



«АККРЕДИТТЕУ ЖӘНЕ РЕЙТИНГТИҢ
ТӘУЕЛСІЗ АГЕНТТІГІ» КЕМ

НУ «НЕЗАВИСИМОЕ АГЕНТСТВО
АККРЕДИТАЦИИ И РЕЙТИНГА»

INDEPENDENT AGENCY FOR
ACCREDITATION AND RATING

REPORT

on the results of work of the external expert commission on the evaluation
of the educational program in the specialty 1-790108 "Pharmacy"
for compliance with requirements of the
standards of international accreditation
of basic medical and pharmaceutical education abroad
based on the WFME standards
State Educational Institution
"Avicenna Tajik State Medical University" Dushanbe
in the period from March 27 to March 29, 2022

INDEPENDENT AGENCY FOR ACCREDITATION AND RATING
External Expert Commission

*Addressed to
the Accreditation
council of IAAR*



«АККРЕДИТТЕУ ЖӨНЕ РЕЙТИНГТИҢ
ТӘУЕЛСІЗ АГЕНТТІГІ» КЕМ

НУ «НЕЗАВИСИМОЕ АГЕНТСТВО
АККРЕДИТАЦИИ И РЕЙТИНГА»

INDEPENDENT AGENCY FOR
ACCREDITATION AND RATING

REPORT

**on the results of work of the external expert commission on the evaluation
of the educational program in the specialty 1-790108 "Pharmacy"
for compliance with requirements of the standards of international accreditation
of basic medical and pharmaceutical education abroad
based on the WFME standards
State Educational Institution "Avicenna Tajik State Medical University" Dushanbe
in the period from March 27 to March 29, 2022**

March 29 , 2022, Dushanbe

(I) LIST OF DESIGNATIONS AND ABBREVIATIONS

ACS	Automated control system
HAC	Higher Attestation Commission
SEC	State Examination Commission
SES RT	State Educational Standard of the Republic of Tajikistan
FSC	Final state certification
EP	Educational program
OSPE	Objective structured practical exam
TS	Teaching staff
CIS	Commonwealth of Independent States
SCU	Scientific Council of the University
ACPD	Academic Council of Pharmacy Department
PBL	Prolem-based learning
SWOT	Strength, weaknesses, opportunities, threats
TBL	Team-based learning
WFME	World Federation of Medical Education
EEC	external expert commission



(II) INTRODUCTION

In accordance with Order 18-22-OD dated 20.01.2022 of the Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating, from March 27 to March 29, 2022, an external expert commission evaluated the compliance of the educational program 1-790108 "Pharmacy" State Educational Institution "Tajik State Medical University named after Abuali Ibni Sino" with the standards of international program accreditation (No. 68-18/1-OD dated 25 May 2018, second edition) in hybrid format.

The report of the external expert commission (EEC) contains an evaluation of the submitted educational program according to the criteria of the IAAR, recommendations of the EEC for further improvement of the educational program and parameters of the profile of the educational program.

Members of EEC:

IAAR expert, Chairman – Kurmangaliev Kairat Bolatovich, NJSC "West Kazakhstan Medical University named after Marat Ospanov" (Republic of Kazakhstan, Aktobe) (online);

IAAR expert - Natalia Lapova Valerievna - Ph.D., docent, Vitebsk State Order of Peoples' Friendship Medical University (Republic of Belarus, Vitebsk) (online);

IAAR expert – Bogomolova Elena Sergeevna, d.m.s., Volga Research Medical University of the Ministry of Health of Russia (Russian Federation, Nizhny Novgorod) (online);

IAAR expert - Kurmanova Gauhar Medeubayeva d.m.s., Professor, Al-Farabi Kazakh National University (Republic of Kazakhstan, Almaty) (offline);

IAAR expert, employer – Huseynzoda Zafar Habibullo, d.m.s., State Institution "Republican Oncology Research Center" (Republic of Tajikistan, Dushanbe) (offline);

IAAR expert, student – Komilova Bibisoro Ikromiddinovna, Faculty of Medicine, Halton State Medical University (Republic of Tajikistan, Dangara) (offline);

IAAR coordinator – Dzhakenova Alisa Satbekovna, PhD, Head of Medical Projects of the Agency (Republic of Kazakhstan, Nur-Sultan) (offline).

(III) REPRESENTATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION

The State educational institution "Avicenna Tajik State Medical University" (hereinafter – ATSMU, University) was established in 1939 and is currently the leading medical university in Tajikistan for training personnel for the healthcare system.

ATSMU has a state license for the right to carry out educational activities under the programs of higher professional, postgraduate professional education and additional education of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Tajikistan dated 13.06.2019, registration No. 3117, series AU 000281.

In 2019, ATSMU passed the IAAR institutional accreditation (Certificate No. 47 dated 22.11.2019 for 5 years).

ATSMU provides multi-level training of specialists, which includes bachelor's degree, specialty, postgraduate (internship, clinical residency, master's degree, doctoral degree) and additional education. The educational process at the university is carried out in three languages – Tajik, Russian and English.

The structure of ATSMU is organized according to the principles corresponding to international standards and includes 5 faculties, 6 centers, 13 departments and 58 chairs.

The total area of University is 103524 m², while 78575.1 m² (75.9%) is the study area.

The University provides free access to electronic sources of information for students and employees. The ratio of computer to student is 1:7, which is the best indicator among the universities of the republic. All departments and divisions of ATSMU, including those located in medical institutions, are connected to the university's internal network and the Internet. Free WiFi access is provided in the university space (study blocks and student campus).

The University has three Information centers "EL-LIBRARY", facilitating the access of students and University staff to internal and external electronic sources of information.

The Scientific and Medical Library of ATSMU provides access to information resources, including printed publications (5,000 units), electronic publications (749 units), scientific (667,533 units) and educational (208,716 units) publications and periodical publications (177,212 units). This number also includes textbooks in English. In addition, it is possible to work with the HINARI Health Research Access program, which provides online access to leading journals on biomedical and related social disciplines.

Since 1999, ATSMU has been publishing the quarterly scientific and practical journal "Avicenna Bulletin", which since 2003 has been included in the list of publications recommended by the Higher Attestation Commission of the Republic of Tajikistan under the President of the Republic of Tajikistan. Since 2019, the quarterly scientific and practical journal "Avji Zuhal" has also been included in this List of publications.

For physical culture and sports, ATSMU has an educational and sports complex with game halls, a stadium and a sports ground with a synthetic covering.

Since 1973, a student polyclinic has been functioning at ATSMU for regular monitoring of the students' health condition, on the basis of which a Medical and diagnostic center was organized in 2009.

The contingent of students has 13166 students, including 1951 foreign students (15%) from 19 countries.

At the regional level, cooperation on the mobility of students and staff is mainly established with medical universities in Kazakhstan, Uzbekistan, and the Russian Federation. Academic mobility with universities outside the CIS is carried out only within the framework of international grants and projects (Erasmus+, World Bank projects, etc.). So, since 2012, TSMU has implemented 11 programs within the framework of Erasmus+, two programs are planned for 2022-2023 with universities in Georgia, Bulgaria, Lithuania, Italy and the Netherlands.

The Department of Pharmacy of ATSMU was founded in 1981.

The structure of the Department unites 7 chairs, of which 4 (pharmacognosy and organization and economics of pharmacy, pharmacology, pharmaceutical technology, pharmaceutical and toxicological chemistry) are specialized. The staff of specialized chairs is 36 people, including 2

doctors of science and 4 candidates of science. There are 298 students studying at the Department of Pharmacy. The training is carried out only on a paid basis.

In 2016, in order to develop practical orientation in the training of pharmaceutical specialists, the Research and production center of "Pharmacy" was opened, which is the main base of the chairs of pharmacognosy and organization of pharmacy economics, pharmaceutical and toxicological chemistry and pharmaceutical technology.

(IV) DESCRIPTION OF THE PREVIOUS ACCREDITATION PROCEDUR

The educational program 1-790108 "Pharmacy" is accredited in the IAAR for the first time.

(V) DESCRIPTION OF THE EEC VISIT

The work of the EEC was carried out on the basis of the approved Program of the hybrid visit of the expert commission on specialized accreditation of educational programs of the International Higher Medical School in the period from March 27 to March 29, 2022.

In order to coordinate the work of the EEC, an on-line installation meeting was held on 25.03.2022, during which duties were distributed among the members of the commission, the schedule of the visit was clarified, and an agreement was reached on the choice of examination methods.

Meetings with the rector, vice-rectors, deans, heads of structural units, heads of chairs, teachers, students, graduates and employers were held to obtain objective information about the organization of ATSMU activities and the implementation of the EP, to clarify the content of self-assessment reports.

During the visual inspection, the members of EEC got acquainted with the state of the material and technical base, visited: lecture halls and classrooms of the Chairs of Children's Diseases No. 1, Propaedeutics of Children's Diseases, Family Medicine, Histology, Human anatomy and Latin medical terminology named after Ya.A.Rakhimov, Pharmaceutical and Toxicological chemistry, Pharmacognosy and Organization of Pharmacy Economics, Pharmaceutical Technology, library, dormitory and dining room.

A total of 148 people took part in the meetings, 38 of them directly in the accredited specialty (Table 1).

