



«АККРЕДИТТЕУ ЖӘНЕ РЕЙТИНГТІҢ  
ТӘУЕЛСІЗ АГЕНТТІГІ» КЕМ

НУ «НЕЗАВИСИМОЕ АГЕНТСТВО  
АККРЕДИТАЦИИ И РЕЙТИНГА»

INDEPENDENT AGENCY FOR  
ACCREDITATION AND RATING

# REPORT

on the results of the work of the external expert commission on the assessment of compliance with the requirements of the standards of specialized accreditation of the educational program

7M10144 Medicine

SOUTH KAZAKHSTAN MEDICAL ACADEMY

in the period from 19 to 21 april, 2023

**INDEPENDENT AGENCY FOR ACCREDITATION AND RATING**  
**External Expert Commission**

*Addressed  
to the IAAR  
Accreditation Council*



**REPORT**

**on the results of the work of the external expert commission on the assessment of  
compliance with the requirements of the standards of specialized accreditation of the  
educational program**

*7M10144 Medicine*

**SOUTH KAZAKHSTAN MEDICAL ACADEMY**

**in the period from 19 to 21 april, 2023**

**Shymkent, 2023**

## Content

(I) LIST OF NOTATIONS AND ABBREVIATIONS .....	3
(II) INTRODUCTION .....	4
(III) REPRESENTATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL ORGANISATION .....	5
(IV) DESCRIPTION OF PREVIOUS ACCREDITATION PROCEDURE .....	7
(V) DESCRIPTION OF THE EEC VISIT .....	10
(VI) COMPLIANCE WITH SPECIALIZED ACCREDITATION STANDARDS .....	11
<b>6.1. Standard «Mission and learning outcomes» .....</b>	<b>11</b>
<b>6.2. Standard «Research environment and educational resources» .....</b>	<b>13</b>
<b>6.3. Standard «Policy and criteria for admission» .....</b>	<b>15</b>
<b>6.4. Standard «Master's Degree Program» .....</b>	<b>16</b>
<b>6.5. Standard «Scientific guidance» .....</b>	<b>18</b>
<b>6.6. Standard «Dissertation» .....</b>	<b>19</b>
<b>6.7. Standard «Evaluation of dissertations» .....</b>	<b>21</b>
<b>6.8. Standard «Management and Administration» .....</b>	<b>22</b>
<b>6.9. Standard «Continuous Improvement» .....</b>	<b>23</b>
(VII) OVERVIEW OF STRENGTHS/BEST PRACTICES FOR EACH STANDARD .....	25
(VIII) OVERVIEW OF QUALITY IMPROVEMENT RECOMMENDATIONS .....	26
(XI) REVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE ORGANIZATION OF EDUCATION .....	27
(X) RECOMMENDATION TO THE ACCREDITATION COUNCIL .....	27
Appendix 1: Evaluation table «PARAMETERS OF SPECIALIZED PROFILE» .....	28
Appendix 2. PROGRAM OF THE VISIT TO THE ORGANIZATION OF EDUCATION .....	38
Appendix 3. RESULTS OF THE TEACHER'S QUESTIONNAIRE .....	45
Appendix 4. RESULTS OF STUDENT QUESTIONNAIRE .....	56

**(I) LIST OF NOTATIONS AND ABBREVIATIONS**

**JSC «SKMA»** - JSC «South Kazakhstan Medical Academy»  
**BD** - basic disciplines;  
**LIC** - library and information center  
**HEI** - higher education institution  
**SMSPE** - State mandatory standard of postgraduate education  
**DSHR** - Department of Science and Human Resources  
**FAC** - final attestation commission  
**IC** - individual curriculum  
**SC** - selection component  
**CMIS** - comprehensive medical information system  
**CT** - comprehensive testing  
**CTPC** - computer - test publishing center  
**MH RK** - Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan  
**MSHE** - Ministry of Science and Higher Education  
**MES RK** - Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan  
**STP** - Scientific and Technical Project  
**EP** - educational program  
**RO** - registrar's office  
**PD** - profile disciplines  
**PC** - professional competencies  
**TS** - teaching staff  
**LO** - learning outcomes  
**WC** - working curriculum  
**MM** - mass media  
**QMS** - quality management system  
**EMCD** - educational and methodical complex of the discipline  
**EMC** - Educational and Methodological Center  
**DSCWDMS** – department of Scientific and Clinical work, doctoral and master's studies

## **(II)INTRODUCTION**

In accordance with the order №34-23-OD from 20.02.2023 of the Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating from 19 to 21 April 2023, the external expert commission conducted an assessment of compliance of the educational programme 7M10144 «Medicine» of the South Kazakhstan Medical Academy with the standards of specialised accreditation of the IAAR (№68-18/1-OD from 25 May 2018, edition two).

The report of the External Expert Commission (EEC) contains the assessment of the submitted educational programmes against the IAAR criteria, recommendations of the EEC on further improvement of educational programmes and parameters of the profile of educational programmes.

### **The composition of the EEC:**

- 1) **Chairperson of the EEC** – Tagadyuk Olga Konstantinovna, Doctor of Medical Sciences, State University of Medicine and Pharmacy named after Nicolae Testemitanu (Republic of Moldova) *Off-line participation*
- 2) **IAAR Expert** – Kiseleva Elena Aleksandrovna, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department of General Practice Dentistry of the Kemerovo State University Medical Institute of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation, (Russian Federation) *On-line participation*
- 3) **IAAR Expert** – Lapova Natalia Valeryevna, Candidate of Philological Sciences, Associate Professor, Dean of the Faculty of Pharmacy, Vitebsk State Medical University (Republic of Belarus) *On-line participation*
- 4) **IAAR Expert** – Karibayeva Dina Orynbassarovna, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, Al-Farabi Kazakh National University (Republic of Kazakhstan) *Off-line participation*
- 5) **IAAR Expert** – Kurmanalina Gulnar Lukmanovna, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, Non-profit Joint Stock Company «West Kazakhstan Medical University named after Marat Ospanov» (Republic of Kazakhstan) *On-line participation*
- 6) **IAAR Expert** – Nurgaliyeva Zhanar Zhenisovna, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, Kazakh National Medical University named after S.D. Asfendiyarov (Republic of Kazakhstan) *Off-line participation*
- 7) **IAAR Expert** – Burkitbayeva Saule Salimovna, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, Non-profit Joint Stock Company «Astana Medical University» (Republic of Kazakhstan) *Off-line participation*
- 8) **IAAR Expert, employer** - Koyslyman Yernar Yerkinbekuly, Deputy Chief Physician of «Neurorehabilitation Centre «Luch» LLP (Republic of Kazakhstan) *On-line participation*
- 9) **IAAR Expert, employer** – Fedorov Sergey Mikhailovich, Head of the Medical Department of the PD of the North Kazakhstan region (Republic of Kazakhstan) *On-line participation*
- 10) **IAAR Expert, student** – Kuat Sultan, 5th-year student of the EP «General Medicine» of Astana Medical University, Member of the Alliance of Students of Kazakhstan (Republic of Kazakhstan) *On-line participation*
- 11) **IAAR Expert, student** – Gabdrakhmanova Nailya Khakimovna, Student of EP «Pediatrics», Semey Medical University, Member of the Alliance of Students of Kazakhstan (Republic of Kazakhstan) *On-line participation*
- 12) **IAAR Expert, student** – Gadzhievna Jasmine Aladinovna, Student of the EP «Dentistry» of Astana Medical University, Member of the Alliance of Students of Kazakhstan (Republic of Kazakhstan) *On-line participation*

13) **IAAR Expert, student** – Kakytayeva Assel Yerdosovna, Resident doctor of the EP «Clinical Pharmacology», Semey Medical University, Member of the Alliance of Students of Kazakhstan (Republic of Kazakhstan) *On-line participation*

14) **IAAR Coordinator** – Saydulayeva Malika Akhyadovna, Project Manager of the Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating (Republic of Kazakhstan) *Off-line participation*

### **(III) REPRESENTATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL ORGANISATION**

SKMA is the leading medical higher educational institution of the country, which has been providing educational services in the market of Kazakhstan for more than 40 years, trains specialists in medical, pharmaceutical and pharmaceutical engineering at the level of secondary technical vocational education (medical college), higher (bachelor's degree, internship), postgraduate education (master's degree, doctoral degree, residency); at the level of continuous professional development of healthcare personnel (advanced training and retraining of medical and pharmaceutical personnel).

SKMA has a licence of the Committee for Control in the Sphere of Education and Science of MES RK №KZ36LAA00011387, from 28 March 2018, without limitation of term, for the right to carry out educational activities on programmes of technical and professional, higher and postgraduate education, according to which the Academy has the right to issue documents on education of state sample; has a [certificate of institutional accreditation](#), issued by IAQAE from 24.12.2018, registration №IA-A №0095, the validity of the certificate - 22 December 2023.

The main objective of JSC «SKMA» is to create necessary conditions for higher and postgraduate professional education, development and professional formation of personality on the basis of national and universal values, formation of competitive medical and scientific pedagogical staff of higher qualification for improvement of public health, medical education and science.

The Academy provides education in Kazakh, Russian and English languages at 35 departments at pre-diploma and postgraduate levels of education, on the following educational programmes:

Pre-diploma education: «General Medicine», «Pediatrics», «Dentistry», «Nursing», «Public Health», «Pharmacy» and «Technology of Pharmaceutical Production». Postgraduate professional education in 5 master's degree programmes: «Medicine», «Public Health», «Nursing», «Pharmacy», «Medical and Preventive work», 3 doctoral degree programmes: «Pharmacy», «Medicine», «Public Health», 29 residency programmes.

The quality of education and research at SKMA is ensured by a high level of infrastructure: 4 educational buildings with classrooms equipped with interactive equipment; scientific library with reading room and electronic library room; research laboratories «Medicinal Plants Laboratory» and «South Clinical & Genetic Laboratory»; Practical Skills Centre, 2 hostels; 42 clinical bases.

SKMA carries out active international cooperation in the field of medical education, science and practice with medical universities and scientific centres of near and far abroad countries. Partners of JSC SKMA are such universities as: NowySaczGraduate School of Business - National Louis University, Poland (Polish partner university), «Institute of Biomedical Research of the University of Barcelona», Spain; Institute of Neurology, University College of London, Great Britain; University of Medicine and Pharmacy, Romania; Institute of Neurology, University College of London, «St. Petersburg State Paediatric Medical University», Russia, «Tashkent Paediatric Medical Institute», Uzbekistan; and others.

In 2020 South Kazakhstan Medical Academy within the Erasmus+ programme won a grant for the project «[AccelED - Improvement of Nursing at Master's and PHD Doctoral level in the higher education system of Kazakhstan](#)», where the grant applicant is Lithuanian University of Health Sciences (Lithuania) (implementation years: 2020-2023).



Every year more than 100 students take part in international scientific conferences and research. Thus, on the initiative of the SKMA, since 2013, the South Kazakhstan Medical UCMA, together with the Nazarbayev Foundation, annually holds an international scientific conference of young scientists and students «Prospects for the development of biology, medicine and pharmacy».

So, on December 8-9, 2022, in JSC «South Kazakhstan Medical Academy» together with the Science Council under the Nursultan Nazarbayev Foundation and the Tajik State Medical University named after Abuali Ibni Sino held the IX International Scientific Conference of young scientists and students «[Prospects for the development of biology, medicine and pharmacy](#)».

SKMA actively participates in international meetings, conferences on the development and implementation of international education standards, global internationalization of research for the successful solution of health problems. The teaching staff of the SKMA carries out 37 scientific and technical projects that have passed state registration. SKMA scientists are co-executors and carry out grant scientific and technical programs.

The passage of high-quality and professional practice of students is carried out at various bases in the Republic of Kazakhstan and abroad.

Youth self-government functions on the basis of the SKMA: student government, student rector, vice-rectors and deans, and the youth center «[Bolashak](#)».

The effectiveness of the activities of the SKMA is confirmed by the reports of the commission for the evaluation of the activities of the SKMA, the successful passage of specialized accreditation.

The following [accreditations](#) have been completed in the IAAR: 7 bachelor's degree educational programs; 28 residency educational programs; 5 college educational programs; 3 doctoral educational programs, 9 master's degree educational programs.

According to the results of the rating of indicators of scientific and innovative activity in 2017, SKMA occupies the 2nd overall place among medical universities of the Republic of Kazakhstan, and in 2018 the 3rd place.

In 2019, SKMA was marked by high national ranking and took the 4th place in the General Institutional Ranking of medical universities of the Republic of Kazakhstan, in the ranking of educational programmes «Master's degree» 1st place in the educational programmes «Pharmacy» and «Medicine», and 2nd place in the ranking of educational programmes «Bachelor's degree» in the educational programme «Public Health», «Pharmacy» and «Nursing» (IAAR).

According to the results of the National ranking of the demand for universities of the Republic of Kazakhstan annually conducted by the IAAR, in 2020 and 2021, the SKMA in the General Ranking of universities of the Republic of Kazakhstan «Top-20» on the 17th place.

Graduates of SKMA successfully work in all regions of Kazakhstan, as well as countries of the near and far abroad. The percentage of graduates' employment remains at a high level from year to year (94.7%), which indicates the recognition, demand and competitiveness of our specialists in the labor market.

Graduates of SKMA in different years lead the medical service of the country: Vice-Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan - Burkitbayev J.K.; Head of "Heart Centre" JSC in Shymkent - Suigenbayev D.J.; General Director GalamatIntegra, MD, DBA - S. Sypabekov; Coordinator of UNICEF programmes on health and nutrition - K. Sukhanberdiev; Director of Johnson & Johnson in Kazakhstan branch - A. Nazarbayev and others. Also, graduates of «SKMA» JSC occupy leading positions in educational organisations, are heads of city and regional health departments, occupy leading positions in medical and preventive organisations of Shymkent city, Turkestan region and other regions of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Pashimov M.O. - Head of Health Department of Turkestan region, Kapanova K.A. - Deputy Head Doctor for Quality Control of Regional Tuberculosis Dispensary, Serikbayeva S.J. - Head Doctor of LLP Medical Centre «Hirudotherapy», President of the Alliance of Hirudotherapists of Kazakhstan, Doctor-neurologist, Member of Public organisation «Association of Independent Medical Experts of Astana». Narkabulov A.A. - Head physician of the Public Health Department of Turkestan region.

Department of Biology and Biochemistry (Head of the Department, Candidate of Medical

Sciences, Professor Yessirkepov Marlen Makhmudovich),

Department «General Practitioner-2» (head of the department, Doctor of Medical Sciences, professor Dossybayeva Gulzhan Nurbekovna).

Department of «Pharmacology, Pharmacotherapy and Clinical Pharmacology» (Head of the Department, Candidate of Pharmaceutical Sciences, Acting Professor Toksanbayeva Zhanat Sadibekovna)

Department of «Neurology, Psychiatry, Rehabilitation and Neurosurgery» (Head of the Department, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Professor Nazira Assanovna Zharkinbekova)

Department of «Microbiology, Virology and Immunology» (Head of the Department, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor Seitkhanova Bibigul Tolegenkyzy)

Department of «Hygiene and Epidemiology» (Head of the Department, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Acting Professor Utepov Parkhat Dusembaevich)

The contingent of students enrolled in OP 7M10144 «Medicine» is represented by 8 undergraduates, of which 4 undergraduates complete their studies in 2023. Topics of Master's theses:

- 1) «Correction of iron deficiency anemia in pregnant women with a balanced diet»
- 2) «Features of resistance of Streptococcus pneumonia, Staphylococcus aureus pathogens to antibiotics in adults and children on the example of the city of Shymkent»
- 3) «Pharmacoepidemiological studies of the use of drugs in patients with COVID 19 in outpatient settings»
- 4) «Clinical and neuropsychological studies of dementia in Shymkent»
- 5) «Research of dental medicines from medicinal plants in the prevention of caries in preschool children»
- 6) «Pharmacoeconomical aspects of targeted breast cancer therapy»
- 7) «Clinical effectiveness of assisted reproductive technologies in the treatment of various forms of female infertility in the Turkestan region and the city of Shymkent»
- 8) «Determination of the microbiological landscape of biomaterials of patients diagnosed with COVID 19»

The leaders of undergraduates are 100% settled, out of 6 leaders - 2 doctors of sciences, 4 candidates of sciences, all have the title of professor or associate professor. The heads of undergraduates are distinguished by a high level of research activity as heads of scientific research institutes, publication activity in international peer-reviewed journals, and a high level of Hirsch.

