



«АККРЕДИТЕУ ЖӘНЕ РЕЙТИНГТИҢ  
ТӘУЕЛСІЗ АГЕНТТІГІ» КЕМ

НУ «НЕЗАВИСИМОЕ АГЕНТСТВО  
АККРЕДИТАЦИИ И РЕЙТИНГА»

INDEPENDENT AGENCY FOR  
ACCREDITATION AND RATING

# REPORT

On the results of the work of the External Expert Evaluation  
Commission for compliance with the requirements of the Standards for  
International Primary Accreditation of Basic Medical and  
Pharmaceutical Education Abroad  
(based on WFME/AMSE standards)  
Program Accreditation 31.05.03 "Dentistry"

FSGFEI HE VolgSMU  
Ministry of Healthcare of Russia

from December 13 to December 15, 2023

**INDEPENDENT ACCREDITATION AND RATING AGENCY**  
**External Expert Commission**

**Addressed**  
**Accreditation**  
**IAAR Council**



«АККРЕДИТТЕУ ЖӘНЕ РЕЙТИНГТІҢ  
ТӘУЕЛСІЗ АГЕНТТІГІ» КЕМ

НУ «НЕЗАВИСИМОЕ АГЕНТСТВО  
АККРЕДИТАЦИИ И РЕЙТИНГА»

INDEPENDENT AGENCY FOR  
ACCREDITATION AND RATING

**REPORT**

**On the results of the work of the External Expert Evaluation Commission  
for compliance with the requirements of the Standards for International Primary  
Accreditation of Basic Medical and Pharmaceutical Education Abroad  
(based on WFME/AMSE standards)  
Program Accreditation 31.05.03 "Dentistry"**

**FSGFEI HE VolgSMU  
Ministry of Healthcare of Russia**

**from December 13 to December 15, 2023**

**Volgograd, 2023**

## Contents

(I) LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS.....	3
(II) INTRODUCTION .....	4
(III) INTRODUCTION OF THE EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION .....	4
(IV) DESCRIPTION OF THE PREVIOUS ACCREDITATION PROCEDURE .....	6
(V) DESCRIPTION OF THE VISIT OF EEC .....	6
(VI) COMPLIANCE WITH PROGRAM ACCREDITATION STANDARDS .....	9
6.1. <i>Mission and Results Standard</i> .....	9
6.2. <i>Standard "Educational Program"</i> .....	12
6.3. <i>Student Assessment Standard</i> .....	16
6.4. <i>Standard "Learners"</i> .....	19
6.5. <i>Academic Staff/Faculty Standard</i> .....	22
6.6. <i>Educational Resources Standard</i> .....	25
6.7. <i>Standard "Evaluation of Educational Programs"</i> .....	29
6.8. <i>Management and Administration Standard</i> .....	31
6.9. <i>Constant Update Standard</i> .....	35
(VII) AN OVERVIEW OF STRENGTHS/BEST PRACTICES FOR EACH STANDARD .....	39
(VIII) OVERVIEW OF QUALITY IMPROVEMENT RECOMMENDATIONS .....	40
(IX) REVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE DEVELOPMENT OF EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATIONS.....	41
(X) RECOMMENDATION TO THE ACCREDITATION BOARD.....	41
Annex 1. Evaluation Table "PROGRAM PROFILE PARAMETERS" .....	42

**(I) LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS**

PRS	—	Point-rating system
SFA	—	State Final Attestation
GIS Contingent	—	Unified Federal Interdepartmental System of Registration of the Contingent of Students
CPE	—	Continuing professional education
EGISM VAK	—	Unified State Information System for Monitoring of the Higher Attestation Commission
c.u.	—	Credits
LNA	—	Local Regulations
Persons with LHC	—	Persons with disabilities
MTO	—	Logistics
Ministry of Healthcare of Russia	—	Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation
LHC	—	Disability
EP	—	Educational process
BVEP	—	The main professional educational program of higher education is the Specialist's program
IA	—	Intermediate Attestation
TS	—	Teaching Staff
PFHD	—	Plan of financial and economic activities
WP	—	Work program
WPD	—	Work program of the discipline
PM	—	Internship Program
RUE	—	Working Curriculum
MIND	—	Educational and Methodical Department
FAC	—	Federal Accreditation Center of the Academy
FSES HE	—	Federal State Educational Standard of Higher Education
FIS SFA and Receptions	—	Federal Information System of State Final Attestation and Admission
FIS FRDO	—	Federal Information System "Federal Register of Information on Documents on Education and (or) Qualifications, Documents on Training"
FAT	—	Valuation Fund
FRMO	—	Automated system of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation
CCUMS	—	Central Coordination Educational and Methodological Council
TSUMK	—	Cyclic Educational and Methodical Commission

## **(II) INTRODUCTION**

In accordance with Order No. 172-23-OD dated 13.10.2023 of the Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating, from December 13 to 15, 2023, an external expert commission assessed the compliance of the educational program 31.05.03 Dentistry (Specialist) of Volgograd State Medical University with the standards for international accreditation of basic medical and pharmaceutical education programs (based on WFME/ AMSE/ ESG) No. 150-22-OD dated December 21, 2022, third edition).

The report of the External Expert Commission (EEC) contains an assessment of the submitted educational program against the IAAR criteria, recommendations of the EEC for further improvement of the educational program and the parameters of the profile of educational programs.

### **Composition of the EEC:**

1) **Chairman of the IAAR Commission** – Dosmagambetova Raushan Sultanovna, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Medical University of Karaganda (Republic of Kazakhstan) *Off-line participation*

2) **IAAR Expert** – Kainarbayeva Maigul Seidullaevna, Ph.D., Head of Department, Asfendiyarov Kazakh National Medical University (Republic of Kazakhstan) *Off-line participation*

3) **IAAR Expert** – Elena A. Kiseleva, MD, PhD, Professor, Head of the Department of General Practice Dentistry of the Medical Institute of Kemerovo State University of the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Russian Federation, (Russian Federation) *Off-line participation*

4) **IAAR Expert** – Natalia V. Lapova, Ph.D., Associate Professor, Dean of the Faculty of Pharmacy, Vitebsk State Medical University (Republic of Belarus) *On-line*

5) **IAAR Expert , Employer** – Polina V., Medicina Plus LLC, Russian Federation (Russian Federation) *On-line participation*

6) **IAAR expert , student** – Oksana Mikhailovna Anisimova, 5th year student of the Institute of Clinical Medicine, Samara State Medical University (Russian Federation) *On-line participation*

7) **IAAR Coordinator** – Malika Saidulaeva, Project Manager of the Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating (Republic of Kazakhstan) *Off-line participation*

## **(III) INTRODUCTION OF THE EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION**

The FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia was founded in 1935 as the Stalingrad State Medical Institute (Decree of the Council of People's Commissars of the USSR dated 17.08.1935 No. 1818). By the Decree of the Presidium of the Supreme Soviet of the USSR of October 2, 1985, VSMI was awarded the Order of the Red Banner of Labor for its merits in the training of qualified specialists, the development of public health and medical science.

In 1993, the Volgograd Medical Institute was transformed into the Volgograd Medical Academy (Order of the Council of Ministers – the Government of the Russian Federation dated 25.06.1993 No. 1127-R, the Order of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia dated 12.07.1993 No. 159).

In 2003, the Volgograd Medical Academy was renamed into the State Educational Institution of Higher Professional Education "Volgograd State Medical University" of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia (Order of the Ministry of Education of the Russian Federation dated 08.01.2003 No. 10, Order of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia dated 11.02.2003 No. 102). In accordance with the Decree of the Government of the Russian Federation dated 10.09.2008 No. 1300-r, the University was assigned to the jurisdiction of the Ministry of Health and Social Development of the Russian Federation.

In accordance with the order of the Ministry of Health and Social Development of the Russian Federation dated 28.04.2012 No. 434, the university was reorganized in the form of joining it as a separate subdivision (branch) of the State Educational Institution of Higher Professional Education "Pyatigorsk State Pharmaceutical Academy" of the Ministry of Health and Social Development of the Russian Federation.

By the Decree of the Government of the Russian Federation dated 19.07.2012 No. 1286-r, the university was assigned to the jurisdiction of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia. Changes in the official name of the university are presented in Appendix 2.

FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia is a legal entity – a budgetary institution (non-profit organization) established in accordance with the legislation of the Russian Federation; By type it is an institution of higher education, by type it is a specialized university.

By the decision of the Administration of the Volgograd Region dated 05.07.1993 No. 3531 (information on the registration of a legal entity before 01.07.2002) it was registered in the Unified State Register of Legal Entities under No. 1023403441380.

The founder of the university is the Russian Federation; the powers of the Founder are exercised by the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia. The activities of the university are organized in accordance with the Charter approved by the order of the Ministry of Health of Russia dated 23.06.2016 No. 396, which is amended as necessary.

VolgSMU has a special permit (extract from the register of licenses) for the right to carry out educational activities; Certificate of State Accreditation No. 3181 dated 10.07.2019 and two annexes to it, issued by the Federal Service for Supervision in Education and Science, giving the right to carry out educational activities within the framework of the main university in three enlarged groups of specialties of secondary vocational education, four enlarged groups of areas of higher education of the first stage - bachelor's programs, five enlarged groups of specialties of higher education of the second stage - Two enlarged groups of higher education training areas of the second stage – master's programs, thirteen enlarged groups of higher education specialties of the third stage – training of highly qualified personnel (of which ten groups of specialties in postgraduate programs for the training of scientific and pedagogical personnel and three enlarged groups of specialties under residency programs).

The total number of students at the main university at the I and II levels of higher education at the university is 1222 people, of which 46 are foreign citizens.

The university has 10 scientific directions/scientific schools, 13 schools of excellence, 7 dissertation councils in the parent university and 1 dissertation council in the branch.

The university has wide international recognition, as evidenced by the export of educational services (over the past three years, the number of foreign students has been approximately 42.6% – see Appendix 4 to the CB); 17 existing agreements with partners from 6 countries; More than 4500 specialists with a diploma of VolgSMU work in 127 countries of the world.

As part of the creation of competitive educational programs, VolgSMU signed an agreement on the implementation of joint educational programs with the Bukhara State Medical University named after Abu Ali ibn Sino (Uzbekistan) in the specialties of General Medicine, Dentistry, and Pediatrics.

A project is being worked out with the Urenche branch of the Tashkent Medical Academy on SOPs in the direction of "Dentistry" and on continuing professional education programs, and the trajectory of cooperation with Jinzhou Medical University (China) is also being worked out in terms of the implementation of an educational program in the specialty of Dentistry according to the 5+0 model.

Active work is underway to recognize VolgSMU diplomas in foreign countries. On 07.10.2023, a cooperation agreement was signed with the National Union of Medical Students, which is the official representative of the International Association of Medical Students - IFMSA. This association provides an opportunity to undergo internships in different countries of



the world, including Russia, as well as to create local committees at the university to work on the current agenda of the WHO and the UN. Since the summer of 2023, work has been resumed within the framework of the Association of International Students of Russia.

There is an expansion of the geography of admission and an increase in the share of foreign students in the total number of students. Thus, the number of students from South American countries has increased: in the 2023-2024 academic year, 17 students from South American countries (1 student from Colombia, 16 students from Ecuador) are studying at VolgSMU.

As part of positioning VolgSMU as a provider of interests of regional Russian universities and companies abroad, close cooperation has been established with Jordan and India.

Thus, a full range of agreements has been signed with Jordan (University of Jordan) (the last one will be in 2023), which provides opportunities for expanding cooperation, including through IFMSA. In India, VolgSMU is one of the most recognizable medical universities.

Work is underway in the direction of recognition of the Faculty of Dentistry of VolgSMU, for which a dossier of the university has been prepared for sending to the Dental Council of the country. As part of the implementation of the direction for the internationalization of scientific research at VolgSMU, the issue of cooperation with the Mazandaran University of Medical Sciences (Islamic Republic of Iran) is being worked out in four areas: clinical pharmacology, medicinal chemistry, pharmacology, chemistry.

Also, due to the large number of Egyptian students, work has been underway with Port Said University since 2022 to sign a cooperation agreement.

The university is represented in the following international ranking systems:

Scimago institutions rankings (SIR) – 569th place;

MosIUR – Three University Missions or Moscow International Ranking (Russia) – 1001st place;

It is present in the DEQAR database – the results of external quality control (contains information about accredited higher education institutions and educational programs).

#### **(IV) DESCRIPTION OF THE PREVIOUS ACCREDITATION PROCEDURE**

International program accreditation EP 31.05.03 Dentistry (Specialist) according to IAAR standards is held for the first time.

#### **(V) DESCRIPTION OF THE VISIT OF EEC**

The visit of the External Expert Commission (hereinafter referred to as the EEC) to the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia was organized and held from December 13 to December 15, 2023 in accordance with the Program approved by the Director of the NU "IAAR" Zhumagulova A.B. and agreed with the rector of the university Shkarin Vladimir Vyacheslavovich.

A preliminary meeting was held on November 12, 2023, which was attended by all members of the EEC.

During the visit, the EEC studied the regulatory and educational documents for the accredited university, educational and methodological complexes of disciplines, methodological documents, visited the structural divisions and departments stated in the program, which ensure the implementation of the educational process, and also checked the operation of information systems used by the University to conduct classes online.

All the materials requested by the commission were provided by the university representatives in a timely manner.

In order to obtain objective information on the assessment of the activities of the FSGFEI

HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia, the members of the EEC carried out: visual inspection of classrooms, laboratories, libraries, clinical bases and their own clinics and other premises that provide training sessions; observation, interviewing of employees of various structural divisions, teachers, employers, questionnaires of the teaching staff and students.

On the part of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia, the presence of all employees and persons specified in the Visit Program was ensured. The three-day program for the EEC program accreditation has been completed in full, in accordance with the distribution of activities by day.

On the first day, December 13, 2023, a preliminary meeting of the Chairman and members of the IAAR EEC was held, during which the goals, program, responsibility of the EEC members were announced.

Members of the EEC discussed key issues, identified additional information that should be requested from the structural divisions of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia for validation and confirmation of the reliability of information/data during accreditation.

The meeting with Rector Vladimir Vyacheslavovich Shkarin took place according to the program, an oral presentation was made on the current activities of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia.

A meeting was held with the Vice-Rectors of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia (First Vice-Rector – Alexander N. Akinchits, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor; Vice-Rector for Educational Activities – Dmitry V. Mikhailchenko, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor; Vice-Rector for Research – Sergey Viktorovich Poroiskiy, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor; Vice-Rector for the Development of Regional Health Care and Medical Activities, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor – Olga Nikolaevna Barkanova).

After that, a meeting was held with the heads of structural divisions of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia (Head of the Department of Educational Programs - Mikhail Vladimirovich Bukatin; Head of the Educational Department - Irina Viktorovna Kagitina; Head of the Human Resources Department - Natalia Ivanenko; Head of the Information Development Department - Sergey Bezborodov; Assistant to the Rector - Mikhail Yakovlevich Ledyayev; Director of the Pre-University - Lyubov Belova Ivanovna; Director of the Center for Continuing Education – Irina Sidorova; Director of the Library – Valentina Dolgova; Head of the Department of Training of Medical Personnel in Residency – Natalia Gennadijevna Chepurina; Head of the Department of Continuing Professional Education – Igor Viktorovich Nefedov; Head of the Youth Policy Department – Ekaterina Troitskaya; Head of the Department of Postgraduate and Doctoral Studies – Olga Golitsyna).

