



«АККРЕДИТТЕУ ЖӘНЕ РЕЙТИНГТІҢ  
ТӘУЕЛСІЗ АГЕНТТІГІ» КЕМ

НУ «НЕЗАВИСИМОЕ АГЕНТСТВО  
АККРЕДИТАЦИИ И РЕЙТИНГА»

INDEPENDENT AGENCY FOR  
ACCREDITATION AND RATING

# REPORT

on the results of the work of the external expert commission for the evaluation of educational programs of residency 7R01102 "Medical Genetics" and 7R01105 "Adult oncology" for compliance with the requirements of the standards of international primary specialized accreditation of postgraduate medical education (residency) based on WFME / AMSE / ESG standards, implemented in the RSE «Medical center hospital of the President's Affairs Administration of the Republic of Kazakhstan» on REU

Date of the visit: 06 June 2023–08 June 2023

*Addressed to the  
Accreditation  
Council of the IAAR*



АККРЕДИТТЕУ ЖӘНЕ РЕЙТИНГТІҢ  
ТӘУЕЛСІЗ АГЕНТТІГІ

НЕЗАВИСИМОЕ АГЕНТСТВО  
АККРЕДИТАЦИИ И РЕЙТИНГА

INDEPENDENT AGENCY FOR  
ACCREDITATION AND RATING

## **REPORT**

**on the results of the work of the external expert commission for the evaluation of educational programs of residency 7R01102 "Medical Genetics" and 7R01105 "Adult oncology" for compliance with the requirements of the standards of international primary specialized accreditation of postgraduate medical education (residency) based on WFME / AMSE / ESG standards, implemented in the RSE «Medical center hospital of the President's Affairs Administration of the Republic of Kazakhstan» on REU**

**Date of the visit: 06 June 2023–08 June 2023**

## CONTENT

(I) LIST OF DESIGNATIONS AND ABBREVIATIONS .....	3
(II) INTRODUCTION .....	4
(III) REPRESENTATION OF EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION .....	5
(IV) DESCRIPTION OF THE PREVIOUS ACCREDITATION PROCEDURE .....	6
(V) DESCRIPTION OF THE EEC VISIT.....	6
(VI) COMPLIANCE WITH SPECIALIZED ACCREDITATION STANDARDS.....	8
6.1. Standard "Mission and learning outcomes" .....	8
6.2. Standard "Educational program" .....	10
6.3. Standard "Student Assessment Policy" .....	14
6.4. Standard "Students" .....	17
6.5. Standard "Academic Staff / Teachers" .....	21
6.6. Standard "Educational Resources" .....	23
6.7. Standard "Evaluation of the educational program" .....	26
6.8. Standard "Management and Administration" .....	28
(VII) OVERVIEW OF STRENGTHS/BEST PRACTICE FOR EACH STANDARD .....	30
(VIII) OVERVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS FOR IMPROVING QUALITY FOR EACH STANDARD .....	31
(IX) RECOMMENDATION TO THE ACCREDITATION BOARD .....	33
Annex 1. Evaluation table "PARAMETERS OF SPECIALIZED PROFILE" .....	34
Annex 1.1. 7R01102 "Medical Genetics" .....	34
Annex 1.2. 7R01105 Adult Oncology.....	43
Annex 2. PROGRAM OF THE VISIT TO THE EDUCATIONAL INSTITUTION.....	52
Annex 3. RESULTS OF THE PPP QUESTIONNAIRE .....	57
Annex 4. RESULTS OF STUDENT QUESTIONNAIRE .....	61

**(I) LIST OF DESIGNATIONS AND ABBREVIATIONS**

RK - Republic of Kazakhstan  
 MH RK - Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan  
 MES RK - Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan  
 UDP RK - Administration of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan  
 MC UDP RK - Medical Center of the Administration of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan  
 Hospital - RSE "Hospital of the Medical Center of the Administration of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan" on REM  
 IAAR - Independent agency of accreditation and rating  
 OS - self-assessment report  
 LEB - local executive body  
 OO - educational organization  
 Department - department of vocational education  
 LPHD - laboratory of personalized genomic diagnostics  
 GOSO - the state obligatory standard of education in the field of health  
 TUP - standard curriculum  
 RUP - working curriculum  
 IEP - individual curriculum  
 IKTP - individual calendar-thematic plan  
 OP - educational program  
 PD - major disciplines  
 OK is a required component  
 HF - component of choice  
 QED - catalog of elective disciplines  
 Research work - research work  
 EMCD - educational and methodological complex of the discipline  
 CRR - independent work of a resident  
 SKRRN - independent clinical work under the guidance of a mentor  
 RO - learning outcomes  
 GPA - grade point average  
 RK - frontier control  
 KIS - control and measuring tools  
 PA - intermediate certification of students  
 IA - final certification  
 RAC - Republican Appeal Commission  
 NCNE - National Center for Independent Examinations  
 NCC - scientific and clinical council  
 IAK - final attestation commission  
 SOP - standard operating procedure  
 DI - job description  
 PPP - faculty  
 PC - advanced training  
 GOBMP - guaranteed volume of free medical care  
 OSMS - compulsory social health insurance  
 Mass media - mass media

## **(II) INTRODUCTION**

In accordance with the order No. 95-23-OD dated March 27, 2023. Independent Accreditation and Rating Agency (hereinafter - IAAR) from June 6 to 8, 2023. an external expert commission (EEC) assessed the educational programs of residency 7R01102 Medical Genetics and 7R01105 Adult Oncology for compliance with the standards of international primary specialized accreditation IAAR based on WFME / AMSE / ESG standards, implemented by the Republican State Enterprise "Hospital of the Medical Center of the Administration of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan" on REM.

The report of the external expert commission contains an assessment of compliance with the standards in the framework of the primary specialized accreditation with the IAAR criteria, recommendations of the EEC for further improving the parameters of the specialized profile of the residency educational programs 7R01102 Medical Genetics and 7R01105 Adult Oncology.

### **Composition EEC:**

**Chairman of the EEC, IAAR expert** - Isaeva Raushan Binomovna, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Al-Farabi Kazakh National University al-Farabi (Republic of Kazakhstan, Almaty);

**IAAR expert** – Redko Dmitry Dmitrievich, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, Gomel State Medical University (Republic of Belarus, Gomel);

**IAAR expert** - Kurmanalina Gulnar Lukpanovna, candidate of medical sciences, associate professor of NAO "West Kazakhstan Medical University named after A.I. Marat Ospanov" (Republic of Kazakhstan, Aktobe);

**IAAR expert** – Murtazalieva Alexandra Vladimirovna, Scientific Center for Obstetrics and Gynecology and Perinatology JSC (Republic of Kazakhstan, Almaty);

**IAAR expert** - Kabildina Nailya Amirbekovna, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, NJSC "Medical University Karaganda" (Republic of Kazakhstan, Karaganda);

**Expert IAAR** - Zhanbyrbaev Sultan Zhanbyrbaevich, Master, Kazakhstan Medical University VSHOZ, (Republic of Kazakhstan, Almaty);

**IAAR expert** - Zholdybai Zhamilya Zholdybaevna, MD, Professor Kazakh National Medical University named after A.I. S.D. Asfendiyarova, (Republic of Kazakhstan, Almaty);

**IAAR expert, EEC employer** – Nurlybay Abilkas Kusayynuly, NGO "Industrial Trade Union of Medical Workers and Related Industries "QazMed";

**IAAR expert, student of the EEC** - Ibraev Batyrzhan Sabyrkhanuly, resident doctor, NJSC "Astana Medical University" (Republic of Kazakhstan, Astana);

**IAAR expert, EEC student** - Aksultanov Nurasyil Almasuly, resident doctor, KF University Medical Center, (Republic of Kazakhstan, Astana);

**IAAR coordinator** – Dzhakenova Alisa Satbekovna, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Head of Medical Projects of the Agency (Republic of Kazakhstan, Astana).

### **(III) REPRESENTATION OF EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION**

RSE "Hospital of the Medical Center of the Administration of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan" on the REM (Hospital) was opened in the city of Astana in 1997 in connection with the transfer of the capital of the Republic of Kazakhstan (RK) from the city of Almaty.

Over the years of its existence, the institution has been renamed several times, and currently, in accordance with the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated August 4, 2011 No. 906 "Some Issues of the Administration of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan", it has been renamed into the Republican State Enterprise "Hospital of the Medical Center of the Administration of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan" on the right of economic management.

The hospital provides all types of medical care: emergency medical care, pre-medical care, primary health care, specialized, including high-tech medical care, medical rehabilitation, palliative care within the guaranteed volume of free medical care (GOBMP), in the system of compulsory social health insurance (OSMS); as well as on a paid and contractual basis for both citizens of the Republic of Kazakhstan and foreign citizens.

The treatment and diagnostic departments of the Hospital are equipped with modern medical equipment, all doctors and paramedical workers undergo a rigorous selection according to qualification requirements when they enter a job. Doctors and candidates of medical sciences, PhD doctors, doctors with the highest and first qualification category work in the staff of the Hospital. All specialists are trained and improve their skills in leading clinics of near and far abroad.

The main activity of the Hospital is aimed at the introduction and successful implementation of innovative projects and technologies to ensure a high level of quality and safety of medical care, optimize operating procedures and modernize the treatment process.

Currently, more than 90% of all operations in the Hospital are performed using endoscopic technologies. Diagnostic algorithms and treatment regimens are based on the principles of evidence-based medicine. The polyclinic is working on early detection and timely treatment of patients with oncological pathology.

In October 2018, a training center for robotic surgery was opened at the Hospital. The robotic system allows for laparoscopic robot-assisted operations in urology, gynecology and general surgery. For the first time in the country, a laboratory has been opened to practice the skills of performing in vivo surgical procedures on operating tables equipped with endoscopic racks and a training robotic system, the necessary sets of modern instruments and suture materials.

Such areas as neurosurgery and epilepsy treatment, hybrid cardiovascular surgery, medical rehabilitation (cardiorehabilitation, neurorehabilitation, rehabilitation after injuries), endoscopy, MRI and CT diagnostics, and minimally invasive surgery are actively developing.

The Nuclear Medicine Center has been opened in the Hospital, where professionally trained personnel for the synthesis of cyclotron radioactive isotopes, the synthesis of radiopharmaceuticals, positron emission tomography combined with computed tomography (PET / CT) and single photon emission computed tomography combined with computed tomography (SPECT) operate. /CT).

The hospital is a user of social networks to provide an information field and a platform for communication with stakeholders.

As part of the implementation of the Development Strategy of the RSE "Hospital of the Medical Center of the Office of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan" for 2022–2026, the main activities of the Hospital are aimed at providing high-quality and safe medical care to the population of the Republic of Kazakhstan, at the introduction and successful implementation of innovative projects and technologies to ensure a high level quality.

The hospital occupies a leading place in the list of rating assessment of the activities of hospitals in the Republic of Kazakhstan, both in terms of clinical indicators and management indicators.

At the same time, the Hospital provides high-quality educational services for residency and professional development programs.

In 2018, the Hospital received a License to engage in educational activities from the State Institution "Committee for Control in the Sphere of Education and Science of the Ministry of Education

and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan" with an attachment to the license for Postgraduate Education / 6R111900 Radiation Diagnostics. In 2019, the subtype of the licensed type of activity was changed to Postgraduate education / 7R091 Healthcare (medicine).

In 2019, the Hospital passed institutional accreditation for compliance with the accreditation standards of the Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Education and Healthcare.

In 2019, the Hospital was accredited for compliance with international quality and safety standards for medical activities JCI (2022 re-accreditation).

In 2021, the Hospital passed National accreditation from the NGO "Experts and Consultants for External Comprehensive Assessment in the Healthcare Sector".

In 2022, the Hospital received an expert opinion on compliance with the status of a scientific organization from the Republican State Enterprise on the REM "NRCRC named after Salidat Kairbekova".

The hospital cooperates with foreign and national clinics, healthcare organizations, professional associations, manufacturing companies and distributors in the following areas: organizing and conducting joint educational master classes, internships, academic exchange with medical universities, centers, clusters and research institutes at the Republican and international levels (India, Uzbekistan, Tajikistan, Turkey, Russia, Korea, Germany and Ukraine)

The Hospital employs highly qualified teaching staff (39 people), 41% (16 people) have an academic degree, of which: doctors of science - 23% (9 people), PhD doctors - 8% (3 people), candidates of science - 10% (4 people)

#### **(IV) DESCRIPTION OF THE PREVIOUS ACCREDITATION PROCEDURE**

The early IAAR accreditation procedure for the submitted EP: 7R01102 "Medical Genetics" and 7R01105 "Adult Oncology" was not carried out.

#### **(V) DESCRIPTION OF THE EEC VISIT**

The visit of the external expert commission to the RSE "Hospital of the Medical Center of the Office of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan" at the REM was organized in accordance with the program agreed with the chairman of the EEC and approved by the director of the BMC UDP, which took place on June 06-08, 2023 in offline mode. To get acquainted with the hospital, information was provided on the main activities by the deputy directors of the clinic.

The offline expert meeting room was fully prepared for comfortable work. The program of the visit was strictly observed in accordance with the established time.

On June 05, 2023, a preliminary meeting of the EEC IAAR was held, during which the program of the visit was clarified, the responsibility of the members of the EEC was distributed. A brief review of the residency EP self-assessment reports submitted by RSE BMC UDP RK for accreditation for accreditation was carried out, additional information was identified that must be requested from the hospital for full awareness of EEC members during specialized accreditation.

In order to obtain objective information to assess the quality of the residency EPs being implemented, the following methods were used: visual inspection, work with documents, meetings and interviews with employees of various structural units, teachers, students, graduates and employers, questioning of faculty and residents.

In accordance with the program of the visit of the EEC, a meeting was held with the leadership of the BMC UDP RK - deputy directors for strategic development, science and education, medical work, outpatient care, in surgery, acting financial and economic activities, who presented the main characteristics of the clinic, spoke about the priorities for the development of the hospital, about the features of interaction with the scientific and educational community of near and far abroad, and the features of the development of postgraduate education on the basis of the hospital. Each deputy director was asked questions within the framework of the executive function.

At the same time, it should be noted that within the framework of the planned visit with Director Albaev R.K. meetings did not take place twice.

23 employees took part in the meeting with the heads of structural divisions of the hospital, in the following areas: scientific and educational block, financial and economic, legal, human resource management department, heads of departments, etc. During the meeting, experts asked questions, the purpose of which was verification of report data. Answers have been received.

We note the high activity and sociability of the majority of the employees of the BMC UDP RK during the planned visit, however, the meetings were repeatedly replaced or employees of the Hospital who were not included in the program took part.

So, from the above, a meeting was held with the head of the department of healthcare technologies and strategic development, the head of the quality management and patient safety service, the head of the department for interaction with partner clinics and the development of medical tourism, the head of the legal department, the head of the public procurement department, **acting** . chief economist , head of the rationing, pricing and analytics department, head of the human resources management department , during which the members of the EEC received answers to questions about the organization and implementation of residency programs, theoretical and practical training of residents, conditions for the implementation of programs.

Separately, a meeting was held with the head of the vocational education department of the Hospital .

In accordance with the approved program, meetings were held with heads of departments, heads of the center and laboratories, during which representatives of the above departments answered numerous questions from experts.

The Commission in full force visited the territory and structural divisions of the Hospital: the Nuclear Medicine Center, the CT and MRI departments, the X-ray diagnostics department, the ultrasound diagnostics department, the personalized genomic diagnostics laboratory, the surgical department No. 4, the cardiology department, the surgical department No. 1, the department of vocational education, simulation center of practical skills, got acquainted with the work of the electronic library, questions were asked in order to clarify the information of the submitted report.

During the visits to the clinical departments, the Nuclear Medicine Center, the CT and MRI department, the X-ray diagnostics department, the ultrasound diagnostics department, the personalized genomic diagnostics laboratory, EEC experts had the opportunity to meet and discuss various issues on training residents with the heads of departments, medical personnel involved in the educational process, clinical mentors, teachers, residents, etc. Members of the expert commission noted the high level of equipment of the Hospital with modern medical equipment, which allows students to master modern methods of diagnosing and treating diseases.

As part of the work of the external expert commission, meetings were held with teachers, mentors and coordinators of accredited EPs. In parallel, a survey of department heads, teachers, and mentors was conducted.

Interviews with students of different courses and specialties of residency on the next day of the commission's work added to the overall picture of the educational process of accredited programs. In parallel, a survey of students on accredited EPs was conducted.

The members of the commission were provided with documents, both on electronic media and in paper form at the request of experts.

The experts conducted an interview in a hybrid format (online/offline) with graduates of the EP "Radiology" and their employers to clarify a number of issues. All online interview procedures in the technical part were followed by the Hospital.

After summing up and evaluating the parameters, the experts met again with the management of the Hospital, heads of structural divisions, heads of departments and laboratories to announce the results of the work and make recommendations for the further development and corresponding improvement of certain processes of the educational environment in the Hospital in accordance with the criteria of the standards that will be submitted to the meeting of the Accreditation Council.

The work of the external expert commission and representatives of the BMC UDP RK was



properly organized: all the documents requested by the members of the EEC were provided on time and according to the list, the norm was observed - ethical and collegial relations, both on the part of experts and on the part of the Hospital staff. All conditions for effective work were provided by the host country.

Meetings with the staff of the Hospital were held in a constructive and friendly atmosphere.

***Information about categories and number of meeting participants***

<i>Category</i>	<i>Quantity</i>
Vice president	5
Heads of structural divisions	8
Head of departments	1
Faculty and mentors	3
Residents	1
Graduates	0
Employers	2
Total	20

## **(VI) COMPLIANCE WITH SPECIALIZED ACCREDITATION STANDARDS**

### **6.1. Standard "Mission and learning outcomes"**

#### ***Evidence***

The mission of educational residency programs in the specialties "Adult Oncology", "Medical Genetics" is presented.

The definition of the mission of the educational program of residency in the specialty "Medical Genetics", "Adult Oncology" describes aspects of health care to provide specialized care to the population.

The purpose of the EP was brought to the attention of the authorized bodies in the field of medical education and healthcare, the academic community, students and other interested parties by posting it on the information stands of the Department and publishing it on the official website of the Hospital. The purpose of the EP goes through the approval process. The supervising department formulates, discusses the mission and main goals of the strategic plan based on the achievements of modern science and education, the requests of those wishing to study under the program, as well as the expectations of employers. After making the final adjustments, the mission is submitted for approval by the NCC of the Hospital.

The Department has developed a Standard of Operational Procedure (SOP) "Algorithm for organizing postgraduate education in residency based on the BMC UDP RK", KOP / SQE ON and PO-8.1, which reflects all stages and components of the educational process, involved structures and resources .

According to EP 7R01102 "Medical Genetics", a resident doctor masters the following practical competencies (PC) - to apply the basic principles of a quality management system in medical laboratories.

The main aspect of social responsibility, stated in the mission of the residency program, is the creation of an effective system of professional training to provide the industry with qualified personnel that meets the needs of society. Social responsibility is reflected in the improvement of corporate governance as an element of the development of strategic planning of the Hospital's activities. Such an aspect as community involvement is reflected in the development of marketing activities, and in the development of educational activities, as well as in the organization of innovative clinical activities of the Hospital.

Today, 5 scientific and technical programs are being implemented on the basis of the Hospital.

Training in residency is carried out in accordance with the state license for the right to conduct educational activities in residency and register the EP in the Register of the Bologna Process Center of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The EPs are structured in such a way

as to provide a holistic, systematic understanding of the processes of clinical activity and the improvement of practical skills.

### ***Analytical part***

The missions of educational residency programs in the specialties "Adult Oncology", "Medical Genetics" were determined and presented by the EEC. The mission of the educational program "Adult Oncology" is determined on the basis of the needs of society in matters of health, the needs of the medical care system and aspects of social responsibility.

The mission of the educational program "Medical Genetics" does not correspond to the system of medical care in the Republic of Kazakhstan, as it replaces a number of practical skills aimed at providing medical genetic counseling to the population of the country for clinical and laboratory research. According to the order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 21, 2020 No. KR DSM-305/2020 "On approval of the nomenclature of specialties and specializations in the field of healthcare, the nomenclature and qualification characteristics of positions of health workers", the specialties of medical genetics and clinical and laboratory diagnostics are separated and have different qualifications. characteristics.

The missions of the residency education programs are presented on the Hospital website and communicated to stakeholders, as evidenced by the fact that knowledge of the mission of the Hospital and the mission of the residency education programs was demonstrated during interviews with focus groups.

The hospital demonstrates the ability to respond dynamically and in a timely manner to rapid changes in the external environment, which was reflected in the implementation of the principles of the Bologna Process, was presented by the EEC in the form of registration of the OP in the Register of the Bologna Process Center of the Ministry of Health and Social Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The hospital incorporates professionalism into the training of physicians and ensures that training promotes professional autonomy and enables future action in the best interests of the patient and society. A resident doctor, under the guidance of a clinical mentor, tries to master the entire list of practical skills in GOSO in order to obtain the necessary competencies.

The documents of the teaching staff contain the signed "Code of honor of the teaching staff", the portfolio of residents contains the signed "Code of honor of residents", which contribute to business communication between teaching staff and residents, provide a favorable moral and psychological climate, determine the rules of corporate culture, and also determine the attitude of resident doctors and doctors to patients.

