



«АККРЕДИТТЕУ ЖӘНЕ РЕЙТИНГТІҢ
ТӘУЕЛСІЗ АГЕНТТІГІ» КЕМ

НУ «НЕЗАВИСИМОЕ АГЕНТСТВО
АККРЕДИТАЦИИ И РЕЙТИНГА»

INDEPENDENT AGENCY FOR
ACCREDITATION AND RATING

REPORT

on the results of the work of the external expert commission for
assessment of compliance with the requirements of standards for
international primary accreditation of residency/ fellowship programs
(based on WFME/AMSE/ESG)

Cluster 2:

7R01150 Pathological Anatomy (primary accreditation)

7R01134 Forensic medicine (primary accreditation)

SOUTH KAZAKHSTAN MEDICAL ACADEMY

in the period from 9 to 11 May 2024

INDEPENDENT AGENCY FOR ACCREDITATION AND RATING
External Expert Commission

Addressed to

IAAR Accreditation Council



REPORT

**on the results of the work of the external expert commission for assessment
of compliance with the requirements of standards for international primary accreditation
of residency/ fellowship programs
(based on WFME/AMSE/ESG)**

Cluster 2:

7R01150 Pathological Anatomy (primary accreditation)

7R01134 Forensic medicine (primary accreditation)

SOUTH KAZAKHSTAN MEDICAL ACADEMY

in the period from 9 to 11 May 2024

2024

Table of contents

(I) LIST OF DESIGNATIONS AND ABBREVIATIONS 3

(II) INTRODUCTION 4

(III) PRESENTATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION 5

(IV) DESCRIPTION OF THE PREVIOUS ACCREDITATION PROCEDURE 7

(V) DESCRIPTION OF THE EEC VISIT 7

(VI) COMPLIANCE WITH THE STANDARDS OF SPECIALIZED ACCREDITATION 9

6.1. The standard "Mission and learning outcomes" 9

6.2. The Standard "Educational program" 13

6.3. The standard "Student Assessment Policy" 18

6.4. The standard "Students" 23

6.5. The standard "Academic staff/Teachers". 28

6.6. Educational Resources Standard 32

6.7. Educational Program Assessment Standard 37

6.8. Management and Administration Standard 40

(VII) OVERVIEW OF STRENGTHS/BEST PRACTICES FOR EACH STANDARD 43

(VIII) OVERVIEW OF THE QUALITY IMPROVEMENT RECOMMENDATIONS FOR EACH STANDARD 44

(IX) REVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION 47

(X) RECOMMENDATION TO THE ACCREDITATION COUNCIL 48

Appendix 1. Evaluation table "Conclusion of the external expert commission" (for the EP residency in the specialty 7R01150 «Pathology»)

Appendix 2: Evaluation table "Conclusion of the external expert commission" (for EP of residency in the specialty 7R01134 "Forensic Medicine") 59

Appendix 2. PROGRAM OF THE VISIT TO THE EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION 71

Appendix 3. RESULTS OF THE QUESTIONNAIRE OF THE ACADEMIC STAFF 77

(I) LIST OF DESIGNATIONS AND ABBREVIATIONS

GPA Weighted average assessment of the level of academic achievements of the student in the chosen specialty

ECTS European Credit Transfer System

Academy Joint Stock Company "South Kazakhstan Medical Academy"

AIS Automated Information System of the Academy

AMS Administrative and managerial staff

BD (L) Basic disciplines (learning)

LIC Library and Information Center

OHPE Organization of higher and postgraduate education

IUQC Intra-university quality control

AC Attestation Commission

SCES The State Compulsory Education Standard

FA Final Attestation

IEP Individual educational plan (resident)

EC Elective component

CREP Committee of Residency Educational Programs

CED Catalog of Elective Disciplines

QCES Quality control of educational services

CTPC Computer-Testing Publishing Center

MC Methodical Council

IAAR Independent Agency FOR Accreditation and Rating

RSRW Resident's scientific research work

NCIE National Center for Independent Examination

SCC Scientific and Clinical Council

EP Educational program

IC Intermediate certification

PD (L) Profile disciplines (learning)

AS Academic staff

WSP Working study plan

QMS Quality Management System

IWR Independent work of the resident

IWRT Independent work of a resident with a teacher

MC Model curriculum

RTRW Resident Training and Research Work

TMC Training and Methodical Center

AC Academic Council

TMCD Training and methodical complex of disciplines

CPS Center of Practical Skills

(II) INTRODUCTION

According to the order №70-24-OD dated 09.02.2024 of the Independent Agency FOR Accreditation and Rating from 9 to 11 May 2024 the external expert commission conducted an assessment of compliance of the educational program 7R01150 Pathological Anatomy (primary accreditation) of the South Kazakhstan Medical Academy according to the standards of international primary accreditation of residency / residency programs (based on WFME / AMSE / ESG) №150-22-OD dated December 21, 2022, edition three.

The report of the External Expert Commission (EEC) contains the evaluation of the submitted educational program to the NAAR criteria, recommendations of the EEC on further improvement of the educational program and parameters of the educational program profile.

The composition of the EEC is as follows:

1) Chairman of the IAAR Commission - Moroz Irina Nikolaevna, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Belarusian State Medical University (Republic of Belarus) Off-line participation

2) IAAR Expert - Larisa Kirichenko, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, Perm State Medical University named after Academician E.A. Wagner, Ministry of Health of Russia (Russian Federation) Off-line Participation

3) IAAR Expert - Omarkulov Bauyrzhan Kadenovich, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, Medical University of Karaganda (Republic of Kazakhstan) Off-line participation

4) IAAR Expert - Shim Victor Robertovich, Department of Outpatient and Polyclinic Pediatrics, NAO S.D. Asfendiyarov KazNMU (Republic of Kazakhstan) Off-line participation

5) IAAR Expert - Gulnar Dostanova Sultanova, Candidate of Medical Sciences, NAO "West Kazakhstan Medical University" (Republic of Kazakhstan), Off-line participation.

6) IAAR Expert - Saulesh Akhatovna Apbasova, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, Semey Medical University (Republic of Kazakhstan) Off-line participation

7) IAAR expert, employer - Saken Arystanovich Katbaev, Public Association "Local trade union of workers of health care organizations 'DENSAULYQ' (Republic of Kazakhstan) Off-line participation

8) IAAR expert, student - Nabiullin Asylkhan, student of the 4th year of the specialty "Medicine", NAO "West Kazakhstan Medical University" (Republic of Kazakhstan) Off-line participation

9) IAAR Expert, student - Kuziev Saidbek Karimovich, 3rd year student of "Forensic medicine", Medical University of Astana (Republic of Kazakhstan) Online participation.

10) IAAR Coordinator - Saidulaeva Malika Akhyadovna, Project Manager of Independent Accreditation and Rating Agency (Republic of Kazakhstan) Off-line participation

(III) PRESENTATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION

Joint Stock Company “South Kazakhstan Medical Academy” (hereinafter - JSC “SKMA”, Academy) was founded in 1979 as a branch of Alma-Ata State Medical Institute (Decree of the Council of Ministers of Kazakh SSR from 03.07.79 № 247 “On organization of the branch of Alma-Ata State Medical Institute in Chimkent”). The report presents normative legal documents regulating the process of transformation and renaming of the branch of Alma-Ata State Medical Institute in JSC “South Kazakhstan Medical Academy” (Decree of the Council of Ministers of the Kazakh SSR from 29.10.1990 № 429; Decree of the Cabinet of Ministers of the RK from 14.07.94. № 778; Resolution of the Government of RK from 25.02.97 № 263; Resolution of the Government of RK from 08.07.2009 № 1037; Resolution of the Government of RK from 09.11.16. № 681 (certificate of state registration of the legal entity from 13.01.2017); Decision № 1 of the Sole Shareholder of JSC “SKGFA” from 13.02. 2018 JSC; certificate of state re-registration of the legal entity from February 21, 2018).

The self-evaluation report was carried out on the basis of the order of the Rector of SKMA “On the formation of working groups for self-evaluation and preparation of the self-evaluation report on the educational programs of SKMA residency” from 28.12.2023 № 152n (Annex of the report 1)

The Academy has a license of the Committee for Control in the sphere of education and science of the MES RK №KZ36LAA00011387, from March 28, 2018, without limitation of term, for the right to carry out educational activities on programs of technical and professional, higher and postgraduate education, according to which the Academy has the right to issue documents on education of state sample (Annex to the license for the direction of training KZ22BFA00167288), has a certificate of institutional accreditation issued by the NAAR from 26.05.2023, registration № AA №0243, term d

The Academy trains specialists of medical, pharmaceutical and engineering-pharmaceutical direction at the level of secondary technical professional education (medical college), higher education (bachelor's degree, internship), postgraduate education (master's degree, doctoral degree, residency); at the level of continuous professional development of health care system personnel (advanced training and retraining of medical and pharmaceutical personnel).

The Academy provides training in Kazakh, Russian and English languages at 42 departments at higher and postgraduate levels of education, on the following OPs:

- 9 Bachelor EPs - “General Medicine” (“Medicine”), “Pediatrics”, “Dentistry”, “Nursing”, “Public Health”, “Pharmacy”, “Technology of Pharmaceutical Production”, “Public Health”, “Medical and Preventive Medicine”.

- 5 Master's degree programs: “Medicine”, “Public Health”, “Nursing”, “Pharmacy” and “Medical and Preventive Medicine”.

- 3 EPs of doctoral studies: “Pharmacy”, “Medicine”, “Public Health”.

- 31 EPs of residency, 29 of which are accredited by NAAR and have a certificate of specialized international accreditation (Residency. Certificate of specialized accreditation).

The Academy carries out active international cooperation in the field of medical education, science and practice with medical and scientific centers of near and far abroad countries. Partners of JSC “UKMA” are: “Nowy Sacz Graduate School of business -National Louis University” (Poland), ‘Institute of Biomedical Research of the University of Barcelona’ (Spain); ‘Institute of Neurology of University College London’ (UK); ‘University of Medicine and Pharmacy’ (Romania); ‘St. Petersburg State Pediatric Medical University’ (Russia), ‘Tashkent Pediatric Medical Institute’ (Uzbekistan) and others.

The Academy carries out 18 scientific and technical projects, the project "Accelerated-Improvement of nursing at the master's and PHD doctoral level in the higher education system of Kazakhstan" within the framework of the Erasmus+ program (2020-2023).

The Academy has resources to ensure the educational process: 4 own and 3 rented academic buildings with classrooms equipped with interactive scientific library with a reading room and an

electronic library hall; research laboratories "Laboratory of Medicinal Plants" and "South Clinical & Genetic Laboratory"; "Center for Practical Skills"; 2 dormitories; 42 clinical bases.

The educational program (EP) of the residency in the specialty 7R01150 "Pathological Anatomy" and EP 7R01134 "Forensic Medicine" was planned for implementation in the academic year 2023/2024. The duration of training in the residency program in the specialty 7R01150 "Pathological Anatomy" and EP 7R01134 "Forensic Medicine" is 2 years. The form of training is full-time.

The persons who have basic medical education, higher medical education in the specialty "General Medicine", "Medicine" "Pediatrics", internship in accordance with the requirements for applicants, which are regulated by the order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan from October 31, 2018 № 600 "On approval of the Model Rules for admission to training in educational organizations implementing educational programs of higher and postgraduate education" (as amended on 27.10.2023). At present there are no students studying on OP specialty 7R01150 "Pathological anatomy" and OP 7R01134 "Forensic medical examination".

The main structural unit coordinating the implementation of the OP on specialties 7R01150 "Pathological Anatomy" and 7R01134 "Forensic Medicine" is the Dean of the residency (Dean Bektenova Gulmira Erseitovna Bektenova, candidate of medical sciences, associate professor).

Realization of OP of residency on specialty 7R01150 "Pathological anatomy" and EP 7R01134 "Forensic Medicine" is carried out at the Department of Pathology and Forensic Medicine of UKMA (Head of the Department, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor Aliya Shamilevna Sadykova).

At present there are students studying on EP of residency on specialties 7R01150 "Pathological anatomy" (no enrollment) and EP 7R01134 "Forensic Medicine" (due to the academic leave of the resident, accepted in 2023 on a paid basis).

As a result of mastering the educational program of residency in the specialty 7R01150 "Pathological anatomy" the graduate should have professional competencies that provide specialized highly qualified pathological anatomical research on postmortem and lifetime diagnosis of patients' diseases. As a result of mastering the educational program of residency in specialty EP 7R01134 "Forensic medical examination" the graduate must have professional competencies that provide specialized highly qualified research in the field of forensic medical examination.

Graduates of EP residency on specialty 7R01150 "Pathological anatomy"/EP 7R01134 "Forensic medical examination" have the opportunity of employment in pathology and anatomy departments of health care institutions / in structural units of the Institute of forensic expertise on Shymkent State Enterprise "CSE MJ RK" and others, in the position of doctor-pathologist / doctor-forensic medical expert, regardless of the form of ownership, to continue training in doctoral studies (PhD) - scientific / pedagogical direction, to obtain additional professional education.

(IV) DESCRIPTION OF THE PREVIOUS ACCREDITATION PROCEDURE

The international specialized accreditation of EP 7R01150 Pathological Anatomy (primary accreditation) and EP 7R01134 "Forensic medicine" (primary accreditation) of the South Kazakhstan Medical Academy according to IAAR standards is held for the first time.

(V) DESCRIPTION OF THE EEC VISIT

The work of the EEC was carried out on the basis of the approved Program of the visit of the expert commission for specialized accreditation of educational programs of UKMA in the period from 9 to 11 May 2024.

In order to coordinate the work of the EEC on 08.05.2024 there was held an on-line introductory meeting, during which the powers were distributed among the members of the Commission, the schedule of the visit was specified, and agreement was reached on the choice of methods of expertise.

To obtain objective information about the quality of educational programs and the entire infrastructure of the university, to clarify the content of self-assessment reports, meetings with the rector, vice-rectors of the university in the areas of activity, heads of structural units, deans, heads of departments, teachers, students were held. A total of 156 representatives took part in the meetings (Table 1).

Table 1 – Information about employees and students who took part in meetings with the EEC IAAR:

Category of participants	Number
Rector	1
Vice-Rector's building	3
Heads of structural divisions	19
Deans	2
Heads of departments, including representatives of the Academic Committee	23
Teachers	49
Students, residents	59*
Total	156

Note:* - the number of students without the number of resident students due to the lack of recruitment for training

During the visual inspection, the members of the EEC got acquainted with the state of the material and technical base of the SKMA, visited the educational and scientific laboratories of the Department of Pharmacology, Pharmacotherapy and Clinical Pharmacology, the anatomical classroom and the physiological educational laboratory of the Department of Morphology, the Center for Practical Skills, the SKMA Dental Clinic, the library and Information center.

At the meetings of the EEC IAAR with the university's target groups, the mechanisms for implementing the university's policy were clarified and the individual data presented in the university's self-assessment report were specified. The members of the EEC visited the practice bases of accredited programs: the Institute of Forensic Experiments in Shymkent, the State Unitary Enterprise "CSE of the Ministry of Internal Affairs of the Republic of Kazakhstan", the State Unitary Enterprise on the PCB "Regional Pathology Bureau", the equipment of which allows for the implementation of residency programs in the specialties "Pathological Anatomy" and "Forensic medicine". An interview with the heads of the structural divisions of the Institute of Forensic Examinations in Shymkent, the State Unitary Enterprise "CSE of the Ministry of Justice of the Republic of Kazakhstan", the State Unitary Enterprise at the Regional Pathology Bureau demonstrated the interest of representatives of practical healthcare in the implementation of residency programs in the specialties "Pathological Anatomy", "Forensic medicine", which consists in providing classrooms, equipment, objects of study; participation in the educational

process as clinical mentors. According to the program of the visit, according to the approved schedule, classes on accredited subjects were not held.

In accordance with the accreditation procedure, a survey of 33 teachers was conducted. The survey of students in the residency program was not conducted due to the lack of recruitment. In order to confirm the information provided in the Self-assessment Report, external experts requested and analyzed the working documentation of the university. Along with this, the experts studied the Internet positioning of the university through the official website of the university [https://skma.edu.kz /](https://skma.edu.kz/).

As part of the planned program, recommendations for improving accredited educational programs of the University, developed by the EEC based on the results of the examination, were presented at a meeting with the management on 05/11/2024.



(VI) COMPLIANCE WITH THE STANDARDS OF SPECIALIZED ACCREDITATION

6.1 Mission and Learning Outcomes Standard

- ✓ *Defining the mission*
- ✓ *The educational organization should:*
- ✓ *define the mission of EP postgraduate medical education and communicate it to stakeholders and the health sector.*
- ✓ *define the mission based on the health needs of society, the need of the health care delivery system, other aspects of social responsibility.*
- ✓ *define a training program containing theoretical and practical components with emphasis on the latter, which will result in a physician:*
- ✓ *competent in the chosen field of medicine, incorporating good medical practice,*
- ✓ *able to work independently at a high professional level,*
- ✓ *able to work in a professional and interprofessional team,*
- ✓ *willing to be a lifelong learner and to participate in continuing medical education/professional development,*
- ✓ *able to provide appropriate patient care that is appropriate, effective, compassionate and safe in addressing health problems and health promotion issues, incorporating a patient-centered and systems approach.*
- ✓ *provide for a willingness to provide an appropriate work environment for trainees to maintain their health.*
- ✓ *ensure that the mission includes the development of innovations in the learning process that allow for the development of broader and more specialized competencies than those identified in the core required competencies; the development of scientific competencies for trainees to enable physicians to conduct research in their chosen field of medicine; and opportunities for physicians to become active participants in addressing the social determinants of health.*
- ✓ *Professionalism and professional autonomy*
- ✓ *The educational organization should:*
- ✓ *incorporate professionalism into physician training and ensure that training promotes professional autonomy to enable future action in the best interests of the patient and society.*
- ✓ *provide for collaboration with government and other partners, while maintaining appropriate independence from them.*
- ✓ *Learning outcomes*
- ✓ *The educational organization should:*
- ✓ *define the expected learning outcomes that trainees should achieve upon completion of their training in relation to their achievements at postgraduate level in relation to knowledge, skills and behaviors/attitudes, an appropriate basis for a future career in the chosen branch of medicine, their future roles in the health sector, commitment and skills in implementing continuing education, the health needs of the community, the needs of the health system and other aspects of social responsibility, professional behavior.*
- ✓ *define and publish the expected learning outcomes: general and specialty-specific, which are required to be achieved by the trainee.*
- ✓ *demonstrate evidence of readiness to ensure appropriate behavior of trainees towards fellow students, teachers, medical staff, patients and their relatives.*
- ✓ *define expected learning outcomes based on those achieved at the basic medical education level to ensure interaction between basic and postgraduate medical education.*
- ✓ *provide opportunities for trainees to participate in research in the relevant health care field.*

- ✓ *Participate in the formulation of mission and learning outcomes*
- ✓ *The educational organization should:*
- ✓ *ensure the participation of key stakeholders in the formulation of the mission and expected learning outcomes*
- ✓ *ensure that the stated mission and expected learning outcomes are based on the views/suggestions of other stakeholders*

The evidentiary part

The mission of the EP residency in the specialties 7R01150 "Pathological Anatomy" and EP 7R01134 "Forensic medicine" are designed in accordance with the Mission, vision, goals and objectives of the Academy, is to be a recognized leader in the field of training competitive personnel, meeting the needs of a resident physician in achieving learning outcomes, ensuring the health system and societies with highly qualified pathologists and forensic medical experts. The mission of the EP residency in the specialty 7R01150 "Pathological anatomy", EP 7R01134 "Forensic medicine" is included in the content of the section "Passport of the educational program" of the OP (p.3), published on the SKMA website and brought to the attention of the academic community, students, staff, authorized bodies in the field of medical education and healthcare, and others interested parties; posted on the Academy's website. At the same time, an interview with the teaching staff of the Department of Pathological Anatomy and Forensic Examination showed that only teaching staff and employees participated in the discussion during the development of the OP, other interested parties were not involved, which does not meet the criteria of the IAAR standard. The Academy has implemented a system for collecting and analyzing customer feedback through internal and external monitoring. Departments are involved in the implementation of monitoring - the QMS department, UMC, OK, KOP.

The residency programs in the specialty 7R01150 "Pathological Anatomy", 7R01134 "Forensic medicine" were discussed at the cathedral meeting with the participation of employers: the chief physician of the OPAB, director of the Institute of CME in Shymkent (minutes of the meeting of the Department No. 11 dated 05/26/2023. minutes of the meeting of the Department No. 7 dated 01/26/2024), at the Commission of Educational programs of the residency, Clinical approved by the Academic Council of the Academy. They were entered into the National Register of Educational Programs (2023), approved for inclusion in the Register on 05/16/2023. The interview showed that changes in the planning and organization of educational programs are made based on the results of a survey and a questionnaire. At the department level, obtaining an external assessment for the mission of the OP is carried out by: involving members of independent professional associations, the administration of clinical bases in reviewing educational programs; monitoring job satisfaction of residents at clinical bases; when interviewing employers about the activities of graduates of the OP. An annual survey of employers studying to assess the level of OP is carried out. The survey of employers studying to assess the level of OP was not conducted due to the lack of recruitment of students. The residency programs of the specialties "Pathological Anatomy", "Forensic medicine" and the results of the training program have been developed in accordance with the requirements of the standard residency curriculum ("On approval of standard training programs in medical and pharmaceutical specialties" dated January 9, 2023 No. 4 according to the Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated November 10, 2023 No. 164) and qualification requirements for a resident doctor on the basis of the order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 21, 2020 No. KR DSM-305/2020 "On approval of the nomenclature of specialties and specializations in the field of healthcare, nomenclature and qualification characteristics of positions of healthcare workers" (with amendments and additions dated 04/14/2023). The implementation of the residency program in the specialty "Pathological Anatomy" and "Forensic medicine" will be carried out in accordance with the Regulations on Residency approved on 09.01.2023, which defines the requirements for the level of training of resident doctors. An interview with the teaching staff of the Department of Pathology and Forensic Examination showed a low level of awareness about the agorhythm,

which ensures the development of scientific competence of students so that doctors can conduct research in the chosen field of medicine, despite the fact that the department implements 2 research topics in the field of pathological anatomy and forensic medicine; which does not meet the criteria of the standard IAAR. An interview with the teaching staff of the Department of Pathology and Forensic Examination shows the lack of a clear algorithm for attracting future residents to research and the development of scientific thinking, which limits the student's ability to form an individual learning trajectory, which does not meet the criteria of the IAAR standard and requires improvement. The Academy has developed documents regulating the norms of behavior that ensure proper behavior of students in relation to classmates, teaching staff, employees of healthcare institutions, patients; they are posted on the website and include: The Code of Honor of Academic Integrity of Students, the Code of Honor of Teaching Staff and Academy employees (a resident's Guide). Not all interested parties took part in the development of the mission of the residency of the specialties "Pathological Anatomy" and "Forensic medicine", and the final results, only teaching staff, employers (interviews), which does not meet the criteria of the IAAR standard and requires improvement.