A meeting was held in the mode of interviews with the heads of the faculties (Dean of the Faculty of Medicine – Kalashnikova Svetlana Aleksandrovna; Dean of the Faculty of Dentistry – Makedonova Yulia Alekseevna; Dean of the Faculty of Pharmacy – Rogova Natalia Vyacheslavovna), in the meeting with experts of the EEC took an active part and highlighted the main areas of their activities in terms of organizing the educational process, developing, implementing and managing educational programs, working with students and faculty, interaction with the rectorate and other structures of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia.

Subsequently, a meeting was held with the heads of the EP "Dentistry" and the heads of the departments of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia, basic and specialized disciplines (Deputy Dean of the Faculty of Dentistry - Fursik Denis Ivanovich; Head of the Department of Therapeutic Dentistry - Firsova Irina Valerievna; Head of the Department of Surgical Dentistry and Clinical Dentistry - Yarygina Elena Nikolaevna; Head of the Department of Orthopedic Dentistry with a Course of Clinical Dentistry - Shemonaev Viktor Ivanovich; Head. Head of the Department of Pediatric Dentistry – Iryna Fomenko; Acting Head of the Department of Orthodontics – Ogonyan Elena Aleksandrovna; Head. Head of the



Department of Dermatology and Venereology – Svetlana Nikolaevna Shchava; Head of the Department of Pathophysiology, Clinical Pathophysiology – Rodion Kudrin).

During the interviews with them, information was obtained about the implementation of the educational process at the departments, the conditions that the university provides for their activities, answers were received to questions about the motivation and stimulation of teaching staff, admission and career growth, financial support for teaching staff and other aspects.

At the meeting with the teaching staff of the departments of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia, in particular with representatives of basic biomedical sciences, behavioral and social sciences, medical ethics, medical jurisprudence, clinical and professional disciplines, the experts of the EEC asked questions about the implementation of educational, scientific and clinical processes in the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia, opportunities for career growth, stimulation of teaching staff, provision of the educational process with the necessary resources (material, technical, informational, etc.), interaction with administrative and management structures. Further, the teaching staff took part in the survey.

During the visual inspection of the material and technical equipment of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia, the experts of the EEC visited the own clinics of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia, the simulation center, which is also an accreditation center.

During the day, there were discussions and exchange of expert opinions, as well as the development of policies and the definition of issues in order to obtain the necessary information. On 02.03.2023, EEC experts met with students of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia.

The meeting was held in the form of interviews, the issues of student support at the university, the functioning of the student representation, the participation of students in the activities of the university, in the development of educational programs and other issues were revealed.

Subsequently, the students took part in a questionnaire. Visual inspection and attendance of classes were carried out at the departments of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia. The department demonstrated a lesson with students of 4-5 courses, methodological materials for students, a lesson plan, control tools, literature for independent study.

A conversation was held with Russian and foreign students, they expressed their positive opinion about the activities of clinics, departments, the university as a whole, and the educational process.

Experts of the EEC selectively visited the bases of practical training at the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia.

There was a meeting with employers. Alexander Viktorovich Osokin (Chief Physician of the State Autonomous Healthcare Institution SP No. 3) and Sergey Mikhailovich Gatsenko (Chief Physician of the State Autonomous Healthcare Institution SP No. 8) were present at the interview with the members of the EEC as employers in the Dentistry EP.

There is evidence that the university closely cooperates with clinical bases, implements clinical training at clinical bases, graduates work in these organizations, through events such as a job fair, young specialists are selected and invited to work, employers participate in the formation of the educational program partly by familiarizing them.

In total, 85 representatives of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia took part in the face-to-face meetings (Table 1).

Table 1 - Information about employees and trainees who took part in meetings with the IAAR EEC:

Category of participants	Quantity
Rector	1
Vice-Rectors	4
Heads of structural subdivisions	12
Deans of Faculties	3
Heads of Departments	15
Teachers	24
Studying	22
Graduates	2
Employers	2
<b>Altogether</b>	<b>85</b>

412 representatives of the teaching staff (48.5% – EP General Medicine, 19.4% – EP Dentistry, 18.9% – EP Pharmacy) and 1406 students (56.1% – EP General Medicine, 28.2% – EP Dentistry, 15.6% – EP Pharmacy) took part in the survey.

According to the results of the survey: **The level of communication between the management and the teaching staff** was assessed as very good and good by 88.1%; 94% of teaching staff are satisfied with the level of attention that the management of the educational institution pays to the content of the educational program; 93.3% of teaching staff are satisfied with the availability of the necessary scientific and educational literature in the library for teachers, 92% - with the openness and accessibility of management for the teaching staff, 81% - with the involvement of the teaching staff in the process of making managerial and strategic decisions, 89.2% - with equal opportunities for all teaching staff, 89.2% are fully satisfied with the attitude of the university management to the teaching staff.

The results of the student survey showed that students were completely satisfied with the level of accessibility of the dean's office in 93% of cases, the availability of academic counseling in 61.8% of cases, the availability of counseling on personal problems in 77%, the level of accessibility of library resources in 89.5%, the general quality of educational programs in 88.3%, and teaching methods in general in 91.3%.

During the three days of the EEC's work, as well as after the end of all interviews and visits, the experts discussed the university's indicators for their compliance with the parameters of program accreditation, and developed recommendations.

On 15.12.2023, at the end of the work, EEC experts met with the management and responsible persons of the university, shared their impressions and familiarized them with the recommendations developed based on the results of the work carried out.

## **(VI) COMPLIANCE WITH PROGRAM ACCREDITATION STANDARDS**

### **6.1. Mission and Results Standard**

- An educational organization should:
  - ✓ define the mission of the EP and communicate it to stakeholders and the health sector.
  - ✓ reflect the goals and educational strategy in the mission of the EP to prepare a competent specialist at the level of higher education in the field of health care with an appropriate basis for further career in any field of health care, including all types of practice, administrative medicine and scientific research in health care; able to perform the role and functions of a specialist in accordance with the established requirements of the health sector; prepared for postgraduate education and committed to lifelong learning.
  - ✓ Ensure that the mission incorporates research advances in the biomedical, clinical, pharmaceutical, behavioral and social sciences, aspects of global health, and reflects major international health issues.
- An educational organization should:

✓ *Have institutional autonomy to develop and implement quality assurance policies, for which the administration and teachers are responsible, especially with regard to the development of the educational program and the allocation of resources necessary for the implementation of the educational program.*

✓ *Provide academic freedom for staff and students to implement the educational program and use the results of new research to improve the study of specific disciplines/issues without expanding the EP.*

- *An educational organization should:*

✓ *Identify the expected learning outcomes that learners are expected to achieve at the end of the training in relation to achievement at the basic level in terms of knowledge, skills and professional attitudes; an appropriate foundation for a future career in any area of the healthcare industry; future roles in the health sector; postgraduate training; commitment to lifelong learning; the needs of public health, the needs of the health system and other aspects of social responsibility*

✓ *Ensure proper behaviour of students towards classmates, teachers, medical staff, patients and their relatives*

✓ *publish the expected learning outcomes of the EP*

✓ *Identify and coordinate the relationship between the learning outcomes required at completion and those required in postgraduate studies*

✓ *provide for the possibility of students to participate in research in the relevant field of health care*

✓ *Pay attention to expected learning outcomes related to global health*

- *An educational organization should:*

✓ *Ensure the participation of key stakeholders in the formulation of the mission and expected learning outcomes*

✓ *ensure that the stated mission and expected learning outcomes are based on the opinions/suggestions of other stakeholders*

### ***Evidence***

All stakeholders participated in the development and approval of the Mission: faculty, students, representatives of the practical sphere, and employers.

The BVEP is developed by the teachers of the departments, as well as working groups including members of the Academic Council, cyclical methodological commissions, the Central Coordination Educational and Methodological Council with the involvement of practical health care workers and students, coordinated with the Educational and Methodological Department and approved by the decision of the Academic Council of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia.

In the development of the BVEP, the Faculty has enough independence in choosing the number of biomedical, behavioral, clinical disciplines, the inclusion of elective disciplines (optional disciplines), types of practices, i.e. ensuring their compliance with national and international requirements as much as possible.

Every year on September 1, the HR department analyzes the provision of both departments and programs with professional personnel. To organize the educational process in clinical disciplines, the capabilities of the Federal Accreditation Center are used, which provides simulation training for students to develop practical skills, form clinical skills based on situation modeling, which allows students to obtain the right basic safety skills for patients, while reducing risks in the provision of medical care in the future. There are phantoms for the use of dental manipulations, technologies for monitoring the correctness of tooth preparation, injections, etc.

As a result of mastering the specialist program, the graduate should form universal, general professional and professional competencies of the FSES HE 31.05.03 Dentistry, implemented through knowledge, skills and possessions (Passport of competencies in the specialty 31.05.03 Dentistry, included in the BVEP). A specialist who has completed the BVEP can carry out the following types of professional activities: 01 Education and science (in the field of scientific research); 02 Health care (in the field of medical care for dental diseases); 07 Administrative, managerial and office activities (in the field of activities of healthcare organizations).

The assessment of the final results of mastering the BVEP in the form of the formation of all competencies enshrined in the educational program is carried out during the State Final Attestation of Graduates. Based on the results of the SFA, the commission, in addition to making decisions on the assignment of the appropriate qualification, forms a report in which it reflects its

opinion on the level of training of students, the main shortcomings in their training (Minutes No. 11 dated 06/30/2022). These data are reported and analyzed at the Academic Council Academy, where an action plan is adopted to eliminate the comments of the chairmen of the SEC in the relevant specialty (Minutes No. 3 dated 10/31/2022). This assessment is a direct feedback for the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia on the formation of clinical competencies in its graduates.

In order to study the needs and expectations of consumers of educational services of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia and all interested parties, to improve the quality of education at the Academy within the framework of the quality management system, internal independent assessment of the quality of education, questionnaires have been developed and a survey of students, teachers, employers and graduates is being conducted (Sociological Research).

The questionnaire process is automated for the convenience and efficiency of information collection. The results are discussed at the meetings of the Academic Council of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia, presented at educational and methodological conferences and used to improve the curriculum and the educational program as a whole.

### *Analytical part*

EEC experts note that within the framework of the standard "Mission and Results" in the specialty "Dentistry" of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia, in the course of the work of the expert commission and the analysis of the submitted documentation, compliance with the requirements of the standard was revealed.

The analysis of the compliance of the activities of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia and the Faculty of Dentistry with the criteria of this Standard, in general, indicates the presence of a Development Strategy in the university that corresponds to the mission and vision.

The management carries out a number of activities on target indicators of the areas of activity, monitoring and improvement activities. Members of the EEC note that the Mission of the EP "Dentistry" is brought to the attention of interested parties by means of notification in the media, by distribution by e-mail to all divisions of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia, teaching staff, students, by placing on the information stands of the departments. However, EEC experts note that during interviews with faculty, students, employers and alumni, the mission and vision were not interpreted.

The EP in the specialty "Dentistry" is designed on the basis of the mission and taking into account the requirements of the federal educational standard and allows you to train a competent doctor capable of the following types of professional activities: medical organizational and managerial; research.

This allows a graduate of the Dental Studies programme to choose career paths. When a graduate is oriented to a medical type of professional activity, he/she has the opportunity, after receiving a certificate, to find a job in medical institutions as a dentist or to continue training in residency, to carry out research activities in the process of training in postgraduate or doctoral programs, preparation and defense of scientific and qualification work. The available material resources are used responsibly, in order to adequately implement the designated mission and goals of the EP "Dentistry".

Members of the EEC note that great importance is attached to the formation of proper behavior among students in relation to colleagues, teachers, administration, patients and their relatives.

At the same time, the members of the EEC note that the stakeholders of the EP "Dentistry" (students and employers, etc.) found it difficult to clearly reproduce the mission of the EP during interviews with members of the EEC and to give specific examples of what exactly was their personal participation in the development of the mission and vision of the FSBEI HE of the VolgSMU of the Ministry of Health of Russia and the EP. In the course of the visit and



interviews, the members of the EEC did not receive a complete and detailed idea of what events were held at the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia in order to discuss the mission and final results of the EP in the specialty "Dentistry".

Satisfactory marks were given by the members of the EEC on those items that formally correspond to the standard, but require increased attention if the criteria of the standards are met.

***Strengths/Best Practices:***

No strengths were identified for this standard.

***Recommendations of the EEC:***

1) Communicate to all stakeholders the mission, quality policy and vision of the organization (deadline – 01.09.2024);

2) The management of the EP is recommended to involve stakeholders in the development of the EP mission in the specialty "Dentistry" on an ongoing basis (deadline – 01.09.2024);

3) It is recommended that the heads of the Dentistry EP regularly (at least once a year) study, analyze and document the opinions/proposals of stakeholders regarding the mission, vision and final results of training (deadline – 01.09.2024).

***Quantitative indicators reflecting the organization's compliance with the criteria of the Standard are as follows:***

*Strong positions – 0*

*satisfactory – 9*

*Suggest improvements – 3*

*Unsatisfactory – 0*

**6.2. Standard "Educational Program"**

- *An educational organization should:*
  - ✓ *Define the specifications of the EP, including a statement of expected learning outcomes, a curriculum based on a modular or spiral structure, and the qualifications obtained as a result of mastering the program*
  - ✓ *Use teaching and learning methods that stimulate, prepare, and support learners to take responsibility for the learning process*
  - ✓ *ensure that the EP is implemented in accordance with the principles of equality.*
  - ✓ *Develop learners' lifelong learning abilities*
- *An educational organization should:*
  - ✓ *Inculcate the principles of scientific methodology, including analytical and critical thinking, throughout the curriculum; Research Methods in Healthcare and Evidence-Based Medicine*
  - ✓ *include the results of modern scientific research in the EP*
- *An educational organization should:*
  - ✓ *identify and include in the EP the achievements of basic biomedical sciences in order to form students' understanding of scientific knowledge, concepts and methods that are the basis for the acquisition and practical application of clinical scientific knowledge*
  - ✓ *Change the educational curriculum to take into account the achievements of the biomedical sciences, reflecting scientific, technological, medical and pharmaceutical developments, the current and expected needs of society and the health care system*
- *An educational organization should:*
  - ✓ *Identify and incorporate into the curriculum the achievements of the behavioral sciences, social sciences, medical/pharmaceutical ethics, and jurisprudence*
  - ✓ *modify the EP, taking into account the achievements of behavioral and social sciences, medical/pharmaceutical ethics and jurisprudence, including modern scientific, technological and medical and pharmaceutical developments, current and expected needs of society and the health care system; Changing demographic and cultural context*
- *An educational organization should:*
  - ✓ *Identify and incorporate advances in clinical/pharmaceutical sciences into the EP to ensure that trainees have acquired sufficient knowledge, clinical and professional skills upon completion of training to assume appropriate responsibilities in subsequent professional activities;*
  - ✓ *Ensure that trainees spend a sufficient portion of the program in planned patient contacts, service users, in appropriate clinical/industrial settings, and gain experience in health promotion and disease prevention*



- ✓ *determine the amount of time allocated to the study of the main clinical/specialized disciplines*
- ✓ *Provide training with appropriate attention to the safety of the learning environment and patients, including observation of the trainee's activities in clinical/industrial settings*
- ✓ *Change the EP, taking into account the achievements of scientific, technological, medical and pharmaceutical developments, the current and expected needs of society and the health care system*
- ✓ *Ensure that each trainee has early contact with real patients, consumers of services, including their gradual participation in the provision of services and including responsibility for:*
  - *in terms of examination and/or treatment of the patient under supervision in an appropriate clinical setting;*
  - *in the procedures of sanitary and epidemiological surveillance in terms of inspection and/or inspection of the facility under supervision, which is carried out in the relevant production bases (sanitary and epidemiological examination centers, territorial departments of sanitary and epidemiological control, including transport, disinfection organizations and health care facilities);*
  - *in terms of consulting the patient on the rational use of medicines, which is carried out in the appropriate production conditions*
- ✓ *Structure the various components of training in clinical, hygienic, environmental and occupational monitoring and other work-related skills according to the specific phase of the training programme*
- *An educational organization should:*
  - ✓ *describe the content, scope and sequence of disciplines/modules, including the appropriate relationship between core biomedical, behavioural, social and clinical/core disciplines*
  - ✓ *provide for the horizontal integration of related sciences and disciplines;*
  - ✓ *Provide for vertical integration of clinical/specialized sciences with basic biomedical and behavioral and social sciences*
  - ✓ *provide an opportunity for elective content (electives) and determine the balance between the mandatory and elective parts of the Civic Chamber*
  - ✓ *to determine the relationship with complementary medicine, including non-traditional, traditional or alternative practices, occupational medicine, including aspects of the impact of the environment and technogenic production loads, the social situation on the health of the population*
- *An educational organization should:*
  - ✓ *Define procedures for the development, approval and revision of the EP.*
  - ✓ *Identify a committee, under the guidance of academic leadership, responsible for planning and implementing the EP to ensure that the expected learning outcomes are achieved*
  - ✓ *to ensure the representation of teachers, students, representatives from other stakeholders, including representatives from clinical, industrial bases, graduates of the PO, healthcare professionals involved in the learning process in the composition of the PO committee responsible for the EP*
  - ✓ *through the committee responsible for the EP to plan and implement innovations in the EP*
- *An educational organization should:*
  - ✓ *Ensure continuity between the EP and the subsequent stages of professional training or practical activities that the learner will embark on at the end of the training*
  - ✓ *take into account the specifics of the conditions in which graduates will have to work and modify the EP accordingly*

### **Evidence**

The total volume of the educational program is 300 credits. The structure of the BVEP corresponds to the FSES HE in the field of training 31.05.03 Dentistry (specialist level).