To ensure cooperation with the government and other partners, there are no documented cooperation agreements with educational organizations, scientific, research and educational or research and production centers that provide for norms on the status of a partner university in the relevant area of training and the involvement of foreign consultants in accordance with the order Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated June 17, 2015 No. 391 "On approval of qualification requirements for educational activities of organizations providing higher and (or) postgraduate education, and a list of documents confirming compliance with them." <https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/V1500011716> .

In the process of mastering EP 7R01102 "Medical Genetics", a resident doctor masters practical competencies that are not included in the list of practical competencies of a geneticist, are the responsibility of the clinical diagnostic laboratory.

In the process of implementing 5 scientific and technical programs on the basis of the hospital, there are no supporting documents on the participation of a resident doctor in research in the relevant field of healthcare.

In the process of interviewing and questioning the students, it was noted that the management of the Hospital creates the necessary conditions for them. During the visual inspection of the Hospital and visits to specific departments, it was confirmed that resident doctors have been provided with appropriate comfortable conditions that help maintain their health: dressing rooms, rest rooms, a canteen, medical services, workplaces equipped with personal computers, training rooms with multimedia installations.

It is stated that for the purpose of discussion with all interested parties, the draft mission of the EP "Adult Oncology", "Medical Genetics" is being discussed with the teaching staff, researchers, heads of

departments, doctors and representatives of trade union health organizations. However, it is noted that the NCC does not include all the stakeholders necessary for the formulation of the mission and expected learning outcomes (in the submitted order, only the Hospital employees are included in the NCC 2022). The educational program in the specialty "Medical Genetics" states that the program was discussed only at a meeting of the LPGD. Also, no document is provided confirming that the stated mission and expected learning outcomes are based on the opinions and suggestions of other stakeholders.

An analysis of the data from a survey of resident doctors revealed satisfaction with the quality of medical services: excellent - 43.8%; good - 31.3%; satisfactory - 25%, unsatisfactory - 0%.

### ***Strengths / best practice***

There are no strengths in this standard.

### ***WEC recommendations:***

1) The head of OP 7R01102 "Medical Genetics" needs to make changes to the mission of the OP, taking into account the specifics of the residency in accordance with the nomenclature of the EP "Medical Genetics" ( *until 09/01/23* ).

2) The Department of Vocational Education should provide for the conclusion of cooperation agreements with educational organizations, scientific, research and educational or research and production centers in the relevant areas of training, and providing for norms on the status of an OVPO partner in the relevant area of training (until 12/31/2023) .

3) The head of EP 7R01102 "Medical Genetics" needs to make changes to the learning outcomes, general and specific for the EP Medical Genetics in accordance with the State Educational Standard, TUP and the EP nomenclature ( *until 09/01/23* )

4) The Department of Vocational Education should provide for the involvement of resident geneticists in research conducted on the basis of the Hospital in accordance with regulatory legal acts in the field of research activities ( *until 12/31/2023* )

5) The management of the Hospital needs to include all stakeholders in the NCC to formulate the mission and expected learning outcomes ( *by 09/01/23* )

6) Provide documented evidence that the stated mission and expected learning outcomes are based on the opinions and suggestions of other stakeholders ( *by 09/01/23* )

***EEC conclusions according to the criteria of the standard "Mission and End Results" of OP 7R01102 "Medical Genetics": (strong / satisfactory / suggest improvements / unsatisfactory) strong - 0, satisfactory - 7, suggest improvements - 6, unsatisfactory - 0***

***Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria of the standard "Mission and End Results" of OP 7R01105 "Adult Oncology": (strong / satisfactory / suggest improvements / unsatisfactory) strong - 0, satisfactory - 10, suggest improvements - 3, unsatisfactory - 0***

## **6.2. Standard "Educational program"**

### ***Evidence***

The hospital independently developed OP 7R01105 "Adult Oncology", 7R01102 "Medical Genetics" based on the requirements of the order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 4, 2022 No. KP DSM-63 "On approval of state compulsory standards for levels of education in the field of healthcare" (GOSO) . The procedure and organization of the training of resident doctors in the departments of the Hospital is determined by the internal regulatory documents "Academic Policy of the Hospital" and "Regulations on the residency of the Hospital". OP 7R01105 "Adult Oncology", 7R01102 "Medical Genetics" were approved at the meeting of the NCC of the Hospital, Minutes No. 2 dated 02.06.2022.

The final results of the training of resident doctors in EP 7R01105 "Adult Oncology", 7R01102 "Medical Genetics" are aimed at mastering general key competencies and professional competencies and are prescribed in the EP. Learning outcomes are formulated both for the entire EP and for each discipline. To achieve them, resident doctors acquire theoretical knowledge and practical skills in the disciplines of the mandatory component (OC) and the disciplines of the elective component (EC), which are developed taking into account the specifics and focus of teachers / mentors of the Hospital departments.

EP residencies are aimed at integrating practice and theory, include the content, the sequence of training a resident doctor with the definition of goals and learning outcomes based on the performance of tasks and the provision of medical care to the population. Integration of the preparation and delivery of medical services implies the provision of medical care by a resident doctor. The training is based on practice, involving resident physicians in personal involvement in the provision of medical services and responsibility for patient care activities in the hospital and at the PHC level under the guidance of a mentor.

On the basis of TUP and RUP, under the guidance of a mentor, an IEP is developed for the entire period of study, which reflects the entire educational process of a resident doctor using practice-oriented learning. The professional competencies of resident doctors are formed through the implementation of real practical tasks. Practice-oriented education is based on the optimal combination of fundamental basic medical education and professional and practical training of resident doctors, which are necessary for the professional activities of future specialists.

When implementing EP 7R01105 "Adult Oncology", 7R01102 "Medical Genetics", the following teaching methods are used: daily provision of theoretical material by the teacher to the resident doctor in the form of lectures, presentations, daily provision of practical material by the clinical mentor. SKRRN includes a discussion of a teacher/mentor with a resident doctor of specific clinical situations based on self-management of patients with the formation of individual treatment and rehabilitation of patients in accordance with clinical protocols and the principles of evidence-based medicine; clinical reviews, consultations, consultations, general rounds. The task of the teacher/mentor leading the discussion is to make the resident doctor an active participant by asking questions about the etiology, pathogenesis, clinic of a particular disease, forming a clinical diagnosis, choosing and justifying treatment tactics. In the process of debriefing, the teacher/mentor gradually leads the resident doctor to a logically correct decision, which contributes to the formation of clinical thinking. SKRRN, aimed at developing practical skills and consolidating the topic of a practical lesson, and SPP, which involves independent study of certain topics using various sources with the further formation of one's own clinical thinking, provide the integration of practical and theoretical components.

In 2022, the Hospital organized a course in the field of research methodology, at which resident doctors listened to the report of AEO "Nazarbayev University" Professor Gaipov A.E. on the topic "Tips for writing medical clinical cases" Astana, 12/20/2022. CRR also includes work with educational and additional literature, scientific data, writing abstracts and presentations on certain topics. Also, within the framework of the CPP, it is proposed to analyze scientific publications from the perspective of evidence-based medicine.

To achieve the main goal of OP 7R01105 "Adult Oncology", 7R01102 "Medical Genetics", the Hospital effectively uses the capabilities of the healthcare system to provide medical care by a resident doctor by providing assistance to the population in a planned manner.

### ***Analytical part***

In the process of familiarization with the documents and in the course of interviews with focus groups, it was revealed that the procedure and organization of the training of resident doctors in the departments of the Hospital are determined by the internal regulatory documents "Academic Policy" of the Hospital and the "Regulations on Residency" of the Hospital. Educational programs 7R01105 "Adult Oncology", 7R01102 "Medical Genetics", approved at the meeting of the NCC of the Hospital (Minutes No. 2 dated 02.06.2022). It was also presented to the EEC that these EPs are registered in the Register of the Bologna Process Center of the MNVO RK.

When developing EP 7R01102 "Medical Genetics", the developers determined the organization

and methodological support for the provision of qualified, specialized medical care to the population in establishing a genetic diagnosis and making a genetic prognosis when planning a pregnancy in the family of a patient with hereditary, chromosomal and congenital pathology, in compliance with international standards of control quality in laboratory research. According to the order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 21, 2020 No. KR DSM-305/2020 "On approval of the nomenclature of specialties and specializations in the field of healthcare, the nomenclature and qualification characteristics of positions of health workers", the specialties of medical genetics and clinical and laboratory diagnostics are separated and have different qualifications. characteristics.

Educational programs 7R01105 "Adult Oncology", 7R01102 "Medical Genetics" consist of profiling (mandatory component) and elective disciplines (optional component). In accordance with GOSO, residency training includes classroom work, SKRRN and SRR; the volume of theoretical training is no more than 20% of the volume of the curriculum. In the Hospital, when implementing a residency program, the volume of theoretical training is 10% of the volume of the curriculum. According to the order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 4, 2022 No. KR DSM-63 (GOSO), the volume of the teaching load for a 2-year EP residency is 140 credits, CV - 8 credits, IA - 2 credits. The full academic load of one academic year is 70 academic credits (2100 academic hours) for one academic year. The academic year provides for one academic period, ending with an intermediate certification for each year of study. However, it is recommended to make changes to the PMM and the academic calendar and not to allocate an additional 4 credits of intermediate certification, as this lengthens the duration of the academic year and reduces the vacation of residents, which, according to the NLA, must be at least 7 weeks (6 weeks are presented in the academic calendar).

The EMCD is presented for all EPs, including the following documents: Educational program, Standard curriculum, Working curriculum, Individual curriculum, Catalog of elective disciplines, Academic calendar, Class schedule, Syllabuses, Portfolio of a resident doctor.

The EEC presented a portfolio of resident doctors, where there is an IEP for the entire period of study, developed on the basis of the TUP and RUP under the guidance of a mentor, reflecting the entire educational process and a list of practical skills. The resident doctor's portfolio also includes Syllabuses, signed resident codes of honor, signed resident privileges, and certificates. The portfolio did not include published articles, grades in disciplines.

In the course of the work of the EEC, it was demonstrated that the residency program seeks to integrate practice and theory, including the content, the sequence of training of a resident doctor with the definition of goals and learning outcomes based on the performance of tasks and the provision of medical care to the population. Integration of the preparation and delivery of medical services implies the provision of medical care by a resident doctor. The training is based on practice, involving resident physicians in personal involvement in the provision of medical services and responsibility for patient care activities in various departments under the guidance of a mentor. There was no evidence of participation of residents in the provision of medical services (residents of other specialties were hired as a resident doctor for 0.5 rates (orders submitted) with the ability to access the information system under a personal login and password). There is no duty schedule for residents signed by the teacher and curator of the EP. During a conversation with residents, their personal interest in increasing the number of shifts, which allow them to acquire more practical skills, was noted.

According to the TUP and RUP, practice-oriented training implies the personal participation of a resident doctor in the supervision of patients, in studies of congenital malformations, mutations in oncology for the appointment of targeted therapy, participation in consultations, consultations, general rounds, participation in outpatient appointments under the guidance of experienced mentors. The portfolio of a resident doctor in the direction of residency "Medical Genetics" does not provide for the rotation of a resident in specialized medical genetic consultations, fetal protection centers, specialized hospitals, as well as training in practical skills according to an individual curriculum in the 1st year of study.

It is necessary to make changes to the individual curricula, the rotation schedule of residents in order to provide a wide range of practical experience in the specialty, including the passage of a number of disciplines in other clinics in accordance with the EP, especially in the development of the children's

component and aspects of emergency, inpatient medical care. Despite the possibility of passing disciplines in other clinics, there are no agreements with clinics and clinical mentors that regulate this process of implementing residency EP. In order to improve the development of the EP, it is necessary to conclude agreements with third-party healthcare organizations and clinical mentors to obtain appropriate access to various aspects of the specialty.

When implementing the EP, the following teaching methods are used: daily provision of theoretical material by the teacher to the resident doctor in the form of lectures, presentations, daily provision of practical material by the clinical mentor. When interviewing teachers and resident doctors, it was presented that teaching methods in the form of lectures, presentations, analysis of situational tasks, and analysis of clinical cases are more often used.

It should be noted that according to the State Educational Standards, the theoretical volume of training in the framework of OP 7R01105 "Adult Oncology", 7R01102 "Medical Genetics" should be no more than 20%. In order to increase the efficiency of mastering the program in the process of implementing EP 7R01102 "Medical Genetics", it is recommended to introduce teaching methods into the educational process with an increase in the component of practical skills aimed at primary, secondary and tertiary prevention of diseases (medical genetic counseling should include - married couples planning pregnancy ; women with habitual miscarriage; men with impaired spermatogenesis; couples planning a pregnancy using ART; closely related marriages ; medical genetic counseling for children and their families with suspected monogenic, chromosomal, congenital pathology; organization of a screening system for target population groups drawing up a diagnostic plan with the appointment of cytogenetic, molecular genetic analyzes, interpretation of the data obtained from studies to patients, etc.).

In order to increase the efficiency of mastering the program in the process of implementing EP 7R01105 "Adult Oncology", it is recommended to introduce teaching methods into the educational process with an increase in the component of practical skills, since "Training in residency is based on the integration of theory and clinical practice with the involvement of resident doctors in personal participation in the provision of medical services and responsibility for the activities of providing care to patients under the supervision of a mentor "(Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 15, 2020 No. ҚР ДСМ-270/2020.) Residency training is focused on the end result - the acquisition of knowledge and skills - results learning. According to the structure of the model residency curriculum in the specialty "Adult Oncology", residents must study more than 40 oncological diseases and conditions and master 11 practical skills (manipulations, procedures), which is not possible on the basis of the UDP clinic, since there is a required number of oncological patients for the studied nosology, there are no clinical mentors, and the prospective clinical mentors of the oncology dispensary in Astana are already involved in the mentoring process of the medical university.

Thus, the EP "Adult Oncology" cannot provide a sufficient material and technical base for resident doctors, which allows for the implementation of an adequate implementation of the educational program, in order to train specialist doctors, paying due attention to the functions of medical care, involving in all types of medical activities, including duty .

When compiling the IEP of a resident doctor, not only a plan for the theoretical and clinical scope of knowledge is prescribed, but also a plan for the research work of a resident doctor. The resident doctor plans scientific activities and publications throughout his studies, every year at the end of the academic period at the intermediate certification, the resident doctor reports on the work done. The EP defines the competencies of a resident doctor in the field of research activities: to formulate adequate research questions, to critically evaluate professional literature, to effectively use international databases in their daily activities, to participate in the work of a research team; analyze and publicly present medical information based on evidence-based medicine; participate in applied medical research.

The hospital provides an opportunity for the resident doctor to develop competencies in the field of research activities. In the course of interviews with residents, it was revealed that they perform research work, participate in conferences, and participate in master classes.

In the Hospital, in order to develop the skills of critical evaluation of literature, writing scientific articles and publications, lectures by specialists with extensive experience in scientific activity are planned for resident doctors. With independent study of scientific publications in periodicals and Internet

resources, a resident doctor develops critical and scientific thinking. It is recommended to introduce an elective component in the EP aimed at an in-depth study of scientific methodology: the use of modern computer technologies in biostatistics; academic writing in Kazakh, Russian and English for writing scientific articles; ethics of scientific publications.

Analysis of the data from the survey of resident doctors revealed:

1) satisfaction with the overall quality of training programs: excellent - 43.8%; well-18.8%; satisfactory - 31.3%, unsatisfactory - 6.3%.

2) satisfaction with teaching methods in general: excellent - 43.8%; good - 25%; by satisfactory - 18.8%, unsatisfactory - 12.5%.

3) that the course program was clearly presented: excellent - 37.5%; good - 25%; satisfactory - 37.5%, unsatisfactory - 0%.

### ***Strengths / best practice***

There are no strengths in this standard.

### ***WEC recommendations:***

1) The head of EP 7R01102 "Medical Genetics" needs to make changes to the expected learning outcomes in accordance with the nomenclature of the OP "Medical Genetics" ( *until 09/01/23* ).

2) Heads of the EP "Adult Oncology", "Medical Genetics" to introduce into the educational process the appropriate methods of teaching practical components aimed at providing diagnostic and specialized medical care to patients, with the provision of supporting documents (until 01.01.24) .

3) The leaders of the EP "Adult Oncology", "Medical Genetics" to make changes to the individual curricula of residents in order to provide a wide range of practical experience, including the passage of a number of disciplines in other clinics in accordance with the OP (until 01.09.23) .

4) The heads of the EP "Medical Genetics", "Adult Oncology" to provide for the rotation of residents to the bases of third-party healthcare organizations with the study of disciplines aimed at primary, secondary and tertiary prevention of diseases and work as part of multidisciplinary groups (until 09/01/23 ) .

5) The heads of the EP "Medical Genetics", "Adult Oncology" to introduce a component of choice for residents, aimed at in-depth study of the methodology of conducting scientific research ( *until 07/01/24* ).

6) The leaders of the EP "Medical Genetics", "Adult Oncology" bring the RUP and the academic calendar in accordance with the order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 04.07.2022 No. KP DSM-63 - vacations are provided to students lasting at least 7 weeks, with the exception of the graduation course ( *until 09/01/23* ).

7) Hospital management to conclude agreements with third-party healthcare organizations and clinical mentors to obtain appropriate access to various aspects of the EP "Medical Genetics", "Adult Oncology" ( *until 01.09.23* ).

***EEC conclusions according to the criteria of the standard "Educational Program" OP 7R01102 "Medical Genetics": (strong / satisfactory / suggest improvements / unsatisfactory) strong - 0, satisfactory - 13, suggest improvements - 7, unsatisfactory - 0***

***Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria of the standard "Educational Program" EP 7R01105 "Adult Oncology": (strong / satisfactory / suggest improvements / unsatisfactory) strong - 0, satisfactory - 14, suggest improvements - 6, unsatisfactory - 0***

## **6.3. Standard "Student Assessment Policy"**

### ***Evidence***

The hospital implements a policy of certification / assessment of students in the EP "Adult Oncology", "Medical Genetics" in accordance with the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On

Education" dated July 27, 2007 No. 319-III; by order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 04.07.2022 No. KR DSM-63 "On approval of state compulsory standards for levels of education in the field of healthcare"; by order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 11, 2020 No. ҚР ДСМ-249/2020 "On approval of the rules for assessing the knowledge and skills of students, assessing the professional preparedness of graduates of educational programs in the field of health and health professionals"; by order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated April 20, 2011 No. 152 "On approval of the Rules for organizing the educational process on credit technology of education in organizations of higher and (or) postgraduate education".

The entire regulatory framework relating to the activities of the residency is presented on the Hospital's website <https://bmcudp.kz/ru/>.

Resident doctors receive training aimed at mastering the key competencies and professional skills that are prescribed in the EP for each discipline, and in general. To achieve these outcomes, resident physicians study compulsory component (OC) and elective component (EC) disciplines, which are designed taking into account the specifics and focus, as well as the strengths of teachers and mentors.

Methods for assessing the boundary, final control in the disciplines of the PMM are developed by the departments responsible for the implementation of the EP. The estimation method is chosen based on the final RO defined in the Syllabus.

The assessment of the educational achievements of resident doctors is carried out on the basis of developed by teachers measuring the level of formed competencies, developed in various forms: control questions, tasks in test and oral form, a list of practical skills, situational tasks, clinical situations, etc.

As criteria for passing examinations and other types of assessment, clinical situations are used to demonstrate acquired skills that determine various aspects of clinical competence. The results of the assignments are evaluated using checklists.

All parties involved in the implementation of the EP share a common understanding that the assessment of resident doctors is an ongoing process that activates a feedback mechanism. This mechanism allows teachers/mentors to receive valuable information about the knowledge acquired by residents and the extent to which they have achieved their educational goals. The assessment process serves as a means of identifying specific knowledge gaps that require intervention. Grades awarded to resident physicians serve as indicators of their progress in education.

According to OP 7R01105 "Adult Oncology", 7R01102 "Medical Genetics", the assessment methods were not reviewed by external experts. The management of the Hospital recognizes the importance of attracting expert knowledge in the implementation of the EP, in order to identify the opinions of specialists and track innovative changes, as this allows you to identify new educational results and systematically consider them.

The integration of traditional and active forms and teaching methods used by the teaching staff of the Hospital ensures the achievement of the desired results by resident doctors. Traditional methods, such as lectures and situational tasks, instill theoretical knowledge and develop practical skills, active forms and teaching methods motivate for independent personal growth. Together, these approaches create a comprehensive learning experience that leads to expected outcomes.

For the successful implementation of integrated training, work is underway to inform resident doctors about the structure and expected learning outcomes. The information provided helps students to understand the need for their own involvement in this process, and forms the need for self-learning and development.

### ***Analytical part***

The department developed and put into effect internal documents: "Academic policy of the Hospital", "Regulations on the residency of the Hospital", "Algorithm organization of postgraduate education in residency on the basis of the BMC UDP RK. In the submitted documents, the procedure for the student assessment policy, assessment methods, including assessment criteria, was not previously considered and clearly spelled out.

The method and format of creating CISs should not be considered only as an assessment process



with an appropriate score. The multifunctional method of assessing the student is the basis and is aimed at: the process of teaching residents, structuring the acquired knowledge, the ability to fill gaps in learning, encouraging students to read independently and actively participate in the learning process. In the development of CIS, it is necessary to provide for the introduction of modern assessment methods: multiple choice questions (MCQ), Objective Structured Clinical Exam (OSKE). As an additional set of assessment methods, a portfolio is used throughout the entire period of study.