The interview with the teaching staff of the Department of Pathology and Forensic Examination also showed that the stated mission and expected learning outcomes are not based on the opinions/suggestions of other stakeholders, which does not meet the criteria of the IAAR standard.

The analytical part

The mission of the EP residency in the specialties 7R01150 "Pathological Anatomy" and 7R01134 "Forensic medicine" was developed in accordance with the Mission, vision, goals and objectives of the Academy, included in the content of the section "Passport of the educational program" of the EP, published on the SKMA website and brought to the attention of the academic community, students, staff, authorized bodies in the field of medical education and healthcare, and other interested parties; posted on the Academy's website.

The analysis of the participation of stakeholders in the formulation of the mission and expected learning outcomes showed their low awareness of this process, does not ensure the involvement of all participants in the educational process in the development and updating of the Mission of the OP in the specialty 7R01150 "Pathological Anatomy" and 7R01134 "Forensic medicine", which is largely due to insufficient work on promotion and popularization. The mission of the EP residency in these specialties among the main participants of the educational process, the lack of a systematic approach to its organization, which does not meet the criteria of the IAAR standard (interviews). The interview of participants in the educational process also showed that it is not fully ensured that the stated Mission of the EP residency in the specialties 7R01150 "Pathological Anatomy", 7R01134 "Forensic medicine" and the expected results are based on the opinion/proposal of other interested parties, which does not meet the criteria of the IAAR standard.

An interview with the teaching staff of the Department of Pathology and Forensic Examination showed a low level of awareness about the algorithm, which ensures the development of scientific competence of students so that doctors can conduct research in the chosen field of medicine, despite the fact that the department implements 2 research topics in the field of pathological anatomy and forensic medicine; which does not meet the criteria of the standard IAAR. An interview with the teaching staff of the Department of Pathology and Forensic Examination shows the lack of a clear algorithm for attracting future residents to research and the development of scientific thinking, which limits the student's ability to form an individual learning trajectory, which does not meet the criteria of the IAAR standard and requires improvement. SKMA has "institutional autonomy" with effective interaction/cooperation with health management bodies, heads of healthcare institutions of various forms of ownership, executive authorities and other partners, due to the availability of human resources, and is accompanied by the provision of clinical bases and equipment, access to patients, and meets the criteria of the IAAR standard (interviews, visits to bases, documents).

Strengths/best practice in EP residency in the specialties 7R01150 "Pathological anatomy" and 7R01134 "Forensic medicine":

According to this standard, no strengths have been identified.

Recommendations of the EEC for the EP residency in the specialties 7R01150 "Pathological anatomy" and 7R01134 "Forensic medicine":

1. The Dean of the residency, together with the head of the Department of Pathology and Forensic Medicine, to develop an algorithm for informing and attracting students to participate in scientific research as part of the implementation of the residency program in the specialties 7R01150 "Pathological Anatomy" and 7R01134 "Forensic medicine". The deadline is December 2024, then permanently.

2. The Dean of the residency, together with the head of the Department of Pathology and Forensic Medicine, should ensure that stakeholders are informed and expanded in the formulation of the mission and expected learning outcomes of the residency in the specialties 7R01150 "Pathological Anatomy" and 7R01134 "Forensic medicine". The deadline is September 2024, then permanently.

3. The Dean of the residency, together with the head of the Department of Pathology and Forensic Medicine, to develop and implement an algorithm to ensure that the stated Mission of the residency in the specialties 7R01150 "Pathological Anatomy" and 7R01134 "Forensic medicine", and the expected results are based on the opinion/suggestion of other interested parties. The deadline is September 2024.

The conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:

- Strong – 0
- Satisfactory – 12
- Suggest improvements – 2
- Unsatisfactory – 0

The conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:

According to the "Mission and learning Outcomes" standard, the educational residency program in the specialty 7R01150 "Pathological Anatomy" has 0 -strong, 12 - satisfactory, 2 - suggest improvement, 0 - unsatisfactory positions.

According to the standard "Mission and learning outcomes" of the educational residency program in the specialty "7R01134 "Forensic medicine" have 0 -strong, 12 - satisfactory, 2 - suggest improvement, 0 - unsatisfactory positions.

6.2. The standard "Educational program"

Approach to learning

The educational organization should:

determine the approach to training based on the expected learning outcomes and official certificates of qualification provided as the basis for official recognition of a specialist in the chosen field of medicine at the national and international level.

to define an approach to training based on the results of basic medical education, systematically and transparently, using practice-oriented training that includes and supports the student's personal participation in providing medical care and responsibility for the patient, their own educational process and clinical practice

demonstrate evidence of willingness to ensure the use of appropriate teaching methods that integrate practical and theoretical components, guide the student through mentoring and regular assessment and feedback, including adherence to ethical requirements and to demonstrate evidence of readiness to ensure that the educational program is implemented in accordance with the principles of equality, to inform students about the program, the rights and obligations of students.

to increase the degree of independence and responsibility of the student as knowledge, skills, and acquired experience improve.

To provide an opportunity to identify gender, cultural and religious characteristics and properly prepare the student to interact with the specified patient population.

Scientific method

The organization of education must: throughout the training program, to instill in students the principles of scientific methodology, including methods of analytical and critical thinking; research methods in healthcare and evidence-based medicine.

Strive to include a critical assessment of literature and scientific data, adapt content based on scientific developments in medicine, change the OP, taking into account the achievements of scientific, technological, medical and pharmaceutical developments, current and expected needs

of society and the health system.

The content of the training

The educational organization should:

include in the learning process the practice and theory of basic biomedical, clinical, behavioral, social sciences and preventive medicine, clinical solutions, communication skills, medical ethics, public health, medical jurisprudence and forensic medicine, management disciplines, patient safety, physician protection, complementary medicine. to organize an educational program with appropriate attention to patient safety and independence

demonstrate evidence of readiness to ensure correction and modification of the OP to ensure the development of knowledge, skills and thinking of various graduate roles, compliance of the content of the OP with changing conditions and needs of society and the health system.

The structure of the educational program, content and duration

The organization of education must: to describe the content, scope and sequence of courses and duration of the OP; to identify mandatory and selective components; to combine practice and theory in the learning process; to ensure compliance with national legislation, which should be presented and described; to ensure adequate impact on how local, national or regional health systems solve health problems and medical needs assistance to the population.

Take into account the learning outcomes of previous basic medical education related to the chosen field of medicine.

Determine the requirements for a graduate to perform various roles in the healthcare system

Organization of training

The educational organization should:

define responsibilities and authorities for the organization, coordination, management and evaluation of the individual learning environment and learning process. To ensure that adequate representation from teaching staff, students and other key and relevant stakeholders is included in the planning and development of the educational program.

Plan the training in such a way as to familiarize the student with a wide range of existing practical experience in the chosen field of medicine.

Guarantee a variety of study sites, coordinate multiple study sites to gain appropriate access to different aspects of the chosen field of medicine.

The link between education, medical practice and the healthcare system

The organization of education must: to provide and ensure integration between theoretical training and professional development, to develop training through medical practice and professional development; to integrate training and medical practice through the provision of medical care to patients; to ensure that training complements and takes into account the needs of medical care.

effectively use the capabilities of the healthcare system to provide medical care for training purposes.

The evidentiary part

The residency programs in the specialties 7R01150 "Pathological Anatomy" and 7R01134 "Forensic medicine" were developed in accordance with the requirements of the State Standard of Medical and Pharmaceutical Specialties; Standard curricula (Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 09.01.2023 No. 4 "On approval of standard curricula in medical and pharmaceutical specialties").

The duration of residency training in the specialty 7R01150 "Pathological anatomy" is 2 years (140 credits). The form of study is full-time. A graduate of the EP is awarded the qualification: a pathologist. The duration of residency training in the specialty 7R01134 "Forensic medicine" is 2 years (140 credits). The form of study is full-time. A graduate of the OP is awarded the qualification: a forensic medical expert.

The development and updating of educational programs is regulated by national and local legal documents of the SCMA, including the "Regulation on the procedure and procedures for the development of educational programs" (2024). The OP is developed in the form of a competence model consisting of modules, the content of which corresponds to the goals and learning outcomes. The practice-oriented training is provided by the availability of clinical bases. Equipping clinical bases makes it possible to effectively use interactive and practice-oriented teaching methods: analysis of clinical cases, conducting autopsies, pathohistological and cytological studies, attending clinical and anatomical conferences, consultations, teaching using web technologies, etc. It is planned to regularly conduct an analysis of teaching methods, an examination of the quality of teaching by the department and the relevant committee of the department, by visiting classes, holding open classes, discussing them at meetings of the department, participation of teaching staff in scientific and methodological seminars, conferences. The SKMA has approved a Code of Ethics, which enshrines ethical principles that are mandatory for students and staff of the Academy.

A policy has been developed in the field of staffing of the Academy, which is inextricably linked with the mission of the Academy and the mission of the OP, and is aimed at constantly ensuring guaranteed equality (<https://base.ukgfa.kz>). The training of residents at clinical bases is conducted under the supervision of curators who are appointed from among the teaching staff with a doctor's degree, candidate of medical Sciences, as well as the highest or first qualification category. A "mentoring system" has been introduced, which is implemented in accordance with the local documents of the Academy "Regulations on the SKMA Residency", Regulations on the

clinical mentor of the resident of JSC South Kazakhstan Medical Academy (approved 09.09.2022).

The content and sequence of the disciplines of the compulsory component of the curriculum have been developed in accordance with the requirements of the State Educational Institution of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, and Standard curricula.

The content of the core disciplines of the mandatory component of EP 7R01150 "Pathological anatomy" is aimed at developing knowledge and skills on general and particular issues of pathological anatomy (30 credits), with a separate study of pathological anatomy issues in surgical (16 credits), therapeutic (14 credits), dental (10 credits), obstetric and gynecological (14 credits), pediatric (13 credits), oncological (20 credits), forensic histological (17 credits) directions. The list of elective/elective subjects includes issues of iatrogenism, maternal death, emergency conditions and especially dangerous infectious diseases (4 credits). The distribution of disciplines by hours and semesters is carried out by the Dean's office of the residency in conjunction with the educational and methodological center. The duration of the final certification is 2 weeks. The academic week consists of 45 hours, of which 20% are classroom (practical classes), 70% are SRP, 10% are SRP. It provides for the formation of an individual curriculum for each resident for the entire period of study, which is coordinated with the clinical mentor and approved by the Dean of the residency. The individual work plan includes a training schedule, a class schedule (number of hours per day), a list of sections and disciplines, the number of hours by sections and disciplines, types of training sessions, forms of knowledge control. The requirements for the formation of a catalog of elective disciplines, individual educational trajectories, individual plans of students are regulated by the NPA SKMA "Rules for approving educational trajectories within the catalog of elective disciplines within the framework of individual curricula, work curricula, academic calendars, class schedules" (2020). The formation of an individual educational trajectory by a resident is achieved by choosing elective disciplines from the presented catalog of elective disciplines for various areas of training. The "Regulation on the service of advisors of JSC South Kazakhstan Medical Academy N 044/407-2022" has been developed, which has not been approved by the rector of the Academy, does not contain information about the residency program, which does not meet the criteria of the IAAR standard and requires improvement.

The residency program of the specialties "Pathological Anatomy" and "Forensic medicine" provides for the performance of various forms of educational and research work (conducting research, completing a project with the publication of scientific articles based on the results of completed research, participation in scientific and practical conferences, etc.). Participation of residents in scientific research with the presentation of results at conferences, congresses, in medical publications; encouraged by additional points and reflected in the portfolio. The Department of Pathology and Forensic Medicine implements 2 research topics in the field of pathological anatomy and forensic medicine. However, "an interview with the teaching staff of the Department of Pathology and Forensic Examination shows the lack of a clear algorithm for attracting future residents to research and the development of scientific thinking, which limits the student's ability to form an individual learning trajectory, which does not meet the criteria of the IAAR standard and requires improvement. When implementing the OP "Pathological Anatomy", it is planned to use active teaching methods: independent autopsy, clinical and anatomical analysis, substantiation of the pathoanatomical diagnosis, comparison of clinical and pathoanatomical diagnoses, histological studies of surgical and biopsy material and cytological smears, case-study, preparation of an individual report on completed studies with a critical analysis of the work done (interview).

During the implementation of the EP "Forensic medicine", it is planned to apply practice-oriented teaching methods: analysis of situations, autopsies, forensic histological, photographic and forensic studies, participation in court sessions, conferences, consultations, etc. In the SKMA, the organization of the implementation of the EP is regulated by the internal normative legal acts of the SKMA: Academic Policy (2023), the Regulation on Residency (2023), the Regulation on the organization of the educational process on credit technology (2021), the Regulation on the

schedule of training sessions (2022), the Regulation on the teaching load of the teaching staff (2020), the Regulations on the clinical activities of the SKMA (2022) (Regulations and Rules of the SKMA).

The First Vice-Rector for Strategic Development, who reports to the Rector, is responsible for the strategy for the development of postgraduate education and for the educational activities of the residency. The clinical bases are determined by the departments together with the Office of Clinical and Scientific Work (UCNR). UCNR draws up contracts with clinical bases in accordance with the order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 21, 2020 No. KR DSM-304/2020 "On approval of the Regulations on the clinical base, clinic, organization of education in the field of healthcare, university hospital, residency base, integrated academic medical center and the requirements for them." The implementation of the OP is carried out in the Regional Pathology Bureau, the Institute of Forensic Examinations in Shymkent of the RSE "CSE of the Ministry of Justice of the Republic of Kazakhstan", on the basis of concluded contracts that have a sufficient volume of pathomorphological and forensic histological materials and classrooms for practical classes, independent work of students, which meets the criteria of the IAAR standard (visits to bases, interviews).

The analytical part

SKMA has developed normative legal acts regulating the organization of the implementation of the residency program: Academic Policy (2023), the Regulation on Residency (2023), the Regulation on the organization of the educational process on credit technology (2021), the Regulation on the schedule of training sessions (2022), the Regulation on the teaching load of the teaching staff (2020), the Regulation on Clinical Activities of the SKMA (2022) (Regulations and Rules of the SKMA., which meets the criteria of the IAAR standard. At the same time, the presented "Regulation on the service of advisors of JSC South Kazakhstan Medical Academy P 044/407-2022, has not been approved by the rector of the Academy, does not contain information about the residency program, which does not meet the criteria of the IAAR standard and requires improvement.

The residency program of the specialties "Pathological Anatomy" "Forensic medicine" provides opportunities for research work, allows you to acquire the skills of independent information retrieval, independent problem solving, the ability to self-determination, self-education, and effective decision-making. However, an interview with the teaching staff of the Department of Pathology and Forensic Examination shows the lack of a clear algorithm for attracting future residents to research and the development of scientific thinking, which limits the student's ability to form an individual learning trajectory, which does not meet the criteria of the IAAR standard and requires improvement. The implementation of the OP will be carried out on the basis of the Regional Pathological Anatomical Bureau, the Institute of Forensic Examinations in Shymkent of the RSE "CSE of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan", on the basis of concluded contracts, in accordance with the order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 21, 2020 No. KR DSM-304/2020 "On approval of the Regulations on the clinical base, clinic of the organization of education in the field of health, university hospital, residency base, integrated academic medical center and the requirements imposed on them." Clinical bases have a sufficient volume of pathomorphological and forensic histological materials and classrooms for practical training, independent work of students, which meets the criteria of the IAAR standard (visits to bases, interviews).

Strengths/best practice in the residency program in the specialty 7R01150 "Pathological anatomy" and 7R01134 "Forensic medicine":

According to this standard, no strengths have been identified.

Recommendations of the EEC for the EP residency in the specialties 7R01150 "Pathological anatomy" and 7R01134 "Forensic medicine":

1. The management of the SKMA, the Dean of the residency, together with the head of the Department of Pathology and Forensic Medicine, to develop and approve new research projects necessary for the development of scientific competencies of students to conduct research within the framework of the implementation of the residency program in the specialties 7R01150 "Pathological Anatomy" 7R01134, "Forensic medicine". The deadline is December 2024, then permanently.

2. The management of the SKMA, the Dean of the residency, together with the head of the Department of Pathology and Forensic Medicine, ensure the implementation of residency programs in the specialties 7R01150 "Pathological Anatomy" and 7R01134 "Forensic medicine", based on the principles of scientific methodology, including methods of analytical and critical thinking; research methods in healthcare and evidence-based medicine. The deadline is during the 2024/2025 academic year, then permanently.

3. The Dean of the residency, together with the head of the Department of Pathology and Forensic Medicine, to develop and implement an algorithm that ensures the procedure for:

- attracting future residents to research and the development of scientific thinking. The deadline is September 2024, then – permanently.- inclusion of changes and additions to the OP based on a critical assessment of literature and scientific data; adaptation of the content of the OP taking into account scientific developments in medicine, achievements of scientific, technological, medical and pharmaceutical developments, current and expected needs of society and the health system. The deadline is September 2024, then – permanently.

4. The Dean of the residency, together with the head of the Department of Pathology and Forensic Medicine, ensure that proper representation from students and other interested parties is included in the planning and development of the residency program in the specialties 7R01150 "Pathological Anatomy" and 7R01134 "Forensic medicine". The deadline is during the 2024/2025 academic year, then permanently. 5. The Head of the Registrar's Office should ensure that additions are made to the regulatory legal documents of the SCMA regulating the activities of the "Service of Advisors of JSC South Kazakhstan Medical Academy" concerning the implementation of the residency program. The deadline is September 2024, then – permanently.

The conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:

- *Strong – 0*
- *Satisfactory – 18*
- *Suggest improvements – 2*
- *Unsatisfactory – 0*

According to the standard "Educational program", the educational residency programs in the specialty 7R01150 "Pathological anatomy" have 0 - strong, 18 - satisfactory, 2 - suggest improvement, 0 - unsatisfactory positions.

According to the standard "Educational program", the educational residency programs in the specialty 7R01134 "Forensic medicine" have 0 - strong, 18 - satisfactory, 2 - suggest improvement, 0 - unsatisfactory positions.

6.3. The standard "Student Assessment Policy"

Assessment methods

The educational organization must:

develop and implement a student certification/assessment policy; define, approve and publish the principles, goals, methods and practices of student assessment, including, if necessary, with verification by specialists; ensure that assessment procedures cover knowledge, skills, attitudes and professional behavior

To ensure the use of an additional set of assessment methods and formats in accordance with their "assessment effectiveness", including the use of multiple evaluators and multiple assessment methods;

Determine the criteria for passing exams or other types of assessment, including the number of acceptable retakes; provide for the possibility of documenting the reliability, validity and fairness of student assessment methods

To implement a system for appealing the evaluation results based on the principles of fairness or in accordance with appropriate legal procedures.

to introduce new assessment methods in accordance with the need, to document the various types and stages of training and assessment;

encourage the process of examination of assessment methods by external experts.

The relationship between assessment and learning

The organization of education must:

To ensure the use of evaluation principles, methods and practices that are comparable to expected learning outcomes and methods; to ensure that students achieve the expected learning outcomes; to facilitate the learning of students; to ensure the adequacy and relevance of learning; to provide timely, specific, constructive and objective feedback to students based on the assessment of their activities.

Strive to use evaluation principles, methods and practices that encourage integrated learning, encourage the involvement of students in clinical practice, and facilitate interprofessional training.

The evidentiary part

At SKMA, the Student assessment Policy is regulated by regulatory legal documents, posted on the SKMA website and available to participants in the educational process: Academic Policy (2023), Learning Outcomes Assessment Policy (2022), Rules for organizing and conducting intermediate certification of students in the form of computer testing at SKMA (2020), Rules for organizing and conducting an exam in a test and orally (2022), Regulations and Rules describing the policy and regulating the basic requirements for evaluating learning Outcomes (Regulations and Rules. Syllabuses are developed by departments before the beginning of the academic year, discussed at departments and approved by the chairmen of the CPC in accordance with the NPA of the SKMA "Regulations on the development of the educational and methodological complex disitsplin" (2022). Electronic versions of approved (updated) syllabuses are posted on the Academy's website (UMKD, on the information platform of the SKMA AIS Platonus (section UMKD) and at the department implementing the residency program.

The system of control of educational achievements of students at the Academy consists of current, boundary and final control of students (intermediate certification at the end of the study of disciplines) and final certification of graduates of the Academy.

The assessment of educational achievements of residents is carried out on the basis of measures of the level of competence formation and achievement of learning outcomes. Departments develop various types of control and measuring tools: questions for oral, tasks in test form (MCQ format), a list of practical skills and forms of their assessment (OCE, portfolio, etc.), clinical situations and scenarios, etc.