The analysis of the employment of graduates of the master's degree EP 7M10144 «Medicine» for three years indicates 100% employment: in 2020 -9, in 2021-5, in 2022-4 graduates.

The teaching staff of JSC «SKMA» implements 33 research projects that are funded by various sources: program-targeted financing of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan - 1 project, Saule–Oil company - 8 projects, a grant from the Ministry of Internal Affairs of the Republic of Kazakhstan-1, KazNMU named after S.D.Asfendiyarov-1, the Rostropovich-Vishnevskaya Charitable Foundation-1, JSC «SKMA» -21.

#### **(IV) DESCRIPTION OF PREVIOUS ACCREDITATION PROCEDURE**

In accordance with the order of the Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating (IAAR) № 32-20-OD dated April 21, 2020, an external expert commission conducted an assessment of the compliance of the Master's degree program in EP 7M10144 «Medicine» with the standards of specialized accreditation of the IAAR at SKMA.

#### **Composition of the previous EEC:**

- 1) *Chairperson of the EEC* - Omarkulov Bauyrzhan Kadenovich, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, NCJSC «Medical University of Karaganda» (Karaganda);



- 2) **Foreign expert** – Kanushina Marina Alekseevna, Director of the «AS Institute of International Education», PhD, MBA. (Prague, Czech Republic);
- 3) **Expert** – Ivanchenko Nellya Nikolaevna, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Kazakh National Medical University named after S.D.Asfendiyarov (Almaty);
- 4) **Expert** – Aimbetova Gulshara Ergazievna, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, Kazakh National Medical University named after S.D. Asfendiyarov (Almaty);
- 5) **Expert** – Shukirbekova Alma Boranbekovna, Doctor of Philology, Associate Professor, JSC «Astana Medical University» (Nur-Sultan);
- 6) **Expert** – Dmitry N. Matyushko, PhD, NCJSC «Medical University of Karaganda» (Karaganda);
- 7) **Expert** – Stepkina Elena Leonidovna, Candidate of Pharmaceutical Sciences, Kazakhstan Medical University «HSE» (Almaty);
- 8) **Employer** – Nuradil Mahanbetkhanovich Rysmakhanov, Multidisciplinary medical Clinic «JAK-med» (Shymkent);
- 9) **Student** – Sattarkhan Anel Aidarkyzy, member of the Alliance of Students of Kazakhstan, International University SILKWAY University (Shymkent);
- 10) The observer from the Agency - Aimurzieva Aigerim Urinbaevna, Head of the Agency's medical projects (Nur-Sultan).

***In 2020, the EEC for specialized accreditation of the educational program «7M10144 Medicine» recommended:***

***Standard 1 «Mission and final results»***

- 1) ***Review the mission of the Master's degree program in the specialty «Medicine», taking into account the problems of global health and social responsibility.***
- 2) ***Provide access to information about the mission of the Master's degree program in the specialty «Medicine», the goals of the medical organization of education for the public (availability of information in the media, on the website of the university).***
- 3) ***Conduct a detailed SWOT analysis to improve the quality of the implementation of master's degree programs, assessment of weaknesses and strengths, on the basis of which the Rector's office, together with the advisory council, should determine policy and develop a strategic development plan.***

***Standard 2 «Research environment and educational resources»***

- 1) ***Develop a plan for the development of joint master's degree programs with foreign partner universities and ensure its implementation.***
- 2) ***To work out with partner universities the possibility of awarding degrees from both universities and joint leadership to support cooperation between higher education institutions.***
- 3) ***To provide a safe environment for employees, undergraduates and those who ensure the implementation of the program, including providing the necessary information and protection from harmful substances, microorganisms, compliance with safety regulations in the laboratory and when using equipment.***
- 4) ***Constantly update the section on Master's degree programs on its website, containing information on the criteria of the accreditation standard.***

***Standard 4 «Master's Degree Program»***

**1) Determine the purpose and objectives of the master's degree program, which are aimed at achieving the mission of the organization of education, the mission of the educational program and the final learning outcomes.**

**2) Develop a plan for the development of joint master's degree programs with foreign partner universities and ensure its implementation.**

**Standard 8 «Management and Administration»**

**1) Constantly update the section on Master's degree programs on its website, containing information on the criteria of the accreditation standard.**

**2) Post reports on the financial activities of the university on the website for access by a wide range of the public, since the financing system should be based on the principles of efficiency, effectiveness, priority, transparency and responsibility.**

**Standard 9 «Continuous improvement»**

**Expansion of the material and technical base by creating its own university clinic.**

On June 9, 2020, by the decision of the IAAR Accreditation Council, the educational program «7M10144 Medicine» implemented by the SKMA was accredited for 3 years.

Post-monitoring control on the assessment of the implementation of the recommendations of the EEC IAAR, formed by the results of the specialized accreditation of the educational program «7M10144 Medicine» by the expert group of the IAAR was conducted in the SKMA on June 28, 2022.

Post-accreditation monitoring of the activities of the SKMA showed that, in general, the recommendations of these EEC are being implemented. The measures and actions taken contributed to improving the quality of the educational process and the implementation of educational programs of the university, positive trends in attracting students to scientific research, creating conditions for expanding the geography of partner universities, developing conditions that contribute to the formation of students' personality.

At the same time, the members of the EEC, who conducted the reaccreditation from April 19 to April 21, 2023, found that the following work was carried out according to the recommendations of the previous EEC:

1. According to the recommendations of the standard «Mission and final results»:

- The recommendations presented by the previous EEC 3 on this standard have been fully implemented

2. According to the recommendations of the standard «Research environment and educational resources»:

- The previous EEC presented 4 recommendations on this standard, of which 2 recommendations were fully implemented. The recommendation «To develop a plan for the development of joint master's degree programs with foreign partner universities and ensure its implementation» has not been implemented. The recommendation «To work out with partner universities the possibility of awarding degrees from both universities and joint leadership to support cooperation between higher education institutions» has not been fully implemented (10%). To date, work is underway to conclude an agreement on scientific and practical cooperation between JSC «SKMA» and the Federal State Budgetary Institution «National Medical Research Center for Therapy and Preventive Medicine» of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation on the educational program «Medicine».

3. According to the recommendations of the Master's Degree Program standard:

- The recommendations presented by the previous EEC 2 on this standard have been fully implemented

4. According to the recommendations of the standard «Management and Administration»:  
 - The recommendations presented by the previous EEC 2 on this standard have been fully implemented

5. According to the recommendations of the «Continuous improvement» standard: - The recommendation on this standard presented by the previous EEC 1 was not fully implemented (10%), although the recommendation «Expanding the material and technical base by creating its own university clinic» was related more to residents than to undergraduates of scientific and pedagogical orientation. Rector of JSC «SKMA» Rysbekov M.M. During the interview, he noted the beginning of construction of a university clinic with 800 beds from 4 buildings (therapeutic, surgical, pediatric, perinatal) and a consulting and diagnostic center for 700 visits per shift based on an agreement with China Machinery Engineering Corporation. This clinic is supposed to have a forensic medical examination center and scientific laboratories.

The analysis carried out by the experts showed that, in general, according to the recommendations given by the EEC in relation to the accredited educational program of the Master's degree 7M10144 «Medicine», there is a good positive trend. The measures and actions taken by the university contribute to improving the quality of the educational process and the implementation of the educational program, positive trends in the development of academic mobility of undergraduates, the expansion of creative relationships, support for young teachers and the development of the research component of the EP.

At the same time, the commission considers that the recommendations on the accredited EP in the field of international cooperation, the organization of joint master's degree programs with partner universities, the development of master's degree programs, cooperation with partner universities with the possibility of awarding degrees from both universities and joint management of undergraduates have been partially implemented and require further study and implementation.

## **(V) DESCRIPTION OF THE EEC VISIT**

The work of the EEC was carried out on the basis of the approved Program of the visit of the expert commission on specialized accreditation of educational programs to the SKMA in the period from April 19 to April 21, 2023.

In order to coordinate the work of the EEC, an introductory meeting was held on 18.04.2023, during which powers were distributed among the members of the commission, the schedule of the visit was clarified, and an agreement was reached on the choice of examination methods.

To obtain objective information about the quality of educational programs and the entire infrastructure of the university, to clarify the content of self-assessment reports, meetings were held with the rector, vice-rectors of the university in areas of activity, heads of structural divisions, deans of faculties, heads of departments, teachers, students, graduates, employers. A total of 115 representatives took part in the meetings (Table 1).

Table 1 - Information about employees and students who took part in meetings with the EEC IAAR:

<b>Category of participants</b>	<b>Quantity</b>
Rector	1
Vice-Rectors and the Head of the Rector's Office	3
Heads of structural divisions	19
Deans of faculties	6
Heads of departments	38
Teachers	5

Students	3
Graduates	14
Employers	26
<b>Total</b>	<b>115</b>

During the tour, the members of the EEC got acquainted with the Laboratory of Medicinal plants, a Computer-test publishing center, an anatomical Museum, a Scientific and clinical laboratory, a Library and Information Center, a dental clinic, a Practical Skills Center, and clinical databases.

At the meeting of the EEC IAAR with the target groups of the SKMA, the mechanisms for implementing the university's policy were clarified and the specification of individual data presented in the university self-assessment report was carried out.

Classes were attended during the accreditation period. Assistant Kulbaeva L.A. conducted a class in a group of interns (8 interns) of the specialty «General medical practice» in the discipline «Outpatient therapy» on the topic «Arterial hypertension». Interns demonstrated theoretical knowledge on this topic and demonstrated practical skills by presenting a clinical situation with the roles of a doctor, nurse, patient, expert. A multimedia installation was used during the lesson.

During the work, the members of the EEC visited the following practice bases: the state municipal enterprise on the right of economic management «City Maternity Hospital» of Shymkent, the state municipal enterprise on the right of economic management «City Hospital №2» of Shymkent, the state municipal enterprise on the right of economic management «City Polyclinic № 6» of Shymkent. The practice bases are equipped with modern equipment, hemodialysis units, angiographic units. Students of all levels practice on these databases, supervise patients, conduct outpatient appointments, practice practical skills on night duty, which are reflected in checklists, and also have access to CMIS under the login of a clinical mentor.

In accordance with the accreditation procedure, a survey was conducted of 159 teachers, 94 students, including junior and senior students.

In order to confirm the information presented in the Self-Assessment Report, external experts requested and analyzed the working documentation of the university. Along with this, the experts studied the Internet positioning of the university through the official website of the university <https://skma.edu.kz/>.

As part of the planned program, recommendations for improving the accredited educational programs of the SKMA, developed by the EEC based on the results of the examination, were presented at a meeting with the management on 21/04/2023.

## **(VI) COMPLIANCE WITH SPECIALIZED ACCREDITATION STANDARDS**

### *6.1. Standard «Mission and learning outcomes»*

#### ***Evidentiary part***

The report presents the Mission of the educational program of the Master's program «Medicine», which was discussed with employers at a meeting of the Committee of Educational Programs and considered at a meeting of the Scientific Council of JSC «SKMA». The mission of the EP was developed by the main participants of the EP: scientists, leading specialists and teaching staff of JSC «SKMA», scientific consultants, with the participation of representatives of the DSHR, NCE «Atameken», professional associations, representatives of medical organizations, health departments.

The mission is brought to the attention of stakeholders by publishing on the official website of JSC «SKMA», official networks (facebook), publication in the guidebook for those who want to master postgraduate education programs and students. When developing the EP, JSC «SKMA»



adopted a competence-oriented approach, which is a unified system for determining goals, selecting content, organizing the process of training a specialist based on the allocation of special, general and key competencies that guarantee a high level and effectiveness of professional activity of a specialist.

The expected final results of the Master's degree program are developed on the basis of competencies comparable to the requirements of the second-level Dublin descriptors. The EP of the magistracy «Medicine» of the scientific and pedagogical direction is included in the national Register of EP.

### ***Analytical part***

According to the criteria of the «Mission and learning outcomes» standard, the university has a mission. The mission was discussed with employers at a meeting of the Educational Programs Committee and considered at a meeting of the Scientific Council of JSC «SKMA». The mission of the OP was developed by the main participants of the EP: scientists, leading specialists and the teaching staff of JSC «SKMA», scientific consultants, with the participation of representatives of the DSHR, NCE «Atameken» professional associations, representatives of medical organizations, health departments. The mission of the university and the mission of the Master's degree program «Medicine» is brought to the attention of all interested parties by submitting it on the official website of JSC «SKMA», official networks (facebook), publication in the guidebook. During the interview, it was revealed that employees, graduates, students, undergraduates, doctoral students, employers and representatives of practical healthcare are well aware of the mission. During interviews with employers, teachers and undergraduates, it was revealed that they know and support the mission of the university and the mission of the Master's degree program «Medicine».

The expected final results of the Master's degree program are developed on the basis of competencies comparable to the requirements of the Dublin descriptors. The final results are aimed at achieving the competencies of undergraduates and correspond to the mission and purpose of SKMA.

The educational program 7M10144 «Medicine» has identified specific expected final learning outcomes for undergraduates, as evidenced by the fact that after completing the master's degree program, graduates continue to work as a teacher or combine the work of a teacher with doctoral studies. Training in the master's degree in EP 7M10144 «Medicine» with the award of an academic master's degree, provides undergraduates with competencies that allow them to become a qualified teacher, as well as a researcher in accordance with the principles of best research practice with continuing studies in doctoral studies.

### ***Strengths/Best practices***

1) Undergraduates of EP 7M10144 «Medicine» have specific expected end results of training, which they clearly show after completing the master's program, continuing to work as a teacher in their specialty or combining the work of a teacher with doctoral studies.

2) Master's degree in the EP 7M10144 «Medicine» with the award of an academic master's degree, provides undergraduates with competencies that allow them to become a qualified teacher, as well as a researcher in accordance with the principles of best research practice with continuing studies in doctoral studies.

### ***EEC Recommendations***

Missing.

### ***EEC conclusions by criteria:***

- *Strong* – 2
- *Satisfactory* – 15
- *Suggest improvements* – 0



- *Unsatisfactory – 0*

## 6.2. Standard «Research environment and educational resources»

### ***Evidentiary part***

Competent teachers with academic degrees and titles are involved for the scientific guidance of undergraduates. The highly professional level of teachers, scientific supervisors, consultants is confirmed by the fact that 100% of TS have academic degrees of doctor or candidate of sciences, extensive experience both in the field of higher education and in the implementation of research works in the form of scientific projects and programs of various levels.

JSC «SKMA» participates in international forums, conferences on the development and implementation of international standards of education, global internationalization of research for the successful solution of health problems.

The teaching staff of JSC «SKMA» carries out 18 scientific and technical projects that have passed state registration in JSC «National Center for State Scientific and Technical Expertise». Undergraduates of JSC «SKMA» make presentations as part of their research work at practical conferences of the national and international level. In order to get acquainted with the latest theoretical, methodological and technological achievements of foreign science, with modern methods of scientific research, processing and interpretation of scientific data, acquisition of practical skills, competencies and professional experience in the specialty under study, participation of undergraduates in the academic mobility program is provided. At the stage of mastering the EP, ethical relationships are formed between undergraduates and their supervisors and teachers, which are based on the code of honor of the student and the teacher, according to the Academic Policy of JSC «SKMA».