Table 1 – Information about employees and students who took part in meetings with the EEC:

Category of participants	Quantity
Rector	1
Vice-rectors	5
Heads of structural divisions	6
Deans	6
Heads of chairs	26
Teachers	26
Students	45
Graduates	21
Employers	12
Total	148

In accordance with the accreditation procedure, a survey was conducted of 100 teachers, including 18 employees of the Pharmacy department, and 101 students, including 32 students of Pharmacy department.

In order to confirm the information provided in the Self-Assessment Report, the working documentation of the university and the information posted on the official website of ATSMU were additionally requested and analyzed <https://tajmedun.tj/ru/>.

As part of the planned program, recommendations for improving the accredited EP 1-790108 "Pharmacy", developed by the EEC based on the results of the examination, were presented at a meeting with the administration on 03/29/2022.

(VI) COMPLIANCE WITH SPECIALIZED ACCREDITATION STANDARDS

6.1. The Standard "MISSION AND FINAL LEARNING OUTCOMES"

The evidentiary part

The mission of ATSMU is defined as: "Providing nationally relevant and internationally recognized medical education for the training of competent personnel and promoting the development of scientific activities in the field of healthcare."

The mission of EP 1-79 01 08 "Pharmacy" is defined as: "Training of qualified competitive pharmaceutical specialists for the development of the pharmaceutical industry of the Republic, that meets international and national requirements."

The mission of ATSMU is posted on the university's website and on information stands in all structural units. Mission of EP 1-79 01 08 "Pharmacy" is not presented on the website. Mission of EP 1-79 01 08 "Pharmacy" is not publicly available, which suggests that it has not been properly communicated to stakeholders.

The mission of EP 1-79 01 08 "Pharmacy" is based on the opinion of the Committee's participants of the educational program, which includes the teaching staff and students. Information about the participation of employers in determining the Mission of EP during the interview was not confirmed.

At the Pharmacy department, there is a system that implements the academic freedom of employees to implement the current educational program, which is based on the basic principles specified in the Quality Assurance Policy. ATSMU also provides certain academic freedoms to students to choose their own study programs, freely express their opinions, and freely participate in scientific researches.

Pharmacy department provides an educational trajectory consisting of disciplines within which students acquire the necessary competencies that are defined with SES RT. EP provides for the presence of several forms of control of acquired competencies, which is given in the curricula.

All of the above was also confirmed as a result of interviews with teaching staff, students, graduates and other stakeholders.

Analytical part

According to the criteria of "Mission and Results" standard, ATSMU has the mission of the university and the mission of EP 1-79 01 08 "Pharmacy". The mission of EP 1-79 01 08 "Pharmacy" reflects the main Mission of the university and takes into account the modern requirements of practical pharmacy imposed on pharmacists-specialists.

The mission of ATSMU is presented on the official website, in an accessible form on the stands of educational buildings and clinical bases, in English, Russian and Tajik languages.

At the same time, the participation of all stakeholders is necessary to establish the Mission and the final results of training, not only by representatives of the Educational Program Committee in the specialty, but also by representatives of a wider range of stakeholders with the preparation of relevant documentation as evidence of the work carried out (for example, protocols, extracts, other documents).

In the self-report of ATSMU in SWOT analysis, it is noted that the university does not have the opportunity to create exclusive EP, since this issue is heavily regulated at the state level, which reduces institutional freedom in the formation of EP.

Academic freedoms of the teaching staff are present during the implementation of EP. According to the results of an anonymous survey of employees, 36.4% of respondents rate the state of academic freedoms as "very good", 59.6% - as "good", 4% - "relatively good".

The final results are aimed at achieving the competencies of students and correspond to the mission of ATSMU and EP 1-79 01 08 "Pharmacy".

Strengths according to the standard

According to this standard, no strengths have been identified

Recommendations for EP 1-79 01 08 "Pharmacy":

1. Head of the EP should ensure that all stakeholders are informed about the content of EP mission by posting on the university's website and by other means (in all languages) by May 2022.
2. Head of the EP should ensure the participation of all stakeholders in the development and/or adjustment of EP mission and reflect their opinions and suggestions by September 2022.

Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:

Strong – 0; satisfactory – 21; suggests improvements – 3; unsatisfactory - 0.

6.2. The Standard "EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM"

The evidentiary part

EP 1-79 01 08 "Pharmacy" is consistent with the Mission and the final results of training and serves to achieve them.

Current EP was implemented in 2018, the last revision was carried out in 2021.

Upon completion of this educational program, the qualification "pharmacist", the academic degree "specialist" is awarded.

When implementing EP 1-79 01 08 "Pharmacy", innovative forms and methods of teaching PBL, TBL are actively used, which is stated in the self-assessment report and confirmed during interviews and when attending classes at departments.

In order to form more in-depth competencies, students have the opportunity to study elective courses and elective disciplines (the list was provided upon request).

The formation of scientific thinking among students is carried out within the framework of scientific research, in which, according to the vice-rector for Scientific and Publishing activities, no more than 10% of students participate. Information about the formation of scientific thinking within the framework of individual academic disciplines is presented in a vague and ambiguous way.

The EP includes a list of academic disciplines divided into four cycles: humanities, natural sciences, general professional and professional disciplines, as well as elective (elective) disciplines. Cycles (blocks) of academic disciplines are divided into modules.

The module of basic medical disciplines combines 16 academic disciplines, which account for 69 credits (20%).

Block of behavioral, social and personal disciplines includes 10 academic disciplines (45 credits, 13%). At the same time, there is no discipline "medical law", the insufficiency of which was noted by graduates during the interview.

Block of specialized disciplines contains 15 pharmaceutical disciplines, which account for 110 credits (31%). In addition, 39 credits (11%) account for educational and industrial practice, which contribute to the direct consolidation of practical skills.

The variable part of EP is 87 credits (25%).

Sequence of studying disciplines is determined by the continuity of the acquired competencies.

To gain experience in practical pharmaceutical activities, students undergo 4 practical training sessions with a total duration of 1 week. All this allows them to fully master the EP, which reflects the changing needs and demands of practical healthcare.

Structure of the EP 1-79 01 08 "Pharmacy" is set out in the standard curriculum and consists of the name and codes of the specialty, qualifications, terms and forms of study; the calendar of the educational process (in weeks); the distributed time budget (in weeks); the plan of the educational process with a list of blocks and mandatory academic disciplines, the number of credits (classroom and extracurricular), semesters, practices and state certification and the register of elective disciplines.

. Model of the EP 1-79 01 08 "Pharmacy" is presented as an integrated system based on the relationship of academic disciplines both horizontally and vertically. A logical sequence of studying academic disciplines is observed.

Total number of credits for 5 years of studying EP is 350 credits

Analytical part

As follows from the evidentiary part, the standard "Educational Program" meets all the requirements of the IAAR standard, which is confirmed in the appendixes to the self-report, the university website and the interviewing of the participants of this standard.

EP 1-79 01 08 "Pharmacy" consists of basic medical, behavioral and socio-personal, profiling and elective academic disciplines.

Despite the presence of modules and horizontal and vertical integration of academic disciplines, when interviewing teachers and students, it was noted that the degree of integration is insignificant and little expressed.

Mastering the skills of scientific thinking mainly when performing scientific research by a small group of students does not allow to fully form this skill and evaluate the achievements of students to the full extent of the graduate's willingness to apply the scientific method and approaches in medical and pharmaceutical research.

At the same time, a set of specialized pharmaceutical disciplines allows meeting the needs of practical pharmacy in certain knowledge of graduates of EP 1-79 01 08 "Pharmacy", defined by the SES RT.

In the process of studying at ATSMU, various forms of teaching are used, including lectures, seminars, practical and/ or laboratory classes, as well as independent work and industrial practice. Within the framework of these forms of teaching, both traditional (explanatory and illustrative method using teaching aids, tables, models, presentations) and innovative teaching methods are used, depending on the specifics of the discipline being studied or the topic of the discipline.

When visiting the Chairs of Pharmaceutical and Toxicological chemistry, pharmacognosy and organization of pharmacy economics, pharmaceutical technology, the availability of the necessary technological and analytical equipment, equipment of a simulation pharmacy was clearly presented, which indicates the availability of opportunities for students to master practical skills. At the same time, the time allotted for the direct development of practical skills is, as a rule, less than 1/3 of the lesson (according to students and teachers – 40-60 minutes for 3-4-hour classes).

The analysis of the survey data of students revealed satisfaction with the quality of EP in general in 67.3% of students, partially in 27.7%; with the quality of educational programs in EP 65.3% and 31.8%, respectively.

Also, during the interviewing of employers and in the SWOT analysis during the self-evaluation of ATSMU, was revealed insufficient interaction with employers, when making changes and periodically adjusting the content of the final results of EP training.

Strengths according to the standard.

According to this standard, no strengths have been identified.

Recommendations for EP 1-79 01 08 "Pharmacy":

1. The developers of the EP are recommended to revise the curriculum to ensure the real integration of fundamental disciplines as part of the training modules by September 2022
2. The developers of the EP should include in the curriculum and/or content of disciplines and in the system of evaluation of educational achievements the implementation of elements of scientific research by students on an ongoing basis by September 2022
3. The head of the EP is recommended to include in the curriculum and/or educational content knowledge of medical law and the legislative framework of practical healthcare and drug provision by September 2022
4. The head of the EP should take the necessary measures to increase the planned time for practicing the professional skills of a pharmacist in specialized disciplines by the 2022-2023 academic years
5. The head of the EP, during the subsequent revision, should involve employers in the development of the curriculum and determining the final results of training.