In 2023, the BVEP was revised by representatives of the teaching staff of the graduating clinical departments, the Council of Students, and employers, a thorough discussion of the main provisions of the BVEP was held, and it was approved by the Academic Council of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia.

Then the BVEP was approved by the decision of the Academic Council of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia. The BVEP HE is updated annually in terms of the composition of disciplines (modules) established in the curriculum, and (or) the content of the work programs of disciplines (modules), work programs of practices, methodological materials that ensure the implementation of appropriate educational technology, taking into account the development of dental science, medicine, healthcare, the social sphere, the economy, focusing on the expectations of consumers, main employers, recommendations developed by the quality management system of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia.

The development and control of the implementation of the BVEP is carried out by the Dean's Office of the Faculty of Dentistry and the Educational and Methodological Department of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia.

The following educational technologies are used in practical training: educational video, solving situational problems, analysis of clinical cases, round tables, discussions, duty in the departments of the medical base, preparation of medical history, portfolio, work on training simulators, etc.

In the study of disciplines aimed at the formation of competencies, including research activities, students' research work is widely used (compilation of an information review of literature on the proposed topic, preparation of an essay, report, preparation of educational schemes, tables), educational and research work of a student, work in the archive of a health care institution. Also, trainings, master classes of experts and specialists in practical healthcare, attendance at medical conferences and tumor boards, participation in scientific and practical conferences, meetings with representatives of Russian and foreign companies, state and public organizations are widely used.

One of the forms of independent work is the formation of a portfolio by the student. According to the regulations on the EIEE, in the personal account, which the student gets access to from the moment of admission to VolgSMU, it is possible to form an "electronic portfolio of the student", including the storage of the student's works, reviews and assessments of these works by any participants in the educational process. Building a portfolio develops students' ability to analyze and evaluate the process of their own development.

In the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia, a system of point-rating assessment of students' academic performance has been introduced. The main objectives of the PRS are: increasing the motivation of students to master educational programs; activation (stimulation) of daily and systematic work of students; increasing the efficiency of regular independent work of students; reducing the role of chance and providing a more accurate and objective assessment of the level of knowledge and practical training of students in the Intermediate attestation time.

Opportunities for conducting research work, in particular, an educational experiment in the classroom, are used. Measures for the development of this area include: updating the curricula of the departments with the mandatory introduction of elements of educational and research work and educational experiment in accordance with the topics of the curriculum; strengthening control over the implementation of the results of research and development of the staff of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia in educational and clinical work.

The FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia has an effective unit responsible for the organization of both direct postgraduate education (residency) and continuing medical education (additional professional programs). One of the tasks of the department is constant interaction with the regional administration, practical health care in order to assess the need for specialists in certain specialties.

In the staffing table of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia there is the position of Vice-Rector for Regional Development of Healthcare and Vice-Rector for Scientific and International Work, which organizes and supervises work in these areas. This allows the teaching staff to provide a link between basic medical education and the subsequent stage of professional training of a specialist.

### ***Analytical part***

EEC experts note that the content of the curricula of all disciplines of the Dentistry programme takes into account regional and national features and the current state of medical science and practice.

Teachers of the clinical departments of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia work at clinical bases and in medical institutions of Volgograd, which ensures a close relationship between the Dentistry EP and the field of practical health care and

the participation of students in the work of a team of specialists in the provision of various types of dental care.

Members of the EEC note that practicing dentists take an active part in the training of students. The labor intensity of the EP "Dentistry" is 300 credits, regardless of the form of educational technologies used, including all types of classroom and independent work of the student, practice and time allotted for quality control of the educational program, electives. The volume of full-time EP implemented in one academic year is 60 credits.

In the process of interviewing students and teaching staff by members of the EEC, the lack of a wide Catalog of elective disciplines was revealed, which dictates the need to intensify the work of the UMO, the dean's office and departments in this direction and the wide involvement of all stakeholders (students, faculty, employers, representatives of practical healthcare, graduates of the Dentistry programme) in the process of developing QED in the specialty "Dentistry" to meet the needs of students and employers.

Based on the results of interviews with representatives of focus groups by members of the EEC, it was revealed that the methods of teaching and learning based on the modern theory of adult education are not actively used in the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia, the analysis of the results of the assessment of the competencies of graduates is not sufficiently carried out and documented to use the results obtained as a feedback tool for improving the EP. Integrated education based on organ systems, diseases has not been documented, the program has a consistent linear design, and the educational process does not include teaching and learning methods based on the best international practices (TBL, CBL, RBL, etc.) based on the principles of andragogy, which was confirmed on the basis of documentation and interviews with faculty and students.

The Dentistry programme does not have a horizontal integration of related sciences (an integrated module, an integrated program), and there is no system of academic counseling for students (advisor service) on the formation of an individual educational trajectory.

The balance between the compulsory and elective parts of the Dentistry programme is regulated only on the basis of the FSES HE, there are recommendations for providing the opportunity to form an individual educational trajectory for students through the Catalog of Elective Disciplines, which was not presented by the EEC; Representatives of clinical bases, graduates of the Dentistry programme, and practical healthcare specialists did not confirm their active participation in the discussion of the content of the Dentistry programme as part of the collegial advisory bodies of the Academy.

According to the Federal State Educational Standard of Higher Education - Specialist in the specialty 31.05.03 Dentistry, approved by the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of Russia dated August 12, 2020 No. 984, 2 internships in the scientific orientation are proposed) introductory practice "Research work (obtaining primary skills of research work)" and production practice "Research work", data on their implementation in VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia are presented (diaries or work programs of scientific practices).

Satisfactory marks were given by the members of the EEC on those items that require increased attention in compliance with the standards.

***Strengths/Best Practices:***

No strengths were identified for this standard.

***Recommendations of the EEC:***

1. It is recommended that the heads of the Dentistry programme carry out a step-by-step adaptation of the EP model to the modular or spiral design (integrated modules on systems or organs, spiral design of material study) of the educational programme. (Deadline – 01.09.2025);

2. It is recommended that the heads of the Dentistry programme include teaching and learning methods in the educational process, taking into account the best international practices (TBL, CBL, RBL, etc.), based on the principles of andragogy. (Deadline – 01.09.2024);



3. It is recommended that the heads of the Dentistry programme introduce horizontal integration of related sciences (integrated module, integrated program). (Deadline – 01.09.2025);

4. The university administration is recommended to develop and implement a system of academic counseling for students (advisor service) on the choice of elective disciplines and the formation of an individual educational trajectory. (The deadline – 01.12.2024).

5. Heads of the Dentistry EP are recommended to expand the Catalog of Elective Disciplines (Deadline – 01.12.2024)

6. Heads of the Dentistry programme are recommended to include issues of non-traditional and alternative medical practice in the Catalog of Elective Disciplines. (The deadline – 01.12.2024).

***Quantitative indicators reflecting the organization's compliance with the criteria of the Standard are as follows:***

*Strong positions – 0*

*satisfactory – 24*

*suggest improvements – 4*

*Unsatisfactory – 0*

### **6.3. Student Assessment Standard**

• *An educational organization should:*

✓ *define and approve the principles, methods and practices used to assess students, including the number of examinations, criteria for establishing passing scores, grades and the number of retakes allowed;*

✓ *ensure that assessment procedures cover knowledge, skills, attitudes and professional behaviour*

✓ *Use a wide range of assessment methods and formats depending on their "usefulness assessment", including a combination of validity, reliability, learning impact, acceptability and effectiveness of assessment methods and formats*

✓ *Ensure that the evaluation process and methods are open (accessible) to external review*

✓ *Ensure that assessment methods and results avoid conflicts of interest and use a student assessment appeal system*

✓ *Ensure the openness of the assessment procedure and its results, to inform students about the criteria and assessment procedures used.*

✓ *Provide for the possibility of documenting and assessing the reliability and validity of assessment methods, as well as the use of external examiners*

• *An educational organization should:*

✓ *Use assessment principles, methods and practices that are compatible with the planned RO and teaching and learning methods, ensure the achievement of the intended learning outcomes, promote student learning, and provide an appropriate balance of formative and summative assessment for the direction of learning and decision-making on academic performance*

✓ *Provide for the possibility of adjusting the number and nature of examinations in order to stimulate both the acquisition of knowledge and integrated learning*

✓ *Provide timely, specific, constructive, and fair feedback to students on assessment results*

### ***Evidence***

The policy and procedure for assessing learning outcomes, forms of assessment of learning outcomes within the framework of the Dentistry EP are regulated in accordance with external and internal regulatory legal acts. Assessment of students' knowledge, skills and abilities takes place at the following levels: entrance control, current assessment in practical and final classes; intermediate attestation – exams and tests upon completion of the study of disciplines, state final attestation. The principles and methods of assessing students' knowledge at exams and tests are established by the Regulation on Current Monitoring of Academic Progress and Intermediate Certification of Students of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia.

The Regulation stipulates that "the main purpose of intermediate certification is to assess the quality of students' achievement of the planned learning outcomes in the discipline (module) and practice." The planned learning outcomes for each discipline (module) and practice are the knowledge, skills, and abilities that characterize the stages of competence formation and ensure

the achievement of the planned results of mastering the main professional educational program. Intermediate attestation is carried out using the assessment tools presented in the work program of the discipline. Evaluation tools for intermediate certification undergo internal (at cyclical educational and methodological commissions) and external examination, the results of which are drawn up in the form of a review, and an annual update of the assessment tools is carried out. Verification of the level of mastery of practical skills and abilities formed in practical classes is carried out at final (modular) classes on practical skills, on thematic patients or on phantoms in the Federal Accreditation Center. When assessing practical skills and abilities in simulated conditions (OSCE), assessment sheets borrowed from the database of the Federal Methodological Center for Accreditation of Specialists are used. In the course of intermediate attestation, a five-point assessment system is applied.

Current monitoring of the progress of students of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia is carried out daily, in the course of the educational process, in the form of oral surveys, testing, written works, practical work, analysis of clinical cases, assessment of the results of students' independent work. Current monitoring of academic performance provides assessment in the course of mastering disciplines and passing internships, intermediate control - assessment of intermediate and final results of training in disciplines and internships. The purpose of the state final attestation of FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia is to establish the compliance of the results of mastering the main educational programs by students with the corresponding requirements of the federal state standard (approved by Order No. 984 of the Ministry of Education and Science of Russia dated August 12, 2020).

Each discipline is provided with a work program and control and measuring tools. These documents are fundamental for the ongoing monitoring of academic progress and intermediate certification. The final assessment of the knowledge of graduates of the Bachelor's programme "Dentistry" is carried out on the basis of the state exam, which includes the assessment of fundamental, paraclinical and clinical knowledge necessary for the professional activities of future specialists.

Regulatory legal acts regulate the processes of current, intermediate and final certification, describe the policy, principles and methods of assessment, appeal procedures, and retake policy. These fundamental documents are available to the public, including supervisors, regulators, faculty, students and external stakeholders. Internal control of the department by types of activities is carried out by the staff of the department in accordance with the Work Plan of the departments, within the framework of visits to lectures and training sessions.

Monitoring of the implementation of the EP is carried out by the Educational and Methodological Department, the Department of Quality Control of Education on the basis of the results of the boundary control, final certification, final state attestation, analysis of test results, examination of graduates, questionnaires of students and faculty, employers who allow assessing the achievement of the final results of EP training. Monitoring of the implementation of the EP is carried out both within the framework of intra-university control and during the internal and external audit of the activities of the teaching staff.

Learning outcomes are divided into three categories – knowledge, skills, and abilities (together constituting competencies). The programs of each academic discipline reflect a list of general cultural, general professional and professional competencies. One discipline can participate in the formation of a number of competencies.

The Simulation Center, the purpose of which is a practice-oriented approach to medical education, training and development of medical care skills using simulation educational technologies, allows to assess the level of mastering practical skills and abilities of students. The second stage of the comprehensive exam of the state final attestation is the analysis of a clinical case (practical skills).

The system provides a certain balance between formative and summative assessment, which makes it possible to objectively rank students when assigning prizes, scholarships,



incentives with certificates, acknowledgments, etc. An important role in the development of measures to encourage students for extracurricular activities is played by student self-government bodies: the student council, the trade union committee of students, the council of the student scientific society.

According to the results of the survey of VolgSMU students in the course of the work of the EEC, 61% and 27% of respondents are "completely" and "partially satisfied" with the fairness of exams and intermediate certification; timeliness of assessment - 76% and 18% of students; explanation of the rules and strategy of the educational program - 69% and 20%; the strategy of the educational program - 73% and 18%; tests and exams conducted by 57% and 24% of respondents, respectively. Student-Faculty Relationships 66% and 26% of respondents are fully and partially satisfied; objectivity and fairness of teachers 53% and 43%; informing students about courses and educational programs 66% and 23% of students, respectively.

### ***Analytical part***

According to the results of the questionnaire conducted during the EEC visit, 49% and 33% of the respondents, respectively, "fully agree" and "partially agree" that the continuous assessment (seminars, tests, questionnaires, etc.) reflects the content of the course. The evaluation criteria used by the teacher are fully and partially understood by 48% and 32% of the surveyed students, respectively. 41% and 39% of respondents, respectively, fully and partially agree that teachers objectively assess students' achievements.

The EEC Commission recommends the use of criteria-based and reasoning-based assessment methods and special examinations, taking into account the specifics of medical education (direct and indirect observation of operational and communication skills, mini-clinical examination (MiniCex), assessment in the workplace, etc.).

The system of assessment of students' knowledge is continuously studied by the heads of departments and is an open environment for the introduction of new methods in this activity. However, there is a need to use a wider range of assessment methods and formats depending on their "usefulness assessment", which includes a combination of validity, reliability, impact on learning, acceptability and effectiveness of assessment methods and format, using modern software. Familiarization with examples of tasks in the test form for senior students revealed the prevalence of tasks of a low cognitive level, the presence of defects made by the developers of tasks in the test form.

