms, laboratories and their equipment must be modern and adequate to the goals and objectives of the master's programme		+		
27.	13	undergraduates should be provided with conditions for the implementation of independent educational research work;		+		
28.	14	renewal and improvement of the material and technical base should be carried out regularly.		+		
29.	15	The medical education organization must have sufficient resources for the proper implementation of the master's programme in order to ensure: admission of undergraduates, organization of training in the master's programme, implementation of dissertations, scientific supervision, advising undergraduates, review and evaluation of dissertations, awarding an academic master's degree, operating costs, costs of participation in training courses, in international scientific conferences, payment for Master's degree studies in institutions where it is practiced; - undergraduate scholarship in terms of variation of its size.			+	
30.	16	The resource policy should be aimed at maintaining and ensuring the constant professional growth of teachers of the master's programme.		+		
31.	17	A medical education organization should have a service and support service for future undergraduates, including a registrar office, research centers and laboratories, a canteen, a medical center, sports grounds and halls.		+		
32.	18	The medical education organization must provide a safe environment for employees, undergraduates and those who ensure the implementation of the programme, including providing the necessary information and protection against harmful substances, microorganisms, compliance with safety regulations in the laboratory and when using equipment.		+		
33.	19	The medical education organization has approved procedures for improving the learning environment of undergraduates through regular renewal, expansion and strengthening of the material and technical base, which should correspond to the development in teaching practice.		+		
<b>Information Technology</b>						
34.	20	A medical education organization must have information support corresponding to the goals and objectives of the master's programme		+		
35.	21	The library should contain materials necessary for training - educational, technical, scientific and reference literature, various medical periodicals, etc		+		
36.	22	The medical education organization must ensure that undergraduates will have timely and free access to library resources		+		
37.	23	The library should have basic technical equipment to support daily activities: fax machines, copiers, computers, printers available for public use, and a telephone with voice mail or answering machine.		+		
38.	24	The library must have an information website. The website may contain the following elements: links, interlibrary loan forms, full-text electronic journal articles, and a feedback form.		+		
39.	25	The medical education organization should regularly monitor library resources, study and implement strategies to meet the existing and future needs of undergraduates		+		
40.	26	Undergraduates should use computer classes and terminals with access to information resources (local network, Internet).		+		



41.	27	In a medical educational institution, accessibility and adequate use of information resources by undergraduates should be monitored.			+	
42.	28	In a medical educational institution, constant updating, improvement and expansion of the information resource base should be carried out with the provision of access for undergraduates to modern electronic databases, including foreign databases (Thomson Reuters (Web of Science, Thomson Reuters), Scopus, Pubmed, Elsevier and etc.).		+		
43.	29	A medical education organization must open and constantly update a section on its website dedicated to master's programmes containing the following information: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- structure and staff of the department of magistracy, duties of the head and employees of the department;</li> <li>- admission policy, including clear rules about the selection process for undergraduates;</li> <li>- list of master's programmes;</li> <li>- structure, duration and content of master's programmes;</li> <li>- criteria for the appointment of a supervisor, outlining the characteristics, duties and qualifications of the supervisor;</li> <li>- methods used to evaluate undergraduates; criteria for designing and writing a dissertation; description of the dissertation defense procedure; description of the work of the State Attestation Commission for the defense of master's theses;</li> <li>- programme of quality assurance and regular evaluation of the master's programme;</li> <li>- information about undergraduates, taking into account the year of study;</li> <li>- information about the employment of master's graduates over the past 3 years, taking into account the direction of study (scientific-pedagogical, specialized).</li> </ul>			+	
		<b>Total :</b>		<b>25</b>	<b>4</b>	
<b>Стандарт 3 «ADMISSION POLICY AND CRITERIA»</b>						
44.	1	The medical education organization must establish a relationship between the selection of undergraduates and the mission of the medical education organization, the educational programme and the requirements of the labor market		+		
45.	2	The medical education institution must define and implement an admissions policy, including a clearly defined regulation on the selection process for undergraduates.		+		
46.	3	Candidates for the master's programme must master the professional training programmes of the higher education (basic medical/pharmaceutical/chemical, higher professional (basic medical + internship) or postgraduate education (residency)).		+		
47.	4	A medical education organization should have a system/mechanisms for career guidance aimed at selecting applicants for the chosen specialty of the magistracy			+	
48.	5	The medical education organization should determine the structure responsible for organizing the admission and selection of undergraduates, developed and approved rules/admission criteria based on the established standard rules for admission to the magistracy for higher educational institutions, dissemination of information to the general public		+		
49.	6	When selecting future undergraduates, one should evaluate the research potential of the applicant, and not just take into account his academic performance.			+	
50.	7	In a medical education organization, there should be a system for studying employment, demand, career support and continuous professional development of graduates.		+		