The point-letter rating system for evaluating the achievements of residents, methods, forms of evaluating learning outcomes are reflected in syllabuses of disciplines, methodological materials for the admission of OCE, etc. types of exams (mini-clinical, "bedside", standardized patient, oral, etc.). The assessment of the current control (assessment of the admission rating) consists of assessments of the current control in the classroom and assessments of the boundary control. With the current monitoring of academic performance, the educational achievements of residents are evaluated on a 100-point scale for each completed task. Residents who do not have a positive assessment of the admission rating in disciplines are not allowed to take the final control (exam). The exam admission rating is calculated automatically by AIS. Missed classes for a disrespectful reason are not worked out. Students who missed classes for a disrespectful reason or did not complete a lesson in an electronic journal next to the mark "h" are given a score of "0" in the last week of the academic period. The final control is carried out according to the schedule of classes in accordance with the periods in the academic calendar upon completion of the study of the discipline. The organization and conduct of final control is carried out according to the work curriculum and in accordance with internal regulatory documents: "Rules for the organization and conduct of intermediate certification of students in the form of computer testing in JSC SKMA" (2022), "Regulations on the procedure for organizing and conducting exams in written and oral form in JSC SKMA" (2022).

The form of final controls is discussed at the Clinical Council and approved by the Academic Council on the recommendation of the head of the Dean's Office of the residency no later than one month of the beginning of the academic year. The organization of final control is assigned to the registrar's office, preparation for exams is assigned to the Dean's office of Residency and the registrar's office. The schedule of classes and exams is developed by the UMC, approved by the Vice-rector for UMVR before the beginning of the academic period.

Residents with a passing score (50%) and higher in all types of controls (current control,

milestone) are allowed to take final control of the discipline. A resident who has not scored a passing grade on one of them is not allowed to take the exam. The exam results are displayed in the exam sheet and the student's transcript on a 100-point scale corresponding to the letter system with a digital equivalent accepted in international practice (positive grades, in descending order, from "A" to "D", and "unsatisfactory" - "GC", "F") and grades according to the traditional the system. A resident doctor who has completed the training program is allowed to complete the final certification. The final certification of resident doctors is carried out in accordance with the rules for assessing the professional readiness of graduates of educational programs in the field of healthcare, approved by Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 11, 2020 No. MH RK-249/2020 "On approval of the rules for assessing the knowledge and skills of students, assessing the professional readiness of graduates of educational programs in the field of healthcare and healthcare specialists" (registered in the Register of State Registration of Normative Legal Acts under No. 21763) within the time limits provided for in the work curriculum and academic calendar. The final certification is carried out in 2 stages: stage 1 – comprehensive testing conducted on test tasks; stage 2 – assessment of practical / clinical skills. The positive results of the final certification of graduates of educational programs in the field of healthcare allow them to obtain a document of education (certificate of completion of residency) and a certificate of a specialist in the field of healthcare with the qualification "doctor" (for an accredited OP – "pathologist"/ "forensic medical expert").

The faculty of the departments, heads of departments (modules), and the registrar's office are responsible for the implementation of the policy on evaluating the educational achievements of residents. Interpersonal interaction with patients, colleagues, practice-based training, with the provision of constructive feedback is carried out through the assessment of the resident by a "360 degree questionnaire". The level of mastering practical skills in conducting autopsies, histological and cytological studies is planned to be carried out according to the checklist for the implementation of clinical skills.

The Academy uses additional methods for evaluating residents. However, an interview with the faculty of the Department of Pathology and Forensic Examination showed a low level of awareness about the use of an additional set of assessment methods and formats in accordance with their "assessment effectiveness", including the use of several evaluators and several assessment methods, which does not meet the criteria of the IAAR standard and requires improvement. Monitoring of compliance of control and measuring instruments with teaching methods and the specifics of the curriculum is carried out by the CPC, which includes experienced methodologists and certified test experts. However, an interview with the teaching staff of the Department of Pathology and Forensic Examination showed a low level of their awareness of the examination in relation to the control and measuring means of certification, which does not meet the criteria of the IAAR standard and requires improvement.

The SKMA has provided for an appeal system based on the results of intermediate and final attestation of residents in accordance with the "Academic Policy", which defines the procedure for filing an appeal, which meets the criteria of the IAAR standard (interviews, documents).

Independent experts are involved in the SCMA to objectify the assessment process. When conducting the final certification to assess the educational achievements of residents, the commission includes specialists in practical healthcare in the field of specialization, external examiners are involved, as well as specialists in related disciplines. UMC systematically organizes seminars, trainings, and master classes on innovative teaching and assessment methods for teaching staff. However, interviews with heads of structural divisions and teaching staff showed a low level of awareness about the use of the possibility of documenting the reliability, validity and fairness of student assessment methods; about the procedure for determining the validity of the content and the validity of the conformity of assessment methods, which does not meet the criteria of the IAAR standard and requires improvement.

The results of the residents' academic achievements are recorded in an electronic educational journal through the office registrar system and the AIS Platonus program, which automatically

generates exam sheets. The electronic educational journal is filled in accordance with the calendar and thematic plan, in accordance with the schedule and the dates of the current, milestone and final controls reflected in the syllabus, which meets the criteria of the IAAR standard (interviews, documents).

Interviews with heads of structural divisions and teaching staff also showed that new assessment methods are practically not used and are not being implemented in accordance with the need, documentation of various types and stages of training and assessment is not used, which does not meet the criteria of the IAAR standard and requires improvement. A system has not been implemented to encourage the examination of evaluation methods by external experts, which does not meet the criteria of the IAAR standard and requires improvement.

The analytical part

At SKMA, the Student Certification/Assessment Policy is implemented in accordance with regulatory legal documents, posted on the SKMA website and available to participants in the educational process: Academic Policy, Regulations and Rules describing the policy and regulating the basic requirements for evaluating learning outcomes (Regulations and Rules), which meets the criteria of the IAAR. The following assessment levels are accepted in the SKMA: current assessment in practical and final classes; intermediate certification – exams and tests upon completion of the study of disciplines, state final certification. The rating system is a 100–point scale, according to the point-rating letter system. However, the interview with the teaching staff showed that no examination is carried out in relation to the control and measuring means of certification, which does not meet the criteria of the IAAR standard. There is a low level of awareness among the faculty of the department about the use of an additional set of assessment methods and formats in accordance with their "assessment effectiveness", including the use of several evaluators and several assessment methods, which does not meet the criteria of the IAAR standard and requires improvement. The interview with the teaching staff showed that the SCMA does not have a system of an additional set of assessment methods and formats in accordance with their "assessment effectiveness", including the use of several evaluators and several assessment methods, which does not meet the criteria of the IAAR standard and requires improvement. The characteristics of the introduction of new assessment methods depending on the need, the use of assessment methods and formats depending on their "usefulness assessment" (interviews) are not presented. There is a low level of awareness among the heads of structural divisions and teaching staff about the use of the possibility of documenting the reliability, validity and fairness of student assessment methods; about the procedure for determining the validity of the content and the validity of the conformity of assessment methods, which does not meet the criteria of the IAAR standard and requires improvement.

There is a low level of awareness among heads of structural divisions and teaching staff about the use and implementation of new assessment methods in accordance with the need, documenting various types and stages of training and assessment, which does not meet the criteria of the IAAR standard and requires improvement. A system has not been implemented to encourage the examination of evaluation methods by external experts, which does not meet the criteria of the IAAR standard and requires improvement.

Сильные стороны/лучшая практика по ОП резидентуры по специальностям 7R01150 "Pathological anatomy" and 7R01134 "Forensic medicine":

According to this standard, no strengths have been identified.

Recommendations of the EEC for the EP residency in the specialties 7R01150 "Pathological anatomy" and 7R01134 "Forensic medicine"

1. The management of the SKMA, the Dean of the residency, organize training for teaching staff and employees of structural divisions on issues related to:

- conducting an examination of the control and measuring means of certification in the implementation of the OP in the specialty of the residency. The deadline is during the 2024/2025 academic year, then permanently.

- assessment methods and formats in accordance with their "assessment effectiveness" and ensure their use in the implementation of the OP in the specialty of the residency. The deadline is during the 2024/2025 academic year, then permanently.

- the process of documenting the reliability, validity and fairness of assessment methods for students in the implementation of OP in the specialty of residency. The deadline is during the 2024/2025 academic year, then permanently.

2. The management of the SKMA, the Dean of the residency, develop and implement an algorithm for documenting the reliability, validity and fairness of student assessment methods. The deadline is during the 2024/2025 academic year, then permanently.

3. The management of the SKMA, the Dean of the residency, ensure the introduction of new assessment methods in accordance with the need, documenting various types and stages of training and assessment. The deadline is during the 2024/2025 academic year, then permanently.

4. The management of the SKMA, the Dean of the residency, to develop and implement an algorithm to encourage the process of examination of assessment methods by external experts. The deadline is during the 2024/2025 academic year, then permanently.

EEC conclusions on the criteria:

- *Strong – 0*
- *Satisfactory – 6*
- *Suggest improvements – 4*
- *Unsatisfactory – 0*

According to the standard "Student Assessment Policy", the educational residency program in the specialty 7R01150 "Pathological Anatomy" has 0 - strong, 6 - satisfactory, 4 - suggest improvement, 0 - unsatisfactory positions. According to the standard "Student Assessment Policy", the educational residency program in the specialty 7R01134 "Forensic medicine" has 0 - strong, 6 - satisfactory, 4 - suggest improvement, 0 - unsatisfactory positions.

6.4. The "Students" standard

Selection and admission policy

The educational organization should:

have a policy and implement admission practices based on the mission of the organization and including a clearly defined provision for the student selection process.

to ensure a balance between learning opportunities and the admission of students; to formulate and implement policies/rules for the selection of students according to established criteria; to have a policy and implement the practice of admission of students with disabilities in accordance with applicable laws and regulatory documents of the country; to ensure a high level of knowledge and skills in the field of basic biomedical sciences, achieved at the the previous level of basic medical education; ensure transparency and fairness of the selection procedure. have a policy and implement the practice of transferring students from other educational institutions, including foreign ones.

to guarantee in the selection procedure the possibilities of potential students to improve the quality of education in the chosen field of medicine; to guarantee the transparency of the selection procedure; to provide a mechanism for appealing admission decisions,

Demonstrate a willingness to involve student associations and other stakeholders in policy development and the selection process by periodically reviewing admission policies and rules.

Number of students

The organization of education must:

- ✓ to determine the number of accepted students in accordance with: clinical/practical training opportunities, the ability of the NGO to carry out appropriate control and monitoring of the educational process, logistical and other available resources, information about the health needs of society and society.
- ✓ Provide for the possibility to periodically review the number and contingent of enrolled students in consultation with relevant stakeholders responsible for planning and developing human resources in the health sector.
- ✓ to provide an opportunity to adapt the number of potential students, taking into account the available information on the number of qualified candidates and information on national and international labor markets; to regulate the number of potential students, taking into account the inherent unpredictability of the exact labor needs of specialists in various fields of medicine. Advising and supporting students
- ✓ The organization of education must:
- ✓ demonstrate readiness to provide students with access to the academic counseling system for students.
- ✓ Demonstrate a willingness to provide academic counseling while monitoring and controlling student progress, including the analysis of unintended incidents.
- ✓ Demonstrate readiness to provide a student support program aimed at social, financial and personal needs.
- ✓ Demonstrate willingness to allocate resources for social and personal support of students; ensure confidentiality regarding counseling and support.
- ✓ Demonstrate willingness to provide professional guidance, counseling, and career planning.
- ✓ demonstrate the willingness to consult, in order to support in case of a professional crisis; involve organizations/associations of students in solving problematic situations of students.
- ✓ Representation of students
- ✓ The educational organization should:
- ✓ have a policy and implement the practice of student representation and their appropriate participation in the development of the mission and intended learning outcomes, in the development of educational programs, planning of learning conditions for students, evaluation and management of educational programs.
- ✓ Demonstrate the willingness to encourage student representation to participate in decision-making on educational processes, conditions and rules of study.
- ✓ Working conditions
- ✓ The educational organization must:
- ✓ implement a training program with the availability of appropriate remuneration/ scholarships or other means of financing and motivating students
- ✓ Ensure that students have access to patient care, including calling a doctor, where appropriate
- ✓ to define and publish the working conditions and responsibilities of students
- ✓ provide for the interruption of education caused by pregnancy (including maternity/paternity leave, child care), illness, military service or secondment for additional training
- ✓ Strive to ensure that the working components in the student's work do not dominate the educational component/training

take into account the needs of patients, the continuity of medical care and the educational needs of students when drawing up a work plan and schedule, including on-call work

to allow distance learning under special circumstances, in accordance with the individual educational trajectory and work experience of the student, providing evidence that the total duration and quality of distance learning is not less than in full-time education.

Provide for the possibility of continuing education under conditions of study breaks related to pregnancy (including maternity / paternity leave), illness, military service or secondment.

Evidentiary part

The SKMA has defined the policy and criteria for admission to the residency in accordance with regulatory documents: The Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated August 30, 1995; the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education" dated July 27, 2007 No. 319-III ZRK; Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 31, 2018 No. 600; Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 15, 2020 No. KR DSM-270/2020 "On approval of the Rules placement of a state order, admission

to training and training of medical personnel in residency"; Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 4, 2022 No. KR DSM-63 "On approval of State mandatory standards for levels of education in the field of healthcare", in the Academic Policy of the SKMA (with additions and amendments, 2023), the Regulation on residency (UKMA, 2023), Rules of admission to the residency (UKMA, 2023), Information for admission to the residency is provided on the Academy's website (for doctoral students, undergraduates, residents).

SCMA, guided by the Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 30.08.1995 (Article 14) and the Law on Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 27.07.2007 No. 309 (Article 3), provides all students with equal opportunities to receive high-quality, affordable education and does not discriminate against students with special needs on racial, national, ethnic, religious, sexual grounds, as well as on the basis of social status, family status.

Admission of citizens to the residency is carried out on a competitive basis based on the results of entrance exams with a diploma of higher or continuous integrated medical education and a document indicating the qualification of a "doctor". The personal achievements of the applicant, the results of research work, etc. are taken into account during admission.

An admissions committee will be established to receive documents and organize entrance exams at SKMA, the composition and functions of which will be approved by the order of the Rector of SKMA. The Chairman of the admissions committee is the rector, whose function is to approve the composition of the admissions, examination and appeals commission. In order to ensure compliance with uniform requirements and resolve controversial issues, an appeals commission is being established at the Academy to consider appeals. The chairman and the composition of the appeals commission at the Academy are approved by the order of the Rector of the SKMA. Admission to the residency with an indication of the specialty is announced through the mass media, by placing ads on the Academy's website. Information about the required list of documents for admission to the residency is posted on the Academy's website, as well as in the admissions committee. Applications for admission to the residency of higher educational institutions are accepted from July 3 to July 25.

The number of accepted residents is regulated by the State Order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan for the training of medical personnel and taking into account the possibilities of clinical, practical training, the maximum permissible load on teaching staff, the provision of educational, methodological and scientific literature, the capacity of clinical bases, as well as the material and technical resources of the Academy. Annually, taking into account the needs for medical personnel, the Academy sends a request to the Department of Science and Human Resources Development of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan (hereinafter – DNHR) about the required number of specialists in the specialty of the residency. In accordance with the submitted request, the DPR is allocated a State order for the training of medical personnel in residency (interviews, documents).

The transfer of a resident doctor from one educational institution to another, from a paid basis for training under a state educational order to a vacant place, expulsion and restoration is carried out during the vacation period in accordance with the Academic Policy of JSC SKMA. The transfer of a resident from one specialty to another, from one form of education to another is carried out for training on the basis of a paid and state educational order. When transferring or restoring residents, the course of their further education is determined taking into account the prerequisites. In the 2023-2024 academic year, there was no recruitment for residency training in the specialty "Pathological Anatomy", transfers of residents in this specialty were not carried out (interviews, documents).

In the Academy, when organizing the educational process, calculating the staffing table, the ratio of the number of residents in the specialty per teacher is taken into account as 1:3.

To implement a competence-based model of medical education, the Academy has a system of academic counseling for residents at departments. To this end, by order of the rector, a curator is assigned to the resident, who provides the functions of an academic mentor, participates in the

formation and implementation of an individual curriculum, manages the educational and scientific activities of the resident, and provides assistance in employment.

The Academy provides social and financial support to students in accordance with the regulatory document of the SKMA "On the provision of social assistance to students and teachers", and includes: payment of one-time financial assistance, provision of free accommodation in the Academy dormitory (orphans), discounts on tuition fees for special categories of students. For psychological support and psychosocial counseling of residents in case of a professional crisis, the Academy operates a "helpline". Systematic work is being carried out to implement the anti-corruption program (monitoring). Educational work is carried out in accordance with Academic Policy, a comprehensive action Plan for the implementation of the Academy's Development Strategy, Internal Regulations, plans developed on the basis of legislative and regulatory acts of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Resolutions of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan, which define the goals, objectives, directions of the organization

The Dean's Office of Internship and Graduate Employment functions at SKMA, which conducts career guidance work with applicants, bachelors, promotes the employment of graduates of the Academy together with the Dean's Office of Residency, establishes close ties with the education, health, employment service; coordinates the work of all structural divisions of the Academy on vocational guidance, promotes the employment of graduates; monitors the movement and career development of graduates of the Academy, establishing business ties with employers, studying the needs of the labor market for specialists produced by the Academy (interviews, documents).

The Dean's Office of Internship and Employment of Graduates annually conducts a Personal distribution of graduates with the participation of representatives of health departments, pharmaceutical companies and departments for public health protection of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Graduates of the Academy are in demand in the labor market, which confirms the high employment rate of graduates of the residency. The employment rate of graduates of the residency is 100%. The employment analysis was not carried out due to the lack of graduates of the residency program in the specialty "Pathological anatomy" / "Forensic medicine". The Academy has a Youth Policy Department, which includes a Department for educational work and social support for students, a group for the development of student self-government, established on a permanent basis as an independent structural unit of the Academy, as well as an "ART" center uniting student creative circles.

The Dean's Office of the residency, along with the heads and teachers, includes residents to participate in the discussion of issues and decision-making in the implementation of the OP in the composition of the collegial bodies of the SKMA. There are no representatives of the residency in the specialty "Pathological Anatomy" and "Forensic medicine" in the collegial bodies of the SKMA due to the lack of recruitment of students (documents, interviews).

The analytical part

The SKMA residency admission policy is implemented in accordance with the national and local regulatory documents of the SKMA: Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 15, 2020 No. KR DSM-270/2020 "On approval of the rules for placing a state order, admission to training and training of medical personnel in residency"; Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 4, 2022 Year No. KR DSM-63 "On approval of state mandatory standards for levels of education in the field of healthcare", in the Academic Policy of the SKMA (with additions and amendments, 2023), the Regulations on Residency (SKMA, 2023), the Rules for admission to Residency (SKMA, 2023). Information for admission to residency is provided on the Academy's website (for doctoral students, undergraduates, residents, which meets the criteria of the IAAR standard.

The formation of the contingent of the EP residency in the specialty "Pathological Anatomy" will be carried out in accordance with the state order and on a contractual basis; with the resources of the SKMA, which meets the criteria of the IAAR standard.

The SKMA has introduced a system of academic counseling for residents at departments; social and financial support for students is provided in accordance with the SKMA regulatory document "On the provision of social assistance to students and teachers". For psychological support and psychosocial counseling of residents in the event of a professional crisis, the Academy operates a "helpline", which meets the criteria of the IAAR standard.

The Dean's Office of Internship and Graduate Employment functions at SKMA, which conducts career guidance work with applicants, bachelors, promotes the employment of graduates of the Academy together with the Dean's Office of Residency, establishes close ties with the education, health and employment authorities; coordinates the work of all structural divisions of the Academy on vocational guidance, promotes the employment of graduates; monitors the movement and career development of graduates of the Academy, establishing business ties with employers, studying the needs of the labor market for specialists produced by the Academy.

The Dean's Office of the residency, along with the heads and teachers, includes residents to participate in the discussion of issues and decision-making in the implementation of the OP in the composition of the collegial bodies of the SKMA. There are no representatives of the residency in the specialty "Pathological Anatomy" in the collegial bodies of the SKMA due to the lack of recruitment of students (documents, interviews).

Strengths/best practice in EP residency in the specialties 7R01150 "Pathological anatomy" and 7R01134 "Forensic medicine":

According to this standard, no strengths have been identified.

Recommendations of the EEC for the EP residency in the specialties 7R01150 "Pathological anatomy" and 7R01134 "Forensic medicine":

1. The management of the SKMA, the dean of the residency, when recruiting students for the residency program in the specialties 7R01150 "Pathological Anatomy" and 7R01134 "Forensic medicine", provide:

- representation of students in the collegial bodies of the SKMA and their respective participation in the development of the mission and intended learning outcomes, in the development of the OP, planning of learning conditions for students, assessment and management of the OP. The deadline is September 2024, then – permanently;

- encouraging the representation of students to participate in decision-making on educational processes, conditions and rules of study. The deadline is September 2024, then permanently.

The conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:

- Strong – 0***
- Satisfactory – 24***
- Suggest improvements – 0***
- Unsatisfactory – 0***

According to the standard, "Students" of the educational residency program in the specialty 7R01150 "Pathological anatomy" have 0 - strong, 24 - satisfactory, 0 - suggest improvement, 0 - unsatisfactory positions.

According to the standard, "Students" of the educational residency program in the specialty and 7R01134 "Forensic medicine" have 0 - strong, 24 - satisfactory, 0 - suggest improvement, 0 - unsatisfactory positions

6.5. The standard "Academic staff/Teachers".

- ✓ Selection and recruitment policy***
- ✓ The educational organization should develop and implement a staff selection and recruitment policy that:***
- ✓ takes into account the necessary criteria for employment with the condition of examination of documents; contains criteria for the scientific, pedagogical***

and clinical/professional merits of applicants, including an appropriate ratio between pedagogical, scientific and professional qualifications. defines the responsibilities of teachers, including the balance between teaching, scientific and other functions, taking into account the mission of the educational institution, the needs of the education system and the needs of the health system.