EEC experts note that the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia needs to document and assess the reliability and validity of assessment methods, which requires the introduction of appropriate software and an appropriate quality assurance process according to the existing assessment practice.

Experts of the EEC note that the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia needs to introduce new assessment methods in accordance with the needs and modern trends in medical education. It is recommended to establish a clear relationship between assessment and learning and to ensure an appropriate balance between formative and summative assessment. This will allow for more effective management of learning and assessment of the student's academic progress and establish rules for assessing progress and their relationship to the evaluation process.

EEC experts note that the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia should guarantee the provision of timely, specific, constructive and fair feedback to students based on the results of formative and summative assessments, document the assessment process using appropriate assessment forms, and make wider use of a variety of models and methods of receiving feedback.

In the course of interviews with the heads of the Dentistry Programme, teaching staff and students of the EEC, it was recorded that there is a certain misunderstanding on the part of the focus group participants on these issues.

Satisfactory marks were given by the members of the EEC on those items that require increased attention in compliance with the standards.

***Strengths/Best Practices:***

No strengths were identified for this standard.

***Recommendations of the EEC:***

1. EP supervisors are encouraged to use and document a wide range of assessment methods and formats on a regular basis, depending on their "usefulness assessment", which includes a combination of validity, reliability, learning impact, acceptability, and effectiveness of assessment methods, and format. (Deadline – 01.09.2025);

2. The management of the university is recommended to ensure the documentation of the process of assessing the educational achievements of students by introducing an electronic journal for accessibility and openness to all participants in the educational process. (Deadline – 01.12.2024).

***Quantitative indicators reflecting the organization's compliance with the criteria of the Standard are as follows:***

*Strong positions – 0*

*satisfactory – 8*

*Suggest improvements – 2*

*Unsatisfactory – 0*

***6.4. Standard "Learners"***

- *An educational organization should:*
  - ✓ *define and implement an admission policy based on the principles of objectivity and including a clear statement of the student selection process*
  - ✓ *Have policies and practices for the admission of Persons with LHC*
  - ✓ *have a policy and implement the practice of transferring students from other educational institutions, including foreign ones.*
  - ✓ *establish a connection between the selection and the mission of the educational organization, the educational program and the desired quality of graduates; periodically review the admissions policy*
  - ✓ *use a system for appealing decisions on the admission of students*
- *An educational organization should:*
  - ✓ *determine the number of students admitted in accordance with the possibilities of organizing education at all stages of the educational program*
  - ✓ *Periodically regulate the number and number of students enrolled, taking into account the views of stakeholders responsible for planning and developing human resources in the health sector to meet the health needs of the population and society as a whole*
  - ✓ *Provide for the possibility of periodically reviewing the number and nature of enrolments, in consultation with other stakeholders, and adjusting to meet the health needs of the population and society as a whole*
- *An educational organization should:*
  - ✓ *have a system of academic counseling for students*
  - ✓ *Offer students a program of support focused on social, financial and personal needs, allocating appropriate resources and ensuring the confidentiality of counseling and support*
  - ✓ *have a feedback system with students on the assessment of conditions and the organization of the educational process*
  - ✓ *provide students with documents confirming the qualification (diploma) and the diploma supplement (transcript)*
  - ✓ *take into account the needs of different groups of students and provide an opportunity for the formation of an individual educational trajectory*
  - ✓ *Provide academic counseling that is based on the monitoring of the student's progress and includes career guidance and career planning*
- *An educational organization should:*
  - ✓ *Develop and implement a policy of student representation and appropriate participation in the mission, development, management and evaluation of the educational program and other matters related to students*
  - ✓ *Provide an opportunity to encourage and promote and support student activities and student organizations*

### ***Evidence***

Admission to higher education programs – specialist programs is carried out in accordance with the regulations of VolgSMU, which are updated annually and in accordance with Federal Law No. 273-F3 of December 29, 2012 "On Education in the Russian Federation". Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of Russia dated August 21, 2020 No. 1076 "On Approval of the Procedure for Admission to Study in Educational Programs of Higher Education - Bachelor's Programs, Specialist Programs, Master's Programs", and other regulatory legal acts of a higher level.

Transparency, objectivity, maximum accessibility and detailing of information for applicants are the main principles of the Academy's admission policy at all stages of admission.

Admission is carried out in accordance with the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia, which are approved and published on the information platforms of the Academy no later than November 1 of the year preceding the year of admission, and are the main document in the organization and implementation of the admission policy. As a basis for the Rules of Admission to FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia enacts federal laws and orders of the Ministry of Education and Science of Russia, orders of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia - the founder of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia, and other departments.

The Government of the Russian Federation, federal executive authorities, the Ministry of Higher Education and Science of the Russian Federation, the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia as the founder of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia determine the volume of admission to training, primarily within the framework of the admission control figures, distribute a detailed quota for targeted admission, determine the requirements for the number of places and conditions for admission, including a special quota, other special, preferential and special conditions, and a general competition. Separately, the list of applicants without entrance exams is detailed.

The organization of work and the composition of the Admissions Committee are determined by the Regulations on the Admissions Committee (approved annually by the order of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia). In order to ensure the conduct of entrance examinations for certain categories of citizens, including foreign citizens and stateless persons, the BSMU has established examination commissions, the organization of which is determined by the Regulations on Examination Commissions and the Procedure for Conducting Entrance Examinations. Applicants can familiarize themselves with the Programs of Entrance Exams on information platforms FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia.

Admission to the first year is carried out on the basis of competitive selection, the competition is carried out on the basis of the total competitive score, which consists of points, entrance exams and points for individual achievements of the applicant, the accounting of individual achievements is carried out even if the competitive points of applicants are equal. The list of individual achievements of applicants, which is approved annually in the Admission Rules, provides for taking into account the diverse interests and capabilities of applicants. Draft orders on enrollment are discussed at the meetings of the admission committee, the decision on enrollment in the first year is collegial. At all stages of admission and enrollment and during the academic year, FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia closely interacts with applicants and their representatives, for which the technical staff of the Admissions Committee is created annually.

FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia has created a system of support and accompaniment for students, covering the main range of problems that students may face at various stages of education.

At all stages of training, the division of VolgSMU for the promotion of employment of graduates and careers carries out work on career guidance and assistance in temporary



employment for the period of study, including for students with LHC. All organizations and structures providing advisory services work within the framework of the law on the protection of personal data on the principles of confidentiality. The existing system of support and accompaniment of students in general provides meeting the needs and demands of students.

Student self-government at the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia is implemented through public student organizations, which are led by the students themselves. The policy of student representation at the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia is implemented in three areas: student self-government; representation of students in the collegial bodies of the university, which manage the educational process; representation of students in social projects regional health care objectives. The range of public organizations includes: the Council of Students coordinates the initiatives of students and the leadership of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia.

According to the results of a survey of students conducted during the EEC visit, relations with the dean's office are rated as "very good" and "good" by 93% of respondents; the level of accessibility of the dean's office - 95% of respondents; the level of accessibility and responsiveness of the university administration - 93% of respondents.

Availability of Academic Advising 92% of respondents are fully and partially satisfied; educational materials - 92% of respondents.

86% of respondents are fully or partially satisfied with the availability of counseling on personal problems and the clarity of procedures for taking disciplinary measures. 86% of students are fully or partially satisfied with the work of the financial and administrative services of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia. 87% of respondents are fully or partially satisfied with the availability of health care services for students and the quality of student health services.

### ***Analytical part***

The requirements set forth in the IAAR standard "Students" are fulfilled in full, with the exception of the expanded choice of elective disciplines.

FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia establishes the relationship between the selection of students, the mission, the degree program and the desired quality of graduates. The main criterion for passing the competition is the amount of competitive points, which is calculated as the sum of points for each entrance exam, as well as for individual achievements.

In the course of interviewing students and graduates of the EP, members of the EEC found that during meetings with the heads of departments, the dean's office, students have the opportunity to express their opinion and wishes regarding their participation in the decision-making process, ensuring academic quality and other professional, financial and social issues.

All issues raised and discussed at these meetings are resolved in a timely manner and in due course.

The results of the survey of students showed high (over 90%) indicators of satisfaction in terms of the attitude and level of accessibility of the dean's office, the availability and responsiveness of the university management, the support of educational materials in the learning process, the availability of counseling on personal problems, the financial and administrative services of the educational institution, the level of availability of library resources, the quality of services provided in libraries and reading rooms, the existing educational resources of the university. the usefulness of the website of educational organizations in general and faculties in particular, the clarity of the procedure for taking incentives and disciplinary measures, the general quality of curricula, teaching methods in general, the quality of teaching.

During the interview, there was no confirmation of the implementation of a certain system of academic counseling of students (a service of permanent advisers) on the choice of elective disciplines, the formation of an individual educational trajectory, preparation for postgraduate studies and professional career planning. The systematic basis for collecting information and

analyzing the results of feedback from the Russian Federation has not been confirmed. students on the formulation of the mission, content and implementation of the educational program and their use to improve the quality of the EP.

Satisfactory marks were given by the members of the EEC on those items that require increased attention in compliance with the standards.

***Strengths/Best Practices:***

No strengths were identified for this standard.

***Recommendations of the EEC:***

It is recommended that the management of the Dentistry programme systematically collect information, analyze the results of feedback from students on the formulation of the mission, content and implementation of the educational program, and use the results to improve the quality of the programme. (The deadline is 01.09.2024, at least once a year).

***Quantitative indicators reflecting the organization's compliance with the criteria of the Standard are as follows:***

*Strong positions – 0*

*satisfactory – 16*

*suggest improvements – 0*

*Unsatisfactory – 0*

***6.5. Academic Staff/Faculty Standard***

- *An educational organization should develop and implement a staff selection and recruitment policy that:
 
  - ✓ *defines their category, responsibilities, and balance of academic staff/faculty in the basic biomedical sciences, behavioral and social sciences, and medical/pharmaceutical sciences for adequate implementation of the EP, including the proper ratio between faculty in the medical, non-medical, pharmaceutical, full-time or part-time faculty, and balance between academic and non-academic staff.*
  - ✓ *takes into account the criteria of scientific, educational and clinical achievements, including the relationship between teaching, research activities and "service" functions*
  - ✓ *identifies and monitors the responsibilities of academic staff/faculty in the basic biomedical sciences, behavioral and social sciences, and clinical, hygienic, pharmaceutical sciences*
  - ✓ *provides for the possibility in the policy of selection and recruitment of personnel to take into account such criteria and features as the attitude to the mission and economic opportunities of the educational organization, as well as the significant features of the region**
- *An educational organization should develop and implement a policy for the activities and development of personnel, which is aimed at:
 
  - ✓ *striking a balance of opportunities between teaching, research and "service" functions, ensuring recognition of worthy academic activity, with appropriate emphasis on teaching, research and professional qualifications.*
  - ✓ *ensuring that individual staff members have sufficient knowledge of the entire educational program, as well as training and professional development of teachers, their development and evaluation*
  - ✓ *the ability to take into account the teacher-student ratio depending on the different components of the educational program*
  - ✓ *Career development of personnel**

***Evidence***

The main resource of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia is a competent and capable of further improvement teaching staff, the professional level of which allows to ensure the high quality of the educational process and the competitiveness of the university in the market of educational services.

The policy of selection and admission of academic staff to FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia is carried out in accordance with the Labor Code of the Russian Federation, the Regulation "On the Procedure for Filling the Positions of Teaching Staff Related



to the Teaching Staff ", approved by the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation dated 23.07.2015 No. 749, The Nomenclature of Positions of Teaching Staff of Organizations Engaged in Educational Activities, Positions of Heads of Educational Organizations, approved by Decree of the Government of the Russian Federation dated 21.02.2022 No. 225 "On Approval of the Nomenclature of Positions of Teaching Staff of Organizations Engaged in Educational Activities, Positions of Heads of Educational Organizations", Order of the Ministry of Health and Social Development of the Russian Federation dated 11.01.2011 No. 1n "On Approval of the Unified Qualification Directory of Positions of Managers, Specialists and Employees, Section "Qualification Characteristics of Positions of Managers and Specialists of Higher Professional and Additional Professional Education" and the Charter of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia.

The personnel policy for the recruitment and selection of personnel ensures full equality and accessibility to the vacancies available at the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia and guarantees equal opportunities and an objective assessment of the professional qualities of applicants.

Over the past 5 years, the degree of TS has remained stable at about 80%. All teachers of clinical departments have specialist certificates. The teaching staff has a high level of qualification and competence, more than 50% of the teaching staff has 15 years of experience in scientific, pedagogical and clinical work. Classes with students are held in Russian and English. Every year, the number of teachers who speak a foreign (English) language with the level necessary for teaching at the university increases.

The teaching staff is guaranteed the right to elect colleagues and to be elected to the governing and advisory bodies of the faculty and the Institute in accordance with the current criteria and procedures. In order to stimulate employees to a high-quality result of work, as well as incentives for the work performed at the Academy, in addition to the official salary, incentive payments have been established.

Issues of personnel encouragement are regulated by local regulations of the university, in particular, orders on remuneration of employees of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia.

The Regulation is designed to ensure uniformity in the issues of remuneration of employees of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia and provides for the procedure and conditions of remuneration, the procedure for spending funds on wages, a system of material incentives and incentives for employees.

The system of material incentives and incentives is aimed at increasing the motivation to work of employees of the VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia, ensuring their material interest and increasing responsibility for the results of their activities, including in the provision of educational services. The Regulation determines the size of official salaries by professional qualification groups, the size of increasing coefficients to salaries; conditions and amounts of compensation and incentives in accordance with the lists of payments approved by the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia.

According to the results of the survey during the visit of the EEC, the teachers of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia gave a positive assessment (grades "very good" and "good") regarding the ability to use their own teaching strategies (90%) and teaching methods (98%); the possibility of participating in academic mobility programs (97%); advanced training (95%); support from the faculty leadership (91%); and the ability to conduct scientific research (91%). 94% of teachers positively assess the opportunities provided by BSMU for the professional development of teaching staff.

According to the results of a survey of students conducted during the EEC visit, 80% of students provided positive answers ("very good" and "good") that the faculty teachers use effective teaching methods (93%); Proficient in the material taught (96%); use effective teaching methods (80%); present the material in an understandable way (89%); present the material in an

interesting way (76%); satisfies the requirements in terms of personal development and professional formation of future specialists (82%); stimulate student activity (77%); stimulate students' creative thinking (72%); demonstrate a positive attitude towards students (82%); speak a professional language (97%).

### *Analytical part*

Experts of the EEC note that in the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia:

- the balance of academic staff/teachers of basic biomedical sciences, behavioral and social sciences, and clinical sciences is maintained for the adequate implementation of the Dentistry programme;
- criteria for admission and selection of teaching staff have been developed, including scientific, pedagogical and clinical merits of applicants;
- Monitoring of the responsibilities of academic staff/faculty who teach social sciences and humanities, basic biomedical sciences, behavioral, social and clinical sciences.
- Institutional conditions for the financing of employees and the efficient use of resources are taken into account.

Experts of the EEC state that the teachers involved in the implementation of the EP "Dentistry":

- provides high-quality educational services for the training of qualified specialists for the healthcare system;
- conduct their own scientific research and implement it both in the educational process and in clinical activities;
- carry out social and educational work within the framework of the formation of social and personal qualities of the future dentist;
- assess the quality of students' training through current, intermediate and final control with the help of assessment tools developed at the departments;
- participate in the selection of basic institutions of practical health care for the training of students and practical training;
- provide consultative, scientific and practical assistance to medical institutions;
- introduce simulation teaching methods into the educational process;
- develop and implement new educational and methodological materials in the educational process;
- participate in the process of implementing academic mobility programs.

The FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia has implemented a policy of activity and development of teaching staff, which guarantees recognition of academic activities, with a corresponding emphasis on teaching, research and clinical qualifications, which is carried out in the form of institute and government awards, promotions and/or remuneration in the form of a bonus. Clinical activities and research results are used in teaching and learning.

In general, there is a satisfaction with the teaching staff of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia and students working and studying conditions, but members of the EEC note that, based on the results of interviews and questionnaires of teaching staff, the results and wishes of respondents regarding the imbalance of the teaching load by semesters ("sometimes" - 10% and "often" - 39%); overcrowding of study groups ("sometimes" - 11 per cent and "often" - 47 per cent); Inconvenient class schedule ("sometimes" - 14% and "often" - 42%); This was also noted during the observation of the course of practical classes during the period of full-time attendance of classes and individual clinical bases where training in the Dentistry EP is conducted.

EEC experts also note that, according to the results of interviews with teaching staff and students, analysis of the content of working curricula in disciplines and face-to-face attendance of lectures and practical classes, the educational process of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia is dominated by methods of learning and teaching focused on

memorization (reproduction) and understanding of educational material; elements of clinical situation analysis; Supervision of patients under the supervision of clinical mentors (in the senior years).

Assessment methods are used that do not fully reflect all the competencies planned in the Dentistry programme, which is also noted in the recommendations of the EEC to Standard 2 "Educational Program".

Most faculty and students are not properly oriented in the field of such learning and teaching methods as TBL (Team Based Learning), CBL (Case Based Learning); (Research Based Learning), Project-Based Learning, etc.

The widespread introduction of modern teaching methods into the educational process of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia in the specialty "Dentistry" will allow students to immerse themselves in the conditions of a safe quasi-professional environment; to simulate real clinical situations based on the available rich clinical experience of teaching staff; to consider and analyze diverse complex clinical cases from the standpoint of an integrated interdisciplinary approach; to form communicative skills, clinical thinking, research and teamwork skills in students starting from the junior years of study.

The introduction of modern educational technologies in the educational process will require the teaching staff of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia to master such assessment methods as assessment of the cognitive, operational, communicative, research component of students' competencies; ability to independently search and analyze information; skills to work in a professional and interdisciplinary team, and this need should be realized in the course of development and implementation modern methods and tools of assessment and evaluation forms successfully used in the world medical educational community.

***Strengths/Best Practices:***

No strengths were identified for this standard.

***Recommendations of the EEC:***

The management of the university is recommended to organize advanced training for teaching staff in the use of modern educational technologies and assessment methods in the educational process. (Deadline – 01.09.2024);

***Quantitative indicators reflecting the organization's compliance with the criteria of the Standard are as follows:***

*Strong – 0*

*Satisfactory – 7*

*Suggest improvements – 1*

*Unsatisfactory – 0*

**6.6. Educational Resources Standard**

• An educational organization should:

✓ have a sufficient material and technical base to ensure the adequate implementation of the educational program, as well as create a safe learning environment for staff, students, patients and their relatives

✓ Improve the learning environment by regularly updating and expanding the material and technical base to meet changes in educational practice

• An educational organization should:

✓ Provide the necessary resources to provide learners with appropriate clinical/practical experience, including:

- Quality and categories of patients/consumers of services

- Number and categories of clinical/manufacturing facilities, which include:

- Observation of students' practice

✓ evaluate, adapt and improve clinical/practical training settings to meet the needs of the population

• An educational organization should:

- ✓ *Develop and implement policies aimed at the effective and ethical use and evaluation of appropriate information and communication technologies*
- ✓ *provide access to websites or other electronic media*
- ✓ *Provide teachers and learners with access to relevant patient data and health information systems, using existing and relevant new information and communication technologies for self-learning, access to information, patient databases and health information systems*
- *An educational organization should:*
  - ✓ *use research activities and scientific achievements in the field of medicine and pharmacy as a basis for an educational program*
  - ✓ *formulate and implement policies that promote the link between research and education; provide information on the research base and priority areas in the field of scientific research of the organization of education*
  - ✓ *Provide for the relationship between research and education is taken into account in teaching, encourages and prepares learners for and participation in research in the field of health*
  - ✓ *An educational organization should:*
    - ✓ *have access to educational expertise of the processes, practices and problems of medical and pharmaceutical education with the involvement of specialists, educational psychologists, sociologists of the university, interuniversity and international levels; develop and implement a policy of expertise in the development, implementation and evaluation of the educational program, the development of teaching and assessment methods.*
    - ✓ *demonstrate evidence of the use of internal or external educational expertise in staff development, taking into account current experience in medical/pharmaceutical education and contributing to the interests of staff in conducting research in education*
  - *An educational organization should:*
    - ✓ *formulate and implement a policy on national and international cooperation with other educational organizations, including the mobility of staff and students, as well as the transfer of educational credits*
    - ✓ *to promote the participation of teachers and students in academic mobility programs in the country and abroad and to allocate appropriate resources for this purpose*

### **Evidence**

For the implementation of the EP "Dentistry", the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia has a sufficient material and technical base that meets the current rules and regulations, ensuring the conduct of all types of disciplinary and interdisciplinary training, practical and research activities of students, provided for by the curriculum.

For the implementation of the educational process, the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia has educational buildings, premises of clinical departments and laboratories located in medical clinics, its own clinics, several dormitories for students (about 2000 students out of 7500 people live in dormitories).

The analysis of the material and technical equipment of the classroom fund for the development of the educational program showed full compliance with the requirements of the FSES HE.

FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia has sufficient opportunities to implement the curriculum: availability of classrooms and lecture halls equipped with modern technical equipment; library and library fund; sports halls and sports grounds with appropriate equipment; sufficient dormitory fund for students; catering facilities (canteen, buffets).

All facilities comply with fire safety and sanitary and hygienic standards. Clinical departments of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia are located directly in the medical organizations of the city. The educational buildings have all the infrastructure for conducting classes and meeting the social and household needs of students.

The entire classroom fund is equipped with modern technical and demonstration facilities.

FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia has the material and technical base necessary for all types of disciplinary and interdisciplinary training, laboratory, practical and research work of students, residents and postgraduates.

The condition of the educational and laboratory base and the level of its equipment meet the requirements of the current educational standards.

At the disposal of students there are classrooms, classrooms, inter-faculty laboratories, an anatomical hall, an anatomical museum, a cadaver storage.



FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia has its own Dental Center.

The departments of the Humanitarian, Socio-Economic, Natural Science and Medical-Biological Blocks of the Ministry of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia have everything necessary for the organization and conduct of the educational process, in particular, equipped classrooms, light projection and linguistic equipment, microscopes, tables for all sections of disciplines.

The educational process is provided with a sufficient amount of a wide variety of modern equipment (computers, office equipment, technical teaching aids, laboratory equipment, medical simulators and phantoms, medical instruments and consumables, medical, physical and chemical devices, reagents and chemical utensils, anatomical and biological collections, microscopes and microslides, etc.), which is replenished according to the standard lists of necessary Equipment.

On the basis of a multidisciplinary accreditation and simulation center, an accreditation center was created at the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia to carry out primary and primary specialized accreditation.

Library and information support of educational activities is carried out by the library of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia.

The library provides educational, methodological, scientific and informational support for the educational programs being implemented. The library of VolgSMU has signed contracts for the provision of services to provide access to professional databases, information reference and search systems necessary for the educational process: EBS "Student Consultant".

During the entire period of study, each student is provided with individual unlimited access to the Student's Consultant and the EIEE of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia. The electronic information and educational environment of the university provides access to publications of electronic library systems and electronic educational resources specified in the work programs.

Thus, the legislative requirements in terms of educational, methodological, library and information support of the educational programs implemented by the university library have been met.

Clinical departments based in medical organizations are used for clinical training of students. Clinical bases, with which FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia has agreements on practical training of students, include several medical organizations, including multidisciplinary round-the-clock hospitals; specialized medical institutions (obstetrics and gynecological, infectious, oncological, dermatological, ophthalmological, phthisiology, psychiatric); outpatient clinics.

Medical organizations, which are clinical bases of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia, have the necessary modern material and technical base for training in the provision of all types of dental care in accordance with the current Procedures for the provision of medical care in the relevant profiles, which is confirmed by the presence of a license.

At clinical bases, students under the supervision of teachers can share medical equipment and tools to develop professional competencies in such areas as Practice for obtaining professional skills and professional experience (preventive dentistry, surgical dentistry, therapeutic dentistry, prosthetic dentistry, general dentistry, pediatric dentistry).

Supplementing the educational process with a stage of simulation training with the extensive use of patient-substituting and patient-oriented technologies.

According to the results of a survey of teachers conducted during the visit of the EEC, the sufficiency and availability of the necessary scientific and educational literature in the library was assessed positively ("very good" and "good") by 91% of respondents; the level of conditions created, taking into account the needs of various groups of students – 94% of respondents.

According to the results of a survey of students of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia, conducted during the visit of the EEC, 94% of respondents assessed the sufficiency and accessibility of library resources positively ("very good" and



"good"), the quality of services provided in libraries and reading rooms - 96%; satisfaction with existing educational resources - 93%; existing computer classes and scientific laboratories - 89%; provision of students with a dormitory - 68% of respondents.

Based on the results of the analysis of the results of the survey, it was found that the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia provides sufficient opportunities for sports and other leisure activities (86%); facilities and equipment for students are safe, comfortable and modern (81%). A positive assessment in terms of providing all students with equal opportunities was received from 84% of respondents.

### ***Analytical part***

Experts of the EEC state the fact that, within the framework of the standard "Educational Resources" in the specialty "Dentistry", in the course of the work of the expert commission and the analysis of the submitted documentation, the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia constantly improves the learning environment of students through regular updating, expansion and strengthening of the material and technical base, which corresponds to the development of health care and the practice of teaching in medicine.

Members of the EEC note that the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia provides the necessary resources for the successful implementation of the EP "Dentistry" by acquiring clinical experience by students, including a sufficient number of educational and clinical bases, categories of patients; long-term contractual relations with medical organizations of Volgograd.

FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia implements a form of practical training in the form of internships at the leading universities of Russia and foreign universities.

Members of the EEC state that teachers of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia, according to the results of the survey during the visit of the EEC, indicate such problems in educational activities (answers "sometimes" and "often"), such as the lack of classrooms (17% and 46%, respectively); Inadequate classroom conditions (8% and 26%, respectively); weak Internet signal (10% and 47%); delays in receiving information on some activities (7% and 35%); lack of technical teaching aids in some classrooms (13% and 27%).

Experts of the EEC note that the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia should develop and implement a policy on the use of expertise in the development of teaching methods and assessment of knowledge and skills in the educational program "Dentistry", for example, a group of independent experts (from among the advanced teaching staff), since the methods of teaching and learning somewhat lag behind the capabilities of the material and technical base of the university.

Experts of the EEC also recommend that the management of VolgSMU carry out a set of measures to conduct an examination in the field of education assessment and research in the field of medical education, including the study of theoretical, practical and social issues, since no convincing data were obtained on the ongoing research and expert work during interviews with the teaching staff of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia.

Based on the results of interviews with the teaching staff who teach disciplines in the specialty "Dentistry", the experts of the EEC revealed the need for greater assistance to the administration of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia to the desire and interests of employees in conducting research in the field of medical education.

There was no confirmation of the control of independent work according to the hours allocated in the Curriculum.

Satisfactory marks were given for those items that require increased attention while meeting the standards.

### ***Strengths/Best Practices:***

No strengths were identified for this standard.

**Recommendations of the EEC:**

1. The management of the EP "Dentistry" is recommended to ensure the implementation of scientific research in medical education and to promote the aspirations and interests of employees in their implementation, including the study of theoretical, practical and social issues. (Deadline – 01.09.2025);

2. It is recommended that the heads of the Dentistry EP organize the control of students' independent work. (Deadline – 01.09.2024).

**Quantitative indicators reflecting the organization's compliance with the criteria of the Standard are as follows:**

*Strong – 0*

*Satisfactory – 12*

*Suggest improvements – 2*

*Unsatisfactory – 0*

**6.7. Standard "Evaluation of Educational Programs"**

• *An educational organization should:*

✓ *have regulated procedures for monitoring, periodic evaluation of the educational program and learning outcomes, progress and academic performance of students.*

✓ *Develop and apply an evaluation mechanism for the educational program, which examines the program, its main components, the performance of students, identifies and solves problems, and ensures that the relevant assessment results affect the EP.*

✓ *Periodically evaluate the program, comprehensively considering the educational process, components of the educational program, expected learning outcomes and social responsibility*

• *An educational organization should:*

✓ *systematically conduct, analyze and respond to feedback from teachers and students*

✓ *Use the results of feedback to improve the educational program*

• *An educational organization should:*

✓ *analyze the performance of students and graduates in accordance with the mission and expected learning outcomes, training program and resource availability.*

✓ *analyze the progress of students and graduates, taking into account the conditions of their previous education, the level of training when entering a university; use the results of the analysis to interact with the structural unit responsible for the selection of students, the development of an educational program, and the consulting of students*

• *An educational organization should:*

✓ *Involve key stakeholders in the monitoring and evaluation of the educational program*

✓ *Provide stakeholders with access to the results of the evaluation of the program, collect and study their feedback on the practical activities of graduates and feedback on the educational program*

**Evidence**

The Volgograd FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia has a multi-level system of evaluation of educational programs, which includes current control by the dean's office, periodic control by the educational and methodological department, assessment of the quality of the educational process by the Department of Standardization and Quality in the form of an internal audit of educational departments and processes. Monitoring of the educational program and the results of its development is carried out on the basis of the Regulation on the Basic Professional Educational Program of Higher Education.

The Educational and Methodological Department of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia is responsible for regular monitoring of the educational program. The dean's office, with the active participation of the departments, ensures the timely implementation and assessment of the assigned tasks. The results are discussed at the Academic Council, the Faculty Council, and are brought to the attention of departments and teachers. Monitoring of the educational program is carried out in order to identify compliance with the requirements of the FSES HE.

The Dean's Office and the UMU provide students with a real opportunity to participate in the formation of their training program, explain their rights and obligations to fulfill the EP.

After studying each discipline, students have the opportunity to formulate and bring to the attention of the head of the department, deans, vice-rector and rector proposals on the structure, scope and content of the discipline studied, as well as on methods and means of control through questionnaires. For the analysis of educational programs, there is a basic feedback system, within the framework of the information maps of the processes "Design and Development of Educational Programs" and "Implementation of Basic Educational Programs" programs", which regulate the implementation of the following indicators: the percentage of curricula and programs of academic disciplines that meet the requirements of the Federal State Educational Standards in terms of level and content; the percentage of disciplines provided with educational and methodological materials; the level of competencies of graduates according to the requirements of the Federal State Educational Standard; student satisfaction; alumni satisfaction; Teacher satisfaction. Patients applying to the dental clinic of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia sign an informed voluntary consent to medical intervention.

Based on the results of a survey of students during the visit of the EEC, the overall quality of educational programs 88% of respondents are fully and partially satisfied; teaching methods of 90% of students; quality of teaching, 94%; academic load and requirements for students – 89% of respondents. The results of the study of the satisfaction of various categories of consumers are communicated to all interested parties.

#### ***Analytical part***

Experts of the EEC note that within the framework of the standard "Evaluation of Educational Programs" in the specialty "Dentistry", in the course of the work of the expert commission and the analysis of the submitted documentation, it was revealed, mainly, compliance with the requirements of the standard. Members of the EEC, having analyzed the submitted documents and talked with the participants of focus groups, came to the conclusion that in the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia there is a multi-level system of evaluation of the educational program in the specialty "Dentistry", which includes an internal assessment of the quality of education and consists of:

- current control over the organization and implementation of the educational process by the dean's office (in the form of a monthly report of the departments on the current academic performance and attendance of classes by students);
- assessment of the quality of the educational process by the Educational and Methodological Department and the Department for Assessment of Quality Control of Education in the form of an internal audit of educational units and processes;
- participation in the procedures of intermediate and final attestation of independent experts;
- assessment of the quality of teaching teaching by students through questionnaires;
- internal departmental assessment of the quality of teaching in the form of mutual visits of employees to classes, etc.