51.	8	The data obtained through this system should be used to further improve educational programmes.	<b>Non applied</b>		
52	9	The medical education organization should ensure that the process of updating and restructuring the educational programme of the master's programme leads to the adaptation of the admission policy for undergraduates, taking into account changing expectations and circumstances, needs for human resources, changes in the postgraduate education system and the needs of the programme.	<b>Non applied</b>		
		Total:		<b>5</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>Standard 4 «MASTER'S DEGREE PROGRAMME»</b>					
<b>Educational programme model, teaching methods and structure</b>					
53	1	The medical education organization must ensure that the educational programme is developed on the basis of an integrated, comprehensive, competence -based approach, using modular learning technologies		+	
54	2	The medical education organization must determine the purpose and objectives of the master's programme, which are aimed at achieving the mission of the educational organization, the mission of the educational programme and the final learning outcomes.		+	
55	3	The medical education organization should ensure that the content of the educational programme complies with the requirements of the State Educational Standards and the model curriculum of the relevant specialty and is developed taking into account the needs of the labor market		+	
56	4	The medical education organization must ensure the implementation of the educational programme with the relevant working curricula, academic calendar, curriculum for disciplines, forms of an individual curriculum for future undergraduates and an individual work plan for a undergraduate		+	
57	5	The master's programme must be based on the performance of original research, which requires analytical and critical thinking and must be carried out under scientific supervision.		+	
58	6	The medical education organization must ensure that the educational programme is implemented in accordance with the principles of equality.		+	
59	7	medical education organization should provide mechanisms that guarantee the fulfillment of obligations by future undergraduates in relation to doctors, teachers, patients and their relatives in accordance with the Code of Conduct/Code of Honor approved in this medical organization of higher and postgraduate education.		+	
60	8	The master's programme must ensure that undergraduates are taught the rules of ethics and the responsible conduct of scientific research.		+	
61	9	The medical education organization should determine the methods of teaching and learning that are appropriate for the educational programme and the achievement of students' competencies.			+
62	10	The master's programme should be structured with a clear time limit equivalent to 1-2 full-time years and include: - theoretical training, including the study of cycles of basic and major disciplines; - practical training of undergraduates - various types of practices, professional internships; - research work, including the implementation of a master's thesis for scientific and pedagogical magistracy; - experimental research work, - including the implementation of a master's thesis for a specialized master's programme; - intermediate and final certification.- промежуточную и итоговую аттестации.		+	
63	11	The medical education organization should provide mechanisms		+	

		for the implementation of pedagogical practice (in accordance with the type of master's degree) for the formation of practical skills and teaching methods in undergraduates.				
64	12	The medical education organization should provide mechanisms for the implementation of research practice to form undergraduates' knowledge, skills, competencies in the field of the latest theoretical, methodological and technological achievements of domestic and foreign science, modern methods of scientific research, processing and interpretation of experimental data.		+		
65	13	The medical education organization should provide mechanisms for the implementation of work practice for the formation of practical skills, competencies and experience of professional activity in the specialty being taught, as well as the development of best practices among undergraduates on the basis of theoretical knowledge		+		
66	14	The medical education organization must ensure that future undergraduates will have the opportunity to study under the academic mobility programme, have mechanisms/procedures for accepting students from other universities, recognizing loans mastered under the academic mobility programme		+		
67	15	The medical education organization must ensure that undergraduates will be provided with the opportunity for additional training during the vacation period in the presence of academic debt, the desire to develop additional loans.			+	
68	16	In a medical education institution, an appeal mechanism should be developed to allow undergraduates to review the decision regarding their programmes and the evaluation of their dissertations.		+		
<b>Graduate Programme Evaluation</b>						
69	17	A medical education organization should have a programme for monitoring processes and results, including the routine collection of data on key aspects of the educational programme. The purpose of monitoring is to ensure the quality of the educational process, identifying areas that require intervention..		+		
70	18	A medical education organization should have approved mechanisms for regular programme quality evaluation, including feedback from academic supervisors, employers and undergraduates..		+		
71	19	The medical education organization should have mechanisms aimed at the systematic collection, analysis of feedback and its provision to teachers and undergraduates, which will include information about the process and products of the educational programme, including information about unfair practices or inappropriate behavior of teachers or undergraduates.		+		
<i>The medical education organization should ensure that the process of updating and restructuring is carried out regularly and is aimed at::</i>						
72	20	- adapting the model of the educational programme and methodological approaches in teaching to ensure that they are appropriate;	<b>Non applied</b>			
73	21	- adjustment of the elements of the programme and their relationship in accordance with advances in the medical sciences, with changes in the demographic situation and the state of health / structure of the incidence of the population and socio-economic, cultural conditions	<b>Non applied</b>			
<b>Stakeholder Engagement</b>						
74	22	The medical education organization must ensure that the teaching staff, undergraduates, administrative and managerial personnel, and employers will be involved in the monitoring programme and activities for evaluating the educational programme.		+		
75	23	The medical education organization should involve other stakeholders in the evaluation process, including representatives		+		