Material and technical resources are constantly updated and replenished on the basis of applications from departments and laboratories, which ensures variable and constant needs. The resources of the TS of the departments providing the training of undergraduates are supported and, if necessary, can be supplemented by the involvement of employees from practical healthcare organizations.

JSC «SKMA» provides free access for each student to information resources, library fund and material and technical equipment in the form of classroom fund, medical equipment, multimedia equipment, and premises where practical skills can be practiced.

For the organization of the educational process, JSC «SKMA» provides premises where the development of the EP «Medicine» takes place: classroom fund, classrooms, laboratories equipped with modern equipment. All lecture halls, as well as many classrooms, have multimedia equipment, medical equipment, phantoms, dummies, medical furniture, measuring instruments for conducting classes. As part of the research work, all the necessary equipment of all divisions of JSC «SKMA» is available for undergraduates.

### ***Analytical part***

In the process of analyzing the presented self-assessment and interviewing data, it was revealed that the scientific management of undergraduates is carried out by a competent highly qualified teaching staff. The highly qualified level of teachers, scientific supervisors, consultants is evidenced by 100% settling down, the presence of academic degrees of doctor or candidate of sciences, the presence of academic titles of professor or associate professor, as well as extensive experience both in the field of higher education and in the implementation of research works in the form of scientific projects and programs of various levels.

The teaching staff of JSC «SKMA» participates in international forums, conferences on the development and implementation of international standards of education, global

internationalization of research for the successful solution of health problems. The analysis of the presented data shows that JSC «SKMA» supports and ensures the continuous professional growth of teachers of the Master's degree program.

It is documented that the TS of JSC «SKMA» carries out 18 scientific and technical projects that have passed state registration in JSC «National Center for State Scientific and Technical Expertise». The analysis of the data of individual curricula, reports and portfolios of undergraduates shows that they make oral presentations as part of their research work at practical conferences of international and national level, as well as publish the results of scientific work in various publications. Material and technical resources are constantly updated and replenished on the basis of applications from departments and laboratories, which ensures variable and constant needs. The resources of the teaching staff of the departments providing the training of undergraduates are supported and, if necessary, can be supplemented by the involvement of employees from practical healthcare organizations

Familiarization with the Library and Information Center (7 halls with 350 seats) indicates that JSC «SKMA» provides free access for each student to information resources, library fund. There is sufficient material and technical equipment in the form of a classroom fund, medical equipment, multimedia equipment, and premises where practical skills can be practiced. The survey data of students confirm this fact: 97.8% agree that the library is well equipped and has a fairly good collection of books (75.5% fully agree, 17% agree, 5.3% partially agree)

The Laboratory of medicinal plants allows undergraduates to grow plants, standardize medicines, and study the toxicity of drugs.

The scientific and clinical laboratory allows students to conduct genetic analysis. As part of the research work, all the necessary equipment of all divisions of JSC «SKMA» is available for undergraduates.

In the process of familiarization with the structural units, it is presented that a safe environment has been created for employees, undergraduates and compliance with safety regulations in the laboratory and when using equipment is carried out. It was also demonstrated that there is a library with the necessary educational literature, computer classes with access to information systems that are constantly updated, improved, expanded. During the interview, undergraduates confirmed that there is constant access to educational literature, to modern electronic databases, including foreign databases (Web of Science, Thomson Reuters, Scopus, Pubmed, Elsevier, etc.). When interviewing undergraduates, they noted that the website is constantly updated, which provides all the information on the master's degree program (structure and staff of the master's degree department, admission policy, list of master's degree programs, content of programs, criteria for appointing managers, methods of evaluating undergraduates, criteria for the design and writing of a dissertation, description of the defense procedure, quality assurance program, etc.). regular evaluation of the program, information about undergraduates, information about the employment of undergraduates).

However, it is noted that at the moment, joint educational programs of the Master's degree «Medicine» with partner universities with the award of degrees from both universities and joint management have not yet been developed and implemented, which would allow to support cooperation between higher educational institutions. Internships in universities of foreign countries with the indication of specific terms of study in other laboratories within the framework of internationalization are also not represented in the educational program of the Master's degree in Medicine.

***Strengths/Best practices***

Missing.

***EEC Recommendations***

1) Development and implementation of joint Master's degree programs «Medicine» with partner universities with the award of degrees from both universities and joint leadership to support cooperation between higher education institutions - (deadline-2023-2024 academic year).

2) To regulate in the educational program of the master's degree «Medicine» internship in universities of foreign countries with the indication of specific terms of study in other laboratories within the framework of internationalization - (deadline-2023-2024 academic year).

***EEC conclusions by criteria***

- *Strong* – 0
- *Satisfactory* – 28
- *Suggest improvements* – 2
- *Unsatisfactory* – 0

***6.3. Standard «Policy and criteria for admission»******Evidentiary part***

In JSC «SKMA» admission of undergraduates for training is carried out in accordance with the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 31, 2018 №600 "On approval of Standard rules for admission to training in educational organizations implementing educational programs of higher and postgraduate education" and according to the results of comprehensive testing. JSC «SKMA» carries out admission in accordance with the Rules of admission to the magistracy, where the policy of admission and selection of applicants is defined and implemented, the technology of enrollment is described, the work of the admissions committee Admission of persons to the magistracy is carried out on a competitive basis based on the results of comprehensive testing. Admission of foreigners is carried out on a paid basis.

An admissions committee is being created to receive documents at JSC «SKMA». The chairman of the admissions committee is the rector of JSC «SKMA» or the person performing his duties. The policy of admission of applicants to JSC «SKMA» is reviewed periodically on the basis of relevant data from the public and specialists of the healthcare system and pharmaceutical production in order to meet the social obligations of the educational institution, as well as the needs of the population and society as a whole and determines the relationship between the selection of applicants, EP and the desired quality of graduates.

***Analytical part***

JSC «SKMA» carries out admission in accordance with the Rules of admission to the magistracy, where the policy of admission and selection of applicants is defined and implemented, the technology of enrollment, the work of the admissions committee are described. Admission of persons to the magistracy is carried out on a competitive basis based on the results of comprehensive testing. Admission of foreigners is carried out on a paid basis. An admissions committee is being created to receive documents at JSC «SKMA». The chairman of the admissions committee is the rector of JSC «SKMA» or the person performing his duties. Persons entering the scientific and pedagogical master's degree program take a CT, which includes a test in a foreign language (English, German, French), a test on the profile of groups of educational programs, a test to determine readiness for elective study in Kazakh or Russian. CT is carried out by the National Testing Center of the Ministry of Internal Affairs of the Republic of Kazakhstan at CT points determined by the Ministry of Internal Affairs of the Republic of Kazakhstan. According to the

results of CT, an electronic certificate is issued, which is confirmed on the website of the NTC Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The procedure for determining the number of accepted undergraduates is determined by the results of CT of applicants who have chosen JSC «SKMA» and the maximum permissible load on managers and teaching staff, the availability of educational, methodological and scientific literature, the throughput capacity of laboratories and research bases, as well as the material and technical resources of JSC «SKMA». Appeals commissions are created to consider the applications of persons who disagree with the results of CT. An application for appeal is submitted to the Chairman of the appeal commission by a person entering the magistracy. The Appeals Commission accepts and considers applications from persons entering the magistracy on the content of examination materials and technical reasons. The process of updating and restructuring the Master's degree program «Medicine» contributes to the adaptation of the admission policy of undergraduates, taking into account changing expectations and circumstances, the need for human resources, changes in the system of postgraduate education and the needs of the program. JSC «SKMA» constantly monitors the employment of graduates of the master's degree, studies the demand, promotes career growth and continuous professional improvement of graduates, which was revealed during interviews with undergraduates and graduates of the master's degree, continuing their studies in doctoral studies and working at this university.

***Strengths/Best practices***

Missing.

***EEC Recommendations***

Missing.

***EEC conclusions by criteria:***

- *Strong* – 0
- *Satisfactory* – 6
- *Suggest improvements* – 0
- *Unsatisfactory* – 0

**6.4. Standard «Master's Degree Program»**

***Evidentiary part***

The Master's degree program «Medicine» was developed according to the modular principle of building a training program, based on an integrated, integrated competence-oriented approach, taking into account the Dublin descriptors of the second cycle of training. JSC «SKMA» develops and approves a modular educational program for the entire period of study, while undergraduates are given the opportunity to choose a training module and elective disciplines of the basic and profiling component, taking into account the complexity of the disciplines in loans.

For the effective study of EP, modules are formed on the basis of the definition of interdisciplinary integration, the formation of competencies and the achievement of LO. The development of the master's degree program was carried out taking into account the requirements of the Regulations on the development of modular EP, posted for general use on the website of JSC «SKMA».

The structure of the Master's degree program is formed from various types of educational, research work and types of practices that determine the content of education, and reflects their correlation, measurement and accounting.

The structure of the content of the Master's degree program is determined in accordance with the SMSPE, and is provided by such auxiliary «tools» as the WC, the academic calendar, the IC



and the individual master's work plan. The academic calendar is developed by the EMC for the academic year, working curricula – for the entire period of study. The WC and the academic calendar are discussed at meetings of collegial management bodies (Scientific and Clinical Council) and approved by the Academic Council of JSC «SKMA».

The Master's degree program provides for the performance of original research work under the supervision of a supervisor. The originality of the master's research work is achieved by independently conducting patent search, collecting and processing information, in-depth analysis of modern medical literature on international databases Scopus, Web of Science, etc.

The studies planned by undergraduates require deep analytical thinking and a critical approach in selecting the necessary information for a master's thesis, which allow determining the logical sequence of research, as well as objectively assessing the effectiveness of the proposed measures, advantages and disadvantages, vulnerabilities, and the quality of work in general. In addition, a master's student can assess the place of his research in practical healthcare. In the process of completing his dissertation, the master's student cooperates with the staff of structural divisions, teaching staff, doctors both in JSC «SKMA» and beyond.

Compliance with the principles of equality of undergraduates in such matters as age, gender, sexual orientation, religion in JSC «SKMA» is strictly guaranteed by both the Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the management of JSC «SKMA».

The final certification of a master's student is carried out in accordance with the State Educational Standard in the form of a master's thesis defense. Undergraduates who have passed the final certification and confirmed the development of the corresponding master's degree program, by the decision of the FAC, are awarded the degree of «Master of Medical Sciences" in the Master's degree and are given a state-issued diploma with a transcript, in the form approved by the Order of the Ministry of Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated January 28, 2015 № 39 «On approval of the types and forms of state-issued education documents and the Rules for their issuance» (registered in the Register of State Registration of Regulatory Legal Acts of the Republic of Kazakhstan under №10348).

### ***Analytical part***

A two-year master's degree program «Medicine» is presented, developed according to the modular principle of building a training program taking into account the Dublin descriptors. The main purpose of the EP is to train highly professional, competitive scientific-pedagogical and administrative-managerial personnel in the EP «Medicine» for science and healthcare organizations with fundamental knowledge that guarantees them professional mobility in the real developing world. In the master's program of scientific and pedagogical direction, the volume of the PD cycle is 49 academic credits. The final certification of a master's student is carried out in accordance with the State Educational Standard in the form of defending master's theses. The final certification is carried out within the terms stipulated by the academic calendar and the curriculum. The EP is designed taking into account the current needs of the labor market. In the process of interviewing employers, it was revealed that they are invited to annual meetings, «round tables», where issues of ensuring the conditions for professional training of competent and competitive specialists in the field of healthcare, strengthening intellectual potential and practice-oriented activities, its integration with production, as well as issues of providing elective subjects by representatives of practical healthcare are discussed.

The IC and the portfolio of undergraduates are presented, where training plans, reports, certificates are reflected. Pedagogical practice and research practice of a master's student are implemented in accordance with an individual plan within the time limits determined by the curriculum. The content of the research practice is determined by the topic of the dissertation research. Pedagogical practice is conducted in order to form practical skills of teaching and learning methods. At the same time, undergraduates are involved in conducting classes in the bachelor's degree. The Master's degree program «Medicine» involves intermediate attestations (semi-annual and annual), which was found out during an interview with the university



management and undergraduates.

During the survey of students, it was revealed that 94.9% were satisfied with the overall quality of educational programs (78.9% were fully satisfied, 16% were partially satisfied). During the survey, it was revealed that 99.4% of the teaching staff are satisfied with the content of the EP.

The internal quality system in JSC «SKMA» is implemented through the activities of various departments, collegial bodies, educational processes whose functions and tasks include monitoring and control of the implementation of educational programs. During interviews with the management, deans, heads of structural divisions, it was revealed that monitoring and control of the implementation of the EP is being carried out, however, there is no internal document on evaluating the effectiveness of the Master's degree program «Medicine» in order to monitor the quality of the educational process, as well as identifying areas requiring interventions.

### ***Strengths/Best practices***

Missing.

### ***EEC Recommendations***

To develop an internal document on evaluating the effectiveness of the Master's degree program «Medicine» in order to ensure monitoring of the quality of the educational process, as well as identifying areas requiring interventions (due date - 2023-2024 academic year).

### ***EEC conclusions by criteria:***

- *Strong* – 0
- *Satisfactory* – 24
- *Suggest improvements* – 0
- *Unsatisfactory* – 0

### ***6.5. Standard «Scientific guidance»***

#### ***Evidentiary part***

To provide scientific and methodological assistance when working on a master's thesis, to control the performance of work, to provide, if necessary, psychological support, to make recommendations on the participation of undergraduates in the educational process within two months after enrollment, each undergraduate is assigned a supervisor from among candidates or doctors of sciences, or PhD doctors to guide the master's thesis, or qualified specialists of the relevant industries with at least 5 years of work experience. The supervisor and the research topic of the undergraduate are approved by the decision of the Academic Council.

If the master's thesis is carried out at the junction of various scientific directions, then scientific consultants in related branches of sciences are appointed. Scientific guidance is based on the criteria of professional experience, research results, recognition from colleagues and teaching experience. No more than five undergraduates are assigned to one supervisor in the master's program.

The topics of master's theses, scientific supervisors and consultants of undergraduates of the EP during the first two months after enrollment are considered at meetings of the graduating departments, the Scientific Committee on the EP «Medicine», the Scientific Council and are approved by the Academic Council of JSC «SKMA». The result of these statements is the corresponding order of the rector of JSC «SKMA».

The supervisor conducts systematic control at the stages of research work, discusses the results, makes adjustments in the course of work and provides assistance at individual stages of the master's thesis. This allows the supervisor to significantly activate the process of assimilation of theoretical knowledge by the undergraduate student with their implementation when performing research work through a personality-oriented approach, i.e. brings the learning process as close as possible to the needs of practice.

***Analytical part***

In the process of analysis, in the process of interviewing teaching staff and heads of structural divisions, it was clarified that within two months after enrollment, each master's student is assigned a supervisor from among candidates or doctors of sciences, or PhD doctors, or qualified specialists in relevant industries with at least 5 years of work experience to guide the master's thesis. The supervisor and the research topic of the undergraduate are approved by the decision of the Academic Council. If the master's thesis is carried out at the junction of various scientific directions, then scientific consultants in related branches of sciences are appointed. The supervisor is responsible for the compliance of the master's student with the academic discipline, the implementation of the IS of the master's student and the timely submission of the master's thesis.

The supervisor assists the master's student in determining the topic and plan of the master's thesis, in the development of the master's IS, in the effective organization of work on the implementation of the master's IC, in the participation of the master's student in international conferences, and also provides feedback (written and oral) on the master's thesis, is present at the public defense of the master's thesis of the master's student. The supervisor conducts systematic control at all stages of the research work, which was confirmed during the analysis of the data of the portfolio of undergraduates.

***Strengths/Best practices***

Missing.

***EEC Recommendations***

Missing.