The administration of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia periodically conducts an assessment of the EP, including the content of disciplines, the organization of the educational process, material and technical resources, the learning environment, cultural and national characteristics.

At the same time, EEC experts note that the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia needs to update the monitoring of processes and results, including the collection and analysis of data on key aspects of the educational program in the specialty "Dentistry".

The educational achievements of students of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia are systematically analyzed in relation to the mission and final learning outcomes of educational programs, including the determination of such indicators as the average

grade point in disciplines and courses of study; absolute academic performance and qualitative performance indicators; the absolute number and proportion of expelled students. The conditions of training in the completed disciplines are analyzed. Administration of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia conducts periodic studies in the field of assessing the degree of satisfaction of students and teaching staff with educational programs and the availability of resources.

At the same time, the members of the EEC state that the processes of obtaining feedback from students regarding the implemented EP "Dentistry" are insufficient for the development of corrective or preventive measures to improve the EP "Dentistry".

Members of the EEC note that feedback on the issues of assessment and improvement of the EP is mainly presented in the form of questionnaires, while the range of forms and methods should be expanded, taking into account the specifics of the EP (oral and written comments from the stakeholders of the EP, reflective reviews, focus group interviews, chronological reports, etc.).

Satisfactory marks were given by the members of the EEC on those items that require increased attention in compliance with the standards.

***Strengths/Best Practices:***

No strengths were identified for this standard.

***Recommendations of the EEC:***

No.

***Quantitative indicators reflecting the organization's compliance with the criteria of the Standard are as follows:***

*Strong – 0;*

*Satisfactory – 9*

*Suggest improvements – 0*

*Unsatisfactory – 0.*

**6.8. Management and Administration Standard**

- *An educational organization should:*
  - ✓ *Identify structural units and their functions, including relationships within the university*
  - ✓ *define committees in the management structure, their responsibilities, and their composition, reflecting the representation of key and other stakeholders, ensuring transparency of the work of management bodies and their decisions*
- *An educational organization should:*
  - ✓ *describe the responsibilities of academic leadership in defining and managing the educational program*
  - ✓ *Periodically evaluate academic leadership in relation to the achievement of its mission and expected learning outcomes*
- *An educational organization should:*
  - ✓ *have a clear distribution of responsibilities and powers to provide resources for the educational program, including a targeted budget for training*
  - ✓ *allocate the resources necessary for the implementation of the EP and allocate educational resources in accordance with their needs*
  - ✓ *Provide for the ability to allocate resources independently, including the remuneration of teachers, who adequately achieve the planned learning outcomes; The allocation of resources should take into account scientific advances in health and public health issues and their needs*
- *An educational organization should:*
  - ✓ *have administrative and professional staff for the implementation of the educational program and related activities, ensure proper management and allocation of resources*
  - ✓ *ensure the participation of all departments of the educational organization in the processes and procedures of the internal quality assurance system.*
- *An educational organization should:*
  - ✓ *engage constructively with the health system and health-related sectors of society and government, including the foreign one*



- ✓ *Formalize collaborations, including staff and training, with partners in the health sector*
- *An educational organization should:*
  - ✓ *publish on the official website of the educational organization and in the media complete and reliable information about the educational program and its achievements.*
  - ✓ *publish on the official website objective information about the employment and demand for graduates*

### ***Evidence***

Management of activities and interaction of structural and collegial subdivisions of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia is carried out in accordance with the charter and organizational structure.

The collegial governing body of FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia is the Academic Council, which includes the rector, vice-rectors, deans of faculties, representatives of regional health authorities, heads of departments, heads of structural divisions, students.

The Academic Council considers and makes decisions on the main areas of educational, scientific and medical activities of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia, as well as approves curricula and educational programs on the recommendation of the deans of the faculties, submits candidates for awarding academic titles, awards honorary titles, approves local regulations governing the main types of activities.

According to the organizational structure, vertical and horizontal interaction of structural subdivisions is carried out in the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia.

The rector is responsible for the general guidance and management of the activities of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia.

Under the direct supervision of the Rector are the Vice-Rectors and Departments that provide all the main and auxiliary processes of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia.

The Dean's Office of the Faculty of Dentistry is a unit under the authority of the Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs. In the course of performing the main tasks and functions, the dean's office interacts with other departments: educational and methodological department, personnel department, departments. The interaction of the dean's office with departments and students is carried out within the framework of meetings of councils and commissions, as well as in the electronic information educational environment of the university through corporate e-mail and electronic personal accounts.

FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia carries out financial and economic activities in accordance with the Charter approved by the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia, the Budget Code, federal laws, orders of the Government of the Russian Federation, other regulatory acts in force on the territory of the Russian Federation, regulating educational activities and the activities of budgetary institutions and on the basis of the Plan of financial and economic activities of federal state institutions subordinate to the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia.

The management of financial and economic activities ensures the economic feasibility and validity of the program policy of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia, aimed at supporting the Mission of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia, the educational program, external relations, etc.

Financing is carried out in accordance with agreements concluded with the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia. Financing of the educational program is carried out from the following sources: 1) subsidies for financial support for the implementation of state (municipal) assignments from the federal budget; 2) targeted subsidies in accordance with the Budget Code of the Russian Federation; 3) receipts from the provision of paid educational services, other paid services.

In accordance with regulatory documents, FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia has the opportunity to independently allocate financial resources to achieve the final learning outcomes. The amount of funding of VolgSMU for the implementation of the

main educational program of higher professional education is determined in accordance with the standards established by the Government of the Russian Federation, taking into account the features of educational programs per one student, resident are provided for: the cost of remuneration of employees, including the established compensation and incentive payments; expenses directly related to the provision of the educational process (purchase of educational visual aids, teaching aids, consumables, stationery, payment for communication services in terms of costs associated with connection to the Internet information network and payment for the use of this network and other economic needs); other expenses related to the educational process (advanced training of employees, travel expenses, etc.).

FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia makes incentive payments to teachers: for high achievements in scientific and methodological activities; for the presence of state, departmental and university awards and distinctions; based on the results of the rating control of the quality of their activities.

FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia allocates funds to support students (financial assistance). The amount of financial resources spent on teachers' salaries is analyzed. Based on the results of the work of teachers, indicators are revised to determine an effective bonus system. It is planned to expand the indicators for assessing the work of teachers in achieving the intended results in education, subject to the availability of financial resources.

External independent assessment of the quality of education is carried out on an ongoing basis in accordance with Federal Law No. 273-FZ of 29.12.2012 "On Education in the Russian Federation", "Methodological Recommendations for the Organization and Conduct of Internal Independent Assessment of the Quality of Education in Educational Institutions of Higher Education in Educational Programs of Higher Education - Bachelor's Programs, Specialist Programs and Master's Programs" (letter of the Ministry of Education and Science of Russia dated February 15, 2018 No. 05-435), by order of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia.

Regular self-assessment is carried out as part of the annual self-examination of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia, as well as through an internal audit, which regulates internal activities and was created to analyze and assess the functioning of the organization. The main objectives of internal audits at the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia are: assessment of compliance of processes with the requirements of internal regulatory documents, international and national standards; providing the management of the organization with reliable data on the quality of educational, research and other processes; analysis of the effectiveness of corrective and preventive actions to eliminate identified inconsistencies.

### ***Analytical part***

According to the Charter of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia, it has the status of a federal state budgetary institution and receives funding for the implementation of the state order. In order to conduct research and professional activities, graduates of the bachelor's program can continue their studies in residency and postgraduate training programs.

FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia independently carries out financial and economic activities, its financial autonomy correlates with the principles of responsibility to society for the quality of all activities in professional training, scientific research and the provision of services, with the effective management of funds and state property.

Members of the EEC state that the administration of the Faculty of Dentistry:

- ensures the fulfillment of the state order of practical health care bodies, employers and the training of doctors in the specialty "Dentistry";
- coordinates the process of curriculum development;
- ensures the implementation of standard and working curricula of the EP;

- monitors the correctness of the registration of cases by the admission committee when enrolling students in the first year or transferring from one university to another;
- participates in the preparation and organization of current and solemn events, International Olympiads, the Student Scientific Society, the Student Volunteer Association, the Youth Union, etc.;
- participates in the development of the schedule of training sessions and monitors the readiness of the departments for the beginning of the academic year;
  - organizes the educational process and ensures quality control of students' training;
- appoints group supervisors in junior years and clinical mentors in senior years;
- provides data on the contingent of students at the Faculty of Dentistry, their academic performance for the rector, the administration of the Institute, the planning and financial department, the accounting department and other departments of the Institute;
  - organizes and supervises the students' educational and industrial practices and the conduct of tests and exams;
- arranges academic leave, expels and reinstates students, makes a decision on the student's re-education on the course.
- collects information on the academic performance of students of the faculty with its subsequent analysis and discussion at the Faculty Council, meetings of the Academic Council, the rectorate;
- implements a set of measures to make up for missed classes, conduct an appeal procedure;
  - provides support to needy and gifted students;
  - assigns scholarships, including nominal scholarships, on the recommendation of the Academic Council, to students of the faculty in accordance with the current Regulations;
  - organizes and ensures control of all types of activities of the assigned departments;
  - prepares control and measurement materials for the final state attestation of graduates of the Bachelor's programme "Dentistry";
  - organizes conversations about a healthy lifestyle, patriotic education of students; visits by students to theatres, museums and exhibitions;
  - assists in the organization of sports and cultural student events;
  - organizes the accommodation of students in the dormitory and monitors the living conditions.

To discuss the main issues of the organization of educational and instructional and methodological work in the dean's office of the Faculty of Dentistry, there is a Council of the faculty, which includes: the dean, deputy deans, representatives of students, heads of departments.

The distribution of resources is implemented depending on the characteristics and needs of the EP, the specifics of the academic discipline, the conditions for conducting practical and laboratory classes, the need to attract standardized patients, etc. The current policy does not contradict the legislative acts of the Russian Federation, which ensures the institutional autonomy of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia.

In the process of interviewing the staff of the AMS of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia and the heads of departments, it was noted that the responsibility of the academic leadership in relation to the development and management of the educational program was determined.

The implementation of the educational program is provided by managers, scientific and pedagogical staff of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia, as well as persons involved under the terms of a civil law contract.

Members of the EEC noted that the Rector, the Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs, the Dean's Office of the Faculty of Dentistry, the Educational and Methodological Department, the Department of Education Quality Control and Monitoring are responsible for the implementation

of the curriculum and the achievement of the final goals and results in the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia.

In the course of the conversation with the focus groups, an answer was received from the interviewers that the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia periodically evaluates the academic leadership regarding the achievement of its mission and the final results of training.

According to a survey conducted during the visit of the EEC, the attitude of the management towards teachers of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia 75% of respondents are fully satisfied; relations with direct management - 82%; relations with colleagues at the department - 92%; the degree of participation in managerial decision-making - 69%; relations with students - 84% of respondents. Recognition of successes and achievements on the part of the administration 80% of teaching staff are fully satisfied; support for suggestions and comments - 75%; the activities of the university administration - 73%; conditions of remuneration - 70% of respondents. 71% of teaching staff are fully satisfied with the working conditions, the list and quality of services provided at the university; occupational health and safety, 73%; management of changes in the activities of the university - 75% of respondents. Provision of a social package (rest, sanatorium treatment, etc.) 50% of teaching staff are fully satisfied; organization and quality of meals at the university - 61%; organization and quality of medical care - 68% of respondents.

Satisfactory marks were given by the members of the EEC on those items that require increased attention in compliance with the standards.

***Strengths/Best Practices:***

VolgSMU has a close and fruitful cooperation with local health care institutions, which is confirmed by the favorable conditions created for the departments and their active participation in the activities of the university.

***Recommendations of the EEC:***

No.

***Quantitative indicators reflecting the organization's compliance with the criteria of the Standard are as follows:***

*Strong – 1*

*Satisfactory – 12*

*suggest improvements – 0*

*Unsatisfactory – 0*

**6.9. Constant Update Standard**

• *An educational organization should:*

✓ *As a dynamic and socially responsible organization, initiate procedures to regularly review and update the process, structure, content, outcomes/competencies, evaluation and learning environment of the program, address documented deficiencies, allocate resources for continuous renewal.*

✓ *base the renewal process on prospective health research and on the results of in-house research, evaluation and literature on medical/pharmaceutical education;*

✓ *Ensure that the process of renewal and restructuring leads to a revision of policies and practices in line with past experience, current activities and future prospects.*

• *The organization of education should provide for the possibility of solving the following issues in the process of renewal:*

✓ *direct the renewal process towards the adaptation of the mission for the scientific, socio-economic and cultural development of society;*

✓ *Direct the renewal process to change the expected learning outcomes of graduates in accordance with the documented needs of the environment in which they will be located. Modification of learning outcomes in accordance with the documented needs of the postgraduate training environment, including clinical skills, public health training, and participation in patient care in accordance with the responsibilities that are assigned to graduates after graduation;*



- ✓ *guide the renewal process to adapt the EP model and teaching methods to ensure their adequacy and relevance;*
- ✓ *guide the renewal process to adjust the elements of the EP and their relationship in accordance with advances in the biomedical, behavioural, social and clinical, hygienic, pharmaceutical sciences, with changes in demographic and health/morbidity patterns of the population and socio-economic and cultural conditions, and the adjustment process will ensure the incorporation of new relevant knowledge, concepts and methods, and the elimination of obsolete ones;*
- ✓ *Guide the renewal process towards the development of assessment principles, methods and number of examinations in accordance with changes in the intended learning outcomes and teaching methods;*
- ✓ *Direct the renewal process to adapt the admission policy and selection methods to changing expectations and circumstances, human resource needs, changes in the pre-university education system, and the needs of EPs;*
- ✓ *Guide the renewal process to adapt recruitment policies and academic staffing to changing needs.*
- ✓ *direct the renewal process to improve educational resources in accordance with changing needs (student recruitment, number and profile of academic staff, and educational program);*
- ✓ *guide the renewal process towards improvements in programme monitoring and evaluation;*
- ✓ *Guide the renewal process towards the development of organizational structure as well as leadership and management to cope with changing circumstances and needs and, over time, adapt to the interests of different stakeholder groups*

### **Evidence**

FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia is a dynamically developing and socially responsible educational organization, which has developed and implemented procedures for constant monitoring and improvement of the fundamental processes of functioning.

Monitoring of the implementation of the main educational program includes: 1) the procedure of self-examination; 2) internal audit procedure; 3) surveys of stakeholders in order to identify requirements for learning outcomes; 4) analysis of the results of the incoming control (testing, USE); 5) employers' feedback; 6) the results of all types of practice.

Documentation of inconsistencies and shortcomings in the work of the departments, the faculty as a whole is carried out in the course of internal and external audits of VolgSMU. Based on the results of audits, in order to eliminate the causes of the identified inconsistencies and prevent their recurrence, the departments develop plans for corrective and preventive measures. Based on the results of the academic year, all departments, councils, commissions prepare reports on the results of the implementation of plans and processes at the dental Faculty. These results are analyzed by the Department of Education Quality and Monitoring, the Dean's Office of the Faculty, the management of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia to make decisions for future periods, and are also reflected in the plans for the strategic development of the Faculty of Dentistry and the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia as a whole.