		of academic and administrative staff, members of the public, authorized bodies for education and health care, professional organizations, and employers.				
76	24	The medical education organization should have mechanisms for providing access to the results of the evaluation of the educational programme of all interested parties.		+		
77	25	The medical education organization should ensure that the process of updating and restructuring leads to an improvement in the process of monitoring and evaluation of the programme in accordance with changes in the learning outcomes and teaching and learning methods.	<b>Non applied</b>			
<b>Total :</b>				<b>19</b>	<b>3</b>	
<b>Standard 5 SCIENTIFIC SUPERVISION</b>						
78	1	The medical education organization must ensure that it assigns to each undergraduate a supervisor, and, in appropriate cases, a co-supervisor in order to cover all aspects of the programme..		+		
79	2	Medical education organization must have mechanisms/procedures regulating the process of discussion and approval of the candidature of the supervisor and the research topic of the undergraduate in accordance with the standard requirements and SCES.		+		
80	3	The medical education organization must ensure that the candidates for supervisors will be selected from specialists who have a scientific degree and are actively engaged in scientific research in the field of science in the specialty of undergraduate education.		+		
81	4	The medical education organization should have clearly defined duties and responsibilities of the supervisor.		+		
82	5	Medical education organization should plan and organize training courses for supervisors on the policy of implementing master's programmes, the main responsibilities of scientific supervisors.			+	
83	6	A medical education organization should have procedures/mechanisms/structures that organize and control the scientific activities of future undergraduates to complete a dissertation research.		+		
84	7	The medical education organization must determine, approve and publish the principles, methods and practices that will be used to evaluate undergraduates, including the criteria for evaluating scientific work.		+		
<b>Total:</b>				<b>6</b>	<b>1</b>	
<b>Standard 6 GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION</b>						
<b>Programme Management</b>						
85	1	The management of the medical education organization must be effective to ensure the improvement of the educational programme.		+		
86	2	The medical education organization must ensure that training in the magistracy is carried out only on a full-time basis.		+		
87	3	The medical education organization must determine the structural unit responsible for the implementation of educational programmes of postgraduate education and the achievement of the final learning outcomes.		+		
88	4	The structural unit responsible for the implementation of educational programmes of postgraduate education should have the authority to plan and implement the educational programme, including the allocation of allocated resources for the planning and implementation of teaching and learning methods, evaluation of undergraduates, evaluation of the educational programme and courses of study.		+		
89	5	The medical education organization must guarantee the interaction of undergraduates with management on the design, management and evaluation of master's programmes.		+		

90	6	The medical education organization should encourage and facilitate the involvement of undergraduates in the process of developing educational programmes for the preparation of undergraduates.		+		
91	7	The structural unit responsible for the implementation of educational programmes of postgraduate education must ensure the transparency of the management system and decisions that are published in bulletins, posted on the website of the university, included in the protocols for review and execution.		+		
92	8	The medical education organization should, through the structural unit responsible for the implementation of educational programmes of postgraduate education, plan and implement innovations in the educational programme.		+		
93	9	The medical education organization should include representatives from other relevant stakeholders in the advisory body responsible for the implementation of educational programmes of postgraduate education, including other participants in the educational process, representatives from clinical and industrial bases, graduates of medical education organizations, healthcare / pharmacy specialists involved in the process teaching or other teachers of the faculties of the university.		+		
94	10	The medical education organization should ensure that the structural unit, responsible for the implementation of educational programmes of postgraduate education: - takes into account the peculiarities of the conditions in which graduates will have to work and, accordingly, modify the educational programme; - considers the modification of the educational programme based on feedback from the public and society as a whole.		+		
95	11	The medical education organization should periodically evaluate the academic leadership regarding the achievement of its mission and the final learning outcomes.		+		
96	12	The medical education organization should ensure that the process of renewal and restructuring leads to the improvement of the organizational structure and principles of management of the master's programme to ensure effective operation and (in the long term) to meet the interests of various stakeholder groups in the face of changing circumstances and needs	<b>Non applied</b>			
<b>Academic Leadership</b>						
97	13	The medical education organization must clearly define the responsibility of the academic leadership in relation to the development and management of the educational programme.		+		
98	14	The medical education organization should periodically evaluate the academic leadership regarding the achievement of its mission and the final learning outcomes.		+		
<b>Allocation of budget and resource to training</b>						
	15	The medical education organization must: - have a clear terms of reference and authority to provide the educational programme with resources, including the target budget for education; - allocate the resources necessary for the implementation of the educational programme, and distribute educational resources in accordance with their needs..		+		
100	16	The system of financing a medical educational organization should be based on the principles of efficiency, effectiveness, priority, transparency, responsibility, differentiation and independence of all levels of budgets.		+		
101	17	Financial and administrative policies should be aimed at improving the quality of the educational programme.		+		
<b>Administrative staff and management</b>						