The hospital needs to develop standard operating procedures (SOPs) for assessment methods and approve them at the NCC. Develop a document with clear criteria that provide for reliability, validity and fairness in the event of appeal and appeal of the results of the assessment. It is necessary to provide for a system of proctoring - a procedure for monitoring the progress of the exam.

The introduction of new assessment methods in accordance with the needs of the EP should be based on examples of world experience, such as the 360 degree assessment method. This requires a concerted effort by curriculum planners, experts, and medical educators.

The Commission was not provided with information on the reliability, validity and fairness of the assessment methods used in the Hospital. It is necessary to develop a procedure that confirms the fairness, validity and reliability of the methods used.

The Department of Education needs to expand the ability to appeal residents based on exam results. Provide an appeal algorithm not only for the results of the final control in disciplines, but also for intermediate and final certification. Given that in the Hospital teachers have developed various forms of assessment (control questions, tasks in test and oral form, a list of practical skills, situational tasks, clinical situations), but examinations conducted in writing are subject to appeal. Other forms of assessment need to be added to the appeal algorithm.

When implementing the residency program, the Hospital monitors compliance with the content, nature and complexity of the practical tasks to be performed by resident doctors upon completion of the program. Feedback occurs in the process of assessment by the teacher/mentor, self-assessment (promotes self-analysis of strengths and weaknesses in the learning process) and peer assessment (aimed at ensuring that students help each other improve their work). The EP system does not provide for an evaluation system by external experts, which does not provide timely, specific, constructive and objective feedback.

To improve the level of student assessment methods, it is necessary to improve educational and methodological materials for each discipline, help residents understand and master key competencies, combine their own knowledge and skills into a single whole based on their interdependence and complementarity.

***Strengths / best practice according to the standard***

There are no strengths in this standard.

***WEC recommendations:***

- 1) EP managers need to develop standard operating procedures (SOPs) for assessment methods and approve them at the NCC (*until 09/01/2023*).
- 2) The Vocational Education Department to introduce an additional set of assessment methods and formats (multiple choice questions (MCQ), Objective Structured Clinical Exam (OSCE), “360 degrees” assessment method) (*until 09/01/2023*).
- 3) The Department of Vocational Education will add midterm and final assessments and other assessment formats to the appeal system in accordance with due legal procedures (*until 09/01/2023*).
- 4) The Department of Vocational Education to develop a documented procedure for the introduction of new methods for assessing the educational achievements of students in accordance with ensuring the reliability and validity of the assessment methods used (*until 09/01/2023*).
- 5) EP managers to develop and implement a documented procedure for the examination of the developed assessment methods, confirming the fairness, validity and reliability of the methods used (*until 09/01/2023*).

*The conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria of the standard "Evaluation of residents" OP 7R01105 "Adult oncology", 7R01102 "Medical genetics": (strong / satisfactory / suggest improvements / unsatisfactory) strong positions - 0, satisfactory - 5, suggest improvements - 5, unsatisfactory - 0.*

#### **6.4. Standard "Students"**

##### ***Evidence***

In accordance with the approved mission, the Hospital implements a policy of admission and selection for residency, focusing on the priorities of the healthcare needs of the Republic of Kazakhstan in the field of specialized medical care for the population of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The hospital carries out the procedure for admission to residency in accordance with the order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 31, 2018 No. 600 "On approval of the Model rules for admission to study in educational organizations implementing educational programs of higher and postgraduate education" <https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/V1800017650> and the internal regulatory document "Rules for admission to residency", approved by order of the director of the hospital on 06/30/2021. For the period of entrance examinations and enrollment in residency, by order of the Director of the Hospital, a reception, examination in specialties and appeal commissions are created. The examination committee for specialties is formed from among the teachers of the Hospital who have the academic degree of Doctor and (or) Candidate of Medical Sciences and (or) the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) in the relevant profile, practical doctors with at least 5 years of work experience, having the highest and (or) ) the first qualification category in the specialty. Applicants for residency pass an entrance exam in their specialty orally on tickets. Persons who have mastered the OP of higher education and internships and have a document with the qualification "Doctor" are accepted into the residency of the Hospital.

The hospital carries out the procedure for the transfer of resident doctors in accordance with paragraph 31 of the order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 30, 2018 No. 595 "On approval of the Model Rules for the activities of organizations of higher and (or) postgraduate education" <https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/V1800017657> and the internal regulatory document Academic Policy. There have been no student transfers to date. For the entire period of implementation of OP 7R01105 "Adult Oncology", 7R01102 "Medical Genetics" the number of voluntary expelled students is: adult oncology - 1.

#### **The contingent of residents by specialties for the 2022-2023 academic year**

<b>Speciality (all residents study in the 1st year)</b>	<b>2022-2023 academic year year</b>	
	<b>reception</b>	<b>release</b>
Oncology adult	1 (deducted)	0
medical genetics	1	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>0</b>

The Hospital only plans to develop and approve the procedure for the employment of graduates of the Hospital in the EP "Adult Oncology" and "Medical Genetics", where the persons responsible for employment, the frequency of monitoring employment will be determined. The hospital provides students with access to the system of academic counseling by the specialists of the Department. Students are consulted on the organization of the educational process (academic calendar, schedule, individual curriculum (IEP), elective disciplines). Each resident doctor is assigned to the department according to the clinical profile, which provides and participates in the implementation of the EP, the formation of the

IEP, the management of the clinical, educational and scientific activities of the student. In addition, a clinical mentor is assigned to the resident doctor for the period of mastering the discipline, whose function is to guide the resident doctor to master the practical skills and competencies necessary in the process of his training.

The Hospital has a Student Support Policy (Hospital Academic Policy). Students regularly meet with the Deputy Director for Strategic Development, Science and Education and the Head of the Department on issues related to the organization of the educational process and educational work, on issues in the field of social, financial and personal needs. The hospital considers individually the questions and needs of each resident doctor. When studying on a paid basis at their own expense, it is allowed to pay in installments (50/50), in isolated cases of financial difficulty in paying for tuition, a resident doctor can apply for a deferral or monthly payment. Also, the Hospital provides free transportation on 6 routes within the city and nearby settlements, which can be used by resident doctors, resident doctors are provided with a room with personal lockers for changing clothes.

For personal issues, in case of a professional or other crisis, in case of emotional burnout, psychological problems, etc. resident doctors can seek help and advice from their teachers and mentors. For questions of interaction with teachers, employees of supervised departments, in general with the structural divisions of the Hospital, resident doctors can contact the Department.

The hospital provides for the possibility of interruptions in training caused by pregnancy (including maternity / paternity leave, parental leave), illness, military service in accordance with paragraph 32. of the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 30, 2018 No. higher and (or) postgraduate education " <https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/V1800017657> academic leave is provided to students on the basis of the conclusion of the medical advisory commission at an outpatient organization for a period of 6 to 12 months due to illness, agendas on conscription for military service, birth, adoption (adoption) of a child up to the age of three years. The hospital independently determines and ensures compliance with the procedure for granting academic leave to resident doctors in accordance with the Academic Policy when providing supporting documents.

### ***Analytical part***

The entire procedure for admission and selection is guided by the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Persons who have mastered the EP of higher education and internships, and who have a document with the qualification "Doctor" are admitted to the residency of the Hospital. Admission to residency is carried out on the basis of developed criteria that are accessible and transparent to applicants with a description of the conditions of study, goals and final results of the EP. In order to ensure the transparency of the selection and enrollment procedure, the hospital management should amend the rules for admission to residency to expand the selection committee, including employees not only of the Hospital, but also of other healthcare organizations or universities of relevant specialties.

Hospital employees claim that a video recording of the interview with applicants for residency was conducted, but this procedure is not reflected in the regulatory documents. It is also necessary to introduce a clause on mandatory video recording of interviews with residents to ensure transparency in the selection and enrollment of residents. The Hospital has an appeal mechanism to resolve contentious issues regarding admission decisions. In preparation for admission and recruitment for residency for the coming academic year, the Department monitors the need for personnel in the Hospital departments and the availability of resources for the implementation of the EP, but there is no process of coordinating the number of residents with the needs of practical healthcare in the Republic of Kazakhstan . During the interviews, the experts found out that the majority of residents do not present their career track, are not aware of potential jobs and, in general, the need for doctors in their chosen specialty in the country. The hospital management should organize a graduate employment center in the vocational education department, which will help graduates plan their career track and monitor employment.

Currently, EP 7R01102 "Medical Genetics" notes an imbalance between students and the resources of the Hospital, the lack of clinical bases for mastering practical skills and the material and technical equipment of the departments, which does not allow creating conditions for the training of

residents. According to OP 7R01105 "Adult Oncology" - the student admitted to residency was expelled.

Documented in the staff list, the order of the Hospital does not identify specific heads of each EP of the residency.

Academic counseling of students is carried out by the staff of the Department, clinical mentors.

During the visit of the VEC to the training organization of the EP "Medical Genetics" resident, a clear predominance of practical work in PGD was revealed (the student's portfolio contains information on the methods of conducting various types of genetic analyzes under the guidance of a mentor and independently, however, medical genetic counseling was carried out only for pregnant women together with mentor). The head of the EP should make changes to the IEP of the resident to eliminate the dominance of the working component based on the personalized genomic diagnostics laboratory, add time to work in medical genetic consultations, in neonatal departments and other specialized centers aimed at providing medical genetic care.

In the portfolio of the resident in the specialty "Medical Genetics" there is no report of the resident after passing each discipline; checklists with an assessment of practical activities. Of the 13 practical skills planned for 1 year of study in residency, there is data only on the implementation of 4 skills, of which only 3 are in full according to the IEP. From the side of the head of the EP, an explanation was given that all undeveloped practical skills were transferred to the second year of study, in connection with the possibility of a 3-6 month trip to practice in regional organizations. In fact, the resident does not have time in the next calendar year to acquire the relevant skills and abilities from the teaching staff of the Hospital.

During an interview with a resident of the Medical Genetics program, it turned out that the resident is confident that the object of the professional activity of a geneticist is laboratory diagnostics. The resident intends to become a cytogenetic doctor. This contradicts the educational program 7R01102 "Medical Genetics", corresponds to the nomenclature of medical specialties and the educational program 6R111900 - "Clinical Laboratory Diagnostics".

The hospital does not comply with the criterion for involving the association of students and other stakeholders in the development of policy and the selection process, promotion, employment, evaluation of the EP and other aspects of the educational process. Taking into account plans to increase recruitment for residency, the head of the vocational education department should organize a student self-government body (for example, the Council of Residents) in order to actively include representatives of this body in the scientific and clinical council of the Hospital to influence various stages of the implementation of the residency program. In order to provide feedback, the Hospital periodically conducts a survey of residents on satisfaction with the conditions and quality of education. In the process of anonymous questionnaires and interviews with residents, a high need for providing places in the hostel was revealed, a possible solution to this issue could be a contract for renting rooms in hostels by the hospital from third-party organizations.

In the event of a difficult / crisis situation, the resident has the opportunity to seek help only from the employees of the Hospital Department, curators, they are not members of a trade union organization, they do not have their own self-government body. A psychologist works in the Hospital, but he does not work with residents.

The creation of a student self-government body (Resident Council) will allow solving a number of issues related to the involvement of residents in various stages of the implementation of the EP, the examination of the EP. Without fail, the hospital management should make changes to the composition of the scientific and clinical council of the Hospital with the inclusion of at least 2 representatives of residents with the right to vote on residency issues.

Currently, the Hospital trains medical personnel in residency in the specialty is carried out at the expense of the resident doctor's own funds, financial incentives and incentives are not provided. In order to stimulate and encourage achievements in educational, scientific and clinical activities, measures of non-material incentives should be provided. For example, it is possible to organize an annual competition "the best resident of the year" based on the results of intermediate certification and research with a discount on tuition for a year.

The hospital does not provide access for resident physicians to provide medical care to patients in

hospital departments under the supervision of a clinical mentor. At the Hospital, after the enrollment of resident doctors, the supervised departments draw up a list of privileges indicating the possible practical skills and responsibilities of resident doctors, which is approved by the Deputy Director of the Hospital.

***Strengths/best practice***

There are no strengths in this standard.

***WEC recommendations:***

1) The Vocational Education Department to involve stakeholders and representatives of other interested parties in the development and revision of the policy and rules for the admission of residents (until 09/01/2023).

2) The department of vocational education needs to expand and revise the methods of academic counseling, conduct explanatory work with the resident and the Head of the EP "Medical Genetics" about the declared object of professional activity - these are Patients with hereditary, chromosomal and congenital pathologies (establishing a genetic diagnosis and making a genetic prognosis in the family of the patient and the choice of preventive measures for pregnant women of the "risk group" to prevent the birth of a sick child in the family, as stated in the OP), and not the biological, genetic material of patients (until 09/01/2023).

3) For the leaders of the EP, in the program of entrance examinations, include questions only of the discipline of prerequisites and exclude highly specialized topics (until 09/01/2023).

4) The management of the Hospital should ensure that students have access to medical care for adults and children under the supervision of a clinical mentor in accordance with the EP (until 09/01/2023).

5) The hospital management should provide for the availability of a hostel for all non-resident residents (possibly under a lease agreement in other organizations) (up to 09/01/2024).

6) Heads of the EP to develop a schedule for the rotation and duty of resident doctors in clinical departments in accordance with the calendar-thematic plan (until 09/01/2023).

7) The hospital management should amend the composition of the admissions committee, include employees of other healthcare organizations and / or universities, and also introduce a clause on mandatory video recording of interviews with residents to ensure transparency in the selection and enrollment of residents (until 09/01/2023).

8) The hospital management organizes a graduate employment center in the vocational education department (until 01/01/2024).

9) The head of the vocational education department organizes a student self-government body (Council of Residents) (until 01.09.2023).

1 0) The management of the hospital to amend the composition of the scientific and clinical council of the Hospital with the inclusion of at least 2 representatives of residents (until 01.09.2023).

1 1) To the management of the hospital to organize an annual competition "the best resident of the year" in order to stimulate achievements in education, including in R&D (until 01.01.2024).

***EEC conclusions according to the criteria of the "Residents" standard of OP 7R01102 "Medical Genetics": (strong / satisfactory / suggest improvements / unsatisfactory) strong - 0, satisfactory - 13, suggest improvements - 11, unsatisfactory - 0.***

***EEC conclusions according to the criteria of the "Residents" standard OP 7R01105 "Adult Oncology": (strong / satisfactory / suggest improvements / unsatisfactory) strong - 0, satisfactory - 14, suggest improvements - 10, unsatisfactory - 0.***

## 6.5. Standard "Academic Staff / Teachers"

### *Evidence*

In accordance with the Human Resources Policy of the Hospital for the implementation of EP 7R01105 "Adult Oncology", 7R01102 "Medical Genetics", teachers / mentors must have at least five years of clinical experience in the field of study, which confirms sufficient practical experience in the relevant specialty. The specialists of the Department form a portfolio of a teacher/mentor, which contains all copies of documents confirming their qualifications (academic degree, medical category, specialist certificate).

Recruitment to teaching staff positions is not provided, because the management of the Hospital did not allocate the appropriate rates. By order of the director No. 264 dated August 18, 2022, the form of the payroll for organizing and conducting paid educational services in residency for the 2022-2023 academic year was approved, which provides for the amount of hourly pay and the load of the teacher / mentor. The pedagogical activity of doctors is carried out in parallel with the main activity. The financial resources received for the cost of training from the resident doctor are directed to reimbursement of expenses in the amount of 40% of the total amount for the teaching activities of the teaching staff.

In order to stimulate scientific personnel and increase the role of research work in the Hospital, by order of the director No. 462 dated December 1, 2022, the "Regulations on the system of motivation of employees for the development of scientific and innovative activities" were approved.

The academic staff of the Hospital is annually approved (without allocation of teaching staff rates) before the start of the academic year by order of the director. The academic staff includes employees of the Hospital involved in the implementation of residency programs. The list is formed by the specialists of the Department on the basis of the staff list of the supervising departments. The academic staff for the 2022-2023 academic year includes 39 teachers/mentors in various areas of residency training. The proportion of teachers / mentors of the academic staff of the Hospital with certificates of a specialist in the field of study and the highest medical category is 100%, of which 41% (16 people) have an academic degree, including MD. - 23% (9 people), Ph.D. - 10% (4 people), PhD - 8% (3 people). Certification of employees is a periodically carried out procedure to determine the level of their professional and qualification training, business and personal qualities.

In order to ensure the quality of classes, the Hospital has a system for advanced training and professional development of teaching staff and staff. The system of advanced training in the Hospital is carried out in accordance with the Thematic plan of advanced training cycles for doctors for 2023 and the Calendar plan for training specialists for 2023 in accordance with the order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 21, 2020 No. ҚР ДСМ-303/2020 "On approval of the rules for additional and non-formal education of healthcare professionals, qualification requirements for organizations implementing educational programs of additional and non-formal education in the field of healthcare, as well as the rules for recognizing learning outcomes obtained by healthcare professionals through additional and non-formal education. <https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/V2000021847> . Training and advanced training of teachers / mentors is carried out through short-term courses and internships within the Republic of Kazakhstan and abroad. The department organizes PC cycles for mastering pedagogical competencies. LLP "National Center for Continuing Education "PROFESSIONAL" in Almaty conducted training in the form of a PC cycle for the teaching staff of the Hospital on the topic: "Innovative technologies in education" in the amount of 120 hours / 4 credits from September 13 to September 25, 2021.

In residency, the "teacher-student" ratio, according to the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 31, 2018 No. 606 "On approval of the average ratio of the number of students to teachers for calculating the total number of faculty members of organizations of higher and (or) postgraduate education, is determined based on the average ratio per 1 teaching staff: 3 resident doctors.

The duties of the teaching staff are enshrined in job descriptions and in contracts for clinical mentors (presented in the portfolio of the teaching staff).

The proportion of teachers implementing residency programs with a scientific degree and/or academic title is 50% or more.

**Qualifying characteristic of the academic staff of the Hospital**

<b>OP</b>	<b>Total</b>	<b>Doctors of the highest category</b>	<b>of which are settled</b>	<b>% degree news</b>	<b>% trained in pedagogy</b>
Oncology adult	6	100%	5 (3dm)	83%	50%
medical genetics	2	100%	1 MD	50%	50%

According to the results of an anonymous survey, the teaching staff are satisfied with the methods of stimulation, encouragement and support by the management of the Hospital.

***Analytical part***

The qualifications of teaching staff implementing accredited residency programs correspond to the level of positions held and ensure the implementation of educational programs, confirmed by the corresponding academic degree, academic title, work experience and medical qualifications. But the staff of teaching staff implementing residency programs is not staffed, because recruitment for teaching staff positions is not provided, and the management of the Hospital has not allocated appropriate rates. Payment for pedagogical activity is carried out according to the acts of completed hourly work, by combining pedagogical and medical activities. At the same time, the working time schedule is not singled out or delimited. No time is allocated for practical training with residents. The management of the Hospital should make changes to the staffing table with the introduction of PPP rates, which will improve the possibility of planning a working day, the distribution of teaching and clinical workload. Based on the results of the survey, 24% of the teaching staff assess the possibility of combining these types of activities as “bad”. The introduction of PPP rates in the Hospital will ensure a balance between teaching, research and medical care.

The qualitative composition of the academic staff as a whole corresponds to the specifics of residency educational programs. Scientific work is an integral part of the activities of the teaching staff of the Hospital and a necessary condition for the training of residents. But it should be noted that according to the submitted documents and self-report, there is an insufficient coverage of teachers and, accordingly, residents involved in R&D.

The Hospital has a well-organized work with staff on advanced training (assigned to the department of vocational education), but not all teaching staff have been trained in pedagogical competencies. According to the results of the survey, 24% of the teaching staff evaluate the work on advanced training as “relatively bad”. The management of the Department needs to provide training / advanced training in pedagogical competencies for all employees of the Hospital implementing the residency program.

Clinical mentors have been assigned to all residents. Interviews with teaching staff revealed an incomplete understanding of the tasks and responsibilities of clinical mentors in the implementation of the EP. The management of the Department needs to develop and approve a local regulatory document "Regulations on clinical mentoring", which is a common practice in the Republic of Kazakhstan. According to the EP "Adult Oncology", the organization does not provide for clinical mentors in the conditions of UDP.

The Hospital has developed a system of material and non-material incentives for employees for clinical and scientific work, publication activity, which is confirmed by the results of an anonymous survey. 72% of teachers expressed full or partial satisfaction with the terms of remuneration. During the interview, representatives of the academic staff expressed their desire for the need for additional

incentives for teaching activities based on the results of the academic year. To distribute responsibility for learning outcomes and key issues of EP implementation, the Hospital management should determine by order of the heads of each of the residency EPs, which is good practice in the Republic of Kazakhstan.

***Strengths/best practice***

There are no strengths in this standard.

***WEC recommendations:***

- 1) The management of the Hospital to make changes to the staffing table with the introduction of PPP rates ( *until 01/01/2024*).
- 2) The Department of Vocational Education to develop and approve a professional development program on pedagogy for further professional development (*09/01/2023*).