Conclusions of the EEC by criteria:

Strong – 0; satisfactory – 41; suggest improvement – 3; unsatisfactory - 0.

6.3. The standard "ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS"***The evidentiary part***

The policy and procedure for evaluating the results of training at ATSMU are carried out in accordance with the objectives of the EP, the final results of training within the framework of the current rating system and control of the educational process, in accordance with the directives, regulatory documents of the Republic of Tajikistan and internal regulations of ATSMU ("Regulations on the credit system of education in higher professional educational institutions of the Republic of Tajikistan", "Regulations on the final certification of students", "Regulations on the ongoing monitoring of academic performance and intermediate certification of students").

The point-rating system assumes an assessment in percentages (0-100%), a letter system (A-F) and a traditional 5-point system according to the established translation tables between the systems.

To determine the degree of mastering by students of EP, focused on achieving the final results of training and the development of competencies, ongoing monitoring of academic performance, intermediate and final certification, testing is carried out.

Transparency and accessibility of assessment rules and procedures is provided by free access to regulatory documents related to the educational process, syllabuses, exam schedules, control and measuring tools of all interested people - teachers, students, office registrars through the Automated control System, student portal (<https://office.tajmedun.tj>), the portal of collective use of ATSMU (<https://lms.tajmedun.tj>).

Current classes include testing and oral questioning (assessment of knowledge), analysis and solution of practical situations, business games, etc. (formation and assessment of skills). A comprehensive assessment of the lesson is made taking into account the assessment of knowledge and skills, as well as the activity of the student's work in the classroom. The presence of students is recorded at each lesson. The proportion of each form of assessment depends on the final result. The Miller model is used for this purpose. Depending on the growth of professional skills, the share of practical skills assessment and workplace assessment increases.

When interviewing students, it was found that 20-30 test tasks are used during certification, regardless of the duration of the discipline and the level of its significance. The students also noted that the list of practical skills and methods of their assessment in the exams are few.

During interviewing teachers and taking into account the information provided, it was found that when determining the validity and reliability of assessment methods, an insignificant list of methods of their analysis is used, in particular, psychometric analysis is not used.

The final assessment of the discipline is equal to the sum of the scores of comprehensive assessments for classes, assessment for intermediate certification, assessment of attendance of lectures by students, assessment for performing additional creative / research tasks.

The contribution of each stage of the rating assessment to the final rating is analyzed annually, which makes it possible to determine the most optimal ratio of the types of educational activities of students and their attitude to the educational process.

The FSC is in the form of a comprehensive exam, which is conducted in 2 stages: stage I – certification of practical skills in OSPE technology, stage II – testing and a written exam. To conduct the FSC, the SEC includes a chairman from among the practical healthcare corresponding to the profile of the specialty and members of the SEC – persons with an academic degree, or academic title or academic degree corresponding to the profile of the specialty, as well as highly qualified specialists of practical healthcare.

The student can appeal the final assessment of the final control in accordance with the "Regulations on the credit system of education in higher professional educational institutions of the Republic of Tajikistan", and the Order of the Rector of the University on the Appeal Commission, which is issued during the winter and summer examination sessions. The Appeal commission consists of experienced teachers whose qualifications correspond to the profile of the discipline.

Analytical part

The standard "Student Assessment" is more in line with the requirements of the IAAR accreditation.

In the process of analyzing the submitted documents, the results of interviewing teachers and students, the presence of evidence on the use of various methods of assessing students' achievements (OSPE, testing, oral and written exams) was revealed. Methods of both current and final assessments of students' knowledge were also presented. At the same time, according to the self-assessment report and the results of interviewing students and teachers, it was revealed that the range of methods for assessing practical skills is insignificant. When using testing, a small number of test tasks are used. There is also no supporting data on the use of psychometric analysis of control measuring instruments.

In order to assess the knowledge and skills of students, a constant ongoing monitoring of progress is carried out.

The final assessment of the knowledge and skills of the final year students is carried out on the basis of comprehensive exams.

The final state certification is carried out by the commission with the involvement of leading specialists in practical healthcare and the most experienced teachers, which contributes to improving the fairness, quality and transparency of the assessment process.

. Methods of assessing students' knowledge and skills at ATSMU allow avoiding conflicts of interest. In case of conflict situations, the review is carried out by the appeal commission.

Strengths according to the standard.

According to this standard, no strengths have been identified.

Recommendations for EP 1-79 01 08 "Pharmacy":

1. The head of the EP should introduce at the level of summative assessment, an evaluation of practical skills using a wide range of techniques by September 2022.

2. The head of the EP should introduce psychometric analysis of control measuring instruments on an ongoing basis by September 2022.

3. Increase the number of test tasks per examinee to at least 90 tasks per discipline in basic medical and specialized pharmaceutical disciplines by September 2022.

The conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:

strong – 0; satisfactory – 11; suggest improvement – 4; unsatisfactory – 0.

6.4. The Standard "STUDENTS"**The evidentiary part**

Admission and selection of persons for higher education is regulated by state and internal university regulations.

Students are admitted to ATSMU at the designated places of the student admission plan in accordance with the quotas of the President of the Republic of Tajikistan based on the results of centralized entrance examinations of the National Testing Center, which is determined at the state level by the "Rules for admission of students to institutions of higher professional education in accordance with the quotas of the President of the Republic of Tajikistan". At the same time, the system of centralized entrance examinations provides benefits for certain categories of persons in accordance with the legislation of the Republic of Tajikistan.

The number of students who can be enrolled in university for various specialties is determined by the license for the implementation of educational activities of ATSMU and the decision of state regulatory authorities.

The transfer of students from other educational programs and medical organizations is carried out in accordance with the "Regulations on the expulsion, reinstatement and transfer of students of higher educational institutions of the Republic of Tajikistan".

At the university, advisors are appointed for students who provide support on professional career planning.

There are nominal scholarships for financial support and motivation of students.

The university has a system of student representation at the level of student self-government, student scientific society, students' trade union committee.

For physical culture and sports, ATSMU has an educational and sports complex with game halls, a stadium and a sports ground with a synthetic covering.

There is a Medical and diagnostic center for regular monitoring of the health of students.

Every year, special events are held among students with competitions for the title of "Best Student of the Year" with awarding the winners with diplomas and prizes.

Analytical part

The standard "Students" fully complies with the requirements of the IAAR accreditation.

ATSMU has defined a policy of admission and selection of applicants, corresponding to the Mission of the University and the Mission of the EP.

To support students, the work of advisors has been organized, which allows providing advisory assistance to students in choosing an individual educational trajectory based on the choice of elective and elective courses.

A number of events are held at ATSMU, which include a program of medical care, social support and financial assistance.

In an online format, one of the buildings of the hostel for foreign students was demonstrated, where comfortable conditions for students' accommodation were created. It was also demonstrated that the University is equipped with the necessary number of canteens and buffets for students and teachers.

Strengths according to the standard.

According to this standard, no strengths have been identified.

Recommendations for EP 1-79 01 08 "Pharmacy":

There are no recommendations for this standard.

The conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:

strong – 0; satisfactory – 17; suggest improvement – 0; unsatisfactory – 0.

6.5. The Standard "ACADEMIC STAFF/TEACHERS"

The evidentiary part

The requirements for academic staff are determined by the Personnel Policy of ATSMU, which reflects the priorities for the formation of human resources and criteria for the selection of personnel, including scientific, pedagogical and clinical merits of applicants.

The degree of teaching staff of three specialized departments implementing EP 1-79 01 08 "Pharmacy" is 27.8%. 100% of teachers speak Russian, and about 25% speak English.

In order to maintain the balance of teachers of general education, basic and specialized disciplines, when drawing up the staff schedule of the department, it is guided by state and local university regulations.

The main criteria of scientific, pedagogical and practical advantages of applicants are higher education in the profile of the discipline taught, the presence of a doctor's degree or candidate of sciences, an academic degree of PhD or master's degree, relevant experience of scientific and pedagogical work, the highest or first medical category for teachers of clinical disciplines, as well as the availability of scientific publications in journals with a high citation index.

The main methods of evaluating the activity of a teacher are the achievement of indicators of the department's activity (the Regulations on the rating of the department and the evaluation of the activities of the teaching staff of ATSMU, the certification of teaching staff, the assignment of a pedagogical category, the competition "The Best teacher of the Year").

ATSMU has established norms of academic workload for academic staff: the following standards are established: before graduation – 23 credits for the head of the department, 24 credits for

the professor of the department, associate professor – 25 credits, senior lecturer – 27 credits, teacher /assistant – 29 credits.

It should be noted that according to the results of the university's self-evaluation, the teacher-student ratio was noted at the level of 1: 10, whereas in the classes attended by the EEC, the number of students in the academic group ranged from 15 to 18.

Scientific research is carried out by teaching staff through participation in national projects.

The Center of Postgraduate Education of the University functions to improve the qualifications of the teaching staff of ATSMU.

In order to implement the educational program and improve the activities of teachers, measures for moral and material motivation of teachers have been developed and implemented under the leadership of the university. The salary fund has increased by almost 100% in five years (2015-2016 - 26.8 million, 2019–2020 - 51.6).

The University provides all employees with opportunities to realize their abilities and career growth.

Analytical part

The standard "Academic staff/teachers" meets the requirements of the IAAR accreditation.

During the classes, the use of innovative educational technologies by teaching staff, knowledge of Russian and English languages of instruction was noted.