- ✓ Ensures that teachers have practical experience in the relevant field, are recognized specialists in the relevant field, and that teachers of narrow specialties, if necessary, are approved for appropriate periods of study, depending on their qualifications.
- ✓ Encourages participation in programs to develop their educational potential, use the expertise of educational activities to increase the potential of the academic staff, determine the level of remuneration for participation in postgraduate education. Staff activity and development policy
- ✓ The educational organization should develop and implement a policy of activity and staff development, which is aimed at:
- ✓ A guarantee that teachers have enough time for training, counseling and independent development.
- ✓ The presence of a structure responsible for the development of the academic staff, ensuring periodic assessment of the academic staff.
- ✓ development and implementation of a policy to support the academic staff on issues of pedagogy and professional development for further professional development; to evaluate and recognize the scientific and academic achievements of teachers.
- ✓ The ability to take into account the teacher-student ratio depending on the various components of the OP, taking into account the features that ensure close personal interaction and monitoring of students.

The evidentiary part

SKMA implements a personnel policy for the selection and hiring of employees in accordance with regulatory legal documents: The personnel policy of JSC SKMA (posted on the Academy's website, "Rules for competitive replacement of positions of teaching staff and researchers" from 2021; KPI of scientific and pedagogical staff of the Academy; Qualification requirements for the positions of teaching staff of the Academy.

The HR Department, the heads of the profiled department are responsible for recruiting teachers and implementing personnel policy in accordance with qualification requirements, Academic Integrity Policy, and the Code of Ethics of an Academy employee.

HR management ensures compliance with the requirements of personnel policy in the educational program for residency by monitoring the ratio of the profile of the teaching staff, compliance with the range and balance of teachers of basic biomedical sciences, behavioral and social sciences and profiling (clinical) disciplines necessary to complete the educational program (documents, interviews).

The personnel policy for the teaching staff and teachers engaged in residency training is carried out on the basis of the Charter and the policy of providing personnel resources to the Academy, the "Rules for the search, selection, admission and adaptation of Academy employees", the Regulations on the clinical mentor of the resident of JSC South Kazakhstan Medical Academy, which define the requirements for clinical mentors, those who are attracted to teach residents from practical healthcare: the presence of basic education, a medical qualification category and sufficient work experience in the specialty. Among the part-time practitioners from practical healthcare, the doctors involved in the training of residents have the highest category, are deputy chief physicians, heads of departments and leading specialists. The teacher must confirm the availability of qualification requirements with relevant documents and the teacher's portfolio.

The staffing of the Department of Pathology and Forensic Medicine is represented by 26 teaching staff, of which 5 teaching staff (1 PhD and 4 PhD) have an academic degree, including 14 teaching staff of pathological anatomy (3 of them have an academic degree), 10 teaching staff of pathological physiology (2 of them have an academic degree), 2 Teaching staff of forensic medicine (part-time students who do not have an academic degree) (staffing of the Department of Pathology and Forensic Medicine for the 2023/2024 academic year, form 1). Among the teaching staff of the Department of Pathology and Forensic Medicine there are 8 part-time teaching staff working in healthcare organizations. The total degree of the department is 19.2%.

Кадровый потенциал реализации ОП резидентуры по специальности 7R01150 «Pathological Anatomy» is represented by: 2 teaching staff of the Department of Pathology and Forensic Medicine of the SKMA (1 MD, 1 PhD) and 1 clinical mentor working in the regional pathology bureau and having over 10 years of experience.

The personnel potential of the implementation of the residency program in the specialty 7R01134 "Forensic medicine" is represented by: 2 teaching staff of forensic medicine (part-time) (staffing of the Department of Pathology and Forensic Medicine for the 2023/2024 academic year, form 1). The degree of teaching staff in the specialty "Forensic medicine" is 0.0%.

However, it should be noted the low level of general competence of the teaching staff of the Department of Pathology and Forensic Medicine, which may affect the quality of training for residents, including the development of scientific competencies and research in the implementation of OP, which does not meet the criteria of the IAAR standard and requires improvement.

The SCMA provides measures to motivate and stimulate employees: ensuring working conditions in accordance with the labor legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the employment contract and the collective agreement, providing employees with equipment, tools, technical documentation and other means necessary for the performance of work duties; timely payment of labor and payment of incentive allowances for quality work in accordance with the regulations on remuneration (interviews, documents). The Academy has introduced additional payment to the official salary of teachers teaching classes in English, in accordance with the "Regulations on remuneration, bonuses, financial assistance and payment of health benefits" of JSC SKMA (with amendments and additions), approved by the Rector of the Academy on August 29, 2018.

The Academy has a Regulation on the intra-university competition for scientific grants and a Regulation on reimbursement of expenses and payment of remuneration for the publication of research results in scientific journals included in the Web of Science database; A regulation on the competition for scientific grants "Potentially commercialized scientific developments of JSC SKMA" to stimulate the scientific activities of teaching staff and maintain promising R&D results of departments of JSC SKMA.

SKMA has developed mechanisms and criteria for the systematic evaluation of the effectiveness of teachers, their level of competence, professional potential of staff and readiness to solve the strategic tasks of the organization due to their scientific activities. By the decision of the Board of Directors of SKMA JSC, since 2022, a remuneration system has been introduced for teachers-applicants who have defended the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) in the form of a cash award personally on behalf of the Main Founder of SKMA JSC, S.S. Seitzhanov in the amount of 2,000,000 (two million)

However, interviews with heads of structural units and faculty members revealed that in SKMA has not developed and implemented criteria on the basis of which incentive payments will be made to employees for their contribution to educational activities, which does not meet the criteria of the IAAR standard and requires improvement.

Interviews with heads of structural divisions, teaching staff showed a low level of their awareness about the organization and conduct of expertise of educational activities to increase the potential of the academic staff, which does not meet the criteria of the IAAR standard and requires improvement (interviews).

The analytical part

SKMA implements a personnel policy for the selection and hiring of employees in accordance with regulatory legal documents: The personnel policy of JSC SKMA (posted on the Academy's website), the "Rules for competitive replacement of positions of teaching staff and researchers" from 2021; KPI of scientific and pedagogical staff of the Academy; Qualification requirements for the positions of teaching staff of the Academy.

The analysis of staffing indicates the availability of professional human resources for the implementation of the OP. However, there is a low level of general competence of teaching staff of the Department of Pathology and Forensic Medicine (the degree of teaching staff in the specialty "Forensic medicine" is 0.0%), which may affect the quality of training for residents, including the development of scientific competencies and research in the implementation of the OP, which does not meet the criteria of the IAAR standard and requires improvements. The SKMA has a system for evaluating the effectiveness of teaching staff based on the analysis of their scientific activities. However, an interview with the heads of structural divisions and teaching staff showed that the SKMA has not developed and implemented criteria on the basis of which incentive payments will be made to employees for their contribution to educational activities, which does not meet the criteria of the IAAR standard and requires improvement.

There is a low level of awareness among the heads of structural divisions, teaching staff about the organization and conduct of educational expertise activities to increase the potential of the academic staff, which does not meet the criteria of the IAAR standard and requires improvement (interviews).

Strengths/best practice in EP residency in the specialties 7R01150 "Pathological anatomy" and 7R01134 "Forensic medicine":

According to this standard, no strengths have been identified.

Recommendations of the EEC for the EP residency in the specialties 7R01150 "Pathological anatomy" and 7R01134 "Forensic medicine":

1. The management of SKMA- to ensure the organization and implementation of the expertise of educational activities to increase the potential of the academic staff. The deadline is during the 2024/2025 academic year, then constantly;

- to organize training for the heads of structural divisions of JSC SKMA and teaching staff on the issues of conducting an examination of educational activities. The deadline is during the 2024/2025 academic year, then permanently.

2. The management of SKMA should develop and implement a system of criteria on the basis of which incentive payments will be made to employees for their contribution to educational activities. The deadline is December 2024, then permanently.

3. The head of the Department of Pathology and Forensic Medicine should develop and implement a system that ensures an increase in the level of teaching staff and staffing of the department for the implementation of OP in the specialties of residency. The deadline is December 2024, then permanently. ***The conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:***

- ***Strong – 0***
- ***Satisfactory – 7***
- ***Suggest improvements – 1***
- ***Unsatisfactory – 0***

According to the standard "Academic staff/Teachers of the "educational residency program in the specialty 7R01150 "Pathological anatomy" have 0 - strong, 7 - satisfactory, 1 - suggest improvement, 0 - unsatisfactory positions.

According to the standard "Academic staff/The teachers of the "educational residency program in the specialty and 7R01134 "Forensic medicine" have 0 - strong, 7 - satisfactory, 1 - suggest improvement, 0 - unsatisfactory positions.

6.6. Standard "Educational resources"

Material and technical base

The organization of education must:

demonstrate readiness to provide students with sufficient material and technical base to ensure adequate implementation of the OP, space and opportunities for practical and theoretical research; access to relevant professional literature; adequate information and communication technologies; modern equipment for teaching practical methods; a safe learning environment.

Demonstrate a willingness to improve the learning environment through regular updating, expansion and strengthening of the material and technical base and equipment to maintain the appropriate quality of education at the postgraduate level.

Educational environment

The organization of education must:

demonstrate readiness to provide the necessary resources for students to acquire adequate practical experience, including the selection and approval of the clinical base as an educational environment; access to sufficient clinical/ practical tools/bases to provide training; sufficient number and diversity of patients; appropriate diverse clinical cases to achieve the goals and objectives of training, including the use of resources as inpatient at the outpatient level, in order to provide the student with a wide range of experience in the chosen field of medicine. demonstrate a willingness, when choosing a learning environment, to guarantee the number of patients and the corresponding variety of clinical cases, allowing you to gain clinical experience in all aspects of the chosen specialty, including training in organization and management in the field of health and disease prevention; training at a university clinic, as well as training in other relevant clinics/institutions and community facilities/locations, if necessary It is necessary.

Information technology

The organization of education must: guarantee access to information and communication technologies and other electronic media.

Demonstrate willingness to use information and communication technologies effectively and ethically in the OP. provide for the possibility of access for teachers and students to use information and communication technologies: for self-study; communication with colleagues; access to health information resources and relevant patient data; patient supervision and work in the health care system to provide medical care.

Clinical teams

The organization of education must:

Demonstrate a willingness to provide students with the opportunity to gain experience working in a team with colleagues and other medical professionals. demonstrate a willingness to encourage learning in a multidisciplinary/interprofessional team, promote the development of the ability to guide and train other medical professionals

Medical and scientific research

The organization of education must:

demonstrate readiness to guarantee and provide conditions for students to acquire knowledge in the field of research methodology and the ability to apply scientific foundations and research methods in the chosen field of medicine, to ensure integration and balance between training and research.

Demonstrate a willingness to encourage students to participate in medical scientific research devoted to the study of the state and quality of public health and the health care system, provide sufficient time within the educational program for students to conduct research, provide access to research facilities and activities in places of study.

Expertise in the field of education

Organization of education to define and implement a policy for the use of expertise in the field of education at the stage of planning, implementation and evaluation of the program.

To stimulate the development of expertise in the assessment of education and research on medical education as a discipline, to promote the desire and interests of employees in conducting research in medical education.

Alternative learning and exchange in the field of education

The organization of education must: to define and implement a policy of accessibility of individual learning opportunities in other educational institutions of the appropriate level within or outside the country, transfer and offset of educational credits and learning outcomes.

Demonstrate readiness to facilitate regional and international exchange of staff (academic, administrative and teaching staff) and students, providing appropriate resources; establish links with relevant national and international bodies in order to exchange and mutual recognition of learning elements

The evidentiary part

SKMA has the "institutional autonomy" to carry out educational, scientific, financial, economic and other activities in accordance with the legislation and the NPA of the Academy and to provide students with sufficient material and technical base to ensure adequate implementation of the OP, space and opportunities for practical and theoretical research; access to relevant professional literature; adequate information and communication technologies; modern equipment

for teaching practical methods, which is one of the strengths of educational activities and meets the criteria of the IAAR standard.

The Academy has resources to ensure the educational process: 4 own and 3 rented academic buildings with classrooms equipped with interactive equipment; a scientific library with a reading room and an electronic library hall; a research laboratory "Laboratory of Medicinal Plants" and "South Clinical & Genetic Laboratory"; "Practical Skills Center"; 2 dormitories; 42 clinical bases. SKMA has the necessary material and technical resources to fulfill the mission and implement the residency program in the specialties ("Pathological Anatomy" and "Forensic medicine") and includes: classrooms, library, clinical bases. The implementation of the residency program in the specialties "Pathological Anatomy" and "Forensic medicine" is carried out at clinical bases on the basis of concluded contracts: the Regional Pathology Bureau (contract No. 43 dated 03/01/2024), the Institute of Forensic Examinations in Shymkent RSE "CSE of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan" (contract No. 44 dated 03/01/2024). SKMA ensures the improvement of the learning environment through regular updating, expansion and strengthening of the material and technical base and equipment to maintain the appropriate quality of education at the postgraduate level. The construction of its own multidisciplinary clinic with 1,000 beds and a clinical diagnostic center (polyclinic) for 700 visits per shift (documents, interviews) has begun, which is one of the strengths of educational activities and meets the criteria of the IAAR standard. Information and library services for students and faculty of the Academy are provided by the library and information center. The unified information and library fund consists of 244538 copies, 18718 titles, including 142664 copies in the state language, 11967 copies of all types and types of publications in a foreign language. To implement a residency program in the specialties of "Pathological anatomy"/The "Forensic medicine" library is equipped with printed and electronic educational and scientific publications, which meets the criteria of the IAAR standard. SKMA provides free access to educational, methodological and scientific literature on electronic and magnetic media in basic and specialized disciplines, access to educational Internet resources, electronic libraries such as RMEB, Epigraph, Aknurpress, Zan, Paragraph, Epigraph-a platform of multimedia textbooks that include more than 10,000 titles of electronic educational, teaching and additional publications in various disciplines in the state, Russian and English languages; to international databases (Cochrane Library, Web of Science, Scopus, Elsevier, PubMed). All information on providing access to electronic information services is posted on the library's website, which meets the criteria of the IAAR standard.

The Academy's official website is functioning, where educational resources are available for teaching staff, students and other interested parties, information about structural divisions is posted, and the main events from the life of the Academy are highlighted.

The Academy has created a scientific infrastructure by combining the Genomic Research Laboratory and the Clinical Diagnostic Laboratory of the Academy: "South clinical & Genetic laboratory" (order of the Rector of JSC SKMA No. 180 dated 03/11/2021). The laboratory has a number of specialized departments: PCR, cytogenetics, biochemistry, hematology and ELISA. The laboratory has a license to carry out laboratory activities No.0012397DX dated 01/13/2013, No. 0111250DX dated 04/06/2018. The laboratory has been participating in the KIIS Dmed information system since 07/27/2021 (an agreement has been drawn up with the student polyclinic).

The Academy carries out international cooperation in the field of medical education, science and practice with medical universities and scientific centers of the countries of the near and far abroad. The Academy's partners are the Gdansk Medical University (Poland) and others.

The Academy implements the programs "Academic mobility of students" and "Visiting Professor" in accordance with the principles of the Bologna process. The implementation of these programs contributes to the internationalization of education and integration into the global educational space and corresponds to the Strategic Plan of the Academy, which meets the criteria of the IAAR standard.

Academic mobility of residents at the national level is planned at leading universities: NAO

MUA (Astana), NAO MUK (Karaganda), NAO ZKSMU (Aktobe), etc., in leading scientific centers of oncology, neurosurgery, centers of departments of pathological anatomy, in foreign universities in accordance with contractual obligations between the Academy and the partner university.

SKMA uses expertise in the field of education at the stage of planning, implementation and evaluation of the OP and includes general mechanisms for planning, implementing and evaluating the OP, such as determining current and future market needs, analyzing the training market, analyzing the university's capabilities for implementing the OP. At the same time, there is a low level of awareness among the heads of structural divisions and teaching staff about the implementation of the policy of using expertise in the field of education at the stage of planning, implementation and evaluation of the program, which does not meet the criteria of the IAAR standard and requires improvement. There is no functioning system to stimulate the development of expertise in the assessment of education and research on medical education as a discipline, to promote the aspirations and interests of employees in conducting research in medical education, which does not meet the criteria of the IAAR standard and requires improvement (interviews, documents).

The analytical part

SKMA has the "institutional autonomy" to carry out educational, scientific, financial, economic and other activities in accordance with the legislation and the NPA of the Academy and to provide students with sufficient material and technical base to ensure adequate implementation of the OP, space and opportunities for practical and theoretical research; access to relevant professional literature; adequate information and communication technologies; modern equipment for teaching practical methods, which is one of the strengths of educational activities and meets the criteria of the IAAR standard.

SKMA has the necessary material and technical resources to fulfill the mission and implement the residency program in the specialties "Pathological Anatomy" and "Forensic medicine", includes: classrooms, library, clinical bases (Institute of Forensic Examinations in Shymkent, RSE "CSE of the Ministry of Internal Affairs of the Republic of Kazakhstan", GKP na PHB "Regional Pathology Bureau"), which meets the criteria of the IAAR standard.

SKMA ensures the improvement of the learning environment through regular updating, expansion and strengthening of the material and technical base and equipment to maintain the appropriate quality of education at the postgraduate level. The construction of its own multidisciplinary clinic with 1,000 beds and a clinical diagnostic center (polyclinic) for 700 visits per shift (documents, interviews) has begun, which is one of the strengths of educational activities and meets the criteria of the IAAR standard.

The SKMA provides for the possibility of access for teachers and students to use information and communication technologies in the implementation of educational programs: for self-study; communication with colleagues; access to health information resources and relevant patient data; patient supervision and work in the health care system to provide medical care (report, documents, interviews).

The Department of Pathology and Forensic Medicine of the SKMA does not fully provide the conditions for students to acquire knowledge in the field of research methodology and the ability to apply scientific foundations and research methods in the chosen field of medicine, integration and balance between training and research, due to a small number of research projects (2 projects are being implemented) necessary for the development of scientific competencies students who are studying to conduct research within the framework of the implementation of the residency program in the specialties "Pathological Anatomy" and "Forensic medicine" (interviews, documents).

Due to the small number of research projects at the Department of Pathology and Forensic Medicine of the SKMA, there is a limitation in the opportunities of students to participate in medical scientific research, providing access to research facilities and activities in places of study, which does not meet the criteria of the IAAR standard and requires improvement (interviews,

documents).

There is a low level of awareness among the heads of structural divisions and teaching staff about the implementation of the policy of using expertise in the field of education at the stage of planning, implementation and evaluation of the program, which does not meet the criteria of the IAAR standard and requires improvement (interviews, documents).

Interviews with heads of structural divisions and teaching staff showed that the system of stimulating the development of expertise in the assessment of education and research on medical education as a discipline does not function, promoting the aspirations and interests of employees in conducting research in medical education, which does not meet the criteria of the IAAR standard and requires improvement (interviews, documents).

Strengths/best practice in EP residency in the specialties 7R01150 "Pathological anatomy" and 7R01134 "Forensic medicine":

1. SKMA has "institutional autonomy" in the use of resources in the implementation of educational, scientific, financial, economic and other activities, and in providing students with sufficient material and technical base to ensure adequate performance of the OP, space and opportunities for practical and theoretical research; access to relevant professional literature; adequate information and communication technologies; modern equipment for teaching practical methods.

2. The construction of its own multidisciplinary clinic with 1,000 beds and a clinical diagnostic center (polyclinic) for 700 visits per shift ensures an improvement in the learning environment through regular updating, expansion and strengthening of the material and technical base and equipment to maintain the appropriate quality of education at the postgraduate level at SKMA.

Recommendations for EP residency in the specialties 7R01150 "Pathological anatomy" and 7R01134 "Forensic medicine"

1. The management of the SKMA, the head of the Department of Pathology and Forensic Medicine, to provide conditions for students to acquire knowledge in the field of research methodology and the ability to apply scientific foundations and research methods in the chosen field of medicine, to ensure integration and balance between training and research, including . development and approval of new research projects necessary for the development of scientific competencies of students in conducting research within the framework of the implementation of the residency program in the specialties 7R01150 "Pathological Anatomy" and 7R01134 "Forensic medicine". The deadline is December 2024, then permanently.

2. The management of the SKMA should organize the implementation of a policy on the use of expertise in the field of education at the stage of planning, implementation and evaluation of the program, training of heads of structural divisions and teaching staff on the use of expertise in the field of education. The deadline is during the 2024/2025 academic year, then permanently.

3. The management of SKMA should develop and implement an algorithm to stimulate the development of expertise in the assessment of education and research on medical education, to promote the aspirations and interests of employees in conducting research in medical education. The deadline is during the 2024/2025 academic year, then permanently.

EEC conclusions on criteria:

- *Strong – 2*
- *Satisfactory – 10*
- *Suggest improvements – 3*
- *Unsatisfactory – 0*

According to the standard "Educational resources" of the educational residency program in the specialty 7R01150 "Pathological anatomy" have 2 strong, 10 satisfactory, 3 suggest improvement, 0 unsatisfactory positions.

According to the standard "Educational resources" of the educational residency program in the specialty 7R01134 "Forensic medicine" have 2 - strong, 10 - satisfactory, 3 - suggest

improvement, 0 - unsatisfactory positions.

6.7. The standard "Evaluation of the educational program"

- ✓ Monitoring and evaluation mechanisms of the program
- ✓ The organization of education should:
- ✓ have regulated procedures for monitoring, periodic evaluation of educational activities, learning outcomes, progress and academic performance of students with the involvement of key stakeholders.
- ✓ Demonstrate evidence of willingness to regularly monitor the OP, assess the relationship between personnel policy and the needs of education and the health system, evaluate the educational process, student assessment methods, student progress, academic staff qualifications, evaluate and analyze identified problems, make sure that the relevant assessment results affect the quality of the OP.
- ✓ Demonstrate a willingness to make the evaluation process and results transparent to all stakeholders.
- ✓ Feedback from the teacher and the student
- ✓ The organization of education must:
- ✓ Demonstrate evidence of willingness to systematically conduct, analyze and respond to feedback from teachers and students.
- ✓ Demonstrate evidence of willingness to actively involve teachers and students in planning the evaluation of the program and using the evaluation results to improve the program.
- ✓ Results of training of qualified specialists
- ✓ The organization of education must:
- ✓ to demonstrate evidence of readiness to constantly monitor qualified specialists; to provide feedback on the clinical practice of qualified specialists from employers; to establish and apply a mechanism for evaluating the program using the collected data on the results of the clinical practice of qualified specialists.

to demonstrate evidence of readiness to inform the structural units responsible for the selection of students, the development and planning of the educational program, and counseling of students about the results of the assessment of clinical practice of students.