***EEC conclusions according to the criteria of the standard "Teachers" OP 7R01105 "Adult Oncology", 7R01102 "Medical Genetics": (strong / satisfactory / suggest improvements / unsatisfactory)*** Strong - 0, Satisfactory - 6, suggest improvement - 2, Unsatisfactory - 0

**6.6. Standard "Educational Resources"**

***Evidence***

The equipment of the Hospital is systematically updated. The departments have the necessary technical teaching aids: computers, laptops, netbooks, projectors, printers, the staffing of the departments with equipment and the satisfaction of the teaching staff is high.

In the L block of the Hospital on the 6th floor, there are free access for resident doctors to classroom training rooms. Classrooms are equipped with the necessary technical support - stationary multimedia projectors, smart boards. The study rooms are fully equipped for seminars, practical, laboratory classes, they have the necessary cabinet furniture, educational and methodological equipment and manuals. The departments of the Hospital have staff rooms for practical and theoretical research and self-training of resident doctors. The hospital is equipped with the latest modern clinical diagnostic equipment. All equipment is available for work, resident doctors are directly involved in using it for diagnostic and therapeutic purposes under the supervision of a mentor. The clinical base used for residency training in the specialty "Medical Genetics" is fully equipped for laboratory diagnostics. The resident is actively involved in laboratory tests, mastering the methods of DNA / RNA isolation, PRC reaction of analyzes delivered from all regions of Kazakhstan.

Currently, the Center for Robotic Surgery has been opened on the basis of the Hospital, equipped with six simulation training racks and a Senhance training robotic system (Trans Enterix, USA), used by surgeons, gynecologists, and urologists.

The hospital has information and communication technologies and electronic media, such as: GroupWise - Mail Server, Novell IManager - Account Server, KRK Mail - File Server (for file exchange), Messenger - Message Server, KavServer - Server for antivirus, MIS - medical information system, PrintServer - print server (there are large printers that are in some departments), WSUS - a server for updating the Windows system. The hospital has signed a joint activity agreement with NJSC "Astana Medical University", a memorandum of cooperation with AEO "Nazarbayev University" to provide students with access to up-to-date professional literature, electronic databases. Compliance with JCI standards, where one of the criteria for the quality of the educational process is its safety, the absence of an unacceptable risk of harm to the health, honor and dignity of its subjects, predetermines the solution of one of the most important tasks of the educational environment in the Hospital - the creation of safe conditions for the successful training of resident doctors.

Under the guidance of clinical mentors, on a daily basis, resident doctors participate in joint rounds with the heads of departments, participate in the discussion of patient treatment tactics at daily conferences, participate in consultations /



Together with doctors geneticists of PLHD, the resident participates in conferences, consultations, including morning laboratory conferences, is trained in emergency care (anaphylactic shock, bleeding, BLS, etc.)

The AIS Platonus database is hosted on a server located in the Hospital and was fully commissioned in 2023. The system contains a centralized database that allows specialists of the Department and teaching staff of the Hospital departments to automate their educational and methodological work, and resident doctors to receive the necessary information on the educational process.

To develop the capacity of the teaching staff, the stimulation of the activities of the teaching staff is one of the mechanisms for periodic review, study and evaluation implemented by the OP, which ensures the quality of the program management process. The teaching staff for participation in scientific research and their results (publications, patents, copyright certificates, monographs, teaching aids, acts of implementation, etc.) are paid monetary rewards (order of the director dated 01.12.2022 No. 462 "On the introduction of a system of employee motivation for development scientific and innovative activities") introduction of new teaching methods, points are awarded when calculating the rating of teaching staff.

### ***Analytical part***

To implement the adequate implementation of the EP "Adult Oncology", OP "Medical Genetics" there are not enough opportunities for practice-oriented training.

During training, the resident doctor gains practical experience by providing medical services in the laboratory and clinic. Residency training is based on practice, involving resident doctors in personal participation in the provision of medical care to patients should be carried out in specialized medical organizations recognized as residency bases. For the implementation of the EP "Adult Oncology", EP "Medical Genetics", according to the NPA (standard curricula), it is required to study a specific list of diseases. The hospital does not provide sufficient material and technical base for teachers and resident doctors to ensure adequate implementation of the educational program for the development of certain practical skills, manipulations, procedures, namely, it does not have an oncology department, a chemotherapy and radiation therapy department, a medical genetic consultation department with reception of the adult and children's population with hereditary, chromosomal, orphan diseases. During the visit, the experts revealed the absence of contracts with clinical sites and other healthcare organizations.

The main department of the EP "Medical Genetics" is the clinical diagnostic laboratory - the Laboratory for Personalized Genomic Diagnostics (PLGD). However, the work of the laboratory does not allow mastering the main competencies (C): interaction with the patient, appointment of an examination plan, diagnosis, treatment, communication with the patient's family, etc. [http://esuvo.platonus.kz/#/register/education\\_program/application/40704](http://esuvo.platonus.kz/#/register/education_program/application/40704)

During the EEC visit, to assess the range of practical skills, statistical data were requested on the medical genetic counseling of patients for 2022 in the layout of pregnant women, children with chromosomal and hereditary pathologies, couples planning pregnancy, children with orphan diseases. However, the report was not provided. Also, during the visit to LPHD, it was not possible to meet and talk with a geneticist who provides advisory assistance.

The students interviewed during the EEC visit are satisfied with the level of availability of library resources in 31.3% - excellent, 37.3% - good, 31.3 - satisfactory, 31.3% - excellent, 43.8% - good, 25% - satisfactory - the quality of the services provided in the library and in the reading rooms.

The equipment of the hospital makes it possible to implement the following teaching methods: training in the conditions of primary health care for a narrow group of the population, attending medical conferences, consultations; learning through research (accomplishment of research work).

According to the EP "Adult Oncology", the Hospital demonstrated insufficient readiness to provide the necessary resources for acquiring practical experience of residents, since training is planned only at the outpatient level. Training should take place at all levels of medical oncological care, including in specialized hospitals (according to the modules and disciplines of the EP), and also provides for night

shifts. It should also be noted the lack of clinical mentors in oncology, radiation therapy, chemotherapy, which is mandatory for the implementation of the EP. However, to implement the adequate implementation of the EP "Adult Oncology", there is not enough space and opportunities for practice-oriented learning. Since training in residency is based on practice, with the involvement of resident doctors in personal participation in the provision of services and in providing assistance to patients in medical organizations recognized as residency bases. For the implementation of the EP "Adult Oncology", according to the NLA (standard curricula), it is required to study a specific list of diseases. The hospital does not provide sufficient material and technical base for teachers and resident doctors to ensure adequate implementation of the educational program for the development of certain practical skills, manipulation procedures, namely, it does not have an oncology department, a chemotherapy and radiation therapy department. During the visit, the experts revealed the absence of contracts with clinical sites and other healthcare organizations. Cooperation is carried out within the framework of memorandums.

According to the OP "Medical Genetics", the Hospital has demonstrated insufficient readiness to provide the necessary resources for acquiring practical experience of residents, according to the resident's portfolio, it is planned to study only in PGD and outpatient admission of pregnant women. Training should take place at all levels of medical genetic care, including in specialized hospitals (according to the modules and disciplines of the EP).

For most disciplines of the EP, the Hospital is ready to provide only theoretical training in the framework of lectures and seminars (classroom work), which is 10-20% of the volume of the discipline.

The main tool for involving resident doctors in the evaluation of the EP, in addition to the questionnaire, is the participation of representatives and resident doctors in the work of the commission of lethal cases, however, the discussion of the EP is held in specialized departments and at the NCC, where the participation of resident doctors is not provided.

In the Academic Policy of the Hospital, resident doctors of the Hospital, employers are involved in the process of evaluating the EP, but there is no external peer review from the public and the academic community.

The hospital has information and communication technology and electronic media. EEC experts found poor knowledge of residents in the field of scientific research and methodology, a small number of residents participating in R&D. Residency training provides for the formation of 6 basic competencies, one of which is the conduct of scientific research.

For the development of pedagogical competence, it is necessary to include publications on medical education in the indicative plan of teachers.

The commission noted the absence of normative documents for the use of expertise in the field of education.

### ***Strengths/best practice***

There are no strengths in this standard.

### ***WEC recommendations:***

1) The hospital management to provide a clinical base (open an oncology department, conclude agreements with clinical bases, open a medical genetic consultation with a full range of services or conclude agreements with clinical bases) (*until 01/01/24*).

2) The hospital management to organize simulation training for residents in order to develop practical skills, possibly with the use of third-party organizations on a contractual basis (*until 01.01.24*).

3) Hospital management to enter into contracts with third-party healthcare organizations to provide training, access to clinical facilities, patients, including the use of resources, both at the inpatient and outpatient levels in accordance with the OP (*until 01.01.24*).

(*until 01.01.24*).

4) The Department of Education to develop a document that allows for the examination of the EP (*until 09/01/23*).

5) The Department of Education needs to make changes to the Academic Policy, SOP "Algorithm

for organizing postgraduate education in residency on the basis of the BMC UDP RK" KOP / SQE-8.1. for the development of external expertise with the participation of the public and the academic community in all structural units that ensure the implementation and evaluation of the EP (*until 09/01/23*).

6) The hospital management to ensure the training of residents in other educational institutions of the appropriate level with the offset of educational loans for the 2023-2024 academic year (*until 01/01/24*).

7) For 2024, the hospital management plan to allocate financial resources to promote regional or international exchange of employees and students in accordance with the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated April 20, 2011 No. 152 "On approval of the Rules for organizing the educational process on credit technology of education in organizations of higher and (or) postgraduate education" (*until 01.01.24*).

***EEC conclusions according to the criteria of the standard "Educational Resources" OP 7R01102 "Medical Genetics", OP 7R01105 "Adult Oncology": (strong / satisfactory / suggest improvement / unsatisfactory) Strong - 0, Satisfactory - 8, Suggest improvement - 7, Unsatisfactory - 0***

### **6.7. Standard "Evaluation of the educational program"**

#### ***Evidence***

The monitoring procedure in the Hospital is carried out by the structural units involved in the implementation of the EP. Responsibility for organizing and coordinating the implementation of OP 7R01105 "Adult Oncology", 7R01102 "Medical Genetics" is assigned to the specialists of the Department. Specialists prepare educational and methodological documentation. Changes to the EP are made as the regulatory legal acts adopted by the authorized bodies are updated.

Quality monitoring of OP, RUP, QED is carried out by the NCC.

Responsibility for the EP evaluation policy is borne by the relevant officials at various stages of training (Department, teaching staff of diagnostic departments, deputy director for strategic development, science and education, deputy director for medical work). Monitoring of the implementation of the EP and control of the achievement of the final RO is carried out continuously, within the framework of the activities of the diagnostic departments, the Department, the NCC of the Hospital.

For teachers / mentors, employers, residency graduates, the Hospital conducts a survey. For resident doctors, a survey is conducted on the topics: "Satisfaction of the resident doctor with the learning process", "Satisfaction of the resident doctor with research", "Satisfaction of the resident doctor with the creation of conditions for personal development and education". In monitoring based on the analysis of teaching data and evaluation of planned learning outcomes, formal and informal methods of feedback from teaching staff and students are used. Formal methods include the participation of students and teaching staff in the NCC. Informal methods include: personal meetings with heads of departments, curators, through social networks.

Teachers / mentors of the Hospital are involved as experts for the examination of teaching methods and assessment of resident doctors for compliance with the requirements of training and the acquired competencies in accordance with the course of study. Resident doctors apply to the Department, where they receive answers to their questions on the conditions for the implementation of the EP. Representatives of resident doctors are included in the working groups for the development of the program in the supervising departments, where they participate in discussing the implementation of the EP.

The hospital has a graduation in OP 7R01101 "Radiology" (2021, 2022), however, there were no graduates in the specialties "Adult Oncology" and "Medical Genetics" yet. At the same time, the Hospital has an algorithm for monitoring the level of training of graduates by obtaining feedback from employers, which is carried out in the form of a questionnaire. Employers of graduates are surveyed on satisfaction

with the training of specialists.

### ***Analytical part***

The hospital, following the requirements of accreditation standards, declares that it monitors the educational programs of the residency "Adult Oncology" and "Medical Genetics" taking into account the mission, the required learning outcomes, the content of the educational program, the assessment of knowledge and skills, and educational resources. The evaluation of educational programs is carried out taking into account the admission policy, the needs of the healthcare system, the process of implementing the educational program, evaluation methods, the progress of residents, identified problems and shortcomings. Responsibility for organizing and coordinating the implementation of the EP is assigned to the specialists of the Department.

Supporting documents offered to EEC members and analysis of interviews with different groups showed that the hospital is monitoring the main processes and results. The collection and analysis of data to ensure a quality educational process is part of the administrative procedures during the admission of students, their assessment and completion of training. The EEC members revealed the absence of a quality management system in the educational process to develop mechanisms for evaluating the EP, providing for the evaluation of programs at the stages of planning, implementation, analysis of results and implementation of changes, which will allow to regulate the process of EP implementation and track the progress of students. The department of education needs to develop SOPs for regular monitoring of the EP in accordance with the PMU and PMM, describing the identified problems and shortcomings, as well as ways to solve them. There is a quality management department in the organizational structure of the Hospital, but educational programs are not included in the scope of their activities.

During the visit of the EEC during the implementation of the EP "Medical Genetics", it was revealed that the progress in the implementation of the EP according to the portfolio and the conversation with the resident, the practical skills obtained during the training of the resident for 1 year do not correspond to the IEP, out of 24 practical skills acquired by the resident geneticist for 2 years of study only 3 are fully described and documented (participation in the preparation of chromosome preparations from peripheral blood, karyotyping, DNA extraction), partially another 1 (medical genetic counseling for pregnant women). During the monitoring carried out by the Division, the identified problems and ways to correct them are not described. It should be noted that the fully mastered practical skills cover only the clinical diagnostic laboratory and do not cover the tasks of interpreting the results of analyzes to patients, there is no skill in prescribing genetic tests, according to the established preliminary diagnosis, thus the key practical skills of a geneticist are not acquired when interacting with a patient.

Evaluation of the components of the EP, the results of the activities of the teaching staff and students based on feedback, allows for effective management of the educational process.

During the visit, it was found that the lack of QMS (as a system of internal quality assurance) and the lack of feedback from stakeholders / employers (as a system of external assessment of the quality of education) does not allow for a realistic assessment of the quality of educational programs, the correspondence of learning outcomes to the needs of practical healthcare. parties to the results of course evaluation and EP.

### ***Strengths/best practice***

There are no strengths in this standard.

### ***WEC recommendations:***

- 1) The hospital management to ensure the introduction of the QMS into the educational process (*until 01.01.24*).
- 2) The Department of Education should develop a standard operating procedure (SOP) for regular monitoring of the EP in accordance with the TUP and PMM, with a description of the identified problems and shortcomings, as well as ways to solve them (*until 01.01.24*).
- 3) The hospital management should ensure that external reviewers and experts have access to the results of the evaluation of the EP, taking into account the results of the feedback (*until 01.01.24*).

*Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria of the standard "Evaluation of the educational program" OP 7R01105 "Adult oncology", 7R01102 "Medical genetics": (strong / satisfactory / suggest improvements / unsatisfactory) Strong - 0, Satisfactory - 6, Suggest improvements - 3, Unsatisfactory - 0*

## **6.8. Standard "Management and Administration"**

### ***Evidence***

In order to ensure the quality of personnel training, the Hospital in its activities is guided by the country's regulatory legal acts and approved internal acts of the Hospital, while forming the contingent of students, the personnel and material and technical capabilities of the Hospital are taken into account.

Assessment of the educational achievements of resident doctors is carried out by conducting control and certification in accordance with the Regulations on residency and the Academic policy of the Hospital.

Responsibility for the policy for assessing the knowledge and skills of resident doctors is borne by the relevant officials at various stages of training (teaching staff, department of science and vocational education, deputy director for strategic development, science and education).

By order of the Director of the Hospital, the final attestation commission is approved, which includes the chairman, members from among the scientific and pedagogical staff and a representative of the evaluation organization and the secretary. Based on the results of academic performance, the rating of resident doctors, IA and the questionnaire of resident doctors, the EP is evaluated and improved.

The implementation of the EP "Adult Oncology", "Medical Genetics" is carried out in accordance with the state license for the right to implement residency and was developed in accordance with the State Educational Standard of residency. The transparency of the management of the residency program at the Hospital is ensured by the functioning of a number of mechanisms, which include:

- the presence of a EP residency approved by the NCC and included in the Register of the Center for the Bologna Process of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the structure of which includes, to the competence of the graduate and the RO, the RUP and the assessment of the achievements of students, the resources necessary for the implementation of the EP, scientific achievements, academic staff, the IA procedure for graduates;
- availability of internal regulatory documents regulating the process of implementation of residency program;
- the presence of collegial management bodies, including employees of the Hospital, resident doctors, representatives of practical healthcare;
- publication of information on residency program on the website of the Hospital.

The management system of educational programs is carried out on the basis of the Charter of the Hospital,

The implementation of the EP is controlled by the NCC, the transparency of the management and decision-making system is ensured by the minutes of the meetings of the deliberative bodies with subsequent communication to all employees.

The management of the EP of residency and the coordination of the activities of resident doctors is carried out by the Department of Professional Education (Department). Responsibility for the policy for assessing the knowledge and skills of students is borne by the relevant officials at various stages of education (teaching staff, department heads, head of the department, deputy director for strategic development, science and education).

Resource support of the EP "Adult Oncology", "Medical Genetics" is carried out by the financial and economic unit, which is directly managed by the Deputy Director for Financial and Economic Activities. Resources for the provision of EP are financed from extrabudgetary funds Hospitals

The budget of the Department for Educational Activities is formed from several sources:

- the republican budget (state order for the training of postgraduate education personnel, advanced training of workers, development of scientific research, transfers);
- provision of paid educational and other services.

The hospital continuously allocates funds for the purchase of computer equipment, medical equipment, AIS "Platonus", an independent final certification of resident doctors, the purchase of government forms (certificate of completion of residency), training of teaching staff.

Training of resident doctors is carried out in outpatient and diagnostic departments.

The hospital signed agreements on cooperation in the use of the database of the electronic library of NJSC "Astana Medical University" and the School of Medicine of Nazarbayev University. The Department has a training room for resident doctors, equipped with 6 new computers with Internet access.

In 2019, the Hospital successfully passed institutional accreditation, the accreditation certificate is valid until May 23, 2024. In 2020, the Hospital was accredited as an entity carrying out scientific activities, an accreditation certificate was received dated 06/23/2020, series MK No. 006188 for the next five years.

According to the requirements of ST RK ISO 9001-2016 Quality Management System by the certification body on December 21, 2021, the Hospital passed a recertification audit confirming the compliance of the quality management system with the requirements of ISO 9001:2016. Registration number of the certificate of conformity No. KZ.Q.01.E0689.C21.007949 for a period of 3 years (until 12/21/2024).

In 2019, the Hospital passed institutional accreditation by the Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Education and Healthcare (Certificate No. IA00009 dated May 24, 2019, valid from May 24, 2019 to May 23, 2024).

The hospital has been assessed by the Public Association "Experts and Consultants for External Comprehensive Assessment in the Healthcare Sector" of the Accreditation Center for Quality in Healthcare from November 22 to 25, 2021. The hospital was awarded the highest category for a period of 3 years. Registration number No. KZ66VEG00011799 based on the results of national accreditation.

In April 2022, the Hospital successfully passed the international re-accreditation of JCI, according to the results of the audit, the Hospital received the status of "Accredited Organization".

Information about the EP is posted and updated on the official website of the Hospital, on the pages of Facebook and Instagram of the Hospital, in the media of republican and regional significance, information and advertising products (booklets, leaflets) are published, on TV monitors of the Hospital, stands that are available to interested parties .

Also, on the official website of the Hospital, information on the employment of graduates is annually posted.

### ***Analytical part***

In the Hospital, the Management System is carried out on the basis of the Charter and the structure of the Hospital. Responsible for the development strategy of postgraduate education is the Deputy Director for Strategic Development, Science and Education.

The forms of collegiate management of the Hospital are the NCC, the Press Service, the Service for the Protection of State Secrets, the Service for Labor Protection, Civil Defense and Emergencies, PB and E, the Service for Quality Management and Patient Support.

At the same time, the form of collegiate management that is involved in planning, monitoring and improving the processes of educational, scientific and educational activities of the Hospital is not described, the frequency of meetings that consider issues in various areas of the educational activities of the Hospital is not regulated. According to the Accreditation rules, the Hospital must conduct an assessment of the academic leadership regarding the achievement of the mission of the EP and the expected learning outcomes.

According to the Rules, the Human Resources Service provides for the work of resident doctors, the creation of job descriptions (JD) for employees who do not have the right to work independently. At the same time, there are no provisions for teaching staff positions in the staffing of the hospital, the creation

of DIs for them. The Hospital has a mentoring system, but the function does not include work with resident doctors.

In the strategic development plan of the Hospital for 2022-2026, the residency program is assessed based on the number of residents studying at the Hospital. Evaluation of the effectiveness of the development program of the EP of the Hospital does not provide for monitoring the main indicators (indicators) of the quality and timing of the implementation of planned activities, monitoring the effectiveness of educational processes, internal and external audit of the quality of the EP.

The development strategy of the Hospital is aimed at improving the qualifications and training of specialists in the framework of practical and scientific activities. Conducting advanced training in the framework of the pedagogical activities of specialists working within the framework of the EP is not provided.