At the same time, a significant occupancy of groups (15-18 people) may not allow students to fully master practical skills, primarily in specialized pharmaceutical disciplines.

ATSMU provides training, support and evaluation of the activities of all teaching staff, which is confirmed by the results of the questionnaire and the information obtained during the interview of teaching staff.

ATSMU has motivational programs that allow teachers to improve themselves, improve their qualification level and pedagogical skills. Most of the teachers are satisfied with the working conditions at ATSMU.

Strengths according to the standard.

According to this standard, no strengths have been identified.

Recommendations for EP 1-79 01 08 "Pharmacy"

1. It is recommended that the university management consider the possibility of reducing the number of students in groups, especially in specialized disciplines, in order to increase the level of mastering professional skills by September 2022

The conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:

Strong – 0; satisfactory – 12; suggest improvement – 0; unsatisfactory – 0.

6.6. The Standard "EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES"

The evidentiary part

The total area of the university is 103524 m², of which 78575.1 m² is the study area. The basis of the specialized departments of Pharmacy Department is the Educational, scientific and Production Center "Pharmacy", equipped with technological equipment, analytical utensils, reagents and premises imitating various departments of the pharmacy.

The practice bases with which the university has agreements on conducting training and production practices include pharmaceutical organizations, including production pharmacies engaged in the manufacture of dosage forms and the release of medicines, pharmaceutical enterprises for the production of finished pharmaceutical drugs (for example, Markaz M L X pharimatsevti va molhoi tibbi VT Kh JT, Khadamoti nazorati davlati fayoliyati pharimatsevti).

For practical training in pharmaceutical botany and pharmacognosy, ATSMU has a department for growing medicinal plants of the Central Research Laboratory of the University with a total area of 2 hectares.

The University provides free access to electronic sources of information, for which there are 1167 computers, 654 printers, 114 multimedia projectors, 104 photocopiers, 111 laptops and net-books, 900 tablets. The ratio of computers to students is 1:7. Free Wi-Fi access is provided in the university space (study blocks and student campus).

The total fund of the scientific library of the University as of 31.12.2021 is 633942/360974 (copies / titles) and meets the requirements for the provision of literature. The book fund for EP 1-79 01 08 "Pharmacy" is 71441 copies of educational literature and 5504 copies of scientific literature.

Pharmacy Department conducts scientific research in the field of search and development of new medicines based on local medicinal plant raw materials, for example, black cumin. The available equipment makes it possible to obtain various forms of medicines, which can later be sold through the pharmacy network.

Students the Pharmacy Department have the opportunity to carry out research within the framework of participation in 4 student scientific circles. The main areas of research include the synthesis and study of the toxicity and pharmacological activity of new complex preparations of albicinate and malbicinate, zinc and amino acids, zinc and copper with dibazole and albendazole. Research is also underway to develop medicines using endemic local flora.

ATSMU publishes quarterly scientific and practical journals "Avicenna Bulletin" and "Avji Zuhal", which are included in the list of publications recommended by the Higher Attestation Commission of the Republic of Tajikistan under the President of the Republic of Tajikistan.

ATSMU implements academic mobility of students and teachers to the CIS countries, as well as within the framework of international grants and projects. Over the past 5 years, 9 4th-year students of the Pharmacy Department have participated in the academic exchange program at the Tashkent Financial Institute, Republic of Uzbekistan.

Analytical part

The standard "Educational Resources" meets the requirements of the IAAR accreditation.

Interviews with employers testified to the interest and involvement of employers in the training of specialists. Graduates note the high degree of participation of employers in practical training in the implementation of production practices. The possibility of implementing the developments of employees through pharmacy chains also confirms the good interaction of the university and practical pharmacy.

The members of the EEC noted the availability of the necessary equipment, the availability of a library system for issuing books and convenient access to them, the availability of well-equipped dormitories, buffets and recreation areas for students.

During interviews with students and teachers, free access to the Internet, as well as various databases and electronic libraries was confirmed.

At the same time, there is a low academic mobility among students of the Pharmacy Department. In particular, over the past 5 years, 9 students of the Pharmacy Department, 135 students of the Medicine Department, 2 students of the Dentistry Department, 4 students of the Pediatrics Department have participated in academic mobility.

The work of the ACS, including an electronic journal, was demonstrated for the members of the EEC.

Strengths according to the standard.

1. Good cooperation with the practical health sector in terms of ensuring the availability of vocational training for students.

Recommendations for EP 1-79 01 08 "Pharmacy":

1. The head of the EP should increase the number of students and staff of the Pharmacy Department participating in academic mobility programs in the 2022-2023 academic year.

The conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:

Strong – 1; satisfactory – 28; suggest improvement – 1; unsatisfactory – 0.

6.7. The Standard "EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM"

The evidentiary part

Evaluation of EP 1-79 01 08 "Pharmacy" is carried out continuously and consists of external and internal evaluations, which are regulated by state and local university regulations. External evaluation is carried out through the certification of the university, as well as institutional and specialized accreditation. Internal self-evaluation includes self-evaluation of divisions, internal audit of structural divisions, intra-departmental control, employee rating, student rating, current, intermediate and final certification of students; checking the state of methodological support of the educational process.

Students participate in changing the content of the EP. When interviewing, they noted that they have the opportunity to point out the insufficient content of curricula and the overload of educational material, as well as insufficient time when teaching specialized disciplines to master practical skills. They also noted that most of the comments they had made were being eliminated. The average student satisfaction is about 85%

Teaching staff, administration and collegial advisory bodies are involved in the process of monitoring the implementation of the EP. Academic achievements of students are discussed at the level of the department, the ACPD after each examination session, and annually in the SCU. The results of the assessments and the decisions taken are subsequently documented in the annual report on the activities of the chair/department.

The main proof of mastering the EP is the achievement by graduates of the final learning outcomes, which is demonstrated by them at the FSC. The average of FSC score tends mainly to decrease (2017 – 4,0; 2018 – 3,9; 2019 – 3,8; 2020 – 3,4), including the OSPE (2017 – 17,5; 2018 – 22,5; 2019 – 16,8; 2020 – 16,5), the absolute academic performance of graduates over the past two years is about 98%, which is given in the appendix to the self-report.

The University analyzes the results of feedback from students, teachers and employers.

Analytical part

The standard "Evaluation of the educational program" meets the requirements of the IAAR accreditation.

Within the framework of EP 1-79 01 08 "Pharmacy", mechanisms for evaluating EP are provided, which is confirmed by the data of the report and is proved by the results of questionnaires and interviews.

At the university, problems that lead to insufficient achievement of the expected final learning outcomes are considered at all levels.

ATSMU uses the results of intermediate and final evaluation to analyze the progress of students. For graduates of the Pharmacy Department, there is a tendency to a drop in the average score, the percentage of absolute academic performance, and for 1-2 courses – the quality of education (in %), which indicates that either the program of corrective measures developed based on the results of the current and final certification is not carried out or is not effective.

The University collects and analyzes the results of stakeholders' feedback.

Strengths according to the standard.

According to this standard, no strengths have been identified.

Recommendations to the EP 1-79 01 08 "Pharmacy":

The head of the EP should use the results of the final learning outcomes demonstrated at the final certification to carry out corrective measures and improve the educational program in the 2022-2023 academic year

The conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:

Strong – 0; satisfactory – 23; suggest improvement – 1; unsatisfactory - 0.

6.8. The Standard “MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION”

The evidentiary part

The first head of the university is the rector. The direct management of the Pharmacy Department is carried out by the Dean. The forms of collegial management of the university are: SCU, Rector's office, ACPD, advisory bodies – Educational and Methodological Council, Coordinating Council, Clinical Council. The SCU and the Educational and Methodological Council also include students.

ATSMU is a legal entity in the organizational and legal form of a State Educational Institution and has an independent balance sheet, bank accounts and official symbols. The University is funded for the current year in the context of budget programs on the basis of a budget application approved by the Ministry of Health and Social Protection of the Population of the Republic of Tajikistan.

In addition to the state order, ATSMU provides paid services: educational under contracts with private and legal entities, other types of licensed and unlicensed activities permitted by the Legislation of the Republic of Tajikistan.

The planned revenues and expenses of ATSMU are approved by the Ministry of Health and Social Protection of the Population of the Republic of Tajikistan.

The internal structure of the university is not static, and as the university grows and develops, the necessary adjustments and changes are made. The responsibilities of each structural unit and employees are established in the regulations on structural units and in job descriptions.

Pharmacy production bases, in accordance with the contracts, have created conditions for the preparation of students, with the provision of the necessary number of educational and industrial premises to the departments of ATSMU; conditions for full participation in the production process to the employees of the chairs of ATSMU.

Analytical part

The standard "Management and Administration" meets the requirements of the IAAR accreditation.

The Department of Pharmacy at ATSMU has administrative and managerial staff to implement EP 1-79 01 08 "Pharmacy", to ensure proper management and administration. EP 1-79 01 08 "Pharmacy" is implemented in accordance with the requirements of regulatory legal acts.

For structural divisions, their responsibility is defined. The university has ensured transparency of the management system and decisions made, which was revealed during the interview and according to the results of the questionnaire.

The University allocates the resources necessary for the implementation of EP 1-79 01 08 "Pharmacy", which is well shown by the example of the creation of the educational research and production center "Pharmacy".

Strengths according to the standard.

According to this standard, no strengths have been identified.