***EEC conclusions by criteria:***

- *Strong* – 0
- *Satisfactory* – 6
- *Suggest improvements* – 0
- *Unsatisfactory* – 0

***6.6. Standard «Dissertation»******Evidentiary part***

Within two months after enrollment, each master's student is assigned a supervisor from among candidates or doctors of sciences, PhD doctors corresponding to the profile of the requested direction, with at least 5 years of work experience, to guide the master's thesis. If necessary, scientific consultants in related branches of science are appointed.

The supervisor and the topic of the master's thesis of the undergraduate are approved by the decision of the Academic Council. The topics of master's theses, scientific supervisors are determined by the graduating departments, discussed at scientific committees, the Scientific Council and approved by the Academic Council on the proposal of the head of the DSCWDMS within two months after enrollment.

To pass the pre-defense procedure, the undergraduate student, no later than two months before the expected date of defense of the master's thesis, submits it for consideration at a meeting of the graduating department, after consideration of the master's thesis is carried out at the Scientific Committee on the EP «Medicine». The pre-defense is formalized by the minutes of the meeting of the department and the minutes of the Scientific Committee. To pass the pre-defense procedure, the undergraduate student, no later than two months before the expected date of defense of the master's thesis, submits it for consideration at a meeting of the graduating department, after consideration of the master's thesis is carried out at the Scientific Committee on the EP «Medicine». The pre-defense is formalized by the minutes of the meeting of the department and

the minutes of the Scientific Committee.

A master's student who has passed pre-defense, who has submitted a list of documents by order of the rector is allowed to defend a master's thesis. Admission to the defense of the master's thesis is issued by the order of the rector of JSC «SKMA» on the basis of the minutes of the annual report of the meeting of the department and the Scientific Committee provided by the head of DSCWDMS.

Research work for the master's degree is a mandatory component of the master's program, which reveals the main problems of the EP.

Master's theses after the defense procedure are transferred to the LIC of JSC «SKMA» and are available to all interested parties (undergraduates, scientific supervisors, employees and researchers performing scientific work).

### ***Analytical part***

The topics of master's theses, scientific supervisors are determined by the graduating departments, discussed at scientific committees, the Scientific Council and approved by the Academic Council on the proposal of the head of the DSCWDMS within two months after enrollment. Research work for the master's degree is a mandatory component of the master's program, which reveals the main problems of the EP. The research work of a graduate student corresponds to the profile of the EP within the framework of which the master's thesis is performed and defended. Practical recommendations, independent solutions of management tasks set out in the research work are based on modern achievements of science, technology and production. The Master's thesis is carried out using advanced information technologies and contains research (practical, methodological, scientific) sections on the main protected provisions. The final result of the master's research work is a master's thesis. The master's thesis must be checked for the presence of plagiarism, the rules and procedure of which are determined by the Regulation on the procedure for checking written works for the presence of borrowings. The defense of a master's thesis includes the preparation of a master's thesis, registration and defense. The duration of the master's degree is determined by the amount of academic credits mastered. Upon mastering the established amount of academic credits and achieving the expected LO for obtaining a master's degree, the Master's degree program is considered fully mastered. The master's thesis is prepared by a master's student independently under the supervision of a supervisor. The volume of the master's thesis should be at least 70 pages. Appendices are not included in the specified volume of the master's thesis. The list of sources used should not exceed more than 20% of the total volume of the master's thesis. Master's theses after the defense procedure are transferred to the LIC of JSC «SKMA» and are available to all interested parties (undergraduates, scientific supervisors, employees and researchers performing scientific work). The analysis of the portfolio of undergraduates who are studying at the moment indicates the availability of documents for the approval of the topic of dissertations, the availability of publications in journals and oral presentations at international conferences.

### ***Strengths/Best practices***

Missing.

### ***EEC Recommendations***

Missing.

### ***EEC conclusions by criteria:***

- Strong – 0
- Satisfactory – 11
- Suggest improvements – 0
- Unsatisfactory – 0

### 6.7. Standard «Evaluation of dissertations»

#### ***Evidentiary part***

When evaluating a master's thesis, the following is taken into account: the relevance of the topic; the novelty of the results obtained; the use of new technologies in the work; the completeness of the literary review and the modernity of the sources used; compliance with the design requirements; the quality of the report on the defense (clarity, literacy, ability to use professional terms, the quality of demonstration material); correctness and completeness of answers to questions asked during the defense and to the comments of the reviewer.

The results of the master's thesis defense are drawn up by a protocol of the established form, individually for each undergraduate, and are announced on the day of defense after the minutes of the FAC meeting are drawn up. The minutes are filled in by the Secretary of the FAC and signed by the Chairman and members of the FAC who participated in the meeting. The final certification of students in JSC «SKMA» is carried out within the terms stipulated by the academic calendar and the IS EP in the form of a master's thesis defense.

The FAC, as its members, includes persons with an academic degree, or an academic title or an academic degree corresponding to the profile of graduates.

The defense of the master's thesis is carried out publicly, at a meeting of the FAC on the relevant EP and is held at an open meeting of the FAC with the participation of at least 2/3 of its members. The FAC meeting on the defense of the master's thesis is conducted under the leadership of its chairman and begins with his introductory speech.

Before the start of the defense of the master's thesis by the master's student, the secretary of the commission reads to the members of the FAC the approbation sheet, the review of the supervisor and the review. After that, the master's student begins to defend his master's thesis.

Decisions on the evaluation of the master's thesis defense, as well as on the award of an academic degree and the issuance of a state-issued diploma are made by the FAC at a closed meeting by a simple majority of the votes of the commission members who participated in the meeting. If the votes are equal, the Chairman is granted the right to an additional vote.

#### ***Analytical part***

The evaluation of undergraduates demonstrates that undergraduates who have completed the training program have knowledge, skills and professional values and attitudes that correspond to the goals of the medical organization of education.

The results of the master's thesis defense are drawn up by a protocol of the established form, individually for each undergraduate, and are announced on the day of defense after the minutes of the FAC meeting are drawn up. The minutes are filled in by the Secretary of the FAC and signed by the Chairman and members of the FAC who participated in the meeting. After the completion of the FAC, all protocols are transferred to DSCWDMS for storage in accordance with the established procedure.

The defense of master's theses is conducted in JSC «SKMA». The entire protection process is videofixed. The video recording of the defense of master's theses on the disk is embedded in the student's personal file. The Master's thesis is issued in the form of a written report and presentation for oral defense. The evaluation of dissertations goes through all the regulated stages of evaluation, review and defense.

#### ***Strengths/Best practices***

Missing.

#### ***EEC Recommendations***

Missing.

#### ***EEC conclusions by criteria:***



- *Strong* – 0
- *Satisfactory* – 7
- *Suggest improvements* – 0
- *Unsatisfactory* – 0

#### 6.8. Standard «Management and Administration»

##### ***Evidentiary part***

In accordance with the structure of JSC «SKMA», the first head of JSC «SKMA» is the Rector, who has three vice-rectors directly subordinate to him: the first vice-rector, the vice-rector for educational, methodological and educational work and the vice-rector for financial and economic activities, supervising their areas. Further, the main structural units directly involved in the implementation of the EP are the graduating departments and the DSCWDMS, which is responsible for the organization of the educational process and the effective functioning of the EP, which carries out its activities according to the regulations approved by the rector.

The graduating departments are the main educational and scientific structural divisions of JSC «SKMA», carrying out educational, methodological and research work in one or more related/related disciplines, educational work among students, as well as training of scientific and pedagogical personnel. The purpose of the department is to ensure effective and operational management of scientific and clinical activities, to ensure the training of scientific and scientific-pedagogical personnel in accordance with modern qualification requirements and requests of practical medicine, as well as the clinical activities of teaching staff, graduate and doctoral students of clinical profile.

Effective interaction of management with undergraduates on the implementation of the EP is achieved by including students in the collegial management bodies: Scientific and Clinical Council.

##### ***Analytical part***

The structure of JSC «SKMA» is aimed at the effective implementation and improvement of the EP implemented in JSC «SKMA». Meetings were held with the first head of JSC «SKMA» - the Rector and vice-rectors.

JSC «SKMA» carries out continuous external and internal monitoring of implemented educational programs, operates a system of internal quality assurance, which are reflected in the Rules of organization and monitoring of educational and methodological work and the Quality Policy of the educational institution in JSC «SKMA».

During the interviewing process, they were familiarized with the structure of JSC «SKMA». It was demonstrated that the organization and coordination of the training of postgraduate education specialists is the responsibility of the DSCWDMS, which reports to the First Vice-Rector. In order to implement postgraduate education, DSCWDMS interacts with the graduating departments and the divisions of JSC «SKMA» involved in the implementation of the EP: EMC, Registrar's Office, LIC, CTPC, personnel department.

Taking into account the demands of modern healthcare, higher and postgraduate medical education and science, DSCWDMS plans and implements the EP; organizes and coordinates the allocation of allocated resources for planning and implementing teaching and learning methods, evaluation of undergraduates, evaluation of EP and training courses with discussion at meetings of the Scientific and Academic Councils of JSC «SKMA».

DSCWDMS discusses and coordinates its activities with collegial management bodies (Academic Council, Scientific Council, Clinical Council, Methodological Council, Rector's Office); interacts with the Ministry of Internal Affairs and the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, internal divisions of JSC «SKMA»: LIC, RO, EMC, CTPC, accounting, administrative and Economic Department, Department of Administrative and legal support, monitoring sector and quality management systems, departments and others. The graduating



departments are the main educational and scientific structural divisions of JSC «SKMA», carrying out educational, methodological and research work in one or more related/related disciplines, educational work among students, as well as training of scientific and pedagogical personnel. The management of JSC «SKMA» regularly holds meetings with undergraduates on the design and management of EP. The issues of the educational process, planning and execution of research activities, academic mobility, organization and practice are discussed with undergraduates. In addition, effective interaction of management with undergraduates on the implementation of the EP is achieved by including students in the collegial management bodies: Scientific and Clinical Council.

JSC «SKMA» is updating and restructuring the Master's Degree program by holding discussions at meetings with all interested parties in order to meet the needs of stakeholders in the changing external conditions, requests and challenges of practical medicine.

During the survey, it was revealed that the involvement of teaching staff in the process of making managerial and strategic decisions is very good – 29.6%, good-59.1%. During the survey of students, it was revealed that the level of accessibility and responsiveness of the university management satisfies 97.9% of students (fully satisfied with 80.9%, partially satisfied with 17%).

#### ***Strengths/Best practices***

Missing.

#### ***EEC Recommendations***

Missing.

#### ***EEC conclusions by criteria:***

- *Strong* – 0
- *Satisfactory* – 21
- *Suggest improvements* – 0
- *Unsatisfactory* – 0

#### ***6.9. Standard «Continuous Improvement»***

##### ***Evidentiary part***

JSC «SKMA» plans and applies the processes of continuous monitoring, evaluation, analysis and improvement of educational services, taking into account the tasks of national legislation, requirements and expectations of stakeholders, contributing to the development of quality education based on competencies and end-users.

In JSC «SKMA» on the basis of the conducted analyses, resources are constantly being allocated for continuous improvement. Educational literature is purchased annually, laboratories are equipped with the latest equipment and comfortable conditions are created for students.

The process of constant updating is based on the introduction of new teaching methods, information technologies, the development of evaluation criteria, the expansion of academic mobility, increasing the efficiency and transparency of the decision-making process.

JSC «SKMA» guarantees the renewal and restructuring of the Master's Degree Program in order to improve the organizational structure and principles of program management to ensure its effective operation and meet the needs of stakeholders in the changing external conditions, requests and challenges of practical medicine.

The update of the EP is provided for when changing the purpose and final goals, taking into account the requests of practical medicine, scientific research and the system of higher and postgraduate education based on the experience of leading universities of the republic and abroad.

The policy of recruitment and selection of students for the Master's degree is carried out in accordance with the Order of the Ministry of Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 31, 2018 №600 «On approval of Standard rules for admission to educational organizations

implementing educational programs of higher and postgraduate education».

The recruitment policy and the formation of the academic staff is carried out on a competitive basis in accordance with the Rules for the competitive replacement of positions of teaching staff and researchers developed by the HR Department, agreed upon by the decision of the Academic Council and approved by the Rector of JSC «SKMA» dated December 29, 2021.

The improvement of the monitoring and evaluation processes of the educational program is carried out not only through the internal monitoring system, which includes self-assessment of departments, self-assessment of JSC «SKMA», internal audit of structural units, intra-departmental control, current, intermediate and final certification of students, certification of teaching staff, but also through the periodic passage of the procedure of external evaluation of the quality of the EP in the form of institutional and specialized accreditation.

### ***Analytical part***

The successful implementation of the EP is closely related to the sufficient provision of the structural divisions of JSC «SKMA» with material, technical and information resources (allocation of office equipment, premises, creation of comfortable conditions) on the basis of the interaction of departments, under the leadership of the administration of JSC «SKMA», which decides on priorities, expediency and the amount of necessary resources. The principles of the distribution of financial resources and the formation of tangible assets are based on the development strategy of JSC «SKMA», correspond to the mission and goals. In JSC «SKMA» the distribution of funds is carried out in accordance with the approved estimates of income and expenses for the corresponding financial year. The estimate of income and expenses takes into account all the activities provided for in the development strategy of JSC «SKMA», the dynamics of expenses over a number of years, the recruited contingent of students and is compiled on the basis of approved financial standards. To plan expenses for the acquisition of tangible assets, for the production of repairs, applications from departments, faculties and other departments are accepted annually before each upcoming financial year. After collecting applications and analysis, the financial resources of JSC «SKMA» are distributed according to the needs of the educational process. In JSC «SKMA» on the basis of the conducted analyses, resources are constantly being allocated for continuous improvement. Educational literature is purchased annually, laboratories are equipped with the latest equipment and comfortable conditions are created for students.

The process of constant updating is based on the introduction of new teaching methods, information technologies, the development of evaluation criteria, the expansion of academic mobility, increasing the efficiency and transparency of the decision-making process.

JSC «SKMA» has created a new system of intra-university interaction based on strengthening horizontal information links and trusting relationships between employees and management units, providing full-fledged opportunities for quality education, and a quality system that orients the educational process not only to the requirements of standards, but also to the needs of the individual, society and the state.

To further improve the management principles, the Basic Ethical Principles have been developed, on which JSC «SKMA» relies to implement its mission, these are the Principle of high professionalism of the teaching staff of JSC «SKMA», the Principle of quality in JSC «SKMA» and the Principle of orientation of training.

In the process of analysis and interviewing, it was revealed that JSC «SKMA» constantly allocates the necessary resources for continuous improvement of the educational process by providing structural units with material, technical and information resources, replenishing the library fund with educational literature, equipping laboratories with the latest equipment and creating comfortable conditions for students, as well as by creating its own university clinic.

JSC «SKMA» updates and updates the content of the EP by integrating the results of promising foreign, domestic and own scientific research, analysis and evaluation of scientific literature in the medical field. The survey revealed: students are satisfied with the availability of computer classes and Internet resources (fully-85.1%; partially-10.6%), satisfied with classrooms

(fully-79.8%; partially-12.8%), satisfied with scientific laboratories (fully-79.8%; partially - 10.6%), believe that the equipment and equipment are safe, comfortable and modern (fully agree -73.4%; agree -20.2%; partially agree- 5.3%).

***Strengths/Best practices***

1) JSC «SKMA» continuously improves the educational process according to EP 7M10144 «Medicine» by providing structural units with material, technical and information resources, replenishing the library fund with educational literature, equipping laboratories with the latest equipment and creating comfortable conditions for students, as well as by creating its own university clinic.

2) JSC «SKMA» updates and updates the content of the EP by integrating the results of promising foreign, domestic and own scientific research, analysis and evaluation of scientific literature in the medical field.

***EEC Recommendations***

Missing.