For the development of EP residency, their improvement, it is necessary to involve representatives of practical healthcare, representatives of other healthcare organizations, representatives of the Health Department and professional associations. In order to effectively plan, develop and implement residency programs, the Hospital needs to include representatives of practical healthcare, residents and independent teachers involved in the implementation of residency programs in the advisory bodies.

It is necessary to discuss the residency program with the inclusion of stakeholders, representatives of other healthcare organizations, representatives of the Health Department and professional associations, which will help prepare a specialist for further practical work in any medical organization.

***Strengths / best practice according to the standard " Evaluation of the educational program "***

There are no strengths in this standard.

***WEC recommendations:***

- 1) The hospital management develop and implement a policy on the periodic evaluation of academic leadership in relation to the achievement of its mission and the final learning outcomes (*until 12/31/2023*).
- 2) Hospital management to review the administrative staff and the staffing of the PMA in order to properly manage and allocate resources.
- 3) The hospital management, when forming the NCC, include at least 30% of external stakeholders, representatives of other healthcare organizations, representatives of the Health Department and professional associations in the commission when discussing and approving postgraduate medical education programs (*until 09/01/2023*).
- 4) The hospital management should allocate resources for advanced training in the framework of the pedagogical activities of employees (*until 09/01/2023*).
- 5) The management of the Hospital to develop and implement an internal quality management system for the EP, including a regular check of the quality of education (*until 01/01/2024*).

to *the criteria of the standard "Management and Administration" OP 7R01105 "Adult Oncology", 7R01102 "Medical Genetics": (strong / satisfactory / suggest improvements / unsatisfactory) Strong -0, Satisfactory -8, Suggest improvements -5, Unsatisfactory - 0*

**(VII) OVERVIEW OF STRENGTHS/BEST PRACTICE FOR EACH STANDARD**

***Mission and Deliverables Standard***

According to this standard, no strengths were identified.

***Standard "Educational program"***

According to this standard, no strengths were identified.

***Standard "Student Assessment Policy"***

According to this standard, no strengths were identified.

***Standard "Students"***

According to this standard, no strengths were identified.

***Standard "Academic Staff / Teachers"***

According to this standard, no strengths were identified.

***Standard "Educational Resources"***

According to this standard, no strengths were identified.

***Standard "Evaluation of the educational program"***

According to this standard, no strengths were identified.

***Standard "Management and Administration"***

According to this standard, no strengths were identified.

**(VIII) OVERVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS FOR IMPROVING QUALITY FOR EACH STANDARD**

***Standard "Mission and learning outcomes"***

1) The head of OP 7R01102 "Medical Genetics" needs to make changes to the mission of the OP, taking into account the specifics of the residency in accordance with the nomenclature of the EP "Medical Genetics" ( *until 09/01/23* ).

2) The Department of Vocational Education should provide for the conclusion of cooperation agreements with educational organizations, scientific, research and educational or research and production centers in the relevant areas of training, and providing for norms on the status of an OVPO partner in the relevant area of training (until 12/31/2023) .

3) The head of EP 7R01102 "Medical Genetics" needs to make changes to the learning outcomes, general and specific for the EP Medical Genetics in accordance with the State Educational Standard, TUP and the EP nomenclature ( *until 09/01/23* )

4) The Department of Vocational Education should provide for the involvement of resident geneticists in research conducted on the basis of the Hospital in accordance with regulatory legal acts in the field of research activities ( *until 12/31/2023* )

5) The management of the Hospital needs to include all stakeholders in the NCC to formulate the mission and expected learning outcomes ( *by 09/01/23* )

6) Provide documented evidence that the stated mission and expected learning outcomes are based on the opinions and suggestions of other stakeholders ( *by 09/01/23* )

***Standard "Educational program"***

***WEC recommendations:***

1) The head of EP 7R01102 "Medical Genetics" needs to make changes to the expected learning outcomes in accordance with the nomenclature of the OP "Medical Genetics" ( *until 09/01/23* ).

2) Heads of the EP "Adult Oncology", "Medical Genetics" to introduce into the educational process the appropriate methods of teaching practical components aimed at providing diagnostic and specialized medical care to patients, with the provision of supporting documents (until 01.01.24) .

3) The leaders of the EP "Adult Oncology", "Medical Genetics" to make changes to the individual curricula of residents in order to provide a wide range of practical experience, including the passage of a number of disciplines in other clinics in accordance with the OP (until 01.09.23) .

4) The heads of the EP "Medical Genetics", "Adult Oncology" to provide for the rotation of residents to the bases of third-party healthcare organizations with the study of disciplines aimed at primary, secondary and tertiary prevention of diseases and work as part of multidisciplinary groups (until 09/01/23 ) .

5) The heads of the EP "Medical Genetics", "Adult Oncology" to introduce a component of choice for residents, aimed at in-depth study of the methodology of conducting scientific research ( *until 07/01/24* ).

6) The leaders of the EP "Medical Genetics", "Adult Oncology" bring the RUP and the academic calendar in accordance with the order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 04.07.2022 No. КР DSM-63 - vacations are provided to students lasting at least 7 weeks, with the exception of the graduation course ( *until 09/01/23* ).



7) Hospital management to conclude agreements with third-party healthcare organizations and clinical mentors to obtain appropriate access to various aspects of the EP "Medical Genetics", "Adult Oncology" (*until 01.09.23*).

**Standard "Student Assessment Policy"**

1) EP managers need to develop standard operating procedures (SOPs) for assessment methods and approve them at the NCC (*until 09/01/2023*).

2) The Vocational Education Department to introduce an additional set of assessment methods and formats (multiple choice questions (MCQ), Objective Structured Clinical Exam (OSCE), "360 degrees" assessment method) (*until 09/01/2023*).

3) The Department of Vocational Education will add midterm and final assessments and other assessment formats to the appeal system in accordance with due legal procedures (*until 09/01/2023*).

4) The Department of Vocational Education to develop a documented procedure for the introduction of new methods for assessing the educational achievements of students in accordance with ensuring the reliability and validity of the assessment methods used (*until 09/01/2023*).

5) EP managers to develop and implement a documented procedure for the examination of the developed assessment methods, confirming the fairness, validity and reliability of the methods used (*until 09/01/2023*).

**Standard "Students"**

1) The Vocational Education Department to involve stakeholders and representatives of other interested parties in the development and revision of the policy and rules for the admission of residents (*until 09/01/2023*).

2) The department of vocational education needs to expand and revise the methods of academic counseling, conduct explanatory work with the resident and the Head of the EP "Medical Genetics" about the declared object of professional activity - these are Patients with hereditary, chromosomal and congenital pathologies (establishing a genetic diagnosis and making a genetic prognosis in the family of the patient and the choice of preventive measures for pregnant women of the "risk group" to prevent the birth of a sick child in the family, as stated in the OP), and not the biological, genetic material of patients (*until 09/01/2023*).

3) For the leaders of the EP, in the program of entrance examinations, include questions only of the discipline of prerequisites and exclude highly specialized topics (*until 09/01/2023*).

4) The management of the Hospital should ensure that students have access to medical care for adults and children under the supervision of a clinical mentor in accordance with the EP (*until 09/01/2023*).

5) The hospital management should provide for the availability of a hostel for all non-resident residents (possibly under a lease agreement in other organizations) (*up to 09/01/2024*).

6) Heads of the EP to develop a schedule for the rotation and duty of resident doctors in clinical departments in accordance with the calendar-thematic plan (*until 09/01/2023*).

7) The hospital management should amend the composition of the admissions committee, include employees of other healthcare organizations and / or universities, and also introduce a clause on mandatory video recording of interviews with residents to ensure transparency in the selection and enrollment of residents (*until 09/01/2023*).

8) The hospital management organizes a graduate employment center in the vocational education department (*until 01/01/2024*).

9) The head of the vocational education department organizes a student self-government body (Council of Residents) (*until 01.09.2023*).

10) The management of the hospital to amend the composition of the scientific and clinical council of the Hospital with the inclusion of at least 2 representatives of residents (*until 09/01/2023*).

11) The hospital management to organize an annual competition "the best resident of the year" in order to stimulate achievements in education, including in R&D (*until 01/01/2024*).

**Standard "Academic Staff / Teachers"**

1) The management of the Hospital to make changes to the staffing table with the introduction of PPP rates (*until 01/01/2024*).

2) The Vocational Education Department to develop and approve a professional development program on pedagogy for further professional development (09/01/2023).

**Standard "Educational Resources"**

1) The hospital management to provide a clinical base (open an oncology department, conclude agreements with clinical bases, open a medical genetic consultation with a full range of services or conclude agreements with clinical bases) ( *until 01/01/24*).

2) The hospital management to organize simulation training for residents in order to develop practical skills, possibly with the use of third-party organizations on a contractual basis ( *until 01.01.24*).

3) Hospital management to enter into contracts with third-party healthcare organizations to provide training, access to clinical facilities, patients, including the use of resources, both at the inpatient and outpatient levels in accordance with the OP ( *until 01.01.24*).

4) The Department of Education to develop a document that allows for the examination of the EP ( *until 09/01/23*).

5) The Department of Education needs to make changes to the Academic Policy, SOP "Algorithm for organizing postgraduate education in residency on the basis of the BMC UDP RK" KOP / SQE-8.1. for the development of external expertise with the participation of the public and the academic community in all structural units that ensure the implementation and evaluation of the EP ( *until 09/01/23*).

6) The hospital management to ensure the training of residents in other educational institutions of the appropriate level with the offset of educational loans for the 2023-2024 academic year ( *until 01/01/24*).

7) For 2024, the hospital management plan to allocate financial resources to promote regional or international exchange of employees and students in accordance with the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated April 20, 2011 No. 152 "On approval of the Rules for organizing the educational process on credit technology of education in organizations of higher and (or) postgraduate education" ( *until 01.01.24*).

**Standard "Evaluation of the educational program"**

1) The hospital management to ensure the introduction of the QMS into the educational process ( *until 01.01.24*).

2) The Department of Education to develop a standard operating procedure (SOP) for regular monitoring of the EP in accordance with the TUP and PMM, with a description of the identified problems and shortcomings, as well as ways to solve them ( *until 01.01.24*).

3) The hospital management should ensure that external reviewers and experts have access to the results of the evaluation of the EP, taking into account the results of the feedback ( *until 01.01.24*).

**Standard "Management and Administration"**

1) The hospital management develop and implement a policy on the periodic evaluation of academic leadership in relation to the achievement of its mission and the final learning outcomes ( *until 12/31/2023*).

2) Hospital management to review the administrative staff and the staffing of the PMA in order to properly manage and allocate resources.

3) The hospital management, when forming the NCC, include at least 30% of external stakeholders, representatives of other healthcare organizations, representatives of the Health Department and professional associations in the commission when discussing and approving postgraduate medical education programs ( *until 09/01/2023* ).

4) The hospital management should allocate resources for advanced training in the framework of the pedagogical activities of employees ( *until 09/01/2023*).

5) The management of the Hospital to develop and implement an internal quality management system for the EP, including a regular check of the quality of education ( *until 01/01/2024*).

**(IX) RECOMMENDATION TO THE ACCREDITATION BOARD**

The members of the EEC came to the unanimous opinion that the educational programs 7R01102 "Medical Genetics" and 7R01105 "Adult Oncology", implemented by the RSE "Hospital of the Medical Center of the Administration of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan" on REM, are recommended for accreditation for a period of 1 year.

**Annex 1. Evaluation table "PARAMETERS OF SPECIALIZED PROFILE"**

**Annex 1.1. 7R01102 "Medical Genetics"**

No. P\P	No. P\P	Crit No.	CRITERIA FOR EVALUATION	Position OO			
				strong	Satisfactory	Assumes improvement	Unsatisfactory
<b>Standard 1 "MISSION AND OUTCOMES OF LEARNING"</b>							
<b>1.1 Mission definition</b>							
The educational organization <b>should:</b>							
1	1	1.1.1.	define the mission of the EP of postgraduate medical education and communicate to stakeholders and the health sector		+		
2	2	1.1.2.	define the mission based on the needs of society in matters of health, the needs of the medical care system, and other aspects of social responsibility			+	
3	3	1.1.3.	define a training program <b>containing</b> theoretical and practical components with an emphasis on the latter, the result of which will be a doctor: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ competent in the chosen field of medicine, including good medical practice,</li> <li>▪ able to work independently at a high professional level,</li> <li>▪ able to work in a professional and interprofessional team,</li> <li>▪ willing to learn throughout life and to participate in continuing medical education/professional development.</li> <li>▪ capable of providing appropriate patient care that is appropriate, effective, compassionate and safe in solving health problems and in health promotion, including a patient-centered and systems approach</li> </ul>		+		
4	4	1.1.4.	provide appropriate working conditions for students to maintain their health		+		
Educational organizations <b>should:</b>							
5	5	1.1.5.	ensure that the mission includes the development of innovations in the educational process that allow the development of broader and more specialized competencies than those defined within the core competencies required; development of the scientific competence of students so that doctors can conduct research work in the chosen field of medicine; opportunities for doctors to become active participants in addressing issues related to the social determinants of health			+	
<b>1.2 Professionalism and professional autonomy</b>							
The educational organization <b>should:</b>							
6	6	1.2.1.	include professionalism in physician training and ensure that training promotes professional autonomy to enable future action in the best interests of the patient and society		+		
Educational organizations <b>should:</b>							
7	7	1.2.2.	ensure cooperation with the government and other partners, while maintaining appropriate independence from them			+	
<b>1.3. Learning Outcomes</b>							
The educational organization <b>should:</b>							
8	8	1.3.1.	define the expected learning outcomes that trainees should achieve upon		+		

			completion of their studies in relation to their achievements at the postgraduate level in terms of knowledge, skills and behavior/attitudes, the appropriate basis for a future career in the chosen field of medicine, their future roles in the health sector, commitment and skills in the implementation of continuing education education, the health needs of society, the needs of the health care system and other aspects of social responsibility, professional behavior				
9	9	1.3.2.	define and publish the expected learning outcomes: general and specialty-specific, which are required to be achieved by students			+	
10	10	1.3.3.	ensure the proper behavior of students in relation to classmates, teachers, medical staff, patients and their relatives		+		
<b>Educational organizations should:</b>							
elev en	eleve n	1.3.4.	define expected learning outcomes based on the results obtained at the level of basic medical education to ensure the interaction between basic and postgraduate medical education		+		
<b>1.4. Participation in the formulation of the mission and learning outcomes</b>							
<b>The educational organization should:</b>							
12	12	1.4.1.	ensure the participation of key stakeholders in the formulation of the mission and expected learning outcomes			+	
<b>Educational organizations should:</b>							
13	13	1.4.2.	ensure that the stated mission and expected learning outcomes are based on the opinions/suggestions of other stakeholders			+	
				<b>Total</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>6</b>	
<b>Standard 2. EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM</b>							
<b>2.1. Teaching approach</b>							
<b>The educational organization should:</b>							
14	1	2.1.1.	define a learning approach based on the expected learning outcomes and official qualification certificates provided as the basis for official recognition of a specialist in the chosen field of medicine at the national and international level, in accordance with the descriptors of the National and European Qualifications Framework			+	
15	2	2.1.2.	define an approach to learning based on the results of basic medical education, systematically and transparently, using practice-oriented learning that includes and supports the personal participation of the student in the provision of medical care and responsibility for the patient, their own educational process and clinical practice		+		
16	3	2.1.3.	use suitable teaching methods that integrate practical and theoretical components, guide the learner through mentoring and regular assessment and feedback, including commitment to ethical requirements and standards			+	
17	4	2.1.4.	ensure that the educational program is implemented in accordance with the principles of equality inform students about the program, the rights and obligations of students		+		
<b>Educational organizations should:</b>							
18	5	2.1.5.	increase the degree of self-responsibility of the student as knowledge, skills, and experience are improved		+		
19	6	2.1.6.	identify gender, cultural and religious backgrounds and prepare the learner appropriately to interact with the specified patient population		+		
<b>2.2. scientific method</b>							
<b>The educational organization should:</b>							
20	7	2.2.1.	throughout the entire curriculum to instill in students the principles of scientific methodology, including methods of analytical and critical thinking; research methods in healthcare and evidence-based medicine			+	
<b>Educational organizations should:</b>							
21	8	2.2.2.	include in the EP a critical assessment of literature and scientific data, adapt the content based on scientific developments in medicine, change the EP, taking into account the achievements of scientific, technological, medical and pharmaceutical developments, current and expected needs of society and the healthcare system			+	
<b>2.3 Training content</b>							
<b>The educational organization should:</b>							
22	9	2.3.1.	include in the learning process the practice and theory of basic biomedical,		+		

			clinical, behavioral, social sciences and preventive medicine, clinical decision, communication skills, medical ethics, public health, medical jurisprudence and forensic science, management disciplines, patient safety, physician protection, complementary medicine				
23	10	2.3.2.	organize an educational program with appropriate attention to patient safety and independence		+		
<b>Educational organizations should:</b>							
24	eleven	2.3.3.	adjust and make changes to the EP to ensure the development of knowledge, skills and thinking of the various roles of the graduate, the compliance of the content of the EP with changing conditions and the needs of society and the healthcare system		+		
<b>2.4. The structure of the educational program, content and duration</b>							
<b>The educational organization should:</b>							
25	12	2.4.1.	give a description of the content, scope and sequence of courses and duration of the EP; define mandatory and optional components; combine practice and theory in the learning process; ensure compliance with national legislation to be presented and described; ensure adequate impact on how local, national or regional health systems address the health problems and health care needs of the population		+		
<b>Educational organizations should:</b>							
26	13	2.4.2.	take into account the learning outcomes of the previous basic medical education related to the chosen field of medicine		+		
27	14	2.4.3.	determine the requirements for a graduate to fulfill various roles in the healthcare system		+		
<b>2.5. Organization of training</b>							
<b>The educational organization should:</b>							
28	15	2.5.1.	define responsibilities and authorities for organizing, coordinating, managing and evaluating the individual learning environment and learning process		+		
29	16	2.5.2.	include in the planning and development of the educational program due representation from the teaching staff, students and other key and relevant stakeholders			+	
thirty	17	2.5.3.	plan training in such a way as to familiarize the student with a wide range of existing practical experience in the chosen field of medicine			+	
<b>Educational organizations should:</b>							
31	18	2.5.4.	guarantee a variety of places of study, coordinate multiple places of study to obtain appropriate access to different aspects of the chosen field of medicine			+	
<b>2.6. Linking education, medical practice and the healthcare system</b>							
<b>The educational organization should:</b>							
32	19	2.6.1.	describe and observe the integration between theoretical training and professional development, develop learning through medical practice and professional development; integrate education and medical practice through patient care; ensure that training complements and addresses health care needs		+		
<b>Educational organizations should:</b>							
33	20	2.6.2.	effectively use the capacity of the health care system to provide health care for learning purposes		+		
					<b>Total</b>	<b>13</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>Standard 3. STUDENT ASSESSMENT POLICY</b>							
<b>3.1. Assessment Methods</b>							
<b>The educational organization should:</b>							
34	1	3.1.1.	develop and implement a policy of attestation/assessment of students; define, approve and publish the principles, goals, methods and practices of assessing students, including, if necessary, with verification by specialists			+	
35	2	3.1.2.	ensure that assessment procedures cover knowledge, skills, attitudes and professional conduct		+		
36	3	3.1.3.	use a complementary set of assessment methods and formats according to their "assessment performance", including the use of multiple assessors and multiple assessment methods			+	
37	4	3.1.4.	define criteria for taking exams or other types of assessment, including the number of retakes allowed		+		
38	5	3.1.5.	assess and document the reliability, validity and fairness of assessment methods		+		