Stakeholder engagement

The organization of education must:

Demonstrate evidence of willingness to involve key stakeholders in the monitoring and evaluation of the OP.

to demonstrate evidence of readiness to provide interested parties with access to the results of the evaluation of the course and educational program; to take into account the results of feedback from qualified specialists; to take into account the results of feedback on the OP.

The evidentiary part

The quality assurance of the OP is implemented in accordance with the Quality Assurance Policy, internal regulatory documents on the assessment of the OP in accordance with the quality standards of the SKMA, including the "Standards of internal quality assurance of educational activities of JSC South Kazakhstan Medical Academy".

The process of improving the educational system is implemented through a specialized CPC, which includes expert groups on various issues of the educational process (monitoring of the educational process, development of educational programs, development of CIS, interactive teaching methods, a group on language competence, publishing), based on the results of a survey of residents, teaching staff, employers. Annually, at the request of residents and employers, the catalog of elective disciplines for implemented residency programs is updated.

The Academy systematically collects and analyzes feedback in accordance with the internal document of the SKMA "ST044/015-2021. Assessment of customer satisfaction" through a survey of residents and employers. The questionnaire includes questions about the quality of the educational process, compliance with schedules, corruption, etc.). The data obtained are discussed at a meeting of the rector's office and the anti-corruption commission.

The external assessment of the OP is carried out within the framework of the institutional and specialized accreditation of the IAAR (in 2021 - 7 OP residencies, in 2022 - 21 OP residencies self-assessment was conducted for compliance with the IAAR Standards).

Monitoring and evaluation of the OP is carried out at all levels, a multi-level approach is used, including the profiling/graduating and related departments, the profile Committee of the educational program, the QMS department, the VVCC, the dean's office of residency, the dean's office of internship and graduate employment (general monitoring of the quality of educational programs through a survey of stakeholders (employers, professional associations and residents). At the same time, an interview with the teaching staff of the Department of Pathology and Forensic Medicine indicates a low involvement of all stakeholders (teachers, students, representatives of the medical community, employers) in planning, monitoring the evaluation of the program and using the evaluation results to improve the residency program in the specialty 7R01150 "Pathological Anatomy" and 7R01134 "Forensic medicine", which does not meet the criteria of the IAAR standard.

The analytical part

The quality assurance of the OP is implemented in accordance with the Quality Assurance

Policy, internal regulatory documents for the assessment of the OP in accordance with the quality standards of the SKMA, including the "Standards for Internal quality assurance of educational activities of JSC South Kazakhstan Medical Academy", which meets the criteria of the IAAR standard.

The process of improving the educational system is implemented through a specialized CPC, which includes expert groups on various issues of the educational process (monitoring of the educational process, development of educational programs, development of CIS, interactive teaching methods, a group on language competence, publishing), based on the results of a survey of residents, teaching staff, employers, which meets the criteria of the IAAR standard.

The Academy systematically collects and analyzes feedback in accordance with the internal document of the SKMA "ST044/015-2021. Assessment of customer satisfaction" through a survey of residents and employers. The questionnaire includes questions about the quality of the educational process, compliance with schedules, corruption, etc.). The data obtained are discussed at a meeting of the rector's office and the anti-corruption commission.

Monitoring and evaluation of the OP is carried out at all levels, a multi-level approach is used, including the profiling/graduating and related departments, the profile Committee of the educational program, the QMS department, the VVCC, the dean's office of residency, the dean's office of internship and graduate employment (general monitoring of the quality of educational programs through a survey of stakeholders (employers, professional associations and residents). There is a low involvement of all stakeholders (teachers of students, representatives of the medical community, employers) in planning, monitoring the evaluation of the program and using the evaluation results to improve the residency program in the specialty 7R01150 "Pathological Anatomy", which does not meet the criteria of the IAAR standard.

Strengths/best practice in the residency program in the specialty 7R01150 "Pathological anatomy" and 7R01134 "Forensic medicine":

According to this standard, no strengths have been identified.

Recommendations of the EEC for the EP residency in the specialty 7R01150 "Pathological anatomy" and 7R01134 "Forensic medicine":

The management of the SKMA, the Dean of the residency, when recruiting students for the residency program in the specialties 7R01150 "Pathological Anatomy" and 7R01134 "Forensic medicine", develop and implement an algorithm that ensures the active involvement of all stakeholders (teachers, students, representatives of the medical community, employers) in planning, monitoring the evaluation of the program and using the evaluation results to improve programs. The deadline is during the 2024/2025 academic year, then permanently.

The conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:

- *Strong – 0*
- *Satisfactory – 9*
- *Suggest improvements – 0*
- *Unsatisfactory – 0*

According to the standard "Assessment of the educational program", the educational residency programs in the specialty 7R01150 "Pathological anatomy" have 0 - strong, 9 - satisfactory, 0 - suggest improvement, 0 - unsatisfactory positions.

According to the standard "Assessment of the educational program", the educational residency programs in the specialty 7R01134 "Forensic medicine" have 0 - strong, 9 - satisfactory, 0 - suggest improvement, 0 - unsatisfactory positions.

6.8. The standard "Management and Administration"

- ✓ Management
- ✓ The organization of education must:
- ✓ Demonstrate evidence of willingness to document completion of studies by issuing degrees, diplomas, certificates or other official certificates of qualification; provide evidence of formal qualifications provided as a basis for official recognition of a specialist in a chosen field of medicine at the national and international level.

- ✓ Demonstrate evidence of willingness to be responsible for quality assurance processes.
- ✓ to demonstrate evidence of readiness to ensure that the OP meets the needs of society in terms of health and the health system, to ensure transparency of the work of management structures and their decisions.
- ✓ Academic leadership
- ✓ The organization of education must:
- ✓ to demonstrate evidence of readiness for leadership/academic leadership and organization of postgraduate medical education.
- ✓ Demonstrate evidence of willingness to periodically evaluate academic leadership regarding the achievement of the mission of the OP and expected learning outcomes.
- ✓ Budget for training and allocation of resources
- ✓ The organization of education should:
- ✓ have a clear distribution of responsibility and authority to provide resources for the educational program, including the target budget for training.
- ✓ Demonstrate evidence of willingness to allocate the resources necessary for the implementation of the OP and allocate educational resources in accordance with their needs
- ✓ Demonstrate evidence of willingness to manage the budget in such a way as to meet the functional responsibilities of the academic staff and students by introducing innovations into the program.
- ✓ Administrative staff and management
- ✓ The educational organization must:
- ✓ have an appropriate administrative staff, including their number and composition in accordance with the qualifications, to ensure the implementation of the OP and the relevant
- ✓ To develop and implement an internal management quality assurance program, including regular reviews and submission by the academic leadership of the OP for regular review to achieve high quality.
- ✓ Requirements and rules
- ✓ The educational organization must:
- ✓ comply with national legislation regarding the number and types of recognized medical specialties for which approved OP are being developed.
- ✓ To discuss and approve the postgraduate medical education program in cooperation with all interested parties.
- ✓ Informing the public
- ✓ The organization of education must:
- ✓ demonstrate evidence of willingness to publish complete and reliable information about the educational program and its achievements on the official website of the educational organization and in the media.

The evidentiary part

Management and administration of SCMA is carried out in accordance with the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Charter and internal regulatory documents of the Academy: regulations on divisions, structure, management and accountability, goals, tasks and functions of structural divisions, job descriptions have been developed and approved. The Rector is appointed and dismissed by the Founder of the Academy and is personally responsible for financial and economic activities, the safety of the Academy's property, for organizing anti-corruption, establishes the competence of the Academy's AUP, independently solves all issues of the Academy's activities in accordance with his competence, determined by the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Charter of the Academy (interviews, documents).

The Dean's Office of the Residency is responsible for the direct organization and support of the implementation of the residency program in the specialties 7R01150 "Pathological Anatomy" and "Forensic medicine", including the control of educational and methodological support for the OP, the introduction of a model of medical education based on a competence-based approach and resident-centered training.

The Academy has a Scientific-clinical and Educational-Methodical Council for the management of the educational process. The NCC is the main advisory body on the issues of educational, methodological and organizational support of the educational process in the residency.

The Academy implements a Quality Policy, which defines the main activities aimed at the development of all forms of SCMA activities. Since 2005, the Academy has implemented and operates a quality management system; a QMS department has been organized.

In SKMA in accordance with the standards "ISO 9001:2015. Quality management systems. Requirements" and "ISO 19001:2011" were developed by "ST 044/020-2021. Internal audits" for the implementation of internal audit. Internal assessment of the quality of education is implemented in the processes of self-certification within the framework of state certification, internal audit (QMS), self-assessment (accreditation), data collection for university ranking and program evaluation, which meets the criteria of the IAAR standard.

The financial and economic activities of the Academy are aimed at ensuring financial stability and solvency for its obligations, increasing income, wage stability, strengthening the material and technical base and are carried out in accordance with legislation

Determining the financial and economic policy and management structure of the Academy is the responsibility of the Rector of the SKMA. The financial issues at the Academy are handled by the Planning and Economic Department. The Chief Accountant oversees the following structures responsible for budget management, including residency programs: financial and Economic Department, Accounting and Finance Department. The Academy's budget is formed from several sources: the republican budget (the state order for the training of postgraduate education, advanced training of medical workers, the development of scientific research, transfers); the local budget; paid educational and other services. The analysis of income and expenses of SCMA for 2023 and 2024 showed an increase in resources for paying salaries to employees, professional development of teaching staff, academic mobility of students, internships for undergraduates and doctoral students, which meets the criteria of the IAAR standard.

SKMA has allocated resources for the construction of its own multidisciplinary clinic with 1,000 beds and a clinical diagnostic center (polyclinics) for 700 visits per shift, which is one of the strengths of the educational process at SKMA (documents, interviews).

The analysis of the strategic directions of the development of the SKMA, the structure of the SKMA, the staffing table of positions, showed the need to introduce the position of vice-rector for medical/medical/clinical activities associated with an increase in the volume of work due to the construction of its own multidisciplinary clinic with 1000 beds and a clinical diagnostic center (polyclinic) for 700 visits per shift (documents, interviews).

The analytical part

SKMA has developed documents defining the organizational structure and organization of the educational process in the implementation of the OP, which meets the criteria of the IAAR standard.

SKMA has developed and certified a quality management system. A Quality Manual has been developed that defines the Quality Policy and Objectives of SKMA and describes the quality management system developed to implement this policy, which meets the criteria of the IAAR standard.

SKMA has the institutional autonomy to allocate financial resources and form tangible assets based on the SKMA Development Strategy, consistent with the mission and goals. In 2023 and 2024, there has been an increase in resources for paying salaries to employees, professional development of teaching staff, academic mobility of students, internships for undergraduates and doctoral students, which meets the criteria of the IAAR standard. SKMA has allocated resources for the construction of its own multidisciplinary clinic with 1,000 beds and a clinical diagnostic center (polyclinic) for 700 visits per shift, which is one of the strengths of the educational process at SKMA (documents, interviews).

It should be noted that one of the strategic directions of the development of SKMA, associated with the construction of its own multidisciplinary clinic with 1,000 beds and a clinical diagnostic center (polyclinic) for 700 visits per shift, causes an increase in the volume of work and requires the introduction of the post of vice-rector for medical/medical/clinical activities, whose functions would include the coordination of this type of activity SKMA and PPP (documents, interviews).

Strengths/best practice in EP residency in the specialties 7R01150 "Pathological Anatomy" and 7R01134 "Forensic medicine":

SKMA has institutional autonomy to allocate and distribute financial resources for the implementation of OP in accordance with the needs of the educational process: characterized by an increase in resources to pay salaries to employees, professional development of teaching staff, academic mobility of students internships for undergraduates and doctoral students; allocation of resources for the construction of its own multidisciplinary clinic with 1,000 beds and a clinical diagnostic center (polyclinics) for 700 visits per shift.

Recommendations of the EEC for the EP residency in the specialties 7R01150 "Pathological anatomy" and 7R01134 "Forensic medicine":

In connection with the construction of its own multidisciplinary clinic with 1,000 beds and a clinical diagnostic center (polyclinic) for 700 visits per shift, the management of the SKMA should introduce the positions of vice-rector for curative (medical/clinical) activities into the staff schedule of the SKMA. The deadline is December 2024, then permanently.

The conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:

- *Strong – 1*
- *Satisfactory – 12*
- *Suggest improvements – 0*
- *Unsatisfactory – 0*

According to the standard "Management and administration" of the educational residency program in the specialty 7R01150 "Pathological anatomy" have 1 - strong, 12 - satisfactory, 0 - suggest improvement, 0 - unsatisfactory positions.

According to the standard "Management and administration" of the educational residency program in the specialty 7R01134 "Forensic medicine" have 1 - strong, 12 - satisfactory, 0 - suggest improvement, 0 - unsatisfactory positions.

(VII) OVERVIEW OF STRENGTHS/BEST PRACTICES FOR EACH STANDARD

For EP residency in the specialties 7R01150 "Pathological anatomy" and 7R01134 "Forensic medicine"

The "Mission and End Results" standard

According to this standard, no strengths have been identified.

The standard "Educational program"

According to this standard, no strengths have been identified.

The standard "Student Assessment Policy"

has not revealed any strengths according to this standard.

The "Students" standard.

According to this standard, no strengths have been identified.

The standard "Academic staff/Teachers"

According to this standard, no strengths have been identified.

The standard "Educational resources"

1. SKMA has "institutional autonomy" in the use of resources in the implementation of educational, scientific, financial, economic and other activities, and in providing students with sufficient material and technical base to ensure adequate performance of the OP, space and opportunities for practical and theoretical research; access to relevant professional literature; adequate information and communication technologies modern equipment for teaching practical methods, which is a strong point in the implementation of the residency program in the specialties 7R01150 "Pathological Anatomy" and 7R01134 "Forensic medicine.

2. The construction of its own multidisciplinary clinic with 1,000 beds and a clinical diagnostic center (polyclinic) for 700 visits per shift ensures an improvement in the learning

environment through regular updating, expansion and strengthening of the material and technical base and equipment to support.

The standard "Evaluation of the educational program"

According to this standard, no strengths have been identified.

Management and Administration Standard

SKMA has institutional autonomy in allocating and distributing financial resources for the implementation of the educational program in accordance with the needs of the educational process: it is characterized by an increase in resources for paying salaries to employees, advanced training of teaching staff, academic mobility of students, internships for undergraduates and doctoral students; allocation of resources for the construction of its own multidisciplinary clinic with 1000 beds and a clinical diagnostic center (polyclinics) 700 visits per shift, which is one of the strengths of the implementation of educational, scientific and medical activities at SKMA.

OVERVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS FOR QUALITY IMPROVEMENT FOR EACH STANDARD

For EP residency in the specialties 7R01150 "Pathological anatomy" and 7R01134 "Forensic medicine"

The "Mission and End Results" standard

1. The Dean of the residency, together with the head of the Department of Pathology and Forensic Medicine, to develop an algorithm for informing and attracting students to participate in scientific research as part of the implementation of the residency program in the specialties 7R01150 "Pathological Anatomy" and 7R01134 "Forensic medicine". The deadline is December 2024, then permanently.

2. The Dean of the residency, together with the head of the Department of Pathology and Forensic Medicine, should ensure that stakeholders are informed and expanded in the formulation of the mission and expected learning outcomes of the residency in the specialties 7R01150 "Pathological Anatomy" and 7R01134 "Forensic medicine". The deadline is September 2024, then permanently.

3. The Dean of the residency, together with the head of the Department of Pathology and Forensic Medicine, to develop and implement an algorithm to ensure that the stated Mission of the residency in the specialties 7R01150 "Pathological Anatomy" and 7R01134 "Forensic medicine", and the expected results are based on the opinion/suggestion of other interested parties. The deadline is September 2024.

Standard "Educational program"

1. The management of the SKMA, the Dean of the residency, together with the head of the Department of Pathology and Forensic Medicine, develop and approve new research projects necessary for the development of scientific competencies of students to conduct research within the framework of the implementation of the residency program in the specialties 7R01150 "Pathological Anatomy" 7R01134, "Forensic medicine". The deadline is December 2024, then permanently.

2. The management of the SKMA, the Dean of Residency, together with the head of the Department of Pathology and Forensic Medicine, ensure the implementation of residency programs in the specialties 7R01150 "Pathological Anatomy" and 7R01134 "Forensic medicine", based on the principles of scientific methodology, including methods of analytical and critical thinking; research methods in healthcare and evidence-based medicine. The deadline is during the 2024/2025 academic year, then permanently.

3. The Dean of the residency, together with the head of the Department of Pathology and Forensic Medicine, to develop and implement an algorithm that ensures the procedure for:

- attracting future residents to research and the development of scientific thinking. The deadline is September 2024, then permanently.

- inclusion of changes and additions to the OP based on a critical assessment of literature and scientific data; adaptation of the content of the OP taking into account scientific developments in medicine, achievements of scientific, technological, medical and pharmaceutical developments, current and expected needs of society and the health system. The deadline is September 2024, then permanently.

4. The Dean of the residency, together with the head of the Department of Pathology and Forensic Medicine, ensure that proper representation from students and other interested parties is included in the planning and development of the residency program in the specialties 7R01150 "Pathological Anatomy" and 7R01134 "Forensic medicine". The deadline is during the 2024/2025 academic year, then permanently.

5. The Head of the Registrar's Office should ensure that additions are made to the regulatory legal documents of the SCMA regulating the activities of the "Service of Advisors of JSC South Kazakhstan Medical Academy" concerning the implementation of the residency program. The deadline is September 2024, then permanently.

The standard "Student Assessment Policy"

1. The management of the SKMA, the Dean of the residency, organize training for teaching staff and employees of structural divisions on issues related to:

- **conducting an examination of the control and measuring means of certification in the implementation of the OP in the specialty of the residency. The deadline is during the 2024/2025 academic year, then permanently.**

- **assessment methods and formats in accordance with their "assessment effectiveness" and ensure their use in the implementation of the OP in the specialty of the residency. The deadline is during the 2024/2025 academic year, then permanently.**

- the process of documenting the reliability, validity and fairness of assessment methods for students in the implementation of OP in the specialty of residency. The deadline is during the 2024/2025 academic year, then permanently.

2. The management of the SKMA, the Dean of the residency, develop and implement an algorithm for documenting the reliability, validity and fairness of student assessment methods. The deadline is during the 2024/2025 academic year, then permanently.

3. The management of the SKMA, the Dean of the residency, ensure the introduction of new assessment methods in accordance with the need, documenting various types and stages of training and assessment. The deadline is during the 2024/2025 academic year, then permanently.

4. The management of the SKMA, the Dean of the residency, to develop and implement an algorithm to encourage the process of examination of assessment methods by external experts. The deadline is during the 2024/2025 academic year, then permanently.

The standard "Students".

1. The management of the SKMA, the dean of the residency, when recruiting students for the residency in the specialties 7R01150 "Pathological Anatomy" and 7R01134 "Forensic medicine", provide:

- **representation of students in the collegial bodies of the SKMA and their respective participation in the development of the mission and intended learning outcomes, in the development of the OP, planning of learning conditions for students, assessment and management of the OP. The deadline is September 2024, then – permanently;**

- **encouraging the representation of students to participate in decision-making on educational processes, conditions and rules of study. The deadline is September 2024, then permanently.**

The standard "Academic staff/Teachers"

1. The management of SKMA:

- to ensure the organization and implementation of the expertise of educational activities to increase the potential of the academic staff. The deadline is during the 2024/2025 academic year, then constantly;

- to organize training for the heads of structural divisions of the Higher School of Economics and Teaching Staff on the issues of conducting an examination of educational activities. The deadline is during the 2024/2025 academic year, then permanently.

2. The management of SKMA should develop and implement a system of criteria on the basis of which incentive payments will be made to employees for their contribution to educational activities. The deadline is December 2024, then permanently.

3. The head of the Department of Pathology and Forensic Medicine should develop and implement a system that ensures an increase in the level of teaching staff and staffing of the department for the implementation of OP in the specialties of the residency. The deadline is December 2024, then permanently.

The standard "Educational resources"

1. The management of the SKMA, the head of the Department of Pathology and Forensic Medicine, to provide conditions for students to acquire knowledge in the field of research methodology and the ability to apply scientific foundations and research methods in the chosen field of medicine, to ensure integration and balance between training and research, including . development and approval of new research projects necessary for the development of scientific competencies of students in conducting research within the framework of the implementation of the residency program in the specialties 7R01150 "Pathological Anatomy" and 7R01134 "Forensic medicine". The deadline is December 2024, then permanently.

2. The management of the SKMA should organize the implementation of a policy on the use of expertise in the field of education at the stage of planning, implementation and evaluation of the program, training of heads of structural divisions and teaching staff on the use of expertise in the field of education. The deadline is during the 2024/2025 academic year, then permanently.

3. The management of SKMA should develop and implement an algorithm to stimulate the development of expertise in the assessment of education and research on medical education, to promote the aspirations and interests of employees in conducting research in medical education. The deadline is during the 2024/2025 academic year, then permanently.

The standard "Evaluation of the educational program"

for the management of the SKMA, the dean of the residency when recruiting students for the residency in the specialties 7R01150 "Pathological Anatomy" and 7R01134 "Forensic medicine" to develop and implement an algorithm that ensures the active involvement of all stakeholders (teachers, students, representatives of the medical community, employers) in planning and monitoring the evaluation of the program and using the evaluation results to improve the program. The deadline is during the 2024/2025 academic year, then permanently.

Management and Administration Standard

In connection with the construction of its own multidisciplinary clinic with 1,000 beds and a clinical diagnostic center (polyclinic) for 700 visits per shift, the management of the SKMA should introduce the positions of vice-rector for curative (medical/clinical) activities into the staff schedule of the SKMA. The deadline is December 2024, then permanently.