***EEC conclusions by criteria:***

- *Strong* – 2
- *Satisfactory* – 9
- *Suggest improvements* – 0
- *Unsatisfactory* – 0

**(VII) OVERVIEW OF STRENGTHS/BEST PRACTICES FOR EACH STANDARD**

***Standard «Mission and final learning outcomes»***

1) Undergraduates of EP 7M10144 «Medicine» have specific expected end results of training, which they clearly show after completing the master's program, continuing to work as a teacher in their specialty or combining the work of a teacher with doctoral studies.

2) Master's degree studies in EP 7M10144 «Medicine» with the award of an academic master's degree, provides undergraduates with competencies that allow them to become a qualified teacher, as well as a researcher in accordance with the principles of best research practice with continuing studies in doctoral studies.

***Standard «Research environment and educational resources»***

Missing.

***Standard «Policy and criteria for admission »***

Missing.

***Standard «Master's Degree Program»***

Missing.

***Standard «Scientific guidance»***

Missing.

***Standard «Dissertation»***

Missing.

***Standard «Evaluation of dissertations»***

Missing.

***Standard «Management and Administration»***

Missing.

***Standard «Continuous Improvement»***

1) JSC «SKMA» continuously improves the educational process according to EP 7M10144 «Medicine» by providing structural units with material, technical and information resources, replenishing the library fund with educational literature, equipping laboratories with the latest equipment and creating comfortable conditions for students, as well as by creating its own university clinic.

2) JSC «SKMA» updates and updates the content of the EP by integrating the results of promising foreign, domestic and own scientific research, analysis and evaluation of scientific literature in the medical field.

**(VIII) OVERVIEW OF QUALITY IMPROVEMENT RECOMMENDATIONS**

***Standard «Mission and final learning outcomes»***

Missing.

***Standard «Research environment and educational resources»***

1) Development and implementation of joint Master's degree programs «Medicine» with partner universities with the award of degrees from both universities and joint leadership to support cooperation between higher education institutions - (due date-2023-2024 academic year).

2) To regulate in the educational program of the master's degree «Medicine» internship in universities of foreign countries with the indication of specific terms of study in other laboratories within the framework of internationalization - (deadline-2023-2024 academic year).

***Standard «Policy and criteria for admission»***

Missing.

***Standard «Master's Degree Program»***

To develop an internal document on evaluating the effectiveness of the Master's degree program «Medicine» in order to ensure monitoring of the quality of the educational process, as well as identifying areas requiring interventions (due date - 2023-2024 academic year).

***Standard «Scientific guidance»***

Missing.

***Standard «Dissertation»***

Missing.

***Standard «Evaluation of dissertations»***

Missing.

***Standard «Management and Administration»***

Missing.

***Standard «Continuous Improvement»***

Missing.



**(IX) REVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE DEVELOPMENT  
OF THE ORGANIZATION OF EDUCATION**

-

**(X) RECOMMENDATION TO THE ACCREDITATION COUNCIL**

The members of the EEC came to the unanimous opinion that the Master's degree program 7M10144 «Medicine» is recommended for accreditation for a period of 5 years.



## Appendix 1: Evaluation table «PARAMETERS OF SPECIALIZED PROFILE»

		EVALUATION CRITERIA	Position of the educational organization			
			Strength	Satisfactory	Suggests improvement	Unsatisfactory
		<b>«MISSION AND LEARNING OUTCOMES»</b>				
		<b>Defining the mission of the educational program</b>				
1	1	Medical education institution should define its mission of educational program and bring it to the attention of stakeholders and health sector.		+		
2	2	Medical education institution should ensure that key stakeholders are involved in the development (formulation) of the mission of the educational program.		+		
3	3	The mission statement of the educational program should contain the goals and educational strategy of the program, allowing to prepare a competent researcher at the level of postgraduate medical/pharmaceutical education.		+		
4	4	Medical education institution must ensure that the stated mission of the educational program includes the problems of public health, needs of the system of medical and pharmaceutical care and other aspects of social responsibility.		+		
5	5	Medical educational organization must guarantee that the mission of educational program corresponds to the mission of the organization and allow to prepare competent researcher at the level of postgraduate medical education.		+		
6	6	Medical education institution must have a strategic plan of educational program development, corresponding to the stated mission of medical education institution, including issues of quality improvement of Master programs and approved by the advisory and consultative council of medical education institution.		+		
7	7	Medical education organization should systematically collect, accumulate and analyze information about the quality of implementation of master's degree programs; conduct an assessment of strengths and weaknesses (SWOT-analysis), on the basis of which the rectorate (pro-rectorate) together with the advisory and consultative council should determine the policy and develop strategic and tactical plans		+		
		<b>Mission and goals of the educational program:</b>				
8	8	should correspond to the available resources, opportunities and market requirements; should identify ways to support them.		+		
9	9	Medical education organization must provide access to information about mission, goals of medical education organization for the public (availability of information in mass media, on the HEI website).		+		
10	10	The mission of the educational program as well as the mission and goals of medical educational organization should be approved by the advisory and consultative council		+		
		<b>Institutional autonomy and academic freedom</b>				
11	11	An organization that implements graduate educational programs must have institutional autonomy to develop and implement policies for which faculty and administration are accountable, especially with regard to: - the development of the educational program;		+		

		- the use of allocated resources necessary to implement the educational program.				
		The medical educational organization should guarantee academic freedom to its staff and master students:				
12	12	- in relation to the current educational program, in which it will be allowed to rely on different points of view in the description and analysis of issues in medicine and pharmacy;		+		
13	13	- in the possibility of using the results of new research to improve the study of specific disciplines/issues without expanding the educational program.		+		
		<b>Learning outcomes</b>				
14	14	Medical education organizations should define the expected learning outcomes that Master students should exhibit upon completion of the Master's program.		+		
15	15	Graduate study with the award of a Master's degree should provide Master's students with competencies that will enable them to become qualified educators and/or researchers in accordance with the principles of best research practice.		+		
16	16	Completion of a master's program should have potential benefits for those who pursue careers outside of the medical education institution and apply the competencies developed during the master's program, including critical analysis, evaluation and solution of complex problems, ability to transfer new technologies and synthesis of new ideas.		+		
17	17	Medical educational organization should ensure that regular (at least once a year) process of updating and restructuring leads to modification of final learning outcomes of graduates in accordance with the responsibilities that are assigned to graduates after graduation from the Master's program.		+		
		<b>Total</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>15</b>		
		<b>Standard «SCIENTIFIC RESEARCH ENVIRONMENT AND EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES»</b>				
		<b>Research Environment</b>				
18	1	The success of individual MSc programs should be ensured by the organization of a strong and effective research environment.		+		
		The quality of the research environment should be assessed by analyzing:		+		
19	2	publications of research results (number of publications, impact factor, etc.) on the profile of the Master's degree in the medical education organization;		+		
20	3	the level of attraction of external funding for research in the medical educational organization;		+		
21	4	the number of qualified and competent teachers, researchers in the group, faculty, educational organization;		+		
22	5	national and international cooperation with research groups of medical organizations, universities, research centers.		+		
23	6	Research must be conducted in accordance with international ethical standards and approved by appropriate and competent ethics committees.		+		
24	7	In order to provide access to the facilities required for the dissertation, MSc programs may include training in other laboratories, preferably in another country, thus ensuring internationalization			+	
25	8	The implementation of the master's program should take place in an environment of joint planning of teaching and research and shared responsibility of the supervisor and the master's student for the final results.		+		
26	9	The medical education institution should explore opportunities to provide joint master's degree programs from both universities and joint leadership to support collaboration between higher education institutions.			+	
27	10	The medical education organization should ensure that the process of updating educational resources is carried out according to changing needs, such as graduate student enrollment, number and profile of academic staff, and graduate program.		+		
		<b>The medical education organization should:</b>				
28	11	- provide sufficient autonomy in the allocation of resources, including decent remuneration of teachers in the order of achievement of the final learning outcomes defined by the relevant indicators;		+		

		when allocating resources, take into account:				
29	12	a) scientific advances in the field of medicine; b) the health problems of society and its needs		+		
		<b>Material and technical base</b>				
		Medical educational organization must have material and technical support, corresponding to the licensing indicators, which include criteria:		+		
30	13	classrooms, laboratories and their equipment shall be modern and adequate to the goals and objectives of the Master's program;		+		
31	14	Master's students should be provided with conditions for realization of independent educational and research work;		+		
32	15	updating and improvement of the material and technical base should be carried out regularly.		+		
33	16	Medical education organization must have sufficient resources for proper implementation of the Master's program. The organization's resources must provide: admission of graduate students, the organization of teaching in the master's program, fulfillment of the dissertation work, academic supervision, counseling of master's students, reviewing, reviewing, and evaluating the thesis, awarding the academic master's degree, costs of operating expenses, expenses for participation in training courses, international scientific conferences, tuition fees for graduate study at institutions where this is practiced. Resources also include a stipend for a master's student, but the amount paid may vary.		+		
34	17	Resource policy should be aimed at maintaining and ensuring continuous professional development of teachers of the Master's program.		+		
35	18	Medical education institution must provide a safe environment for staff, graduate students and those who provide the implementation of the program, including the provision of necessary information and protection from harmful substances, microorganisms, compliance with safety rules in the laboratory and in the use of equipment.		+		
36	19	Medical educational organization must have service and support service for future master students, including office-registrar, research centers and laboratories, canteen, buffet, medical center, sports grounds and halls.		+		
37	20	The medical education institution shall have approved procedures to improve the learning environment of master students through regular updating, expansion and strengthening of facilities, which shall be in line with the development in the practice of education.		+		
		<b>Information technologies</b>				
38	21	Medical education organization must have information support corresponding to the goals and objectives of the Master's program.		+		
39	22	The library shall contain materials necessary for training - educational, technical, scientific and reference literature, various periodical medical publications, etc.		+		
40	23	Graduate students should have timely and ready access to library resources.		+		
41	24	The library should have basic technical equipment to support daily operations: fax machines, copy machines, computers, printers available for public use, and a telephone with voice mail or answering machine.		+		
42	25	The library should have an informational Web site. The website may include the following elements: links, interlibrary loan forms, full-text electronic journal articles, and a feedback form.		+		
43	26	The medical education organization should regularly monitor library resources, research and implement strategies to meet the current and future needs of graduate students.		+		
44	27	Computer classes and terminals with access to information resources (local area network, Internet) should be available for use by master students.		+		



45	28	In medical educational organization should be carried out control of availability and adequate use of information resources by master students.		+		
46	29	In medical educational organization should be carried out constant updating, improvement and expansion of the base of information resources with the provision of access to modern electronic databases, including foreign databases (Thomson Reuters (Web of Science, Thomson Reuters), Scopus, Pubmed, Elsevier, etc.).		+		
47	30	A medical education organization must establish and continuously update a section on its website dedicated to graduate programs containing the following information: structure and staffing of the graduate program department, responsibilities of the department head and staff; admissions policies, including clear rules about the graduate student selection process; a list of graduate programs; structure, duration and content of graduate programs; criteria for the appointment of a supervisor, outlining the characteristics, responsibilities, and qualifications of the supervisor; methods used to evaluate graduate students; criteria for the design and writing of the thesis; description of the dissertation defense procedure; description of the work of the State Attestation Commission for the defense of master's theses; program of quality assurance and regular evaluation of the Master's program; information on Master's students with regard to the year of study; information about employment of Master's degree graduates for the last 3 years taking into account the direction of study (scientific and pedagogical, profile).		+		
		<b>Total</b>		<b>28</b>	<b>2</b>	
		<b>Standard «POLICY AND CRITERIA for Admission»</b>				
48	1	The medical education organization must define and implement an admission policy, including a clearly established provision for the selection process of graduate students.		+		
49	2	Candidates for the Master's program must have completed professional curricula of higher education (basic medical/pharmacy/chemistry, advanced professional (basic medical + internship) or postgraduate education (residency).		+		
50	3	When selecting future graduate students, the research potential of the applicant should be evaluated, rather than simply considering academic performance.		+		
51	4	The medical education organization should have a system for studying employment, demand, career support and continuous professional development of graduates.		+		
52	5	The data obtained through this system should be used for further improvement of educational programs.		+		
53	6	Medical education institution should ensure that the process of renewal and restructuring of educational program of Master's degree leads to adaptation of admission policy of Master's degree students taking into account changing expectations and circumstances, needs in human resources, changes in the system of postgraduate education and needs of the program.		+		
		<b>Total</b>		<b>6</b>		
		<b>Standard «Master's Degree Programme»</b>				
		Model of educational program, teaching methods and structure		+		
54	1	Medical educational organization must define the model of educational program, including integrated model based on interdisciplinary connection and competence-oriented approach, with application of modular learning technologies with consideration of final learning outcomes.		+		
55	2	The medical education institution must define the purpose and objectives of the Master's program, which are aimed at achieving the mission of the		+		

		educational institution, the mission of the educational program and the final learning outcomes.				
56	3	Medical educational organization must guarantee that the content of educational program corresponds to the requirements of the State Educational Standards and the standard curriculum of the relevant specialty and is developed taking into account the needs of the labor market		+		
57	4	Medical educational organization must provide implementation of educational program by appropriate working curricula, academic calendar, curricula for disciplines, forms of individual educational plan of future Master students and individual work plan of Master students		+		
58	5	Master's program should be based on the performance of original research, which requires analytical and critical thinking and should be carried out under scientific guidance.		+		
59	6	The medical education institution shall ensure that the educational program is implemented in accordance with the principles of equality.		+		
60	7	Medical education institution must guarantee that Master student fulfills obligations in relation to doctors, teachers, colleagues, patients and their relatives in accordance with the Code of Conduct/Honor Code.		+		
61	8	The Master's program must ensure that Master's students are trained in ethics and responsible conduct of scientific research.		+		
62	9	Medical educational organization must determine the teaching and learning methods used, appropriate to the educational program and to the achievement of students' competencies.		+		
63	10	The Master's program must be structured with a clear time limit, equivalent to 1-2 years full-time and contain:		+		
64	11	Medical educational organization shall provide mechanisms for implementation of pedagogical practice (in accordance with the type of Master's degree) for formation of practical skills and teaching methods in Master's students.		+		
65	12	Medical educational organization shall provide mechanisms for implementation of research practice for formation of knowledge, skills, competencies in the field of the latest theoretical, methodological and technological achievements of domestic and foreign science, modern methods of scientific research, processing and interpretation of experimental data.		+		
66	13	Medical educational organization shall provide mechanisms for implementation of industrial practice for formation of practical skills, competences and experience of professional activity on the basis of theoretical knowledge of master students in the specialty under study, as well as mastering of advanced experience		+		
67	14	Medical education institution must guarantee that future Master students will have an opportunity to study under the academic mobility program, have mechanisms/procedures for admission of students from other universities, recognition of credits mastered under the academic mobility program.		+		
68	15	The medical education organization must have an appeal mechanism in place to allow Master students to have a review of the decision regarding their programs and the evaluation of their thesis.		+		
		Evaluation of the graduate program				
69	16	Medical education organization should have a program for monitoring processes and outcomes, including routine collection of data on key aspects of the education program. The purpose of monitoring is to ensure the quality of the educational process, identifying areas requiring intervention.		+ reco men dati on		
70	17	Medical education institution shall, on the basis of approved mechanisms, carry out regular assessment of program quality, including feedback from academic supervisors, employers and master students.		+		
71	18	Medical education institution should, on the basis of approved mechanisms, systematically collect, analyze and provide feedback to teachers and master students, which includes information on the process and products of the		+		

		educational program, including information on unfair practices or inappropriate behavior of teachers or master students.				
		The medical education organization should ensure that the process of updating and restructuring is carried out regularly and is aimed at:		+		
72	19	- adapting the educational program model and methodological approaches in teaching to ensure that they are appropriate and relevant;		+		
73	20	- adjusting the program elements and their interrelationships in accordance with advances in medical sciences, changes in demographics and health status/ morbidity patterns of the population and socio-economic, cultural conditions.		+		
		<b>Involvement of stakeholders</b>				
74	21	Medical education institution should involve academic staff and graduate students, its administration and management in its monitoring program and evaluation activities of the educational program.		+		
75	22	Medical education institution should involve in the process of evaluation other stakeholders, including representatives of academic and administrative staff, representatives of the public, authorized bodies on education and health care, professional organizations, as well as develop mechanisms to encourage participation of external experts on evaluation of educational program.		+		
76	23	Medical education institution should provide access to the results of educational program evaluation to all interested parties.		+		
77	24	Medical education institution should ensure that the process of renewal and restructuring leads to improvement of the process of monitoring and evaluation of the program in accordance with changes in learning outcomes and teaching and learning methods.		+		
		<b>Total</b>		<b>24</b>		
		<b>Standard «SCIENTIFIC MANAGEMENT»</b>				
78	1	The medical education institution must identify each master student a scientific supervisor and, if applicable, a co-supervisor to cover all aspects of the program.		+		
79	2	Medical educational organization must have mechanisms/procedures regulating the process of discussion and approval of the candidate of scientific supervisor and the master student's research topic according to the standard requirements and GOSA.		+		
80	3	The medical education institution must ensure that the candidates of scientific supervisors will be selected from specialists who have an academic degree and are actively engaged in scientific research in the field of science on the specialty of Master student's study.		+		
81	4	Medical educational organization must have clearly defined duties and responsibilities of a scientific supervisor.		+		
82	5	Scientific supervisors should conduct regular consultations with their Master students.		+		
83	6	The master's student must study on the basis of an approved individual work plan, which is prepared under the guidance of a supervisor, which should be reflected in the approved reports for each semester, heard at the meeting of the department (departments) approved reports for each semester		+		
		<b>Total</b>		<b>6</b>		
		<b>Standard «DISSERTATION»</b>				
84	1	The topic of the dissertation and the research supervisor of the Master's student must be approved after enrollment in the Master's program.		+		
85	2	The dissertation topic must be evaluated and approved by a group of independent experts (examiners) by external evaluation of the written description or based on the presentation of the research work.		+		
86	3	The Master's program should be completed with the preparation and defense of the Master's thesis, which is an indicator of the Master's student's formation of competencies in accordance with the educational program.		+		
87	4	Research work in the scientific and pedagogical master's program should: - correspond to the main problematics of the specialty in which the master's thesis is defended;		+		