39	6	3.1.6.	use a fair or due process appeal system			+	
<b>Educational organizations should:</b>							
40	7	3.1.7.	implement new assessment methods as needed, document the different types and stages of training and assessment			+	
41	8	3.1.8.	encourage the process of peer review of assessment methods by external experts			+	
<b>3.2. Relationship between assessment and learning</b>							
<b>The educational organization should:</b>							
42	9	3.2.1.	use assessment principles, methods and practices that are consistent with expected outcomes and learning methods; ensure that learners achieve expected learning outcomes; contribute to the learning of students; ensure the adequacy and relevance of training; provide timely, specific, constructive and objective feedback to trainees based on the assessment of their performance			+	
<b>Educational organizations should:</b>							
43	10	3.2.2.	use assessment principles, methods and practices that encourage integrated learning, encourage student involvement in clinical practice, promote interprofessional training			+	
				<b>Total</b>		<b>5</b>	<b>5</b>
<b>Standard 4. STUDENTS</b>							
<b>4.1. Selection and admission policy</b>							
<b>The educational organization should:</b>							
44	1	4.1.1.	define and implement an admissions policy based on the mission of the organization and including a clearly defined statement of the student selection process			+	
45	2	4.1.2.	ensure a balance between learning opportunities and student acceptance; formulate and implement policies / rules for the selection of students according to established criteria; have and implement the practice of accepting students with disabilities in accordance with the current laws and regulations of the country; ensure a high level of knowledge and skills in the field of basic biomedical sciences, achieved at the previous level of basic medical education; ensure transparency and fairness of the selection procedure			+	
46	3	4.1.3.	have a policy and implement the practice of transferring students from other educational organizations			+	
<b>Educational organizations should:</b>							
47	4	4.1.4.	take into account in the selection procedure the specific opportunities of potential trainees to improve the quality of education in the chosen field of medicine; guarantee the transparency of the selection procedure; provide for an appeal mechanism for admission decisions			+	
48	5	4.1.5.	involve student associations and other stakeholders in the policy development and selection process by periodically reviewing the admissions policy and rules				+
<b>4.2. Number of students</b>							
<b>The educational organization should:</b>							
49	6	4.2.1.	determine the number of accepted students in accordance with: clinical / practical training opportunities, the ability of the BO to conduct appropriate control and monitoring of the educational process, logistical and other available resources information about the health needs of society and society			+	
<b>Educational organizations should:</b>							
50	7	4.2.2.	periodically review the number and cohort of enrolled students in consultation with relevant stakeholders responsible for health workforce planning and development			+	
51	8	4.2.3.	adapt the number of potential trainees, taking into account available information on the number of qualified candidates and information on national and international labor markets; adjust the number of potential trainees, taking into account the inherent unpredictability of the exact workforce needs of specialists in various fields of medicine				+
<b>4.3. Advice and support for students</b>							
<b>The educational organization should:</b>							
52	9	4.3.1.	provide students with access to the system of academic counseling for students				+
53	10	4.3.2.	base academic advising on monitoring and controlling student progress,			+	

			including analysis of unintentional incidents				
54	eleven	4.3.3.	offer a support program to learners that addresses social, financial and personal needs			+	
55	12	4.3.4.	allocate resources for social and personal support of students; ensure confidentiality regarding advice and support			+	
56	13	4.3.5.	offer career guidance, professional career planning advice			+	
<b>Educational organizations should:</b>							
57	14	4.3.6.	provide counseling to support in the event of a professional crisis; involve organizations / associations of students in solving problem situations of students			+	
<b>4.4. Student representation</b>							
<b>The educational organization should:</b>							
58	15	4.4.1.	define and implement a policy of student representation and their respective participation in the development of the mission and intended learning outcomes, in the development of the EP, the planning of learning conditions for students, the assessment and management of the EP			+	
<b>Educational organizations should:</b>							
59	16	4.4.2.	encourage the representation of students to participate in decision-making on educational processes, conditions and rules of education			+	
<b>4.5 Working conditions</b>							
<b>The educational organization should:</b>							
60	17	4.5.1.	implement a training program with the availability of appropriate remuneration / scholarships or other ways of financing and motivating students			+	
61	18	4.5.2.	ensure that trainees have access to patient care, including doctor on call where appropriate			+	
62	19	4.5.3.	define and publish working conditions and responsibilities of students			+	
63	20	4.5.4.	provide for interruption of studies caused by pregnancy (including maternity/paternity leave, parental leave), illness, military service or secondment for additional training			+	
<b>Educational organizations should:</b>							
64	21	4.5.5.	make sure that the work components in the work of the learner do not dominate the educational component / training			+	
65	22	4.5.6.	take into account the needs of patients, the continuity of medical care and the educational needs of students, when drawing up a plan and schedule of work, including work on call			+	
66	23	4.5.7.	allow distance learning under special circumstances, in accordance with the individual educational trajectory and work experience of the student, providing evidence that the overall duration and quality of distance learning is not less than face-to-face education			+	
67	24	4.5.8.	provide for the possibility of continuing education under the conditions of interruptions of studies related to pregnancy (including maternity / paternity leave), illness, military service or secondment			+	
<b>Total</b>						<b>13</b>	<b>eleven</b>
<b>Standard 5. ACADEMIC STAFF/TEACHERS</b>							
<b>5.1. Recruitment and selection policy</b>							
<b>The educational organization should develop and implement a staff selection and recruitment policy that :</b>							
68	1	5.1.1.	takes into account the necessary criteria for employment with the condition of examination of documents; contains criteria for scientific, pedagogical and clinical/professional merit of applicants, including a proper balance between pedagogical, scientific and professional qualifications			+	
69	2	5.1.2.	determines the responsibilities of teachers, including the balance between teaching, research and other functions, taking into account the mission of the EP, the needs of the education system and the needs of the healthcare system			+	
<b>Educational organizations should, when developing and implementing personnel policy :</b>							
70	3	5.1.3.	ensure that teachers have practical experience in the relevant field, are recognized specialists in the relevant field, that teachers of subspecialties, if necessary, are approved for appropriate periods of study depending on their qualifications			+	
71	4	5.1.4.	encourage participation in programs to develop their educational potential, use			+	

			the expertise of educational activities to increase the potential of the academic staff, determine the level of remuneration for participation in postgraduate education				
<b>5.2. Personnel activity and development policy</b>							
The educational organization <b>should</b> develop and implement a policy of activity and development of personnel, which is aimed at :							
72	5	5.2.1.	Ensuring that educators have enough time for teaching, advising and self-development		+		
73	6	5.2.2.	existence of a structure responsible for the development of the academic staff, ensuring periodic evaluation of the academic staff		+		
Educational organizations <b>should</b> :							
74	7	5.2.3.	develop and implement a policy to support the academic staff on issues of pedagogy and advanced training for further professional development; evaluate and recognize the scientific and academic achievements of teachers		+		
75	8	5.2.4.	take into account the “teacher-student” ratio depending on the various components of the EP, taking into account the features that ensure close personal interaction and monitoring of students		+		
<b>Total</b>					<b>6</b>	<b>2</b>	
<b>Standard 6. EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES</b>							
<b>6.1. Material and technical base</b>							
The educational organization <b>should</b> :							
76	1	6.1.1.	provide students with sufficient material and technical base to ensure adequate implementation of the EP, space and opportunities for practical and theoretical research; access to up-to-date professional literature; adequate information and communication technologies; modern equipment for teaching practical methods; safe learning environment			+	
Educational organizations <b>should</b> :							
77	2	6.1.2.	improve the learning environment by regularly updating, expanding and strengthening the material and technical base and equipment to maintain the appropriate quality of education at the postgraduate level		+		
<b>6.2. Educational environment</b>							
The educational organization <b>should</b> :							
78	3	6.2.1.	provide the necessary resources for students to acquire adequate practical experience, including the selection and approval of the clinical base as an educational environment; having access to sufficient clinical/practical facilities/bases to provide training; sufficient number and variety of patients; appropriate variety of clinical cases to achieve the goals and objectives of the training, including the use of resources at both inpatient and outpatient levels to provide the trainee with a broad experience in the chosen field of medicine			+	
Educational organizations <b>should</b> :							
79	4	6.2.2.	when choosing a training environment, ensure the number of patients and the corresponding variety of clinical cases, allowing for clinical experience in all aspects of the chosen specialty, including training in the organization and management of health care and disease prevention; training at the university clinic, as well as training in other relevant clinics / institutions and community facilities / locations, if necessary			+	
<b>6.3. Information Technology</b>							
The educational organization <b>should</b> :							
80	5	6.3.1.	provide access to information and communication technologies and other electronic media		+		
81	6	6.3.2.	effectively and ethically use information and communication technologies in the EP		+		
Educational organizations <b>should</b> :							
82	7	6.3.3.	provide teachers and students with opportunities to use information and communication technologies: for self-study; communication with colleagues; access to health information resources and related patient data; supervision of patients and work in the health care system to provide medical care		+		
<b>6.4 Clinical teams</b>							
The educational organization <b>should</b> :							
83	8	6.4.1.	provide students with the opportunity to gain experience working in a team with colleagues and other health professionals		+		
Educational organizations <b>should</b> :							



84	9	6.4.2.	encourage learning in a multidisciplinary/interprofessional team, promote the development of the ability to guide and train other health professionals		+		
<b>6.5. Medical and scientific research</b>							
The educational organization <b>should:</b>							
85	10	6.5.1.	guarantee and ensure the conditions for the acquisition by students of knowledge in the field of research methodology and the ability to apply scientific foundations and research methods in the chosen field of medicine, ensure integration and balance between teaching and research			+	
Educational organizations <b>should:</b>							
86	eleven	6.5.2.	encourage students to participate in medical research on the state and quality of public health and the health system, provide sufficient time within the educational program for students to conduct research, provide access to research facilities and activities in places of study		+		
<b>6.6. Expertise in the field of education</b>							
The educational organization <b>should:</b>							
87	12	6.6.1.	define and implement a policy for the use of educational expertise at the planning, implementation and evaluation stage of the program			+	
Educational organizations <b>should:</b>							
88	13	6.6.2.	to pay attention to the development of expertise in the evaluation of education and research in medical education as a discipline, to promote the aspiration and interest of employees in conducting research in medical education		+		
<b>6.7. Education in alternative conditions and exchange in the field of education</b>							
The educational organization <b>should:</b>							
89	14	6.7.1.	define and implement a policy of accessibility of individual learning opportunities in other educational institutions of the appropriate level within or outside the country, transfer and offset of educational credits and learning outcomes			+	
Educational organizations <b>should:</b>							
90	15	6.7.2.	promote regional and international exchange of staff (academic, administrative and teaching staff) and students, providing appropriate resources; create links with relevant national and international bodies in order to exchange and mutually recognize elements of training			+	
				<b>Total</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>7</b>	
<b>Standard 7. EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM</b>							
<b>7.1. Program monitoring and evaluation mechanisms</b>							
The educational organization <b>should:</b>							
91	1	7.1.1.	have regulated procedures for monitoring, periodic evaluation of the EP, learning outcomes, progress and academic performance of students with the involvement of key stakeholders			+	
92	2	7.1.2.	regularly monitor the EP, assess the relationship between personnel policy and needs in the field of education and health care, evaluate the educational process, student assessment methods, student progress, academic staff qualifications, evaluate and analyze identified problems, make sure that the relevant assessment results affect the quality			+	
Educational organizations <b>should:</b>							
93	3	7.1.3.	make the assessment process and results transparent to all stakeholders		+		
<b>7.2. Feedback from teacher and student</b>							
The educational organization <b>should:</b>							
94	4	7.2.1.	systematically conduct, analyze and respond to feedback from teachers and students		+		
Educational organizations <b>should:</b>							
95	5	7.2.2.	actively involve faculty and students in planning program evaluation and using evaluation results to improve the program		+		
<b>7.3 Learning outcomes for qualified professionals</b>							
The educational organization <b>should:</b>							
96	6	7.3.1.	constantly monitor qualified specialists; provide feedback on the clinical practice of qualified professionals from employers; establish and apply a mechanism to evaluate the program using the data collected from the results of the clinical practice of qualified professionals		+		
Educational organizations <b>should:</b>							
97	7	7.3.2.	inform the structural units responsible for the selection of students, the		+		

			development and planning of the educational program, and counseling of students about the results of the assessment of the clinical practice of students				
<b>7.4. Stakeholder Engagement</b>							
The educational organization <b>should:</b>							
98	8	7.4.1.	involve key stakeholders in monitoring and evaluation of the EP		+		
Educational organizations <b>should:</b>							
99	9	7.4.2.	provide access to interested parties to the results of the evaluation of the course and the educational program; take into account the results of feedback from qualified specialists; take into account the results of feedback on the EP			+	
				<b>Total</b>		<b>6</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>Standard 8. MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION</b>							
<b>8.1. Control</b>							
The educational organization <b>should:</b>							
100	1	8.1.1.	document the completion of training by issuing degrees, diplomas, certificates or other formal qualifications; provide evidence of formal qualifications provided as a basis for the official recognition of a specialist in the chosen field of medicine at the national and international level		+		
101	2	8.1.2.	be responsible for quality assurance processes		+		
Educational organizations <b>should:</b>							
102	3	8.1.3.	ensure that the EP meets the needs of society in terms of health and the health care system, ensure the transparency of the work of management structures and their decisions		+		
<b>8.2. Academic leadership</b>							
The educational organization <b>should:</b>							
103	4	8.2.1.	take responsibility for the leadership/academic leadership and organization of postgraduate medical education.		+		
Educational organizations <b>should:</b>							
104	5	8.2.2.	periodically evaluate the academic leadership regarding the achievement of the mission of the EP and the expected learning outcomes			+	
<b>8.3. Training budget and resource allocation</b>							
The educational organization <b>should:</b>							
105	6	8.3.1.	have a clear distribution of responsibility and authority to provide resources for the educational program, including the target budget for training		+		
106	7	8.3.2.	allocate the resources necessary for the implementation of the EP and distribute educational resources in accordance with their needs			+	
Educational organizations <b>should:</b>							
107	8	8.3.3.	manage the budget in such a way as to ensure the functional responsibilities of the academic staff and students, the introduction of innovations in the program			+	
<b>8.4. Administrative staff and management</b>							
The educational organization <b>should:</b>							
108	9	8.4.1.	have an appropriate administrative staff, including their number and composition in accordance with qualifications, to ensure the implementation of the OP and related activities; ensure proper management and allocation of resources		+		
Educational organizations <b>should:</b>							
109	10	8.4.2.	develop and implement an internal management quality assurance program, including regular reviews and submission by the academic management of the EP for regular review to achieve high quality			+	
<b>8.5. Requirements and rules</b>							
The educational organization <b>should:</b>							
110	eleven	8.5.1.	comply with national legislation regarding the number and types of recognized medical specialties for which approved OPs are being developed		+		
Educational organizations <b>should:</b>							
111	12	8.5.2.	approve postgraduate medical education programs in collaboration with all stakeholders			+	
<b>8.6. Public information</b>							
The educational organization <b>should:</b>							
112	13	8.6.1.	publish on the official website of the educational organization and in the media complete and reliable information about the study program and its achievements		+		

	<b>Total</b>		<b>8</b>	<b>5</b>	
	<b>TOTAL TOTAL</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>66</b>	<b>46</b>	<b>0</b>



**Annex 1.2. 7R01105 Adult Oncology**

No. P\P	No. P\P	Crit No.	CRITERIA FOR EVALUATION	Position OO			
				strong	Satisfactory	Assumes improvement	Unsatisfactory
<b>Standard 1 "MISSION AND OUTCOMES OF LEARNING"</b>							
<b>1.1 Mission definition</b>							
The educational organization <b>should:</b>							
1	1	1.1.1.	define the mission of the EP of postgraduate medical education and communicate to stakeholders and the health sector		+		
2	2	1.1.2.	define the mission based on the needs of society in matters of health, the needs of the medical care system, and other aspects of social responsibility		+		
3	3	1.1.3.	define a training program <b>containing</b> theoretical and practical components with an emphasis on the latter, the result of which will be a doctor: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ competent in the chosen field of medicine, including good medical practice,</li> <li>▪ able to work independently at a high professional level,</li> <li>▪ able to work in a professional and interprofessional team,</li> <li>▪ willing to learn throughout life and to participate in continuing medical education/professional development.</li> <li>▪ capable of providing appropriate patient care that is appropriate, effective, compassionate and safe in solving health problems and in health promotion, including a patient-centered and systems approach</li> </ul>		+		
4	4	1.1.4.	provide appropriate working conditions for students to maintain their health		+		
Educational organizations <b>should:</b>							
5	5	1.1.5.	ensure that the mission includes the development of innovations in the educational process that allow the development of broader and more specialized competencies than those defined within the core competencies required; development of the scientific competence of students so that doctors can conduct research work in the chosen field of medicine; opportunities for doctors to become active participants in addressing issues related to the social determinants of health		+		
<b>1.2 Professionalism and professional autonomy</b>							
The educational organization <b>should:</b>							
6	6	1.2.1.	include professionalism in physician training and ensure that training promotes professional autonomy to enable future action in the best interests of the patient and society		+		
Educational organizations <b>should:</b>							
7	7	1.2.2.	ensure cooperation with the government and other partners, while maintaining appropriate independence from them			+	
<b>1.3. Learning Outcomes</b>							
The educational organization <b>should:</b>							
8	8	1.3.1.	define the expected learning outcomes that trainees should achieve upon completion of their studies in relation to their achievements at the postgraduate level in terms of knowledge, skills and behavior/attitudes, the appropriate basis for a future career in the chosen field of medicine, their future roles in the health sector, commitment and skills in the implementation of continuing education education, the health needs of society, the needs of the health care system and other aspects of social		+		

				responsibility, professional behavior				
9	9		1.3.2.	define and publish the expected learning outcomes: general and specialty-specific, which are required to be achieved by students		+		
10	10		1.3.3.	ensure the proper behavior of students in relation to classmates, teachers, medical staff, patients and their relatives		+		
Educational organizations <b>should:</b>								
eleven	eleven		1.3.4.	define expected learning outcomes based on the results obtained at the level of basic medical education to ensure the interaction between basic and postgraduate medical education		+		
<b>1.4. Participation in the formulation of the mission and learning outcomes</b>								
The educational organization <b>should:</b>								
12	12		1.4.1.	ensure the participation of key stakeholders in the formulation of the mission and expected learning outcomes			+	
Educational organizations <b>should:</b>								
13	13		1.4.2.	ensure that the stated mission and expected learning outcomes are based on the opinions/suggestions of other stakeholders			+	
					<b>Total 13</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>Standard 2. EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM</b>								
<b>2.1. Teaching approach</b>								
The educational organization <b>should:</b>								
14	1		2.1.1.	define a learning approach based on the expected learning outcomes and official qualification certificates provided as the basis for official recognition of a specialist in the chosen field of medicine at the national and international level, in accordance with the descriptors of the National and European Qualifications Framework		+		
15	2		2.1.2.	define an approach to learning based on the results of basic medical education, systematically and transparently, using practice-oriented learning that includes and supports the personal participation of the student in the provision of medical care and responsibility for the patient, their own educational process and clinical practice		+		
16	3		2.1.3.	use suitable teaching methods that integrate practical and theoretical components, guide the learner through mentoring and regular assessment and feedback, including commitment to ethical requirements and standards			+	
17	4		2.1.4.	ensure that the educational program is implemented in accordance with the principles of equality, inform students about the program, the rights and obligations of students		+		
Educational organizations <b>should:</b>								
18	5		2.1.5.	increase the degree of self-responsibility of the student as knowledge, skills, and experience are improved		+		
19	6		2.1.6.	identify gender, cultural and religious backgrounds and prepare the learner appropriately to interact with the specified patient population		+		
<b>2.2. scientific method</b>								
The educational organization <b>should:</b>								
20	7		2.2.1.	throughout the entire curriculum to instill in students the principles of scientific methodology, including methods of analytical and critical thinking; research methods in healthcare and evidence-based medicine			+	
Educational organizations <b>should:</b>								
21	8		2.2.2.	include in the EP a critical assessment of literature and scientific data, adapt the content based on scientific developments in medicine, change the EP, taking into account the achievements of scientific, technological, medical and pharmaceutical developments, current and expected needs of society and the healthcare system			+	
<b>2.3 Training content</b>								
The educational organization <b>should:</b>								