(VIII) OVERVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE ORGANIZATION OF EDUCATION

There are no recommendations.

(IX) RECOMMENDATION TO THE ACCREDITATION COUNCIL

The members of the EEC came to the unanimous opinion that the residency program in the specialty 7R01150 "Pathological Anatomy", implemented in JSC South Kazakhstan Medical Academy, is recommended for accreditation for a period of 5 years.

The members of the EEC came to the unanimous opinion that the residency program in the specialty 7R01134 "Forensic medicine", implemented in JSC South Kazakhstan Medical Academy, is recommended for accreditation for a period of 5 years.

Appendix 1. Evaluation table "Conclusion of the external expert commission" (for the EP residency in the specialty 7R01150 "Pathological anatomy")

No. N\N no. N\N no. crit. EVALUATION CRITERIA FOR THE position of the NGO	No. N\N no. N\N no. crit. EVALUATION CRITERIA FOR THE position of the NGO	No. N\N no. N\N no. crit. EVALUATION CRITERIA FOR THE position of the NGO	No. N\N no. N\N no. crit. EVALUATION CRITERIA FOR THE position of the NGO	No. N\N no. N\N no. crit. EVALUATION CRITERIA FOR THE position of the NGO	
				Strong Satisfactory Implies improvement Unsatisfactory	Strong Satisfactory Implies improvement Unsatisfactory
Standard 1 "MISSION AND LEARNING OUTCOMES"					
1.1 Definition of the mission					
The organization of education must:					
1	1	1.1.1.	define the mission of postgraduate medical education and bring to the attention of stakeholders and the health sector		+
2	2	1.1.2.	define the mission based on the needs of society in health issues, the needs of the medical care system, other aspects of social responsibility		+
3	3	1.1.3.	define a training program containing theoretical and practical components with an emphasis on the latter, the result of which will be a doctor:		+
4	4	1.1.4.	☑ competent in the chosen field of medicine, including good medical practice,		+

5	5	1.1.5.	☑ able to work independently at a high professional level,		
1.2 Professionalism and professional autonomy					
The organization of education must:					
6	6	1.2.1.	include professionalism in the training of physicians and ensure that training promotes professional autonomy to enable future action in the best interests of the patient and society		+
7	7	1.2.2.	to provide for cooperation with the Government and other partners, while maintaining appropriate independence from them		+
1.3. Learning outcomes					
The organization of education must:					
8	8	1.3.1.	to determine the expected learning outcomes that students should achieve upon completion of their studies in relation to their achievements at the postgraduate level in terms of knowledge, skills and behavior/attitude, the appropriate basis for a future career in their chosen field of medicine, their future roles in the health sector, commitment and skills in the implementation of continuing education, the health needs of society, the needs of the health system and other aspects of social responsibility, professional behavior		+
9	9	1.3.2.	identify and publish expected learning outcomes: general and specialty-specific that students need to achieve		+
10	10	1.3.3.	demonstrate evidence of willingness to ensure proper behavior of students towards classmates, teachers, medical staff, patients and their relatives		+
11	11	1.3.4.	determine expected learning outcomes based on the results obtained at the level of basic medical education to ensure interaction between basic and postgraduate medical education		+

12	12	1.3.5	should provide for the possibility of students' participation in research in the relevant field of health		
1.4. Participation in the formulation of the mission and learning outcomes					
The organization of education must:					
13	13	1.4.1.	ensure the participation of key stakeholders in the formulation of the mission and expected learning outcomes		+
14	14	1.4.2.	Ensure that the stated mission and expected learning outcomes are based on the opinions/suggestions of other stakeholders		+
				total	0
12					
Standard 2. EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM					
2.1. The learning approach					
The organization of education must:					
15	1	2.1.1.	to define an approach to training based on expected learning outcomes and official certificates of qualification provided as the basis for official recognition of a specialist in a chosen field of medicine at the national and international level		+
16	2	2.1.2.	to define an approach to training based on the results of basic medical education, systematically and transparently, using practice-oriented training that includes and supports the student's personal participation in to provide medical care and responsibility for the patient, their own educational process and clinical practice		+
17	3	2.1.3.	to demonstrate evidence of willingness to ensure the use of appropriate teaching methods that ensure the integration of practical and theoretical components, to guide the student through mentoring and regular assessment and feedback,		+

			including adherence to ethical requirements and norms		
18	4	2.1.4.	demonstrate evidence of readiness to ensure that the educational program is implemented in accordance with the principles of equality, inform students about the program, the rights and obligations of students		+
19	5	2.1.5.	, increase the degree of independence and responsibility of the student as knowledge, skills, and acquired experience improve		+
20	6	2.1.6.	, provide an opportunity to identify gender, cultural and religious characteristics and properly prepare the student for interaction with the specified contingent patients		+
2.2. The scientific method					
The organization of education must:					
21	7	2.2.1.	throughout the training program, to instill in students the principles of scientific methodology, including methods of analytical and critical thinking; research methods in healthcare and evidence-based medicine		
22	8	2.2.2.	, strive to include in the OP a critical assessment of literature and scientific data, adapt content based on scientific developments in medicine, change the OP, taking into account the achievements of scientific, technological, medical and pharmaceutical developments, current and the expected needs of society and the health system		
2.3 The content of the training					
The organization of education must:					
23	9	2.3.1.	to include in the learning process the practice and theory of basic biomedical, clinical, behavioral,		+

			social sciences and preventive medicine, clinical solutions, communication skills, medical ethics, public health, medical jurisprudence and forensic medicine, management disciplines, patient safety, physician protection, complementary medicine		
24	10	2.3.2.	to organize an educational program with appropriate attention to patient safety and their independence		+
25	11	2.3.3.	to demonstrate evidence of readiness to ensure correction and modification of the OP to ensure the development of knowledge, skills and thinking of various graduate roles, compliance of the content of the OP with changing conditions and needs of society and the health system		+
2.4. Structure of the educational program, content and duration					
The organization of education must:					
26	12	2.4.1.	to describe the content, scope and sequence of courses and duration of the OP; to identify mandatory and selective components; to combine practice and theory in the learning process; to ensure compliance with national legislation, which should be presented and described; to ensure adequate impact on how local, national or regional health systems solve health problems and medical needs to help the population		+
27	13	2.4.2.	take into account the learning outcomes of previous basic medical education related to the chosen field of medicine		+
28	14	2.4.3.	to determine the requirements for a graduate to perform various roles in the healthcare system		+
2.5. Organization of training					
The organization of education must:					

29	15	2.5.1.	to define responsibilities and powers for the organization, coordination, management and evaluation of the individual learning environment and the learning process		+	
30	16	2.5.2.	to provide for the inclusion in the planning and development of the educational program due representation from teaching staff, students and other key and relevant stakeholders		+	
31	17	2.5.3.	to plan training in such a way as to familiarize the student with a wide range of existing practical experience in the chosen field of medicine		+	
32	18	2.5.4.	to guarantee a variety of places coordinate multiple training locations to gain appropriate access to different aspects of the chosen field of medicine		+	
2.6. The relationship between education, medical practice and the healthcare system						
The organization of education must:						
33	19	2.6.1.	to provide and ensure integration between theoretical training and professional development, to develop training through medical practice and professional development; to integrate training and medical practice through the provision of medical care to patients; to ensure that training complements and takes into account the needs of medical care		+	
34	20	2.6.2.	to effectively use the capabilities of the health care system to provide medical care for training purposes		+	
				Total	0	18
Standard 3. STUDENT ASSESSMENT POLICY						
3.1. Assessment methods						
The organization of education must:						

35	1	3.1.1.	develop and implement a student assessment/assessment policy; define, approve and publish the principles, objectives, methods and practices of student assessment, including, if necessary, with verification by specialists		+
36	2	3.1.2.	to ensure that assessment procedures cover knowledge, skills, attitudes and professional behavior		+
37	3	3.1.3.	to ensure the use of an additional set of assessment methods and formats in accordance with their "assessment effectiveness", including the use of several evaluators and several assessment methods		
38	4	3.1.4.	, determine the criteria for passing exams or other types of assessment, including the number of allowable retakes		+
39	5	3.1.5.	, provide for the possibility of documenting the reliability, validity and fairness of student assessment methods		
40	6	3.1.6.	to implement a system for appealing evaluation results based on the principles of fairness or in accordance with appropriate legal procedures		+
41	7	3.1.7.	to introduce new evaluation methods in accordance with the need, document the various types and stages of training and evaluation		
42	8	3.1.8.	to provide for the encouragement of the process of examination of evaluation methods by external experts		

3.2. The relationship between assessment and learning

The organization of education must:

43	9	3.2.1.	to ensure the use of evaluation		+
----	---	--------	---------------------------------	--	---

			principles, methods and practices that are comparable to expected learning outcomes and methods; to ensure that students achieve the expected learning outcomes; to facilitate the learning of students; to ensure the adequacy and relevance of learning; to provide timely, specific, constructive and objective feedback to students based on the assessment of their activities		
44	10	3.2.2.	Strive to use evaluation principles, methods and practices that encourage integrated learning, encourage the involvement of students in clinical practice, and facilitate interprofessional training		+
Total				0	6
Standard 4. STUDENTS					
4.1. Selection and Admission Policy					
The organization of education must:					
45	1	4.1.1.	have a policy and implement the practice of admission, admission based on the mission of the organization and including a clearly established provision for the selection process of students		+
46	2	4.1.2.	to ensure a balance between learning opportunities and admission of students; formulate and implement policies/rules for the selection of students according to established criteria; have a policy and implement the practice of admission, admission of students with disabilities in accordance with current to ensure a high level of knowledge and skills in the field of basic biomedical sciences achieved at the previous level of basic medical education; to ensure transparency and fairness of the selection procedure		+
47	3	4.1.3.	to have a policy and implement the practice of transferring students from other educational organizations, including foreign		+
48	4	4.1.4.	ones, to guarantee in the selection procedure the opportunities of potential students to improve the		+

			quality of education in the chosen field of medicine; to guarantee transparency of the selection procedure; to provide a mechanism for appealing admission decisions		
49	5	4.1.5.	to demonstrate willingness to involve student associations and other stakeholders in the development of policy and selection process periodically reviewing the admission policy and rules		+
4.2. Number of students					
The organization of education must:					
50	6	4.2.1.	determine the number of accepted students in accordance with: clinical/practical training opportunities, the ability of the NGO to carry out appropriate control and monitoring of the educational process, logistical and other available resources, information on the health needs of society and the society		+
51	7	4.2.2.	to provide an opportunity to periodically review the number and contingent of accepted students in consultation with relevant stakeholders responsible for planning and the development of human resources in the health sector		+
52	8	4.2.3.	to provide an opportunity to adapt the number of potential students, taking into account the available information on the number of qualified candidates and information on national and international labor markets; to regulate the number of potential students, taking into account the inherent unpredictability of the exact need for the workforce of specialists in various fields of medicine		+

4.3. Advising and supporting students**The organization of education must:**

53	9	4.3.1.	demonstrate willingness to provide students with access to the academic counseling system for students		+
54	10	4.3.2.	demonstrate willingness to provide academic counseling when monitoring and controlling student progress, including analysis of unintended incidents		+
55	11	4.3.3.	demonstrate willingness to provide a student support program aimed at social, financial and personal needs		+
56	12	4.3.4.	demonstrate willingness to allocate resources for social and personal support for students; ensure confidentiality regarding counseling and support		+
57	13	4.3.5.	demonstrate willingness professional orientation, counseling and career planning		+
58	14	4.3.6.	to demonstrate the willingness of counseling, in order to support in the event of a professional crisis; involve organizations/associations of students in solving problematic situations of students		+

4.4. Representation of students**The organization of education must:**

59	15	4.4.1.	have a policy and implement the practice of student representation and their appropriate participation in the development of the mission and intended learning outcomes, in the development of educational programs, planning of learning conditions for students, evaluation and management of educational		+
60	16	4.4.2.	programs to demonstrate a willingness to encourage student representation to participate in		+

			decision-making on educational processes, conditions and rules of learning		
4.5 Working conditions					
The organization of education must:					
61	17	4.5.1.	to provide a training program with appropriate remuneration/scholarships or other means of financing and motivating students		+
62	18	4.5.2.	to guarantee students' access to medical care for patients, including calling a doctor, where appropriate		+
63	19	4.5.3.	, to demonstrate evidence of willingness to identify and publish working conditions and responsibility of students		+
64	20	4.5.4.	to provide for interruption of training caused by pregnancy (including maternity/paternity leave, care to		+
65	21	4.5.5.	strive to ensure that the work components in the student's work do not dominate the educational component/training		+
66	22	4.5.6.	to take into account the needs of patients, continuity of medical care and educational needs of students, when drawing up a work plan and schedule, including on-call work		+
67	23	4.5.7.	to allow distance learning in special circumstances, in accordance with the individual educational trajectory and work experience of the student, providing evidence that the total duration and quality of distance learning is not less than in full-time education		+
68	24	4.5.8.	, to provide for the possibility of continuing education under conditions of study breaks related		+

			to pregnancy (including maternity / paternity leave), illness, military service or secondment		
			Total	0	24
Standard 5. ACADEMIC STAFF/TEACHERS					
5.1. Recruitment and Selection Policy					
The educational organization should develop and implement a staff selection and recruitment policy that:					
69	1	5.1.1.	takes into account the necessary criteria for employment with the condition of examination of documents; contains criteria for the scientific, pedagogical and clinical/professional merits of applicants, including the proper ratio between pedagogical, scientific and professional qualifications		+
70	2	5.1.2.	defines the duties of teachers, including the balance between teaching, scientific and other functions, taking into account the mission of the OP, the needs of the education system and the needs of the healthcare system		+
71	3	5.1.3.	ensures that teachers have practical experience in the relevant field, are recognized specialists in the relevant field, and that teachers of narrow specialties, if necessary, are approved for appropriate periods of study, depending on their qualifications		+
72	4	5.1.4.	encourages participation in programs to develop their educational potential, use the expertise of educational activities to increase the potential of the academic staff, determine the level of remuneration for participation in postgraduate education		
5.2. Personnel Activity and Development Policy					
The educational organization should develop and implement a staff activity and development policy aimed at:					
73	5	5.2.1.	a guarantee that teachers have enough time for training,		+

			consulting and independent development		
74	6	5.2.2.	the presence of a structure responsible for the development of the academic staff, ensuring periodic assessment of the academic staff		+
75	7	5.2.3.	the development and implementation of a policy to support the academic staff on pedagogy and professional development for further professional development; evaluate and recognize the scientific and academic achievements of teachers		+
76	8	5.2.4.	the ability to take into account the ratio "teacher-student" depending on the various components of the OP, taking into account the features that ensure close personal interaction and monitoring of students		+
			Total	0	7
Standard 6. EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES					
6.1. Material and technical base					
The organization of education must:					
77	1	6.1.1.	demonstrate a willingness to provide students with sufficient material and technical base to ensure adequate implementation of the OP, space and opportunities for practical and theoretical research; access to relevant professional literature; adequate information and communication technologies; modern equipment for teaching practical methods; safe learning environment		+
78	2	6.1.2.	demonstrate a willingness to improve the learning environment through regular updating, expansion and strengthening of the material-technical base and equipment to maintain the		+

			appropriate quality of education at the postgraduate level		
6.2. Educational environment					
The organization of education must:					
79	3	6.2.1.	demonstrate a willingness to provide the necessary resources for students to acquire adequate practical experience, including the selection and approval of the clinical base as an educational environment; access to sufficient clinical/practical tools/bases to provide training; sufficient number and diversity of patients; appropriate diverse clinical cases to achieve the goals and objectives of training, including the use of resources both inpatient, at the outpatient level, in order to provide the student with a wide range of experience in the chosen field of medicine		+
80	4	6.2.2.	, to demonstrate readiness, when choosing a learning environment, to guarantee the number of patients and the corresponding variety of clinical cases, allowing them to gain clinical experience in all aspects of the chosen specialty, including training in organization and management in the field of health and disease prevention; training in a university clinic, as well as training in other relevant clinics/institutions		+
6.3. Information technology					
An educational organization should:					
81	5	6.3.1.	demonstrate a willingness to provide the necessary resources for students to acquire adequate practical experience, including the selection and approval of the clinical base as an educational environment; access to sufficient clinical/practical tools/bases to provide training; sufficient number and diversity of patients; appropriate diverse clinical cases		+

			to achieve the goals and objectives of training, including the use of resources both inpatient, at the outpatient level, in order to provide the student with a wide range of experience in the chosen field of medicine		
82	6	6.3.2.	, to demonstrate readiness, when choosing a learning environment, to guarantee the number of patients and the corresponding variety of clinical cases, allowing them to gain clinical experience in all aspects of the chosen specialty, including training in organization and management in the field of health and disease prevention; training in a university clinic, as well as training in other relevant clinics/institutions		+
83	7	6.3.3.	to provide access for teachers and students to use information and communication technologies: for self-study; communication with colleagues; access to health information resources and relevant patient data; patient supervision and work in the health care system to provide medical care		+
6.4 Clinical Teams					
The organization of education must:					
84	8	6.4.1.	demonstrate a willingness to provide students with the opportunity to gain experience working in a team with colleagues and other medical professionals		+
85	9	6.4.2.	demonstrate a willingness to encourage learning in a multidisciplinary/interprofessional team, promote the development of the ability to guide and train other medical professionals		+
6.5. Medical and scientific research					
The organization of education must:					
86	10	6.5.1.	demonstrate a willingness to guarantee and provide conditions for students to acquire knowledge		

			in the field of research methodology and the ability to apply scientific foundations and research methods in the chosen field of medicine, ensure integration and balance between training and research		
87	11	6.5.2.	demonstrate a willingness to encourage students to participate in medical scientific research devoted to the study of the state and quality of public health and the health system, ensure sufficient time Within the framework of the educational program, students should be provided with access to research facilities and activities in the places of study.		+
6.6. Expertise in the field of education					
The organization of education must:					
88	12	6.6.1.	to define and implement a policy for the use of expertise in the field of education at the stage of planning, implementation and evaluation of the program		
89	13	6.6.2.	to stimulate the development of expertise in the assessment of education and research on medical education as a discipline, to promote the desire and interests of employees in conducting research in medical education		
6.7. Alternative learning and exchange in the field of education					
The organization of education must:					
90	14	6.7.1.	define and implement a policy of accessibility of individual learning opportunities in other educational institutions of the appropriate level within or outside the country, transfer and offset of educational credits and learning outcomes		+

91	15	6.7.2.	demonstrate readiness to facilitate regional and international exchange of staff (academic, administrative and teaching staff) and students, providing appropriate resources; establish links with relevant national and international bodies for the purpose of exchange and mutual recognition of learning elements		+
Total				2	10
Standard 7. EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM					
7.1. Monitoring and evaluation mechanisms of the program					
The organization of education must:					
92	1	7.1.1.	to have regulated procedures for monitoring, periodic evaluation of the OP, learning outcomes, progress and academic performance of students with the involvement of key stakeholders		+
93	2	7.1.2.	to demonstrate evidence of readiness to regularly monitor the OP, assess the relationship between personnel policy and needs in the field of education and the health system, evaluate the educational process, methods of evaluating students, student progress, academic staff qualifications, assessment and analyze the identified problems, ensure that the relevant evaluation results affect the quality of the OP		+
94	3	7.1.3.	, demonstrate a willingness to make the evaluation process and results transparent to all stakeholders		+
7.2. Feedback from the teacher and the student					
The organization of education must:					
95	4	7.2.1.	demonstrate evidence of a willingness to systematically conduct, analyze and respond to		+

			feedback from teachers and students			
96	5	7.2.2.	demonstrate evidence of a willingness to actively involve teachers and students in planning the evaluation of the program and using the evaluation results to improve the program		+	
7.3 Results of training of qualified specialists						
The organization of education must:						
97	6	7.3.1.	demonstrate evidence of readiness to constantly monitor qualified specialists; provide feedback on the clinical practice of qualified specialists from employers; establish and apply a mechanism for evaluating the program using the collected data on the results of the clinical practice of qualified specialists		+	
98	7	7.3.2.	; demonstrate evidence of readiness to inform the structural units responsible for the selection of students about the results of the assessment of clinical practice of students, development and planning of educational programs		+	
7.4. Stakeholder engagement						
The organization of education must:						
99	8	7.4.1.	7.3 Results of training of qualified specialists		+	
100	9	7.4.2.	The educational organization should:		+	
				Total	0	9
Standard 8. MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION						
8.1. Management						
The organization of education must:						
101	1	8.1.1.	demonstrate evidence of willingness to document completion of studies by issuing degrees, diplomas, certificates or other official certificates of		+	

			qualification; provide evidence of formal qualifications provided as the basis for official recognition of a specialist in a chosen field of medicine at the national and international level		
102	2	8.1.2.	demonstrate evidence of willingness to be responsible for quality assurance processes		+
103	3	8.1.3.	demonstrate evidence of willingness to ensure compliance with the needs of society at the level of to ensure the transparency of the work of management structures and their decisions		+
8.2. Academic Leadership					
The organization of education must:					
104	4	8.2.1.	demonstrate evidence of willingness to take responsibility for leadership/academic leadership and organization of postgraduate medical education.		+
105	5	8.2.2.	demonstrate evidence of willingness to periodically evaluate academic leadership regarding the achievement of the mission of the OP and expected learning outcomes		+
8.3. Budget for training and allocation of resources					
The organization of education must:					
106	6	8.3.1.	have a clear distribution of responsibility and authority to provide resources for the educational program, including the target budget for training		+
107	7	8.3.2.	, demonstrate evidence of readiness to allocate the resources necessary for the implementation of the educational program and allocate educational resources in accordance with their needs	+	
108	8	8.3.3.	, demonstrate evidence of readiness to manage the budget in		+

			such a way as to meet the functional responsibilities of the academic staff and students, the introduction of innovations into the program		
8.4. Administrative staff and management					
The organization of education must:					
109	9	8.4.1.	have an appropriate administrative staff, including their number and composition in accordance with qualifications, to ensure the implementation of the OP and related activities; ensure proper management and allocation of resources		+
110	10	8.4.2.	to develop and implement an internal management quality assurance program, including regular reviews and submission by the academic leadership of the OP for regular review to achieve high quality		+
8.5. Requirements and rules					
An educational organization should:					
111	11	8.5.1.	Comply with national legislation regarding the number and types of recognized medical specialties for which approved EPs are developed		+
112	12	8.5.2.	Discuss and approve the postgraduate medical education program in collaboration with all stakeholders		+
8.6. Informing the public					
The organization of education must:					
113	13	8.6.1.	demonstrate evidence of willingness to publish complete and reliable information about the educational institution and its achievements on the official website of the educational organization and in the media	demonstrate evidence of willingness to publish complete and reliable information about the educational institution and its achievements on the official	+

				website of the educational organization and in the media	
			Total	1	12
			TOTAL	3	98