102	18	A medical education organization must have an appropriate administrative and academic staff, including their number and composition in accordance with qualifications, in order to: - ensure the implementation of the educational programme and related activities; - ensure proper management and allocation of resources.		+		
103	19	The medical education organization should develop and implement an internal management quality assurance programme, including consideration of needs for improvement, and conduct regular management review and analysis.	<b>104.</b>	+		
105	20	The medical education organization must ensure the implementation of the master's programme in accordance with the quality management system certified by independent organizations.		+		
<b>Interaction with health sector</b>						
106.	21	The medical education organization should have a constructive interaction with the health sector, with related sectors of health, society and government, including the exchange of information, cooperation and initiatives of the organization, which contributes to the provision of qualified specialists in accordance with the needs of society.		+		
107.	22	The medical education organization must provide an operational link between the educational programme and the subsequent stages of professional training.		+		
108.	23	A medical education organization should be given official status of cooperation with partners in the health sector, which includes the conclusion of official agreements defining the content and forms of cooperation and/or the conclusion of a joint contract and the creation of a coordinating committee, and holding joint events.		+		
		Total :		<b>22</b>		
<b>Standard 7 On-going improvement</b>						
<i>The medical education organization <b>must ensure that</b>, as a dynamic and socially –responsible institution, it will:</i>						
109.	1	initiate procedures for regular review and revision of content, result in/competencies, evaluation and learning environment, structure and function, document and eliminate deficiencies;		+		
110.	2	allocate resources for continuous improvement.		+		
<i>The medical education organization <b>should</b>:</i>						
111.	3	Base the update process on forward-looking research and analysis and on the results of our own research, evaluation and literature on postgraduate medical education;		+		
112.	4	ensure that the process of renewal and restructuring leads to a revision of its policies and practices in line with previous experience, current activities and prospects.		+		
<i>Medical education organization in the process of updating/ continuous improvement must pay attention to:</i>						
113.	5	adaptation of the mission and end results of postgraduate medical education to the scientific, socio-economic and cultural development of society for the future;		+		
114.	6	Modification of the intended outcomes of postgraduate education in the chosen field of health in accordance with the documented needs of the environment. Changes may include adjusting the structure and content of the educational programme, the principles of active learning. The adjustment will ensure, along with the exclusion of obsolete ones, the assimilation of new relevant knowledge, concepts, methods and concepts based on new achievements in the basic biomedical, clinical, behavioral and social sciences, taking into account changes in the demographic situation and the structure of the population on public health issues, as well as changes in socio-economic and cultural conditions;	<b>Non applied</b>			

115.	7	development of evaluation principles, methods of conducting and the number of examinations in accordance with changes in learning outcomes and teaching and learning methods;	<b>Non applied</b>			
116.	8	adapting the policy of recruitment and selection of students to the master's programme, taking into account changing expectations and circumstances, the needs for human resources,	<b>Non applied</b>			
117.	9	Adapting the recruitment policy and the formation of the academic staff in accordance with changing needs;	<b>Non applied</b>			
118.	10	improvement of the process of monitoring and evaluation of the educational programme				
11.	11	. Медицинская организация образования должна гарантировать, что совершенствование организационной структуры и принципов управления будет направлено на обеспечение эффективной деятельности в условиях изменяющихся обстоятельств и потребностей, и, в перспективе, на удовлетворение интересов различных групп заинтересованных сторон. changes in the system of postgraduate education and the needs of the educational programme; адаптацию политики набора и формирования академического штата сотрудников в соответствии с изменяющимися потребностями		+		
		Total :		<b>6</b>		
		Total :		<b>96</b>	<b>11</b>	