22	9		2.3.1.	include in the learning process the practice and theory of basic biomedical, clinical, behavioral, social sciences and preventive medicine, clinical decision, communication skills, medical ethics, public health, medical jurisprudence and forensic science, management disciplines, patient safety, physician protection, complementary medicine		+		
23	10		2.3.2.	organize an educational program with appropriate attention to patient safety and independence		+		
Educational organizations <b>should:</b>								
24	eleven		2.3.3.	adjust and make changes to the EP to ensure the development of knowledge, skills and thinking of the various roles of the graduate, the compliance of the content of the EP with changing conditions and the needs of society and the healthcare system		+		
<b>2.4. The structure of the educational program, content and duration</b>								
The educational organization <b>should:</b>								
25	12		2.4.1.	give a description of the content, scope and sequence of courses and duration of the EP; define mandatory and optional components; combine practice and theory in the learning process; ensure compliance with national legislation to be presented and described; ensure adequate impact on how local, national or regional health systems address the health problems and health care needs of the population		+		
Educational organizations <b>should:</b>								
26	13		2.4.2.	take into account the learning outcomes of the previous basic medical education related to the chosen field of medicine		+		
27	14		2.4.3.	determine the requirements for a graduate to fulfill various roles in the healthcare system		+		
<b>2.5. Organization of training</b>								
The educational organization <b>should:</b>								
28	15		2.5.1.	define responsibilities and authorities for organizing, coordinating, managing and evaluating the individual learning environment and learning process		+		
29	16		2.5.2.	include in the planning and development of the educational program due representation from the teaching staff, students and other key and relevant stakeholders			+	
thirty	17		2.5.3.	plan training in such a way as to familiarize the student with a wide range of existing practical experience in the chosen field of medicine			+	
Educational organizations <b>should:</b>								
31	18		2.5.4.	guarantee a variety of places of study, coordinate multiple places of study to obtain appropriate access to different aspects of the chosen field of medicine			+	
<b>2.6. Linking education, medical practice and the healthcare system</b>								
The educational organization <b>should:</b>								
32	19		2.6.1.	describe and observe the integration between theoretical training and professional development, develop learning through medical practice and professional development; integrate education and medical practice through patient care; ensure that training complements and addresses health care needs		+		
Educational organizations <b>should:</b>								
33	20		2.6.2.	effectively use the capacity of the health care system to provide health care for learning purposes		+		
<b>Total 20</b>						<b>14</b>	<b>6</b>	
<b>Standard 3. STUDENT ASSESSMENT POLICY</b>								
<b>3.1. Assessment Methods</b>								
The educational organization <b>should:</b>								
34	1		3.1.1.	develop and implement a policy of attestation/assessment of students; define, approve and publish the principles, goals, methods and practices of assessing students, including, if necessary, with verification by specialists			+	
35	2		3.1.2.	ensure that assessment procedures cover knowledge, skills,		+		

				attitudes and professional conduct					
36	3		3.1.3.	use a complementary set of assessment methods and formats according to their "assessment performance", including the use of multiple assessors and multiple assessment methods			+		
37	4		3.1.4.	define criteria for taking exams or other types of assessment, including the number of retakes allowed			+		
38	5		3.1.5.	assess and document the reliability, validity and fairness of assessment methods			+		
39	6		3.1.6.	use a fair or due process appeal system			+		
Educational organizations <b>should:</b>									
40	7		3.1.7.	implement new assessment methods as needed, document the different types and stages of training and assessment			+		
41	8		3.1.8.	encourage the process of peer review of assessment methods by external experts			+		
<b>3.2. Relationship between assessment and learning</b>									
The educational organization <b>should:</b>									
42	9		3.2.1.	use assessment principles, methods and practices that are consistent with expected outcomes and learning methods; ensure that learners achieve expected learning outcomes; contribute to the learning of students; ensure the adequacy and relevance of training; provide timely, specific, constructive and objective feedback to trainees based on the assessment of their performance			+		
Educational organizations <b>should:</b>									
43	10		3.2.2.	use assessment principles, methods and practices that encourage integrated learning, encourage student involvement in clinical practice, promote interprofessional training			+		
					<b>Total 10</b>		<b>5</b>	<b>5</b>	
<b>Standard 4. STUDENTS</b>									
<b>4.1. Selection and admission policy</b>									
The educational organization <b>should:</b>									
44	1		4.1.1.	define and implement an admissions policy based on the mission of the organization and including a clearly defined statement of the student selection process			+		
45	2		4.1.2.	ensure a balance between learning opportunities and student acceptance; formulate and implement policies / rules for the selection of students according to established criteria; have and implement the practice of accepting students with disabilities in accordance with the current laws and regulations of the country; ensure a high level of knowledge and skills in the field of basic biomedical sciences, achieved at the previous level of basic medical education; ensure transparency and fairness of the selection procedure			+		
46	3		4.1.3.	have a policy and implement the practice of transferring students from other educational organizations			+		
Educational organizations <b>should:</b>									
47	4		4.1.4.	take into account in the selection procedure the specific opportunities of potential trainees to improve the quality of education in the chosen field of medicine; guarantee the transparency of the selection procedure; provide for an appeal mechanism for admission decisions			+		
48	5		4.1.5.	involve student associations and other stakeholders in the policy development and selection process by periodically reviewing the admissions policy and rules			+		
<b>4.2. Number of students</b>									
The educational organization <b>should:</b>									
49	6		4.2.1.	determine the number of accepted students in accordance with: clinical / practical training opportunities, the ability of the BO to conduct appropriate control and monitoring of the educational process, logistical and other available resources information			+		

				about the health needs of society and society				
<b>Educational organizations should:</b>								
50	7		4.2.2.	periodically review the number and cohort of enrolled students in consultation with relevant stakeholders responsible for health workforce planning and development		+		
51	8		4.2.3.	adapt the number of potential trainees, taking into account available information on the number of qualified candidates and information on national and international labor markets; regulate the number of potential trainees, taking into account the inherent unpredictability of the exact workforce needs of specialists in various fields of medicine			+	
<b>4.3. Advice and support for students</b>								
<b>The educational organization should:</b>								
52	9		4.3.1.	provide students with access to the system of academic counseling for students			+	
53	10		4.3.2.	base academic advising on monitoring and controlling student progress, including analysis of unintentional incidents		+		
54	eleven		4.3.3.	offer a support program to learners that addresses social, financial and personal needs			+	
55	12		4.3.4.	allocate resources for social and personal support of students; ensure confidentiality regarding advice and support		+		
56	13		4.3.5.	offer career guidance, professional career planning advice		+		
<b>Educational organizations should:</b>								
57	14		4.3.6.	provide counseling to support in the event of a professional crisis; involve organizations / associations of students in solving problem situations of students			+	
<b>4.4. Student representation</b>								
<b>The educational organization should:</b>								
58	15		4.4.1.	define and implement a policy of student representation and their respective participation in the development of the mission and intended learning outcomes, in the development of the EP, the planning of learning conditions for students, the assessment and management of the EP			+	
<b>Educational organizations should:</b>								
59	16		4.4.2.	encourage the representation of students to participate in decision-making on educational processes, conditions and rules of education			+	
<b>4.5 Working conditions</b>								
<b>The educational organization should:</b>								
60	17		4.5.1.	implement a training program with the availability of appropriate remuneration / scholarships or other ways of financing and motivating students			+	
61	18		4.5.2.	ensure that trainees have access to patient care, including doctor on call where appropriate			+	
62	19		4.5.3.	define and publish working conditions and responsibilities of students		+		
63	20		4.5.4.	provide for interruption of studies caused by pregnancy (including maternity/paternity leave, parental leave), illness, military service or secondment for additional training		+		
<b>Educational organizations should:</b>								
64	21		4.5.5.	make sure that the work components in the work of the learner do not dominate the educational component / training		+		
65	22		4.5.6.	take into account the needs of patients, the continuity of medical care and the educational needs of students, when drawing up a plan and schedule of work, including work on call			+	
66	23		4.5.7.	allow distance learning under special circumstances, in accordance with the individual educational trajectory and work experience of the student, providing evidence that the overall duration and quality of distance learning is not less than face-to-face education		+		
67	24		4.5.8.	provide for the possibility of continuing education under the		+		



				conditions of interruptions of studies related to pregnancy (including maternity / paternity leave), illness, military service or secondment				
<b>Total 24</b>					<b>0</b>	<b>14</b>	<b>10</b>	
<b>Standard 5. ACADEMIC STAFF/TEACHERS</b>								
<b>5.1. Recruitment and selection policy</b>								
The educational organization <b>should</b> develop and implement a staff selection and recruitment policy that :								
68	1		5.1.1.	takes into account the necessary criteria for employment with the condition of examination of documents; contains criteria for scientific, pedagogical and clinical/professional merit of applicants, including a proper balance between pedagogical, scientific and professional qualifications		+		
69	2		5.1.2.	determines the responsibilities of teachers, including the balance between teaching, research and other functions, taking into account the mission of the EP, the needs of the education system and the needs of the healthcare system			+	
Educational organizations <b>should</b> , when developing and implementing personnel policy :								
70	3		5.1.3.	ensure that teachers have practical experience in the relevant field, are recognized specialists in the relevant field, that teachers of subspecialties, if necessary, are approved for appropriate periods of study depending on their qualifications		+		
71	4		5.1.4.	encourage participation in programs to develop their educational potential, use the expertise of educational activities to increase the potential of the academic staff, determine the level of remuneration for participation in postgraduate education			+	
<b>5.2. Personnel activity and development policy</b>								
The educational organization <b>should</b> develop and implement a policy of activity and development of personnel, which is aimed at :								
72	5		5.2.1.	Ensuring that educators have enough time for teaching, advising and self-development		+		
73	6		5.2.2.	existence of a structure responsible for the development of the academic staff, ensuring periodic evaluation of the academic staff		+		
Educational organizations <b>should</b> :								
74	7		5.2.3.	develop and implement a policy to support the academic staff on issues of pedagogy and advanced training for further professional development; evaluate and recognize the scientific and academic achievements of teachers		+		
75	8		5.2.4.	take into account the "teacher-student" ratio depending on the various components of the EP, taking into account the features that ensure close personal interaction and monitoring of students		+		
<b>Total 8</b>					<b>0</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>2</b>	
<b>Standard 6. EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES</b>								
<b>6.1. Material and technical base</b>								
The educational organization <b>should</b> :								
76	1		6.1.1.	provide students with sufficient material and technical base to ensure adequate implementation of the EP, space and opportunities for practical and theoretical research; access to up-to-date professional literature; adequate information and communication technologies; modern equipment for teaching practical methods; safe learning environment			+	
Educational organizations <b>should</b> :								
77	2		6.1.2.	improve the learning environment by regularly updating, expanding and strengthening the material and technical base and equipment to maintain the appropriate quality of education at the postgraduate level		+		
<b>6.2. Educational environment</b>								
The educational organization <b>should</b> :								
78	3		6.2.1.	provide the necessary resources for students to acquire adequate practical experience, including the selection and approval of the clinical base as an educational facilities environment; having access to sufficient clinical/practical facilities/bases to provide training;			+	

				sufficient number and variety of patients; appropriate variety of clinical cases to achieve the goals and objectives of the training, including the use of resources at both inpatient and outpatient levels to provide the trainee with a broad experience in the chosen field of medicine				
Educational organizations <b>should:</b>								
79	4		6.2.2.	when choosing a training environment, ensure the number of patients and the corresponding variety of clinical cases, allowing for clinical experience in all aspects of the chosen specialty, including training in the organization and management of health care and disease prevention; training at the university clinic, as well as training in other relevant clinics / institutions and community facilities / locations, if necessary			+	
<b>6.3. Information Technology</b>								
The educational organization <b>should:</b>								
80	5		6.3.1.	provide access to information and communication technologies and other electronic media			+	
81	6		6.3.2.	effectively and ethically use information and communication technologies in the EP			+	
Educational organizations <b>should:</b>								
82	7		6.3.3.	provide teachers and students with opportunities to use information and communication technologies: for self-study; communication with colleagues; access to health information resources and related patient data; supervision of patients and work in the health care system to provide medical care			+	
<b>6.4 Clinical teams</b>								
The educational organization <b>should:</b>								
83	8		6.4.1.	provide students with the opportunity to gain experience working in a team with colleagues and other health professionals			+	
Educational organizations <b>should:</b>								
84	9		6.4.2.	encourage learning in a multidisciplinary/interprofessional team, promote the development of the ability to guide and train other health professionals			+	
<b>6.5. Medical and scientific research</b>								
The educational organization <b>should:</b>								
85	10		6.5.1.	guarantee and ensure the conditions for the acquisition by students of knowledge in the field of research methodology and the ability to apply scientific foundations and research methods in the chosen field of medicine, ensure integration and balance between teaching and research			+	
Educational organizations <b>should:</b>								
86	eleven		6.5.2.	encourage students to participate in medical research on the state and quality of public health and the health system, provide sufficient time within the educational program for students to conduct research, provide access to research facilities and activities in places of study			+	
<b>6.6. Expertise in the field of education</b>								
The educational organization <b>should:</b>								
87	12		6.6.1.	define and implement a policy for the use of educational expertise at the planning, implementation and evaluation stage of the program			+	
Educational organizations <b>should:</b>								
88	13		6.6.2.	to pay attention to the development of expertise in the evaluation of education and research in medical education as a discipline, to promote the aspiration and interest of employees in conducting research in medical education			+	
<b>6.7. Education in alternative conditions and exchange in the field of education</b>								
The educational organization <b>should:</b>								
89	14		6.7.1.	define and implement a policy of accessibility of individual learning opportunities in other educational institutions of the appropriate level within or outside the country, transfer and offset			+	

				of educational credits and learning outcomes				
Educational organizations <b>should:</b>								
90	15		6.7.2.	promote regional and international exchange of staff (academic, administrative and teaching staff) and students, providing appropriate resources; create links with relevant national and international bodies in order to exchange and mutually recognize elements of training			+	
<b>Total 15</b>					<b>0</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>7</b>	
<b>Standard 7. EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM</b>								
<b>7.1. Program monitoring and evaluation mechanisms</b>								
The educational organization <b>should:</b>								
91	1		7.1.1.	have regulated procedures for monitoring, periodic evaluation of the EP, learning outcomes, progress and academic performance of students with the involvement of key stakeholders			+	
92	2		7.1.2.	regularly monitor the EP, assess the relationship between personnel policy and needs in the field of education and health care, evaluate the educational process, student assessment methods, student progress, academic staff qualifications, evaluate and analyze identified problems, make sure that the relevant assessment results affect the quality			+	
Educational organizations <b>should:</b>								
93	3		7.1.3.	make the assessment process and results transparent to all stakeholders			+	
<b>7.2. Feedback from teacher and student</b>								
The educational organization <b>should:</b>								
94	4		7.2.1.	systematically conduct, analyze and respond to feedback from teachers and students			+	
Educational organizations <b>should:</b>								
95	5		7.2.2.	actively involve faculty and students in planning program evaluation and using evaluation results to improve the program			+	
<b>7.3 Learning outcomes for qualified professionals</b>								
The educational organization <b>should:</b>								
96	6		7.3.1.	constantly monitor qualified specialists; provide feedback on the clinical practice of qualified professionals from employers; establish and apply a mechanism to evaluate the program using the data collected from the results of the clinical practice of qualified professionals			+	
Educational organizations <b>should:</b>								
97	7		7.3.2.	inform the structural units responsible for the selection of students, the development and planning of the educational program, and counseling of students about the results of the assessment of the clinical practice of students			+	
<b>7.4. Stakeholder Engagement</b>								
The educational organization <b>should:</b>								
98	8		7.4.1.	involve key stakeholders in monitoring and evaluation of the EP			+	
Educational organizations <b>should:</b>								
99	9		7.4.2.	provide access to interested parties to the results of the evaluation of the course and the educational program; take into account the results of feedback from qualified specialists; take into account the results of feedback on the EP			+	
<b>Total 9</b>					<b>6</b>	<b>3</b>		
<b>Standard 8. MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION</b>								
<b>8.1. Control</b>								
The educational organization <b>should:</b>								
100	1		8.1.1.	document the completion of training by issuing degrees, diplomas, certificates or other formal qualifications; provide evidence of formal qualifications provided as a basis for the official recognition of a specialist in the chosen field of medicine at the national and international level			+	
101	2		8.1.2.	be responsible for quality assurance processes			+	
Educational organizations <b>should:</b>								

102	3		8.1.3.	ensure that the EP meets the needs of society in terms of health and the health care system, ensure the transparency of the work of management structures and their decisions		+			
<b>8.2. Academic leadership</b>									
The educational organization <b>should:</b>									
103	4		8.2.1.	take responsibility for the leadership/academic leadership and organization of postgraduate medical education.		+			
Educational organizations <b>should:</b>									
104	5		8.2.2.	periodically evaluate the academic leadership regarding the achievement of the mission of the EP and the expected learning outcomes			+		
<b>8.3. Training budget and resource allocation</b>									
The educational organization <b>should:</b>									
105	6		8.3.1.	have a clear distribution of responsibility and authority to provide resources for the educational program, including the target budget for training		+			
106	7		8.3.2.	allocate the resources necessary for the implementation of the EP and distribute educational resources in accordance with their needs			+		
Educational organizations <b>should:</b>									
107	8		8.3.3.	manage the budget in such a way as to ensure the functional responsibilities of the academic staff and students, the introduction of innovations in the program			+		
<b>8.4. Administrative staff and management</b>									
The educational organization <b>should:</b>									
108	9		8.4.1.	have an appropriate administrative staff, including their number and composition in accordance with qualifications, to ensure the implementation of the OP and related activities; ensure proper management and allocation of resources		+			
Educational organizations <b>should:</b>									
109	10		8.4.2.	develop and implement an internal management quality assurance program, including regular reviews and submission by the academic management of the EP for regular review to achieve high quality			+		
<b>8.5. Requirements and rules</b>									
The educational organization <b>should:</b>									
110	eleven		8.5.1.	comply with national legislation regarding the number and types of recognized medical specialties for which approved OPs are being developed		+			
Educational organizations <b>should:</b>									
111	12		8.5.2.	approve postgraduate medical education programs in collaboration with all stakeholders			+		
<b>8.6. Public information</b>									
The educational organization <b>should:</b>									
112	13		8.6.1.	publish on the official website of the educational organization and in the media complete and reliable information about the study program and its achievements		+			
<b>Total 13</b>							<b>8</b>	<b>5</b>	
<b>TOTAL TOTAL 112</b>						<b>0</b>	<b>71</b>	<b>41</b>	<b>0</b>

**Annex 2. PROGRAM OF THE VISIT TO THE EDUCATIONAL INSTITUTION**



**БОЛЬНИЦА  
МЕДИЦИНСКОГО ЦЕНТРА  
УПРАВЛЕНИЯ ДЕЛАМИ ПРЕЗИДЕНТА  
РЕСПУБЛИКИ КАЗАХСТАН**



**АККРЕДИТЕУ ЖӘНЕ РЕЙТИНГТІҢ  
ТӘУЕЛСІЗ АГЕНТТІГІ  
НЕЗАВИСИМОЕ АГЕНТСТВО  
АККРЕДИТАЦИИ И РЕЙТИНГА  
INDEPENDENT AGENCY FOR  
ACCREDITATION AND RATING**

**AGREED**

**Director of the Republican State Enterprise "Hospital  
of the Medical Center of the Administration of the  
President of the Republic of Kazakhstan" at the REM**

\_\_\_\_\_ **Albaev R.K.**  
"\_\_\_" \_\_\_\_\_ 2023

**APPROVE**

**CEO  
NU "Independent agency  
accreditation and rating"**

\_\_\_\_\_ **Zhumagulova A.B.**  
"\_\_\_" \_\_\_\_\_ 2023

**VISIT PROGRAM  
EXTERNAL REVIEW COMMISSION OF THE INDEPENDENT AGENCY FOR ACCREDITATION AND RATING (IAAR)  
RSE "HOSPITAL OF MEDICAL CENTER FOR MANAGEMENT OF CASES  
OF THE PRESIDENT OF THE REPUBLIC OF KAZAKHSTAN" on REM  
(INTERNATIONAL PROGRAM ACCREDITATION FOR EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMS:  
7R01101 RADIOLOGY (specialized accreditation);  
7R01102 MEDICAL GENETICS (primary accreditation);  
7R01103 UROLOGY AND ANDROLOGY ADULTS, CHILDREN (primary accreditation);  
7R01104 CARDIOLOGY ADULTS, CHILDREN (primary accreditation);  
7R01105 ADULTS ONCOLOGY (primary accreditation);  
7R01106 OTORHINOLARYNGOLOGY ADULTS, CHILDREN (primary accreditation)).**

Date of the visit: June 06, 2023 - June 08, 2023

Astana

date and time	EEC work with target groups	Surname, name, patronymic and position of target group participants	Meeting point
<b>June 05, 2023</b>			
16.00-17.00	Preliminary meeting of the EEC (distribution of responsibility, discussion of key issues and visit program)	<i>External IAAR experts</i>	
<b>Day 1: June 06, 2023</b>			
10.00-10.20	Discussion of organizational issues with experts	<i>External IAAR experts</i>	L block, 6th floor, room 6.56
10.20-10.50	Meeting with the Director of the Hospital	PhD <b>Albaev Rustam Kuanyshbekovich</b>	F block, 3rd floor, small conference hall
10.50-11.30	Meeting with the Deputy Directors of the Hospital	Deputy directors for: - strategic development, science and education d.m.s. <b>Shanazarov Nasrulla Abdullaevich</b> - medical work d.m.s. <b>Karabaeva Raushan Zhumartovna</b> - outpatient care Ph.D. <b>Tuleuova Aliya Asylbekovna</b> - in surgery PhD <b>Berdikhozhaev Mynzhylky Sailauovich</b> - financial and economic activities and about. <b>Birimkulova Zhazira Bakytovna</b>	F block, 3rd floor, small conference hall
11.30-11.40	<b>Technical break</b>		
11.40-12.10	Meeting with the heads of structural divisions of the Hospital	Head of the Department of Health Technologies and Strategic Development <b>Avdeev Andrey Vladislavovich</b> Head of Quality Management and Patient Safety Service <b>Sultanbekova Bibigul Malgazhdarovna</b> Head of the department of interaction with partner clinics and development of medical tourism <b>Kazbekov Kairat Turekhanovich</b> Head of the legal department <b>Turebaev Serikbol Shakhizatovich</b> Head of Public Procurement Department <b>Iglikov Rasul Gabdualievich</b> And about. Chief Economist <b>Zhumagulova Samal Akhmetkalievna</b> Head of rationing, pricing and analytics department <b>Nurzhanov Alibek Ablayevich</b> Head of Human Resources Department <b>Tugumova Sangul Shyngystauovna</b>	L block, 6th floor, room 6.58
12.10-12.30	Meeting with the head of the vocational education department of the Hospital	<b>Yerzhanova Farida Nurmukhambetovna</b>	L block, 6th floor, room 6.58
12.30-13.00	EEC work	<i>External IAAR experts</i>	L block, 6th floor, auditorium 6.56
13.00-14.00	<b>Lunch break</b>		
14.00-14.30	EEC work	<i>External IAAR experts</i>	L block, 6th floor, room 6.56