Appendix 2: Evaluation table “Conclusion of the external expert commission” (for EP of residency in the specialty 7R01134 “Forensic medicine”)

№ П\П	№ П\П	№ крит.	EVALUATION CRITERIA	EVALUATION CRITERIA
Standard 1 “MISSION AND LEARNING OUTCOMES”				
1.1 Definition of mission				
An educational organization should:				
1	1	1.1.1.	define the mission of postgraduate medical education and bring to the attention of stakeholders and the health sector	+
2	2	1.1.2.	define the mission based on the needs of society in health issues, the needs of the medical care system, other aspects of social responsibility	+
3	3	1.1.3.	define a training program containing theoretical and practical components with an emphasis on the latter, the result of which will be a doctor:	+
4	4	1.1.4.	to provide a willingness to provide appropriate working conditions for students to maintain their health	+
5	5	1.1.5.	, to ensure that the mission of the OP includes the development of innovations in the educational	

			process, allowing the development of broader and more specialized competencies than those defined within the framework of the basic required competencies; the development of scientific competence of students so that doctors can conduct research in the chosen field of medicine; opportunities for doctors to become active participants in addressing issues related to the social determinants of health		
--	--	--	---	--	--

1.2 Professionalism and professional autonomy

The educational organization should:

6 6 1.2.1. include professionalism in the training of doctors and ensure that training promotes professional autonomy in order to enable them to act in the best interests of the patient and society in the future +	6 6 1.2.1. include professionalism in the training of doctors and ensure that training promotes professional autonomy in order to enable them to act in the best interests of the patient and society in the future +	6 6 1.2.1. include professionalism in the training of doctors and ensure that training promotes professional autonomy in order to enable them to act in the best interests of the patient and society in the future +	6 6 1.2.1. include professionalism in the training of doctors and ensure that training promotes professional autonomy in order to enable them to act in the best interests of the patient and society in the future +	6 6 1.2.1. include professionalism in the training of doctors and ensure that training promotes professional autonomy in order to enable them to act in the best interests of the patient and society in the future +	6 6 1.2.1. include professionalism in the training of doctors and ensure that training promotes professional autonomy in order to enable them to act in the best interests of the patient and society in the future +
7 7 1.2.2. provide for cooperation with the government and other partners, while maintaining appropriate independence from them +	7 7 1.2.2. provide for cooperation with the government and other partners, while maintaining appropriate independence from them +	7 7 1.2.2. provide for cooperation with the government and other partners, while maintaining appropriate independence from them +	7 7 1.2.2. provide for cooperation with the government and other partners, while maintaining appropriate independence from them +	7 7 1.2.2. provide for cooperation with the government and other partners, while maintaining appropriate independence from them +	7 7 1.2.2. provide for cooperation with the government and other partners, while maintaining appropriate independence from them +

1.3. Learning outcomes

The organization of education must:

8	8	1.3.1.	to determine the expected learning outcomes that students should achieve upon completion of their studies in relation to their achievements at the postgraduate level in terms of knowledge, skills and behavior/attitude, the appropriate basis for a future career in their chosen field of medicine, their future roles in the health sector, commitment and skills in the implementation of continuing education, the health needs of society, the needs of the health system and other aspects of social responsibility, professional behavior		+
9	9	1.3.2.	to identify and publish the expected learning outcomes: general and specialty-specific that students need to achieve		+
10	10	1.3.3.	to demonstrate evidence of readiness to ensure proper behavior of students in relation to classmates, teachers, medical staff, patients and their relatives		+
11	11	1.3.4.	to determine the expected learning outcomes based on the results obtained at the level of basic medical education for ensuring mutual relations		+
12	12	1.3.5	to determine the expected learning outcomes that students should achieve upon completion of their studies in relation to their achievements at the postgraduate level in terms of knowledge, skills and behavior/attitude, the appropriate basis for a future career in their chosen field of medicine, their future roles in the health sector, commitment and skills in the implementation of continuing education, the health needs of society, the needs of the health system and other aspects of		

			social responsibility, professional behavior		
1.4. Participation in the formulation of the mission and learning outcomes					
The organization of education must:					
13	13	1.4.1.	ensure the participation of key stakeholders in the formulation of the mission and expected learning outcomes		+
14	14	1.4.2.	Ensure that the stated mission and expected learning outcomes are based on the opinions/suggestions of other stakeholders		+
				Total	0
12					
Standard 2. EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM					
2.1. The learning approach					
The organization of education must:					
15	1	2.1.1.	to define an approach to training based on expected learning outcomes and official certificates of qualification provided as the basis for official recognition of a specialist in a chosen field of medicine at the national and international level		+
16	2	2.1.2.	to define an approach to training based on the results of basic medical education, systematically and transparently, using practice-oriented training that includes and supports the student's personal participation in providing medical care and responsibility for the patient, their own educational process and clinical practice		+
17	3	2.1.3.	demonstrate evidence of willingness to ensure the use of appropriate teaching methods that ensure the integration of practical and theoretical components, guide the student through mentoring and regular assessment and feedback,		+

			including adherence to ethical requirements and norms		
18	4	2.1.4.	demonstrate evidence of willingness to ensure that the educational program is implemented		+
19	5	2.1.5.	to define an approach to training based on expected learning outcomes and official certificates of qualification provided as the basis for official recognition of a specialist in a chosen field of medicine at the national and international level		+
20	6	2.1.6.	to define an approach to training based on the results of basic medical education, systematically and transparently, using practice-oriented training that includes and supports the student's personal participation in providing medical care and responsibility for the patient, their own educational process and clinical practice		+
2.2. Scientific method					
An educational organization should:					
21	7	2.2.1.	Throughout the training program, instill in trainees the principles of scientific methodology, including analytical and critical thinking techniques; research methods in health care and evidence-based medicine		
22	8	2.2.2.	strive to incorporate critical appraisal of literature and scientific evidence into the EP, adapt content based on scientific developments in medicine, modify the EP to take into account advances in scientific, technological, medical and pharmaceutical developments, current and anticipated societal and health system needs		
2.3 The content of the training					
The organization of education must:					
23	9	2.3.1.	to include in the learning process the practice and theory of basic biomedical, clinical, behavioral, social sciences and preventive medicine, clinical solutions,		+

			communication skills, medical ethics, public health, medical jurisprudence and forensic medicine, management disciplines, patient safety, protection of doctors, complementary medicine		
24	10	2.3.2.	to organize an educational program with appropriate attention to the safety of patients and their independence		+
25	11	2.3.3.	to demonstrate evidence of readiness to ensure correction and modification of the OP to ensure the development of knowledge, skills and thinking of various graduate roles, compliance of the content of the OP with changing conditions and needs of society and the health system		+
2.4. The structure of the educational program, content and duration					
The organization of education must:					
26	12	2.4.1.	to describe the content, scope and sequence of courses and duration of the OP; to identify mandatory and selective components; to combine practice and theory in the learning process; to ensure compliance with national legislation, which should be presented and described; to ensure adequate impact on how local, national or regional health systems solve health problems and medical needs to help the population		+
27	13	2.4.2.	take into account the learning outcomes of previous basic medical education related to the chosen field of medicine		+
28	14	2.4.3.	to determine the requirements for a graduate to perform various roles in the healthcare system		+
2.5. Organization of training					

The organization of education should:						
29	15	2.5.1.	to define responsibilities and powers for the organization, coordination, management and evaluation of the individual learning environment and the learning process		+	
30	16	2.5.2.	to provide for the inclusion in the planning and development of the educational program due representation from teaching staff, students and other key and relevant stakeholders		+	
31	17	2.5.3.	to plan training in such a way as to familiarize the student with a wide range of existing practical experience in the chosen field of medicine		+	
32	18	2.5.4.	to guarantee a variety of places coordinate multiple training locations to gain appropriate access to different aspects of the chosen field of medicine		+	
2.6. The relationship between education, medical practice and the healthcare system						
The organization of education must:						
33	19	2.6.1.	to provide and ensure integration between theoretical training and professional development, to develop training through medical practice and professional development; to integrate training and medical practice through the provision of medical care to patients; to ensure that training complements and takes into account the needs of medical care		+	
34	20	2.6.2.	to effectively use the capabilities of the health care system to provide medical care for training purposes		+	
				Total	0	18
Standard 3. STUDENT ASSESSMENT POLICY						
3.1. Assessment methods						

The organization of education must:					
35	1	3.1.1.	develop and implement a student assessment/assessment policy; define, approve and publish the principles, objectives, methods and practices of student assessment, including, if necessary, with verification by specialists		+
36	2	3.1.2.	to ensure that assessment procedures cover knowledge, skills, attitudes and professional behavior		+
37	3	3.1.3.	to ensure the use of an additional set of assessment methods and formats in accordance with their "assessment effectiveness", including the use of several evaluators and several assessment methods		
38	4	3.1.4.	, determine the criteria for passing exams or other types of assessment, including the number of allowable retakes		+
39	5	3.1.5.	, provide for the possibility of documenting the reliability, validity and fairness of student assessment methods		
40	6	3.1.6.	, implement a system of appealing assessment results based on the principles of fairness or in accordance with appropriate legal procedures		+
41	7	3.1.7.	, introduce new assessment methods in accordance with the need to document the various types and stages		
42	8	3.1.8.	develop and implement a student assessment/assessment policy; define, approve and publish the principles, objectives, methods and practices of student assessment, including, if		

			necessary, with verification by specialists		
3.2. The relationship between assessment and learning					
The organization of education must:					
43	9	3.2.1.	to ensure the use of evaluation principles, methods and practices that are comparable to the expected learning outcomes and methods; to ensure that students achieve the expected learning outcomes; to facilitate the learning of students; to ensure the adequacy and relevance of learning; to provide timely, specific, constructive and objective feedback to trainees based on the assessment of their activities		+
44	10	3.2.2.	to strive to use principles, methods and assessment practices that encourage integrated learning, encourage the involvement of students in clinical practice, and facilitate interprofessional training		+
				Total	0
Standard 4. STUDENTS					
4.1. Selection and Admission Policy					
The organization of education must:					
45	1	4.1.1.	have a policy and implement the practice of admission, admission based on the mission of the organization and including a clearly established provision for the selection process of students		+
46	2	4.1.2.	to ensure a balance between learning opportunities and admission of students; formulate and implement policies/rules for the selection of students according to established criteria; have a policy and implement the practice of admission, admission of students with disabilities in accordance with current to ensure a high level of knowledge and skills		+

			in the field of basic biomedical sciences achieved at the previous level of basic medical education; to ensure transparency and fairness of the selection procedure		
47	3	4.1.3.	to have a policy and implement the practice of transferring students from other educational organizations, including foreign		+
48	4	4.1.4.	ones, to guarantee in the selection procedure the possibilities of potential students to improve the quality training in the chosen field of medicine; guarantee the transparency of the percentage		+
49	5	4.1.5.	have a policy and implement the practice of admission, admission based on the mission of the organization and including a clearly established provision for the selection process of students		+
4.2. Number of students					
The organization of education must:					
50	6	4.2.1.	determine the number of accepted students in accordance with: clinical/practical training opportunities, the ability of the NGO to carry out appropriate control and monitoring of the educational process, logistical and other available resources, information on the health needs of society and the society		+
51	7	4.2.2.	to provide an opportunity to periodically review the number and contingent of accepted students in consultation with relevant stakeholders responsible for planning and the development of human resources in the health sector		+
52	8	4.2.3.	to provide an opportunity to adapt the number of potential students, taking into account the available information on the number of		+

			qualified candidates and information on national and international labor markets; to regulate the number of potential students, taking into account the inherent unpredictability of the exact need for a workforce of specialists in various fields of medicine		
4.3. Advising and supporting students					
The organization of education must:					
53	9	4.3.1.	demonstrate willingness to provide students with access to the academic counseling system for students		+
54	10	4.3.2.	demonstrate willingness to provide academic counseling when monitoring and controlling student progress, including analysis of unintended incidents		+
55	11	4.3.3.	demonstrate willingness to provide a student support program aimed at social, financial and personal needs		+
56	12	4.3.4.	demonstrate willingness to allocate resources for social and personal support for students; ensure confidentiality regarding counseling and support		+
57	13	4.3.5.	demonstrate willingness professional orientation, counseling and career planning		+
58	14	4.3.6.	to demonstrate the willingness of counseling, in order to support in the event of a professional crisis; to involve organizations/associations of students in solving problematic situations of students		+
4.4. Representation of students					
The organization of education must:					
59	15	4.4.1.	have a policy and implement the practice of student representation		+

			and their appropriate participation in the development of the mission and intended learning outcomes, in the development of educational programs, planning of learning conditions for students, evaluation and management of educational		
60	16	4.4.2.	programs demonstrate a willingness to encourage student representation to participate in decision-making on educational processes, conditions and rules of learning		+
4.5 Working conditions					
The organization of education must:					
61	17	4.5.1.	to provide a training program with appropriate remuneration/scholarships or other means of financing and motivating students		+
62	18	4.5.2.	to guarantee students' access to medical care for patients, including calling a doctor, where appropriate		+
63	19	4.5.3.	, to demonstrate evidence of willingness to identify and publish working conditions and responsibility of students		+
64	20	4.5.4.	to provide for interruption of training caused by pregnancy (including maternity/paternity leave, care to		+
65	21	4.5.5.	strive to ensure that the work components in the student's work do not dominate the educational component/training		+
66	22	4.5.6.	to take into account the needs of patients, continuity of medical care and educational needs of students, when drawing up a work plan and schedule, including on-call		+
67	23	4.5.7.	work, to allow distance learning when in special circumstances,		+

			according to the individual educational		
68	24	4.5.8.	to provide a training program with appropriate remuneration/scholarships or other means of financing and motivating students		+
Total				0	24
Standard 5. ACADEMIC STAFF/TEACHERS					
5.1. Recruitment and Selection Policy					
The educational organization should develop and implement a staff selection and recruitment policy that:					
69	1	5.1.1.	takes into account the necessary criteria for employment with the condition of examination of documents; contains criteria for the scientific, pedagogical and clinical/professional merits of applicants, including the proper ratio between pedagogical, scientific and professional qualifications		+
70	2	5.1.2.	defines the duties of teachers, including the balance between teaching, scientific and other functions, taking into account the mission of the OP, the needs of the education system and the needs of the healthcare system		+
71	3	5.1.3.	ensures that teachers have practical experience in the relevant field, are recognized specialists in the relevant field, that teachers of narrow specialties, if necessary, are approved for appropriate periods of study, depending on their qualifications		+
72	4	5.1.4.	, encourages participation in programs to develop their educational potential, use the expertise of educational activities to increase the potential of the academic staff, determine the level of remuneration for participation in the software		

5.2. Personnel Activity and Development Policy						
The educational organization should develop and implement a staff activity and development policy aimed at:						
73	5	5.2.1.	a guarantee that teachers have enough time for training, consulting and independent development		+	
74	6	5.2.2.	the presence of a structure responsible for the development of the academic staff, ensuring periodic assessment of the academic staff		+	
75	7	5.2.3.	the development and implementation of a policy to support the academic staff on pedagogy and professional development for further professional development; evaluate and recognize the scientific and academic achievements of teachers		+	
76	8	5.2.4.	the ability to take into account the ratio "teacher-student" depending on the various components of the OP, taking into account the features that ensure close personal interaction and monitoring of students		+	
				Total	0	7
Standard 6. EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES						
6.1. Material and technical base						
The organization of education must:						
77	1	6.1.1.	demonstrate readiness to provide students with sufficient material and technical base to ensure adequate implementation of the OP, space and opportunities for practical and theoretical research; access to relevant professional literature; adequate information and communication technologies; modern equipment for teaching practical methods; safe learning environment		+	

78	2	6.1.2.	demonstrate readiness to improve the learning environment through regular updating, expansion and strengthening of the material-technical base and equipment to maintain the appropriate quality of education at the postgraduate level	+	
6.2. Educational environment					
The organization of education must:					
79	3	6.2.1.	demonstrate a willingness to provide the necessary resources for students to acquire adequate practical experience, including the selection and approval of the clinical base as an educational environment; access to sufficient clinical/practical tools/bases to provide training; sufficient number and diversity of patients; appropriate diverse clinical cases to achieve the goals and objectives of training, including the use of resources both inpatient, at the outpatient level, in order to provide the student with a wide range of experience in the chosen field of medicine	+	
80	4	6.2.2.	, to demonstrate readiness, when choosing a learning environment, to guarantee the number of patients and the corresponding variety of clinical cases, allowing them to gain clinical experience in all aspects of the chosen specialty, including training in organization and management in the field of health and disease prevention; training in a university clinic, as well as training in other relevant clinics/institutions	+	
6.3. Information technology					
An educational organization should:					
81	5	6.3.1.	demonstrate a willingness to provide the necessary resources for students to acquire adequate practical experience, including the selection and approval of the	+	

			clinical base as an educational environment; access to sufficient clinical/practical tools/bases to provide training; sufficient number and diversity of patients; appropriate diverse clinical cases to achieve the goals and objectives of training, including the use of resources both inpatient, at the outpatient level, in order to provide the student with a wide range of experience in the chosen field of medicine		
82	6	6.3.2.	, to demonstrate readiness, when choosing a learning environment, to guarantee the number of patients and the corresponding variety of clinical cases, allowing them to gain clinical experience in all aspects of the chosen specialty, including training in organization and management in the field of health and disease prevention; training in a university clinic, as well as training in other relevant clinics/institutions		+
83	7	6.3.3.	demonstrate a willingness to provide the necessary resources for students to acquire adequate practical experience, including the selection and approval of the clinical base as an educational environment; access to sufficient clinical/practical tools/bases to provide training; sufficient number and diversity of patients; appropriate diverse clinical cases to achieve the goals and objectives of training, including the use of resources both inpatient, at the outpatient level, in order to provide the student with a wide range of experience in the chosen field of medicine		+

6.4 Clinical Teams

The organization of education must:

84	8	6.4.1.	demonstrate a willingness to provide students with the opportunity to gain experience working in a team with colleagues and other medical professionals		+
85	9	6.4.2.	demonstrate a willingness to encourage learning in a multidisciplinary/interprofessional team, promote the development of the ability to guide and train other medical professionals		+
6.5. Medical and scientific research					
An educational organization should:					
86	10	6.5.1.	demonstrate readiness to guarantee and provide conditions for students to acquire knowledge in the field of research methodology and the ability to apply scientific foundations and research methods in the chosen field of medicine, ensure integration and balance between training and research		
87	11	6.5.2.	, demonstrate readiness to encourage students to participate in medical scientific research devoted to the study of the state and quality of public health and the health system, provide sufficient time within the framework of the educational program for students to conduct research, provide access to		+
6.6. Expertise in the field of education					
The organization of education must:					
88	12	6.6.1.	to define and implement a policy for the use of expertise in the field of education at the stage of planning, implementation and evaluation of the program		
89	13	6.6.2.	to stimulate the development of expertise in the assessment of education and research on medical education as a discipline, to promote the desire and interests of employees in		

			conducting research in medical education		
6.7. Alternative learning and exchange in the field of education					
The organization of education must:					
90	14	6.7.1.	define and implement a policy of accessibility of individual learning opportunities in other educational institutions of the appropriate level within or outside the country, transfer and offset of educational credits and learning outcomes		+
91	15	6.7.2.	demonstrate readiness to facilitate regional and international exchange of staff (academic, administrative and teaching staff) and students, providing appropriate resources; establish links with relevant national and international bodies for the purpose of exchange and mutual recognition of learning elements		+
				Total	2
Standard 7. EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM					
7.1. Monitoring and evaluation mechanisms of the program					
The organization of education must:					
92	1	7.1.1.	to have regulated procedures for monitoring, periodic evaluation of the OP, learning outcomes, progress and academic performance of students with the involvement of key stakeholders		+
93	2	7.1.2.	to demonstrate evidence of readiness to regularly monitor the OP, assess the relationship between personnel policy and needs in the field of education and the health system, evaluate the educational process, methods of evaluating students, student progress, academic staff qualifications, assessment and analyze the identified problems, ensure that the relevant		+

			evaluation results affect the quality of the OP		
94	3	7.1.3.	, demonstrate a willingness to make the evaluation process and results transparent to all stakeholders		+
7.2. Feedback from the teacher and the student					
The organization of education must:					
95	4	7.2.1.	demonstrate evidence of a willingness to systematically conduct, analyze and respond to feedback from teachers and students		+
96	5	7.2.2.	demonstrate evidence of a willingness to actively involve teachers and students in planning the evaluation of the program and using the evaluation results to improve the program		+
7.3 Results of training of qualified specialists					
The organization of education must:					
97	6	7.3.1.	to demonstrate evidence of readiness to constantly monitor qualified specialists; to provide feedback on the clinical practice of qualified specialists from employers; to establish and apply a mechanism for evaluating the program using the collected data on the results of the clinical practice of qualified specialists to		+
98	7	7.3.2.	demonstrate evidence of readiness to inform the structural units responsible for the selection of students, the development and planning of educational programs, counseling of students		+
7.4. Stakeholder engagement					
The organization of education must:					
99	8	7.4.1.	demonstrate evidence of willingness to involve key		+

			stakeholders in the monitoring and evaluation of the OP		
100	9	7.4.2.	demonstrate evidence of willingness to provide stakeholders with access to the results of the evaluation of the course and educational program; take into account the results of feedback from qualified specialists; take into account the results of feedback on the OP		+
Total				0	9
Standard 8. MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION					
8.1. Management					
The organization of education must:					
101	1	8.1.1.	demonstrate evidence of willingness to document completion of studies by issuing degrees, diplomas, certificates or other official certificates of qualification; provide evidence of formal qualifications provided as the basis for official recognition of a specialist in a chosen field of medicine at the national and international level		+
102	2	8.1.2.	demonstrate evidence of willingness to be responsible for quality assurance processes		+
103	3	8.1.3.	demonstrate evidence of willingness to ensure compliance with the needs of society at the level of to ensure the transparency of the work of management structures and their decisions		+
8.2. Academic Leadership					
The organization of education must:					
104	4	8.2.1.	demonstrate evidence of willingness to take responsibility for leadership/academic leadership and organization of postgraduate medical education.		+

105	5	8.2.2.	demonstrate evidence of willingness to periodically evaluate academic leadership regarding the achievement of the mission of the OP and expected learning outcomes		+
8.3. Budget for training and allocation of resources					
The organization of education must:					
106	6	8.3.1.	have a clear distribution of responsibility and authority to provide resources for the educational program, including the target budget for training		+
107	7	8.3.2.	, demonstrate evidence of readiness to allocate the resources necessary for the implementation of the educational program and allocate educational resources in accordance with their needs	+	
108	8	8.3.3.	, demonstrate evidence of readiness to manage the budget in such a way as to meet the functional responsibilities of the academic staff and students, the introduction of innovations into the program		+
8.4. Administrative staff and management					
The organization of education must:					
109	9	8.4.1.	have an appropriate administrative staff, including their number and composition in accordance with qualifications, to ensure the implementation of the OP and related activities; ensure proper management and allocation of resources		+
110	10	8.4.2.	to develop and implement an internal management quality assurance program, including regular reviews and submission by the academic leadership of the OP for regular review to achieve high quality		+

8.5. Requirements and Rules					
The organization of education must:					
111	11	8.5.1.	comply with national legislation regarding the number and types of recognized medical specialties for which approved programs are being developed		+
112	12	8.5.2.	, discuss and approve the postgraduate medical education program in cooperation with all interested parties		+
8.6. Informing the public					
The educational organization must:					
113 13 8.6.1. demonstrate evidence of readiness to publish complete and reliable information about the educational institution and its achievements on the official website of the educational organization and in the media	113 13 8.6.1. demonstrate evidence of readiness to publish complete and reliable information about the educational institution and its achievements on the official website of the educational organization and in the media	113 13 8.6.1. demonstrate evidence of readiness to publish complete and reliable information about the educational institution and its achievements on the official website of the educational organization and in the media	113 13 8.6.1. demonstrate evidence of readiness to publish complete and reliable information about the educational institution and its achievements on the official website of the educational organization and in the media		+
Total					
TOTAL IN TOTAL					

Annex 2. PROGRAM OF THE VISIT TO THE EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION



SOUTH KAZAKHSTAN
MEDICAL
ACADEMY

AGREED

**Rector of South Kazakhstan
Medical Academy**

Rysbekov M.M.