For the successful implementation of the educational program, it is necessary to provide the departments, structural divisions of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia participating in educational activities with material, technical, information resources (the availability of classrooms, office equipment, equipping classrooms, etc.), human resources.

Every year, before the start of the academic year, an order is prepared to prepare VolgSMU for the new academic year. For the "Dentistry" program, a list of members of the commission is determined, who make a conclusion in accordance with the acts of readiness of the departments, on the need for additional resources for the high-quality educational process, which are further reflected in the applications.

At the end of the calendar year, a plan for the material and technical support of the educational program is formed on the basis of applications from structural divisions and departments, for planning financial resources for the future period for the educational process. The Planning and Finance Department develops a plan for financing all processes related to the implementation of the program.

All departments keep records of material and technical resources. A significant amount of resources was allocated for the formation of the EIEE in order to implement the program in a

remote format. The implementation of scientific research by both teachers and students of the program also requires certain material costs, which is reflected in the procurement plan of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia.

The process of updating educational resources is carried out in accordance with changing needs, the development of research areas in medicine, innovative technologies of surgical intervention, treatment of many diseases, as well as the socio-economic requirements of the labor market in the field of medical services, which involves updating the program, introducing new compulsory disciplines and elective disciplines, electives, based on promising and own research, world trends in the study of this area.

Dynamic adjustment of educational resources is based on new trends in basic, clinical, behavioral, social sciences, taking into account the level of morbidity, mortality, health status in society, state assignment, profile of specialists, and correction of the inclusion of new knowledge contributes to the improvement of socio-economic indicators of the standard of living in the country and in the world.

The educational process is organized using modern technologies. Many classrooms are equipped with interactive whiteboards and video conferencing equipment. Extensive resources of the online library and international databases are at the students' disposal.

One of the important tasks of the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia in the near future is to establish the compliance of activities with international standards, by integrating higher medical education, research work and qualified clinical activities into the educational process; harmonizing the traditions of the national medical school with international standards in the field of medical education.

#### ***Analytical part***

Members of the EEC, having analyzed the submitted documents and talked with the participants of focus groups, came to the conclusion that the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia, as a dynamically developing and socially responsible organization of higher medical education, should initiate procedures for regular review and revision of the content of the EP, learning outcomes/competencies, assessment and learning environment.

It is necessary to carefully revise the functions of structural and functional divisions and process maps, document and eliminate shortcomings in the accredited EP "Dentistry", taking into account the fact that the FSBEI HE of the VolgSMU of the Ministry of Health of Russia constantly allocates resources for continuous improvement.

Supervisors of EP 31.05.03 "Dentistry" need to annually adjust the elements of the educational program and their interrelationships in accordance with advances in the biomedical, behavioral, social and clinical sciences, changes in demographic and health/morbidity patterns of the population, and socio-economic and cultural conditions, and the adjustment process will ensure the inclusion of new relevant knowledge, concepts and methods, and the exclusion Legacy.

Members of the EEC recommend the development of clear principles for assessment and methods of conducting and the number of examinations in accordance with changing learning outcomes and teaching and learning methods, since in the process of interviews with trainees, only oral and written surveys, testing and solving situational problems were mentioned.

Satisfactory marks were given by the members of the EEC on those items that require increased attention in compliance with the standards.

#### ***Strengths/Best Practices:***

No strengths were identified for this standard.

#### ***Recommendations of the EEC:***

Dentistry supervisors are encouraged to use and document a wide range of assessment

methods and formats on a regular basis depending on their "usefulness assessment", which includes a combination of validity, reliability, learning impact, acceptability and effectiveness of assessment methods and format. (Deadline – 01.09.2025).

*Quantitative indicators reflecting the organization's compliance with the criteria of the Standard are as follows:*

*Strong – 0*

*satisfactory – 11*

*Suggest improvements – 1*

*Unsatisfactory – 0*



## **(VII) AN OVERVIEW OF STRENGTHS/BEST PRACTICES FOR EACH STANDARD**

### ***Mission & Results Standard***

No strengths were identified for this standard.

### ***Standard "Educational Program"***

No strengths were identified for this standard.

### ***Student Assessment Standard***

No strengths were identified for this standard.

### ***Standard "Learners"***

No strengths were identified for this standard.

### ***Academic Staff/Faculty Standard***

No strengths were identified for this standard.

### ***Educational Resources Standard***

No strengths were identified for this standard.

### ***Standard "Evaluation of Educational Programs"***

No strengths were identified for this standard.

### ***Management and Administration Standard***

VolgSMU has a close and fruitful cooperation with local health care institutions, which is confirmed by the favorable conditions created for the departments and their active participation in the activities of the university.

### ***Continuous Update Standard***

No strengths were identified for this standard.



## (VIII) OVERVIEW OF QUALITY IMPROVEMENT RECOMMENDATIONS

### *Mission & Results Standard*

1. Communicate to all stakeholders the mission, quality policy and vision of the organization (deadline – 01.09.2024);
2. The management of the EP is recommended to involve stakeholders in the development of the EP mission in the specialty "Dentistry" on an ongoing basis (deadline – 01.09.2024);
3. It is recommended that the heads of the Dentistry EP regularly (at least once a year) study, analyze and document the opinions/proposals of stakeholders regarding the mission, vision and final results of training (deadline – 01.09.2024).

### *Standard "Educational Program"*

1. It is recommended that the heads of the Dentistry programme carry out a step-by-step adaptation of the EP model to the modular or spiral design (integrated modules on systems or organs, spiral design of material study) of the educational programme. (Deadline – 01.09.2025);
2. It is recommended that the heads of the Dentistry programme include teaching and learning methods in the educational process, taking into account the best international practices (TBL, CBL, RBL, etc.), based on the principles of andragogy. (Deadline – 01.09.2024);
3. It is recommended that the heads of the Dentistry programme introduce horizontal integration of related sciences (integrated module, integrated program). (Deadline – 01.09.2025);
4. The university administration is recommended to develop and implement a system of academic counseling for students (advisor service) on the choice of elective disciplines and the formation of an individual educational trajectory. (The deadline is 01.12.2024).
5. Heads of the Dentistry EP are recommended to expand the Catalog of Elective Disciplines (Deadline – 01.12.2024)
6. Heads of the Dentistry programme are recommended to include issues of non-traditional and alternative medical practice in the Catalog of Elective Disciplines. (The deadline is 01.12.2024).

### *Student Assessment Standard*

1. EP supervisors are encouraged to use and document a wide range of assessment methods and formats on a regular basis, depending on their "usefulness assessment", which includes a combination of validity, reliability, learning impact, acceptability, and effectiveness of assessment methods, and format. (Deadline – 01.09.2025);
2. The management of the university is recommended to ensure the documentation of the process of assessing the educational achievements of students by introducing an electronic journal for accessibility and openness to all participants in the educational process. (The deadline is 01.12.2024).

### *Standard "Learners"*

It is recommended that the management of the Dentistry programme systematically collect information, analyze the results of feedback from students on the formulation of the mission, content and implementation of the educational program, and use the results to improve the quality of the programme. (Deadline – 01.09.2024, at least once a year).

### *Academic Staff/Faculty Standard*

The management of the university is recommended to organize advanced training for teaching staff in the use of modern educational technologies and assessment methods in the educational process. (Deadline – 01.09.2024).

***Educational Resources Standard***

1. The management of the EP "Dentistry" is recommended to ensure the implementation of scientific research in medical education and to promote the aspirations and interests of employees in their implementation, including the study of theoretical, practical and social issues. (Deadline – 01.09.2025);

2. It is recommended that the heads of the Dentistry EP organize the control of students' independent work. (Deadline – 01.09.2024).

***Standard "Evaluation of Educational Programs"***

No.

***Management and Administration Standard***

No.

***Continuous Update Standard***

Dentistry supervisors are encouraged to use and document a wide range of assessment methods and formats on a regular basis depending on their "usefulness assessment", which includes a combination of validity, reliability, learning impact, acceptability and effectiveness of assessment methods and format. (Deadline – 01.09.2025).

**(IX) REVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE DEVELOPMENT OF EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATIONS**

No.

**(X) RECOMMENDATION TO THE ACCREDITATION BOARD**

The members of the external expert commission came to a unanimous opinion that the educational program in the specialty 31.05.03 "Dentistry", implemented at the FSGFEI HE VolgSMU of the Ministry of Healthcare of Russia, can be accredited for a period of 5 years.

## Annex 1. Evaluation Table "PROGRAM PROFILE PARAMETERS"

No P/P	№	Crete No.	EVALUATION CRITERIA	Position of the NGO			
				Strong	Satisfactory	Suggests improvement	Unsatisfactory
<b>Standard 1 "MISSION AND RESULTS"</b>							
<b>1.1 Mission Definition</b>							
An educational organization should:							
1	1	1.1.1.	define the mission of the EP and communicate it to stakeholders and the health sector.			+	
2	2	1.1.2.	reflect in the mission of the EP the goals and educational strategy to prepare a competent specialist at the level of higher education in the field of health care with an appropriate basis for further career in any field of health care, including all types of practice, administrative medicine and scientific research in health care; able to perform the role and functions of a specialist in accordance with the established requirements of the health sector; prepared for postgraduate education and committed to lifelong learning		+		
3	3	1.1.3.	Ensure that the mission incorporates research advances in the biomedical, clinical, pharmaceutical, behavioral and social sciences, aspects of global health, and reflects major international health issues.		+		
<b>1.2. Institutional Autonomy and Academic Freedom</b>							
An educational organization should:							
4	4	1.2.1.	Have institutional autonomy to develop and implement quality assurance policies, for which the administration and teachers are responsible, especially with regard to the development of the educational program and the allocation of resources necessary for the implementation of the educational program		+		
5	5	1.2.2.	provide academic freedom for staff and students to implement the educational program and use the results of new research to improve the study of specific disciplines/issues without expanding the EP		+		
<b>1.3. Learning Outcomes</b>							
An educational organization should:							
6	6	1.3.1.	Identify the expected learning outcomes that learners are expected to achieve at the end of the training provides for the opportunity to achieve at a basic level in terms of knowledge, skills and professional relationships; an appropriate foundation for future careers in any area of the healthcare industry; future roles in the health sector; follow-up to postgraduate training; commitment to lifelong learning; health needs society, the needs of the health system and other aspects of social responsibility		+		
7	7	1.3.2.	Ensure proper behaviour of students towards classmates, teachers, medical staff, patients and their relatives		+		
8	8	1.3.3.	publish the expected learning outcomes of the EP		+		
9	9	1.3.4.	Identify and coordinate the relationship between the learning outcomes required at completion and those required in postgraduate studies		+		

10	10	1.3.5.	provide for the possibility of students to participate in research in the relevant field of health care		+		
11	11	1.3.6.	Pay attention to expected learning outcomes related to global health		+		
1.4. Participation in the formulation of the mission and learning outcomes							
An educational organization should:							
12	12	1.4.1.	Ensure the participation of key stakeholders in the formulation of the mission and expected learning outcomes			+	
13	13	1.4.2.	Ensure that the stated mission and expected learning outcomes are based on the opinions/suggestions of other stakeholders.			+	
<i>Total</i>				<b>0</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>0</b>
Standard 2. EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM							
2.1. Educational Program Model and Teaching Methods							
An educational organization should:							
14	1	2.1.1.	Define the specifications of the EP, including a statement of expected learning outcomes, a curriculum based on a modular or spiral structure, and the qualifications obtained as a result of mastering the program		+		
15	2	2.1.2.	Use <i>teaching and learning methods</i> that stimulate, prepare, and support learners to take responsibility for the learning process			+	
16	3	2.1.3.	ensure that the EP is implemented in accordance with the principles of equality.		+		
17	4	2.1.4.	Develop learners' lifelong learning abilities		+		
2.2. Scientific Method							
An educational organization should:							
18	5	2.2.1.	Inculcate the principles of scientific methodology, including analytical and critical thinking, throughout the curriculum; Research Methods in Healthcare and Evidence-Based Medicine		+		
19	6	2.2.2.	include the results of modern scientific research in the EP		+		
2.3 Basic biomedical sciences							
An educational organization should:							
20	7	2.3.1.	identify and include in the EP the achievements of basic biomedical sciences in order to form students' understanding of scientific knowledge, concepts and methods that are the basis for the acquisition and practical application of clinical scientific knowledge		+		
21	8	2.3.2.	Change the educational curriculum to take into account the achievements of the biomedical sciences, reflecting scientific, technological, medical and pharmaceutical developments, the current and expected needs of society and the health care system		+		
2.4. Behavioral and Social Sciences, Medical/Pharmaceutical Ethics, and Jurisprudence							
An educational organization should:							
22	9	2.4.1.	Identify and incorporate into the curriculum the achievements of the behavioral sciences, social sciences, medical/pharmaceutical ethics, and jurisprudence		+		
23	10	2.4.2.	modify the EP, taking into account the achievements of behavioral and social sciences, medical/pharmaceutical ethics and jurisprudence, including modern scientific, technological and medical and pharmaceutical developments, current and expected needs of society and the health care system; Changing demographic and cultural context		+		
2.5. Clinical/Pharmaceutical Sciences and Skills							
An educational organization should:							
24	11	2.5.1.	Identify and incorporate advances in clinical/pharmaceutical sciences into the EP to ensure that trainees have acquired sufficient knowledge, clinical and professional skills upon completion of training to assume appropriate responsibilities		+		



			in subsequent professional activities;				
25	12	2.5.2.	Ensure that trainees spend a sufficient portion of the program in planned patient contacts, service users, in appropriate clinical/industrial settings, and gain experience in health promotion and disease prevention		+		
26	13	2.5.3.	determine the amount of time allocated to the study of the main clinical/specialized disciplines		+		
27	14	2.5.4.	Provide training with appropriate attention to the safety of the learning environment and patients, including observation of the trainee's activities in clinical/industrial settings		+		
28	15	2.5.5.	Change the EP, taking into account the achievements of scientific, technological, medical and pharmaceutical developments, the current and expected needs of society and the health care system		+		
29	16	2.5.6.	Ensure that each trainee has early contact with real patients, consumers of services, including their gradual participation in the provision of services and including responsibility for: - in terms of examination and/or treatment of the patient under supervision in an appropriate clinical setting; - in the procedures of sanitary and epidemiological surveillance in terms of inspection and/or inspection of the facility under supervision, which is carried out in the relevant production bases (sanitary and epidemiological examination centers, territorial departments of sanitary and epidemiological control, including transport, disinfection organizations and health care facilities); - in terms of consulting the patient on the rational use of medicines, which is carried out in the appropriate production conditions		+		
30	17	2.5.7.	Structure the various components of training in clinical, hygienic, environmental and occupational monitoring skills and other manufacturing skills according to the specific phase of the training program.		+		
<b>2.6. Educational Program Structure, Content and Duration</b>							
An educational organization should:							
31	18	2.6.1.	Describe the content, scope and sequence of disciplines/modules, including appropriate balance between basic biomedical, behavioural, social and clinical/profile disciplines.		+		
32	19	2.6.2.	provide for the horizontal integration of related sciences and disciplines;			+	
33	20	2.6.3.	Provide for vertical integration of clinical/specialized sciences with basic biomedical and behavioral and social sciences			+	
34	21	2.6.4.	provide an opportunity for elective content (electives) and determine the balance between the mandatory and elective parts of the Civic Chamber			+	
35	22	2.6.5.	determine the relationship with complementary medicine, including non-traditional, traditional or alternative practices, occupational medicine, including aspects of the impact of the environment and technogenic production loads, the social situation on the health of the population.		+		
<b>2.7. Program Management</b>							
An educational organization should:							
36	23	2.7.1.	define procedures for the development, approval and revision of the EP		+		
37	24	2.7.2.	Identify a committee, under the direction of academic leadership, responsible for planning and implementing the EP to ensure that the expected learning outcomes are achieved.		+		
38	25	2.7.3.	To ensure the representation of teachers, students,		+		