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- be relevant, contain scientific novelty and practical significance;</li> <li>- be based on modern theoretical, methodological and technological achievements of science and practice;</li> <li>- be carried out using modern methods of scientific research;</li> <li>- contain research (methodological, practical) sections on the main defended provisions;</li> <li>- be based on the advanced international experience in the relevant field of knowledge.</li> </ul>				
88	5	<p>Experimental-research work in the specialized master's program should:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- correspond to the main problematics of the specialty in which the master's thesis is defended;</li> <li>- be based on modern achievements of science, technology and production and contain specific practical recommendations, independent solutions to management problems;</li> <li>- be carried out with the application of advanced information technologies;</li> <li>- contain experimental and research (methodological, practical) sections on the main defended positions</li> </ul>		+		
89	6	Medical education organization shall determine the term of dissertation preparation, limited to 1-2 years.		+		
90	7	The dissertation should be written by the Master student independently, contain a set of scientific results and provisions put forward by the author for public defense.		+		
91	8	The structure of the dissertation should include a literature review related to the research topic, goals and objectives of the research work, research methodology, results, discussion, conclusion, conclusions and further prospects of the research.		+		
92	9	The results of the dissertation work should be made available to interested parties (master students, supervisors, employees of the organization where the dissertation was performed, researchers performing scientific work in a similar direction, and other categories of interested parties), i.e. published, if copyright or other reasons do not prevent this.		+		
93	10	The dissertation work must be accompanied by at least one publication and/or one presentation at a scientific and practical conference.		+		
94	11	Medical educational organization must ensure the discussion of the Master's thesis at the meeting of the department(s) where the thesis was performed.		+		
		<b>Total</b>		<b>11</b>		
		<b>Standard «EVALUATION OF DISSERTATIONS »</b>				
95	1	Medical education organization must define, approve and publish the principles, methods and practices used for the evaluation of master's theses, including the criteria for evaluation of scientific work.		+		
96	2	The final evaluation and approval of the thesis must be carried out by the State Attestation Commission (SAC) for Master's thesis defense.		+		
97	3	The dissertation defense should be held in the medical educational organization where the Master's student is studying.		+		
98	4	The dissertation must be reviewed (external) in a similar on the profile of the medical education organization by a person with a degree of candidate of sciences or PhD-doctor on the profile of the defended dissertation.		+		
99	5	The dissertation defense should include both preparation of a written version of the report and subsequent oral defense.		+		
100	6	The thesis defense must be open to the public.		+		
101	7	The academic master's degree shall be awarded by the medical education organization based on the decision of the SAC, which evaluates the thesis (standard "Dissertation") and the oral defense.		+		
		<b>Total</b>		<b>7</b>		
		<b>Standard «MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION»</b>				
		<b>Program Management</b>				
102	1	Management of medical education organization must be effective and ensure improvement of educational program.		+		
103	2	Medical educational organization shall determine the structural subdivision responsible for implementation of educational programs of postgraduate education and achievement of final results of education.		+		



104	3	The structural subdivision responsible for the implementation of educational programs of postgraduate education must have authority for planning and implementation of educational program, including allocation of allocated resources for planning and implementation of teaching and learning methods, evaluation of master students, evaluation of educational program and training courses.		+		
105	4	The medical education organization should guarantee the interaction of graduate students with the management on the design, management and evaluation of graduate programs.		+		
106	5	Medical education organization should encourage and facilitate involvement of Master students in the process of development of educational programs for Master students.		+		
107	6	Structural subdivision responsible for implementation of educational programs of postgraduate education shall ensure transparency of management system and decisions made, which are published in bulletins, placed on HEI website, included in protocols for review and implementation.		+		
108	7	Medical education institution should through structural subdivision responsible for implementation of educational programs of postgraduate education plan and implement innovations in educational program.		+		
109	8	Medical education institution should include representatives from other relevant stakeholders in the advisory body responsible for implementation of educational programs of postgraduate education, including other participants of educational process, representatives from clinical and industrial bases, graduates of medical education institutions, health care/pharmacy specialists involved in the process of education or other teachers of university faculties.		+		
110	9	Medical educational organization should ensure that structural subdivision responsible for implementation of educational programs of postgraduate education: - considers peculiarities of conditions in which graduates will have to work and modify educational program accordingly; - considers modification of educational program on the basis of feedback from the public and society as a whole.		+		
111	10	The medical education organization should ensure that the process of renewal and restructuring leads to improvements in the organizational structure and management principles of the graduate program to ensure effective operations and (in the long term) to meet the interests of different stakeholder groups in the face of changing circumstances and needs.		+		
		<b>Academic Leadership</b>				
112	11	The medical education organization must clearly define the responsibilities of academic leadership with respect to the development and management of the educational program.		+		
113	12	The medical education organization should periodically evaluate academic leadership regarding the achievement of its mission and ultimate educational outcomes.		+		
		<b>Academic budget and resource allocation</b>				
114	13	The medical education organization should: - have a clear range of responsibilities and authority to provide the educational program with resources, including the target budget for training; - allocate resources necessary for the implementation of the educational program and distribute educational resources according to their needs.		+		
115	14	The system of financing of medical education organization shall be based on the principles of efficiency, effectiveness, priority, transparency, responsibility, differentiation and independence of all levels of budgets.		+		
116	15	Financial and administrative policy should be aimed at improving the quality of the educational program.		+		
		<b>Administrative staff and management</b>				
117	16	The medical education organization must have adequate administrative and academic staff, including their number and composition according to their qualifications, in order to:		+		

		- ensure the implementation of the educational program and related activities; - guarantee proper management and allocation of resources.				
118	17	Medical education institution should develop and implement an internal program for quality assurance of management, including consideration of needs for improvement, and conduct regular review and analysis of management.		+		
119	18	The medical education institution should ensure that the Master's programme is implemented in accordance with the quality management system certified by independent organizations.		+		
		Interaction with the health sector				
120	19	Medical education organization shall have constructive interaction with health sector, allied health sectors, society and government, including information exchange, cooperation and initiatives of the organization, which contributes to the provision of qualified specialists in accordance with the needs of the society.		+		
121	20	The medical education organization should provide an operational link between the educational program and subsequent stages of professional training.		+		
122	21	The medical education organization should formalize cooperation with partners in the health sector, which includes the conclusion of formal agreements defining the content and forms of cooperation and/or joint contracting and the establishment of a coordinating committee, and joint activities.		+		
		<b>Total</b>		<b>21</b>		
		<b>Standard «CONTINUOUS IMPROVEMENT»</b>				
		The medical education organization must, as a dynamic and socially responsible institution:		+		
123	1	initiate procedures to regularly review and revise content, outcomes/competencies, assessment and learning environment, structure and function, document and address deficiencies;		+		
124	2	Allocate resources for continuous improvement.		+		
		The medical education organization should:				
125	3	base the renewal process on prospective research and analysis and on the results of its own study, evaluation and literature on medical postgraduate education;		+		
126	4	ensure that the process of renewal and restructuring leads to revision of its policies and practices in accordance with previous experience, current activities and perspectives.		+		
		Medical education organization in the process of renewal/continuous improvement should pay attention to:		+		
127	5	adaptation of the mission and outcomes of postgraduate medical education to the scientific, socio-economic and cultural development of society for the future;		+		
128	6	modification of the intended outcomes of postgraduate education in the chosen field of health care in accordance with the documented needs of the environment. The modifications may include adjustment of the structure and content of the educational program, principles of active learning. The adjustment will guarantee, along with the elimination of outdated, the mastery of new relevant knowledge, concepts, methods and concepts based on new advances in basic biomedical, clinical, behavioral and social sciences, taking into account changes in demographics and population structure on public health issues, as well as changes in socio-economic and cultural conditions;		+		
129	7	developing assessment principles, methods of administration, and number of examinations in line with changes in learning outcomes and teaching and learning methods;		+		
130	8	adapting recruitment and selection policies for graduate students to meet changing expectations and circumstances, human resource needs, changes in the postgraduate education system, and the needs of the educational program;		+		

131	9	adapting the recruitment and academic staffing policy to meet changing needs;		+		
132	10	improving the monitoring and evaluation process of the educational program.		+		
133	11	Improving the organizational structure and management principles to ensure effective performance in the face of changing circumstances and needs, and, in the long term, to meet the interests of different stakeholder groups.		+		
		<b>Total: 4 strengths, 1 recommendation, 2 improvements</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>127</b>	<b>2</b>	



## Appendix 2. PROGRAM OF THE VISIT TO THE ORGANIZATION OF EDUCATION

Date and time	EEC work with target groups	Position and name of target group participants	EEC work with target groups
<i>18 April, 2023</i>			
<b>20.00-21.00</b>	Preliminary meeting of the EEC	<i>External IAAR Experts</i>	Link <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765?pwd=Tk9MYWptb2dnV01YMm1oN0Q0dEhSdz09">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765?pwd=Tk9MYWptb2dnV01YMm1oN0Q0dEhSdz09</a>  Conference ID: 389 293 1765 Password: 334352 <b>(only for EEC)</b>
<i>Day 1: April 19, 2023</i>			
<b>10.00-10.30</b>	Distribution of responsibility of experts, solution of organizational issues	<i>External IAAR Experts</i>	Link <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765?pwd=Tk9MYWptb2dnV01YMm1oN0Q0dEhSdz09">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765?pwd=Tk9MYWptb2dnV01YMm1oN0Q0dEhSdz09</a>  Conference ID: 389 293 1765 Password: 334352 <b>(only for EEC)</b>
<b>10.30 – 11.10</b>	Interview with the rector	<i>Rector - Rysbekov Myrzabek Myrzashevich, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor</i>	Link <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765?pwd=Tk9MYWptb2dnV01YMm1oN0Q0dEhSdz09">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765?pwd=Tk9MYWptb2dnV01YMm1oN0Q0dEhSdz09</a>  Conference ID: 389 293 1765 Password: 334352
<b>11.10-11.25</b>	<b>Technical break</b>		
<b>11.25-12.05</b>	Meeting with vice-rectors	1) <i>First Vice-Rector - Yessirkepov Marlen Makhmudovich, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Professor</i> 2) <i>Vice-Rector for Financial and Economic Activities – Seitzhanova Zhanna Serikzhanovna, MBA</i> 3) <i>Vice-rector for educational and methodological work - Anartayeva Maria Ulasbekovna, MD, Associate Professor</i>	Link <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765?pwd=Tk9MYWptb2dnV01YMm1oN0Q0dEhSdz09">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765?pwd=Tk9MYWptb2dnV01YMm1oN0Q0dEhSdz09</a>  Conference ID: 389 293 1765 Password: 334352



<b>12.05-12.20</b>	<b>Technical break</b>		
<b>12.20-13.00</b>	Meeting with the heads of structural divisions of the NGO	<p>1) <i>The Head of the department of scientific and clinical work, doctoral and master studies - Zhaksylyk Alikhan Altynkhanovich</i></p> <p>2) <i>The Head of the department of strategic development and international cooperation - Akhmetova Alma Abdugarimovna</i></p> <p>3) <i>Chief Accountant - Dinara Ashirkhanovna Baimbetova</i></p> <p>4) <i>The Head of the department of administrative and legal support - Kabishtayev Orynassar Abdugarimovich</i></p> <p>5) <i>The Head of the educational and methodological center - Doltayeva Bibigul Zaydullaevna</i></p> <p>6) <i>The Head of the Human Resources Department - Yeleusizova Gulsara Lesovna</i></p> <p>7) <i>The Head of the center of practical skills (CPS) - Kalmenov Nurlan Zhumanovich</i></p> <p>8) <i>Dean of internship and employment of graduates - Kemelbekov Kanatzhau Saukhanbekovich</i></p> <p>9) <i>The Head of the registrar's office - Syzdykova Saulet Akmurzayevna</i></p> <p>10) <i>The Head of the Library Information Center (LIC) - Darbicheva Raushan Iskakovna</i></p> <p>11) <i>The Head of the Computer-testing, publishing center (CTIC) - Uksikbayev Maksat</i></p> <p>12) <i>The Head of the Department for Social Affairs and Youth Policy - Salim Yerbol Kaltursynovich</i></p> <p>13) <i>Head of Quality Assurance and QMS Department Yerzhanov Nurlan Amirovich</i></p> <p>14) <i>The Head of the Department of DLT Khalmetova Shakhnoza Abdulakimovna</i></p> <p>15) <i>The Head of the student registration department - Zhipsibayeva Urzhan Konakbayevna</i></p> <p>16) <i>Director of the Department of AEP- Yunusov Samukhzhau Kasymovich</i></p> <p>17) <i>The Head of the office - Spatayeva Gulnara Zhangubekovna</i></p> <p>18) <i>Compliance officer - Pernebayev Nurgali Alikhanovich</i></p> <p>19) <i>Office of commercialization - Bekaryssova Dana</i></p>	<p>Link  <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765?pwd=Tk9MYWptb2dnV01YMm1oN0Q0dEhSdz09">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765?pwd=Tk9MYWptb2dnV01YMm1oN0Q0dEhSdz09</a></p> <p>Conference ID: 389 293 1765          Password: 334352</p>
<b>13.00-14.00</b>	<b>Lunch</b>		
<b>14.00-14.15</b>	EEC` s work	<i>External IAAR Experts</i>	<p>Link  <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765?pwd=Tk9MYWptb2dnV01YMm1oN0Q0dEhSdz09">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765?pwd=Tk9MYWptb2dnV01YMm1oN0Q0dEhSdz09</a></p> <p>Conference ID: 389 293 1765</p>