"29" April 2024

PROGRAM OF VISIT OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION INDEPENDENT ACCREDITATION AND RATING AGENCY (IAAR) TO THE SOUTH KAZAKHSTAN MEDICAL ACADEMY (SCMA) (INTERNATIONAL SPECIALIZED ACCREDITATION)

Date of the visit: May 9-11, 2024 (Shymkent time)

Cluster 1	1) 6B10115 Medicine (primary accreditation) 2) 6B10116 Pediatrics (primary accreditation) 3) 6B10117 Dentistry (primary accreditation) 4) 6B10118 Preventive Medicine (primary accreditation)
Cluster 2	5) 7R01134 Forensic Medicine (primary accreditation) 6) R01150 Pathologic Anatomy (primary accreditation)

Date and time	Date and time	Date and time	Date and time
May 8, 2024			
19.00-20.00 Preliminary meeting of the EEC (discussion of key issues and the program of the visit)	19.00-20.00 Preliminary meeting of the EEC (discussion of key issues and the program of the visit)	19.00-20.00 Preliminary meeting of the EEC (discussion of key issues and the program of the visit)	19.00-20.00 Preliminary meeting of the EEC (discussion of key issues and the program of the visit)

External IAAR experts To join the Zoom conference	External IAAR experts To join the Zoom conference	External IAAR experts To join the Zoom conference	External IAAR experts To join the Zoom conference
https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765			
Conference ID:	Conference ID:	Conference ID:	Conference ID:
389 293 1765	389 293 1765	389 293 1765	389 293 1765
11.00-11.15	Technical break External experts IAAR Small Hall of the SKMA	Technical break External experts IAAR Small Hall of the SKMA	Technical break External experts IAAR Small Hall of the SKMA
11.15-12.00	Meeting with Vice- rectors 1) First Vice- rector - Yesirkepov Marlen Makhmudovich, PhD, Professor	Meeting with Vice- rectors 1) First Vice- rector - Yesirkepov Marlen Makhmudovich, PhD, Professor	Meeting with Vice- rectors 1) First Vice- rector - Yesirkepov Marlen Makhmudovich, PhD, Professor
12.00-12.15	2) Vice-Rector for Financial and Economic Activities – Seitzhanova Zhanna Serikzhanovna, MBA	2) Vice-Rector for Financial and Economic Activities – Seitzhanova Zhanna Serikzhanovna, MBA	2) Vice-Rector for Financial and Economic Activities – Seitzhanova Zhanna Serikzhanovna, MBA
12.15-13.00	3) Vice-rector for educational and methodological work – Anartaeva Maria Ulasbekovna, MD, Associate professor of the Small Hall of the SKMA	3) Vice-rector for educational and methodological work – Anartaeva Maria Ulasbekovna, MD, Associate professor of the Small Hall of the SKMA	3) Vice-rector for educational and methodological work – Anartaeva Maria Ulasbekovna, MD, Associate professor of the Small Hall of the SKMA
13.00-14.00	Lunch break	Lunch break	Lunch break
14.00-14.15	External IAAR experts The	External IAAR experts The	External IAAR experts The
14.15-15.00	work of the EEC External IAAR experts The Small Hall of the SKMA	work of the EEC External IAAR experts The Small Hall of the SKMA	work of the EEC External IAAR experts The Small Hall of the SKMA
15.00-15.15			
15.15-16.00	Connect to the Zoom Conference	Connect to the Zoom Conference	Connect to the Zoom Conference

16.00-16.15	https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765	https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765	https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765
16.15-17.00	Conference ID:	Conference ID:	Conference ID:
17.00-18.30	389 293 1765	389 293 1765	389 293 1765
17.00-17.15	Meeting with Deans 1) Dean of the Faculty of Medicine – Seydakhmetova Aizat Ashimkhanovna	Meeting with Deans 1) Dean of the Faculty of Medicine – Seydakhmetova Aizat Ashimkhanovna	Meeting with Deans 1) Dean of the Faculty of Medicine – Seydakhmetova Aizat Ashimkhanovna
17.15-18.30	2) Dean of Residency - Bektenova Gulmira Yerseitovna Small Hall of the SKMA	2) Dean of Residency - Bektenova Gulmira Yerseitovna Small Hall of the SKMA	2) Dean of Residency - Bektenova Gulmira Yerseitovna Small Hall of the SKMA
18.30-18.40			
Day 2: May 10, 2024			
10.00-12.00 Visit to the OP practice bases (in parallel) Appendix No. 6 of the database of practices (route by cluster)	10.00-12.00 Visit to the OP practice bases (in parallel) Appendix No. 6 of the database of practices (route by cluster)	10.00-12.00 Visit to the OP practice bases (in parallel) Appendix No. 6 of the database of practices (route by cluster)	10.00-12.00 Visit to the OP practice bases (in parallel) Appendix No. 6 of the database of practices (route by cluster)
Along the route	Along the route	Along the route	Along the route
12.00-12.10 Technical break External experts IAAR Small Hall of the SKMA	12.00-12.10 Technical break External experts IAAR Small Hall of the SKMA	12.00-12.10 Technical break External experts IAAR Small Hall of the SKMA	12.00-12.10 Technical break External experts IAAR Small Hall of the SKMA
12.10-13.00 Meeting with students Appendix No. 4 List of full names SKMA Assembly Hall	12.10-13.00 Meeting with students Appendix No. 4 List of full names SKMA Assembly Hall	12.10-13.00 Meeting with students Appendix No. 4 List of full names SKMA Assembly Hall	12.10-13.00 Meeting with students Appendix No. 4 List of full names SKMA Assembly Hall
Connect to the Zoom Conference	Connect to the Zoom Conference	Connect to the Zoom Conference	Connect to the Zoom Conference

https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765	https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765	https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765	https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765
Conference ID:	Conference ID:	Conference ID:	Conference ID:
389 293 1765			
13.00-15.00 Survey of students (in parallel) Appendix No. 4 (list with valid e-mails) The link is sent to the student's email personally 5 minutes before the start of the survey	13.00-15.00 Survey of students (in parallel) Appendix No. 4 (list with valid e-mails) The link is sent to the student's email personally 5 minutes before the start of the survey	13.00-15.00 Survey of students (in parallel) Appendix No. 4 (list with valid e-mails) The link is sent to the student's email personally 5 minutes before the start of the survey	13.00-15.00 Survey of students (in parallel) Appendix No. 4 (list with valid e-mails) The link is sent to the student's email personally 5 minutes before the start of the survey

11.30-11.40 Technical break External experts IAAR Small Hall of the SKMA
 11.40-13.00 Work of the EEC, development and discussion of recommendations External experts IAAR Small Hall of the SKMA

(Individual work of an offline expert)

13.00-14.00 Lunch break External IAAR experts

14.00-16.15 EEC work, discussion, decision-making by voting (recording is underway) External experts of IAAR Small Hall of the SKMA

Connect to the Zoom Conference

<https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765>

Conference ID:

389 293 1765

16.15-16.30 Technical break External experts of IAAR Small Hall of SKMA

16.30-17.00 The final meeting of the EEC with the leadership of the university Heads of the university and structural divisions of the Small Hall of the SKMA

Connect to the Zoom Conference

<https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765>

Conference ID:

389 293 1765

Appendix 3. RESULTS OF THE ACADEMIC STAFF SURVEY

1. Total number of questionnaires: 33

2. Your department:

Медицина	29 чел.	87,88%
Лечебный	1 чел.	3,03%
Педиатрия	1 чел.	3,03%
Фармакология, фармакотерапия и клиническая фармакология	1 чел.	3,03%
Кафедра терапевтической и детской стоматологии	1 чел.	3,03%

3. Position

Professor	3 чел.	9,1%
Associate Professor	4 чел.	12,12%
Senior lecturer	10 чел.	30,3%
Teacher	12 чел.	36,36%
Head of the department	0 чел.	0%
Acting professor	0 чел.	0%
Teacher researcher	0 чел.	0%
Assistant	4 чел.	12,12%

4. Academic degree, academic title

Honored Worker of the Republic of Kazakhstan	0 чел.	0%
Doctor of Sciences	0 чел.	0%
Candidate of Sciences	7 чел.	21,21%
Master	17 чел.	51,52%
PhD	0 чел.	0%
Professor	0 чел.	0%
Associate Professor	0 чел.	0%
No	8 чел.	24,24%
Assistant, Clinician	1 чел.	3,03%

5. Work experience

Less than 1 year	1 чел.	3,03%
1 год – 5 year	6 чел.	18,18%
More than 5 year	26 чел.	78,79%

№	The questions are very good Good Relatively bad Bad Very bad Not answered	The questions are very good Good Relatively bad Bad Very bad Not answered	The questions are very good Good Relatively bad Bad Very bad Not answered	The questions are very good Good Relatively bad Bad Very bad Not answered	The questions are very good Good Relatively bad Bad Very bad Not answered	The questions are very good Good Relatively bad Bad Very bad Not answered	The questions are very good Good Relatively bad Bad Very bad Not answered
6	To what extent does the content of the educational program meet your scientific and professional interests and needs?	23 чел. (69,7%)	10 чел. (30,3%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)	-
7	How do you assess the opportunities provided by the University for the	24 чел. (72,73%)	9 чел. (27,27%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)	-

	professional development of teaching staff						
8	How do you assess the opportunities provided by the University for the career growth of teaching staff	17 чел. (51,52%)	16 чел. (48,48%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)	-
9	How do you assess the degree of academic freedom of the faculty	18 чел. (54,55%)	15 чел. (45,45 %)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)	-
	To what extent can teachers use their own						
10	• Strategies	23 чел. (69,7%)	9 чел. (27,27%)	1 чел. (3,03 %)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)	-
11	• Methods	23чел. (69,7%)	10чел. (30,3%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)	-
12	• Innovations in the learning process	22 чел. (66,67%)	11 чел. (33,33%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)	-
13	How do you assess the work on the organization of medical care and disease prevention at the university?	20 чел. (60.6%)	13 чел. (39,4%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)	-
14	How is the management of the educational institution paying attention to the content of the educational program?	24 чел. (72,73%)	9 чел. (27,27%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)	-
15	How do you assess the sufficiency and accessibility of the necessary scientific and educational literature in the library?	27 чел. (81,82%)	5 чел. (15,15%)	1 чел. (3,03%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)	-
16	Do you assess the level of conditions created that take into account the needs of different groups of students?	20 чел. (60,6%)	12 чел. (36,36%)	1 чел. (3,03%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)	-
	Evaluate the accessibility of the manual						
17	• Students	20 чел. (60,6%)	13 чел. (39,39%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)	-
18	• Teachers	17 чел. (51,52%)	16 чел. (48,48%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)	-

19	Evaluate the involvement of the PPP in the process of making managerial and strategic decisions	19 чел. (57,58%)	12 чел. (36,36%)	2 чел. (6,06%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)	-
20	How innovation is encouraged	15 чел. (45,45%)	16 чел. (48,48%)	2 чел. (6,06%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)	-
21	To what extent does the content of the educational program meet your scientific and professional interests and needs?	14 чел. (42,42%)	19 чел. (57,58%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)	-
22	How do you assess the opportunities provided by the University for the professional development of teaching staff	18 чел. (54,55%)	15 чел. (45,45%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)	-
23	How do you assess the opportunities provided by the University for the career growth of teaching staff	14 чел. (42,42%)	19 чел. (57,58%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)	-
24	How do you assess the degree of academic freedom of the faculty	14 чел. (42,42%)	18 чел. (54,55%)	1 чел. (3,03%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)	-
	To what extent can teachers use their own						
25	• Strategies	23 чел. (69,7%)	10 чел. (30,3%)	1 чел. (3,03%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)	-
26	• Methods	24 чел. (72,73%)	8 чел. (24,24%)	1 чел. (3,03%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)	-
	• Innovations in the learning process						
27	How do you assess the work on the organization of medical care and disease prevention at the university?	24 чел. (72,73%)	9 чел. (27,27%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)	-
28	How is the management of the educational institution paying attention to the content of the educational program?	25 чел. (75,76%)	8 чел. (24,24%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)	-

	How do you assess the sufficiency and accessibility of the necessary scientific and educational literature in the library?						
29	Do you assess the level of conditions created that take into account the needs of different groups of students?	12 чел. (36,36%)	20 чел. (60,6%)	1 чел. (3,03%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)	-
30	Evaluate the accessibility of the manual	16 чел. (48,48%)	16 чел. (48,48%)	1 чел. (3,03%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)	-
31	• Students	16 чел. (48,48%)	17 чел. (51,52%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)	-
32	• Teachers	8 чел. (24,24%)	23 чел. (69,7%)	2 чел. (6,06%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)	-
33	Evaluate the involvement of the PPP in the process of making managerial and strategic decisions	8 чел. (24,24%)	22 чел. (66,7%)	3 чел. (9,09%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)	-
34	How innovation is encouraged	15 чел. (45,45%)	18 чел. (54,55%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)	-
35	Evaluate how the educational program meets the expectations of the labor market and employers in terms of content and quality of implementation	15 чел. (45,45%)	18 чел. (54,55%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)	-

- 36. is it possible to work in this Vuse?
- I live in this city.
- How to train a local youth
- The Medical University
- From location
- He started with the assistant, the professor. There is a shortage, support and career growth.
- He signed the resident, and loved his PPS.
- This from the Semipalatinsk test site will not be able to get out in zarubezh
- In the Prestige Academy, the opportunity to train, a friendly salary, a career
- In addition, the opportunities and requirements for employees of this university are favorable for me
- After becoming a graduate of this educational institution, I decided to continue my work. All conditions have been created for work and career planning.
- the state of affairs of this educational institution for the teacher is satisfied with the
- For the purchase of housing in Shymkent
- - I like working with students
- Because I live here. And I love my subject.
- I live here."
- It was necessary to change the formed presentation, which in our higher quality knowledge is low. Welling up *urбілім алушылармен жұмыс істеу ұнайды*
- *Мамандығым сәйкес келуіне байланысты, басқа жұмыс орнына қабылдана алмадым*
- *Себебі, жұмыс ұнайды*
- *На данный момент мне в нем комфортно*

37. How often are master classes and reading of topics with the participation of practitioners conducted as part of your course?

Very often (very chasto)	12 чел.	36,36%
--------------------------	---------	--------

Often (chasto)	18 чел.	54,55%
Sometimes (inogda)	3 чел.	9,09%
Very rare (very Redco)	0 чел.	0%
Absolutely not (nikogda)	0 чел.	0%

38. How often do invited teachers (domestic and foreign) participate in the learning process?

Very often (very chasto)	8 чел.	24,24%
Often (chasto)	19 чел.	57,58%
Sometimes (inogda)	6 чел.	18,18%
Very rare (very Redco)	0 чел.	0%
Absolutely not (nikogda)	0 чел.	0%

39. How often do you encounter the following problems in your work: (please give an answer in each line)

	Часто	Иногда	Никогда	Нет ответа
Lack of classrooms	0 чел. (0%)	14 чел. (42,42%)	19 чел. (57,58%)	-
Unbalanced academic load by semester	0 чел. (0%)	8 чел. (24,24%)	25 чел. (75,76%)	-
Unavailability of necessary literature in the library	1 чел. (3,03%)	5 чел. (15,15%)	27 чел. (81,82%)	-
Overcrowding of study groups (too many students in a group)	9 чел. (27,27%)	24 чел. (72,73%)	0 чел. (0%)	-
Inconvenient schedule	2 чел. (6,06%)	11 чел. (33,33%)	20 чел. (60,61%)	-
Inappropriate classroom conditions	2 чел. (6,06%)	6 чел. (18,18%)	25 чел. (75,76%)	-
Lack of Internet access/weak Internet	0 чел. (0%)	8 чел. (24,24%)	25 чел. (75,76%)	-
Students' lack of interest in learning	1 чел. (3,03%)	11 чел. (33,33%)	21 чел. (63,64%)	-
Late receipt of information about events	0 чел. (0%)	7 чел. (21,21%)	26 чел. (78,79%)	-

Lack of technical facilities in classrooms	0 чел. (0%)	11 чел. (33,33%)	22 чел. (66,67%)	-
Other problems	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓✓<i>Net</i> ✓✓<i>No</i> ✓✓<i>net</i> ✓✓<i>No</i> ✓✓<i>No problem</i> ✓✓<i>Test net</i> ✓✓<i>Other projects</i> ✓✓<i>I am fully satisfied with my work</i> ✓✓- ✓✓<i>no other problems</i> ✓✓<i>I believe that everything is in order</i> ✓✓<i>Netu</i> ✓✓<i>Non-payment of paid work</i> ✓✓<i>no problems</i> ✓✓<i>Low labor</i> ✓✓<i>no problem</i> ✓✓<i>no serious problem</i> ✓✓<i>Loyalty of foreign students to practical work with patients</i> 			

40. There are many different sides and aspects in the life of the university that affect every teacher and employee in one way or another. Rate how satisfied you are:

The question is fully satisfied Partially satisfied Not satisfied I find it difficult to answer	The question is fully satisfied Partially satisfied Not satisfied I find it difficult to answer	The question is fully satisfied Partially satisfied Not satisfied I find it difficult to answer	The question is fully satisfied Partially satisfied Not satisfied I find it difficult to answer	The question is fully satisfied Partially satisfied Not satisfied I find it difficult to answer
The attitude of the university management towards you	26 чел. (78,79%)	7 чел. (21,21%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)
Relations with direct management	24 чел. (72,73%)	9 чел. (27,27%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)
Relations with colleagues at the department	27 чел. (81,82%)	6 чел. (18,18%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)
Participation in management decision-making	22 чел. (66,67%)	9 чел. (27,27%)	0 чел. (0%)	2 чел. (6,06%)
Relations with students	30 чел. (90,9%)	3 чел. (9,1%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)

Recognition of your successes and achievements by the administration	25 чел. (75,76%)	8 чел. (24,24%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)
Support for your suggestions and comments	25 чел. (75,76%)	8 чел. (24,24%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)
The activities of the university administration	23 чел. (69,7%)	10 чел. (30,3%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)
Terms of payment	22 чел. (66,7%)	7 чел. (21,21%)	3 чел. (9,09%)	1 чел. (3,03%)
Working conditions, list and quality of services provided at the university	26 чел. (78,8%)	7 чел. (21,2%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)
Occupational safety and health	27 чел. (81,82%)	6 чел. (18,18%)	0 чел. (0%)	0 чел. (0%)
Managing changes in the university's activities	24 чел. (72,73%)	7 чел. (21,21%)	0 чел. (0%)	2 чел. (6,06%)
By providing a social package: rest, sanatorium treatment, etc.	16 чел. (48,48%)	8 чел. (24,24%)	4 чел. (12,12%)	5 чел. (15,15%)
Organization and quality of nutrition at the university	18 чел. (54,55%)	9 чел. (27,27%)	2 чел. (6,06%)	4 чел. (12,12%)
Organization and quality of medical care	25 чел. (75,76%)	7 чел. (21,21%)	0 чел. (0%)	1 чел. (3,03%)