Recommendations for EP 1-79 01 08 "Pharmacy":

There are no recommendations for this standard.

The conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:

strong – 0; satisfactory – 17; suggest improvement – 0; unsatisfactory – 0.

6.9. The Standard "CONTINUOUS IMPROVEMENT"

The evidentiary part

ATSMU is a dynamically developing educational institution. The University's development strategy was revised and supplemented in the planned time periods. The Action plan for the implementation of the Development Strategy until 2025 was discussed and adopted at the meeting of the Academic Council by decision No. 11 of 30.06.2017. The development strategy corresponds to the priorities of the Education Development Strategy for 2018-2025.

In 2019, ATSMU passed the IAAR institutional accreditation (certificate No. 47 dated 22.11.2019 for 5 years).

An example of the process of updating and dynamic development of a university is the development of a Strategic Plan of ATSMU in accordance with the requirements in the state for universities, healthcare and medicine.

The mission and main directions of the Strategic Plan of ATSMU involve further development and strengthening of the material and technical base to improve the learning environment, to ensure the implementation of educational programs and the quality of clinical training of specialists.

The process of constant updating and improvement is also carried out through the introduction of new learning technologies.

The regularly conducted SWOT analysis of the internal and external environment of ATSMU represents the implementation of priority directions of the strategic development of the university, taking into account the established traditions, values and corporate culture of the University.

To improve the EP, all interested parties are constantly involved to varying degrees.

Analytical part

The standard "Continuous Improvement" meets the requirements of the IAAR accreditation.

The ATSMU regularly reviews the content, the final results of the training of the EP "Pharmacy", which is subject to the State Budget of the Republic of Tajikistan and the documents submitted on request.

ATSMU is in the process of updating the development of evaluation principles, and methods of conducting and the number of exams in accordance with changes in the final results of training and methods of teaching and learning.

The updating of educational resources is fixed in the Strategic Plan of ATSMU.

ATSMU is improving its activities to meet the interests of various groups of stakeholders, as evidenced by the results of the questionnaires presented.

Strengths according to the standard.

According to this standard, no strengths have been identified.

Recommendations for EP 1-79 01 08 "Pharmacy":

There are no recommendations for this standard.

The conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:

Strong – 0; satisfactory – 14; suggest improvement – 0; unsatisfactory – 0.

(VII) OVERVIEW OF STRENGTHS/BEST PRACTICES FOR EACH STANDARD

Standard 1 "Mission and final learning outcomes"

According to this standard, no strengths have been identified

Standard 2 "Educational program"

According to this standard, no strengths have been identified

Standard 3 "Assessment of student"

According to this standard, no strengths have been identified.

Standard 4 "Students"

According to this standard, no strengths have been identified.

Standard 5 "Academic staff/teachers"

According to this standard, no strengths have been identified.

Standard 6 "Educational resources"

Good cooperation with the practical health sector in terms of ensuring the availability of vocational training for students

Standard 7 "Evaluation of the educational program"

According to this standard, no strengths have been identified.

Standard 8 "Management and Administration"

According to this standard, no strengths have been identified

Standard 9 "Continuous improvement"

According to this standard, no strengths have been identified.

(VIII) OVERVIEW RECOMMENDATIONS FOR QUALITY IMPROVEMENT FOR EACH STANDARD

Recommendations for EP 1-79 01 08 "Pharmacy":

According to the standard "Mission and final learning outcomes":

1 Руководителю ОП обеспечить информирование всех стейкхолдеров о содержании миссии ОП путем размещения на сайте университета и другими средствами (на всех языках) к маю 2022. 1 To ensure that the head of the EP informs all stakeholders about the content of the mission of the EP by posting on the university's website and by other means (in all languages) by May 2022.

2 Руководителю ОП обеспечить участие всех стейкхолдеров в разработке и/или корректировке миссии ОП и отразить их мнения и предложения к сентябрю 2022.

2 To ensure that the head of EP provides participation of all stakeholders in the development and/or adjustment of the mission of the EP and reflect their opinions and suggestions to by September 2022.

According to the "Educational program" standard

1. The developers of the EP are recommended to revise the curriculum to ensure the real integration of fundamental disciplines as part of the training modules by September 2022

2. The developers of the EP should include in the curriculum and/or content of disciplines and in the system of evaluation of educational achievements the implementation of elements of scientific research by students on an ongoing basis by September 2022

3. The head of the EP is recommended to include in the curriculum and/or educational content knowledge of medical law and the legislative framework of practical healthcare and drug provision by September 2022

4. The head of the EP should take the necessary measures to increase the planned time for practicing the professional skills of a pharmacist in specialized disciplines by the 2022-2023 academic years

5. The head of the EP, during the subsequent revision, should involve employers in the development of the curriculum and determining the final results of training.

According to the standard "Assessment of students"

1. The head of the EP should implement an assessment of practical skills at the level of summative assessment using a wide range of techniques by September 2022

2. The head of the EP should introduce psychometric analysis of control measuring instruments on an ongoing basis by September 2022

3. Increase the number of test tasks per examinee to at least 90 per discipline in basic medical and specialized pharmaceutical disciplines by September 2022

According to the standard "Students"

There are no recommendations for this standard.

According to the standard "Academic staff/teachers"

1. It is recommended that the university management consider the possibility of reducing the number of students in groups, especially in specialized disciplines, in order to increase the level of mastering professional skills

According to the standard "Educational resources"

1. The head of the OP should increase the number of students and staff of the Department of Pharmacy participating in academic mobility programs in the 2022-2023 academic year.

According to the standard "Evaluation of the educational program"

1. The head of the OP should use the results of the final learning outcomes demonstrated at the final certification to carry out corrective measures and improve the educational program in the 2022-2023 academic year

According to the standard "Management and Administration"

There are no recommendations for this standard.

According to the standard "Continuous Improvement"

There are no recommendations for this standard.

(IX) OVERVIEW RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE ORGANIZATION OF EDUCATION

There are no recommendations for the development of the organization of education.

(X) RECOMMENDATION TO THE ACCREDITATION COUNCIL

The external Expert Commission made a unanimous decision: to recommend to the Accreditation Council to accredit the educational program 1-790108 "Pharmacy" of the State Educational Institution "Tajik State Medical University named after Abuali Ibni Sino" for a period of 5 (five) years.

Appendix 1. Evaluation table "Conclusion of the external Expert Commission"

#	# numbers in order	# Criteria	EVALUATION CRITERIA	Educational organization's position			
				Strong	Satisfactory	Suggest improvement	Unsatisfactory
		1.	"MISSION AND RESULTS"				
		1.1.	Mission Definition				
1	1	1.1.1	Medical educational organization should define its mission and the EP's mission and communicate it to stakeholders and the health sector.			+	
			The mission statement should include goals and an educational strategy to train a competent doctor at the level of basic medical education:				
2	2	1.1.2	with an appropriate foundation for a further career in any field of medicine, including all types of medical practice, administrative medicine and research in medicine		+		
3	3	1.1.3	capable of performing the role and functions of a doctor in accordance with the established requirements of the health sector		+		
4	4	1.1.4	prepared for postgraduate study		+		
5	5	1.1.5	with a commitment to lifelong learning, which includes professional responsibility to support the level of knowledge and skills through performance evaluation, auditing, studying one's own practices and recognized activities in the continuous professional development and continuous medical education .		+		
6	6	1.1.6	Medical educational organization should ensure that its mission includes medical research achievements in the biomedical, clinical, behavioral, and social sciences.		+		
7	7	1.1.7	Medical educational organization should ensure that the mission includes aspects of global health and reflects major international health issues.		+		
		1.2	Participation in mission formulation				
8	8	1.2.1	Medical educational organization should ensure that key stakeholders are involved in the development of the EP's mission.			+	
9	9	1.2.2	Medical educational organization should ensure that the stated mission of the EP is based on the views/suggestions of other relevant stakeholders.			+	
		1.3	Institutional autonomy and academic freedom		+		
			Medical educational organization should have		+		

			institutional autonomy to develop and implement policies for which the administration and department are responsible in relation to:				
10	10	1.3.1	development and drafting of the educational program;		+		
11	11	1.3.2	use of the allocated resources necessary for the implementation of the educational program.		+		
			Medical educational organization should guarantee academic freedom to its staff and students:		+		
12	12	1.3.3	in relation to the current educational program, which will be allowed to rely on different points of view in the description and analysis of questions on medicine;		+		
12	12	1.3.4	the possibility of using the results of new research to improve the study of specific disciplines / issues without expanding the educational program.		+		
		1.4	Final learning outcomes				
		1.4.1	The medical educational organization should determine the expected final learning outcomes that students should show upon completion regarding:		+		
13	13		their achievements at a basic level in terms of knowledge, skills and abilities;				
14	14		an appropriate foundation for a future career in any branch of medicine;				
15	15		their future roles in the health sector;				
16	16		their role in the health sector.				
17	17		their commitment to lifelong learning;				
18	18		the health needs of society, the needs of the health system, and other aspects of social responsibility.				
19	19	1.4.2	Medical educational organization should ensure that the student fulfills his or her obligations to doctors, teachers, patients and their relatives in accordance with appropriate standards of conduct.		+		
20	20	1.4.3	Medical educational organization should identify and coordinate the relationship of the final learning outcomes required upon completion with those required in post-graduate training		+		
21	21	1.4.4	Medical educational organization should determine the results of involving students in conducting research in medicine;		+		
22	22	1.4.5	Medical educational organization should pay attention to the final results related to global health;		+		
23	23	1.4.6	Medical educational organization should use the results of the assessment of graduates ' competencies as a feedback tool for improving the educational program.		+		
			Total		20	3	
		2	EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM				
		2.1	Educational program model and teaching methods				
24	1	2.1.1	Medical educational organization should define an educational program that includes an integrated model based on disciplines, organ systems, clinical			+	