			Password: 334352 <b>(only for EEC)</b>
<b>14.15-15.00</b>	Interviews with deans	<p>1) <i>Head of the Department of Scientific and Clinical Work, Doctoral and Master's studies - Zhaksylyk Alikhan Altynkhanovich</i></p> <p>2) <i>Dean of the Faculty of Medicine - Sagtaganov Zhaxybek Ilisbekovich</i></p> <p>3) <i>Head of the residency department - Bektenova Gulmira Yerseitovna</i></p> <p>4) <i>Dean of the International Faculty - Tolbasiyeva Arailym Aibatillayevna</i></p> <p>5) <i>Dean of internship and employment of graduates - Kemelbekov Kanatzhan Saukhanbekovich</i></p> <p>6) <i>Dean of the Faculty of Pharmacy - Umurzakhova Galiya Zhanbyrbayevna</i></p>	<p>Link <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765?pwd=Tk9MYWptb2dnV01YMm1oN0Q0dEhSdz09">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765?pwd=Tk9MYWptb2dnV01YMm1oN0Q0dEhSdz09</a></p> <p>Conference ID: 389 293 1765 Password: 334352</p>
<b>15.00-15.15</b>	<b>Technical break</b>		
<b>15.15-16.00</b>	Interviews with the leaders of the EP, heads of departments	<i>Heads of departments, Appendix 1</i>	<p>Link <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765?pwd=Tk9MYWptb2dnV01YMm1oN0Q0dEhSdz09">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765?pwd=Tk9MYWptb2dnV01YMm1oN0Q0dEhSdz09</a></p> <p>Conference ID: 389 293 1765 Password: 334352</p>
<b>16.00-16.15</b>	<b>Technical break</b>		
<b>16.15-17.00</b>	Interview with teaching staff EP	<i>Teachers of the EP, Appendix 2</i>	<p>Link <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765?pwd=Tk9MYWptb2dnV01YMm1oN0Q0dEhSdz09">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765?pwd=Tk9MYWptb2dnV01YMm1oN0Q0dEhSdz09</a></p> <p>Conference ID: 389 293 1765 Password: 334352</p>
<b>17.00-18.30</b>	Questioning of teaching staff (in parallel)	<i>Teachers of the EP, Appendix 2</i>	The link is sent to the e-mail of the teacher personally
<b>17.00-17.15</b>	<b>Technical break</b>		
<b>17.15-18.30</b>	Visual inspection	<p><i>Medicinal Plants Laboratory</i></p> <p><i>Computer Test Publishing Center</i></p> <p><i>SKMA Museum</i></p> <p><i>Anatomical Museum</i></p> <p><i>Genomic Research Laboratory</i></p> <p><i>Library and Information Center</i></p> <p><i>Dining room</i></p> <p><i>Hall</i></p> <p><i>Model of the Hospital University</i></p>	<p>Link <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765?pwd=Tk9MYWptb2dnV01YMm1oN0Q0dEhSdz09">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765?pwd=Tk9MYWptb2dnV01YMm1oN0Q0dEhSdz09</a></p> <p>Conference ID: 389 293 1765 Password: 334352</p>

		<i>dental clinic Practical Skills Center Dormitory</i>	
<b>18.30-18.40</b>	The work of the EEC. Summing up the results of the first day	<i>External IAAR Experts</i>	Link <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765?pwd=Tk9MYWptb2dnV01YMm1oN0Q0dEhSdz09">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765?pwd=Tk9MYWptb2dnV01YMm1oN0Q0dEhSdz09</a>  Conference ID: 389 293 1765 Password: 334352 <b>(only for EEC)</b>
<b>Day 2: April 20, 2023</b>			
<b>10.00-10.15</b>	EEC's work	<i>External IAAR Experts</i>	Link <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765?pwd=Tk9MYWptb2dnV01YMm1oN0Q0dEhSdz09">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765?pwd=Tk9MYWptb2dnV01YMm1oN0Q0dEhSdz09</a>  Conference ID: 389 293 1765 Password: 334352 <b>(only for EEC)</b>
<b>10.15-10.30</b>	<b>Technical break</b>		
<b>10.30-11.10</b>	Interviews with EP students (in parallel)	<i>Students, Appendix 3</i>	Link <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765?pwd=Tk9MYWptb2dnV01YMm1oN0Q0dEhSdz09">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765?pwd=Tk9MYWptb2dnV01YMm1oN0Q0dEhSdz09</a>  Conference ID: 389 293 1765 Password: 334352
<b>11.10-12.30</b>	Questionnaire of students (in parallel)	<i>Students, Appendix 3</i>	The link is sent to the e-mail of the teacher personally
<b>11.10-11.25</b>	<b>Technical break</b>		
<b>11.25-13.00</b>	Work with the documents of the departments and attendance of teaching staff classes according	<i>Timetable of classes, Appendix 4</i>	Link <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765?pwd=Tk9MYWptb2dnV01YMm1oN0Q0dEhSdz09">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765?pwd=Tk9MYWptb2dnV01YMm1oN0Q0dEhSdz09</a>  Conference ID: 389 293 1765 Password: 334352

	to the schedule (Appendix 1A with links to classes)		
<b>13.00-14.00</b>	<b>Lunch</b>		
<b>14.00-14.15</b>	EEC's work	<i>External IAAR Experts</i>	<p>Link  <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765?pwd=Tk9MYWptb2dnV0lYMm1oN0Q0dEhSdz09">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765?pwd=Tk9MYWptb2dnV0lYMm1oN0Q0dEhSdz09</a></p> <p>Conference ID: 389 293 1765          Password: 334352  <b>(only for EEC)</b></p>
<b>14.15-14.30</b>	<b>Technical break</b>		
<b>14.30-16.00</b>	Visiting the practice bases of the EP	<i>Practice bases, Appendix 5</i>	<p>Link  <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765?pwd=Tk9MYWptb2dnV0lYMm1oN0Q0dEhSdz09">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765?pwd=Tk9MYWptb2dnV0lYMm1oN0Q0dEhSdz09</a></p> <p>Conference ID: 389 293 1765          Password: 334352</p>
<b>16.00-16.15</b>	<b>Technical break</b>		
<b>16.15-16.30</b>	EEC's work, discussion	<i>External IAAR Experts</i>	<p>Link  <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765?pwd=Tk9MYWptb2dnV0lYMm1oN0Q0dEhSdz09">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765?pwd=Tk9MYWptb2dnV0lYMm1oN0Q0dEhSdz09</a></p> <p>Conference ID: 389 293 1765          Password: 334352  <b>(only for EEC)</b></p>
<b>16.30-17.10</b>	Interviews with EP employers	<i>Employers' representatives, Appendix 6</i>	<p>Link  <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765?pwd=Tk9MYWptb2dnV0lYMm1oN0Q0dEhSdz09">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765?pwd=Tk9MYWptb2dnV0lYMm1oN0Q0dEhSdz09</a></p> <p>Conference ID: 389 293 1765          Password: 334352</p>
<b>17.10-17.15</b>	<b>Technical break</b>		

17.15-18.00	Interviews with graduates of the EP	<i>Graduates, Appendix 7</i>	<p>Link  <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765?pwd=Tk9MYWptb2dnV01YMm1oN0Q0dEhSdz09">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765?pwd=Tk9MYWptb2dnV01YMm1oN0Q0dEhSdz09</a></p> <p>Conference ID: 389 293 1765          Password: 334352</p>
18.00-18.10	<b>Technical break</b>		
18.10-20.10	EEC work, discussion of the results of the second day and profile parameters ( <i>recording</i> )	<i>External IAAR Experts</i>	<p>Link  <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765?pwd=Tk9MYWptb2dnV01YMm1oN0Q0dEhSdz09">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765?pwd=Tk9MYWptb2dnV01YMm1oN0Q0dEhSdz09</a></p> <p>Conference ID: 389 293 1765          Password: 334352  <b>(only for EEC)</b></p>
<b>Day 3: April 21, 2023</b>			
10.00-11.30	The work of the EEC development and discussion of recommendations ( <i>recording</i> )	<i>External IAAR Experts</i>	<p>Link  <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765?pwd=Tk9MYWptb2dnV01YMm1oN0Q0dEhSdz09">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765?pwd=Tk9MYWptb2dnV01YMm1oN0Q0dEhSdz09</a></p> <p>Conference ID: 389 293 1765          Password: 334352  <b>(only for EEC)</b></p>
11.30-11.45	<b>Technical break</b>		
11.45-13.00	EEC work, development and recommendations	<i>External IAAR Experts</i>	(Individual work of an expert)
13.00-14.00	<b>Lunch</b>		
14.00-16.00	The work of the EEC discussion, decision-making by voting	<i>External IAAR Experts</i>	<p>Link  <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765?pwd=Tk9MYWptb2dnV01YMm1oN0Q0dEhSdz09">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765?pwd=Tk9MYWptb2dnV01YMm1oN0Q0dEhSdz09</a></p> <p>Conference ID: 389 293 1765</p>



	<i>(recordin g)</i>		Password: 334352 <b>(only for EEC)</b>
<b>16.00- 17.00</b>	Preparati on by the chairman of informati on on the results of an external evaluatio n	<i>Chairperson of the EEC</i>	(Individual work of the Chairperson)
<b>17.00- 17.40</b>	Final meeting of the EEC with the leadershi p of the university	<i>Heads of the university and structural divisions</i>	Link <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765?pwd=Tk9MYWptb2dnV01YMm1oN0Q0dEhSdz09">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765?pwd=Tk9MYWptb2dnV01YMm1oN0Q0dEhSdz09</a>  Conference ID: 389 293 1765 Password: 334352
<b>17.40- 17.55</b>	<b>Technical break</b>		
<b>17.55- 19.00</b>	Work of the EEC, Discussio n of the results of the quality assessme nt	<i>External IAAR Experts</i>	Link <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765?pwd=Tk9MYWptb2dnV01YMm1oN0Q0dEhSdz09">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3892931765?pwd=Tk9MYWptb2dnV01YMm1oN0Q0dEhSdz09</a>  Conference ID: 389 293 1765 Password: 334352 <b>(only for EEC)</b>

### Appendix 3. RESULTS OF THE TEACHER'S QUESTIONNAIRE

Total number of questionnaires: 159

1. Your department/faculty?

Faculty of Pharmacy	45,9%
Faculty of Medicine	44%
Internship	2,5%
International Faculty	2,5%
Others	5,1%

2. Your position

Senior Teacher	35,8%
Teacher	28,3%
Docent (Assistant professor)	18,9%
Professor	6,3%
Head of department	2,5%
Assistant	7,5%
Department assistant	0,6%

3. Academic degree, academic title

Doctor of science	2,5%
Candidates	22,6%
Master	46,5%
PhD	3,1%
Professor	2,5%
Docent (Assistant professor)	5%
Honored Worker	0,6%
Without academic degree	23,9%
Others	0,6%

4. Work experience in this university

Over 5 years	47,4 %
1- 5 years	29,5 %

Less than 1 year	6,4 %
Others	16,7%

5. How satisfied the content of the educational program?

Good	51,6 %
Very good	47,8%
Relatively bad	0,6%

6. Does the university provide an opportunity for continuous development of teachers?

Very good	43,4 %
Good	52,2 %
Relatively bad	1,9 %
Bad	2,5%

7. What extent can teachers use their own strategies to?

Very good	36,5%
Good	57,2 %
Relatively bad	4,4%
Bad	1,9%

8. To what extent can teachers use their own methods?

Very good	46,5 %
Good	50,9 %
Relatively bad	1,9 %
Bad	0,6 %

9. To what extent can teachers use their own innovations in the learning process?

Very good	50,9 %
Good	46,5 %
Relatively bad	2,5 %

11. How is the attention of the management of the educational institution paid to the content of the educational program?

Very good	52,2 %
Good	46,5 %

Relatively bad	1,3 %
----------------	-------

12. How do you assess the availability of the necessary scientific and educational literature in the library for teachers?

Very good	52,2 %
Good	44,7 %
Relatively bad	2,5 %
Bad	0,6 %

13. Assess the level of development of conditions for students with different physical abilities?

Very good	35,8 %
Good	59,7 %
Relatively bad	1,9 %
Bad	1,9 %
Very bad	0,6 %

14. Оцените доступность высшего руководства студентам

Очень хорошо	47,8 %
хорошо	49,7 %
Относительно плохо	2,5 %

15. Assess the accessibility of top management to faculty

Very good	44 %
Good	49,1 %
Relatively bad	4,4 %
Bad	1,9%
Very bad	0,6%

16. Assess the involvement of teaching staff in the process of making managerial and strategic decisions

Very good	29,6 %
Good	59,1 %
Relatively bad	6,9 %
Bad	2,5 %
Very bad	1,9 %

17. How is the innovation activity of teaching staff encouraged?

Very good	38,4 %
Good	51,6 %
Relatively bad	6,3 %
Bad	2,5 %
Very bad	1,3%

## 18. Assess the level of feedback from teaching staff with management

Very good	42,1 %
Good	50,3 %
Relatively bad	5 %
Bad	1,9 %
Very bad	0,6 %

## 19. What is the level of stimulation and involvement of young professionals in the educational process?

Very good	42,1 %
Good	49,7 %
Relatively bad	5,7 %
Bad	2,5 %

## 20. Assess how equal opportunities are given to all teaching staff

Very good	38,4 %
хорошо	56,6 %
Relatively bad	3,1 %
Bad	1,3 %
Very bad	0,6 %

## 21. Assess the adequacy of recognition of the potential and abilities of teachers

Very good	37,7 %
Good	57,2 %
Relatively bad	3,8 %
Bad	0,6 %
Very bad	0,6 %

## 22. How is the work on academic mobility organized?



Very good	35,8 %
Good	57,9 %
Relatively bad	5%
Bad	1,3 %

23. How is the work to improve the qualifications of teaching staff organized?

Very good	40,3 %
Good	52,8 %
Relatively bad	3,8 %
Bad	3,1 %

24. Evaluate the support of the university and its leadership for the research initiatives of the teaching staff

Very good	39 %
Good	53,5 %
Relatively bad	6,3 %
Bad	0,6 %
Very bad	0,6 %

25. Assess the speed of development of new educational programs

Very good	40,9 %
Good	57,2 %
Relatively bad	1,3 %
Bad	0,6 %

26. Assess the level of faculty's ability to combine teaching with research

Very good	32,1 %
Good	56 %
Relatively bad	9,4 %
Bad	1,3 %
Very bad	1,3 %

27. Assess the level of the teaching staff's ability to combine teaching with practical activities

Very good	32,7 %
Good	59,7 %
Relatively bad	6,3 %

Bad	0,6 %
Very bad	0,6 %

28. Assess the extent to which students' knowledge obtained at this university corresponds to the realities of the requirements of the modern labor market

Very good	36,5 %
Good	61,6 %
Relatively bad	1,3 %
Very bad	0,6 %

29. How does the leadership and administration of the university perceive criticism?

Very good	25,8 %
Good	54,7 %
Relatively bad	13,2 %
Bad	5 %
Very bad	1,3 %

30. In your opinion, how do the curricula of educational organizations form the ability of students to analyze situations and make forecasts?