<p><b>14.30-15.00</b></p>	<p>Meeting with heads of departments</p>	<p><b>7 R 01101 Radiology:</b>                  Head of the Center for Nuclear Medicine                  Saduakasova Aigul Bolatovna                  Head of CT and MRI department                  Elshibayeva Elmira Serikkalieвна                  Head of the Department of X-ray Diagnostics                  Smailova Kyzylgul Maidanovna                  Head of the Department of Ultrasound Diagnostics                  Oskenzaeva Karlygash Karimkhanovna  <b>7 R 01102 Medical genetics</b>                  Head of the laboratory of personalized genomic diagnostics Abildinova                  Gulshara Zhusupovna  <b>7 R 01103 Adult and pediatric urology and andrology</b>                  Head of the surgical department No. 4                  Kasymov Bakhtiyar Galyuly  <b>7 R 01104 Adult and pediatric cardiology</b>                  Head of the Cardiology Department                  Knyazova Gulbanu Zhaksybaevna  <b>7 R 01105 Adult oncology</b>                  Oncologist, mammologist Seydalin Nazar Karimovich  <b>7 R 01106 Otorhinolaryngology, adult, pediatric</b>                  Head of the surgical department No. 1                  Nagumanov Arman Kakimzhanovich</p>	<p>L block, 6th floor, room 6.58</p>
<p><b>15.00-15.10</b></p>	<p><i>Technical break</i></p>		
<p><b>15.10-16.30</b></p>	<p>Visual inspection of the Hospital                  Visual inspection of clinical sites</p>	<p>Territory of the Hospital, department of vocational education, conference rooms, lecture and training rooms, hall of the administrative building, canteen, locker room, With a heck - up .                  Center for Nuclear Medicine; CT and MRI departments, X-ray diagnostics, ultrasound diagnostics.                  Laboratory of personalized genomic diagnostics.                  Surgical department No. 4 (urology).                  Cardiology department.                  Offices of oncologists, department of pathological anatomy.                  Surgical department No. 1 (otorhinolaryngology).</p>	<p><i>Watching a video about the infrastructure of the Hospital (K.T. Kazbekov)</i></p>
<p><b>16.30-18.00</b></p>	<p>The work of the EEC (discussion of the results and summarizing the results of 1 day)</p>	<p><i>External IAAR experts</i></p>	<p>L block, 6th floor, room 6.56</p>
<p><b>Day 2: June 07, 2023</b></p>			
<p><b>10.00-10.40</b></p>	<p>EEC work</p>	<p><i>External IAAR experts</i></p>	<p>L block, 6th floor, room 6.56</p>
<p><b>10.40-11.20</b></p>	<p>Meeting with teachers of accredited EPs</p>	<p><b>Annex 1</b></p>	<p>L block, 6th floor, room 6.58</p>

10.40-11.20	Questioning of heads of departments, teachers, mentors (in parallel)		The link is sent to the teacher's e-mail personally
11.20-11.30	<b>Technical break</b>		
11.30-12.00	Meeting with students	<i>Annex 2</i>	L block, 6th floor, room 6.58
11.30-12.00	Questionnaire of students (in parallel)		The link is sent to the student's e-mail personally
12.00-13.00	EEC work	<i>External IAAR experts</i>	L block, 6th floor, room 6.56
13.00-14.00	<b>Lunch break</b>		
14.00-14.30	EEC work	<i>External IAAR experts</i>	L block, 6th floor, room 6.56
14.30-15.30	Working with EP documents	Radiology <a href="https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1n7P_YiCMh_rDZCchWP5S97PHIYdjrTK5?usp=sharing">https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1n7P_YiCMh_rDZCchWP5S97PHIYdjrTK5?usp=sharing</a> Medical genetics <a href="https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1-W24El-Z6Rcj4ecP-7IZfO6Xp441BHnc?usp=sharing">https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1-W24El-Z6Rcj4ecP-7IZfO6Xp441BHnc?usp=sharing</a> Urology and andrology for adults and children <a href="https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1Ldrk5gcHL75MMJXEagEf00YOIRt5Of_G?usp=sharing">https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1Ldrk5gcHL75MMJXEagEf00YOIRt5Of_G?usp=sharing</a> Cardiology adult, children's <a href="https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1MMsR5UGdFZ69blWfWuqjZYWwP5amxJRr?usp=sharing">https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1MMsR5UGdFZ69blWfWuqjZYWwP5amxJRr?usp=sharing</a> Adult Oncology <a href="https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1qc46Km4i10JmXAs768gMuVTuUaOYTHAN?usp=sharing">https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1qc46Km4i10JmXAs768gMuVTuUaOYTHAN?usp=sharing</a> Otorhinolaryngology for adults, children <a href="https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1HsrXeDHYri-k-0xAZPJc-9IH7koLhZw3?usp=sharing">https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1HsrXeDHYri-k-0xAZPJc-9IH7koLhZw3?usp=sharing</a>	
15.30-15.50	Meeting with employers	<i>Annex 3</i>	Online/offline
15.50-16.00	<b>Technical break</b>		
16.00-16.30	Meeting with alumni of the EP Radiology	<i>Appendix 4</i>	L block, 6th floor, room 6.58
16.30-18.00	The work of the EEC (discussion of the proposed profile parameters, discussion of the results and summing up the results of the 2nd day)	<i>External IAAR experts</i>	L block, 6th floor, room 6.56
<b>Day 3: June 08, 2023</b>			
10.00-11.00	EEC work, discussion	<i>External IAAR experts</i>	L block, 6th floor, room 6.56
11.00-12.00	The work of the VEC, discussion of the calculated parameters of the profile, discussion of the results	<i>External IAAR experts</i>	L block, 6th floor, room 6.56
12.00-13.00	Work of the EEC (collective discussion and preparation of an oral preliminary assessment of the results of the EEC visit)	<i>External IAAR experts</i>	L block, 6th floor, room 6.56
13.00-14.00	<b>Lunch break</b>		



<b>14.00-14.45</b>	EEC work, development (elaboration) of recommendations	<i>External IAAR experts</i>	(Individual work of the expert)
<b>14.45-15.15</b>	EEC work, discussion, decision-making by voting	<i>External IAAR experts</i>	L block, 6th floor, room 6.56
<b>15.15-16.00</b>	Preparation by the chairman of information on the results of an external evaluation	<i>External IAAR experts</i>	(Individual work of the chairman)
<b>16.00-16.10</b>	<b><i>Technical break</i></b>		
<b>16.10-16.40</b>	Final meeting of the EEC with the management of the Hospital	<i>Director and heads of structural divisions Hospitals</i>	L block, 6th floor, room 6.56
<b>16.30-17.00</b>	EEC work, discussion of quality assessment results	<i>External IAAR experts</i>	L block, 6th floor, room 6.56



**Annex 3. RESULTS OF THE PPP QUESTIONNAIRE****Questionnaire P PS BMC UDP**

Total number of profiles: 25

1. Your department/faculty?

7R01101 RADIOLOGY	8 (32%)
7R01106 OTORHINOLARYNGOLOGY ADULTS, CHILDREN	7 (28%)
7R01104 CARDIOLOGY ADULTS, CHILDREN	4 (16%)
7 R 01103 UROLOGY AND ANDROLOGY ADULT, PEDIATRIC	3 (12%)
7R01102 MEDICAL GENETICS	2 (8%)

2. Your Position (your position)

Professor (Professor)	5(20%)
Associate Professor	1(4%)
Senior Teacher (Senior teacher)	1(4%)
teacher (teacher)	11(44%)
Head of the Department (Head of the Department)	2(8%)
Mentor	2(8%)
Doctor radiologist	1(4%)
Head of CT and MRI department	1(4%)
Head of Department of Cardiorehabilitation	1(4%)

academic title degree , scientist rank )

Honored Worker (Honoured Worker)	0(0%)
Doctor of Science (Doctor of Science)	7(28%)
Candidate of Science (PhD)	3(12%)
Master (Master)	1(4%)
PhD (PhD)	3(12%)
Professor (Professor)	1(4%)
Associate Professor _	0(0%)
No (No)	10(40%)
Department assistant, head teacher	0(0%)

Top category	1(4%)
--------------	-------

Work experience at this HEI work V given university )

Less than 1 year	2(8%)
1 year - 5 years	5(20%)
Over 5 years	14(56%)
10 years or more	3(%)
Over 40 years	0(0%)

	Very good	Fine	Relatively bad	Badly	Very bad
To what extent does the content of the educational program meet your needs?	6(24%)	19(76%)	0	0	0
How do you assess the opportunities that the university provides to improve the qualifications of the teaching staff?	4(16%)	17(68%)	4 (16%)	0	0
How do you assess the opportunities provided by the university for the career growth of teachers?)	7(28%)	15(60%)	2 (8%)	14%)	0
How do you assess the degree of academic freedom of the teaching staff?	8(32%)	17(68%)	0	0	0
To what extent can teachers use their own strategies?	10(40%)	15(60%)	0	0	0
To what extent can teachers use their own methods in the teaching process?	7(28%)	17(68%)	14%)	0	0
To what extent can teachers use their own innovations in the learning process?	12(50%)	12(50%)	0	0	0
How do you assess the organization of healthcare and disease prevention at the university?	5(20%)	20(80%)	0	0	0
How is the attention of the management of the educational institution paid to the content of the educational program?)	4(16%)	20(80%)	14%)	0	0
How do you assess the availability of the necessary scientific and educational literature in the library for teachers?	1(4%)	18(72%)	6 (24%)	0	0
Assess the level of conditions created that take into account the needs of different groups of students?	4(16%)	21(84%)	0	0	0
Assess the openness and accessibility of management for students	4(16%)	20(80%)	14%)	0	0
Assess the openness and accessibility of management for teaching staff	6(24%)	19(76%)	0	0	0
What is the level of encouragement and involvement of young professionals in the educational process?	3(12%)	17(68%)	5 (20%)	0	0
Assess the opportunities for professional and personal growth created for each employee	3(12%)	19(76%)	3 (12%)	0	0
Assess the adequacy of the recognition by the leadership of the university of the potential and abilities of teachers	3(12%)	21(84%)	14%)	0	0
How academic mobility activities are organized	0(0%)	20(80%)	5 (20%)	0	0

How is the work to improve the qualifications of teaching staff organized?	0(0%)	19(76%)	6 (24%)	0	0
Evaluate the support of the university and its leadership for the research initiatives of the teaching staff	8(32%)	14(56%)	3 (12%)	0	0
Evaluate the support of the university and its management for the development of new educational programs	6(24%)	18(72%)	14%)	0	0
Assess the level of faculty's ability to combine teaching with research	6(24%)	14(56%)	5 (20%)	0	0
Assess the level of the teaching staff's ability to combine teaching with practical activities	6(24%)	13(52%)	6 (24%)	0	0
Assess the extent to which students' knowledge obtained at this university corresponds to the realities of the requirements of the modern labor market	1(4%)	19(76%)	4 (16%)	14%)	0
How does the leadership and administration of the university perceive criticism?	2(8%)	18(72%)	5(20%)	0	0
Assess how the knowledge of students received at this university corresponds to your expectations	0(0%)	22(88%)	3 (12%)	0	0
In your opinion, how do the curricula of educational organizations form the ability of students to analyze situations and make forecasts?	0(0%)	25(100%)	0	0	0
Assess how the content and quality of the implementation of the educational program meet the expectations of the labor market and the employer.	1(4%)	24(96%)	0	0	0

31. Why do you work in this particular HEI? (Why do you work at this university?)

The best clinic in the Republic of Kazakhstan

It is the best!

Alma mater

I have been working for 19 years, I love my job and the team

This clinic is No. 1 in Kazakhstan

Because the main work of a doctor in this clinic is

This is the best place to work

By deep inner conviction

Opportunities for professional and personal growth

The possibilities of the clinic in the clinical aspect are great

A unique clinic with great room for growth

Doing what I love

Main place of work

Modern equipment, equipment

Because I live in Astana

Best

	Often	Often	Sometimes	Very rarely	Never
How often do you have workshops and lectures with practitioners in your course?	5(20%)	9(36%)	10(40%)	0	14%)
How often do additionally invited teachers participate in the learning process?	0(0%)	8(32%)	10(40%)	4 (16%)	3 (12%)

How often do you encounter the following problems in your work?

	Often	Sometimes	Never
Unbalanced study load by semesters	0 (0%)	8(32%)	17(68%)
Absence or insufficiency of necessary literature in the library	3 (12%)	9(36%)	13(52%)
Overcrowding of study groups	0	3(12%)	22(88%)
Inconvenient schedule	0	11(44%)	14(56%)
Poor classroom conditions	0	5(20.8%)	19(79.2%)
No internet access	14%)	9(36%)	15(60%)
Students' lack of interest in learning	0	15(60%)	10(40%)
Untimely receipt of information about events	2(8%)	8(32%)	15(60%)
Lack of teaching aids in classrooms	2 (8%)	12(48%)	11(44%)

**Other problems (if any). Please indicate which**

- No
- No
- 
- like no
- Didn't notice
- no problem
- missing

35. There are many different sides and aspects in the life of the university, which in one way or another affect every teacher and employee. Rate how satisfied you are:

	Completely satisfied	Partially satisfied	Not satisfied	Difficult to answer
Relationships with direct management	20(80%)	4(16%)	0	14%)
Relationships with colleagues in the department	19(76%)	5(20%)	0	14%)
Participation in management decision making	17(68%)	4(16%)	14%)	3 (12%)
Relations with students	22(88%)	2(8%)	0	14%)
Recognition of your successes and achievements by the administration	17(68%)	7(28%)	0	14%)
Support for your suggestions and comments	14(56%)	10(40%)	0	14%)
University administration activities	16(64%)	8(32%)	0	14%)
Terms of pay	7(28%)	11(44%)	5 (20%)	2 (8%)
Convenience of work, services available at the university	17(68%)	7(28%)	0	14%)

Occupational health and safety	20(80%)	4(16%)	0	14%)
Management of changes in the activities of the university	14(56%)	10(40%)	0	14%)
Providing benefits: rest, sanatorium treatment, etc.	13(52%)	6(24%)	3(12%)	3 (12%)
Food system, medical and other services	14(56%)	9(36%)	0	2 (8%)
Organization of healthcare and quality of medical services	15(60%)	7(28%)	3(12%)	0

#### **Annex 4. RESULTS OF STUDENT QUESTIONNAIRE**

##### *Questionnaire for students of BMC UDP*

**Total number of profiles: 16**

**Educational program (specialty):**

Radiology	<b>7(43.8%)</b>
Otorhinolaryngology for adults, children	<b>5(31.3%)</b>
Urology and andrology for adults and children	<b>2(12.6%)</b>
medical genetics	<b>1(6.3%)</b>
Cardiology for adults, children	<b>1(6.3%)</b>

**Floor:**

Male	7(43.8%)
Female	9(56.3%)

**Rate how satisfied you are:**

Questions	Great	Fine	satisfied	not satisfied	very bad
1. Relationship with the dean's office	9(56.3%)	5(31.3%)	2(12.5%)	0	0
2. The level of accessibility of the dean's office	9(56.3%)	5(31.3%)	2(12.5%)	0	0
3. The level of accessibility and responsiveness of the university management	7(43.8%)	5(31.3%)	4(25%)	<b>0</b>	0
4. Availability of academic counseling	4(25%)	10(62.5%)	1(6.3%)	1(6.3%)	0
5. Support with educational materials in the learning process	5(31.3%)	7(43.8%)	4(25%)	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>

6. Availability of personal counseling	6(37.5%)	4(25%)	5(31.3%)	1(6.3%)	0
7. Relationship between student and teacher	7(43.8%)	5(31.3%)	4(25%)	0	0
8. The activities of the financial and administrative services of the university	5(31.3%)	9(56.3%)	2(12.5%)	0	0
9. Availability of medical health service	6(37.5%)	7(43.8%)	3(18.8%)	0	0
10. The quality of medical services at the university	7(43.8%)	5(31.3%)	4(25%)	0	0
11. The level of availability of library resources	5(31.3%)	6(37.5%)	5(31.3%)	0	0
12. The quality of services provided in libraries and reading rooms	5(31.3%)	7(43.8%)	4(25%)	0	0
13. Satisfaction with the existing educational resources of the university	6(37.5%)	5(31.3%)	5(31.3%)	0	0
14. Availability of computer classes and Internet resources	6(37.5%)	6(37.5%)	4(25%)	0	0
15. Availability and quality of Internet resources	8(50%)	4(25%)	4(25%)	0	0
16. The usefulness of the website of educational organizations in general and faculties in particular	6(37.5%)	4(25%)	5(31.3%)	1(6.3%)	0
17. Study rooms, auditoriums for large groups	8(50%)	3(18.8%)	5(31.3%)	0	0
18. Are there student lounges (subject to availability)	5(31.3%)	4(25%)	4(25%)	2(12.5%)	1(6.3%)
19. Clarity of disciplinary procedures	5(31.3%)	6(37.5%)	4(25%)	1(6.3%)	0
20. The overall quality of study programs	7(43.8%)	4(25%)	3(18.8%)	2(12.5%)	0
21. The quality of study programs at the university	7(43.8%)	3(18.8%)	5(31.3%)	1(6.3%)	0
22. Teaching methods in general	7(43.8%)	4(25%)	3(18.8%)	2(12.5%)	0
23. Quick response to feedback from teachers on the educational process	8(50%)	3(18.8%)	4(25%)	1(6.3%)	
24. The quality of teaching	7(43.8%)	3(18.8%)	6(37.5%)	0	0
25. Academic load / requirements for the student	9(56.3%)	2(12.5%)	4(25%)	1(6.3%)	0
26. The requirements of the teaching staff for the student	8(50%)	3(18.8%)	5(31.3%)	0	0
27. Information support and clarification of the requirements for entering the university and the strategy of the educational program (specialty) before entering the university	9(56.3%)	3(18.8%)	4(25%)	0	0
28. Informing the requirements that must be met for the successful completion of this educational program (specialty)	8(50%)	4(25%)	4(25%)	0	0

29. The quality of examination materials (tests and exams)	8(50%)	3(18.8%)	4(25%)	1(6.3%)	0
30. Objective assessment of knowledge, skills and other educational achievements	8(50%)	3(18.8%)	3(18.8%)	2(12.5%)	0
31. Available computer classes	9(56.3%)	4(25%)	2(12.5%)	1(6.3%)	0
32. Available scientific laboratories	8(50%)	4(25%)	4(25%)	0	0
33. The objectivity and fairness of the teacher	8(50%)	3(18.8%)	4(25%)	1(6.3%)	0
34. Informing students about courses, educational programs, and academic degrees	9(56.3%)	3(18.8%)	4(25%)	0	0
35. Providing students with a hostel	5(31.3%)	2(12.5%)	4(25%)	4(25%)	1(6.3%)

**How much do you agree with:**

Statement	Full consent	Agree	Partially agree	Disagree	Complete disagreement	Difficult to answer
36. The course program was clearly presented	6(37.5%)	4(25%)	6(37.5%)	0	0	0
37. Course content is well structured	6(37.5%)	4(25%)	6(37.5%)	0	0	0
38. Key terms adequately explained	6(37.5%)	5(31.3%)	5(31.3%)	0	0	0
39. The material proposed by the teaching staff is relevant and reflects the latest scientific and practical developments	6(37.5%)	6(37.5%)	4(25%)	0	0	0
40. The teacher uses effective teaching methods	6(37.5%)	5(31.3%)	5(31.3%)	0	0	0
41. The teacher owns the material being taught	7(43.8%)	7(43.8%)	2(12.5%)	0	0	0
42. The lecturer's presentation is clear	6(37.5%)	6(37.5%)	4(25%)	0	0	0
43. The teacher presents the material in an interesting way	6(37.5%)	7(43.8%)	3(18.8%)	0	0	0
44. Knowledge, skills and other academic achievements are assessed objectively	6(37.5%)	6(37.5%)	4(25%)	0	0	0
45. The teacher meets your requirements and expectations in terms of professional and personal development	6(37.5%)	5(31.3%)	5(31.3%)	0	0	0
46. The teacher stimulates the activity of students	4(25%)	7(43.8%)	3(18.8%)	2(12.5%)	0	0
47. The teacher stimulates the creative thinking of students	5(31.3%)	5(31.3%)	5(31.3%)	5(31.3%)	2(12.5%)	0



48. Appearance and manners of the teacher are adequate	7(43.8%)	6(37.5%)	3(18.8%)	0	0	0
49. The teacher has a positive attitude towards students	7(43.8%)	4(25%)	5(31.3%)	0	0	0
50. The system for assessing academic achievements (seminars, tests, questionnaires, etc.) reflects the content of the course	6(37.5%)	5(31.3%)	4(25%)	1(6.3%)	0	0
51. The evaluation criteria used by the teaching staff are clear and accessible	6(37.5%)	5(31.3%)	5(31.3%)	0	0	0
52. The teaching staff objectively evaluates the achievements of students	8(50%)	3(18.8%)	5(31.3%)	0	0	0
53. The teacher speaks a professional language	8(50%)	6(37.5%)	2(12.5%)	0	0	0
54. The organization of education provides sufficient opportunities for sports and other leisure activities.	5(31.3%)	4(25%)	4(25%)	3(18.8%)	0	0
55. Facilities and equipment for students are safe, comfortable and modern	9(56.3%)	5(31.3%)	2(12.5%)	0	0	0
56. The library is well stocked and has a fairly good collection of books.	6(37.5%)	7(43.8%)	3(18.8%)	0	0	0
57. (Equal opportunities are provided to all students	7(43.8%)	5(31.3%)	4(25%)	0	0	0

**Other concerns regarding the quality of teaching:**

No

No problem

More practice  
rotation

The number of hours of paperwork exceeds the practical part, which means that there is no time left for theory. As for the answers to the block about the objectivity of the teaching staff - only one teacher is biased towards all residents, which affects the learning atmosphere and self-esteem of residents.