			representatives from other stakeholders, including representatives from clinical, industrial bases, graduates of the PO, health professionals involved in the learning process in the composition of the PO committee responsible for the EP.				
39	26	2.7.4.	through the committee responsible for the EP, plan and implement innovations in the EP.		+		
<b>2.8. Relationship to medical/pharmaceutical practice and the health care system</b>							
An educational organization should:							
40	27	2.8.1.	Ensure continuity between the EP and the subsequent stages of professional training or practical activities that the learner will embark on at the end of the training		+		
41	28	2.8.2.	take into account the specifics of the conditions in which graduates will have to work and modify the EP accordingly		+		
<i>Total</i>				<b>0</b>	<b>24</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Standard 3. STUDENT ASSESSMENT</b>							
<b>3.1. Assessment Methods</b>							
An educational organization should:							
42	1	3.1.1.	define and approve the principles, methods and practices used to assess students, including the number of examinations, criteria for establishing passing scores, grades and the number of retakes allowed;		+		
43	2	3.1.2.	ensure that assessment procedures cover knowledge, skills, attitudes and professional behaviour		+		
44	3	3.1.3.	Use a wide range of assessment methods and formats depending on their "usefulness assessment", including a combination of validity, reliability, learning impact, acceptability and effectiveness of assessment methods and formats			+	
45	4	3.1.4.	Ensure that the evaluation process and methods are open (accessible) to external review		+		
46	5	3.1.5.	Ensure that assessment methods and results avoid conflicts of interest and use a student assessment appeal system		+		
47	6	3.1.6.	ensure the openness of the assessment procedure and its results, to inform students about the criteria and assessment procedures used		+		
48	7	3.1.7.	Provide for the possibility of documenting and assessing the reliability and validity of assessment methods, as well as the use of external examiners			+	
<b>3.2. The Relationship Between Assessment and Learning</b>							
An educational organization should:							
49	8	3.2.1.	Use assessment principles, methods and practices that are compatible with the planned RO and teaching and learning methods, ensure the achievement of the intended learning outcomes, promote student learning, and provide an appropriate balance of formative and summative assessment for the direction of learning and decision-making on academic performance		+		
50	9	3.2.2.	Provide for the possibility of adjusting the number and nature of examinations in order to stimulate both the acquisition of knowledge and integrated learning		+		
51	10	3.2.3.	Provide timely, specific, constructive, and fair feedback to students on assessment results		+		
<i>Total</i>				<b>0</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Standard 4. STUDYING</b>							
<b>4.1. Admission and Selection Policy</b>							
An educational organization should:							
52	1	4.1.1.	define and implement an admission policy based on the principles of objectivity and including a clear statement of the student selection process		+		
53	2	4.1.2.	Have policies and practices for the admission of persons with		+		

			LHC					
54	3	4.1.3.	have a policy and implement the practice of transferring students from other educational institutions, including foreign ones		+			
55	4	4.1.4.	establish a connection between the selection and the mission of the educational organization, the educational program and the desired quality of graduates; periodically review the admissions policy		+			
56	5	4.1.5.	use a system for appealing decisions on the admission of students		+			
4.2. Recruitment of students								
An educational organization should:								
57	6	4.2.1.	determine the number of students admitted in accordance with the possibilities of organizing education at all stages of the educational program		+			
58	7	4.2.2.	Periodically regulate the number and number of students enrolled, taking into account the views of stakeholders responsible for planning and developing human resources in the health sector to meet the health needs of the population and society as a whole		+			
59	8	4.2.3.	Provide for the possibility of periodically reviewing the number and nature of enrolments, in consultation with other stakeholders, and adjusting to meet the health needs of the population and society as a whole		+			
4.3. Student Counseling and Support								
An educational organization should:								
60	9	4.3.1.	have a system of academic counseling for students		+			
61	10	4.3.2.	Offer students a program of support focused on social, financial and personal needs, allocating appropriate resources and ensuring the confidentiality of counseling and support		+			
62	11	4.3.3.	have a feedback system with students on the assessment of conditions and the organization of the educational process		+			
63	12	4.3.4.	provide students with documents confirming the qualification (diploma) and the diploma supplement (transcript)		+			
64	13	4.3.5.	take into account the needs of different groups of students and provide an opportunity for the formation of an individual educational trajectory		+			
65	14	4.3.6.	Provide academic counseling that is based on the monitoring of the student's progress and includes career guidance and career planning		+			
4.4. Student Representation								
An educational organization should:								
66	15	4.4.1.	Develop and implement a policy of student representation and appropriate participation in the mission, development, management and evaluation of the educational program and other matters related to students		+			
67	16	4.4.2.	Provide an opportunity to encourage and promote and support student activities and student organizations		+			
				<i>Total</i>	<b>0</b>	<b>16</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
Standard 5. ACADEMIC STAFF/FACULTY								
5.1. Recruitment and Selection Policy								
An educational organization should develop and implement a staff selection and recruitment policy that:								
68	1	5.1.1.	defines their category, responsibilities, and balance of academic staff/faculty in the basic biomedical <i>sciences</i> , <i>behavioral and social sciences</i> , and <i>medical/pharmaceutical sciences for adequate implementation of the EP</i> , including the <i>proper ratio between medical, non-medical, pharmaceutical</i> , full-time or part-time faculty, and the balance between academic and non-academic Employees		+			
69	2	5.1.2.	takes into account the criteria of scientific, educational and clinical achievements, including the relationship between		+			

			teaching, research activities and "service" functions				
			Identifies and monitors the responsibilities of academic staff/faculty in Basic Biomedical Sciences, Behavioral and Social Sciences, and Clinical, Hygienic, Pharmaceutical Sciences.		+		
70	3	5.1.3.	Identifies and monitors the responsibilities of academic staff/faculty in Basic Biomedical Sciences, Behavioral and Social Sciences, and Clinical, Hygienic, Pharmaceutical Sciences.		+		
71	4	5.1.4.	provides for the possibility in the policy of selection and recruitment of personnel to take into account such criteria and features as the attitude to the mission and economic opportunities of the educational organization, as well as the significant features of the region		+		
<b>5.2. Personnel Activity and Development Policy</b>							
An educational organization should develop and implement a policy for the activities and development of personnel, which is aimed at:							
72	5	5.2.1.	striking a balance between teaching, research and service functions, ensuring recognition of worthy academic activity, with due emphasis on teaching, research and professional qualifications		+		
73	6	5.2.2.	ensuring that individual staff members have sufficient knowledge of the entire educational program, as well as training and professional development of teachers, their development and evaluation			+	
74	7	5.2.3.	the ability to take into account the teacher-student ratio depending on the different components of the educational program		+		
75	8	5.2.4.	Career development of personnel		+		
				<i>Total</i>	<b>0</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>Standard 6. EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES</b>							
<b>6.1. Material and technical base</b>							
An educational organization should:							
76	1	6.1.1.	have a sufficient material and technical base to ensure the adequate implementation of the educational program, as well as create a safe learning environment for staff, students, patients and their relatives		+		
77	2	6.1.2.	Improve the learning environment by regularly updating and expanding the material and technical base to meet changes in educational practice		+		
<b>6.2. Practical Training Resources</b>							
An educational organization should:							
78	3	6.2.1.	Provide the necessary resources to provide learners with appropriate clinical/practical experience, including: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Quality and categories of patients/consumers of services</li> <li>• Number and Categories of Clinical/Production Facilities</li> <li>• Observation of students' practice</li> </ul>		+		
79	4	6.2.2.	evaluate, adapt and improve clinical/practical training settings to meet the needs of the population		+		
<b>6.3. Information Technologies</b>							
An educational organization should:							
80	5	6.3.1.	Develop and implement policies aimed at the effective and ethical use and evaluation of appropriate information and communication technologies		+		
81	6	6.3.2.	provide access to websites or other electronic media		+		
82	7	6.3.3.	Provide teachers and learners with access to relevant patient data and health information systems, using existing and relevant new information and communication technologies for self-learning, access to information, patient databases and		+		



			health information systems				
<b>6.4. Medical/Pharmacy Research and Scientific Advances</b>							
An educational organization should:							
83	8	6.4.1.	use research activities and scientific achievements in the field of medicine and pharmacy as a basis for an educational program		+		
84	9	6.4.2.	formulate and implement policies that promote the link between research and education; provide information on the research base and priority areas in the field of scientific research of the organization of education		+		
85	10	6.4.3.	Provide for the relationship between research and education is taken into account in teaching, encourages and prepares learners for and participation in research in the field of health		+		
<b>6.5. Expertise in the field of education</b>							
An educational organization should:							
86	11	6.5.1.	have access to educational expertise of the processes, practices and problems of medical and pharmaceutical education with the involvement of specialists, educational psychologists, sociologists of the university, interuniversity and international levels; develop and implement a policy of expertise in the development, implementation and evaluation of the educational program, the development of teaching and assessment methods		+		
87	12	6.5.2.	demonstrate evidence of the use of internal or external educational expertise in staff development, taking into account current experience in medical/pharmaceutical education and contributing to the interests of staff in conducting research in education		+		
<b>6.6. Exchange in the field of education</b>							
An educational organization should:							
88	13	6.6.1.	formulate and implement a policy on national and international cooperation with other educational organizations, including the mobility of staff and students, as well as the transfer of educational credits		+		
89	14	6.6.2.	promote the participation of teachers and students in academic mobility programs in the country and abroad and to allocate appropriate resources for this purpose		+		
<i>Total</i>				<b>0</b>	<b>14</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Standard 7. EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM</b>							
<b>7.1. Programme Monitoring and Evaluation Mechanisms</b>							
An educational organization should:							
90	1	7.1.1.	have regulated procedures for monitoring, periodic evaluation of the educational program and learning outcomes, progress and academic performance of students		+		
91	2	7.1.2.	develop and apply an evaluation mechanism for the educational program, which considers the program, its main components, the performance of students, identifies and solves problems, and ensures that the relevant assessment results affect the EP		+		
92	3	7.1.3.	Periodically evaluate the program, comprehensively considering the educational process, components of the educational program, expected learning outcomes and social responsibility		+		
<b>7.2. Feedback from the teacher and the student</b>							
An educational organization should:							
93	4	7.2.1.	systematically conduct, analyze and respond to feedback from teachers and students		+		
94	5	7.2.2.	Use the results of feedback to improve the educational program		+		
<b>7.3. Educational achievements of students</b>							
An educational organization should:							

95	6	7.3.1.	analyze the progress of students and graduates in accordance with the mission and expected learning outcomes, the training program and the availability of resources		+		
96	7	7.3.2.	analyze the progress of students and graduates, taking into account the conditions of their previous education, the level of training when entering a university; use the results of the analysis to interact with the structural unit responsible for the selection of students, the development of an educational program, and the consulting of students		+		
<b>7.4. Stakeholder Engagement</b>							
An educational organization should:							
97	8	7.4.1.	Involve key stakeholders in the monitoring and evaluation of the educational program		+		
98	9	7.4.2.	Provide stakeholders with access to the results of the evaluation of the program, collect and study their feedback on the practical activities of graduates and feedback on the educational program		+		
<i>Total</i>				<b>0</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Standard 8. MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION</b>							
<b>8.1. Management</b>							
An educational organization should:							
99	1	8.1.1.	Identify structural units and their functions, including relationships within the university		+		
100	2	8.1.2.	define committees in the management structure, their responsibilities, and their composition, reflecting the representation of key and other stakeholders, ensuring transparency of the work of management bodies and their decisions		+		
<b>8.2. Academic Leadership</b>							
An educational organization should:							
101	3	8.2.1.	describe the responsibilities of academic leadership in defining and managing the educational program		+		
102	4	8.2.2.	Periodically evaluate academic leadership in relation to the achievement of its mission and expected learning outcomes		+		
<b>8.3. Training Budget and Resource Allocation</b>							
An educational organization should:							
103	5	8.3.1.	have a clear distribution of responsibilities and powers to provide resources for the educational program, including a targeted budget for training		+		
104	6	8.3.2.	allocate the resources necessary for the implementation of the EP and allocate educational resources in accordance with their needs		+		
105	7	8.3.3.	Provide for the ability to allocate resources independently, including the remuneration of teachers, who adequately achieve the planned learning outcomes; In the allocation of resources, take into account scientific achievements in the field of health and public health problems and their needs.		+		
<b>8.4. Administrative Staff and Management</b>							
An educational organization should:							
106	8	8.4.1.	have administrative and professional staff for the implementation of the educational program and related activities, ensure proper management and allocation of resources		+		
107	9	8.4.2.	ensure the participation of all departments of the educational organization in the processes and procedures of the internal quality assurance system		+		
<b>8.5. Engagement with the health sector</b>							
An educational organization should:							
108	10	8.5.1.	engage constructively with the health system and health-related sectors of society and government, including foreign		+		
109	11	8.5.2.	Formalize collaborations, including staff and training, with		+		

			partners in the health sector				
8.6. Informing the public							
An educational organization should:							
110	12	8.6.1.	publish on the official website of the educational organization and in the media complete and reliable information about the educational program and its achievements		+		
111	13	8.6.2.	publish on the official website objective information about the employment and demand for graduates		+		
<i>Total</i>				<b>1</b>	<b>12</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
Standard 9. CONSTANT UPDATING							
An educational organization should:							
112	1	9.1.1.	As a dynamic and socially responsible organization, initiate procedures to regularly review and update the program's process, structure, content, outcomes/competencies, evaluation and learning environment, address documented deficiencies, allocate resources for continuous renewal		+		
113	2	9.1.2.	base the renewal process on prospective health research and on the results of in-house research, evaluation and literature on medical/pharmaceutical education;			+	
The education organization should ensure that the process of renewal and restructuring leads to a revision of policies and practices in accordance with past experience, current activities and future prospects, and provide for the following issues to be addressed in the renewal process:							
114	3	9.1.3.	adaptation of the mission for the scientific, socio-economic and cultural development of society		+		
115	4	9.1.4.	changing the expected learning outcomes of graduates in accordance with the documented needs of the environment in which they will be located. <b>Modification of learning outcomes</b> to meet the documented needs of the postgraduate training environment, including clinical skills, public health training, and participation in patient care in accordance with the responsibilities that are assigned to graduates after graduation		+		
116	5	9.1.5.	adaptation of the EP model and teaching methods to ensure their adequacy and relevance		+		
117	6	9.1.6.	Adjustments to the elements of EP and their relationship in line with advances in biomedical, behavioral, social and clinical, hygienic, pharmaceutical sciences, changes in demographic and health/morbidity patterns of the population and socio-economic and cultural conditions, and the adjustment process will ensure the incorporation of new relevant knowledge, concepts and methods, and the elimination of obsolete ones		+		
118	7	9.1.7.	development of assessment principles, methods and number of examinations in accordance with changes in the intended learning outcomes and teaching methods		+		
119	8	9.1.8.	adapting student admission policies and selection methods to changing expectations and circumstances, human resource needs, changes in the pre-university education system, and the needs of EPs		+		
120	9	9.1.9.	adapting the policy of recruitment and formation of academic staff in accordance with changing needs		+		
121	10	9.1.10.	updating educational resources in accordance with changing needs, i.e., the number of students, the number and profile of academic staff, and the educational program;		+		
122	11	9.1.11.	improving programme monitoring and evaluation		+		
123	12	9.1.12.	developing the organizational structure, as well as leadership and management, to cope with changing circumstances and needs and, over time, to adapt to the interests of different stakeholder groups		+		
<i>Total</i>				<b>0</b>	<b>11</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>TOTAL</b>				<b>1</b>	<b>110</b>	<b>13</b>	<b>0</b>