Very good	30,2 %
Good	66,7 %
Relatively bad	2,5 %
Very bad	0,6 %

31. Assess how much the share of the rate assigned to you corresponds to your desires and possibilities?

Very good	30,2 %
Good	55,3 %
Relatively bad	10,1 %
Bad	3,8 %
Very bad	0,6 %

32. Why do you work in this university?

Like

Like the profession

I like

Prestige

like

I like

Super university

Graduater

Moving to this city

Opportunity for professional development and career advancement

Good incentive + career growth

There is a perspective  
 I am a patriot of my university and I really like the work in our academy  
 I love this university  
 Because I love my job  
 I defended my Ph.D. thesis at SKMA. Much attention is paid to clinical pharmacology at the university.  
 Like teaching  
 Promising university  
 promising university  
 I like the method of teaching and healing  
 Because everything is transparent, objective. There is an opportunity for career growth  
 for creative work  
 Very potential university  
 Because I'm used to the team  
 discipline high I like it, there is support from management and career growth  
 Because it is easier to work with students than with students  
 Native University  
 It happened  
 Can't find another job  
 Super university  
 Like to teach  
 Everything suits me  
 Difficult to answer  
 I think this university is one of the best  
 Good university  
 Because I know this university and its kings of employees for a long time  
 I like teaching and working with interns  
 The team is very good, I like working with students  
 good conditions and perspective  
 Arranges  
 I like to work at the university  
 good university  
 Ttt  
 I like the academy in all EPs  
 Good conditions for career growth  
 used to  
 Necessary  
 For further development  
 Ability to teach in English  
 Because  
 I like this job  
 professional activities, career development...  
 I like the university, conditions, atmosphere, prestigious  
 I'm satisfied in every way  
 By profession  
 I studied here  
 I like to teach  
 In our region, there is no other worthy medical university or medical faculty in other universities  
 In order to train highly qualified specialists

33. How often do you have workshops and lectures with practitioners in your course?

Very often	25,2 %
Often	46,5 %
Sometimes	25,2 %
Very rarely	2,5 %
Never	0,6 %

34. How often do additionally invited teachers participate in the learning process?

Very often	17 %
Often	46,5 %
Sometimes	31,4 %
Very rarely	2,5 %
Never	2,5 %

35. Как часто Вы сталкиваетесь в своей работе со следующими проблемами:

Often	12,6 %
Sometimes	44,7 %
Never	42,8 %

35.2 Unbalanced study load by semesters

Often	5 %
Sometimes	47,2 %
Never	47,8 %

35.3 Unavailability of required books in the library

Often	5 %
Sometimes	30,2 %
Never	64,8 %

35.4 Переполненность учебных групп (слишком большое количество студентов в группе)

часто	18,9 %
иногда	37,1 %
никогда	44 %

35.5 Inconvenient schedule

Often	11,3 %
Sometimes	42,8 %
Never	45,9 %

35.6 Poor classroom conditions

Often	8,3 %
Sometimes	31,4 %
Never	60,3 %

## 35.7 No internet access

Often	8,2 %
Sometimes	28,9 %
Never	62,9 %

## 35.8 Low discipline of students

Often	2,5 %
Sometimes	44 %
Never	53,5 %

## 35.9 Untimely receipt of information about events

Often	2,5 %
Sometimes	31,4 %
Never	66 %

## 35.10 Lack of technical facilities in classrooms

Often	6,9 %
Sometimes	42,8 %
Never	50,3 %

## 35.11 Other problems

No

No

No

The salary is meager

No problem

no problem

Don't know

Class starts at 8.00

Low salary of teaching staff

Not available

If there are problems, they are solved at every level.

The problem was not

Low salary, no incentives, bonuses. Big load hours.

Ttt

Very low salary, even comparatively

The salary is very small

Lots of student group. Little practice

No problems

There is no opportunity to implement an additional allowance, non-working KPI.

No problem

No problem

Pay for professional development

36. There are many different sides and aspects in the life of the university, which in one way or another affect every teacher and employee. Rate how satisfied you are:

Completely satisfied	52,8 %
----------------------	--------



Partially satisfied	37,1 %
Not satisfied	2,5 %
Difficult to answer	7,5 %

## 36.2 Relationships with direct management

Completely satisfied	67,3 %
Partially satisfied	27,7 %
Not satisfied	0,6 %
Difficult to answer	4,4 %

## 36.2 Relationships with direct management

Completely satisfied	67,3 %
Partially satisfied	27,7 %
Not satisfied	0,6 %
Difficult to answer	4,4 %

## 36.3 Relationships with colleagues in the department

Completely satisfied	86,8 %
Partially satisfied	12,6 %
Difficult to answer	0,6 %

## 36.4 Participation in management decision making

Completely satisfied	51,6 %
Partially satisfied	35,8 %
Not satisfied	7,5 %
Difficult to answer	5%

## 36.5 Relations with students

Completely satisfied	83%
Partially satisfied	16,4 %
Difficult to answer	0,6 %

## 36.6 Recognition of your successes and achievements by the administration

Completely satisfied	57,9 %
Partially satisfied	32,7 %

Not satisfied	5,7 %
Difficult to answer	3,8

## 36.7 Recognition of your successes and achievements by the administration

Completely satisfied	61 %
Partially satisfied	31,4 %
Not satisfied	4,4 %
Difficult to answer	3,1 %

## 36.8 Terms of pay

Completely satisfied	30,8 %
Partially satisfied	35,8 %
Not satisfied	5,7 %
Difficult to answer	27,7 %

## 36.9 Convenience of work, services available at the university

Completely satisfied	54,7 %
Partially satisfied	37,1 %
Not satisfied	3,8 %
Difficult to answer	4,4 %

## 36.10 Occupational health and safety

Completely satisfied	66,7 %
Partially satisfied	28,3 %
Difficult to answer	3,1 %
Not satisfied	1,9 %

## 36.11 Management of changes in the activities of the university

Completely satisfied	54,7 %
Partially satisfied	35,8 %
Difficult to answer	7,5 %
Not satisfied	1,9 %

## 36.12 Provision of benefits: rest, sanatorium treatment, etc.

Completely satisfied	30,2 %
----------------------	--------

Partially satisfied	25,8 %
Difficult to answer	14,5%
Not satisfied	29,6 %

## 36.13 Food system, medical and other services

Completely satisfied	37,7 %
Partially satisfied	28,3 %
Difficult to answer	13,2 %
Not satisfied	20,8 %

## 36.14 Food system, medical and other services

Completely satisfied	40,3 %
Partially satisfied	29,9 %
Difficult to answer	13,6 %
Not satisfied	16,2 %

### Appendix 4. RESULTS OF STUDENT QUESTIONNAIRE

Total number of questionnaires: 94

1. Your educational program?

General medicine	31,9%
Medicine	2,1%
Stomatology	13,8 %
Pediatrics	6,4 %
TPhI	3,2 %
Others	42,6%

2. Gender

Male	42,6%
Female	59,6 %

3. How satisfied are you with: 3.1 Relations with the dean's office

Completely satisfied	81,9 %
----------------------	--------

Partially satisfied	16 %
Partially dissatisfied	2,1%
Not satisfied	0%

## 3.2. Dean's office accessibility level

Completely satisfied	79,8 %
Partially satisfied	17 %
Partially dissatisfied	2,1%
Difficult to answer	1,1%

## 3.3. The level of accessibility and responsiveness of the university management

Completely satisfied	80,9 %
Partially satisfied	17 %
Partially dissatisfied	1,1%
Difficult to answer	1,1%

## 3.4 Availability of academic counseling

Completely satisfied	79,8 %
Partially satisfied	14,9 %
Partially dissatisfied	2,1%

## 3.5 Support with educational materials in the learning process

Completely satisfied	79,8%
Partially satisfied	18,1%
Partially dissatisfied	1,1%
Difficult to answer	1,1%

## 3.6 Availability of personal counseling

Completely satisfied	80,9%
Partially satisfied	13,8 %
Partially dissatisfied	1,1%

Difficult to answer	4,3 %
---------------------	-------

## 3.7 Financial and administrative services of the educational institution

Completely satisfied	74,5%
Partially satisfied	20,2%
Partially dissatisfied	1,1%
Difficult to answer	4,3%

## 3.8 Availability of health services for students

Completely satisfied	76,6 %
Partially satisfied	19,1%
Partially dissatisfied	1,1%
Difficult to answer	2,1%

## 3.9 The quality of the student health service

Completely satisfied	76,6 %
Partially satisfied	21,3 %
Partially dissatisfied	1,1%
Difficult to answer	1,1%

## 3.10 The level of availability of library resources

Completely satisfied	79,8 %
Partially satisfied	16 %
Partially dissatisfied	3,2%
Difficult to answer	1,1%

## 3.11 The quality of services provided in libraries and reading rooms

Completely satisfied	81,9 %
Partially satisfied	16 %
Partially dissatisfied	1,1%
Difficult to answer	1,1%

## 3.12 Satisfaction with the existing educational resources of the university

Completely satisfied	76,6 %
Partially satisfied	21,3 %



Partially dissatisfied	1,1%
Difficult to answer	1,1%

## 3.13 Availability of computer classes and Internet resources

Completely satisfied	85,1 %
Partially satisfied	10,6%
Partially dissatisfied	2,1%
Difficult to answer	1,1%
Not satisfied	1,1 %

## 3.14 The usefulness of the website of educational organizations in general and faculties in particular

Completely satisfied	87,2 %
Partially satisfied	11,7%
Difficult to answer	1,1%

## 3.15 Study rooms, auditoriums for large groups

Completely satisfied	79,8 %
Partially satisfied	12,8%
Difficult to answer	2,1%
Partially dissatisfied	5,3%

## 3.16 Proportionate rooms for small groups

Completely satisfied	78,7 %
Partially satisfied	18,1 %
Difficult to answer	1,1%
Partially dissatisfied	1,1%
Not satisfied	1,1%

## 3.17 Lounges for students (if any)

Completely satisfied	62,8 %
Partially satisfied	12,8 %
Difficult to answer	10,6%
Not satisfied	11,7%
Partially dissatisfied	2,1 %

## 3.18 Clarity of procedure for taking disciplinary action

Completely satisfied	79,8 %
Partially satisfied	17%
Difficult to answer	2,1%
Partially dissatisfied	2,1%

## 3.19 The overall quality of study programs

Completely satisfied	78,9 %
Partially satisfied	16%
Difficult to answer	1,1%
Partially dissatisfied	4,3%

## 3.20 Teaching methods in general

Completely satisfied	78,7%
Partially satisfied	17%
Difficult to answer	1,1%
Partially dissatisfied	3,2%

## 3.21 Quick response to feedback from teachers regarding the educational process

Completely satisfied	80,9 %
Partially satisfied	14,9%
Difficult to answer	1,1%
Partially dissatisfied	3,2%

## 3.22 The quality of teaching

Completely satisfied	83 %
Partially satisfied	13,8 %
Difficult to answer	1,1%
Partially dissatisfied	2,1%

## 3.23 Academic load / requirements for the student

Completely satisfied	73,4 %
Partially satisfied	14,9%
Difficult to answer	1,1%
Partially dissatisfied	7,4%

Not satisfied	3,2%
---------------	------

3.24 Fairness of examinations and certification

Completely satisfied	86,2 %
Partially satisfied	12,8 %
Difficult to answer	3,2%

3.25 Timeliness of student assessment

Completely satisfied	78,7 %
Partially satisfied	20,2 %
Difficult to answer	1,1%

3.26 Explaining to you before entering the rules and strategies of the educational program (specialty)

Completely satisfied	83 %
Partially satisfied	12,8 %
Difficult to answer	2,1%
Partially dissatisfied	2,1 %

3.27 Уровнем исполнения данных правил и стратегий образовательной программы (специальности)

Completely satisfied	85,1%
Partially satisfied	11,7 %
Difficult to answer	1,1%
Partially dissatisfied	2,1%

3.28 Informing the requirements in order to successfully complete this specialty

Completely satisfied	84 %
Partially satisfied	12,8%
Difficult to answer	1,1%
Partially dissatisfied	2,1%

3.29 Conducted tests and exams Like

Completely satisfied	80,9 %
Partially satisfied	14,9%
Difficult to answer	2,1%
Partially dissatisfied	1,1%
Not satisfied	1,1%

## 3.30 Available computer classes

Completely satisfied	80,9 %
Partially satisfied	13,8%
Difficult to answer	2,1%
Partially dissatisfied	3,2%

## 3.31 Available scientific laboratories

Completely satisfied	79,8 %
Partially satisfied	10,6 %
Difficult to answer	2,1%
Partially dissatisfied	5,3 %
Not satisfied	2,1%

## 3.32 Relationship between student and teacher

Completely satisfied	85,1 %
Partially satisfied	11,7 %
Difficult to answer	1,1%
Partially dissatisfied	2,1%

## 3.33 Objectivity and fairness of teachers

Completely satisfied	84 %
Partially satisfied	11,7%
Partially dissatisfied	3,2%
Difficult to answer	1,1%

## 3.34 Informing students about courses, educational programs, and academic degrees

Completely satisfied	83 %
Partially satisfied	12,8%
Partially dissatisfied	2,1%
Difficult to answer	1,1%
Not satisfied	1,1%

## 3.35 Providing students with a hostel

Completely satisfied	81,9 %
Partially satisfied	8,5 %

Difficult to answer	9,6 %
---------------------	-------

## 4. Rate how much you agree:

## 4.1 The course program was clearly presented

Full consent	77,7 %
Agreement	18,1 %
Partially agree	3,2%
Disagree	1,1%

## 4.2 Course content is well structured

Full consent	76,6 %
Agreement	16 %
Partially agree	7,4 %

## 4.3 Key terms adequately explained

Full consent	75,5 %
Agreement	22,3 %
Partially agree	2,1 %

## 4.4 The material taught is up to date.

Full consent	74,5 %
Agreement	19,1%
Partially agree	6,4 %

## 4.5 The teacher uses effective teaching methods

Full consent	74,5 %
Agreement	19,1%
Partially agree	6,4 %

## 4.6 The teacher owns the material being taught

Full consent	73,4 %
Agreement	24,5 %
Partially agree	1,1 %
Disagree	1,1%

## 4.7 The lecturer's presentation is clear

Full consent	74,5 %
Agreement	22,3 %
Partially agree	2,1%
Disagree	1,1%

## 4.8 The teacher presents the material in an interesting way

Full consent	70,2 %
Agreement	25,5%
Partially agree	3,2 %
Disagree	1,1 %

## 4.9 The teacher satisfies my requirements for personal development and professional development

Full consent	76,6 %
Agreement	17 %
Partially agree	6,4 %

## 4.10 The teacher stimulates the activity of students

Full consent	77,7 %
Agreement	16 %
Partially agree	5,3 %
Disagree	1,1 %

## 4.11 The teacher stimulates the creative thinking of students

Full consent	75,5 %
Agreement	18,1%
Partially agree	4,3 %
Disagree	2,1%

## 4.12 Appearance and manners of the teacher are adequate

Full consent	79,8 %
Agreement	17 %
Partially agree	3,2 %

## 4.13 The teacher has a positive attitude towards students

Full consent	77,7 %
--------------	--------



Agreement	17 %
Partially agree	5,3 %

## 4.14 Continuous assessment (seminars, tests, questionnaires, etc.) reflects the content of the course

Full consent	76,6%
Agreement	17%
Partially agree	6,4 %

## 4.15 Evaluation criteria used by the instructor are clear

Full consent	75,5 %
Agreement	20,2 %
Partially agree	4,3 %

## 4.16 The teacher objectively evaluates the achievements of students

Full consent	74,5 %
Agreement	21,3 %
Partially agree	4,3 %

## 4.17 The teacher speaks in a professional language

Full consent	76,6 %
Agreement	17 %
Partially agree	3,8 %

## 4.18 The organization of education provides sufficient opportunities for sports and other leisure activities.

Full consent	70,2 %
Agreement	20,2 %
Partially agree	8,5 %
Disagree	1,1 %

## 4.19 Facilities and equipment for students are safe, comfortable and modern

Full consent	73,4 %
Agreement	20,2 %
Partially agree	5,3 %
Complete disagreement	1,1 %

## 4.20 The library is well stocked and has a fairly good collection of books.

Full consent	75,5 %
--------------	--------

Agreement	17 %
Partially agree	5,3 %
Disagree	2,1 %

## 4.21 Equal opportunities are provided to all students

Full consent	75,5 %
Agreement	18,1 %
Partially agree	5,3 %
Complete disagreement	1,1 %

## Other issues regarding the quality of teaching

No

Missing

No

No problem

No

Everything is at a high level

-

None as such.

Net

No problem

No

there are no problems

Improve digitalization in the educational process

No

Everything is old lack of materials for laboratory work