			problems and diseases, a model based on modular or spiral design.				
25	2	2.1.2	Medical educational organization should define the teaching and learning methods used that encourage, prepare and support students to take responsibility for their learning process.		+		
26	3	2.1.3	Medical educational organization should ensure that the educational program develops students ' lifelong learning abilities.		+		
27	4	2.1.4	Medical educational organization must ensure that the educational program is implemented in accordance with the principles of equality.		+		
28	5	2.1.5	Medical educational organization teaching and learning methods,obased on the modern theory of adult education should be used.		+		
		2.2	Scientific method				
		2.2.1	Medical educational organization should teach students throughout the entire training program:				
29	6		principles of scientific methodology, including methods of analytical and critical thinking;		+		
30	7		scientific research methods in medicine;		+		
31	8		evidence-based medicine,		+		
32	9		which require the appropriate competence of teachers and will be a mandatory part of the educational program.		+		
33	10	2.2.2	Medical educational organization should include elements of scientific research in the educational program for the formation of scientific thinking and the application of scientific research methods.		+		
34	11	2.2.3	Medical education organizations should promote the involvement of students in conducting or participating in research projects.		+		
			Basic biomedical sciences				
			Medical organization of education should define and include in the educational program:				
35	12	2.3.1	achievements in basic biomedical sciences to develop students ' understanding of scientific knowledge;		+		
36	13	2.3.2	concepts and methods that are fundamental to the acquisition and application of clinical scientific knowledge.		+		
			Medical organization of education should adjust and introduce new achievements in biomedical sciences in the educational program for:				
37	14	2.3.3	scientific, technological and clinical developments;		+		
38	15	2.3.4	current and expected needs of society and the healthcare system.		+		
		2.4	Behavioral and Social Sciences and Medical Ethics				
		2.4.1	Medical educational organization should identify and include in the educational program the following achievements:		+		
39	16		behavioral sciences;		+		
40	17		social sciences;		+		

41	18		medical ethics;		+		
42	19		medical jurisprudence, which will provide the knowledge, concepts, methods, skills and attitudes necessary to understand socio-economic, demographic and cultural issues. understanding the causes, distribution and consequences of medical health problems, as well as knowledge about the national health system and patient rights, which will contribute to the analysis of public health problems, effective communication, clinical decision-making and ethical practice.			+	
		2.4.2	Medical educational organization should adjust and introduce new achievements in behavioral and social sciences and medical ethics in the educational program for:		+		
43	20		scientific, technological and clinical developments;		+		
44	21		current and expected needs of society and the healthcare system;		+		
45	22		changing demographics and cultural conditions.		+		
		2.5	Clinical Sciences and skills				
			Medical educational organization should define and implement clinical science achievements in the educational program and ensure that students:				
46	23	2.5.1	acquire sufficient knowledge and clinical and professional skills to take on appropriate responsibilities, including activities related to health promotion, disease prevention and patient care;		+		
47	24	2.5.2	carry out a reasonable part (one third) of the program in planned contacts with patients, including consideration of the goal, the appropriate number and their sufficiency for training in appropriate clinical databases;			+	
48	25	2.5.3	carry out health promotion and prevention activities.		+		
49	26	2.5.4	Medical educational organization should set a certain amount of time for training in the main clinical disciplines, including internal medicine, surgery, psychiatry, general medical practice (family medicine), obstetrics and gynecology, and pediatrics.		+		
50	27	2.5.5	Medical educational organization should organize clinical training with appropriate attention to patient safety, including monitoring the student's activities in the conditions of clinical bases.		+		
			Medical educational organization should adjust and introduce new achievements in clinical sciences in the educational program for:				
51	28	2.5.6	scientific, technological and clinical developments;		+		
52	29	2.5.7	current and expected needs of society and the healthcare system.		+		
53	30	2.5.8	Medical educational organization should guarantee that each student has early contact with real		+		

			patients, including their gradual participation in patient care, including responsibility for the examination and / or treatment of the patient under supervision, which is carried out in the appropriate clinical databases.				
54	31	2.5.9	Medical educational organization should structure the various components of clinical skills training according to the specific stage of the training program.		+		
		2.6	Structure of the educational program, content and duration				
55	32	2.6.1	Medical educational organization should describe the content, scope and sequence of courses and other elements of the educational program in order to ensure that an appropriate balance is maintained between the basic biomedical, behavioral, social and clinical disciplines.		+		
			Medical organization of education should include in the educational program:		+		
56	33	2.6.2	ensure horizontal integration of related sciences and disciplines;		+		
57	34	2.6.3	ensure vertical integration of clinical sciences with basic biomedical and behavioral and social sciences;		+		
58	35	2.6.4	provide the possibility of elective content (ellektivny) and determine the balance between the mandatory and elective part of the educational program, which includes a combination of mandatory elements and electives or special components of choice;		+		
59	36	2.6.5	determine the relationship with complementary medicine, including non-traditional, traditional, or alternative practices.		+		
		2.7	Program management				
60	37	2.7.1	Medical educational organization should identify a structural unit responsible for educational programs that, under the direction of academic leadership, has the responsibility and authority to plan and implement the educational program, including the allocation of allocated resources for planning and implementing teaching and learning methods, evaluating students, and evaluating the educational program and courses of study, in order to ensure that the final results are learning outcomes.		+		
61	38	2.7.2	Medical educational organization should guarantee representation from teachers and students in the structural unit responsible for educational programs.		+		
62	39	2.7.3	Medical educational organization should plan and implement innovations in the educational program through the structural unit responsible for educational programs.		+		
63	40	2.7.4	Medical educational organization should include representatives from other relevant stakeholders in the structural unit of the medical educational		+		

			organization responsible for educational programs that include other participants in the educational process, representatives from clinical databases, graduates of medical educational organizations, healthcare professionals involved in the training process, or others. Department members of the university.				
		2.8	Communication with medical practice and the health care system				
64	41	2.8.1	Medical educational organization should provide an operational link between the educational program and the subsequent stages of professional training (internship if available, specialization, continuous professional development and continuous medical education .) or the internship that the student will start at the end of their studies, including identifying health problems and determining the required learning outcomes, clearly defining identify and describe the elements of the educational program and their relationships at various stages of training and practice, with due regard to local, national, regional and global circumstances, as well as feedback to/from the health sector and the involvement of teachers and students in the work of the specialist team in providing health care.		+		
			Medical organization of education should ensure that the structural unit responsible for the educational program:				
65	42	2.8.2	takes into account the specifics of the conditions in which graduates will work and accordingly modify the educational program;		+		
66	43	2.8.3	considers the modification of the educational program based on feedback from the public and society as a whole.		+		
			Total		40	3	
		3.	STUDENT ASSESSMENT				
		3.1	Assessment methods				
			Medical educational organization should:				
67	1	3.1.1	define, approve and publish the principles, methods and practices used to evaluate students, including the number of exams and other tests, maintaining a balance between written and oral exams, using criteria-based and reasoning-based assessment methods, and special exams (OSCE or Mini-clinical examination), as well as define criteria for establishing passing scores, grades, and the number of allowed retakes;		+		
68	2	3.1.2	ensure that the assessment covers knowledge, skills, and attitudes to learning;		+		
69	3	3.1.3	use a wide range of assessment methods and formats depending on their "utility assessment", which includes a combination of validity, reliability, impact on learning, acceptability and effectiveness			+	

			of the assessment methods and format;				
70	4	3.1.4	ensure that the evaluation methods and results avoid conflicts of interest;		+		
71	5	3.1.5	ensure that the evaluation process and methods are open (accessible) for external experts to review;		+		
72	6	3.1.6	use the system of appeal of evaluation results.		+		
			Medical educational organization should:				
73	7	3.1.7	document and evaluate the reliability and validity of the data, evaluation methods, which requires an appropriate quality assurance process for existing evaluation practices;			+	
74	8	3.1.8	implement new evaluation methods as needed;		+		
75	9	3.1.9	use the system to appeal evaluation results.		+		
		3.2	Relationship between assessment and learning				
			Medical educational organization should use principles, methods and practices of assessment that include students' academic achievements and assessment of knowledge, skills, and professional values of relationships that:				
76	10	3.2.1	clearly comparable to teaching methods, teaching methods and final learning outcomes;		+		
77	11	3.2.2	ensure that students achieve their final learning outcomes;			+	
78	12	3.2.3	promote student learning;		+		
79	13	3.2.4	provide an appropriate balance between formative and summative assessment to manage learning and evaluate student academic progress, which requires establishing rules for assessing progress and their relationship to the assessment process.		+		
			Medical educational organization should:				
80	14	3.2.5	regulate the number and nature of inspections of various elements of the educational program in order to promote knowledge acquisition and integrated learning, and to avoid negative impact on the learning process and eliminate the need to study an excessive amount of information and overload the educational program;			+	
81	15	3.2.6	ensure that timely, specific, constructive and fair feedback is provided to students based on the assessment results.		+		
			Total		11	4	
		4.	STUDENTS				
		4.1	Admission and Selection Policy				
			The medical educational organization should:				
82	1	4.1.1	define and implement an admission policy, including a clearly defined provision on the student selection process;		+		
83	2	4.1.2	have a policy and implement the practice of admitting students with disabilities in accordance with the current laws and regulations of the country;		+		
84	3	4.1.3	have a policy and policy and implement the practice of transferring students from other programs and medical organizations of education.		+		

			Medical educational organization should:				
85	4	4.1.4	establish the relationship between the selection of students and the mission of the medical educational organization, the educational program and the desired quality of graduates;		+		
86	5	4.1.5	periodically review the admission policy, based on relevant data from the public and professionals, in order to meet the health needs of the population and society as a whole, including consideration of student recruitment based on their gender, ethnic origin and language, and the potential need for special admission policies for students from low-income families and national minorities;		+		
87	6	4.1.6	use the system to appeal admission decisions.		+		
		4.2	Student recruitment				
88	7	4.2.1	Medical organization of education should determine the number of students accepted in accordance with the material and technical capabilities at all stages of training and preparation, and make a decision on the recruitment of students, which implies the need to regulate national requirements for health personnel resources. in the event that medical organizations of education do not control the number of students recruited, they should demonstrate their obligations by: explain all relationships, paying attention to the consequences of the decisions made (the imbalance between the recruitment of students and the material, technical and academic potential of the university).		+		
89	8	4.2.2	Medical education organization should periodically review the number and enrollment of students in consultation with relevant stakeholders responsible for planning and developing human resources in the health sector, as well as with experts and organizations on global aspects of human resources in health (such as insufficient and uneven distribution of human resources in health, migration of doctors, opening of new medical universities) and regulate in order to meet the health needs of the population and society as a whole.		+		
		4.3	Student counseling and support				
			Medical educational organization should:				
90	1	4.3.1	have a system of academic counseling for their students, which includes questions related to the selection of electives, preparation for postgraduate studies, professional career planning, appointment of academic mentors (mentors) for individual students or small groups of students;		+		
91	2	4.3.2	offer a student support program focused on social, financial and personal needs, which includes support related to social and personal problems and events, health and financial issues, access to health care, immunization programs and health insurance,		+		

			as well as financial assistance services in the form of financial assistance, scholarships and loans;				
92	3	4.3.3	allocate resources to support students;		+		
93	4	4.3.4	ensure confidentiality regarding advice and support.		+		
			Medical educational organization should provide counseling that:		+		
94	5	4.3.5	is based on monitoring student progress and addresses students ' social and personal needs, including academic support, support for personal problems and situations, health problems, financial issues;		+		
95	6	4.3.6	includes counseling and professional career planning.		+		
		4.4	Student representation				
96	7	4.4.1	Medical educational organization should define and implement policies for student representation and appropriate participation in mission definition, program design, management, and evaluation, and other matters relevant to students.		+		
97	8	4.4.2	Medical educational organization should promote and support student activities and student organizations, including providing technical and financial support to student organizations.		+		
			Total		17		
		5.	ACADEMIC STAFF/TEACHERS				
		5.1	Selection and Recruitment Policy				
			Medical educational organization should define and implement a staff selection and recruitment policy that:				
98	1	5.1.1	defines their category, responsibilities, and balance of academic staff/teachers in basic biomedical sciences, behavioral and social sciences, and clinical sciences in order to adequately implement the educational program, including an appropriate balance between medical and social sciences teachers. non-medical staff, full-time or part-time teachers, as well as the balance between academic and non-academic staff;		+		
99	2	5.1.2	contains criteria for the scientific, pedagogical and clinical merits of applicants, including the appropriate ratio between pedagogical, scientific and clinical qualifications;		+		
100	3	5.1.3	defines and monitors the responsibilities of academic staff/department in basic biomedical sciences, behavioral and social sciences, and clinical sciences.		+		
			Medical educational organization should take into account the following criteria in its recruitment policy:				
101	4	5.1.4	attitude to its mission, the significance of local conditions, including gender, nationality, religion, language and other conditions relevant to the medical organization of education and the		+		

			educational program;				
102	5	5.1.5	economic opportunities that take into account the institutional environment for employee funding and efficient use of resources.		+		
		5.2	Employee Development Policy and Activities The				
			Medical educational organization should define and implement an employee development policy that:				
104	6	5.2.1	allows you to maintain a balance between teaching, research and service functions, which includes setting the time for each type of activity, taking into account the needs of the medical educational organization and the professional qualifications of teachers;		+		
105	7	5.2.2	guarantees the recognition of academic performance, with appropriate emphasis on teaching, research and clinical qualifications, and is implemented in the form of awards, promotions and / or remuneration;		+		
106	8	5.2.3	ensures that clinical activities and research are used in teaching and learning;		+		
107	9	5.2.4	ensures that each employee has sufficient knowledge of the educational program, which includes knowledge of teaching/learning methods and the general content of the educational program, as well as other disciplines and subject areas in order to encourage cooperation and integration;		+		
108	10	5.2.5	includes training, development, support and evaluation of teachers' activities, which involves all teachers, not only newly hired, but also teachers drawn from hospitals and clinics.		+		
			Medical educational organization should:				
109	11	5.2.6	take into account the ratio of "teacher-student " depending on the various components of the educational program;		+		
110	12	5.2.7	develop and implement employee promotion policies.		+		
			Total		12		
		6.	EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES				
		6.1	Material and technical base				
			Medical educational organization should:				
111	1	6.1.1	have sufficient material and technical base for teachers and students to ensure adequate implementation of the educational program;		+		
112	2	6.2.2	provide a safe environment for employees, students, patients and their caregivers, including: providing the necessary information and protection from harmful substances, microorganisms, compliance with safety regulations in the laboratory and when using equipment.		+		
113	3	6.1.3	Medical educational organization should improve the learning environment of students by regularly updating, expanding and strengthening the material and technical base, which should correspond to		+		

			developments in the practice of training.				
		6.2	Resources for clinical training				
			Medical educational organization should provide the necessary resources for students to acquire adequate clinical experience, including sufficient:				
114	4	6.2.1	number and categories of patients;		+		
115	5	6.2.2	number and categories of clinical bases that include clinics, outpatient services (including primary health care), primary health care facilities, health centers and other public health care facilities, as well as clinical skills centers/laboratories that allow for clinical training, using the capabilities of clinical databases and provide rotation in the main clinical disciplines;	+			
116	6	6.2.3	monitoring of students ' clinical practice.		+		
117	7	6.2.4	Medical educational organization should study and evaluate, adapt and improve clinical training resources to meet the needs of the population served, which will include compliance and quality for clinical training programs in relation to clinical facilities, equipment, number and category of patients and clinical practice, supervision as a supervisor and administration.		+		
		6.3	Information technology				
118	8	6.3.1	Medical educational organization should define and implement policies that aim to effectively use and evaluate relevant information and communication technologies in the educational program.		+		
119	9	6.3.2	Medical educational organization should provide access to online or other electronic media		+		
			Medical educational organization should provide teachers and students with opportunities to use information and communication technologies:				
120	10	6.3.3	for self-study;		+		
121	11	6.3.4	access to information;		+		
122	12	6.3.5	patient management;		+		
123	13	6.3.6	work in the healthcare system.		+		
124	14	6.3.7	Medical educational organization should optimize students ' access to relevant patient data and health information systems.		+		
		6.4	Medical research and scientific achievements				
			Medical educational organization should:				
125	15	6.4.1	have medical research and scientific achievements as the basis for the educational program;		+		
126	16	6.4.2	define and implement policies that promote the relationship between research and education;		+		
127	17	6.4.3	provide information on the research base and priority areas in the field of scientific research of the medical educational organization;		+		
128	18	6.4.4	use medical scientific research as a basis for the curriculum		+		
			Medical educational organization should ensure that the relationship between research and education:		+		

129	19	6.4.5	is taken into account in teaching;		+		
130	20	6.4.6	encourages and prepares students to participate in scientific research in the field of medicine and their development.		+		
		6.5	Expertise in the field of education				
			The medical educational organization should:				
131	21	6.5.1	have access to educational expertise, where appropriate, and conduct expertise that examines the processes, practices, and problems of medical education and can involve physicians with experience in conducting research in medical education, psychologists, and sociologists in the field of education, or through involve experts from other national and international institutions.		+		
			Medical educational organization should define and implement a policy on the use of expertise in the field of education:		+		
132	22	6.5.2	in the development of the educational program;		+		
133	23	6.5.3	in the development of teaching methods and assessment of knowledge and skills.		+		
			Medical educational organization should:		+		
134	24	6.5.4	provide evidence of the use of internal or external expertise in the field of medical education to develop the capacity of employees;		+		
135	25	6.5.5	pay due attention to the development of expertise in educational assessment and research in medical education as a discipline that includes the study of theoretical, practical and social issues in medical education;		+		
136	26	6.5.6	promote the commitment and interests of employees in conducting research in medical education.		+		
		6.6	Exchange in the field of education				
			Medical educational organization should define and implement policies for:				
137	27	6.6.1	cooperation at the national and international levels with other medical universities;		+		
138	28	6.6.2	transfer and offsetting of educational credits, which includes consideration of the limits of the scope of the educational program that can be transferred from other educational organizations and which can be facilitated by the conclusion of agreements on mutual recognition of educational program elements, and active coordination of programs between medical educational organizations and the use of a transparent system of credit units and flexible course requirements.		+		
			Medical educational organization should:				
139	29	6.6.3	promote regional and international exchange of staff (academic, administrative and teaching staff) and students by providing appropriate resources;			+	
140	30	6.6.4	ensure that the exchange is organized in accordance with the objectives, taking into account the needs of employees, students, and in compliance with ethical		+		

			principles.				
			Total	1	28	1	
		7.	EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM				
		7.1	Mechanisms for monitoring and evaluating the program				
			Medical educational organization should				
141	1	7.1.1	have a program for monitoring processes and outcomes, including collecting and analyzing data on key aspects of the educational program in order to ensure that the educational process is carried out appropriately and to identify any areas requiring intervention. Data collection is also part of administrative procedures related to student admissions, student assessment, and graduation.		+		
142	2	7.1.2	ensure that the relevant evaluation results affect the curriculum			+	
			Medical educational organization should establish and apply mechanisms for evaluating the educational program that:				
143	3	7.1.3	are aimed at the educational program and its main components, including the model of the educational program, the structure, content and duration of the educational program, and the use of mandatory and elective parts;		+		
144	4	7.1.4	recommendations on the student's progress;		+		
145	5	7.1.5	identify and address problems that include insufficient achievement of the expected final learning outcomes, and will assume that the information received about the final learning outcomes, including identified shortcomings and problems, will be used as feedback for implementing activities and corrective action plans, for improving the educational program and discipline curricula;		+		
			Medical educational organization should periodically conduct a comprehensive assessment of the educational program, directed to:		+		
146	6	7.1.6	on the context of the educational process, which includes the organization and resources, learning environment and culture of the medical educational organization;		+		
147	7	7.1.7	for special components of the educational program, which include a description of the discipline and methods of teaching and learning, clinical rotations and assessment methods;		+		
148	8	7.1.8	for general final results, which will be measured by the results of national exams, international exams, career choices and post-graduate training results;		+		
149	9	7.1.9	Medical educational organization should rely on social responsibility / accountability.		+		
		7.2	Teacher and student feedback				
150	10	7.2.1	Medical educational organization should		+		

			systematically collect, analyze and provide teachers and students with feedback that includes information about the process and products of the educational program, and also include information about unfair practices or inappropriate behavior of teachers or students with legal consequences.				
151	11	7.2.2	Medical educational organization should use the feedback results to improve the educational program.		+		
		7.3	Academic achievements of students				
			Medical educational organization should conduct an analysis of students ' academic achievements in relation to:				
152	12	7.3.1	its mission and final learning outcomes of the educational program, which includes information on the average duration of study, academic performance scores, the frequency of passing and failing exams, cases of successful completion and expulsion, student reports on the conditions of study in the courses taken, on the time spent studying areas of interest, including elective components, as well as interviews with students on repeat courses, and interviewing students who have leaves the training program;		+		
153	13	7.3.2	of the educational program;		+		
154	14	7.3.3.	availability of resources.		+		
			Medical educational organization should analyze the academic achievements of students in relation to:		+		
155	15	7.3.4	their previous experience and conditions, including social, economic, cultural conditions;		+		
156	16	7.3.5	level of training at the time of admission to a medical educational organization.		+		
			Medical organization of education should use the analysis of students ' academic achievements to provide feedback to the structural divisions responsible for::		+		
157	17	7.3.6	student selection;		+		
158	18	7.3.7	planning the educational program;		+		
159	19	7.3.8	advising students.		+		
		7.4	Stakeholder engagement				
			Medical educational organization should include in its monitoring program and educational program evaluation activities:				
160	20	7.4.1	Teching staff and students;		+		
161	21	7.4.2	its administration and management.		+		
			Medical educational organization should be open to other stakeholders, including other representatives of academic and administrative staff, members of the public, authorized bodies for education and health, professional organizations, as well as those responsible for postgraduate education:		+		
162	22	7.4.3	provide access to the results of the course and		+		

			educational program assessment;				
163	23	7.4.4	collect and study feedback from them on the clinical practice of graduates;		+		
164	24	7.4.5	collect and study feedback from them on the educational program.		+		
			Total		23	1	
		8.	MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION				
		8.1	Management				
165	1	8.1.1	Medical educational organization should define the management structures and functions, including their relationship with the university, if the medical educational organization is a part or branch of the university.		+		
			Medical educational organization should define structural divisions in its management structures, defining the responsibilities of each structural division, and include in their composition:				
166	2	8.1.2	representatives of academic staff;		+		
167	3	8.1.3	students;		+		
168	4	8.1.4	other stakeholders, including representatives of the Ministry of Education and Health, the public health sector.		+		
169	5	8.1.5	Medical educational organization should ensure transparency of the management system and decisions made, which are published in bulletins, posted on web-site, the university's website, and included in protocols for review and implementation.		+		
		8.2	Academic guidance				
170	6	8.2.1	Medical educational organization should clearly define the responsibility of academic management in relation to the development and management of the educational program.		+		
171	7	8.2.2	Medical educational organization should periodically evaluate academic leadership regarding the achievement of its mission and ultimate learning outcomes.		+		
		8.3	Training and resource allocation budget				
			Medical educational organization should:				
172	8	8.3.1	have a clear range of responsibilities and powers for providing the educational program with resources, including the target budget for training;		+		
173	9	8.3.2	allocate the resources necessary for the implementation of the educational program and allocate educational resources in accordance with their needs.		+		
174	10	8.3.3	The system of financing of medical educational organization should be based on the principles of efficiency, priority, transparency, responsibility, differentiation and independence of all levels of budgets.		+		
			Medical educational organization should:				
175	11	8.3.4	provide sufficient autonomy in the allocation of		+		

			resources, including decent remuneration of teachers in order to achieve the final learning outcomes;				
176	12	8.3.5	when allocating resources, take into account scientific achievements in the field of medicine and public health problems and their needs.		+		
		8.4	Administrative staff and management				
			Medical educational organization should have an appropriate administrative staff, including their number and composition in accordance with their qualifications, in order to:				
177	13	8.4.1	ensure the implementation of the educational program and related activities;		+		
178	14	8.4.2	ensure proper management and allocation of resources.		+		
179	15	8.4.3	Medical educational organization should develop and implement an internal quality assurance management program, including consideration of needs for improvement, and conduct a regular review and review of management.		+		
		8.5	Interaction with the health sector				
180	16	8.5.1	Medical educational organization should have a constructive interaction with the health sector, with related health sectors of society and government, including information exchange, cooperation and initiatives of the organization, which contributes to the provision of qualified doctors in accordance with the needs of society.		+		
181	17	8.5.2	Medical educational organization should be given a formal status of cooperation with partners in the health sector, which includes the conclusion of formal agreements defining the content and forms of cooperation and/or the conclusion of a joint contract and the establishment of a coordination committee, and conducting joint activities.		+		
			Total		17		
		9.	CONTINUOUS IMPROVEMENT				
			Medical educational organization should, as a dynamic and socially responsible institution:				
182	1	9.1.1	initiate procedures for regular review and revision of the content, results / competencies, assessment and learning environment, structure and function, document and address deficiencies;		+		
183	2	9.1.2	allocate resources for continuous improvement.		+		
			Medical educational organization should:				
184	3	9.1.3	base the update process on prospective results, research and analysis and based on the results of their own research, evaluation and literature on medical education;		+		
185	4	9.1.4	ensure that the renewal and restructuring process results in a review of its policies and practices in accordance with previous experience, current activities and future prospects; direct the renewal		+		

			process to the following issues::				
186	5	9.1.5	Adaptation of the mission statement and final results to the scientific, socio-economic and cultural development of society.		+		
187	6	9.1.6	Modification of the final learning outcomes of graduates in accordance with the documented needs of the postgraduate training environment, including clinical skills, training in public health issues and participation in the process of providing medical care to patients in accordance with the responsibilities that are assigned to graduates after graduation from the Local Public Organizations.		+		
188	7	9.1.7	Adaptation of the educational program model and methodological approaches to ensure that they are appropriate and appropriate and takes into account current theories in education, adult learning methodology, and active learning principles.		+		
189	8	9.1.8	Adjust the elements of the educational program and their relationship in accordance with advances in biomedical, behavioral, social and clinical sciences, with changes in the demographic situation and health / morbidity structure of the population and socio-economic and cultural conditions, and the adjustment process will ensure the inclusion of new relevant knowledge, concepts and methods, and the exclusion of outdated ones.		+		
190	9	9.1.9	Development of assessment principles and methods for conducting and quantity of examinations in accordance with changes in final learning outcomes and teaching and learning methods.		+		
191	10	9.1.10	Adapt student recruitment policies and selection methods to meet changing expectations and circumstances, human resource needs, changes in the pre-university education system, and the needs of the educational program.		+		
192	11	9.1.11	Adapting the policy of recruitment and formation of academic staff in accordance with changing needs.		+		
193	12	9.1.12	Updating educational resources to meet changing needs, such as student recruitment, the number and profile of academic staff, and the educational program.		+		
194	13	9.1.13	Improving the process of monitoring and evaluating the educational program.		+		
195	14	9.1.14	Improve the organizational structure and management principles to ensure effective performance in the face of changing circumstances and needs, and, in the long term, to meet the interests of various groups of stakeholders.		+		
			Total		14		
			IN TOTAL	1	182	12	